# Final Evaluation of the UNDP Project:

# Youth Sleuth - Engaging Serbia's Youth to Fight Corruption Through Investigative Journalism and Social Media

## FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

Evaluated and written by: Slobodan Vukadinović E-mail: <a href="mailto:slobodan.vukadinovic@pravnifakultet.rs">slobodan.vukadinovic@pravnifakultet.rs</a> www.slobodanvukadinovic.com

The report is submitted to: UNDP - Office in the Republic of Serbia

# Table of Contents:

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	4
2. INTRODUCTION	7
2.1. Objective of the evaluation	7
2.2. Background and context	7
2.3. Scope of evaluation	7
3. METHODOLOGY	8
3.1. Evaluation criteria and evaluation questions	8
3.2. Concept framework	9
3.3. Data collection methods and sources	9
3.4. Analytical approach	9
3.5. Risk and potential shortcoming	10
3.6. Evaluation plan and programme of work	10
3.6.1. Work phases	10
3.6.2. Work plan	10
4. EVALUATION FINDINGS	11
4.1. Effectiveness	11
4.2. Innovative project approaches	14
4.3. Political Economy	15
4.4. Impact	16
4.5. Sustainability	18
5. LESSONS LEARNED	20
6. CONCLUSION	22
7. RECOMMENDATIONS	24
8. APPENDICES	26
Appendix 1 Evaluation matrix	26
Appendix 2 Stakeholders list	29
Appendix 3 Examined documentation list	29
Appendix 4 Websites	30
Appendix 5 Interviewed interlocutors list	32

<sup>\*</sup> All the terms used in this report as masculine nouns also refer to their feminine equivalents.

<sup>\*\*</sup> The views expressed in this report are those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of the UNDP.

# Tables list:

Table no. 1: Comprehensive trainings for the project participants (young investigative journalists)
Table no. 2: Total number of stories and investigative blogs published
Table no. 3: Creating a social media presence to promote Agency activities during the UNDP project
Table no. 4: Achieved interest for the fight against corruption among citizens on social media as a result of the investigative stories enabled by the UNDP project
Table no. 5: Number of investigative stories republished by mainstream media (fully or partially)
Table no. 6: Growing interest in the fight against corruption among Serbian citizens
Table no. 7: Increased number of visits to the ACA website
Table no. 8: Overview of website visits according to users technologies
Table no. 9: Number of the website visits by states
Acronyms
ACA – Anticorruption Agency
BIRN – Balkan Investigative Reporting Network
BRC – Bratislava Regional Center
CIN-IJC - Investigative Journalism Center
CINS – Center for Investigative Journalism
CPD - Country Programme Document
DGTTF - The Democratic Governance Thematic Trust Fund
NA - National Assembly
NGO - Non-governmental organization
NIM – National Implementation (procedures)
NPD – National Project Director
NUNS – Independent Journalists' Association of Serbia
ToR – Terms of Reference
UNCAC –United Nations Convention against Corruption
UNDAF - United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNDP - United Nations Development Programme
UNS - Journalists' Association of Serbia

#### 1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The UNDP Project: Youth Sleuth - Engaging Serbia's Youth to Fight Corruption through Investigative Journalism and Social Media is relevant for national priorities and users' needs; formulated and implemented within the UNDP mandate – in accordance with the CPD and UNDAF for the Republic of Serbia.

The planned project outcomes were fully achieved. All the envisaged project activities were realized in full. The candidates for the project were selected through open competition among students of journalism at the Faculty of Political Science University of Belgrade. The project included the selection of ten motivated and qualified young journalists, however only 9 made through the whole selection process and took part in the project. Young journalists were empowered to conduct research independently and to create reports about corruption for social and mainstream media. Through grants competition, 3 NGOs were selected to lead the journalists through the project and to provide internship opportunities for the selected journalists. Selected NGOs were well-known, reliable and specialized NGOs for fight against corruption.

Young journalists used NGOs' social network methodology to investigate and write about corruption thus to fuel intolerance towards the corruption in public. The participants attended comprehensive trainings on the following topics: investigative journalism, corruption, ethical decision making, public procedures, digital journalism and data driven journalism. Total average grade on a five-point scale is 4,66. During the evaluation procedure, some young journalists said that they had learned more about investigative journalism during the UNDP project than during their studies at the Faculty.

During the project, 34 investigative stories and 12 investigative blogs were published. All stories were shared on the Facebook page "Mi To Ne Damo", which gained 170 likes on April 22<sup>nd</sup> 2014. UNDP Serbia facilitated establishment of two open source online systems for information gathering and corruption reporting: (1) SMS Platform for Corruption Reporting Corruption in the Health Sector and (2) Pištaljka's 256-bit encoding of anonymous reporting of corruption for whistleblowers. The Project enabled publishing of the study: Two years of Protection: Testimonies of Whistleblowers Who Were Granted Protection by the Anti-Corruption Agency, which provided an overview of the situation after two years of the implementation of The Rulebook on the Protection of Whistleblowers, organised in the form of three wholes: (1) the testimonies of whistle-blowers themselves, (2) an analysis of the implementation of the Rulebook in the 2011-2013 period, and (3) recommendations for providing better protection to whistleblowers in Serbia. The publication is publicly available at the website of the Eutopija / pištaljka [Eutopia / Whistle] association. The Project has produced a comprehensive study on the University curricula in investigative journalism (in Serbia). The study offered ideas and several options for integration of anti-corruption subject for journalists into university education. Journalism experts discussed and supported the study at the conference in December 2013 in Media center in Belgrade.

The project was **innovative** because it introduced several novelties. The project included cooperation of state institutions, civil society, as well as media, students and universities. Hence, the UNDP project contributed directly to the implementation of international standards that imposed by ACA obligation (as per international conventions and domestic legislation) to engage

civil society in the fight against corruption. The project approach was innovative because it succeeded in using NGO support to avoid mainstream media's allowing it to neutralize political influences that exist in commercial media. In avoiding the mainstream media the project facilitated fairness and objectivity in stories investigating corruption as well as avoided censorship and autocensorship. Connecting NGO's and young journalists through the use of social media and crowdsourcing created synergy in the fight against corruption. Trainings provided to the participants during the project were new to Serbia and very innovative and organized for the first time in Serbia and they significantly improved the abilities of young journalists to use modern investigative journalism techniques and tools. The project participants took part in a debate on the role of innovations, new media and digital tools in creating a better future by 2030, at the Social Good Summit on September 23, 2013. This was the first time that UNDP office in Serbia joined the Social Good Summit. Journalists' associations (UNS and NUNS), young sleuths and anticorruption NGOs shared their views on how social media can be used to encourage larger number of citizens to report corruption and how can social media support mainstream media in creating investigative stories. The Project participants presented their experience with social media during the project and their investigative work.

Cooperation with the ACA as a national implementation partner was exceptional and the project achieved full involvement from a large number of Agency employees in project implementation and education of young journalists. Improved cooperation between the ACA and NGOs helped the Agency to better perceive how NGOs operate, to further cooperation with civil society, to develop a proactive approach to NGOs, meaning to assign topics that will be analyzed or to emphasize ACA's needs that are clearly defined now. Currently, the ACA is finalizing its own priorities for further NGO involvement with respect to the needs and main concerns of the ACA that will be published on the ACA website.

The UNDP project has supported development and improvement of the involved NGOs capacities to implement investigative journalism as a means of combatting corruption. This is especially remarkable as two out of the three NGO's did not have previous experience with investigative journalism. In facilitating enrichment of institutional cooperation between one NGO and the Ministry of Health, this was a first step towards further collaboration on new ideas that arose during the project.

During the evaluation, project participants emphasized that the project had been "a window to the 21 century". The interviewed interlocutors in the ACA pointed out that this project facilitated their learning and represented useful experience for work improvement and modernization.

The UNDP project and published stories triggered a direct reaction from Serbian society and state authorities. Institutions that reacted were the following: Ministry of Health, the ACA, Public Prosecution Office, Ministry of Interior, as well as public enterprises such as Apoteke Beograd and Infostan, numerous officials, presidents of municipalities, the director of Djerdap National Park. Published stories initiated actions and procedures among state authorities. Consequently, criminal charges were filed and criminal proceedings were initiated. The Ministry of culture filed a criminal complaint to the Prosecutor in August 2013 reacting to the story on abuse of public funds National Museum has been ordered to pay a 2 million euro compensation for a depot it has not used written by the young journalists involved in the project. In addition, the Ministry of Health filed a complaint based on the stories about unlicensed medical equipment. The

ACA initiated control of the head of Kovačica municipality and police reacted on the Serbia on the Move stories. Therefore, it can be concluded that investigative stories, published as the result of this UNDP project, brought significant and evident change in the fight against corruption in Serbia.

Once published, stories were shared widely on social media, raising awareness about the corruption among public at large and triggering interest among journalists of conventional media. When stories were published, citizens were asking questions on Facebook and youth sleuths were providing answers, hence the **project succeed in establishing social interactions on anti-corruption topics**. Based on a story published on website Pistaljka.com, ACA has initiated property control of nine government officials. After one story, even the prosecutor office reacted. **All published stories are still publicly available as well as having been taken over by mainstream media.** Pistaljka published the largest number of stories that were shared in the mainstream media such as daily newspapers with national coverage Politika, Kurir, Alo, Blic, Informer, as well as TV Prva.

The project is **catalytic** because it has lead to further projects and initiatives. With this project the UNDP has connected the Public Procurement office and Transparency Serbia through an investigative story of youth sleuths about public procurements and pharmacies Belgrade. In addition, the model of investigative journalism in the NGOs that the project promoted has been recognized as the best practice and re-implemented in the outcome number 5 "Better quality of monitoring and reporting about public finances by NGOs and media" in the project <u>Advancing Accountability Mechanisms in Public Finances</u>.

<u>Regular half-year UNDP corruption surveys in Serbia</u> indicated significant decrease in the levels of corruption, as well as lower perception of corruption among Serbian citizens during the project, in December 2012.

All project outcomes and results are **sustainable**. After the project, young journalists have continued cooperation with the NGOs that partnered with the UNDP on this project. Specifically, all three project participants have continued cooperation with NGO Pistaljka, a girl, who participated as young sleuth in the project, still works at the Transparency Serbia and one participant has been employed at Center for Investigative Journalism (CINS). The project contributed to the NGOs development of their investigative journalism knowledge and helped them understand the potential of social media. As a direct outcome of the project, NGOs became more active on social networks. On the other hand, young journalists have improved their analytical capabilities and skills by working at NGOs.

SMS service that was introduced in Serbia with UNDP project support has continued to operate after completion of the project. As the best practice, SMS service was taken in the project's anti-corruption activities in the health system (a new project was initiated) and it improved institutional cooperation with the Ministry of Health and enabled further development of joint activities with the Ministry. SMS service has improved communication between people and institutions, because young journalists directed citizens, who pointed out the problems, to the appropriate authority to whome they can then submit their complaint.

Based on the project evaluation, it can be concluded that next, **larger project is needed** in order to further strengthen anti-corruption capacities in Serbia and further develop comprehensive anti-corruption actions that would include both preventive and law enforcement measures.

#### 2. INTRODUCTION

#### 2.1. Objective of the Evaluation

The objective of the Evaluation is to provide an independent assessment of the *Youth Sleuth - Engaging Serbia's Youth to Fight Corruption through Investigative Journalism and Social Media* project, with the purpose of providing information about the results of the project and assessing if and how the project outcomes were achieved. In accordance with the projects' Terms of Reference (ToR), the objective of the evaluation is to identify, analyze and document results of the project and the factors that have impacted its results, to identify the positive and negative lessons learned from the project, and to evaluate the instruments used to achieve the final results.

This is the **final project evaluation**. According the UNDP requirements, every completed project requires a final evaluation.

# 2.2. Background and Context

The output and activity results of the project are the following:

Output 1: Investigative journalism and use of digital and social media promoted through the non-profit sector

- 1. Activity Result: Established open-source, online gathering and dissemination of information on corruption.
- 2. Activity Result: Lead stories and other content developed and disseminated through electronic and social media.
  - 3. Activity Result: Enhanced measurement of public sentiment and behavior towards corruption.

<u>Implementation period</u>: June 7<sup>th</sup>, 2012 – November 30<sup>th</sup>, 2013.

#### 2.3. Scope of the Evaluation

The evaluation identified outputs of the project, elaborated how the outputs had or had not contributed to progress towards outcomes, and identified results and changes, if any, achieved by The Democratic Governance Thematic Trust Fund (DGTTF) initiative.

In accordance with the ToR, in assessing the project the national consultant examined the following elements:

- 1) Effectiveness,
- 2) Political Economy,
- 3) Sustainability.

The Evaluator reviewed, analyzed and provided conclusions and recommendations on the following:

- The status of the Corresponding Country Programme outcome and estimated degree of the project's contribution to it;
- The degree to which the project activities listed in the Project Document have been successfully implemented and desired outputs achieved;
- What factors contributed to effectiveness or ineffectiveness;
- The efficiency of the project's approach in delivering outputs;
- Assessment of external factors affecting the project and the extent to which the project has been able to adapt to and/or mitigate the effects of such factors;
- The approach to project management including the role of stakeholders and coordination with other development projects in the same area;
- The extent to which the targeted population have benefited from the project activities;
- The level of beneficiaries' and partners' satisfaction with the implementation and results of the programme;
- The potential for continuing or up-scaling of the initiative.

## 3. METHODOLOGY

# 3.1. Evaluation criteria and evaluation questions

#### 1) Effectiveness

Evaluation questions for Effectiveness:

- 1. To what extent has the DGTTF project achieved its objectives?
- 2. In what ways is the project innovative?
- 3. Which innovative approaches have proven most effective?
- 4. What type of internal and external problems did the project face and how did it cope with them?
- 5. Is there evidence that the results extend beyond the individual project?
- 6. To what extent has the project had a catalytic effect, substantially, financially and in terms of development and/or strengthening of partnerships?

## 2) Political Economy

Evaluation questions for Political Economy:

- 1. What was the political context?
- 2. How did the political context in the country during the project implementation affect commitment of national partners to the project?
- 3. What was the institutional set up and degree of autonomy/dependence of the partner institution in relation to others?
- 4. Who were the key local and national stakeholders?
- 5. What was the overall mapping of the project stakeholders including local and national stakeholders, international partners, bilateral or multilateral organizations?
- 6. What were their interests and incentives?
- 7. What was their ability to promote these interests through formal or informal channels?

8. How did policies and/or institutional and governance arrangements affect the project performance and attainment (or non-attainment) of results?

# 3) Sustainability

**Evaluation questions** for Sustainability:

- 1. What measures were taken to ensure the sustainability of the achievements of the project?
- 2. To what extent did national partners feel that they "owned" the project?
- 3. How have issues of ownership and participation of target groups/clients been addressed both in the formulation and implementation of project?
- 4. What should be done differently?
- 5. Did the project continue without further DGTTF funding?

# **3.2.** Conceptual framework

Evaluation is based on the utilization-focused approach with the purpose of providing information about the results of the project, and ensuring the the findings can be utilized. In accordance with international professional standards and project evaluation practice, the evaluator ensures that the evaluation is conducted through systematic, data-based inquiries, guarantees honesty, and ensures the integrity of the entire evaluation process with respect to all subjects participating in the evaluation.

#### 3.3. Data collection methods and sources

- 1. Collection and review of documents: project document, annual reports, final report, project board meeting minutes, monitoring records and progress and other relevant reports, financial reports, materials produced as outputs of the project;
- 2. Conduct individual interviews with relevant stakeholders either in person or by telephone;
- 3. Website visit and email surveys;
- 4. Analyzing knowledge products produced by the project and codification of tools and instruments (e.g. training manuals, laws, regulations, etc) that were used during the project to achieve the project results.

#### Data sources:

- 1. Project documentation
- 2. Reports
- 3. Key documents produced by the project
- 4. Interview protocols/minutes
- 5. Websites

# 3.4. Analytical approach

The proposed evaluation methodology is based on a combined methodology approach consisting of document and file review, considering and analyzing knowledge products produced by the project, website and emails surveys and discussions and interviews with relevant stakeholders and interlocutors involved in various project phases.

The methodology approach comprises quantitative and qualitative analyses.

#### 3.5. Risks and potential shortcoming

- 1. Lack of engagement of certain participants for interviews;
- 2. Operations of the stakeholders and interlocutors, possible delay.

# 3.6. Evaluation plan and programme of work

# 3.6.1. Work phases

The evaluation programme consists of three phases. While the preparatory and final phases are carried out through analysis, evaluation and preparing the report, the second phase consists of conducting interviews.

# First Phase: Preparatory phase

In this evaluation phase, in order to gain an adequate and profound understanding of the *Youth Sleuth - Engaging Serbia's Youth to Fight Corruption through Investigative Journalism and Social Media* project, it was necessary to review, consider and analyze numerous documents including official project documentation, project reports, records from meetings, minutes of board meetings, progress reports, key documents produced by the project, research results. Besides the analysis of the project documentation, the preparatory phase served to further define the evaluation methodology. In this phase, it was necessary to identify relevant stakeholders and establish an optimal number of interlocutors and relevant stakeholders to be interviewed in person. During the preparatory phase, special attention was paid to evaluating whether the representatives of the project users were involved in setting up the project activities and to what extent their specific needs were incorporated into the planned project activities.

The evaluator prepared an inception report with an evaluation matrix including evaluation criteria, evaluation questions, data collection methods and data sources.

#### Second Phase: Interviews and assessment

The aim of the evaluation was to gain an understanding of the direct and indirect effects of the project. The evaluator personally interviewed project users and representatives of all of the project's stakeholders.

# **Third Phase: Writing the Report**

Before writing the final report, the evaluator presented the draft evaluation report which included the main evaluation findings, conclusions, recommendations and lessons learned, to the UNDP. Using the subsequent feedback, the evaluator wrote the final evaluation report. The report was written at the evaluator's home and all the reports (initial report, draft final report and final report) were delivered to the UNDP Serbia by e-mail.

## 3.6.2. Work plan

The proposed steps in conducting the evaluation were:

- 1. Initial meeting with UNDP project documentation and to agree upon specific design and appropriate methods of evaluation, which would correspond to the evaluation purpose and objectives. Agree upon the evaluation questions, given time limitations and available data;
- 2. Review of relevant project documentation, monitoring records and progress and other relevant reports;
- 3. Review of all knowledge products produced by the project;
- 4. Prepare inception report with evaluation matrix;
- 5. Organization of interviews;
- 6. Conduct interviews discussions with relevant stakeholders and key staff involved in project implementation to obtain feedback on the project's results;
- 7. Conduct assessment including site visit;
- 8. Analysis;
- 9. Prepare draft report including codification of tools and methods used to achieve the project results;
- 10. Analysis: comments from UNDP, feedback Incorporate received feedback into the final report;
- 11. Conclusions and recommendations:
- 12. Prepare the final report with the executive Summary for submission.

#### 4. EVALUATION FINDINGS

The UNDP Project: Youth Sleuth - Engaging Serbia's Youth to Fight Corruption through Investigative Journalism and Social Media is relevant for national priorities and users' needs. The project is formulated and implemented under the UNDP mandate (in accordance with the CPD and UNDAF for the Republic of Serbia).

The project enabled implementation within the framework of the Agency's standards and procedures (National Implementation - NIM).

#### 4.1. Effectiveness

The planned project outcomes were fully achieved. All the envisaged project activities were realized in full.

The candidates for the project were selected through open competition among students of journalism at the Faculty of Political Science University of Belgrade. Having in mind that the participants were at the final year of the BA or MA studies, young sleuths had already possessed knowledge about investigative journalism that facilitated their work during the project on anticorruption stories.

The project included the selection of ten motivated and qualified young journalists, however only 9 made through the whole selection process and took part in the project. Trainings in anticorruption issues and investigative journalist techniques and internship opportunities supported further building of professionalism of young journalists to cope with challenging tasks of investigative

journalism. Young journalists were empowered to conduct research independently and to create reports about corruption for social and mainstream media.

Through grants competition, 3 NGOs were selected to lead the journalists through the project and to provide internship opportunities for the selected journalists. Selected NGOs were well-known, reliable and specialized NGOs for fight against corruption.

- a) Eutopija Pištaljka
- b) Serbia on the Move (*Srbija u pokretu*)
- c) Transparency Serbia

Young journalists used NGOs' social network methodology to investigate and write about corruption thus to fuel intolerance towards the corruption in public.

The participants attended comprehensive trainings on the following topics: investigative journalism, corruption, ethical decision making, public procedures, digital journalism and data driven journalism.

Table no. 1: Comprehensive trainings for the project participants (young investigative journalists)

Topics	Date of training	Trainers	Participants' evaluation of lectures
			(total average grade)
Corruption prevention	February 19-21,	ACA, BIRN, Public	4.67
mechanisms in Serbia	2013	procurement office,	
(ACA mandate, basic		Commissioner for	
notions regarding		information of public	
corruption and ethical		importance and	
decision-making)		personal data	
		protection	
Investigative	February 25-27,	Branko Čečen	4,78
journalism	2013	(CINS), Saša	
		Leković (CIN – IJC,	
		Zagreb)	
Digital reporting	March 12-15,	UNDP Bratislava	4,50
(storytelling)	2013	Regional Center:	
		Guillio Quadriggoto,	
		Blythe Fraser	
Data driven journalism	April 8-12, 2013	Nicolas Kayser	4,67
		Pierre Romero	

Total average grade on a five-point scale (1-lowest, 5-highest) is 4,66.

All participants assessed innovative trainings that the UNDP office organized as very useful. They emphasized that data journalism was the most useful. During the evaluation procedure, some young journalists said that they had learned more about investigative journalism during the UNDP

project than during their studies at the Faculty. The only suggestion for improvement was that the time frame in which the training took place could be extended as the short timeframe resulted in it being rather intensive. The participants stressed out that they needed more time to obtain more insightful and comprehensive knowledge and expertise in the investigative journalism on anticorruption topics.

Young sleuths obtained strong support from external mentors Mr. Saša Leković and Mr. Branko Čečen. The mentors lent a helping hand in production of investigative stories, but at the same time encouraged their individual and independent engagement. External mentor Mr. Branko Čečen and Transparency Serbia provided extensive support the interns during the investigative work on the multifaceted story about the Pharmacy Belgrade.

Young journalist had paid internship practice in three selected NGO during 6 months, from February to August 2013. During the project, 34 investigative stories and 12 investigative blogs were published. All stories were shared on the Facebook page "Mi To Ne Damo", which gained 170 likes on April 22<sup>nd</sup> 2014.

Table no. 2: Total number of stories and investigative blogs published

Stories and blogs published	Pištaljka	Serbia on the Move	Transparency Serbia	Total number
Number of stories published	16	11	7	34
Number of investigative blogs published	6	5	1	12
Total number of stories and blogs published	22	16	8	46

Table no. 3: Creating a social media presence to promote Agency activities during the UNDP project

Social media	Start date	Internet address
Facebook	April 25 <sup>th</sup> 2013	https://sr-rs.facebook.com/MiToNeDamo
Twitter	April 23 <sup>rd</sup> 2013	http://doublecrosscorruption.tumblr.com/

The UNDP project assisted further improvement of corruption prevention process, in particular, whistleblower protection and reporting systems management. The project enabled the protection of whistleblowers by providing technical support so that submissions to Pistaljka's website could not be traced. UNDP Serbia facilitated the establishment of two open source online systems for information gathering and corruption reporting: (1) <u>SMS Platform</u> for Corruption Reporting Corruption in the Health Sector and (2) Pištaljka's 256-bit encoding of <u>anonymous reporting of corruption</u> for whistleblowers.

The Project Youth Sleuth - Engaging Serbia's Youth to Fight Corruption through Investigative Journalism and Social Media has produced a comprehensive study on the University curricula in investigative journalism (in Serbia). Baseline study for the project "Youth Sleuth" provided an overview of formal and informal journalism education with the focus on investigative journalism, social networks for journalists, and digital storytelling. In addition, the study offered ideas and several options for integration of anti-corruption subject for journalists into university education. Journalism experts discussed and supported the study at the conference in December 2013 in Media center in Belgrade.

The project also made possible the preparation of the publication Two years of Protection: Testimonies of Whistleblowers Who Were Granted Protection by the Anti-Corruption Agency, which provided an overview of the situation after two years of the implementation of The Rulebook on the Protection of Whistleblowers, organised in the form of three wholes: (1) the testimonies of whistle-blowers themselves, (2) an analysis of the implementation of the Rulebook in the 2011-2013 period, and (3) recommendations for providing better protection to whistle-blowers in Serbia. The publication is publicly available at the website of the Eutopija / pištaljka [Eutopia / Whistle] association.

The project faced a challenge of interconnections between young journalists and NGOs, because they did not have chance to choose each other. However, adequate project management and intermediation by the project team resolved this issue.

# 4.2. Innovative project approaches

The project was innovative because it introduced several novelties. The project included cooperation of state institutions, civil society, as well as media, students and universities. Hence, the UNDP project contributed directly to the implementation of international standards that imposed by ACA obligation (as per international conventions and domestic legislation) to engage civil society in the fight against corruption.

The project approach was innovative because it succeeded in using NGO support to avoid mainstream media's allowing it to neutralize political influences that exist in commercial media. In avoiding the mainstream media the project facilitated fairness and objectivity in stories investigating corruption as well as avoided censorship and auto-censorship. Connecting NGO's and young journalists through the use of social media and crowd-sourcing created synergy in the fight against corruption.

Trainings provided to the participants during the project were new to Serbia and very innovative and organized for the first time in Serbia and they significantly improved the abilities of young journalists to use modern investigative journalism techniques and tools.

The project participants took part in a debate on the role of innovations, new media and digital tools in creating a better future by 2030, at the <u>Social Good Summit</u> on September 23, 2013. This was the first time that UNDP office in Serbia joined the Social Good Summit. Journalists' associations (<u>UNS</u> and <u>NUNS</u>), young sleuths and anticorruption NGOs shared their views on how social media can be used to encourage larger number of citizens to report corruption and how can

social media support mainstream media in creating investigative stories. The Project participants presented their experience with social media during the project and their investigative work.

# **4.3. Political Economy**

Based on its long term cooperation with ACA and insights in local circumstances, the UNDP office in Serbia chose an excellent project that gave a new direction to ACA work.

The project is relevant for national priorities; formulated and implemented within the UNDP mandate – in accordance with the CPD and <u>UN Development Assistance Framework for the Republic of Serbia /UN Country Partnership Strategy for the Republic of Serbia</u>. The planned results and stated outputs are in accordance with the relevant UNDP documents.

Cooperation with the ACA as a national implementation partner was exceptional and the project achieved full involvement from a large number of Agency employees in project implementation and education of young journalists. The ACA was fully engaged in the programme from the selection of the participants to the project implementation and financial reporting. The ACA representatives coordinated and monitored activities of the young sleuths and the NGOs and they were at their disposal for any assistance during the project. During the project, the ACA was publishing investigative stories on social networks.

Improved cooperation between the ACA and NGOs helped the Agency to better perceive how NGOs operate, to further cooperation with civil society, to develop a proactive approach to NGOs, meaning to assign topics that will be analyzed or to emphasize ACA's needs that are clearly defined now. Currently, the ACA is finalizing its own priorities for further NGO involvement with respect to the needs and main concerns of the ACA that will be published on the ACA website.

Having in mind the excellent cooperation with the ACA that was deeply involved in all phases of the project, the Agency should be considered as national implementation partner in future UNDP projects.

Lessons learned through this innovative project enabled the Agency, as a young and relatively new independent state institution in Serbia, to improve its own internal working model. This means that in future the Department for Co-operation with NGOs will consult the Department for Petitions regarding identification of critical corruption concerns and that strategic cooperation with NGOs will be directed to the finding solutions to these important issues. This way they will follow up the *Action Plan for Implementation of the National Anti-Corruption Strategy 2013-2018*.

The project enabled implementation within the framework of the Agency's standards and procedures, through national procedures (NIM) as well as implementation through NGOs.

Slight delays at the beginning of the implementation activities did not influence the project outcomes and duration. Therefore, the project was on target.

During the project, in November 2012, the director of the ACA was replaced, however this did not caused project delays because the national project director was the ACA's Head of International co-operation Department.

In facilitating enrichment of institutional cooperation between one NGO and the Ministry of Health, this was a first step towards further collaboration on new ideas that arose during the project.

The UNDP project has supported development and improvement of the involved NGOs capacities to implement investigative journalism as a means of combatting corruption. This is especially remarkable as two out of the three NGO's did not have previous experience with investigative journalism.

During the evaluation, project participants emphasized that the project had been "a window to the 21 century". The project stimulated these young journalists interest in investigative journalism and the fight against corruption.

The interviewed interlocutors in the ACA pointed out that this project facilitated their learning and represented a useful experience for work improvement and modernization.

# 4.4. Impact

The UNDP project and published stories triggered a direct reaction from Serbian society and state authorities. During the project, youth sleuths (project participants) explored numerous areas that suffer from corruption in Serbia something that had a great impact on Serbian society.

Published investigative stories that arose from this project caused reactions from citizens and state institutions across Serbia. Institutions that reacted were the following: Ministry of Health, the ACA, Public Prosecution Office, Ministry of Interior, as well as public enterprises such as Apoteke Beograd and Infostan, numerous officials, presidents of municipalities, the director of Djerdap National Park. **Published stories initiated actions and procedures among state authorities.** Consequently, criminal charges were filed and criminal proceedings were initiated.

The Ministry of culture filed a criminal complaint to the Prosecutor in August 2013 reacting to the story on abuse of public funds National Museum has been ordered to pay a 2 million euro compensation for a depot it has not used written by the young journalists involved in the project. In addition, the Ministry of Health filed a complaint based on the stories about unlicensed medical equipment. The ACA initiated control of the head of Kovačica municipality and police reacted on the Serbia on the Move stories.

Therefore, it can be concluded that investigative stories, published as the result of this UNDP project, brought significant and evident change in the fight against corruption in Serbia.

The Facebook page "Mi-To ne damo" had 170 likes on April 22<sup>nd</sup> 2014.

Once published, stories were shared widely on social media, raising awareness about the corruption among public at large and triggering interest among journalists of conventional media.

When stories were published, citizens were asking questions on Facebook and youth sleuths were providing answers, hence the **project succeed in establishing social interactions on anti-corruption topics**.

Based on a story published on website Pistaljka.com, ACA has initiated property control of nine government officials. After one story, even the prosecutor office reacted.

Table no. 4: Achieved interest for the fight against corruption among citizens on social media as a result of the investigative stories enabled by the UNDP project

Social Media Coverage	Serbia on	Transparency	Pištaljka	Total	
(Total data)	the Move	Serbia	Ü		
Likes	1.341	19	1.200	2.560	
Seen or shared on Facebook	312.964	5.505	14.000	332.469	
Retweets	102	33	120	2551	

All published stories are still publicly available as well as having been taken over by mainstream media. Pistaljka published the largest number of stories that were shared in the mainstream media such as daily newspapers with national coverage Politika, Kurir, Alo, Blic, Informer, as well as TV Prva. Stories published from the Serbia on the Move had far less success in mainstream media, tough they had success in digital communication because the stories were published on the website <a href="www.kakavjedoktor.org">www.kakavjedoktor.org</a> that is used for evaluation of the health institutions and corruption reports in the health sector. Stories done in the Transparency Serbia also did not reach mainstream media due to the absence of any promotional strategy.

Table no. 5: *Number of investigative stories republished by mainstream media (fully or partially)* 

Republishing in the Media	Pištaljka	Serbia on the Move	Transparenc y Serbia	Total
Republishing stories by Mainstream Media				
(fully or partially)	15	5	1	21
Republishing stories by non-Mainstream				
Media	8	27	0	35
Total Number of Republished Stories in	23			
Media		32	1	56

The project is **catalytic** because it has lead to further projects and initiatives. With this project the UNDP has connected the Public Procurement office and Transparency Serbia through an investigative story of youth sleuths about public procurements and pharmacies Belgrade. Hence, the synergy of two projects was achieved.

17

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Data from the progress report – project number (Atlas): 00082829, prepared by Mr. Žarko Petrović.

In addition, the model of investigative journalism in the NGOs that the project promoted has been recognized as the best practice and re-implemented in the outcome number 5 "Better quality of monitoring and reporting about public finances by NGOs and media" in the project <u>Advancing Accountability Mechanisms in Public Finances</u>.

Regular half-year UNDP corruption surveys in Serbia indicated significant decrease in the levels of corruption, as well as lower perception of corruption among Serbian citizens during the project, in December 2012. The survey conducted in June and December 2013 showed stagnation of the corruption in all areas of the society, except health sectors.

### 4.5. Sustainability

All project outcomes and results are sustainable. After the project, young journalists have continued cooperation with the NGOs that partnered with the UNDP on this project. Specifically, all three project participants have continued cooperation with NGO Pistaljka, a girl, who participated as young sleuth in the project, still works at the Transparency Serbia and one participant has been employed at Center for Investigative Journalism (CINS).

The project contributed to the NGOs development of their investigative journalism knowledge and helped them understand the potential of social media. As a direct outcome of the project, NGOs became more active on social networks. On the other hand, young journalists have improved their analytical capabilities and skills by working at NGOs.

All published stories are still publicly available.

Publishing investigative stories that draw media and citizens' attention to corruption in Serbian society directly correspond to increased number of visits to the ACA website and an increased number of likes on the Agency's Facebook page.

Table no. 6: Growing interest in the fight against corruption among Serbian citizens

Month/year	Number of likes on the ACA's		
	Facebook profile		
December 2012	973		
January 2013	1.173		
February 2013	1.187		
March 2013	1.305		
April 2013	3.090		
May 2013	3.274		
June 2013	3.362		
August 2013	3.488		
September 2013	3.520		
October 2013	3.683		
November 2013	3.737		
December 2013	3.832		

January 2014	3.878
February 2014	3.917
March 2014	9.963

Table no. 7: Increased number of visits to the ACA website

year	number of visits to the ACA website
2011	50.000
2012	207.000
2013	207.044

acas.rs unique users statistics for 2013					
month	unique users	visits	page views		
January	13853	26067	109184		
February	947	1327	5319		
March	19854	52919	183109		
April	13147	23511	85995		
May	7148	11303	39727		
June	7271	11860	43345		
July	7442	12421	44242		
August	5990	9062	30787		
September	7488	11920	42470		
October	9992	15899	58881		
November	9826	14854	55004		
December	8875	15901	59110		
total	111833	207044	757173		

acas.rs unique users statistics for 2014						
month	month unique users visits page views					
January	11182	18967	78432			
February	10010	15749	56495			
March	9440	14830	53539			
subtotal	30632	49546	188466			

Table no. 8: Overview of website visits according to users technologies

Users technology (device category)	visits (total)	visits (2013)
Desktop	447.238	220.041
Mobile	7.582	5.890
Tablet	3.049	1.957

Table no. 9: Number of the website visits by states

Country	visits (total)	visits (2013)
Serbia	433.911	214.246

Bosnia and Herzegovina	6.112	3.187
Montenegro	2.600	1.672
Germany	2.082	1.650
United States	1.707	1.117
Croatia	831	421
(FYROM) Macedonia	637	319
United Kingdom	539	309
Austria	493	304

In addition to investigative journalism, the project enabled synergy of different methods of fighting corruption that were developed during other UNDP projects. For example, a woman, who reported corruption in the health system, was given whistleblower status. This indicates that the ACA reacted to the stories, published by young journalists in conjunction with the NGO, during the project.

SMS service that was introduced in Serbia with UNDP project support has continued to operate after completion of the project. As the best practice, SMS service was taken in the project's anti-corruption activities in the health system (a new project was initiated) and it improved institutional cooperation with the Ministry of Health and enabled further development of joint activities with the Ministry.

SMS service has improved communication between people and institutions, because young journalists directed citizens, who pointed out the problems, to the appropriate authority to whome they can then submit their complaint.

# 5. LESSONS LEARNED

- 1. The project showed how investigative journalism could support responsible authorities. As such, investigative journalism should be embedded in future projects as well.
- 2. All interviewed interlocutors opined that the project was well designed with social networks the appropriate choice for medium. The analysis of visits to social networks' demonstrates that people between 18 and 34 are the most active, thus that the project achieved great synergy between young sleuths' engagement and publishing of stories on social media.
- 3. The stories should be more intensely promoted through broader activities on social networks and websites in order to make them more visible. Stories could be announced in advance on web banners and more specific content about research and stories on corruption could be published as well as logo of all organizations involved. Such announcements would be an opportunity to present the youth sleuths and the project itself. Links at the end of each story leading to other related stories published during the project would contribute to improved connectivity and visibility of the stories. It also would be useful to prepare a special blog.
- 4. Partner NGO's should be involved in the future selection of youth sleuth participants in order to ensure compatibility of interests and participant's satisfaction.

- 5. Feedback from participants indicated that quantitative and qualitative measures would be useful to measure performance and understand expectations. (Whether they should write one comprehensive investigative story or larger number of more narrow stories).
- 6. The program should be promoted more extensively in order to attract a larger number of applicants. Only 15 applications were submitted for this project.
- 7. The time that the young journalists (youth sleuth's) devote to the preparation of investigative stories should be extended beyond the 6 months that they had for this project.
- 8. Taking into account that some NGOs lack editorial experience (except Pistaljka) and that external mentors were not available all the time for direct contact on daily basis, but mostly via email and Skype, it would be useful to rotate the roles, to assign experienced editors to mentor journalists and people from NGO to become external mentors, i.e. young journalists would work directly with editor mentor's with an editorial teams of Investigative Journalism Centre Serbia (CINS) and Balkan Investigative Reporting Network (BIRN) on investigative journalism and these NGOs would be sources of information for investigative stories. The mentors should be more closely involved in project and they should spend more time with the interns.
- 9. It would be useful to consider regular meetings between NGOs involved in the project to improve mutual cooperation. During this project there were significant differences between the three NGOs in terms of operation, capacities and themes and increased coordination between them would be beneficial.
- 10. Four substantial drawbacks are: (1) absence of editorial and reporting experience in two NGOs, (2) lack of public interest in the investigative stories due to their length, (3) lack of appealing titles that would attract attention of mainstream media. In addition, (4) impact of the investigative stories was limited because youth sleuths were not affirmed as journalists and as such did not have the corresponding credibility (their names were not publicly known at the moment of publication of the stories).
- 11. Youth sleuths were not interconnected enough and for that reason they did not become a team and were recognized as NGO associates rather than UNDP youth sleuths.
- 12. At the end of the project, a larger conference or a public hearing could have been organized in order to present project outcomes, stories could have been intensively promoted, as well as youth sleuths. Public hearing (with media support) would enable scrutiny of people that were stated in the investigative stories (directors of public enterprises) on their responsibility in specified corruption cases. This would give legitimacy to the investigative stories and they would gain additional importance and influence in public because they would not represent one-time stories and they role in the society would be acknowledged.
- 13. **Support from the Bratislava Regional Center** through professional trainings and consultations with their experts significantly contributed to the quality and the success of the project. In the interview during the evaluation process, the UNDP office in the Republic of Serbia also indicated importance, usefulness and meaningfulness of the BRC support.

#### 6. CONCLUSION

The project is relevant for national priorities and users' needs; formulated and implemented within the UNDP mandate – in accordance with the CPD and UNDAF for the Republic of Serbia. The planned results and stated outputs are in accordance with the relevant UNDP documents. The project enabled implementation within the framework of the Agency's standards and procedures, through national procedures (NIM) as well as implementation through NGOs.

All the envisaged project activities were realized in full. Trainings in anticorruption issues and investigative journalist techniques and internship opportunities supported further building of professionalism of young journalists to cope with challenging tasks of investigative journalism. During the project, 34 investigative stories and 12 investigative blogs were published. All stories were shared on the Facebook page "Mi To Ne Damo", which gained 170 likes on April 22<sup>nd</sup> 2014. UNDP Serbia facilitated establishment of two open source online systems for information gathering and corruption reporting: (1) SMS Platform for Corruption Reporting Corruption in the Health Sector and (2) Pištaljka's 256-bit encoding of anonymous reporting of corruption for whistleblowers. The project also made possible the preparation of the publication Two years of Protection: Testimonies of Whistleblowers Who Were Granted Protection by the Anti-Corruption Agency, which provided an overview of the situation after two years of the implementation of The Rulebook on the Protection of Whistleblowers, organised in the form of three wholes: (1) the testimonies of whistle-blowers themselves, (2) an analysis of the implementation of the Rulebook in the 2011-2013 period, and (3) recommendations for providing better protection to whistle-blowers in Serbia. The publication is publicly available at the website of the Eutopija / pištaljka [Eutopia / Whistle] association. The Project has produced a comprehensive study on the University curricula in investigative journalism (in Serbia). The study offered ideas and several options for integration of anti-corruption subject for journalists into university education. Journalism experts discussed and supported the study at the conference in December 2013 in Media center in Belgrade.

The project was **innovative** because it included cooperation of state institutions, civil society, as well as media, students and universities. Hence, the UNDP project contributed directly to the implementation of international standards that imposed by ACA obligation (as per international conventions and domestic legislation) to engage civil society in the fight against corruption. The project approach was innovative because it succeeded in using NGO support to avoid mainstream media's allowing it to neutralize political influences that exist in commercial media. In avoiding the mainstream media the project facilitated fairness and objectivity in stories investigating corruption as well as avoided censorship and auto-censorship. Connecting NGO's and young journalists through the use of social media and crowd-sourcing created synergy in the fight against corruption. Trainings provided to the participants during the project were new to Serbia and very innovative and organized for the first time in Serbia and they significantly improved the abilities of young journalists to use modern investigative journalism techniques and tools. The project participants took part in a debate on the role of innovations, new media and digital tools in creating a better future by 2030, at the Social Good Summit on September 23, 2013. This was the first time that UNDP office in Serbia joined the Social Good Summit. Journalists' associations, young

sleuths and anticorruption NGOs shared their views on how social media can be used to encourage larger number of citizens to report corruption and how can social media support mainstream media in creating investigative stories.

Cooperation with the ACA as a national implementation partner was exceptional and the project achieved full involvement from a large number of Agency employees in project implementation and education of young journalists. Having in mind the excellent cooperation with the ACA that was deeply involved in all phases of the project, the Agency should be considered as national implementation partner in future UNDP projects. Lessons learned through this innovative project enabled the Agency, as a young and relatively new independent state institution in Serbia, to improve its own internal working model. This means that in future the Department for Cooperation with NGOs will consult the Department for Petitions regarding identification of critical corruption concerns and that strategic cooperation with NGOs will be directed to the finding solutions to these important issues. This way they will follow up the *Action Plan for Implementation of the National Anti-Corruption Strategy 2013-2018*.

In facilitating enrichment of institutional cooperation between one NGO and the Ministry of Health, this was a first step towards further collaboration on new ideas that arose during the project. The UNDP project has supported development and improvement of the involved NGOs capacities to implement investigative journalism as a means of combatting corruption. This is especially remarkable as two out of the three NGO's did not have previous experience with investigative journalism.

The project stimulated interest for investigative journalism and fight against corruption among young journalists. All stakeholders expressed their satisfaction with the project. They found it precious and very important in the fight against systematic problem of the Serbian society – corruption, as well as for further development of investigative journalism in the country.

The UNDP project and published stories triggered a direct reaction from Serbian society and state authorities. During the project, youth sleuths (project participants) explored numerous areas that suffer from corruption in Serbia something that had a great impact on Serbian society. Published investigative stories that arose from this project caused reactions from citizens and state institutions across Serbia. Consequently, criminal charges were filed and criminal proceedings were initiated. Therefore, it can be concluded that investigative stories, published as the result of this UNDP project, brought significant and evident change in the fight against corruption in Serbia. Once published, stories were shared widely on social media, raising awareness about the corruption among public at large and triggering interest among journalists of conventional media. When stories were published, citizens were asking questions on Facebook and youth sleuths were providing answers, hence the project succeed in establishing social interactions on anticorruption topics. All published stories are still publicly available as well as having been taken over by mainstream media. Pistaljka published the largest number of stories that were shared in the mainstream media such as daily newspapers with national coverage Politika, Kurir, Alo, Blic, Informer, as well as TV Prva.

The project is **catalytic** because it has lead to further projects and initiatives. With this project the UNDP has connected the Public Procurement office and Transparency Serbia through an

investigative story of youth sleuths about public procurements and pharmacies Belgrade. In addition, the model of investigative journalism in the NGOs that the project promoted has been recognized as the best practice and re-implemented in the outcome number 5 "Better quality of monitoring and reporting about public finances by NGOs and media" in the project <u>Advancing Accountability Mechanisms in Public Finances</u>.

All project outcomes and results are **sustainable**. After the project, young journalists have continued cooperation with the NGOs that partnered with the UNDP on this project. Specifically, all three project participants have continued cooperation with NGO Pistaljka, a girl, who participated as young sleuth in the project, still works at the Transparency Serbia and one participant has been employed at Center for Investigative Journalism (CINS). The project contributed to the NGOs development of their investigative journalism knowledge and helped them understand the potential of social media. As a direct outcome of the project, NGOs became more active on social networks. On the other hand, young journalists have improved their analytical capabilities and skills by working at NGOs. SMS service that was introduced in Serbia with UNDP project support has continued to operate after completion of the project. As the best practice, SMS service was taken in the project's anti-corruption activities in the health system (a new project was initiated) and it improved institutional cooperation with the Ministry of Health and enabled further development of joint activities with the Ministry.

Based on the project evaluation, it can be concluded that next, **larger project is needed** in order to further strengthen anti-corruption capacities in Serbia and further develop comprehensive anti-corruption actions that would include both preventive and law enforcement measures.

### 7. RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the project evaluation, it can be concluded that a further, **larger project is necessary** in order to continue to strengthen anti-corruption capacities in Serbia and further develop comprehensive anti-corruption actions that would include both preventive and law enforcement measures. In addition to investigative journalism, new project should:

- 1. Provide institutional support to Serbian universities (state and private) in order to improve investigative journalism curriculum. Lectures delivered by the ACA experts on anti-corruption should be included in existing investigative journalism courses. In addition, the journalism curriculum should include digital storytelling and role of social media in anti-corruption efforts.
- 2. Establish youth sleuths' teams while taking into account the project feedback that stressed that for certain investigative stories expertise on economy or law is needed. As such, applications for the next project should be opened to other faculties of social science so as to form youth sleuths teams to include journalists, lawyers and economists.
- 3. NGOs across Serbia should be included as NGOs specialized in investigative journalism and fighting corruption exist in many other cities (Niš, Prokuplje, Kragujevac, etc.). This would engage local levels of societies in the fight against corruption and expand the fight against corruption to the national level.

- 4. Implementing video journalism training in order to encourage investigative video journalism so as to attract more attention from the public as visual aids tend to have more of an impact upon the public than written articles. It would be useful to train young journalists to create, edit and upload footage (multimedia approach). This has not been practice in Serbia and it was implemented by New York Times that brought about a revolution in investigative journalism people trust their eyes (they trust more in video rather than statements in an article written by unknown young person).
- 5. Introduction of internships for students of journalism at the NGOs that were involved in this project. This would improve students' capabilities as investigative journalists as well as aid in the fight against corruption. Such internships would provide valuable, on the job training to students who indicated a lack of formative skills. Students indicate that they do not know how it looks like working in a newsroom and what investigative journalism really means.
- 6. Support the Faculty of Political Science to develop a website dedicated to publishing students' investigative stories.
- 7. Wider campaign with publications, TV commercials, billboards in order to raise awareness among the public at large of the importance of preventing corruption. Currently people are largely only attracted to stories of corruption if accompanied by media headlines and big arrests. Greater exposure to the fight against corruption through a wider national campaign is needed to educate the public about the issue.
- 8. Involving Members of the National Assembly (MPs) and strengthening the role of the National Assembly in developing corruption prevention mechanisms in Serbia.
- 9. Support the ACA in 2015 aiming at successful evaluation of harmonization and implemented measures towards fulfilment of UNCAC standards and Convention (Chapter II), because interviewees during the evaluation process pointed out exact need for such support.
- 10. SMS service for corruption notification in health care system (provided by UNDP project support) showed that 50% of complainants report corruption in other areas of society. When they find out that SMS service is dedicated to the health care system only, they ask how they can report other form of corruption. Since, similar service does not exist in Serbia it would be useful to provide project support for development of SMS service systems for other public sectors with a high perceived level of corruption. This could be done through strengthening the capacity of NGOs' that are engaged in the fight against corruption in the judiciary, the education system or the health care system. Interconnecting NGO's would provide support and encourage the sharing of successful practices.
- 11. It would be useful to engage NGOs in ACA projects, keeping in mind that this cooperation is binding according to international conventions and domestic legislation.
- 12. The Anti-Corruption Agency should be supported in the publication of a professional and popular bulletin. This has been planned and needed for a long period of time but has yet to be realized.

- 13. Support the educational system in Serbia in order to enhance the *Civil education* curriculum in elementary and high schools with ethics and integrity in order to establish mechanisms for corruption prevention.
- 14. In order to achieve the previous, a special "train the trainer" education sessions on anticorruption should be organized for elementary and high school teachers of *Civil education*.
- 15. Aiming to increase the influence of the investigative stories and to change perception, and consequently behavior of the citizens, more attention should be devoted to the creation of investigative stories (i.e. editor should prepare a plan and dynamic before stories creation and this would improve promotion of stories, their visibility and their influence on larger audience).
- 16. Aiming at better organization, it would be useful to create an internship program or guidelines for participants with clear objectives, tasks, roles, time frames and phases: 1. education; 2. themes selection analysis of potential stories; 3. investigative work; 4. promotion, visibility, production and influence.
- 17. In further projects, the structure of reports on project implementation and progress that NGOs prepare should be standardized by developing reporting guidelines in order to avoid paraphrasing activities and returns of reports for qualitative improvement.
- 18. There is a need for larger scale projects directed towards supporting anticorruption efforts in Serbia as an adequate response to the needs of the Republic of Serbia.

#### 8. APPENDICES

#### 8.1. EVALUATION MATRIX

Criteria	Questions to be addressed by evaluation	What to look for	Data sources	Data collection methods
Effectiveness	To what extent has the DGTTF project achieved its objectives?	Were stated outputs achieved? Number of young journalists selected. Number of NGOs selected. Number of investigative stories and investigative blogs published.	Project progress reports, website, project stakeholders, project documentation, final report	Review, interviews
	In what ways is the project innovative? Which innovative approaches have proven to be most effective?	New source – online gathering and dissemination of information on corruption established. The use of social media and crowd-sourcing – new feature in Serbia. Connecting NGOs and young journalists created synergy of purpose	Knowledge products produced by the project, project documentation, project stakeholders, final report, reports, stakeholders	Review, interviews

	What type of internal and external problems	in fighting corruption. Establishment of two open source online systems for gathering information and reporting corruption (SMS Platform for Reporting Corruption in the Health Sector and Pištaljka's 256-bit encoding of anonymous reporting of corruption for whistleblowers system).  Director of the Leading implementation partner	Project reports, project board,	Review, interviews
	has the project faced and how has it coped with them?  Is there evidence that the results extended beyond the individual project?	(AC Agency) changed.  The impact of stories/information on society and government. Number of selected young journalists working in NGOs.	project management Websites	Review, interviews
	To what extent has the project had a catalytic effect, substantially, financially and in terms of development and/or strengthening of partnerships?	Connecting NGOs and young journalists; Created synergy of purpose in fighting corruption; Young journalists and NGOs are better able to cope with challenging tasks of investigative journalism. The Government reacted as a result of the Project activities.	Knowledge products produced by the project, project stakeholders, project reports	Interviews, review
Political Economy	What was the political context? How did the political context in the country at the time of project implementation affect that commitment of national partners to the project?	Country context, new Government, independent bodies. Was the project within the UNDP's mandate? Were stated outputs in accordance with CPD and UNDAF for the Republic of Serbia?	Project document, Country Programme Document, UN Development Assistance Framework for the Republic of Serbia /UN Country Partnership Strategy for the Republic of Serbia	Review
	What was the institutional set up and degree of autonomy/dependence of the partner institution in relation to others?	Independent bodies, ACA. Did the ACA participate in the decision making process during the implementation of the Project? A part of the project's implementation was realized through national procedures (NIM) + NGO implementation.	Selection of young journalists and NGOs; Selection of topics.	Review, interviews

	XX71		C'	I •.
	Who were the key	Anticorruption Agency;	Citizens feedback,	review,
	local and national	UNDP Serbia – Project	book of comments	interviews
	stakeholders? What	Team; National consultants		
	was the overall	and experts; NGOs; Young	reports, minutes	
	mapping of project	investigative journalists		
	stakeholders including	(youth sleuths).		
	local and national	Have mutual cooperation		
	stakeholders,	and coordination with		
	international partners,	other international		
	bilateral or	organization and		
	multilateral	stakeholders who support		
	organizations? What	enhancing anticorruption		
	were their interests	efforts in Serbia		
	and incentives? What	(established to avoid		
	was their ability to	activities overlapping and		
	promote these	to plan activities on the one		
	interests through	hand, and to jointly		
	formal or informal	organize some activities,		
	channels?	on the other) existed?		
	Chamilets:	ŕ		
	How did policies	How decisions were made?	Government cost-	Review,
	and/or institutional	How did that affect the	sharing	interviews
	and governance	project results? Whether	agreements.	
	arrangements affect	Project Board existed and	project team	
	the project	was it operational/efficient	I J	
	performance and	etc. Political highest-level		
	attainment (or non-	commitment to fight		
	attainment) of results?	corruption.		
Sustainability	What measures have	Have activities continued	Project	Review,
Sustamability	been taken to ensure		stakeholders,	interviews
		after the end of the project?  Number of young		interviews
	the sustainability of		project reports	
	the achievements of	journalists. Republishing		
	the project?	Stories and Blogs by		
		Mainstream Media (fully or		
		partially). Number of likes,		
		seen or shared posts on		
		Facebook, and Twitter.		
	To what extent did	Did ACA participate in	Project document	Review, interviews
	national partners feel	young journalists and	Project	
	that they "owned" the	NGOs selection process? A	stakeholders,	
	project? How have	part of the project's	ACA, UNDP:	
	issues of ownership	implementation was	Project team	
	and participation of	realized through national		
	target groups/clients	procedures (NIM) + NGO	rely heavily on	
	been addressed both in	implementation. Was the	national processes,	
	the formulation and	project relevant to national	procedures and	
	implementation of	priorities and beneficiary	capacities	
	project? What should	needs? Did stated outputs	capacities	
İ				
	be done differently?	adequately respond to the real needs of beneficiaries?		

Did the project	Number of young	Number of website   Site visit, review
continue without	investigative journalists.	visits; number of
further DGTTF	Are web pages and	media reports
funding?	investigative blogs	regarding
	continued after the project	corruption.
	ended? The visible	Number of likes,
	government anti-corruption	seen or shared
	efforts have led to the	posts on Facebook,
	decrease in public	and Twitter.
	perception of corruption.	

#### 8.2. STAKEHOLDERS LIST

- 1. Young investigative journalists (youth sleuths)
- 2. NGOs
- 3. Anticorruption Agency
- 4. National consultants and experts
- 5. UNDP Serbia Project Team

#### 8.3. EXAMINED DOCUMENTATION LIST

- 1. Project Document
- 2. Standard Basic Framework Agreement (SBBA)
- 3. Common Country Assessment (CCA)
- 4. United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF)
- 5. Country Programme Documents (CPD)
- 6. Signed Country Programme Action Plan (CPAP)
- 7. Project proposal
- 8. Project budget
- 9. Guidelines for competition OCD 2012- CIR-1
- 10. Banner
- 11. Criteria for students' selection
- 12. Advertisment for html
- 13. Guidlines for competition OCD 2013- CIR-1
- 14. +Files for application and details of the application \_201012\_NR
- 15. +Draft criteria for selection 201012 ENG
- 16. COMPETITION
- 17. Final draft Youth Sleuth Report
- 18. STATISTICS
- 19. Youth Sleuth Final Report
- 20. AC\_DGTTF May 30-2012\_Serbia final
- 21. PRODOC signed
- 22. Project Board Meeting Minutes YouthSleuth 16 July 2012
- 23. Project Board Meeting Minutes YouthSleuth 18 June 2013
- 24. Project Board Meeting Minutes YouthSleuth 24 July 2013
- 25. Project Board Meeting Minutes YouthSleuth 25 Oct 201
- 26. Project Board Meeting Minutes YouthSleuth 26 Dec 2013

- 27. Agenda SGS 23 Sept 2013
- 28. Introduction
- 29. List of Invited Participants to Meet up
- 30. Meet up Concept for Social Good Summit
- 31. Moderation Topics
- 32. Social Good Summit 2013-final
- 33. 9 young journalists
- 34. Anticorruption Blog
- 35. Blog for Youth Sleuth2
- 36. For Francesco
- 37. EutopiaOffer
- 38. Note for the File draft
- 39. Agency's support
- 40. Confirmation of the Ministry of Justice
- 41. Final ToR W-blower analysis
- 42. +DataDrivenJournalism
- 43. +Digital\_Reporting
- 44. +Report\_DataDrivenJournalism\_8\_12\_4\_2013
- 45. Report -Investigative journalism
- 46. Report Mechanisms for corruption prevention in Serbia 19-21 February
- 47. Two years of Protection: Testimonies of Whistleblowers Who Were Granted Protection by the Anti-Corruption Agency

### 8.4. WEBSITES

http://pistaljka.rs/

http://www.transparentnost.org.rs

http://www.srbijaupokretu.org

http://www.acas.rs/

http://www.rs.undp.org/serbia/en/home.html

http://doublecrosscorruption.tumblr.com

https://www.facebook.com/MiToNeDamo

www.prijavikorupciju.rs

http://doublecrosscorruption.tumblr.com/post/48689616086/jedan-poziv-ne-menja-sve http://doublecrosscorruption.tumblr.com/post/52133396252/borba-protiv-korupcije-i-jacanje-kontrole-javnih

http://doublecrosscorruption.tumblr.com/post/52376006481/depolitizacija-javnog-sektora http://doublecrosscorruption.tumblr.com/post/53841618266/dve-balerine-i-jednog-rezaka-natender

http://pistaljka.rs/home/read/338

http://pistaljka.rs/home/read/357

http://pistaljka.rs/blog/read/17/

http://pistaljka.rs/blog/read/16/

http://pistaljka.rs/home/read/372

http://pistaljka.rs/home/read/349

http://pistaljka.rs/blog/read/15/

http://pistaljka.rs/home/read/370

http://pistaljka.rs/home/read/363

http://blog.kakavjedoktor.org/

http://pistaljka.rs/home/read/379

http://pistaljka.rs/home/read/380

http://pistaljka.rs/home/read/383

http://pistaljka.rs/home/read/385

http://pistaljka.rs/home/read/384

http://pistaljka.rs/home/read/390

http://pistaljka.rs/home/read/389

http://pistaljka.rs/home/read/388

http://pistaljka.rs/home/read/387

http://pistaljka.rs/home/read/394

http://pistaljka.rs/home/read/395

http://pistaljka.rs/home/read/398

http://pistaijka.is/floine/read/396

http://pistaljka.rs/home/read/386

http://doublecrosscorruption.tumblr.com/

http://www.transparentnost.org.rs/index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=338%3Afondu-rauni-apotekama-popusti-

&catid=14%3Avesti&Itemid=1&lang=srhttp://www.transparentnost.org.rs/index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=333%3Adravni-organi-deset-godina-nemi-na-nesprovoenjezakona&catid=14%3Avesti&Itemid=1&lang=sr

http://www.transparentnost.org.rs/index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=335%3Aapoteka-beograd-i-posle-primene-trai-rupe-u-zakonu&catid=14%3Avesti&Itemid=1&lang=sr

http://blog.kakavjedoktor.org/2013/03/28/pravo-vreme-za-prava-pacijenata/

http://blog.kakavjedoktor.org/2013/03/31/pacijenti-kao-beli-medvedi/

http://blog.kakavjedoktor.org/2013/04/04/gradani-nezadovoljni-zdravstvenom-uslugom-a-neznaju-kome-da-se-zale/

http://blog.kakavjedoktor.org/2013/04/04/zoran-milovanovic-aktivista-i-humanitarac/

http://blog.kakavjedoktor.org/2013/04/08/pacijente-treba-ohrabriti/

http://blog.kakavjedoktor.org/2013/04/09/lidija-zlatanovic-zivot-za-zdravlje/

http://blog.kakavjedoktor.org/2013/04/12/korupcija-upucivanje-pacijenata-na-privatnu-praksu-2/

http://blog.kakavjedoktor.org/2013/04/13/da-li-su-pacijenti-u-domovima-zdravlja-zaista-postedeni-trazenja-mita/

http://blog.kakavjedoktor.org/2013/04/26/zakon-o-zastiti-prava-pacijenata-u-skupstini-a-procedura-koja-prethodi-nedovoljno-ispostovana/

http://blog.kakavjedoktor.org/2013/06/12/korumpirani-lekari-kaznjeni-ispod-minimuma/

http://blog.kakavjedoktor.org/2013/06/12/od-studentske-poliklinike-do-privatne-prakse/

http://blog.kakavjedoktor.org/2013/06/12/intervju-sa-direktorkom-studentske-poliklinike-dr-dubravkom-miljus/

http://blog.kakavjedoktor.org/2013/07/31/prvi-rezultati-sms-servisa-za-prijavu-korupcije-u-zdravstvu/

http://blog.kakavjedoktor.org/2013/08/12/kandidat-dobio-posao-iako-ga-komisija-nije-uvrstila-u-uzi-izbor/

http://blog.kakavjedoktor.org/2013/10/23/zamena-aparata-bez-znanja-osnivaca-upravnog-odbora-i-komisije-za-javne-nabavke/

http://blog.kakavjedoktor.org/2013/10/23/u-stanovima-9-godina-zive-ljudi-koji-na-njih-nemaju-pravo/

http://www.blic.rs/Kultura/Vesti/373583/Na-depo-baceno--dva-miliona-evra

http://www.kurir-info.rs/bruka-placaju-dva-miliona-evra-za-depo-koji-ne-koriste-clanak-710277

http://www.e-novine.com/kultura/kultura-tema/81148-Dva-miliona-evra-nekorieni-depo.html

http://www.novimagazin.rs/vesti/narodni-muzej-placa-dva-miliona-evra-za-depo-koji-nikad-nije-korisen

http://www.naslovi.net/2013-03-22/e-novine/dva-miliona-evra-za-nekorisceni-depo/5068496 http://www.naslovi.net/tema/486154

http://www.vesti.rs/Vesti/BRUKA-Placaju-dva-miliona-evra-za-depo-koji-ne-koriste.html

http://www.newsbcc.com/%D0%A1%D1%80%D0%B1%D0%B8%D1%98%D0%B0/%D0%97

<u>%D0%B0%D0%B1%D0%B0%D0%B2%D0%B0/Na\_depo\_ba%C4%8Deno\_dva\_miliona\_evra</u>/182388/

http://www.zajednoprotivkorupcije.org/category/novosti/

http://www.vesti-novine.com/vecnici-nisu-prijavili-imovinu/

http://www.energyobserver.com/vesti.php?lang=1&ID=40211

http://www.cins.rs/srpski

#### 8.5. INTERVIEWED INTERLOCUTORS LIST

# National project director:

1. Ms. Milica Božanić, Head of International co-operation Department, Anti-Corruption Agency (ACA)

#### **UNDP-** Project management:

- 2. Ms. Jelena Manić Petronikolos, Programme Analyst, UNDP, Good Governance
- 3. Mr. Žarko Petrović, Portfolio Manager, Rule of Law and Access to Justice, UNDP

#### Anti-Corruption Agency (ACA):

- 4. Ms. Marijana Obradović, Assistant Director for Prevention;
- 5. Ms. Ivana Tosović, Advisor in International Cooperation Department;
- 6. Ms. Ksenija Mitrović, Advisor
- 7. Mr. Miodrag Škundrić, Advisor
- 8. Ms. Lidija Kujundžić, Head of Public Relations Department

#### Transparency Serbia

- 9. Mr. Danilo Pejović
- 10. Ms. Bojana Medenica
- 11. Mr. Nemanja Nenadić

#### Serbia on the Move (Srbija u pokretu)

- 12. Ms. Ana Babović
- 13. Mr. Predrag Stojčić

# Eutopija / Pištaljka

- 14. Mr. Vladimir Radomirović
- 15. Ms. Dragana Matović

# Young investigative journalists (youth sleuths)

- 16. Ms. Maša Lujić
- 17. Ms. Milica Jović
- 18. Ms. Sonja Gočanin
- 19. Mr. Novak Grujić
- 20. Ms. Snežana Đurić
- 21. Mr. Ivan Perović
- 22. Ms. Natalija Divac
- 23. Ms. Nevena Cukucan
- 24. Ms. Bojana Pavlović

# National consultants and experts

- 25. Ms. Nevena Ršumović
- 26. Mr. Branko Čečen