

Stakeholder mapping analysis: report on consultation workshop feedback for West New Britain

Development of REDD+ Stakeholder Engagement Plans in East New Britain, West New Britain and
Madang Provinces of Papua New Guinea

Wildlife Conservation Society
December 2018

This project is funded by the Forest Carbon Partnership Facility, undertaken by the Wildlife Conservation Society in partnership with FORCERT and the Research and Conservation Foundation, and overseen by the FCPF REDD+ Project of the United Nations Development Program.

For more information contact:
Dr Ambroise Brenier abrenier@wcs.org

Country Director
Wildlife Conservation Society – Papua New Guinea Program



Introduction

A series of consultation workshops were held in November 2018 to present and gain provincial feedback on the Stakeholder Engagement Mapping and Analysis report drafted by the Wildlife Conservation Society. This represents the third deliverable of a project, coordinated by the Climate Change and Development Authority (CCDA), aimed at accelerating the implementation of PNG’s National REDD+ Strategy through ensuring the effective participation of key stakeholders in three pilot provinces (East New Britain, West New Britain, and Madang) via the development of province specific Stakeholder Engagement Plans and tools.

To introduce the project to provincial stakeholders, an inception workshop was held in the three pilot provinces in June 2018. Then, surveys were conducted in the three provinces between August and October 2018 to understand current stakeholder engagement, as it related to REDD+ preparedness. The results of these surveys, involving over 800 stakeholders, were compiled into a Stakeholder Engagement Mapping and Analysis report which was then circulated in November for feedback.

Presented here is a brief report on the consultation workshop recently held in West New Britain province, at Genesis Haven Lodge, Kimbe, on Tuesday 6th November 2018 (12pm –4.30 pm) to present the results of the stakeholder mapping and analysis.

Objective of the workshop

The objective of this consultation workshop was to invite provincial authorities and key stakeholders to view and comment on the finding and recommendations of the stakeholder mapping and analysis surveys conducted in West New Britain province.

Participation and program

FORCERT undertook the advanced planning of the workshop. A total of 34 provincial participants were invited but only 22 materialised. Some of the stakeholders invited to the workshop did not attend and no reasons were given as to their lack of attendance. A total of 28 people attended the consultation workshops. See Annex 1 for the full list of participants and the organisations they represented. Owing to issues relating to flight times and confusion over the location of the workshop (in Kimbe there are confusingly two accommodation facilities with the name ‘Genesis’) the workshop observers arrived towards the end of the workshop.

Role (West New Britain)	Date	Female	Male
Observers	6-Nov-18	1	2
Organisers	6-Nov-18	1	2
Participants	6-Nov-18	8	14
Total	-	10	18

Lunch was provided in order to encourage participation and allow a time buffer for attendees to arrive. The meeting began with formal introductions by all participants just after 1pm. Lester Seri from WCS then preceded by formally opening the meeting and welcoming the attendees. He said some words of appreciation to the West New Britain Provincial Government and other stakeholders for making time available to attend the consultation workshop. At the conclusion of

the opening statements Nathan Whitmore proceeded with a power point presentation which was separated into three stages. At the end of each stage participants were given the opportunity to ask questions, make comments or ask for clarifications. The three stages were:

1. Background about REDD+, the stakeholder engagement project, and the results of the recent survey covering:
 - *An analysis of provincial engagement networks* which demonstrated that the Provincial Administration would be the single most important group for facilitating the interchange of information around REDD+ within the Province.
 - *An analysis of provincial typology* which demonstrated that there were so many similarities between the three provinces that there is no evidence to suggest separate training plans needed to be developed for each province. However, the analysis showed while there is much overlap, the provinces fall along a gradient with Madang and West New Britain being the least similar provinces. As a consequence it was suggested that while a single set of REDD+ tools could be produced as part of the project they use should be adapted to the local provincial conditions.
 - *An analysis of the key predictors in relation to REDD+ preparedness* which revealed that experience (age) and education were the best predictors of preparedness in individuals. Landowners were identified as the group least prepared for REDD+ implementation.
 - *An analysis of rural village concerns* which demonstrated major concern of village stakeholders was focused around issues associated with cash crop livelihoods. Many were concerned with the lack of assistance in terms of agricultural extension services, lack of advice on pest control, and deteriorating infrastructure relating to transport and markets.
2. The major impediments to REDD+ implementation identified by the survey
3. The draft recommendations of the report

Following the presentation the participants were separated into three groups and asked to give feedback on the six draft recommendations of the report. All participants had an opportunity to share their thoughts on the presented recommendations and make comments. Lester Seri and Nathan Whitmore of WCS, and Pamela Avusi of FORCERT acted as facilitators and scribes. In addition to the feedback given at the workshop participants were invited to submit any further comments to WCS by email. The feedback from each province was then aggregated and annotated in a table (see Feedback: West New Britain below) from which an overall feedback summary was made (See Annex 2). Based on this process a revised list of recommendations was made (see Annex 3). The Kimbe workshop finished around 4.30 pm.

Feedback: West New Britain

[Comments have been edited for clarity]

Ref	Theme	Within TOR	Province	REDD+ Action (within this project)	Stakeholder Recommendation	Stakeholder Feedback
1	Recommendation 1	yes	WNB	Inform CCDA PCCC is yet to activate	Letter required to get PCCC started	Letter to provincial administration to get PCCC started
2	Recommendation 4 & cross cutting	yes	WNB	Pre-existing networks need to be harnessed (church, agriculture and forestry)	Use church networks	The church partnership program in which each church has a strategic plan for climate change which are already aligned with the direction of provincial government
3	Recommendation 4 & cross cutting	yes	WNB	Pre-existing networks need to be harnessed (church, agriculture and forestry)	Use church networks	Large church meetings can use provincial officers to disseminate information
4	Recommendation 4	yes	WNB	Pre-existing networks need to be harnessed (church, agriculture and forestry)	Use church networks	Churches have specific groups for the voice of the vulnerable including women and youth e.g. Liklik Katholik Kommunti.
5	Recommendation 6	yes	WNB	Target chamber of commerce in order to involve businesses	Chamber of commerce should be targeted.	Chamber of commerce should be targeted.
6	National governance	no	WNB	No change (as outside of TOR)	ILG act needs to be amended	ILG act needs to be amended so as to include more women representatives.
7	Recommendation 5	yes	WNB	No change (pre-existing in current recommendations)	Capacity of LLG and wards needs to be increased about climate change and land-use planning and ward development.	Capacity of LLG and wards needs to be increased about climate change and land-use planning and ward development.
8	Cross cutting	yes	WNB	Social media, especially Facebook, to be advocated as a communication mechanism	Use of social media	Program should attempt to use social media especially Facebook
9	Recommendation 4	yes	WNB	Gender parity to be a goal within this project's	Sex segregated workshops	Female participation needs to be increased

				capacity development program		
10	Recommendation 4	yes	WNB	Share gender inclusive successes from industry	Share gender inclusive successes from industry	Mama lus frut - sharing knowledge from NBPOL & industry e.g. mama card
11	Recommendation 1	yes	WNB	No change (pre-existing in current recommendations)	Comment only	Representatives of NGOs and private sector, church already on PCCC
12	Cross cutting	no	WNB	Provincial government needs to be mindful of issues around creating silos	Provincial government needs to be mindful of issues around creating silos	Environment and climate change unit in WNB a potential silo
13	Cross cutting	no	WNB	No change (as outside of TOR)	Outside TOR	Need provincial DAL in cooperation with DAL to have an agricultural retreat.
14	Recommendation 1	yes	WNB	Internal protocols, projects, contact points, and jurisdictions within subnational government have to be mapped	Protocols need to be established	Need MOU for protocols for Provincial government
15	Communication	yes	WNB	Pre-existing networks need to be harnessed (church, agriculture and forestry)	Use of field days by business for outreach	Possibly using field days by business for REDD+ outreach
16	Communication	yes	WNB	Pre-existing networks for women and vulnerable groups need to be harnessed (church, agriculture and forestry)	Use provincial council of women	PNG provincial council of women already in existence
17	Communication	yes	WNB	Identify cross cutting REDD+ issues already being implemented by industry	Identify pre-existing REDD+ activities businesses are already engaging in	NBPOL operates an outreach fire program because it is both concern about threats to its business and reputation, as well as the wellbeing of the wider community
18	Recommendation 1	yes	WNB	Inform CCDA PCCC is yet to activate	Establish PCCC in WNB	PCCC not established
19	Communication	yes	WNB	No change (pre-existing in current recommendations)	Use simplified language	Make appropriate information on REDD+ in simplified language
20	Budget	no	WNB	No change (as outside of TOR)	Funding of PCCC has to be delineated	Need to mobilise fund to establish PCCC
21	Governance	no	WNB	No change (as outside of TOR)	A provincial REDD+ policy	Need to develop a provincial REDD+ policy

TOR)						
22	Recommendation 5	yes	WNB	No change (pre-existing in current recommendations)	Support of recommendation 5	Need process / mechanisms to facilitate community engagement, particularly for mobilization
23	Land-use	no	WNB	No change (as outside of TOR)	A provincial REDD+ policy and land-use policy required	Need a provincial land-use policy and land-use plan
24	Land-use	no	WNB	No change (as outside of TOR)	Provincial GIS system required	Need a provincial GIS system
25	Land-use	yes	WNB	No change (pre-existing in current recommendations)	Support of recommendation 5	Need appropriate education materials on land-use planning to work
26	Recommendation 5	yes	WNB	No change (pre-existing in current recommendations)	Support of recommendation 5	Need to develop education materials to increase the role of women in development initiatives
27	Recommendation 5	yes	WNB	No change (pre-existing in current recommendations)	Support of recommendation 6	Need to establish mechanisms to develop appropriate education materials to inform: landowners, stakeholders, on FPIC and land-use planning
28	Governance	no	WNB	No change (as outside of TOR)	GRM required	Need to establish a grievance redress mechanism
29	Recommendation 5	yes	WNB	No change (pre-existing in current recommendations)	Support of recommendation 5	Need to educate landowners on rights, protocols, and development approval procedures
30	Recommendation 6	yes	WNB	No change (pre-existing in current recommendations)	Support of recommendation 6	More appropriate educational awareness on REDD+ direction in PNG and province.
31	Budget	no	WNB	Subnational budget needs to be outlined in RFIP	Funding of PCCC has to be delineated	For PCCC to work, it has to be captured in the ward development plans and the Provincial cooperate plans. This can be headed by the planning division and the Community development office. PCCC does not have an office, so the provincial government will have to factor that into their operational budget so it has an office and resource persons. now it only has board members. The Provincial Management Unit must be convinced to endorse the budget because it has the authority. PMU will direct all stakeholders to implement climate change and REDD+ activities in the province. Otherwise, who will fund the awareness and who will carry out the awareness?
32	Budget	no	WNB	Subnational budget needs to be outlined in RFIP	Funding of PCCC has to be delineated as well as	The question is who will fund the PCCC and who will carry out the awareness.

					responsibilities	
33	Recommendation 1	yes	WNB	Advocate for developing overarching Provincial Sustainable Development Committees	Establish overarching Provincial Sustainable Development Committees.	With revisions coming up in both Climate Change Management Act and Forestry Act in 2019, there is the possibility of establishing overarching Provincial Sustainable Development Committees.
34	Recommendation 2	no	WNB	No change (as outside of TOR)	Vertical integration of land-use planning	Focus should be on Provincial Administration together with the District Development Authorities to undertake this. These two authorities should also develop plans on how to engage with and involve the LLGs on. Additional recommendations: NSLUP to include bottom up community/Ward level sustainable land use planning, combined into LLG and District LUPs. Top-down national level LUP to be informative and guiding, assisting District & LLGs in their technical assistance to Wards/communities to undertake sustainable LUP. Districts to get Sustainable LUP officers (male and female team), and same for LLG's. Government to work with experienced NGO's to train and guide these officers.
35	Recommendation 4	no	WNB	No change (as outside of TOR)	Male and female sustainable land-use planning officers teams should be required at District & LLG level	See suggestion above on male and female sustainable LUP Officers teams at District & LLG level
36	Recommendation 5	yes	WNB	While desirable such a recommendation is likely to economically impractical unless the project is sufficiently large to trigger a number of social and environmental safeguards	Information and trusted sources to provide information	FPIC on actual positive and negative long term economic, environmental and social impacts of any proposed land use, provided by independent and trusted sources.
37	Recommendation 2	no	WNB	No change (as outside of TOR)	Stakeholder integration to be vertically integrated	Policy and implementation planning development at all levels of government to include extensive stakeholder consultation, with participation of civil society and lower levels of government down to Ward Members.
38	Recommendation 5	yes	WNB	No change (as outside of TOR)	ILGs are not to be mandatory for involvement in REDD+	Awareness at all government levels and community level of the pros and cons of ILGs. ILGs not to be made a requirement for involvement in any REDD+ related support programs.

Annex 1: List and contact details of participants

Ref	Name	Organisation	Role	Contact details	Sex
1	Terence Barambi	CCDA	Observer	larsonwavi@gmail.com	M
2	Samson Kupale	UNDP	Observer	73413816	M
3	Lydia Nenai Bobola	UNDP	Observer	75208208	F
4	Pamela Avusi	FORCERT	Organiser	72886354	F
5	Nathan Whitmore	WCS	Organiser	72284379	M
6	Lester Seri	WCS	Organiser	75767714	M
7	Simon Kamerol	Anglican Church	Participant	73239133	M
8	Stacey Raphael	Caritas	Participant	74423269	F
9	Pauline Jilius	Catholic Church	Participant	70661316	F
10	Hugo Kuvord Oic	Coco Board	Participant	74319669	M
11	Ben Drius	FORCERT	Participant	9834440	M
12	Lazarus Peka	FORCERT	Participant	72797982	M
13	Loretta Abraham	FORCERT	Participant	71222353	F
14	Esther Mata	FORCERT	Participant	79600846	F
15	Ranus Simpson	KIK	Participant	73104919	M
16	Benjamin Sipia	Live & Learn	Participant	72801209	M
17	Dianna Mirio	NBPOL Sustainability	Participant	72570760	F
18	Wilfred Tangole	NBPOL Smallholder affairs	Participant	71822298	M
19	Frasure Bmini	NBPOL Smallholders	Participant	71799153	M
20	Harold Rawei	WNB Culture & Tourism	Participant	72661895	M
21	Theodora Maea	WNB Development Forum	Participant	72881819	F
22	Desmond Mondo Vaghelo	WNB provincial administration	Participant	73644026	M
23	Jeremiah Sokiam	WNB provincial administration	Participant	72150583	M
24	Steven Manasaplo	WNBPA DAL	Participant	71895122	M
25	Jerry Taratia	WNBPA DAL	Participant	79339021	M
26	Desmond	WNBPA	Participant		M
27	Maristella	WNBPA Fisheries Authority	Participant	79881239	F
28	Stephanie Tangole	WNBPA UNDP	Participant	7228974	F

Annex 2: Feedback all provinces combined

Based on the feedback received from the consultation workshops and from direct submission from various institutions (see Annex 4) we have altered the Stakeholder Engagement Mapping and Analysis report in a number of respects. The major points are summarised below:

Barriers to provincial implementation of REDD+

Participants at the consultation workshops identified that there were a number of jurisdictional challenges with regard to PCCC including a lack of budgetary support, no clear statutory mandate for its existence, and no linkages or protocols for enforcement and compliance with executing line agencies. In most cases provincial administrations are waiting for both a letter from CCDA to activate the committee and for CCDA to clarify the role of the PCCC. Of the three provinces Madang has the most advanced PCCC with the committee having already been formed.

The authors of this report are concerned that the PCCC is a separate body to the Provincial Forestry Management Committee (PFMC), which is the legislated provincial consultative body that advises on forestry projects. The PFMC is charged with coordination on forest management under the Forestry Act 1991:

Section 30:

- (a) *to provide a forum for consultation and co-ordination on forest management between the National Government and Provincial Governments, forest resource owners and special interest groups*

but the Provincial Climate Change Committee's role, outlined by CCDA's stipulated Terms of Reference, is charged with provincial sector coordination elements which align with REDD+:

Function 4:

- (4.1) *Provincial Sectoral Coordination: promote coordination, integration and facilitation among sectors such as but not restricted to agriculture, fishery, forestry, water resource, transport, climate induced migration, human settlement and infrastructure, to ensure a holistic approach to climate change adaptation and mitigation including eco-system friendly measures.*
- (4.4) *Support adaptation and mitigation programs, projects and reform initiatives that reduce greenhouse gas emissions.*

Given that REDD+ is a primarily a forest management mechanism we suggest that such jurisdictional overlap is counterproductive and will inevitably lead to confusion. Not only is sectoral alignment in land-use planning required for REDD+ but other PNG national government initiatives such as the National Strategy For Responsible Sustainable Development (StaRS) and the PNG Protected Area Policy presumably require similar alignments. As a result we advocate that the government of Papua New Guinea investigates the practicality of establishing a singular multi-stakeholder consultative body in each province tasked with screening plans for large scale development, forestry, agriculture, and infrastructure projects ensuring that they follow legislated protocols and are consistent with provincial and national land-use policies. Many workshop participants suggested that such a body could be named the Provincial Sustainable Development Committee.

Additionally, many participants voiced concerns over how REDD+ initiatives including the PCCC were going to be funded. In this regard we suggest the forthcoming REDD+ Finance and Investment Plan should clearly outline the subnational budget allocations. Some participants advocated that provinces need to develop individual REDD+ policies, however, we suggest that what may be required, as a first step, is a national guidance document authored by the Department of National Planning and Monitoring, which outlines how development decisions should be resolved when there are conflicting land-use plans, concessions, or permits in play.

It is clear that the largest barrier to the successful implementation of REDD+ at the provincial level is a highly convoluted and bureaucratic system of often poorly linked governance structures. Such poorly connected systems can be expected to lead to information silos. In many cases the protocols between national agencies and the various levels and divisions within subnational government are not understood, and in some situations may not actually exist. For this reason the capacity development training program will, as a priority, focus on the mapping of the existing roles and responsibilities between the different subnational actors as a first step in identifying issues connected with communication and reporting. Initially, the capacity development training program will, at a minimum, have to include actors from the PFMC, PCCC (or equivalent), representatives from the District Development Authorities, PNGFA and DAL, as well as some external representatives of key stakeholder groups.

Harnessing the power of existing informal networks and business initiatives

The original report and its analyses underestimated the extent to which church and business organisations are involved in distributing livelihood information and involved in advocacy for women and marginalised groups. It is clear that church networks have strong advocacy programs and often function as an alternate route for distributing livelihood information to rural communities. Concurrently, we were made aware of sophisticated business initiatives which specifically target women such as New Britain Palm Oil Ltd's *Lus Frut Mamas* program. Similarly we were informed that PNGFA operates a *Women In Forestry Network* (WIFIN). While WIFIN currently focuses on the health and social welfare of the members based at the PNGFA headquarters they are planning to extend the membership to the women in the provinces and across the wider industry in future.

Business initiatives extend beyond gender and, at least in some cases, include adjunct forestry management strategies such as New Britain Palm Oil Ltd's proactive program on fire control. It is currently unclear how many similar business initiatives are currently in existence. Workshop participants also identified local chambers of commerce as useful access points to involve businesses.

From our consultation workshops is clear that provincial REDD+ initiatives should draw and build upon initiatives already active in their provinces and that these should be mapped as part of the capacity development training program.

Community engagement

While this project aims to develop the foundations for provincial REDD+ implementation (but is not attempting to develop a comprehensive program for its national implementation) preparatory communication materials for community outreach are being developed in Tok Pisin. However, as pointed out by stakeholders in East New Britain there are some very remote communities in the province who are illiterate (and possibly non-Tok Pisin speakers) for whom any sort of engagement will present logistic and ethical challenges. However, given the short time frame of this project at this stage we will only focus on developing simplified communication tools for Tok Pisin speaking communities. Workshop participants also identified

social media, especially Facebook, as a viral communication mechanism which is rapidly expanding in its use across PNG due, and advocated its use as a comparatively cheap way of engaging with a wider audience on issues related to REDD+.

Concerns over land-use planning and ILGs

Some feedback extended into issues of national sustainable land-use planning and issues relating to Incorporated Land Groups (ILGs) which, while outside the terms of reference for this project, have been annotated in Annex 4 for the purposes of record keeping. Of particular note is that participants identified that the formation of ILGs risk marginalising the role of women in decision making. They point out that in practice ILGs are controlled by a limited number of men, and in this way disenfranchise the decision making powers of traditional landowners. Further to this, ILGs stand to negatively affect matrilineal societies by effectively stripping from women their traditional role as it relates to land ownership.

Annex 3: Revised Recommendations

Governance

In order to overcome the possibility of jurisdiction confusion from a number of parallel committees involved in REDD+ and land-use activities we recommend that the government of Papua New Guinea investigates the practicality of establishing a singular multi-stakeholder consultative body in each province tasked for screening plans for large scale development, forestry, agriculture, and infrastructure projects and ensuring they follow legislated protocols and are consistent with provincial and national land-use policies. Such a body, possibly named the Provincial Sustainable Development Committee, would subsume any similar roles currently undertaken by other provincial committees.

Capacity

On the basis of our analysis and stakeholder feedback we suggest improved capacity to undertake REDD+ in the pilot provinces of East New Britain, West New Britain, and Madang could be best addressed through the development of a capacity development training program (and associated tools) which seeks to:

1. *Using the pre-existing Provincial Climate Change Committees as a hub for improved communication between all provincial level stakeholders*
2. *Encouraging the provincial administration to proactively engage with national departments and authorities to implement national REDD+ strategy (and advocate for improved national infrastructure and technical assistance for the support of rural livelihoods)*
3. *Undertaking outreach to sensitise both business and communities to the necessity of community level land-use planning*
4. *Promoting the inclusion of women and vulnerable groups in decision making as part of an approach to move towards integrated land-use planning*
5. *Increasing awareness for all stakeholders on:*
 - a. *landowner rights*
 - b. *climate change*
 - c. *the necessity of free, prior and informed consent*
 - d. *subnational administration contact points for land-use (i.e. REDD+) related issues*
 - e. *avenues for grievance redress and reporting of illegal forestry or land-use activities*
 - f. *basics of village future-proofing (as an introduction to land-use planning)*
6. *Increasing awareness for businesses, civil society and subnational government on:*
 - a. *the direction of REDD+ in PNG*
7. *Targeting the initial capacity development training program at a representative group of people from the Provincial Climate Change Committees, Provincial Forest Management Committees, Provincial and District planning units, District Development Authorities, representatives of provincial church, business and non-government organisations, and provincial officers of PNGFA and DAL.*

Workshop pictures



Lester Seri welcoming participants to West New Britain Workshop – photo credit Nathan Whitmore (WCS)



West New Britain consultancy workshop group photograph 6 November 2018 – photo credit Samson Kupale (UNDP)