and Communication Technology for Terminal Evaluation of Information Development (ICTD) Project



Executive Summary

ICT and Development

The role of Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs) in combating poverty and fostering sustainable development has been the subject of increasing debate and experimentation within the development community. ICTs have been hailed as holding out great hope for developing countries, and have warned of a growing "digital divide" between rich and poor that must be narrowed by concerted action.

UNDP and ICT4D in India

In India, UNDP supports the mainstreaming of ICTs to achieve the country's national development goals. UNDP's approach is multistakeholder, aiming at innovative, result oriented policy guidance in the support of holistic, cross-sectoral e-development strategies and programmes. Together with Ministry of Communications & Information Technology, Government of India, UNDP has been supporting ICTD pilot initiatives in India since 2004.

Context of the Current Programme

The current UNDP project is a long-term multi-phased programme of support to the national initiatives on eGovernment and eGovernance led by the Ministry of Communications and Information Technology, Government of India, in collaboration with the UNDP. The broad objective of the ICTD project is to make ICTs work for people. The project seeks to demonstrate a range of ICT solutions to alleviate poverty, improve service delivery, enhance women's participation and promote transparency and accountability in governance. The project includes running pilot initiatives in the areas of e-Government and e-Governance, developing solutions & applications to bridge the digital divide, preparation of roadmaps for e-governance, and documenting success stories, transfer of knowledge and capacity building in the area of e-government.

Themes of Focus and Elements of Interventions

The Project focuses on four broad themes of Integrated Citizen Services, Rural Livelihoods, Governance and Women's Empowerment.

While each of the projects taken up under the above programmes is aligned to the themes mentioned above, each of them also spans the following elements of interventions.

- Citizen-Centric Service Delivery;
- Capacity Building;
- Change Management;
- Business Process Re-Engineering;
- Public Private Partnerships;
- Bridging the Digital Divide; and
- Knowledge and Experience-sharing.

Project Objectives

The key objectives of the project are

- to demonstrate the use of ICT for improved governance through sustainable initiatives in delivery of key public services in selected states in areas such as e-procurement, rural development, legal information and the like;
- to encourage active Business Process Re-engineering efforts to make governance procedures simpler, rule-based, nondiscretionary and transparent, thereby facilitating use of ICT on a sustainable basis and outsourcing of functions;
- to build Public-Private Partnerships in ICT applications for governance;
- to develop solutions and applications based on open source and other electronic communication technologies that would improve access to and reduce costs of ICT applications with a view to



cover even those areas that now suffer from high access costs, inadequate communications infrastructure and insufficient localised content and media development;

- to support the formulation of master plans and roadmaps for eGovernance; and
- to document lessons learnt for horizontal transfer of success stories.

ICTD Projects Under Consideration

The table below is the clutch of the projects being undertaken.

Project Name	Theme	Implementing Agency	Implementation State
Bangalore -One	Integrated Citizen Services	Dept. of Administrative Reforms, Govt. of Karnataka	Karnataka
Integrated Community Service Centres (i-CoSC)	Integrated Citizen Services	Dept. of IT, Govt. of Himachal Pradesh	Himachal Pradesh
Ashwini	Rural Livelihoods	Byrraju Foundation	Andhra Pradesh
e-Krishi (Agri-Business Centres)	Rural Livelihoods	Kerala State IT Mission	Kerala
Decentralized Rural Information System & Technology Initiatives (DRISTI)	Governance	West Bengal State Rural Development Agency	West Bengal
e-Procurement	Governance	Dept. of Administrative Reforms, Govt. of Karnataka	Karnataka
Mahiti Mitra	Governance	Kutch Nav Nirman Abhiyan	Gujarat
Village Information System	Integrated Citizen Services	Gujarat Informatics Limited	Gujarat
Mahiti Manthana	Women Empowerment	IT for Change	Karnataka
Enterprise Development Service	Rural Livelihoods	Development Alternatives	Madhya Pradesh/Punjab
e-Justice	Governance (Access to Justice)	Centre for Good Governance	Andhra Pradesh
Mahiti Mitra - Phase II	Governance	Kutch Nav Nirman Abhiyan	Gujarat
ICT School for Women's Empowerment	Women Empowerment	SEWA	Gujarat
ICT for Women Conciliation Centre	Women Empowerment	VIDIYAL	Tamil Nadu
Mobile Information Technology for Rural Advancement - MITRA	Rural Livelihood	PEDO	Rajasthan
Using ICT for Improving Livestock Productivity - NANDINI	Rural Livelihoods	OCAC	Orissa
Mobile - Government	Governance	West Bengal State Rural Development Agency	West Bengal
Centre for Development Process Innovations through ICTs - Community Radio Unit	Women's Empowerment	IT for Change	Karnataka
Real Time Provisioning of Fishing Zone Information	Livelihood/ Early Warning	INCOIS- Kutch Nav Nirman Abhiyan	Gujarat

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Outputs, Outcomes and Recommendations

Further, for every project evaluated, immediate outputs that have been achieved are clearly brought out in a summarised form, as well as the developmental outcomes that have resulted. Key recommendations have also been made as to how interventions on the lines of what has taken place in the project can better yield the desired outcomes. The tables below respectively demonstrate theme-wise select outputs and recommendations for the pilots.

Integrated Citizen Services	e-Governance
 Greater Convenience to the Citizens through Round the clock (ANYTIME), Jurisdiction free (ANYWHERE) services Optimal Location of Citizen Service Centres Reduction in payment cost and travel Reduction in time taken for payment of bills Additional vistas of employment Reduction in corruption was found, mainly due to the PPP approach of service delivery One-stop shops' availability Benefits to Government through lower defaults in tax and bill payments Empowerment of Citizens through availability of information and participation in governance Increase in accountability of government by giving powers to citizens to raise issues Benefits to the community a large through bridging the digital divide between the urban and the rural areas 	 Benefits to Citizens Reduction in time for delivering services e.g. birth registration Increased transparency Considerable saving time/effort, owing to actual visits reduced Empowering marginalised by information on rights/ entitlements Reduction in corruption through transparency Savings in time and cost due to intermediary being eliminated Fair and fearless participation of vendors possible Reduction of turn-around-time in tender processing Benefits to Citizens owing to Better decision support system Savings to departments owing to lo lower bid values Uniform procurement system Significant reduction in vendor cartelization Removed hindrances in information dissemination and collection All layers of Government helped in terms of decision making Services design aligned with user needs
Livelihood	Women Empowerment
 Increase in literacy and computer literacy increases employability Expert consultation increases real-life decision making including increased productivity and yield through timely interventions Increased incomes through ICT-enabled matchmaking Improved negotiating abilities through better knowledge of market Benefits from the registered agricultural input providers. Increased entrepreneurship abilities through all-round knowledge enhancement Improved standard of living of entrepreneurs' families, enhancing health, education and providing safety net with trickle down effect on communities Enhanced system of alerts against emergencies and disasters Reduction of cost of processing of receipt and compilation of accounts Enhanced faith in Self-Help Group members who in turn have become more independent Better pricing of plat and animal produce through touch with the market 	 Increase in negotiation power has led to increase of financial assistance extended by local banks Increased familiarity with judiciary officials and procedures for not just women but their families too Increased awareness led to higher rates of application for developmental schemes Increased Credit flow to women Increased levels of literacy and computer literacy ICT training led to livelihood generation/social upliftment of rural women. Horizontal and Vertical knowledge exchange and sharing Increased awareness regarding their entitlements, worked to enhance citizenship, increased participation in governance. Increased participation bymarginalised women over the air-waves and other ICT channels and media Women generally empowered which has led to an increase in social capital



EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Integrated Citizen Services	eGovernance
 Integration amongst software applications to avoid duplication of entries and reduce time. Expand services to include other departments along with back end automation; consider inclusion of private sector services to take advantage of the common infrastructure created. Self help kiosks for segments without internet connectivity and Telephone Helpdesk so that citizens do not visit centres for queries. Categorisation of services and specific counters for high volume services for better service delivery SMS based tracking of status of all applications based on unique identification numbers associated with applications. Provide services that are in line with citizen expectations; receive citizen inputs through a formalised feedback process. Sustainable Business Model to continue on expiry of funding. 	 Sustainable Business Model needs to be adopted as existing models may not survive without funding. Consider levying charges on services, PPP etc Inclusion of private sector services to take advantage of the common infrastructure created. Online status of work registers showing the status of work Wherever applicable link GIS application with Land Records Department Integration of the existing application with other government departments so that static information is not provided. Single data source may be developed out of existing ones Standardise data and field definitions to enable comparison and compilation Complete integration of front office applications with back office programs. Set and operationalise a system of alerts and reminders; judiciously use mobile as a device on which to access services, including particularly, alerts and reminders
Livelihood	Women Empowerment
 Adopt strategy for sustenance after implementation of CSCs under NeGP. Alternatively tie up with government to run CSCs in their area using existing infrastructure or provide services not covered by CSCs Use local language (other than English and Hindi) for greater reach. Creating a Constitution or Guiding Manual for each community-oriented groupings to lay out roles and responsibilities. Align services offered with Government schemes and collaborate with Government for funding, technical knowledge and cooperation Wherever possible replicate projects after due customisation Create publicity and generate awareness among communities Provide two way communications between server and mobile. Using one form instead of multiple forms reducing duplicate entry Regular and timely update of information on Electronic Display Boards(EDBs) for real time information More Awareness campaign to increase and convince target groups. 	 Develop social network, communication channels, so that groups can share and exchange information Improve efficiency and quality of services by imparting training in latest technology developments creating forward formal linkages. Develop a Sustainable Business Model to continue on expiry of funding Reducing dependency on services like g-talk, Skype, Yahoo messenger, etc for video communications as recent government move is towards restricting them on grounds of security Need to create a Constitution or Guiding Manual for each SHGs to lay out roles and responsibilities for participating stakeholders Require a sustainable Business Model for VKCs, as the current model will not suffice post expiry of funding from external agencies. Alignment of services with Government Schemes and collaboration with Government for funding, knowledge and cooperation Improve efficiency and quality of services by imparting training in latest

Recommendations for UNDP and the Implementing Partner

Besides the recommendations made above on existing projects certain other suggestions are due for both UNDP and the implementing partner.

While the above can continue to influence future project proposals, the UNDP could consider rolling out the pilots first to their immediate vicinity where word about the project would already have travelled, and then to locations beyond where similar conditions prevail. Newer areas and themes merit attention too; for example, the North-East of the country, is an area that was completely left out by the pilots. Forest-dwelling communities and their livelihood issues have not been covered by these pilots in any substantial way either. Local and decentralised interventions towards building up Early Warning Systems need to be considered too since large swathes of the country become exposed to that every year.

For the Implementation Partner it is suggested that closer and more frequent monitoring of projects be done since audit reports reveal some gaps in this area. Further, utilisation of budgetary allocations for activities they are intended for is something that needs to be ensured. Diversions, if any, should get reported as soon as possible after they take place and revisions made accordingly. NISG is also at an excellent vantage point from where it can ensure that appropriate standardisation, enhancement and replication of ICT applications that have resulted take place and benefit communities in other regions of the country too.

Terminal Evaluation of the ICTD Projects

This document represents a terminal evaluation of each of these projects after the conclusion of their pilot phase. Evaluation of the projects has taken into account the following different dimensions:

- **RELEVANCE**, or the extent to which the activity is suited to local and national development priorities and organizational policies, including changes over time.
- EFFECTIVENESS, or the extent to which an objective has been achieved or how likely it is to be achieved
- EFFICIENCY, or the extent to which results have been delivered with the least costly resources possible.
- **RESULTS/IMPACTS** means the positive and negative, foreseen and unforeseen, changes to and effects produced by a development intervention.
- **SUSTAINABILITY**, or the likely ability of an intervention to continue to deliver benefits for an extended period of time after completion.

Approach followed for Evaluation

Each of these categories above has been further broken down into different parameters and every project has been rated on a scale of 1 through 6 on each of these parameters to arrive at separate evaluation scores for Relevance, Efficiency, Effectiveness, Results/Impacts and Sustainability. According equal weightage to each of these five categories a total evaluation score has also been arrived at, again on a scale of 1 through 6 in increasing order of satisfaction, for each of these projects. The figure on the left brings out a comparative standing for each of these projects on the total score obtained or each of the five criteria mentioned above. This has been done by taking the total score for each of the criteria mentioned above and then dividing the sum by five.

Best Practices and Lessons Learnt

Of the 19 different projects, 15 of them have also been chosen for elaboration as success stories. Careful examination of these 15 cases has revealed a set of best practices and lessons learnt from these 15 exercises. These are reproduced in brief in the table below.





EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Integrated Citizen Services	e-Governance
Collaboration must happen but there must be role clarity among	• An exclusive earmarked group of dedicated individuals rather than ex-
collaborators	officio posts is better for operationalisation of ICT initiatives
Citizen service must encompass all dimensions	Mobile is often the most viable medium for far-flung areas
• Citizens' inputs must be taken before they are offered services	• For instant messaging mobile services are often the best option
• Well-defined Service Level Agreements reduce gap between expectations	• Use the mobile phone for two-way communication, not only to give
and offerings	information to citizens but also to take their feedback on them
• It is important to offer choice to citizens by way of channels and devices	• Properly craft Service Level Agreements with service parameters
• Before going for a wider roll-out it is better to pilot the projects first	• For emergency services a formal or informal acknowledgement is important
• Public Private Partnership arrangements are becoming a common mode to	• Continued functioning of important people as champions is important
roll out service delivery by distributing risks and responsibilities	• Build on existing partnerships at the project level when it is being planned
• Instead of offering all services at one go, prioritise them	to go for a wider area rollout
• All services must be provided in as error-free manner as possible; this	• Use of regional language is often the best way to ensure community
requires a highly available ICT Support Group	involvement
Effective Capacity Building and Change Management must accompany	• Use information intermediary in case of limited access to technology
technology deployment	• Provide multiple services under one umbrella rather than make citizen
• Queue Management System is required to effectively manage large footfalls	approach different interfaces
 Continual citizen feedback on services offered must be pursued 	• Effective capacity building must accompany technology deployment
 Explore all options for making the project sustainable 	• Community involvement at every step is a must to retain touch with reality
• Leadership must come from the top but all stakeholders must be involved	• Strong technical support group is required to provide uninterrupted services
Livelihood	Women Empowerment
 Involve communities as stakeholders not beneficiaries 	• Use ICT as a low-cost tool for generation and sharing of content
 A robust ICT infrastructure with redundancy is a must 	Community Radio and Video are important channel choices for their
 Empower communities through development of core skills 	tremendous reach and ability to bridge digital and non-digital divides
• Ensure the right partnerships are in place before taking initiatives forward	• Collaboration with government initiative improves scalability/ sustainability
 Streamlined operational planning is required to handle busy periods 	• Tap the potential of educational institutions
Use existing infrastructure wherever possible to cushion cost pressures	• Use Community Centres for collective learning, listening and ideating
 Government can be approached for support during business incubation 	• ICT-enabled learning also gives a choice to include youth, specially girls,
 Use innovative features to bring buyers and sellers together 	who have dropped out of the educational process
 Target ideas with a low gestation period 	 Existing ICTD projects can also be used as testbeds
 Identify skills conducive for remote ICT-enabled training delivery 	 Large NGO's offer an opportunity to scale up geographically
 Exploit the benefits of demonstrable pilot exercises 	• Use innovative products (voice mail) to reach out to disadvantaged sections
 ICT-enabled interactions can only augment, never substitute real-life 	Deploy Management Committees for Community Centres
interactions, particularly where life-skills are involved	 Negotiating and bargaining power of women increases when dealing with
• The ICT-enabled multipurpose telecentre is the nucleus for a lot of activities	banks, governments and marketing agencies
 Relentlessly explore revenue streams to ensure sustainability 	 Deploy horizontal and vertical knowledge transfer
 Select the problem that impacts the greatest number of people 	 Content at community and software production at educational institutes
• A largely concentrated problem offers a chance to exploit economies of scale	 Deploy Train the Trainer model for large and dispersed populations
 Mobile-based alerts and notifications make pre-emptive interventions 	• Explore collaboration with training certifying bodies for better acceptability



Table of Contents

1. In	ntroduction	21
1.1	Background	
1.2	Context of the Programme	
1.3	Programme Description	
1.4	Description of the Projects	
1.5	Limitations and Constraints	

2. Approach and Methodology

2.1	Understanding	. 26
2.2	Overall Approach	. 27
2.2.1	Conceptualisation of the Project	27
2.2.2	Overall Approach for the Project	30
2.3	Parameters of Evaluation	. 31
2.3.1	Relevance	31
2.3.2	Effectiveness	31
2.3.3	Efficiency	31
2.3.4	Results/Impacts	32
2.3.5	Sustainability	32

Bangalore One	
1 Project Background	
2 Project Strategic Objectives	
3 Project Relevance Inputs	
4 Project Effectiveness Inputs	
5 Project Results/Impacts Generated	
6 Project Sustainability Considerations	
7 Project Evaluation Matrix	40
Integrated Community Service Centres (i-CoSC)	
1 Project Background	47
2 Project Strategic Objectives	
3 Project Relevance Inputs	
4 Project Effectiveness Inputs	
5 Project Efficiency Inputs	50
	Bangalore One. 1 Project Background 2 Project Strategic Objectives 3 Project Relevance Inputs 4 Project Effectiveness Inputs 5 Project Results/Impacts Generated 6 Project Sustainability Considerations 7 Project Evaluation Matrix Integrated Community Service Centres (i-CoSC) 1 Project Strategic Objectives 3 Project Strategic Objectives 3 Project Effectiveness Inputs

Deloitte.

3.2.6	Project Results/Impacts Generated	.53
3.2.7	Project Sustainability Considerations	.56
3.2.8	Project Evaluation Matrix	.59
3.3	Ashwini	. 70
3.3.1	Project Background	.71
3.3.2	Project Strategic Objectives	.74
3.3.3	Project Relevance Inputs	.74
3.3.4	Project Effectiveness Inputs	.74
3.3.5	Project Efficiency Inputs	.75
3.3.6	Project Results/Impacts Generated	.76
3.3.7	Project Sustainability Considerations	.78
3.3.8	Project Evaluation Matrix	.80
3.4	e-Krishi (Agri-Business Centres)	. 86
3.4.1	Project Background	.87
3.4.2	Project Strategic Objectives	.91
3.4.3	Project Relevance Inputs	.92
3.4.4	Project Effectiveness Inputs	.94
3.4.5	Project Efficiency Inputs	.95
3.4.6	Project Results/Impacts Generated	.96
3.4.7	Project Sustainability Considerations	.98
3.4.8	Project Evaluation Matrix	101
3.5	Decentralized Rural Information System & Technology Initiatives (DRISTI) 1	108
3.5.1	Project Background	109
3.5.2	Project Strategic Objectives	113
3.5.3	Project Relevance Inputs	114
3.5.4	Project Effectiveness Inputs	114
3.5.5	Project Efficiency Inputs	115
3.5.6	Project Results/Impacts Generated	117
3.5.7	Project Sustainability Considerations	118
3.5.8	Project Evaluation Matrix	120
3.6	E-Procurement	127
3.6.1	Project Background	128
3.6.2	Project Strategic Objectives	128
3.6.3		120
364	Project Relevance Inputs	129
5.0.1	Project Relevance Inputs Project Effectiveness Inputs	129 129
3.6.5	Project Relevance Inputs Project Effectiveness Inputs Project Efficiency Inputs	129 129 129 129
3.6.5 3.6.6	Project Relevance Inputs Project Effectiveness Inputs Project Efficiency Inputs Project Results/Impacts Generated	129 129 129 129 131
3.6.5 3.6.6 3.6.7	Project Relevance Inputs Project Effectiveness Inputs Project Efficiency Inputs Project Results/Impacts Generated Project Sustainability Considerations	129 129 129 129 131 132
3.6.5 3.6.6 3.6.7 3.6.8	Project Relevance Inputs Project Effectiveness Inputs Project Efficiency Inputs Project Results/Impacts Generated Project Sustainability Considerations Project Evaluation Matrix	129 129 129 129 131 132 134
3.6.5 3.6.6 3.6.7 3.6.8 3.7	Project Relevance Inputs Project Effectiveness Inputs Project Efficiency Inputs Project Results/Impacts Generated Project Sustainability Considerations Project Evaluation Matrix	129 129 129 131 132 134 134
3.6.5 3.6.6 3.6.7 3.6.8 3.7 3.7.1	Project Relevance Inputs Project Effectiveness Inputs Project Efficiency Inputs Project Results/Impacts Generated Project Sustainability Considerations Project Evaluation Matrix Mahiti Mitra (Phase I and Phase II)	129 129 129 131 132 134 140 141
3.6.5 3.6.6 3.6.7 3.6.8 3.7 3.7.1 3.7.1 3.7.2	Project Relevance Inputs Project Effectiveness Inputs Project Efficiency Inputs Project Results/Impacts Generated Project Sustainability Considerations Project Evaluation Matrix Mahiti Mitra (Phase I and Phase II) Project Background Project Strategic Objectives	129 129 129 131 132 134 140 141 143



3.7.3	3 Project Relevance Inputs	143
3.7.4	4 Project Effectiveness Inputs	144
3.7.5	5 Project Efficiency Inputs	144
3.7.6	6 Project Results/Impacts Generated	149
3.7.7	7 Project Sustainability Considerations	152
3.7.8	8 Project Evaluation Matrix	156
3.8	Village Information System	164
3.8.1	1 Project Background	165
3.8.2	2 Project Strategic Objectives	167
3.8.3	3 Project Relevance Inputs	167
3.8.4	4 Project Effectiveness Inputs	168
3.8.5	5 Project Efficiency Inputs	170
3.8.6	6 Project Results/Impacts Generated	173
3.8.7	7 Project Sustainability Considerations	179
3.8.8	8 Project Evaluation Matrix	183
3.9	Mahiti Manthana	192
3.9.1	1 Project Background	193
3.9.2	2 Project Strategic Objectives	
3.9.3	3 Project Relevance Inputs	194
3.9.4	4 Project Effectiveness Inputs	195
3.9.5	5 Project Efficiency Inputs	195
3.9.6	6 Project Results/Impacts Generated	197
3.9.7	7 Project Sustainability Considerations	199
3.9.8	8 Project Evaluation Matrix	202
3.10	Enterprise Development Service	208
3.10.	.1 Project Background	209
3.10.	.2 Project Strategic Objectives	211
3.10.	.3 Project Relevance Inputs	211
3.10.	Project Effectiveness Inputs	213
3.10.	1.5 Project Efficiency Inputs	213
3.10.	9.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated	214
3.10.	1.7 Project Sustainability Considerations	217
3.10.	0.8 Project Evaluation Matrix	219
3.11	e-Justice	227
3.11.	.1 Project Background	228
3.11.	.2 Project Strategic Objectives	230
3.11.	.3 Project Relevance Inputs	231
3.11.	.4 Project Effectiveness Inputs	232
3.11.	.5 Project Efficiency Inputs	232
3.11.	.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated	233
3.11.	.7 Project Sustainability Considerations	234
3.11.	.8 Project Evaluation Matrix	236



3.12	ICT for Women Conciliation Centre	243
3.12.	1 Project Background	. 244
3.12.	2 Project Strategic Objectives	. 247
3.12.	3 Project Relevance Inputs	. 247
3.12.	4 Project Effectiveness Inputs	. 248
3.12.	5 Project Efficiency Inputs	. 248
3.12.	6 Project Results/Impacts Generated	. 250
3.12.	7 Project Sustainability Considerations	. 252
3.12.	8 Project Evaluation Matrix	. 256
3.13	Mobile Information Technology for Rural Advancement - MITRA	263
3.13.	1 Project Background	. 264
3.13.	2 Project Strategic Objectives	. 267
3.13.	3 Project Relevance Inputs	. 267
3.13.	4 Project Effectiveness Inputs	. 269
3.13.	5 Project Efficiency Inputs	. 269
3.13.	6 Project Results/Impacts Generated	. 271
3.13.	7 Project Sustainability Consideration	. 273
3.13.	8 Project Evaluation Matrix	. 275
3.14	Using ICT for Improving Livestock Productivity - NANDINI	282
3.14.	1 Project Background	. 283
3.14.	2 Project Strategic Objectives	. 283
3.14.	3 Project Relevance Inputs	. 284
3.14.	4 Project Effectiveness Inputs	. 285
3.14.	5 Project Efficiency Inputs	. 285
3.14.	6 Project Results/Impacts Generated	. 286
3.14.	7 Project Sustainability Considerations	. 286
3.14.	8 Project Evaluation Matrix	. 289
3.15	Mobile - Government	296
3.15.	1 Project Background	. 297
3.15.	2 Project Strategic Objectives	. 298
3.15.	3 Project Relevance Inputs	. 299
3.15.	4 Project Effectiveness Inputs	. 300
3.15.	5 Project Efficiency Inputs	. 300
3.15.	6 Project Results/Impacts Generated	. 301
3.15.	7 Project Evaluation Matrix	. 304
3.16	Centre for Development Process Innovations through ICTs - Community Radio Unit	310
3.16.	1 Project Background	. 311
3.16.	2 Project Strategic Objectives	. 312
3.16.	3 Project Relevance Inputs	. 312
3.16.	4 Project Effectiveness Inputs	. 313
3.16.	5 Project Efficiency Inputs	. 313
3.16.	6 Project Results/Impacts Generated	. 315



3.16.7	.7 Project Sustainability Considerations	
3.16.8	8 Project Evaluation Matrix	
3.17	ICT School for Women's Empowerment	325
3.17.1	.1 Project Background	
3.17.2	2 Project Strategic Objectives	
3.17.3	3 Project Relevance Inputs	
3.17.4	4 Project Effectiveness Inputs	329
3.17.5	5 Project Efficiency Inputs	
3.17.6	.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated	332
3.17.7	.7 Project Sustainability Considerations	335
3.17.8	8 Project Evaluation Matrix	337
3.18	Real Time Provisioning of Fishing Zone Information	344
3.18.1	1 Project Background	
3.18.2	2 Project Strategic Objectives	
3.18.3	3 Project Relevance Inputs	
3.18.4	4 Project Effectiveness Inputs	
3.18.5	5 Project Efficiency Inputs	
3.18.6	.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated	350
3.18.7	.7 Project Sustainability Considerations	
3.18.8	8 Project Evaluation Matrix	357

4. Comparative Analysis of Findings

6.1	The Role of the Stakeholders	390
6.2	Year-wise Expenditure Incurred on account of the ICTD Project	391
6.3	Project Details and Management Audit Report of 2008	391
6.3.1	Auditor's Comments (Year 2008)	392
6.3.2	Utilisation of Funds (Year 2008)	392
6.4	Project Details and Management Audit Report of 2008	393
6.4.1	Auditor's Comments (Year 2009)	393
6.4.2	Utilisation of Funds	394
6.5	Financial Analysis of the Project Expenditure	395

.365

List of Tables

Table 1 List of Pilot Projects supported by UNDP	24
Table 2-The Logical Framework Approach	
Table 3 Introduction- Bangalore One	
Table4 Impact of the Project in Brief (Bangalore One)	
Table 5 Stakeholders - Bangalore One	
Table 6 Project Evaluation Matrix- Bangalore One	
Table 7 Introduction- iCoSC	
Table 8 Impact of the Project in Brief- i-Cosc	
Table 9 Project Stakeholders and their Roles	
Table 10 Theme-wise activities conducted during the project	
Table 11 List of Activities for the Project- iCosc	
Table 12 Impact of the Project - iCosc	
Table 13 Project Evaluation Matrix- iCosc	
Table 14 Introduction- ICT for Women Conciliation Centre	
Table 15 Brief Impact of the Project- ASHWINI	
Table 16 Stakeholders and Their Roles- Ashwini	73
Table 17 Theme-based List of Activities- Ashwini	75
Table 18 Project Evaluation Matrix- Ashwini Ashwini	
Table 19 Introduction- e-Krishi	
Table 20 Brief Impact of the Project	
Table 21 Stakeholders and their Roles- eKrishi	
Table 22 Theme-Based List of Activities (eKrishi)	
Table 23 Impact of the Project- eKrishi	
Table 24 Detailed evaluation matrix for ICT for e-Krishi	101
Table 25 Project Introduction- DRISTI	108
Table 26 Brief Impact of the Project	108
Table 27 DRISTI Project Stakeholders and their Roles	113
Table 28 Theme-Based Activities (DRISTI)	116
Table 29 Evaluation of the Project- DRISTI	121
Table 30 Introduction- e-Procurement	127
Table 31 Impact of the Project in brief- e-Procurement	127
Table 32 Role played by various stakeholders	129
Table 33 Theme-based Activity List for eProcurement	130
Table 34 Detailed evaluation matrix for Bangalore One	134
Table 35 Introduction-Mahiti Mitra	140
Table 36 Brief Impact of the Project- Mahiti Mitra	140
Table 37 Stakeholders and Their Roles- Mahiti Mitra I and II	145
Table38 Linkage between Entities- Mahiti Mitra I and II	146
Table 39 Theme-based List of Activities- Mahiti Mitra I and II	147
Table 40 Services and Charges Levied	152
Table 41 Services and their charges	152
Table 42 Comparison of Parameters before and after Project	153





Table 43 Detailed evaluation matrix for Mahiti Mitra I & II	156
Table 44 Introduction- Village Information System	164
Table 45 Brief Impact of the Project- VIS	164
Table 46 Project Stakeholders and their Roles	168
Table 47 Theme-wise activities conducted during the project	170
Table 48 Hardware and Software Details- VIS	174
Table 49 Bandwidth Availability- VIS	175
Table 50 - Indicative charges for various services	178
Table 51 Fee Charges- VIS Project	179
Table 52 - Governance Structure	180
Table 53 Impact of the Project- VIS Project	180
Table 54 - Detailed evaluation matrix for Village Information System	183
Table 56 Introduction- Mahiti Manthana	192
Table 55 Impact of the Project in Brief- Mahiti Manthana	192
Table 57 Stakeholders and their Roles	194
Table 58 Component-wise activities conducted during the project	195
Table 59 Theme wise activities performed	196
Table 60 Detailed evaluation matrix for ICT for Women Conciliation Center	202
Table 61 Project Introduction- EDS	208
Table 62 Brief Impact of the Project	208
Table 63 Stakeholders and their Roles- EDS	212
Table 64 Project Evaluation - EDS	219
Table 66 Introduction- eJustice Project	227
Table 65 Brief Impact of the Project	227
Table 67 Stakeholders and Their Roles	230
Table 68-Activities in Different Themes	231
Table 69 Detailed evaluation matrix for ICT for Women Conciliation Center	236
Table 70 Introduction- ICT for Women Conciliation Centre	243
Table 71 Brief Impact of the Project- VIDIYAL	243
Table 72 Description of ICT Components- VIDIYAL	246
Table 73 VIDIYAL's Interventions and eGovernance	247
Table 74 Project Stakeholders and their Roles	247
Table 75 Theme-wise activities conducted during the project	248
Table 76 Detailed evaluation matrix for ICT for Women Conciliation Center	256
Table 77 Introduction-MITRA	263
Table 78 Brief Impact of the Project- MITRA	263
Table 79 Organisation Set Up PEDO	265
Table 80 Project Stakeholders and Roles- PEDO.	267
Table 81 Theme-based Activities (PEDO)	268
Table 82 Tiers, ICT and Roles	270
Table 83 Impact of the Project- PEDO	271
Table 84-Hardware Procured	272
Table 85-List of Records Generated From the System	272

Table 86-Evaluating the Project- MITRA	273
Table 87-Detailed evaluation matrix for MITRA	275
Table 88 Introduction- NANDINI	282
Table 89 Impact of the Project in Brief- NANDINI	282
Table 90 Stakeholders and Roles- NANDINI	284
Table 91 Stakeholders and their Roles	284
Table 92 Theme-based Activities for Nandini	285
Table 93 Pre-Project and Post-Project Comparison for Nandini	287
Table 94 Detailed evaluation matrix for ICT for Women Conciliation Center	289
Table 95 Introduction- m-Gov	296
Table 96 Brief Impact of the Project - mGovt	296
Table 97 Stakeholders and Roles- mGov	299
Table 98 Theme-Based Activities- mGov	301
Table 99 Evaluating the Project- mGov	303
Table 100 Project Evaluation Matrix- mGov	304
Table 101 Project Introduction- Community Radio Unit	310
Table 102 Brief Impact of the Project	310
Table 103 Stakeholders and their Roles- CRU	313
Table 104 Theme-based Activity List- CRU	314
Table 105 Project Evaluation Matrix- CRU	318
Table 106: Introduction- ICT School for Women's Empowerment	325
Table 107 Brief Impact of the Project- ICR for Women's Empowerment	325
Table 108 Brief Impact of the Project- ICR for Women's Empowerment	325
Table 109 Project Stakeholders and their Roles	328
Table 110 Theme-wise activities conducted during the project	331
Table 111-Pre & Post Project Parameter Synopsis	333
Table 112 Project Evaluation Matrix- SEWA	343
Table 113 Introduction- Real Time Provisioning of Fishing Zone Information	344
Table 114 Brief Impact of the Project- Real Time PFZ	344
Table 115 Project Stakeholders and their Roles	347
Table 116 Theme-wise Activities	348
Table 117 - Pre & Post project parameter synopsis	353
Table 118 Project Evaluation Matrix- INCOIS	357
Table 119 Comparative Evaluation of the Projects	365
Table 120 Best Practices and Lessons Learnt from the Pilot ICTD Projects	367
Table 121 Year-Wise Expenditure Figures on account of the Project	391
Table 122 ICTD Project Details at a Glance	391
Table 123 Summary of Auditor's Comments for Year 2008	392
Table 124 Utilisation of UNDP Core Funds, 2008	393
Table 125 Utilisation of SIDA Funds, 2008	393
Table 126 Summary of Auditor's Comments for Year 2009	394
Table 127 Utilisation of UNDP Core Funds, 2009	395
Table 128 Utilisation of SIDA Funds, 2009	395



List of Figures

Figure 1 Interlinkages between Themes and Dimensions of Intervention	
Figure 2 Linkages between Areas of Intervention, Evaluation parameters and Stakeholders	
Figure 3 Conceptualisation of the Project	
Figure 4 Overall Approach for the Project	
Figure 5 Evaluating the Project- Bangalore One	
Figure 6 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps	
Figure 7 High Level Overview of the Functioning of the I-COSC centre	
Figure 8 List of Sugam Centres	
Figure 9 Software & Hardware Overview of SUGAM Centre	
Figure 10 Organisational Hierarchy- iCosc	
Figure 11 Guidelines for Sugam Centres	
Figure 12 Evaluating the Project- VIDIYAL	
Figure 13 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps	
Figure 14 Communication Infrastructure for the Ashwini Project	
Figure 15 Evaluating the Project- eKrishi	
Figure 16 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps	
Figure 17 Akshaya Centres in Kerala	
Figure 18 Evaluating the Project- eKrishi	
Figure 19 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps	100
Figure 20 Coverage of DRISTI	110
Figure 21 Evaluating the Project- DRISTI	119
Figure 22 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps	120
Figure 23 Evaluating the Project- e-Procurement	133
Figure 24 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps	133
Figure 25 Inter-relationship among KNNA, Setu, K-Link and Mahiti Mitra Centre	142
Figure 26 Information flow among various stakeholders	149
Figure 27 Information Flow at MM Centers	149
Figure 28 Various initiatives of Abhiyan	153
Figure 29 Various initiatives of Abhiyan	154
Figure 30 Evaluating the Project- Mahiti Mitra I & II	154
Figure 31 Key Recommendations- Mahiti Mitra Phase I and II	155
Figure 32 Network	175
Figure 33 Flow of information	176
Figure 34 Evaluating the Project- Village Information System	181
Figure 35 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps	182
Figure 36 Evaluating the Project- MAHITI MANTHANA	200
Figure 37 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps	201
Figure 38 EDS Process Flows	210
Figure 39 Enterprise Development Service- Data Flow Diagram	210
Figure 40 Project Management Structure- EDS	213
Figure 41 Theme-Based Activities for EDS	215
Figure 42 Evaluating the Project- EDS	218

Figure 43 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps	219
Figure 44 Main Features of eJustice Project	228
Figure 45 Geographical Coverage- eJustice Project	229
Figure 46 eJustice Architecture	229
Figure 47 eJustice Portal	. 232
Figure 48 Evaluating the Project- eJustice	. 234
Figure 49 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps	235
Figure 50 Evaluating the Project- VIDIYAL	254
Figure 51 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps	. 255
Figure 52-Technical Architecture MITRA	267
Figure 53-Project Institutional Arrangement	. 273
Figure 54-Key Recommendations for Next Steps	274
Figure 55 Evaluating the Project- NANDINI	. 287
Figure 56 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps	. 288
Figure 57 Technical Archiecture for the m-Gov Project	. 297
Figure 58 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps	303
Figure 59 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps	317
Figure 60 Evaluating the Project- Community Radio Unit	317
Figure 61 Evaluating the Project- ICT School for Women's Empowerment	335
Figure 62 Key Recommendations- SEWA	336
Figure 63 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps	337
Figure 64-Project Work Plan	349
Figure 65 Conceptual and Functional Block Diagram	351
Figure 66 Snapshot of Major Outputs	354
Figure 67 Evaluating the Project- Real Time Provisioning of Fishing Zone (PFZ) Information	355
Figure 68 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps	356
Figure 69 Comparative Evaluation of the Projects	366
Figure 72 Year-Wise Amount Disbursed on the Project	395
Figure 73 Actual Project Expenditure Allocation	396
Figure 74 Budgetary Allocation for Project Expenditure Item-Wise	396



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ATP	Acceptance Test Procedures	EDB	Electronic Display Boards	IFMS	System
B1	Bangalore One	EDP	Enterprise Development Programme		Indian
B2C	Business to Citizen	EDS	Enterprise Development Service		Inform
BDO	Block Development Officer	EDSS	Enterprise Development and Support	INM	Integra
BEL	Bharat Electronics Limited	FIS	Services	IOB	Indian
BEML	Bharat Earth Movers Limited	FOMS	Electronic Queue Management System	IP	Implen
воот	Build Own Operate Transfer	EQMS	Ecod and Agricultural Organisation	IPM	Integra
BPL	Below Poverty Line	FAO	Frequently Asked Questions	ISDN	Integra
вро	Business Process Outsourcing	FAQ	Frequency Asked Questions	ITfC	IT For
BPR	Business Process Re-engineering	гкэ Сэр	Coversment to Business	ITI	Indian
СВО	Community Based Organisations	GZB	Government to Business	KB	Knowle
CBT	Computer Based Training	GZC	Government to Citizen	KNNA	Kutch
CD 1	Centre for Development Process	GIL	Gujarat Informatics Limited	KSITM	Kerala
CDPII	Innovations through ICTs	GIS	Geographical Information System	KSOU	Mission
CeG	Centre for eGovernance	GoHP	Government of Himachal Pradesh	K300	Kerala
CLC	Community Learning Centre	GP	Gram Panchayat	КТРР	Procur
СМР	Common Minimum Programme	GPMS	Gram Panchayat Management Systems	KVK	Krishi '
CPCRI	Central Plantation Crops Research	GPRS	General Packet Radio Service	L3	Lifelor
	Institute Catch Por Unit Effort	GSDMA	Gujarat State Disaster Management Authority	LFA	Logica
CPUE		GVS	Gram Vikas Samiti	LSG	Local S
CRU		HAL	Hindustan Aeronautical Limited	MCR	Micro-
CSS	Cascading Style Sheets	HTML	Hyper Text Markup Language	MIS	Manag
CTCRI	Central Tuber Crops Research Institute	НТТР	Hypertext Transfer Protocol	MITRA	Mobile
DA	Development Alternatives		Indian Citizen Eligibility Identification		Rural A
DoEACC	Department of Electronics and Accreditation of Computer Classes	ICLIS	System	MMK	Mahiti
DolT	Department of Information Technology	i-CoSC	Integrated Citizen Service Centre	MoES	Ministr
DPAR	Department of Personnel and	ICSC	Integrated Citizen Service Centre	MS	Mahila
	Administrative Reforms	ICT	Information and Communication	MSK	Mahila
DRDA	District Rural Development Agency		Information and Communication	NeGP	Nation
DRISTI	& Technology Initiatives		Technologies for Development	NGO	Non-G
DTP	Desktop Publishing	IEEE	Engineers	NIC	Nation

MS	Integrated Financial Management Systems
COIS	Indian National Centre for Ocean Information Services
M	Integrated Nutrient Management
В	Indian Overseas Bank
	Implementation Partner
Μ	Integrated Pest Management
DN	Integrated Services Digital Network
fC	IT For Change
I	Indian Telephone Industries Limited
3	Knowledge Block
INA	Kutch Nav Nirman Abhiyan
ITM	Kerala State Information Technology Mission
OU	Karnataka State Open University
TPP	Kerala Transparency in Public Procurement
/К	Krishi Vigyan Kendra
5	Lifelong Learning
A	Logical Framework Approach
G	Local Self Government
CR	Micro-Concrete Roofing
S	Management Information System
TRA	Mobile Information Technology for Rural Advancement
мĸ	Mahiti Mitra Kendra
DES	Ministry of Earth Sciences
5	Mahila Samakhya
SK	Mahila Samakhya Karnataka
eGP	National eGovernance Plan
GO	Non-Governmental Organisation
с	National Informatics Centre

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

NISG	National Institute of Smart Governance	PS	Panchayat Samiti		Authority of India
NMK	Namma Mahiti Kendra	RBM	Results Based Management	UNDP	United Nations Development
NPA	Non-Performing Assets	RDBMS	Relational Database Management Systems	UPS	Programme Uninterrupted Power Supply
NREGA	National Rural Employment Guarantee Act	RFP	Request for Proposal	VC	Video Conferencing
NRHM	National Rural Health Mission	RTI	Right to Information	VFPCK	Vegetable and Fruit Promotion Council Keralam
OCAC	Orissa Computer Application Centre	SBU	Strategic Business Unit	VIS	Village Information System
OSF	Ocean State Forecast	SC/ST	Scheduled Caste/ Scheduled Tribe	VKC	Village Knowledge Centre
PDS	Public Distribution System	SEWA	Self-Employed Women's Association	WRDPD	West Bengal Panchayat and Rural
PFAR	PHP Extension and Application	SHG	Self-Help Group	WDFRD	Development Department
	Repository People's Education and Development	SIMS	SETU Information Management System	WBSRDA	Agency
PEDO	Organization	SLA	Service Level Agreement	wcc	Women Conciliation Centre
PFZ	Potential Fishing Zones	SMS	Short Messaging Service	WEBEL	West Bengal Electronics Industry Development Corporation
PHC	Primary Healthcare Centre	SRS	Software Requirement Specifications	WSIS	World Summit on Information Society
PHP	Hypertext Preprocessor	SSVK	Samajik Shaikshanik Vikas Kendra	wто	World Trade Organisation
PKI	Public Key Infrastructure	TBGRI	Tropical Botanical Garden and Research	XHTML	Extensible Hyper Text Markup Language
PPP	Public Private Partnership			70	Zilla Darishad
PRI	Panchayati Raj Institutions	IFE	Technical and Financial Evaluation	۲	
		TRAI	Telecommunications Regulatory		



INTRODUCTION

1. Introduction

1.1 Background

ICT and Development

The role of Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs) in combating poverty and fostering sustainable development has been the subject of increasing debate and experimentation within the development community. The contrast between the complexity and expense of some of these technologies and the urgent, basic needs of the poor has led some to doubt whether ICTs should be a priority in the first place. However, there are others have hailed these technologies as holding out great hope for developing countries, and have warned of a growing "digital divide" between rich and poor that must be narrowed by concerted action.

The Digital Divide

Digital Divide refers to the gap between individuals, households, businesses and geographic areas at different socioeconomic levels with regard both to opportunities available to them to access information and communication technologies (ICTs) and to their use of the Internet for a wide variety of activities¹.

Digital divides emerge from existing nondigital divides revolving around monetary status, gender, ethnicity and disability. These restrict access to and participation in the digital world and therefore lead to the continued exclusion and underrepresentation of traditionally excluded groups into ICT fields too.

Digital Divide as a Paradox

The paradox, then, is that those historically disadvantaged may just sink deeper because of modern-day digital opportunities favouring the traditionally advantaged classes. Instead of bridging the existing socio-economic divides, ICTs may just end up opening them even more.

ICTs disparities usually exacerbate existing disparities based on location, gender, ethnicity, physical disability, age, and, especially income level and between —rich and —poor countries. ...The (digital divide) term is therefore not limited to the differentiation of information —haves and have nots", but refers to a —complex, multifaceted set of issues that encompass information and technology issues as well as social and economic issues².

Access to ICTs not an end in itself However, access to ICTs should not be seen as an end in itself; the measure of success remains progress towards reaching the developmental targets, rather than the spread of technology or bridging the digital divide. However, addressing the information and communication needs of the poor and creating information rich societies is an essential part of efforts to tackle poverty. Properly deployed, ICTs have enormous potential as tools to increase information flows and empower poor people.

UNDP and ICT4D in India

In India, UNDP supports the mainstreaming of ICTs to achieve the country's national development goals. UNDP's approach is multi-stakeholder, aiming at innovative, result oriented policy guidance in the support of holistic, cross-sectoral e-development strategies and programmes. Together with Ministry of Communications & Information Technology, Government of India, UNDP



¹ OECD (2001): Understanding the Digital Divide

² Information and Communication Technologies for Poverty Reduction: Discussion Paper by RICHARD GERSTER AND SONJA ZIMMERMANN, publication of Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation

has been supporting ICTD pilot initiatives in India since 2004.

1.2 Context of the Programme

The broad objective of the ICTD project is to make ICT work for people. The project seeks to demonstrate a range of ICT solutions to alleviate poverty, improve service delivery, enhance women's participation and promote transparency and accountability in governance.

The project includes the following components:

- Pilot initiatives in the areas of e-Government and e-Governance, including new initiatives or replication of projects implemented successfully in one part of the country to another part.
- Developing solutions & applications to bridge the digital divide.
- Preparation of roadmaps for egovernance.
- Documenting success stories, transfer of knowledge and capacity building in the area of e-government.

Multi-stakeholder Interventions

The ICTD project requires combining appropriate technology and infrastructure with local knowledge & expertise to deal with varied development challenges. It was therefore implemented drawing on the strengths and views of the government, civil society, the private sector and the international development community.

Thematic Areas of Intervention

The Project focuses on four broad themes:

- Integrated Citizen Services;
- Rural Livelihoods;
- Governance; and
- Women's Empowerment.



Dimensions of Intervention

Additionally, the project involves the following integral activities, aligned with the objectives and needs of specific pilots and initiatives:

- Citizen-Centric Service Delivery;
- Capacity Building;
- Change Management;
- Business Process Re-Engineering;
- Public Private Partnerships;
- Bridging the Digital Divide; and
- Knowledge and Experience-sharing.

1.3 Programme Description

India has pioneered an amazing range of ICT applications for improving the lives of common citizens, promoted by a host of government and non-government agencies who have shown the role that ICT can play in enhancing development outcomes through greater transparency, greater convenience, people's participation, revenue growth and cost reduction. Past efforts at improving service delivery, including transparency and accountability of public institutions have however not met with success throughout.

eGovernment and eGovernance are therefore seen as key priority areas to bring about fundamental improvements in governance driven by the objective of





INTRODUCTION

making government more effective, transparent and participatory.

The current UNDP project is a long-term multi-phased programme of support to the national initiatives on eGovernment and eGovernance led by the Ministry of Communications and Information Technology, Government of India, in collaboration with the UNDP.

The key objectives of the project are

• to demonstrate the use of ICT for improved governance through sustainable initiatives in delivery of key public services in selected states in areas such as e-procurement, rural development, legal information and the like;

- to encourage active Business Process Re-engineering efforts to make governance procedures simpler, rulebased, non-discretionary and transparent, thereby facilitating use of ICT on a sustainable basis and outsourcing of functions;
- to build public-private partnerships in ICT applications for governance;
- to develop solutions and applications based on open source and other electronic communication technologies that would improve access to and reduce costs of ICT applications with a view to cover even those areas that now

suffer from high access costs, inadequate communications infrastructure and insufficient localised content and media development;

- to support the formulation of master plans and roadmaps for eGovernance; and
- to document lessons learnt for horizontal transfer of success stories.

1.4 Description of the Projects

The following is the list of pilot projects that have been taken up.

Project Name	Theme	Implementing Agency	Implementation State
Bangalore -One	Integrated Citizen Services	Dept. of Administrative Reforms, Govt. of Karnataka	Karnataka
Integrated Community Service Centres (i-CoSC)	Integrated Citizen Services	Dept. of IT, Govt. of Himachal Pradesh	Himachal Pradesh
Ashwini	Rural Livelihoods	Byrraju Foundation	Andhra Pradesh
e-Krishi (Agri-Business Centres)	Rural Livelihoods	Kerala State IT Mission	Kerala
Decentralized Rural Information System & Technology Initiatives (DRISTI)	Governance	West Bengal State Rural Development Agency	West Bengal
e-Procurement	Governance	Dept. of Administrative Reforms, Govt. of Karnataka	Karnataka
Mahiti Mitra	Governance	Kutch Nav Nirman Abhiyan	Gujarat
Village Information System	Integrated Citizen Services	Gujarat Informatics Limited	Gujarat
Mahiti Manthana	Women Empowerment	IT for Change	Karnataka
Enterprise Development Service	Rural Livelihoods	Development Alternatives	Madhya Pradesh/Punjab
e-Justice	Governance (Access to Justice)	Centre for Good Governance	Andhra Pradesh

Project Name	Theme	Implementing Agency	Implementation State
Mahiti Mitra - Phase II	Governance	Kutch Nav Nirman Abhiyan	Gujarat
ICT School for Women's Empowerment	Women Empowerment	SEWA	Gujarat
ICT for Women Conciliation Centre	Women Empowerment	VIDIYAL	Tamil Nadu
Mobile Information Technology for Rural Advancement - MITRA	Rural Livelihood	PEDA	Rajasthan
Using ICT for Improving Livestock Productivity - NANDINI	Rural Livelihoods	OCAC	Orissa
Mobile - Government	Governance	West Bengal State Rural Development Agency	West Bengal
Centre for Development Process Innovations through ICTs - Community Radio Unit	Women's Empowerment	IT for Change	Karnataka
Real Time Provisioning of Fishing Zone Information	Livelihood/ Early Warning	INCOIS- Kutch Nav Nirman Abhiyan	Gujarat

Table 1 List of Pilot Projects supported by UNDP



1.5 Limitations and Constraints

The following could be said to represent the constraints under which the project was executed and the limitations of the recommendations and conclusions made in this document.

COMPRESSED TIMEFRAMES

The project has been extremely compressed in terms of the timeframe in which tasks had to be performed. Typically a field visit to a project site lasted about two days with one of them being dedicated for visiting the pilot sites where the project was to be implemented. More often than not, the pilot sites were in remote locations which further cut into the time permissible for interactions. However, the team, and often the target communities, went out of their way to ensure that the planned meetings actually took place, however late into the night the interactions went.

VERACITY OF THE DOCUMENTS AND FACTS CONTAINED THEREIN

Factual details of the projects have been extracted from documents shared by implementing agencies and other stakeholders including Detailed Project Reports, the Proposal to the UNDP, Mid-Term Appraisal and other such literature. Facts contained in these documents, our learnings during interactions at the field level and subsequent discussions we had internally have been instrumental in our drawing the conclusions contained in this document. It is assumed, therefore, that the factual details contained in the documents are correct.

SAMPLE REPRESENTATIVE ENOUGH

During our field visits the team has visited a few of the target communities who were the intended beneficiaries for this project. However, paucity of time has meant that we could interact with only a sample set of beneficiaries. It is assumed that interactions

Deloitte.

we have had with them were largely representative of the entire set of target communities for the respective projects.

CORRECTNESS OF RESPONSES TO THE QUESTIONNAIRE

Every field visit was preceded by eliciting responses to a Questionnaire that was circulated substantially in advance to the implementing partners. Our conclusions are also based on the factual responses presented in the responses.

QUANTITATIVE TECHNIQUE BUT A MODEL

A model has been conceptualised for a "quantitative" evaluation of each of these projects based on parameters that could be said to constitute a measure of each of the five attributes on which the projects were to be evaluated, namely, Effectiveness, Relevance, Efficiency, Results/Impacts and Sustainability. Every project was then graded on a scale of 1 through 6 in increasing order of success. It must be understood that this is after all a model and another set of minds could well have an evaluation model which could be different from what has been presented. Nevertheless the model does broadly indicate the relative performance of each of the projects evaluated.

2. Approach and Methodology

2.1 Understanding

The table provided in the "Introduction" section represents the group of projects that need to be evaluated. On closer scrutiny the following is revealed:

THEMATIC AREAS OF INTERVENTION

The projects centre on the following thematic areas of intervention:

- Integrated Citizen Services, or making services delivered to the citizens to be centred around life events
- or business-episodes rather than department-centric;
- Rural Livelihoods, or making gainful and effective use of ICT towards increasing rural livelihood options;
- Governance, or using ICT to improve governance processes towards making them more transparent, equitable, accountable and other similar parameters; and
- Women's Empowerment, or using ICT to better empower women's lives and narrow the gender divide.

Any Project could have within its ambit one or more of the above themes.

DIMENSIONS OF INVOLVEMENT

The implementation of the projects takes into account the following dimensions of involvement:

- Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, or making the citizen the centre of the service delivery processes;
- Capacity Building or enhancing the capability of the departmental staff towards offering citizen centric service delivery and bringing about better levels of internal efficiencies and effectiveness;
- Change Management, or making the change stick through a gradual transformation of the governance processes;
- Business Process Re-Engineering, or revisiting the front office and backoffice governance processes towards making them more effective and efficient;
- Public Private Partnerships or deploying the most appropriate alternative of ownership and management that utilizes the best of private sector

efficiencies and public sector sensitivities;

- Bridging the Digital Divide, or narrowing the gap between the digital haves and have-nots; and
- Knowledge and Experience-sharing, or using ICT to bring about better knowledge and experience sharing through various means.

Any project would typically have most of these dimensions taking place in it.

STAKEHOLDERS FOR THE PROJECTS

Typically the following are the stakeholders

- The Department of Information Technology, Government of India;
- The National Institute of Smart Governance;



Figure 2 Linkages between Areas of Intervention, Evaluation parameters and Stakeholders



- Line departments who are the implementing agencies;
- Members of the Civil Society and the Private sector that lend the initiative the multi-stakeholder focus; and
- The United Nations Development Programme (UNDP).
- A comprehensive look at the assignment would involve examining all three aspects listed above as shown in the figure.

2.2 Overall Approach

Before we cover the sections on approach followed for the project and the methodology deployed to carry out our activities for evaluation of the project, presented below is a brief description of how the project has been conceptualised.

2.2.1 Conceptualisation of the Project

Conceptually, the assignment would involve evaluating projects for steps taken during the planning (whether effectiveness and efficiency were built into it) and implementation stages (the extent to which projects achieved what they set out to achieve).

Effectiveness

Effectiveness as a planning construct identifies whether the issues that the projects intend to address have been

defined correctly and, having thus identified the issues, whether the mix of objectives, activities and resources has been outlined clearly for the project. Typically, then, the "Effectiveness" of the project in the planning phase defines the "what" of the project.

Broadly speaking, the following constitute the planning effectiveness of the projects:

- Identification and definition of Issue;
- Identification of stakeholders;
- Definition of objectives of the project;
- Objective were precise, verifiable and achievable;
- Objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was logically linked;
- Project elements were logical and commensurate with time and resource;
- Quantity and quality of project inputs;
- Identification of the needs of the beneficiaries;
- Identification of the expectations of the stakeholders;
- Development priorities for Gol/State Government correctly identified; and
- Aligning the project objectives with the UNDP areas of focus.

Efficiency

Efficiency as another planning construct implies whether the activities that have been identified above have been performed cost-effectively or not. That is to say, with the most optimum usage of resources including people, funds, infrastructure, equipments and such other material support that are required for the project. "Efficiency", therefore, in the planning phase defines the "how" of the project.

Broadly speaking, the following constitute the planning efficiency of the projects:

- Quality and timeliness of inputs, activities received;
- Responsiveness of project management to changes, monitoring by parties;
- Flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment;
- Use of resources the most optimum possible;
- Cleary articulated activities and respective roles and responsibilities of stakeholders who would perform them;
- Work plan prepared and followed timeliness with actual plan;
- Factors affecting the outputs correctly spotted;
- Use of local expertise, indigenous technologies and resources; and
- Institutional arrangements for execution and implementation.

<u>Output</u>

Output as an implementation construct is the immediate deliverable that results from the performance of activities that have been planned. In the context of the current project, this is likely to be an ICT product or a service; for example, the output for a project could be a multipurpose Internet kiosk to be thrown open to public as one of the measures to bridge the digital divide.

The output of any project could be from the following

- ICT products and/or services for improved governance/ service delivery, women's empowerment, and generating rural livelihoods.
- ICT for strengthening decentralization and promoting gender equality
- Management processes with which to operationalise outputs
- Clear definition of roles and responsibilities for the participating stakeholders

- Monitoring and evaluation framework, systems and processes
- Lesson learned for country, state ownership and stakeholder involvement

Outcome

Outcome as an implementation result is the eventual deliverable that results from the performance of activities that have been planned. In the context of the current project, this is likely to be development benefit or advantage; for example, the outcome for a project that uses a multi-purpose Internet kiosk as described above could be the generation of rural livelihoods that beneficiaries have available to them with the advantage of ICT and easily available and affordable connectivity.

Figure 3 conceptualizes the whole project.

The evaluation of the project closely follows the Logical Framework (LogFrame) approach wherein the project goals, objectives, outputs, activities and resources/inputs are closely tied together, such that any one stage can be linked to and be derived from the immediately preceding stage.

Table 2-The Logical Framework Approach

The Logical Framework Approach

The Logical Framework Approach (LFA) is a set of designing tools to be used for analysis, assessment, follow-up and evaluation of projects. The purpose of LFA is to undertake participatory, objectives-oriented planning that spans the life of project (including setting priorities and plan for implementation and monitoring) to build stakeholder team commitment and capacity with a series of workshops.

To move from an idea to planning and managing the overall project using the LFA, 7 core questions are addressed which include:

Who are we?This includes evaluation of the environment in which the project is to be implemented including factors that may influence the
project and identification of all those who may affect or will get affected by the proposed project)Where are we now?This includes identification of the main/ focal problem that is proposed to be addressed and its immediate and subsidiary

causes and effects which is depicted in the form of a problem tree

Where we want to be? This includes he building of *objective tree* is formed which is typically a reverse image of the problem tree and classifies the overall objectives of the project at three levels (i.e. Overall objectives; Project purpose; Results)

How will we get there? Clusters of objectives to be included in the project wherein the main objective becomes the project purpose and the lower order objectives become the outputs or results and activities.

What may stop us? (Under this assumptions and critical risks - both internal and external to the project are identified and their mitigation strategies are developed - which may in some cases even add to the activities already identified)

How we know we got there? This includes measuring performance of goals, outcomes and objectives for project and completion of activities. How do we know we are on target and/or have achieved our objectives? This includes verification of the above indicators- that would be used to

monitor/evaluate the programme/ project- could include minutes of meetings, stakeholder feedback, surveys, reports, project reviews, etc)



APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY

← PLANN	ING>		R E S U	L T S	<u> </u>
EFFECTIVENESS	EFFICIENCY		Ουτρυτ	OUTCOME	EVALUATION REPORT
 Problem was identified correctly Identification of the stakeholder Objectives of the project were correct Objective were precise, verifiable and achievable Objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was logical Project elements were logical and commensurate with time and resource Quantity and quality of project inputs Needs of the beneficiaries Expectations of the stakeholders Development priorities for Gol correctly identified UNDP areas of focus correctly harmonised with the project 	 Quality and timeliness of - inputs, activities was received Responsiveness of project management of changes and monitoring by concerned parties Flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment. Use of resources the most optimum possible Project strategy Cleary articulated Work plan prepared and followed timeliness with actual plan Factors affecting the outputs correctly spotted Local expertise, indigenous technologies and resources Institutional arrangements for execution and implementation 	IMPLEMENTATION	 ICT for improved governance / service delivery has been operationalised ICT for strengthening decentralization and promoting gender equality Management processes Roles and responsibilities Monitoring and evaluation framework, systems and processes Risk assessment and management Sustainability of the project Lesson learned for country, state ownership Financial management established Implementation strategy Involvement of local communities, NGOs, CBOs 	 Poverty reduction Governance: participation of the local communities in natural resource management and decision making Promotion of gender equality Achievement of project and assessment of effectiveness in solving problem Outputs effectively and efficiency Asses project impact Collaborative approach capacity building done under the project Information exchange/sharing, 	 Brief List of Annexes Executive Summary Introduction: background and context of the programme Description of the program - its logic theory, results framework and external factors likely to affect success Purpose of the evaluation Key questions and scope of the evaluation with information on limitations and de limitations Approach and methodology Findings Summary and explanation of findings and interpretations Conclusions Lessons, generalizations, alternatives
	Cit	izen	Centric Service	Delivery	

Public Private Partnership

Capacity Building

Change Management

Business Process Re-Engineering

Knowledge and Experience-sharing

Figure 3 Conceptualisation of the Project

2.2.2 Overall Approach for the Project

The project will be executed in the five SEQUENTIAL STAGES of "Initiation", "Deskwork", "Finalising Questionnaire", "Field Work" and "Final Outcome".

Activities to be performed have been

categorized into seven STREAMS, which are the same as the dimensions of involvement that has been earlier described, namely, Bridging the Digital Divide, Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, Business Process Re-engineering, Capacity Building, Change Management, Public Private Partnerships and Knowledge and Experience Sharing.

Besides "deliverables" that are stagelinked, interim working papers have also been produced. Figure 4 brings out this overall approach.

STAGE	INITIATION	DESK WORK	FINALIZING QUESTIONNAIRE	FIELD WORK	FINAL OUTCOME		
ACTIVITIES	 Defining project charter Outlining roles, responsibilities Meetings with the UNDP & other related key officials. Identifying contact personnel's related to projects Preparation and submission of inception report 	 Thorough analysis of documents like review meeting minutes/ Quarterly & Annual Reports /Back-to-office Reports etc. Develop a detailed evaluation framework developed and discussed/ finalise with DIT, UNDP and NISG officials. 	 Develop and finalize a detailed questionnaire with focus areas including: Project concept & Design Implementation and management of the project Results of the project Key lessons learnt 	 Conduct visits to the Identified locations to gain understanding of the entire project life cycle. Cover the areas identified in the questionnaire. 	 Prepare draft Evaluation report Prepare draft notes on success stories identified Discuss with key officials of UNDP Finalize evaluation report after incorporated the changes suggested by UNDP. 		
DELIVERABLE	Inception Report	Interim Working Papers	Questionnaire	 Draft & Final Evalu Success Stories 	uation report		
TIMELINE	0-5 days	0-10 days	0-10 days	20-50 days	50-75 days		
METHODOLOGIES & SOURCES	Kick off	Kick off Image: Constraint of the second					
DIMENSIONS OF INVOLVEMENT	Bridging Digital Divide Citizen Centric Service Delivery Public Private Partnership Capacity Building Change Management Business Process Re-Engineering Knowledge and Experience-sharing						
30				Figure 4	Overall Approach for the Project		



2.3 Parameters of Evaluation

The evaluation of the progress of the projects and its achievements will be tested against the following criteria that are described below.

2.3.1 Relevance

By Relevance is implied the extent to which the activity is suited to local and national development priorities and organizational policies, including changes over time. Relevance of the project can be captured in terms of the following parameters:

- Whether the needs of the beneficiaries have been captured;
- Whether the project is relevant to needs & expectations of beneficiary;
- Whether the project is relevant to development priorities of Government of India;
- Whether the project is relevant to development priorities of concerned State Government;
- Whether the project is relevant to UNDP four focal theme;
- Whether the identified problem has high incidence in area of focus;
- Whether a correct & accurate identification of target stakeholders and/or correctly defined vulnerable groups was done;

- Whether there was adequacy of Government commitment to project; and
- Whether the project had relevance to ICT4D focus under the project.

2.3.2 Effectiveness

Effectiveness means the extent to which an objective has been achieved or how likely it is to be achieved can be captured in terms of the following parameters:

- Whether the problem been stated correctly and distinctly;
- Whether nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries, users of the project have been identified as stakeholders of the project;
- Whether assumptions, objectives, outputs and outcomes have been clearly articulated in measurable terms;
- Whether linkages between objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was clear;
- Whether the planning component of the project takes into account the use of ICT for improved governance / service delivery in various areas through pilot initiatives, encouraging BPR, development local solutions and applications and encouragement of PPP model;
- Whether the project has the assistance, relationship, relevance to and

coordination with the pre-existing Project management system and staff;

- Whether there is clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various institutional arrangements for overall programme management and implementation and the level of coordination between relevant players; and
- Extent of conflict of interest either between stakeholders involved in the project or with outside agencies.

2.3.3 Efficiency

Efficiency implies the extent to which results have been delivered with the least costly resources possible. This can be captured in terms of the following parameters:

- Was a formal workplan made at the start of the project to determine the timeframe in which activities would be performed;
- Were resources made available to the project implementation agencies in accordance with the requirements of the workplan;
- Extent of deviation in the project implementation in so far as timelines are concerned;
- Responsiveness of the project management to such deviations and flexibility to deploy resources;

- Were any systems, processes, manuals etc made to govern the activities in the project among the different stakeholders;
- Extent to which roles and responsibilities of the different stakeholders participating in the project were made clear during the implementation;
- Extent to which Results Based Management has been used;
- Whether there was an adequacy of steps taken to resolve any conflict of interest in or due to the project;
- Extent to which already available resources have been deployed (people, infrastructure, equipments etc); and
- Extent of participation of the government in the project.

2.3.4 Results/Impacts

Results/impacts means the positive and negative, and foreseen and unforeseen, changes to and effects produced by a development intervention. This can be captured in terms of the following parameters:

- Whether the project has produced its desired immediate outputs;
- Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, use of the new outputs as against the traditional options);

- Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, percentage of the target population);
- Extent of drop-outs from usage of the outputs by the intended beneficiaries;
- Are there any unforeseen/ unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups;
- Extent of the project results on the target beneficiaries in terms of (a) Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, (b) Capacity Building, (c) Change Management, (d) Business Process Reengineering, (f) Public Private Partnership, (g) Bridging the Digital Divide, and (h) Knowledge and Experience Sharing;
- Extent of the project impact on the target groups in terms of (a) governance (improved efficiency, transparency and accountability), (b) citizen-centric service delivery (advantages of cost, time and convenience), (c) rural livelihoods (number of jobs, extent and sufficiency of employment), and (d) women's empowerment (increased knowledge, and use of the same to voice their concerns);
- Extent of significance of the project impact on the development of the region/country;

- Extent of utilization of the project outputs by marginalized communities; and
- Extent to which capacities have been built in stakeholders during the project.

2.3.5 Sustainability

Sustainability is the likely ability of an intervention to continue to deliver benefits for an extended period of time after completion. Projects need to be environmentally as well as financially and socially sustainable. This can be captured in terms of the following parameters:

- Extent of ownership of stakeholders in the project;
- Degree of support given by the Government in integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme;
- Extent of availability of inputs/resources required for the project (people, finances, infrastructure, equipments);
- Have any revenue streams been defined in the project to make it self-sustaining;
- Extent of success of such pre-defined revenue streams;
- Extent to which inventory of the assets created out of the grants received in the project have been properly maintained and transferred to the beneficiaries;



- Degree of collaboration that has developed among stakeholders during the project; and
- Extent to which government is willing to finance the project after its completion of the UNDP funding.

The assessment of each of the projects in terms of each of the above parameters

described above has been done into each of the following categories (from best to worst) on scale of 5 through 1:

- Highly Satisfactory
- Satisfactory
- Moderately Satisfactory
- Moderately Unsatisfactory
- Unsatisfactory
- Highly Unsatisfactory

In order to make the evaluation of the project in terms of each of these evaluation parameters as objective as possible, Annexure I brings out the basis on which any project merits the above ratings on the identified parameters.

3. Project-Wise Findings

3.1 Bangalore One

	Table 3 Introduction- Bangalore Une	
Project Title	Bangalore One	
Proponent Organisation	e-Governance Secretariat, Government of Karnataka	
Implementation State	Karnataka	
Target Site for Pilot Project	Bangalore	
Theme of Project	Integrated Citizen Service	Sector Sector
Target Population	Approximately 6 million citizens	
Funding Required for Project	Rs. 150 Lakh	
Name(s) of Partner Agencies	Other Government departments	

IMPACT OF THE PROJECT IN BRIEF

The Government of Karnataka has adopted PPP model for providing citizens a one-stop-shop for Government services (G2C) and business to citizen services (B2C) through a project called as Bangalore One. Adoption of the PPP model, process re-engineering, clear work allocation and strict monitoring of SLAs have resulted in overall efficiency, effectivness, accountability in services and increase in convenience to citizens.

OBJECTIVE AREAS	OUTPUTS	OUTCOMES
Providing G2C & B2C services in a convenient and efficient manner through integrated citizen service centers	 16 Centers with 195 counters across Bangalore 24 services of 17 departments including 18 G2C and 6 B2C services 	 87.17 lakh transactions during 2009, valuing more than Rs. 649 crores Round the clock, jurisdiction free services are being delivered at all the centers Centres are located such that citizens do not have to travel very far for availing services
Enhancing accountability, transparency and responsiveness to citizens' needs	• Performance monitoring of service delivery at each center by Bangalore One directorate against the pre-defined SLAs	 Reduction in corruption was found, mainly due to the PPP approach of service delivery, as 97.5 percent did not have to pay any extra charges for availing the services Lower defaults in bill payments and tax collections
Providing cost-effective methods of service provision to the departments	 All payment modes (cash, cheque, demand draft and credit card) available to the Citizens Most of the services can be availed through portal 	• Reduction in payment cost and travel (due to availability of services close to residences and workplaces) - Costs of visits reduced, with 35 % of incurring no costs and 55 % spending less than Rs. 25 a month*
Ensuring speed and certainty of providing services	• Service Level Agreement with Private Partner and participating departments	 Time taken for payment of utility bills took less than 15 minutes for 88 % of the respondents* Average waiting time is 6.5 minutes and transaction time is 1.5 minutes*

* Lessons from Public Service Delivery in Karnataka, India: Gopal Naik, K .P. Basavarajappa, Nageena Sultana and Prasanna Rashmi K K of IIM-Bangalore



3.1.1 Project Background

Bangalore One - The Concept

The Government of Karnataka (GoK) has taken up an initiative to provide integrated services to the citizens deploying the tools of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) so as to enhance Speed, Convenience, Certainty and Accountability in providing such services through the concept of a 'One-Stop-Shop' facility called Bangalore One or B1 Project.

B1 Project envisioned to redefine public service through its focus on the common man, to provide citizens of Karnataka all G2C and G2B services and information of departments and agencies of Central, State and Local Governments in an efficient, reliable, transparent and integrated manner on a sustained basis, with certainty, through easy access to a chain of computerized Integrated Citizen Service Centers (ICSC's) and through multiple delivery channels like kiosks, mobile phones and the Internet

Salient Features of Bangalore One

Salient Features of the Bangalore One project are:

- Non Stop Services: Services on 24X7 basis including all holidays;
- One Stop Shop: Multiple services of Government and Private Companies available under one roof;
- No service charges: Citizens do not have to pay any service charge;
- Jurisdiction free services: services are available on any time any where basis;
- Choice of Pay modes: Can pay through cash/cheques/DDs/ Credit cards;
- No more standing in queues: centres are equipped with well designed chairs to wait;
- Quality Service: waiting and transaction times for delivery of services are defined within which the services will be delivered;

- Citizen Friendly ambience: air-conditioned, elegant, comfortable with citizen friendly executives ,Television, drinking water ,newspapers and magazines;
- Electronic Queue Management System: at all centres to monitor transactions and waiting time for each transaction; and
- Services through Internet: can also avail the bill payment services for few of the departments through Bangalore One website.

Key Issue

Earlier, the citizens had to spend several hours for availing Government services, making multiple visits for completion of the same task and at various government offices to obtain similar services.

3.1.2 Project Strategic Objectives

The project identified following specific objectives for the Bangalore One project:

- To provide G2C & B2C services in a convenient and efficient manner through integrated citizen service centres;
- To scale up operations to cover all G2C services throughout Bangalore City;
- To enhance accountability, transparency and responsiveness to citizens needs;
- To provide cost-effective methods of service provision to departments;
- To provide efficient and real-time MIS and EIS (Enterprise Information Systems) to departments;
- To ensure speed and certainty of providing the services through enforcement of Service Level Agreement with the Private Partner (BOOT Operator) and participating departments; and
- To enable the Government departments and agencies to focus on their core functions and responsibilities by freeing them from the

routine operations like collection of revenues and accounting, issuing of certificates etc, thereby enhance overall productivity of the administrative machinery.

Strategic Innovations

The project involved following key innovations:

- The centres function 24 hours a day & 7 days a week;
- MIS Reports: Role based MIS reports are made available to all stakeholders. Customized reports for all departments are made available based on their requirement;
- Dynamic Reconciliation reports: Data reconciliation in real time has been implemented as part of MIS reports to confirm data transfer from Bangalore One data centre to department servers and to identify mismatches at the individual record level.
- Electronic Queue Management System: Electronic Queue Management System is adopted in all Bangalore One centres to give service on first come first serve basis and also to capture the waiting time for citizens. EQMS reports help to enforce service level agreement with the PPP partner and there are penalties in case SLAs are breached;
- Redundancy and fail over mechanism of infrastructure deployed at Bangalore One Project through following fall back mechanism:
 - Man power operations: 15% leave reserve,
- Power supply: UPS and diesel engine generator,

- Connectivity: ISDN back up to leased lines. In the event of disruption of the entire network, services shall continue through an offline server at each of the centres
- o Data centre: Disaster recovery and business continuity site,
- Systems: Network Load balancing and fail over.
- Automation of various processes:
 - SLA reports are made available Online;
 - Payment Grid to effect and track the transfer of collections to the departments;
 - Automated generation of covering letters for cheque bounces; and
 - Automated monitoring of operator's attendance.

3.1.3 Project Relevance Inputs

Identification of Information and Services Needs

The information and services requirements of citizens were identified through comprehensive surveys, focused group sessions, personal interactions during training sessions / seminars and workshops / helpdesk conversations. The government officials from various departments also suggested services based on historical trends of demand.

Table 5 Stakeholders - Bangalore One

Stakeholder	Role(s) Played
Government Departments/ Agencies	• Provide built-up space or land to start Bangalore One centres and provide fund for site preparation for few centres
	Close down existing citizen service centres that are co-located with Bangalore One centres
	Enter into service level agreement with Bangalore One Directorate
Partner Bank	 Keep one day float on a day's collection through Bangalore One and bear the salary expenses of the operators of Bangalore One.
	• Provide note counting machine, card swiping machine, arrange for cash pick from the centres.
	Provide free Banking services for the participating departments
	Provide funds for promotional activities of Bangalore One.


3.1.4 Project Effectiveness Inputs

Project Stakeholders and Envisaged Roles

The stakeholders involved in the project are as follows.

- 1. Government Departments / Agencies;
- 2. Citizens; and
- 3. Private Service providers.

Table 6 brings out the different stakeholders involved and the respective roles they played.

Risks and Mitigation Strategies

Following risks were identified and mitigation strategies applied:

- Data security: Security of data was perceived to be a major risk. It was ensured through restricted access to databases for private players.
- Existence of parallel government centres for the services Partner departments were asked to close their centres which were co-located / near to Bangalore One centres.

3.1.5 Project Results/Impacts Generated

Results/ impacts generated through Bangalore One

- Operating 16 Centres with 195 counters;
- Started with 13 services of 10 departments, presently offers 24 services of 17 departments which include 18 services of Government and 6 services of Private companies;
- More than 87.17 lakh transactions during 2009, valuing more than Rs. 649 crores;
- Round the clock, jurisdiction free services are being delivered at all the centres. From 2nd April 2005 till date Bangalore One never stopped delivery of the service;
- All pay modes (cash, cheque, demand draft and credit card) are available to the Citizens;
- Service oriented approach and citizen friendly delivery has facilitated the life of Citizens;

- Most of the services are made available on portal; and
- Citizens can pay their bills, taxes without producing the bills, challans etc.

Factors Facilitating/Impeding the Production of Outputs

The following factors have helped iron out problems in implementation of the project as well as in attracting citizens to avail services:

- Clarity in the role of partners;
- Government taking major role in coordinating with various government agencies; and
- Government providing back end support coupled with private partners' initiative to keep the B1 centres open for longer hours

Unforeseen/Unintended Outputs Resultant from the Project

The unintended outputs that have resulted due to Bangalore One are:

- Reduction in corruption was found, mainly due to the PPP approach of service delivery, as 97.5 percent did not have to pay any extra charges for availing the services;
- Lower defaults in bill payments and tax collections;
- Process and policy changes in the government, where for the first time in India, a private player has been given the responsibility of processing and delivering passports;
- Increase in traffic fine collections, as hitherto people who feared visiting courts or police stations did so at the convenience of B1; and
- Reduction in travel and thereby traffic congestion and pollution due to availability of services close to residences and workplaces.

3.1.6 Project Sustainability Considerations

Financial sustainability

The financial sustainability considerations were:

- The respective stakeholder shall pay the fixed transaction charges to the Directorate and the same amount shall be paid to the Bangalore One Partner;
- The partner bank keeps one day float on a day's collection through Bangalore One and bears the salary expenses of the operators of Bangalore One;
- Bangalore One Directorate is financially self-sufficient. A part of the transaction fee comes to the Bangalore One Directorate to run its day to day expenses including staff salaries through the transaction charges and doesn't depend on the Government funding for its functioning;
- Addition of more services and opening of more centres as per citizen demands lead to increase in the number of transactions and in turn the PPP partner will be benefited and makes him economically sustainable; and
- BOOT model of the project.

External Sustainability

The external sustainability considerations were:

- Departments to close down their existing citizen service centres which are co-located with Bangalore One centres;
- Departments to explore the possibility of integrating their services with Bangalore One before opening their centres;
- Participating departments to enter into service level agreement with Bangalore One Directorate; and
- Service level agreement with the banking partner;

Project Institutional Arrangements

The private players are responsible for the functioning of all facilities and services at the centers, the government ensures the participation of the state departments besides providing the space with furniture and fixtures. Initially, the centers were set up in government-owned premises, and as the number of centers increased, buildings were rented in. The requests for G2C received at the service centers are processed at either B1 itself or the respective departments (e.g., passports) and certificates are issued to the citizens.

EVALUATING THE PROJECT

The project has been evaluated on five parameters viz. Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Results/Impacts and Sustainability which were further affirmed by subparameters illustrated in Table 6 that exhibits the evaluation in six categories of Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Moderately Satisfactory, Moderately Unsatisfactory, Unsatisfactory And Highly Unsatisfactory, accounting respectively for 6,5,4,3,2 and 1 points. The right most column substantiates the scores. The rating for each of the parameters was arrived at after averaging on the ratings for each of the sub-parameters. Similarly the overall evaluation rating were arrived at after averaging on the parameter ratings.



Figure 5 Evaluating the Project- Bangalore One





KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE NEXT STEPS

MOBILE BASED STATUS TRACKING AND ALERTS

Mobile based (through SMSs) option could be provided to applicants for tracking status of their application, date of delivery, alerts etc. This could increase the convenience of applicants as they would not have to visit the B1 centres or portal repetitively.

PUBLISH PERFORMANCES OF B1 CENTRES, PARTICIPANT DEPARTMENTS AND PRIVATE PARTNERS FOR IMPROVED TRANSPARENCY AND MOTIVATION FOR BETTER PERFORMANCE

The performances of various Bangalore-one centres, participant department and private partners can be published for public viewing. This would give citizens a peek into the benefits that B1 project is bringing. It can motivate good performers and push bad performers in performing better. Hence it can result in overall improvement of the performance, motivation of staff and increased transparency.

EXPANSION OF SERVICES

B1 may tie up with various other departments and private parties for providing their services through this initiative. This would have a cascading effect as more services would attract more citizens and in turn would attract more service providers. The ideal impact would be conversion of B1 into a true one-stop-shop for all Government services and most of the common private services.

SELF HELP KIOSKS

Self help kiosks could be installed at B1 centres for providing services which requires minimum human interaction such as searching for information on government services, eligibility criteria, status tracking, printing of challans etc. This would also give portal access to citizens who do not have internet connectivity. The applicants would be able to do electronic payments through such kiosks. This would directly impact the size of queue at the counters and waiting time as well as the cost of manpower required at the counter.

CATEGORIZATION OF SERVICES AND ESTABLISHING SPECIFIC COUNTERS FOR HIGH VOLUME SERVICES

As service requests for few services are quite high during a given period of time such as electricity bill submission or water bill submission, which have a common deadline for all residents of a region. Hence during those peak periods, queue on counters would be quite large and an applicant visiting for availing a different service would have to wait for a long time. Hence it is suggested that few counters be dedicated for specific services during their peak time for convenience of the citizens.

COMMUNITY MONITORING OF BANGALORE ONE CENTRES

Local community could be involved in monitoring the performances of Bangalore One centres. A team of representatives may be helpful in not only overseeing the performances but also providing valuable suggestions on improvement of service levels, incorporation of specific services required for the region etc.

3.1.7 Project Evaluation Matrix

							Table 6 Project Evaluation Matrix- bangatore One	
EVALUATION MATRIX	Нісні Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks	
					RELE	VANCE		
Needs of the beneficiary captured							 Needs of All Possible beneficiary groups (including citizens, Govt. departments and private players) captured Formal procedure (questionnaire, meetings, discussion forums,) followed. 	
Relevant to needs & expectations of beneficiary							 High correlation between citizens' needs and project objectives Objectives and design captures needs of all beneficiary groups The project is suitable and capable to incorporate new or up-coming needs / expectations of beneficiaries even during execution period 	
Relevant to development priorities of Govt. of India							• Project designed to meet and fully aligned towards development priorities identified in Govt. of India's budget	
Relevant to development priorities of concerned State Government							 Project designed to meet and fully aligned towards development priorities identified in Govt. of Karnataka's budget 	
Identified problem has high incidence in area of focus							• The services provided are relevant to all the citizens / residents of Bangalore	
Correct & accurate identification of target stakeholders and/or correctly defined vulnerable groups							• Precise and comprehensive definitions for stakeholders available	
Adequacy of Government commitment to project							• The project is a part of Government structure and its execution is assigned to the Bangalore One Directorate under e-Governance Secretariat.	
Project relevance to ICT4D focus under the project							• The project brings significant improvement / development of majority of citizens through information availability, access of resources and services (both Govt. as well as private services)	
				E	FFECT	IVENE	SS	
Problem been stated correctly and distinctly							Problem clearly defined with no or little scope of misunderstanding	





Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	SATISFACTORY	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks	
Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries, users of the project are identified as stakeholders of the project							 Roles and responsibilities and other details of each stakeholder group also identified Interaction and needs of each stakeholder group identified 	
The assumptions, objectives, outputs and outcomes have been clearly articulated in measurable terms							• Objectives and outcomes identified and defined in a clear and unambiguous manner. All assumptions articulated but impact is not clearly articulated	
The linkages between objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was clear							• Logical linkages present but not documented	
The project design allowed for flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment.							• Project design capable of adapting to and responding positively to most of the possible types of changes.	
Degree of support given by the Government towards integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme and other related projects							• The project objectives are already part of the national e-governance plan	
Planning component of the project take into account the use of ICT for improved governance / service delivery in various areas through pilot initiatives, encouraging BPR, development local solutions and applications and encouragement of PPP model	•						 Sophisticated ICT applications and tools used Localization of solution: ICT tools are user friendly and easy in handling for local users. BPR: In-depth BPR to improve the convenience of users, reduce time & effort drastically, make available information & service any-time to anybody from any-where - practically PPP: PPP model implemented to ensure sustainability of the initiative 	
The adequacy of institutional arrangements in attaining the long-term objective of the project. Also the infrastructural, logistical, and financial implication of sustaining the project objectives beyond the project duration/after completion of UNDP funding.							• Infrastructure arrangement adequate for the entire planned duration	
Project's linkages, liaison, coordination and impact upon related activities under NeGP being implemented in the country.							 The project derives its objectives from NeGP and directly contributes in achieving NeGP's goals and objectives 	
The project's assistance, relationship, relevance to and coordination with the pre-							• Uses the pre-existing management system effectively and coordinates with them effectively.	

EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks	
existing Project management system and staff								
Clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various institutional arrangements for overall programme management and implementation and the level of coordination between relevant players							 Roles and responsibilities of all the institutional arrangements defined, in a formal and legally binding manner 	
Risk assessment and management of the project							Proper risk assessment done periodically during the entire project duration.Risk mitigation planned to certain extent	
Efforts of stakeholders in support of the implementation of the project							Assessment of efforts of stakeholders done through formal procedure	
Extent of conflict of interest either between stakeholders involved in the project or with outside agencies.							Certain degree of conflict of interest may be present.Basic procedure to handle exceptions present	
					EFFIC	IENCY		
Was a formal workplan made at the start of the project to determine the timeframe in which activities would be performed							 Detailed workplan prepared for all activities along with the resources responsible for performing the activities. Date wise timelines defined for each activity Gantt chart (or similar work plan charts) also prepared for better visual impact and monitoring 	
Were resources made available to the project implementation agencies in accordance with the requirements of the workplan							• Almost all the resource requirement fulfilled as per plan	
Extent of deviation in the project implementation in so far as timelines is concerned.							• Most of the major milestones have been achieved as per the work plan	
Responsiveness of the project management to such deviations and flexibility to deploy resources							• Management taking necessary steps to reduce the delay by bring in additional resources, doing parallel work, or other corrective measures	





Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks	
Were any systems, processes, manuals etc made to govern the activities in the project among the different stakeholders							• Though instructions are clear and specific but not comprehensive	
Extent to which Results Based Management has been used							Continuous RBM under usage	
Whether there was adequacy of steps taken to resolve any conflict of interest in or due to the project							• Adequate steps taken at right time to resolve all conflict of interest situations	
				RE	SULTS	/IMPA	стѕ	
Whether the project has produced its desired immediate outputs							• More than 90% of immediate outputs achieved including all the major outputs	
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, use of the new outputs as against the traditional options)							• Sizable portion of citizens used the project output through Bangalore One	
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, percentage of the target population)							• Sizable portion of citizens utilized the services through Bangalore One	
Extent of drop-outs from usage of the outputs by the intended beneficiaries							• Significantly less drop-out from usage of outputs by the intended beneficiaries	
Are there any unforeseen/ unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups							Yes it helped in reduction of corruption	
Extent of the project results on the target beneficiaries in terms of (a) Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, (b) Capacity Building, (c) Change Management, (d) Business Process Re-engineering, (f) Public Private Partnership, (g) Bridging the Digital Divide, and (h) Knowledge and Experience Sharing							• Of all the areas relevant to the project, excellence has been achieved in most of the cases	

EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks	
Extent of the project impact on the target groups in terms of (a) governance (improved efficiency, transparency and accountability), (b) citizen-centric service delivery (advantages of cost, time and convenience), (c) rural livelihoods (number of jobs, extent and sufficiency of employment), and (d) women's empowerment (increased knowledge, and use of the same to voice their concerns).							 Of all the areas relevant to the project, excellence has been achieved in majority of the cases 	
Extent of significance of the project impact on the development of the region/country							Significant development of the region	
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by marginalized communities							 No separate study conducted however sizable portion of such communities utilized the services 	
Extent to which capacities have been built in stakeholders during the project							• Capacities of most of the stakeholders (at least the main stakeholders) built up to at least perform the necessary activities assigned to / expected of them	
				ડા	JSTAI	ABILI	ГҮ	
Extent of ownership of stakeholders in the project							Complete ownership of all the stakeholders in the project	
Degree of support given by the Government in integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme							• The project derives its objectives from NeGP	
Extent of availability of inputs/resources required for the project (people, finances, infrastructure, equipments)							Resources or commitment available for the entire planned duration	
Have any revenue streams been defined in the project to make it self-sustaining							 Revenue stream defined with proper basis and justification with taking into consideration possible revenue generation scope 	
Extent of success of such pre-defined revenue streams							• Significant achievement	





Evaluation matrix	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Μοderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent to which inventory of the assets created out of the grants received in the project have been properly maintained and transferred to the beneficiaries							• Planned maintenance of the assets by well trained personnel
Degree of collaboration that has developed among stakeholders during the project							 Significant collaboration among stakeholders for operations as well as decision making related to the project
Extent to which government is willing to finance the project after its completion of the UNDP funding							• Government has taken up the entire project and run it completely including its roll-out and extension

3.2 Integrated Community Service Centres (i-CoSC)

46

Table 7 Introduction- iCoSC

Project Litle	Integrated Community Service Centres (1-CoSC)
Proponent Organisation	Department of Information Technology, Government of Himachal
	Pradesh (DoIT- HP)
Implementation State	Himachal Pradesh
Target Site for Pilot Project	Shimla
Theme of Project	Integrated Citizen Services(Administration at the door step of citizen)
Target Population	Implemented in Shimla District. Total target population is 7,21,745 and
	area is 5131 Sq.KM
Project Cost	Rs.7,32,28,877
Funding Required for Project	Rs 1,50,00,000
Time Required to Implement Project	18 months (actual project implementation period extended up to 4 years
	approx.)
Name(s) of Partner Agencies	



IMPACT OF THE PROJECT IN BRIEF

i-CoSC has been influential in making available a basket of Government services through single channel at the door-steps of the Citizens. The project has set up one-stop shop information resource and service centres for people in the state using simple but state-of-the-art methods of organizing, sharing, and communicating information.

OBJECTIVE AREAS	OUTPUTS	OUTCOMES
• Bring Government departments closer to the masses by offering efficacious and speedy services under a single window	 Project lead to the establishment of 16 Sugam centres at district, sub-division, tehsil and sub-tehsil level Approx 33 online and offline services including issuance of driving license, arms license, property registration, etc have been provided at the Sugam centers 	 Sugam Centre has added to convenience of the citizens as they are now not required to run from pillar to post to avail Government services. Services which are rendered by multiple departments have been brought under one umbrella near the door step of citizens leading to considerable savings in time and efforts required in availing these services Ease in availing various government services has also resulted in elimination of middle-men and reduction of corruption.
• Ensure availability of updated and latest information	• Touch screen Internet kiosks have been established in each Sugam centre	• Empowerment of citizens with the availability of updated information about mandi rates of the identified commodity, examination results, tourism related information, etc
• Reduce response time in addressing grievances by concerned departments	• E-Samadham software has been developed and implemented for grievance redressal	 Citizens can raise their problem/ query/ suggestion to higher officials of the government without any fear by registering on the e-Samadhan portal. Availability of information as a right empowers citizens and facilitates wider participation in the governance process.



3.2.1 Project Background

The Department of Information Technology (DoIT), Government of Himachal Pradesh is responsible for furthering the development of IT in the State of Himachal Pradesh. Broadly DoIT strives for:

- Encouraging investments in the IT sector industries in the State.
- Facilitating the establishment of IT institutes and improving the quality of IT education in the State.
- Using IT tools to ensure a SMART (Simple, Moral, Accountable, Responsive and Transparent) Government

The Secretary (Information Technology) is the functional Head of the DoIT.

Recognition of i-COSC Need

Himachal Pradesh is a state with difficult geographical terrain and climatic conditions. Individuals have to travel large distances on foot or by road to reach the appropriate level of administration to get their jobs done. Besides this, within a place, he may have to go to different offices for various kinds of jobs. This results in substantial wastage of time and money of an individual. To overcome the above problem, ICT was recognised as an important tool for providing services at the doorstep of rural



community, by bringing all citizen specific services and information under a single roof, cutting across different tiers of administration. This leads to the conceptualisation of ICT enabled centres at district, sub-divisional

and tehsil level, which should serve as a single window for citizens to get access to various government services. These centres were



termed as **Integrated Community Service Centre (i-COSC)**, which later on renamed as **Sugam Centres**. These centres should serve as front end for citizens, and should be integrated with various Government Departments for back end processing.

Project Description - Integrated Community Service Centre (i-COSC)

i-CoSC was a pilot project conceived and executed by Department of Information Technology, Government of Himachal Pradesh (GoHP) with support from United Nations Development Program, Department of Information Technology (Government of India) and National Institute for SMART Government (NISG) as part of the ICT4D initiatives in India. Shimla District was selected as pilot district to implement Sugam. A high level overview of the functioning of the I-COSC centre is illustrated in Figure 7.

3.2.2 Project Strategic Objectives

i-CoSC aimed at setting up one-stop shop information resource and service centres for people in the State using simple but state-ofthe-art methods of organizing, sharing, and communicating

information. The following have been identified as the main strategic objectives for the project:

- To improve quality of services by re-engineering administrative processes in order to extend convenience to users, minimization of expenditure/ manual work and sharing of information.
- To ensure greater transparency, efficiency, objectivity, accountability and speed that can help overcome unbridled discretion and corruption by providing improved services in a time bound manner.
- To bring Government departments closer to the masses by offering efficacious and speedy services under a single window.

- To ensure better dissemination of information through web portal and online status of applications submitted online or through post or by hand.
- To reduce the response time in addressing grievances by the concerned departments.
- To provide facilities to the farmers and villagers who make queries about latest techniques, advice for their problems, new technologies etc. from a group of experts pertaining to fields of agriculture, horticulture, animal husbandry, health, fisheries etc.
- To ensure availability of updated and latest information regarding public distribution system, list of beneficiaries under

different programmes, information regarding government grants given to PRIs and urban local bodies.

- To facilitate direct participation of the masses in governance.
- To solicit online feedback from users (citizens, departments etc) to improve the quality and features of the project.
- To provide Internet/ E-mail facilities and links to various departmental websites through District Headquarter.



Figure 7 High Level Overview of the Functioning of the I-COSC centre



Stakeholder	Role(s) Played
Citizens	 Citizens play a vital role in need assessment survey which forms the basis for services being provided by SUGAM. Citizens are the actual users of the services provided through the Sugam Centres and participated in feedback to further improve the service delivery design.
State Government Departments	 DoIT has been the project implementer and provided necessary strategic guidance & support in establishment of Sugam centres. Also, several other Government Departments/ Offices have been involved in effective provision of services to citizens through Sugam centres. These include: Office of Deputy Commissioner for issuance of handicap certificate Election Department for elector's registration & issuance of elector's photo identity cards Revenue Department for facilitating property registration Transport Department for issuance of driving license, registration certificates of new vehicles, etc Electricity Boards, Municipal Corporations, etc are involved in providing frontline services at i-CoSC centres.
NIC, Himachal Pradesh (National Informatics Centre)	 NIC helped in software designing, development and implementation for i-CoSC project. Its broad set of roles and responsibilities include: Designing of software application based on need assessment Guiding various departments and field offices of the Government for Computerization / E-Governance. Ensuring an integrated approach in Application Software development and Hardware Infrastructure creation, with a view to create Integrated Databases Implementation of the E-Governance Policies, as integral part of the overall IT Policy-2001 of the H.P. State Government.
Institutions of Local Self Government (PRIs, ULBs)	 Panchayats officials and local community leaders have participated in decision-making and in promotion of community management (moving towards community ownership and operation) of services and resources.

3.2.3 Project Relevance Inputs

Identification of Information and Services Needs

Need assessment survey for i-COSC project was undertaken by Himachal Productivity Council, Shimla. In order to ensure effective gathering of information need, the study factored the following:

- Taking into consideration the existing social infrastructure, the survey focussed on what exactly was needed to empower the population for whom the project was being implemented.
- The survey aimed at assessing whether ICT intervention provided will be more beneficial at a local micro-level (at the village) or at a macro level (district/ State)
- The survey was based on the premise that ICT project should not be technologically intensive, but be usable by local citizen.

3.2.4 Project Effectiveness Inputs

Project Stakeholders and Envisaged Roles

Table 9 brings out the different stakeholders involved and the roles they played.

Risks and Mitigation Strategies

The key risks and mitigation strategy are as follow:

- Risk of setting adequate fee structure for various services being offered from Sugam Centres to ensure self sustainability as well as adequate usage of the centre.
- To overcome the above risk, a need assessment survey was carried out to assess citizen's ability and readiness to pay for various services to be provided at Sugam centre.
- Government process delays may affect the project service delivery. The multiplicity of authorities involved also raises accountability issues.
- To overcome the issue of multiplicity of authorities, a team headed by the Deputy Commissioner at the district level and by the Secretary IT at state level was created for centralized decision making and accountability.
- Risk of leakage/ misuse of confidential information provided by citizen during any transaction with a Government Agency.
- To prevent leakage of citizen's information, efforts have been made to ensure that the information flow through a predefined

set of channels. Also new Law for Data Privacy has been formulated to safeguard the private information of the citizen.

- Lack of regular data backup and consequent risk of data loss.
- To prevent loss of data, NIC is mandated to take regular back-up of all database servers through remote access
- Risk of acceptability and applicability of the wide range of services provided.
- To ensure wide spread acceptability, software applications and service delivery channels have been designed and developed in utmost user friendly manner. Further inclusion of language localization software translates English to the preferred local language to ensure understanding by local people.

3.2.5 **Project Efficiency Inputs**

Activities Performed in different Dimensions of Intervention Table 10 brings out the different activities of the project spread across different themes.

Table 10 Theme-wise activities conducted during the project

Theme	Activities
Bridging the Digital Divide	 Touch Screen Kiosks have been installed at all Sugam centres to facilitate citizens to access internet, send e-mail, etc
Citizen-Centric Service Delivery	 The services provided across the counters eliminates the requirement of people to visit each officer/ official in the process chain for verification / attestation of documents by bringing all citizen related services and information under a single roof cutting across different tiers of administration. Further, to ensure mass usage of facilities provided at Sugam centre, service charges for the services were fixed on the basis of need assessment and citizens' capacity to pay.
Public Private Partnership	ΝΑ
Capacity Building	 Computer training to the staff of the government departments has been provided on periodic basis to facilitate effective usage of software applications.



Theme	Activities
	 Citizen awareness programmes have also been organized by way of advertisement, seminars/ workshops in schools/colleges and prominent offices to spread the awareness about the services provided at Sugam centre.
Change Management	• The staffs of various departments (involved in provision of services from the Sugam centres) have been trained by way of interactive sessions to provide citizen centric services in a friendly manner (without reducing their perceived importance in the entire administrative set up).
	 Further, an independent mechanism has been established to solicit regular feedback from the citizens, to continuously improve the quality of services and speed of delivery.
Business Process Reengineering	 Services which were rendered by multiple departments have been brought under one umbrella leading to considerable savings in time and efforts required in availing these services. Further, signing authority has been delegated (to a limited extent) to the representatives sitting at Sugam centres to ensure prompt over the counter issuance of various certificates to the citizens. Queue Management System has been launched at Sugam Centres to effectively manage huge footfall at Sugam centre and enhance convenience of the Citizens coming to Sugam centres
Knowledge/Experience Sharing	 The knowledge and experience has been shared with various institutes/ communities and departments through regular workshops, meetings, presentations, etc
Others	NA

Project Management Approach

The implementation of the project has been carried out under overall supervision of Secretary (IT) to the Government of Himachal Pradesh. A State level society has been constituted, which was headed by Chief Secretary to Government of Himachal Pradesh, to ensure better inter departmental coordination.

Further, there were district level societies chaired by the Deputy Commissioners of the respective districts. Field level implementation of the project was ensured by these district level societies. Table 11 provides project activity schedule along with the timelines.

The project was implemented by a team of 8 professionals (including software professionals working under them) at the State level. Apart from them a team of software professionals from NIC, HP and Department of IT, HP worked on software development. These professionals have enough IT exposure and experience in various fields like, hardware, software and networking implementations.

Table 11 List of Activities for the Project- iCosc

Sr.	Activity	No. of Months*
1.	Needs assessment in areas selected as pilot sites	T + 1
2.	Study/ Design, business process re- engineering and Development of Software and Web portal for i-CoSC project	T+1 to T+8
3.	Backend hardware purchase	T+1 to T+2
4.	Identifying the location, floating RFP and building i-CoSC centres	T+2 to T+5
5.	Procurement and installation of Hardware/ Software for i-CoSC	T+5 to T+7
6.	Training/Change Management/ Capacity Building	T+7 to T+9
7.	Installation of leased line connectivity & testing for backbone performance from i- CoSC to State Headquarter	T+8 to T+10
8.	Testing of s/w with connectivity from Departmental Servers and trial runs (POC)	T+10 to T+12
9.	Review of Pilot/ POC	T+12 to T+14
10.	Full Rollout of Project	T+14 to T+16
11.	Feedback and enhancement	T+16 to T+17
12.	First Assessment of Project by external agency	T+17 to T+18

Extent of Usage of Local Expertise

The local expertise has been used in the below mentioned manner:

- Local Govt. officials have been appointed as representatives for providing services from the Sugam Centres.
- Local Media & Channels have been used to propagate awareness about e-Governance services

• Local citizens have been employed as computer operators at all Sugam Centres to cater to the Citizens' requirements which also lead to overcoming the hindrance of language barrier and enabled better understanding of the actual requirement.

Management Processes Followed during the Project

The project periodically conducted the following processes:

- Stakeholders meetings;
- Preparation of periodic workplan;
- Preparation of activity schedules for staff;
- Time schedules for various project activities;
- Allocation of human resources;
- Implementation at the field level;
- Monitoring and reporting;
- Preparation of quarterly report;
- Preparation of training plan;
- Internal evaluation; and
- Follow ups.

Extent of Usage of RBM and Performance Indicators

Performance indicators have been designed to assess the performance of each Sugam centres. The key indicators include:

- Number of G2C, G2B & B2C services made available
- Percentage quarterly increase in G2C, G2B & B2C services transactions growth rate
- Number government departments whose schemes made available online
- Number of persons accessed information on government schemes
- Number of PRI/ ULBs accessed information on government schemes
- Number of cases of grievances registered for Redressal
- Number of youngsters used educational counselling
- Number of unemployed accessed livelihood related services
- Number of persons used product related extension services



- Number of persons accessed market price information
- Number of i-CoSC centres established against targeted
- Number of services adapted and integrated
- Number of grievances on transactions received & solved

Proper records of the above performance indicators are being maintained and analysed on monthly/ quarterly/ annual basis by State/ District e-Governance Society to assess areas of further improvement/ strengthening. Cost and revenue details of each Sugam centres have also been analysed by the concerned district level e-Governance society and each centres have been encouraged to become self-sustainable.

3.2.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated

The project led to the establishment of 16 Sugam centres at district, sub-division, tehsil and sub-tehsil level covering 7.21 lakh population and 5131 sq km of area.

Factors Facilitating/Impeding the Production of Outputs

Factors facilitating the production of outputs include:

- Technical and financial support by the State Government
- People's participation, involvement and clear understanding of goals;
- Co-operation from the stakeholders across the board;

SUGAM CENTRES

- 1. DC Office, Shimla
- 2. SDM Office, Rampur
- 3. SDM Office, Rohru
- 4. SDM Office, Chopal
- 5. SDM Office, Theog
- 6. SDM Office, Dodra-Kwar
- 7. Tehsil Office, Jubbal
- 8. Tehsil Office, Kotkhai

- Tehsil Office, Kumarsain
 Tehsil Office, Sunni
- 11. Tehsil Office, Chirgaon
- 12. Sub-Tehsil Office, Kupvi
- 13. Sub-Tehsil Office, Nankhari
- 14. Sub-Tehsil Office, Nerwa
- 15. Sub-Tehsil Office, Tikkar
- 16. Sub-Tehsil Office, Junga

Figure 8 List of Sugam Centres

- Support from the local departments and agencies;
- Enthusiastic commitment of the staff members; and
- Well designed project management plan being followed such as participatory preparation of RBM and work-plan with realistic timelines.

Extent of Operationalization of the project recommendations 16 Sugam Centres have been established at the following locations:

Services Offered -

The various services being offered by the Sugam centres at different levels (district, sub-division & tehsil) are: List of Transaction Based Services:

- At DC Office, Shimla
 - Property Registration
 - o Nakal Jamabandi
 - Certificates (Caste Certificate, Other Backward Class Certificate, Domicile Certificate, Handicapped Certificate, Marriage Certificate, etc)
 - $_{\odot}$ Driving Licenses
 - $_{\odot}$ Vehicle Registration
 - o Arms License
 - $_{\odot}$ Disabilities Card
 - Senior Citizens Identity Card
 - \circ Ticket Reservation
 - \circ Telephone Bills Collection
 - \circ Electricity Bills Collection
- At Sub-Division Level Centres
 - Property Registration
 - \circ Nakal Jamabandi

SOFTWARE & HARDWARE OVERVIEW OF SUGAM CENTRE

Software:

The key software, along with brief functionality, installed at Sugam Centre of Shimla district are:

- E-Praman: used for issuing certificates and has been implemented at 16 locations.
- **HIMRIS**: developed and implemented for Property Registration related processes and has been implemented at 6 locations.
- **HimBhoomi:** developed for Revenue Records purposes and implemented at 12 locations.
- Vahan: designed and implemented for Vehicle Registration
- Saarthi: developed and implemented for Driving licenses
- ERMS: developed and implemented for Employment related processes.
- E-Samadhan: developed and implemented for grievance redressal
- **E-Registration:** developed and implemented for Voter registration
- Shastra: designed and implemented Arms licence
- Queue Management System: for management of queue at Sugam centre

Hardware:

Each i-CoSC center is equipped with the following hardware:

- Server
- Clients (4 at Tehsil level, 5 at Sub-division level and 8 at District level)
- Touch Screen Kiosk
- Printers
- Scanner
- Web Cam
- Biometric Devise
- UPS (4 KVA)

Figure 9 Software & Hardware Overview of SUGAM

- \circ Certificates
- \circ Driving Licenses

- Vehicle Registration
- At Tehsil/Sub-Tehsil Level Centres:
 - Property Registration
 - \circ Nakal Jamabandi
 - \circ Certificates

Web-Based Services:

- High Court Cause List
- \circ Vidhan Sabha List of Business
- Welfare Pensioners Detail
- o Government Pensioner Helpline
- e-Registration of Electors
- \circ Police Online Complaints
- Employment Job Portal
- Major Government Schemes (for Rural Development, Horticulture, Social Justice & Empowerment, Education Departments)
- Essential Commodities Rates (Daily rates for Shimla, weekly Wednesday rates for Shimla and Mandi, weekly Friday rates for all districts)
- \circ HRTC Time Table
- HRTC Online Bus Tickets
- AGMARKNET
- \circ Blood Donors
- \circ TCP Permissions Status
- Examination Results
- Telephone/ e-Mail Directory
- Secretariat Library
- \circ Secretariat Information
- o Tender/Vacancies
- $_{\odot}$ HPTDC Online Hotel Reservation
- \circ Government Notifications
- \circ RTI Information





Figure 9 provides description of various software and hardware installed at Sugam Centres.

Sugam Centre at Tehsil have real-time environment for all those services which can be processed at Tehsil level and have been executed as soon as relevant documents are furnished by the citizen.

However, all those services which are either related to Sub-Division level or related to District Headquarter Level, can be availed online from Tehsil centre i.e. user can apply online for a particular service from Tehsil centre and the relevant documents can be submitted there itself. Instead, the user can get the status of his application (or even delivery) at Tehsil centre or through a web portal or even through SMS on mobile phone or IVR on PSTN line. This leads to elimination of repetitive visits to Sub-Division / District Headquarter for application status tracking. A definite date and mode of delivery for the completion of the task can also be indicated to the citizen.

Effect of Outputs/Results on the Target Groups of the Project

The key effects of the outputs/ results of the project on the identified key target groups (citizen & government) include: Citizens:

- Basket of services through single channel
- · Availability of services on door-steps of Citizens
- Elimination of middle-men
- Awareness of community based services.
- Access to community based services.
- Constant monitoring of their status for application request.
- Exercising their right to information
- One touch screen kiosk installed at each i-CoSC Centre to facilitate free access to information.

• Reduction in response time in addressing grievances by the concerned departments

Government:

- World-class platform for delivering services to Citizens
- Greater transparency & accountability
- Service delivery taken up by SUGAM
- Ease of maintaining database using Computers instead of manual entries
- Reduction in costs by replicating the same delivery channel for major services provided.

The very need of Queue Management System to manage large number of persons visiting Sugam centre at Shimla district highlights the success story of the centre and its wide-spread acceptability.

Further, a recent survey conducted by DoIT at Shimla district Sugam Centre revealed that Citizens are satisfied with the services that are being provided at this centre. The Citizens were happy with fast and efficient service delivery through these centres which



Figure 10 Organisational Hierarchy- iCosc



was impossible prior to the establishment of these enters.

Unforeseen/Unintended Outputs Resultant from the Project

The project leads to wide spread awareness about computers and latest ICT technology among the rural population, which had not been possible without the penetration of computers in rural areas through the Sugam Centres.

3.2.7 Project Sustainability Considerations

To ensure long term sustainability, the project has requisite arrangements laid down for smooth functioning.

Project Institutional Arrangements

An organizational structure exists within DoIT to manage the project. The structure includes a Deputy Manager supported by experts and team created exclusively for the operations.

Further, the creation of District level e-Governance Societies

provides a mechanism for the participation of the District Collector, Sub-Divisional Magistrates (SDMs) and the State Government Department in the project process, which contributes to the sustainability of the project.

Project Financial Arrangements

Sugam centres collect charges for various services rendered by it. 50% of the revenue collected from any Sugam centre has been retained by the centre for incurring regular expenses of the centre and balance 50% has been transferred to district level e-Governance society for salary payment and major maintenance of ICT infrastructure.

This district level e-Gov society encourage centres to become self sustainable and in case of need request funding from government through DoIT.

Although currently the collection at Sugam centre are not adequate to bear all operating cost (barring a few centre such as at district

DOIT GUIDELINES FOR ESTABLISHMENT OF NEW SUGAM CENTERS

- These Sugam Centers will be established at District, Sub- divisional, Tehsil, Sub-tehsil and Block level of every district.
- Sugam Centers in particular district will work under District E-Governance Society which will be headed by Deputy Commissioner's of the district.
- Locating out of area for Sugam centers will be done by the District E-Governance Society for their respective districts.
- Sugam Centers at the sub divisional, tehsil and block level will be headed by their respective heads of their area. e.g. Sugam centre at Sub division level will be headed by SDM of the sub division, at tehsil level by Tehsildar and at block level by Block Development Officer(BDO).
- These Centers will be connected through HIMSWAN (Himachal Pradesh State Wide Area Network).
- It has been proposed to utilize the funds of E-districts in this project where E-district will act as back-end and Sugam as front-end.
- To integrate additional services in the sugam Project, the department of Information Technology, GoHP has prepared E-Governance Road Map and presently Detailed Project Report has been Prepared for Public Distribution System (PDS), and various applications of Social Justice and Empowerment(SJ&E) are being developed will be soon integrated with Project Sugam. Thus Sugam will act as a platform for Common Service Centers "LOKMITRA" in Himachal Pradesh.

Figure 11 Guidelines for Sugam Centres



Shimla), it is expected that centre would be financially self sustainable in short run with net cash surplus per centre per month projected is approx Rs.10, 000, whereas over a period of 5 years it would be Rs.6 lacs approximately. This amount would be sufficient enough for up gradation of hardware/software and for improving the infrastructure. No additional governmental assistance would be required to keep this project going.

Project Technical Arrangements

The project is also technically sustainable and equipped with adequate software packages with some other packages being under development. Availability of sufficient band width (nearly 1/3rd of the total road length in the State has n x 2mbps connectivity) right down to the Panchayat level is another reason that makes the project technically viable.

Now, the State Government has issued a policy wherein provision of bandwidth of up to 2 mbps even at Tehsil / Block level has been envisaged. Besides this, assets and hardware from different sources are proposed to be pooled together to strengthen the project.

Extent of Commitment/Involvement/Ownership of Stakeholders

The success of the project is realised from the extent of commitment of stakeholders involved in the project. The State

Government of Himachal Pradesh, a major stakeholder, has taken complete ownership of the project:

- Department of IT has been responsible for providing various technical and financial assistance to Sugam Centres
- Further, State/ District level e-Governance Society has been responsible for co-ordination between various government departments & Sugam centres for faster processing of citizen's request
- Representatives of various departments such as transport, etc are stationed at Sugam centre to facilitate quick resolution of citizens' query and over-the-counter processing of their service request (to the extent possible)
- NIC has designed, developed and implemented software based solutions for all Sugam Centres based on the need assessment. NIC also ensures regular upgradation of installed software besides regular maintenance. It is also responsible for regular back-up.

Degree of Support Provided by the Government

The State Govt. has played a major role in institutionalising the project. The cost of developing applications and providing requisite hardware in various departments is been arranged by the State Govt.

EVALUATING THE PROJECT

The project has been evaluated on five parameters viz. Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Results/Impacts and Sustainability which were further affirmed by subparameters illustrated in Table 13 that exhibits the evaluation in six categories of Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Moderately Satisfactory, Moderately Unsatisfactory, Unsatisfactory And Highly Unsatisfactory, accounting respectively for 6,5,4,3,2 and 1 points. The right most column substantiates the scores. The rating for each of the parameters was arrived at after averaging on the ratings for each of the sub-parameters. Similarly the overall evaluation rating was arrived at after averaging on the parameter ratings.



Figure 12 Evaluating the Project- VIDIYAL

		Table 12 Impact of the Project - iCosc				
Parameters	Before Project	After Project	Efforts to Replicate Project Results			
Points of Citizens' Interaction	Multiple-Different Departments/ Offices for different services	Single- Different services can be availed from Sugam Centre	After the successful implementation of SUGAM in Shimla District, DoIT proposes to rollout SUGAM project to Mandi,			
Internet Accessibility	Nil or Very Low	Substantially Increased	Hamirpur and Kangra Districts. DPRs are being prepared for rolling out SUGAM project by DOFACC DoIT has			
Involvement of Middlemen	High	Nil or Very Low	sanctioned Rs.5 lacs each to 8 district administration for the establishment of SUGAM centres.			
Incidence of Corruption	High	Low	DoIT has also issued guidelines for establishment and			
Price information for crops	Not possible earlier	Possible through web services	management of Sugam centres			
Grievance Redressal	Slow & at times ineffective	Faster and effective				

DRO IFCT-WISE FINDINGS

Figure 13 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE NEXT STEPS

- Back-end Integration with Concerned Government Department: Currently there has been physical movement of documents collected at Sugam Centres to the concerned department/ agencies for further processing. There should be back-end integration of software applications at Sugam centre with the concerned departments so that documents can be shared with them online and requisite approvals can be obtained online. This would reduce the response time for various requests of the citizens.
- Introduction of Digital signature: Certain services such as issuance of driving licence, arm licenses, etc require signature of the concerned government officials. There has been physical movement of entire set of documents for obtaining approval/ signature of that official. To overcome the above issue, a concept of digital signatures can be introduced in these centres.

Proper Documentation of Software Applications: There should be proper documentation for all the application software including need assessment, SRS, FRS, user manuals, etc so that the same can be used with required modification for similar centres at other locations/ States.

- Integration of Multiple Software Applications: Multiple isolated software applications are currently being running at Sugam centres such as e-Praman, e-Vaham, e-Shastra, etc. These applications should be integrated so that basic information about citizens can be shared across application avoiding duplication of entry and ensuring better checks & control.
- Document tracking/ Status tracking Application: There has been frequent movement of documents from Sugam centres to the concerned departments for further processing. Adequate mechanism for tracking these documents would ensure status tracking of the citizen's service request and facilitate faster processing. Also citizens should be provided online access to track status of their request.
- Telephonic Helpdesk at Sugam Centres: Currently citizens need to visit Sugam centre to collect various information regarding various services such as types of documents required, etc. A helpdesk should be set-up at Sugam centres to provide telephonic information to the citizens' query. This would save considerable time and efforts of visiting Sugam centres merely for collecting information.





3.2.8 Project Evaluation Matrix

							Table 13 Project Evaluation Matrix- iCosc
EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	SATISFACTORY	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
				RELEVA	ANCE		
Needs of the beneficiary captured		•					 A formal need assessment survey for i-COSC project was undertaken by an external consultant - Himachal Productivity Council, Shimla. Citizens were contacted to identify their service need and also to assess how much fee they were willing to pay for various services to be offered from the Sugam Centre. The need assessment study factored the following: Taking into consideration the existing social infrastructure, focus on what exactly is needed to empower the population for whom the project is being implemented. Whether the ICT intervention provided will be more beneficial at a local micro-level (at the village) or at a macro level (district/ State) ICT project not to be technologically intensive, but should be usable by local citizen.
Relevant to needs & expectations of beneficiary		•					 i-CoSC aimed at setting up one-stop shop information resource and service centre for the people in the State. The services that are provided at 'Sugam Centres', the one stop shop, at district/ sub-divisional/ tehsil level have been identified based on the citizen's need. Sugam Centre, has added to the convenience of the citizens are they are now not required to run from pillar to post to avail any Government services. Also this has reduced the service delivery time and lead to greater transparency and accountability. The very need of Queue Management System to manage large number of persons visiting Sugam centre at Shimla district highlights the success story of the centre and its wide-spread acceptability.
Relevant to development priorities of Govt. of India							 I-COSC is strongly aligned with the overall objective of the CSC (a national plan of the GOI under NeGP) and has the same priorities such as delivery of services to the

59

EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							citizens at their doorsteps, one stop solution for all the services of state departments, creation of employment opportunities, empowerment of the citizens, increase in transparency etc.
Relevant to development priorities of concerned State Government		•					• The project is strongly aligned with the development priorities of the State Government in terms of establishment of SMART Governance, citizen empowerment, increase in transparency, bridging the digital divide etc.
Identified problem has high incidence in area of focus		•					 Himachal Pradesh is a state with difficult geographical terrain and climatic conditions. Individuals, for availing any services such as arms licence renewal, driving licence renewal, land registration, etc, have to travel large distances on foot or by road to reach the appropriate level of administration to get their jobs done. Besides this, within a place, he may have to go to different offices for various kinds of jobs. This results in substantial wastage of time and money of an individual. The establishments of Sugam Centres have lead to substantial saving in time and efforts of the citizens by providing services at the doorstep of citizens.
Correct & accurate identification of target stakeholders and/or correctly defined vulnerable groups			•				 Stakeholder of the I-COSC project have been clearly identified and segmented. The key stakeholder groups include - Citizens, State Government Departments, DoIT, NIC, and Institutions of Local Self Government (PRIs, ULBs). Vulnerable group, i.e. Citizen, has been clearly identified and to ensure proper & adequate service delivery, citizens are encouraged to provide regular feedback on the quality of services being provided at Sugam centres.
Adequacy of Government commitment to project		•					 State Government has played a major role in overall implementation of the projects in terms of is providing financial, technical and infrastructural assistant for the project. Department of Information Technology, Government of Himachal Pradesh (DoIT) was the nodal implementation agency for the Project.



EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηισημγ Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							 The financial assistance is provided through State/ District e-Governance Societies, which are established by the State Government. The technical assistance is provided by the professionals of DoIT and NIC. Further, Sugam centre at district Shimla is situated in the premises of the Secretariat.
Project relevance to ICT4D focus under the project		•					 Use of ICT was must to bring multiple citizen services cutting across different State department under one umbrella. Approx 33 online and offline services have been deployed at the Sugam centers. Further, an SMS alert to citizens stating completion status of their service request, eases the convenience of the citizens Queue management system facilitate effective management of huge footfall at Sugam centre and enhance convenience of the Citizens coming to Sugam centres Touch screen kiosk at Sugam centre empowered citizens by enabling them to access information on internet or communicate through e-mails.
				EFFECTI	/ENESS		
Problem been stated correctly and distinctly		•					 Problems regarding inconvenience, & substantial wastage of time and money for availing any government services, due to difficult geographical terrain of Himachal Pradesh, have been clearly identified and defined. The various services need has been formally identified and documented. Informal validation of identified problems through various community members.
Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries, users of the project are identified as stakeholders of the project		•					 Nodal agency of the project was Department of Information Technology, Govt. of Himachal Pradesh. Other operational partners such as NIC, institutions of local governance, other state department, etc have been identified as stakeholders and their roles & responsibilities have been clearly identified.

EVALUATION MATRIX	Ніснцу Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							 Citizens have been identified as beneficiaries and end user of the services rendered at Sugam centre.
The assumptions, objectives, outputs and outcomes have been clearly articulated in measurable terms				•			 The Objectives have been clearly defined in terms of number of centres to be established, types of services to be rendered, etc and linked to outputs and outcomes identified. All of the outcomes of the project have not been quantified and still remain subjective in nature. As such no concurrent evaluation or feedback study has been conducted to extract the exact nature of the outcomes
The linkages between objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was clear							• Logical linkages have been planned and implemented but not documented
The project design allowed for flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment.		•					 The number of services that is offered from Sugam centres is scalable, more services can added under the ambit of Sugam centre. For e.g. recently the facility of payment of electricity and telephone bills at Sugam centre is added in the list of services being offered at Sugam centres.
Degree of support given by the Government towards integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme and other related projects			•				• As stated I-COSC project is supported by the State/ District e-Governance Society and is strongly aligned with the overall objective of the CSC (a national plan of the GOI under NeGP).
Planning component of the project take into account the use of ICT for improved governance / service delivery in various areas through pilot initiatives, encouraging BPR, development local solutions and applications and encouragement of PPP model			•				 The planning component of the project (I-COSC) took into account the use of ICT for improved governance/ service through: Localization of solution - Touch screen internet kiosks to facilitate interest access by locals with little/ no ICT knowledge BPR: (a.) A large number of services which was earlier provided by different government departments have been converged at Sugam centre through the use of ICT (b.) Document signing authority has been delegated (to a limited extent) to the representatives sitting at Sugam centres ensures prompt over the counter





EVALUATION MATRIX	Нібні у Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	MODERATELY UNSATISFACTORY	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							issuance of various certificates to the citizens. (c.) Queue Management System has been launched at Shimla for the convenience of the Citizens. • PPP - No PPP model planned.
The adequacy of institutional arrangements in attaining the long- term objective of the project. Also the infrastructural, logistical, and financial implication of sustaining the project objectives beyond the project duration/after completion of UNDP funding.		•					 Well defined institutional arrangement for operation and maintenance of the project has been defined. An organizational structure exits within Department of IT, Government of Himachal Pradesh to manage the project. The structure includes a Deputy Manager supported by experts and team created exclusively for the operations. State/ District level e-Governance Societies have been established to support and monitor the functioning of Sugam centre. The fee charged by Sugam centre from citizens for rendering various services would facilitate in attaining the financial sustainability of Sugam centres. The required assets to provide ICT based services have been acquired and maintained properly.
Project's linkages, liaison, coordination and impact upon related activities under NeGP being implemented in the country.				•			 The project has substantial linkages with various initiatives NeGP such as integration with various departmental applications. NIC Data centre is currently being used for replication of data and formation of comprehensive database. Wherever possible the feasibility of HPSWAN was first analyzed. However, the project may lead to duplication of efforts as services proposed to be provided by CSC is already been provided at the Sugam centres.
The project's assistance, relationship, relevance to and coordination with the pre-existing Project management system and staff		•					 Uses both the pre-existing management system as well as staff effectively and coordinates with them effectively. The project has a well defined management process, and the implementation of the project is being carried out under the overall supervision of the Secretary (IT), Government of Himachal Pradesh. State / District level e-Governance Societies are established to effectively operate and maintain Sugam centre.

EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various institutional arrangements for overall programme management and implementation and the level of coordination between relevant players			•				 The State Government played the role of facilitator/ coordinator, responsible for overall implementation of the project. It provided constant guidance and support in functioning of Sugam Centers. Roles and responsibilities of other stakeholders were defined clearly however clear demarcation and documentation of the same needs to be carried out.
Risk assessment and management of the project			•				 Most of the potential risks were noted down Mitigation strategies for identified risk have been laid down The risk management and mitigation plan was substantially adhered
Efforts of stakeholders in support of the implementation of the project			•				 The project proposal submitted to UNDP was documented in coordination with most of the stakeholders but complete buy-in of these stakeholders was not taken Most of the stakeholders have extended support as envisaged from them during the proposal stage. Multi-stakeholder participatory approach ensures mobilizing local communities to collaborate the project activities.
Extent of conflict of interest either between stakeholders involved in the project or with outside agencies.							• I-COSC project and the CSC project are conceptualized on the similar kind of revenue model and services; hence clear demarcation of the basket of services for each of the project has not been laid out.
				EFFICIE	ENCY		
Was a formal workplan made at the start of the project to determine the timeframe in which activities would be performed							 Detailed workplan prepared for all important activities has been detailed. Month wise timelines defined for each activity
Were resources made available to the project implementation agencies in accordance with the requirements of the work plan			•				 The resource placement is adequate as per the requirement. None of the key resources, only a few of the support staff replaced. However the replacements had similar qualification and experience as proposed ones





Evaluation matrix	Ніснцу Satisfactory	SATISFACTORY	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highley Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent of deviation in the project implementation in so far as timelines is concerned.							• The project was originally planned for 18 months, but actual implementation period extended up to approx. 4 years.
Responsiveness of the project management to such deviations and flexibility to deploy resources							• Management was responsive in taking steps to correct the course of implementation by identifying various solutions.
Were any systems, processes, manuals etc made to govern the activities in the project among the different stakeholders			•				 The roles and responsibilities of various stakeholders of the projects have been laid out. Operating guidelines of Sugam centres in terms of administrative guidelines, technical guidelines, infrastructure requirement, etc has been clearly defines and documented.
Extent to which Results Based Management has been used		•					 Performance indicators have been designed to assess the performance of each Sugam centres. The indicators include number of G2C, G2B & B2C services made available, % quarterly increase in G2C, G2B & B2C services transactions growth rate, number of grievances on transactions received & solved, etc Proper records of the performance indicators are being maintained and analysed on monthly/ quarterly/ annual basis by State/ District e-Governance Society to assess areas of further improvement/ strengthening.
Whether there was adequacy of steps taken to resolve any conflict of interest in or due to the project							• No major efforts have been taken so far in demarcating the services provided by Sugam Centre and CSC
			R	RESULTS/I	MPACTS		
Whether the project has produced its desired immediate outputs							 The project led to the establishment of 16 Sugam centres at district, sub-division, tehsil and sub-tehsil level covering 7.21 lac population and 5131 sq km of area. Approx 33 online and offline services have been deployed at the Sugam centers.
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, use of the new outputs as							 Most of the intended beneficiaries utilized the services delivered under the I-COSC project in cases where they needed similar service.



EVALUATION MATRIX	Ніснцу Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
against the traditional options)							
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, percentage of the target population)		•					 There is an ever increasing number of footfalls for the services being offered from these centres which is likely to have a manifold growth with the introduction of more services. The very need of Queue Management System to manage large number of persons visiting Sugam centre at Shimla district highlights the success story of the centre and its wide-spread acceptability.
Extent of drop-outs from usage of the outputs by the intended beneficiaries							 No/ Marginal drop-out from usage of outputs by the intended beneficiaries
Are there any unforeseen/ unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups	•						 No unintended effect caused on the target groups. A few unforeseen positive effects seen are the increase in awareness levels of the citizens and their adoption to the changed e-environment and demand for more such services.
Extent of the project results on the target beneficiaries in terms of (a) Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, (b) Capacity Building, (c) Change Management, (d) Business Process Re- engineering, (f) Public Private Partnership, (g) Bridging the Digital Divide, and (h) Knowledge and Experience Sharing		•					 Excellence has been achieved in following areas relevant to the project: Citizen-centric service delivery: (a.) The services provided at Sugam Centres across the counters eliminates the requirement of people to visit each officer/ official in the process chain for verification / attestation of documents by bringing all citizen related services and information under a single roof cutting across different tiers of administration. Capacity building and bridging the digital divide: (a.) Computer training to the staff of the government departments has been provided on periodic basis to facilitate effective usage of software applications. (b.) Citizen awareness programmes were also organized by way of advertisement, seminars/ workshops in schools/colleges and prominent offices to spread the awareness about the services provided at Sugam centre Business Process Re-engineering: (a.) Services which were rendered by multiple departments have been brought under one umbrella leading to considerable savings in time and efforts required in availing these

66



EVALUATION MATRIX	Нібні v Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							 services. (.b) Delegation of signing authority (to a limited extent) to the representatives sitting at Sugam centres ensures prompt over the counter issuance of various certificates to the citizens. (c.) Queue Management System has been launched at Sugam Centres to effectively manage huge footfall at Sugam centre and enhance convenience of the Citizens coming to Sugam centres Knowledge and experience sharing: The knowledge and experience is shared with various institutes/ communities and departments through regular workshops, meetings, presentations, etc. Bridging the digital divide: Touch Screen Kiosks have been installed at the Sugam centres to provide access to information and internet.
Extent of the project impact on the target groups in terms of (a) governance (improved efficiency, transparency and accountability), (b) citizen-centric service delivery (advantages of cost, time and convenience), (c) rural livelihoods (number of jobs, extent and sufficiency of employment), and (d) women's empowerment (increased knowledge, and use of the same to voice their concerns).		•					 Excellence has been achieved in significant number of cases in following relevant areas: Governance (facilitating the process of governance by ensuring accountability at various levels, involvement of key stakeholders as collaborators) Citizen centric service delivery for various G2C services. Rural livelihood by employing computer operators for operating the Sugam centres.
Extent of significance of the project impact on the development of the region/country							 Indicators for development were defined during project conceptualization stage
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by marginalized communities							 Most of the marginalized communities have utilized the project output in more than 50% cases where they needed similar service
Extent to which capacities have been built in stakeholders during the project			•				 Capacities of the main stakeholders have been built up to at least perform the necessary operational and maintenance activities assigned to them. Computer training to the staff of the government departments is being provided on periodic basis to

EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							facilitate effective usage of software applications.
				SUSTAINA	ABILITY		
Extent of ownership of stakeholders in the project		•					 Complete ownership of all the 'implementing and operating' stakeholders in the project including - DoIT, NIC, other government departments whose services are provided through Sugam centres, etc.
Degree of support given by the Government in integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme			•				• Project objectives and goals were in line with NeGP programme and deliver most of G2C services as per the CSC plan.
Extent of availability of inputs/resources required for the project (people, finances, infrastructure, equipments)		•					• Resources in all the four area - people, finances, infrastructure, and equipments were mostly available during the duration of the project.
Have any revenue streams been defined in the project to make it self- sustaining		•					 Revenue stream to ensure long term sustainability of the project has been clearly defined: Sugam centres are charging fee from the citizens for various services provided by the centres. The fee structure is based on the need assessment survey carried out to ascertain the willingness and paying capacity of the users. A portion of revenue (50%) generated from i-CoSC centres are collected by respective district level societies and used to meet the recurring expenditures of the centres and for furthering the ICTD projects in the State. This revenue is shared between the District level and State level societies as per a pre-determined formula.
Extent of success of such pre-defined revenue streams			•				 Substantial revenue is being generated at Sugam centre in district Shimla to recover its operating cost. However, Sugam centres at sub-divisional and tehsil level, due to limited footfall, is generating limited. It has been projected that Sugam centre would have the current net cash surplus per centre per month of approx Rs.10, 000, whereas over a period of 5 years it would be Rs.6 lacs approximately and hence would not require any



68

PROJECT-WISE FINDINGS

EVALUATION MATRIX	Ніснцу Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							government assistance in terms of funding the project.
Extent to which inventory of the assets created out of the grants received in the project have been properly maintained and transferred to the beneficiaries		•					 Assets received under the project such as desktops, printers, servers, internet modems, softwares, etc. have been maintained well. Employees at Sugam centres have been trained in using and maintaining these assets
Degree of collaboration that has developed among stakeholders during the project		•					 Stakeholder management plan was well defined and has complete adherence during project execution. Stakeholders were involved continuously during operational and strategic decision making
Extent to which government is willing to finance the project after its completion of the UNDP funding		•					 For the existing Sugam centers, the State Govt. would fund operational expenses to the extent not recovered from the revenue generated at the Centers through district / state level e-Gov society. For roll out of Sugam Centers, the Govt. of Himachal Pradesh would provide funding for the capital expenditure required to establish the Sugam Centers depending on their feasibility.

3.3 Ashwini

70

	Table 14 Introduction- ICT for Women Conciliation Centre		
Project Title	Ashwini		
Proponent Organisation	Byrraju Foundation		
Implementation State	Andhra Pradesh		
Target Site for Pilot Project	32 villages in West Godavari district		
Theme of Project	Rural Development, Livelihoods		
Target Population	Over 500,000		
Project Cost			
Funding Required for Project	Rs. 1.35 Crores		
Time Required to Implement Project	6 Months		
Name(s) of Partner Agencies	Media Lab Asia		

BRIEF IMPACT OF THE PROJECT

The project aimed to enable a platform for multi-dimensional interaction between experts and service providers in towns/cities and defined target segments in villages of Andhra Pradesh in order to empower rural population through access to information and services. It takes ICTD from a level where it provides information, to a level where it can provide online interaction.

OBJECTIVE AREAS	OUTPUTS	OUTCOMES
Providing urban quality facilities to rural areas in a focused manner for targeted population segments	Facilitated access to broadband connectivity in more than 115 villages through Ashwini centres.	Benefiting a population of more than 5 lakhs of the 2 districts of Andhra Pradesh (East Godavari and West Godavari districts)
Linking up online activities with their off line counterparts to shift the emphasis purely from technology to the use of technology	Virtual service delivery through the Ashwini centers	Classes of various subjects of 8th - 10th standards and computer literacy. Computer literacy program was also targeted for unemployed youth of the locality, which helped them to get employment opportunities.
Providing rural friendly solutions which will enable each and every person in the village to take advantage of the facility	Tie-up with Hospitals for delivery of the services in the area of Gynecology, Cardiology, Orthopedic, Pediatric and General Medicine	About 7000 patients received expert consultation.
Ensuring community stake holding through financial as well as social investment	Women were trained virtually in tailoring, embroidery, fabric painting etc.; v-agri & v-aqua advisory services for farmers by paying a token fee	Nearly 12,000 women have benefited from this program, helped them in income generation through self-employment. Around 1000 agri and 400 aqua farmers have benefited thus far.





3.3.1 Project Background

Introduction to the Project

Project ASHWINI seeks to enable a platform for multi-dimensional interaction between experts and service providers in towns/cities and defined target segments in 32 villages in Andhra Pradesh in order to empower rural population through access to information and services. It takes ICTD from a level where it provides information, to a level where it can provide online interaction.

This system would enable the population from any of the 32 villages covered, to interact with experts and service providers from Bhimavaram and Hyderabad. To bring focus into the endeavour, one subject (Health, Governance etc.) is taken up each day. Each day is further divided into 8 Knowledge Blocks (KB) of 2 hours each. Every KB covers one sub-topic in the broad area (Eg. Gynaecology, Paediatrics etc. under the broad area of Health). Using this system, people with specific issues/queries would be able to connect to the corresponding expert virtually at their doorstep. The other enabling feature of the system is that it links up online connectivity with offline activity as well.

The aim was to create a self-sufficient and people -centric environment capable of empowering the rural populace and narrow the urban-rural divide caused by unequal distribution of social infrastructure using state of art wireless technology. The project provides people in rural Andhra Pradesh timely access to an array of high quality services using a virtual delivery platform.

Village Community Involvement:

The village communities were very actively involved in the implementation of Ashwini. An area of about 600 sq ft (approximately 20X30 ft in size without structural columns in the

carpet area) with two-phase or single-phase power connection to support 3KVA of load with a separate power meter is the base requirement of land for an Ashiwni centre. The location should be convenient, so that people from within and neighbouring villages can easily access the facility. There should be a high school within the village or in any nearby village catering to at least 4 or 5 surrounding villages and hamlets. (The centre has programmes designed to benefit students). The site and building (600 sqft) for the centres are provided by the community and the site preparation is done by the Byrraju Foundation. One trained educated youth willing to stay in the village manages the centre.

The community is actively involved in proliferating the program schedule of various activities among the villagers, students and the participants. The operating personnel to be manned in the Ashwini centres were suggested by the community and are recruited once they fulfil the basic qualifications. The community also helps the foundation in identifying the need for various service offerings from



Ashwini centres, thereby making interactions and transactions more meaningful and maximizing the value adds.

Community Participation in Other stages:

Ensuring sustainability becomes easy once the community sees itself not as a beneficiary but as a stakeholder and accepts the



project as its responsibility. Incorporating the thoughts and ideas of the community at each and every step of the programme, ensures that the community's choices are part of the project design. Provide the key steps taken and lessons learnt on involving communities through the project implementation.

Gram Vikasa Samiti (GVS) in each of the Ashwini centre villages was actively involved in the Ashwini programs in their proliferation, iterative refinement of the program, pre-program coordination, and inter-Ashwini village centre coordination. In all, the community was constantly involved in a dialogue using this virtual platform and gearing up themselves for the virtual market and labour exchange across the villages.

Each Ashwini centre in the village is Owned and Managed by the village community. The program designs and services on Ashwini Platform are continuously added up with active community participation. Based on the public-private partnership model, Project Ashwini takes into appreciation the invaluable role played by its multiple stakeholders, who constantly engage towards empowering rural communities through livelihood generation. For instance, patients in remote areas requiring specialized care can get treatment from medical experts from virtually anywhere in the country or abroad. Similarly, a farmer can have his crop monitored by a best-in-class expert from an agricultural institution. The Ashwini Centres established in each village provide videoconferencing and Internet access for all the villagers.

Project Coverage:

Project Ashwini has established a broadband wireless network connecting about 32 village centres and three towns in Krishna, East and West Godavari Districts of Andhra Pradesh with a hub at Bhimavaram town in point to multi point and mesh configurations. This facilitates access to broadband connectivity in more than 115 villages benefiting a population of more than 5 lakhs. Project coverage is illustrated below:

- 32 Ashwini centres services offered by these Ashwini centres will be accessed by these and 84 neighbouring villages of Andhra Pradesh, South India
- 2 districts of Andhra Pradesh (East Godavari and West Godavari districts)
- Covering a total population of over 500,000 and spread in approximately 4,000 sq kms


Description of the services being offered:

Project Ashwini is a program that envisions bringing information, interaction and transaction into rural India, thus enabling the village communities to make informed decisions and take immediate action. It helps empower them with 24x7 connectivity to provide access to a wide range of high quality services like e-Learning, e-Governance, e-Medicine, e-ticketing and e-Education besides virtual agricultural advisory services to rural areas. The major components of the initiative are:

- Large scale deployment of 802.11 b/g to provide 2 Mbps
- Replacement of expensive VC equipment with Camcorder
- Multi conferencing collaboration software replacing high cost VC equipment at studio end
- Power constraint issues overcome to ensure uninterrupted usage of facility
- User friendly operations at studio / village end
- Village to village direct interaction without involvement of base station
- Last mile connectivity to Rural BPO

Currently 31 centres are fully operational in West Godavari and East Godavari districts. In the centres that are fully operational, education, telemedicine, agriculture, livelihood opportunity enhancement training like spoken English programs are conducted for the benefit of the students, farmers, and women. In fact the last mile connectivity for the Rural BPO initiative (Gram IT) of the



Figure 14 Communication Infrastructure for the Ashwini Project

Foundation was provided by Project Ashwini.

These programs delivered through the Ashwini centres were mostly driven from Bhimavaram studios where 4 studios and 3 studios at Amalapuram. Of the expected loading of 14 hours/day of each Ashwini centres, current loading is about 6 hours spanning agriculture, education, telemedicine and spoken English.

- Virtual class room: Mathematics, spoken English, Physical sciences are being offered to the secondary school students from the knowledge blocks at Bhimavaram and Hyderabad.
- Telehealth programs are being offered from the knowledge

Stakeholder	Role(s) Played
Village Community	The village community was involved right from the needs assessment to setting up Ashwini centres besides contributing 10% of the project cost, offering land and building for operating the centres. Village community is key beneficiaries of the Project.
Media Lab Asia	Funding Agency; demonstrated virtual delivery service operation at large scale by using state of art Wi-Fi technology
Other alliance partners like CARE Foundation	Assistance on rolling out tele-medicine services
	Table 16 Stakeholders and Their Roles- Ashwir

blocks at Hyderabad / Bhimavaram to rural women and children

- Virtual Agricultural extension services are being offered to the farmers through knowledge blocks at Bhimavaram.
- Community interactions and visioning for self reliance are held.
- Internet and e-mail services are offered to the rural communities in general and to the students in particular.
- Multimedia content for various edutainment programs

3.3.2 Project Strategic Objectives

The mission of Project Ashwini was to empower village population with a tangible impact through access to information and urban quality integrated services in education, health, agriculture, livelihood creation, governance, and skill development by connecting the rural populace to the experts in that domain using (Broadband Wireless Network)state of art Wi-Fi Technology.

- Providing urban quality facilities to rural areas in a focused manner for targeted population segments
- Linking up online activities with off line counterparts to shift emphasis purely from technology to the use of technology
- Providing rural friendly solutions which will enable each and every person in the village to take advantage of the facility
- Ensuring community stake holding through financial as well as social investment
- Target Stakeholders: Project ASHWINI caters to the village in its entirety. Various segments of the population ranging from women to children to the elderly are stakeholders.

3.3.3 Project Relevance Inputs

Identification of Information and Services Needs

Information and services needs were identified through the following techniques:

- Participatory Rural Appraisal;
- Base line survey;
- Trainings and Workshops;
- Field Visit Questionnaire and
- Needs assessment study.

The major information needs identified were the following

- Quality education and tele-medicine/ tele-health are some of the critical needs of the community
- Lack of opportunity for increased livelihood opportunities

3.3.4 Project Effectiveness Inputs

Project Stakeholders and Envisaged Roles

Table 16 brings out the different stakeholders involved and the respective roles they played.

Risks and Mitigation Strategies

The following were identified as the main risks

- Lack of awareness of the utility of the medium. This was mitigated by public Awareness Campaigns, advertising about Ashwini services, etc.
- Lack content for virtual delivery of service. For mitigation collaboration with different institutions for content were developed.
- Deployment of trained manpower for operating Ashwini Centres. The strategy for mitigation was providing training in technical Know-How and social entrepreneur skills to all Ashwini operators
- Services sought by all during the same time (evening). It was mitigated Effective virtual delivery of services time slots scheduling with great support from village beneficiaries
- Unfriendly terrain: As the state of art Wi-Fi technology (IEEE 802.11 b/g) was used, the environmental factors caused the





losses in transmission of data which intern caused low quality video and audio transfer. It was mitigated through better line of sight, weather proof wireless equipment reduces the transmission losses.

A

3.3.5 Project Efficiency Inputs

Activities Performed in different Dimensions of Intervention: Table 17 summarises the main activities being performed in the different themes of intervention.

Table 17 Theme-based List of Activities- Ashwini

meme	
Bridging the Digital Divide	Deployment of ICT infrastructure (IEEE 802.11 b/g, conferencing equipment, personal computers, classroom infrastructure, UPS and services affordable to the rural masses, thereby deepening and increasing the level of digital inclusion in the village community which facilitated the social and economic upliftment of the rural masses.
Citizen-Centric Service Delivery	e-Learning, e-Medicine, V-Agri & V-Aqua (Virtual Agriculture and Virtual Aqua Culture Services), e-Ticketing, Computer literacy, and women livelihood programs, etc.,
Public Private Partnership	Based on the public-private partnership model, Project Ashwini takes into appreciation the invaluable role played by its multiple stakeholders, who constantly engage towards empowering rural communities through livelihood generation
Capacity Building	GVS (Grama Vikasa Samithi, People participation and accountability model adopted by the foundation in every village helps people to act as the owners of the project. This model ensures high degree of village community involvement in the entire project life cycle.
Change Management	In the process, we have observed that Ashwini operator is the key for the success of Ashwini Project since they are the ones who can act as village level social entrepreneur in making Ashwini centres self sustainable. We have trained Ashwini centre operators in rural ICT-Marketing strategies and social entrepreneurship. To increase Ashwini centre utilization factor, we have started various services like "IT enabled and IT-driven: Google Notice Board application, rural marketing initiative launched in Ashwini Platform", railway reservations, forms and applications, etc.,
Business Process	BPR was carried out in terms of moving out of traditional way of delivering the services which were provided by
	Ashwin centres. The project truly exemplifies the role played by applications of ICT for sustainable development from a level
Knowledge/Experience Sharing	where it provides information, to a level where it can provide online interaction. Project Ashwini have demonstrated the potential of ICT towards achieving Millennium Developmental Goals such as poverty alleviation, increased access to education and health services and reduced gender inequalities. Knowledge/Experience Sharing for the same were carried out through website, publicity campaign, workshops, seminars and host of other similar activities.
Others	Linking up Ashwini Project online classes with ISRO-VRC offline programs
Others	seminars and host of other similar activities. Linking up Ashwini Project online classes with ISRO-VRC offline programs

Deloitte.

_

Project Management Approach

Ashwini project technical team and program coordinating team works together to provide uninterrupted and quality virtual delivery of services to the village community. Monitoring and evaluation team works under project leader with the day to day analysis of project performance and evaluation and takes necessary actions to ensure socio-techno-economic sustainability of the project

Each Ashwini centre was operated by resource person employed from the village community by the village community itself. As project Ashwini is using state of art Wi-Fi technology and sophisticated equipment for video-based virtual services, we have a strong technical team to ensure proper operation and maintenances of this well established infrastructure. The program co-ordination team ensures timely delivery of high quality uninterrupted services with great support from Ashwini centre operators and technical team. The program co-ordination team monitors and evaluates the individual Ashwini centres performance and helps Ashwini operators by providing them training in rural marketing strategies, social entrepreneur skills to make their centres self sustainable.

Extent of Usage of Local Expertise

In total 32 Ashwini Centres, 26 Ashwini centres are operated by women whereas 5 Ashwini Centre operated by 6 men. This implies that 80% of the Ashwini centre operators were women from the same village community.

Management Processes Followed during the Project

The project periodically conducts the following processes:

- Stakeholders meetings;
- Preparation of RBM based LFA;
- Preparation of workplan;

- Preparation of activity schedules for staff;
- Time schedules for various project activities;
- Allocation of human resources;
- Monitoring and reporting;
- Preparation of training plan.

Extent of Usage of RBM and Performance Indicators

Various metrics like no of programs per day, no of participants per day per program per centre, revenues collected per centre per day, participant feedback. Break even analysis per centre, training parameters of the centre heads, demand generation activities among the community, down time of equipment, network etc. Extensive usage of RBM was not observed for the project.

3.3.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated

Project Ashwini facilitates access to broadband connectivity in more than 115 villages benefiting a population of more than 5 lakhs. Through a tie-up with Hospitals in nearby towns and Narayana Hrudayalaya (NH) in Bangalore, about 7000 patients received expert consultation in Gynaecology, Cardiology, Orthopaedic, Paediatric and General Medicine. Currently services delivered virtually are Mathematics, Science, English and Spoken English classes for 8th - 10th standards and computer literacy.

About 10,000 students have benefited so far. Women are trained virtually in tailoring, embroidery, fabric painting etc., which helps them in income generation through self-employment, wage employment or an increase in productivity. So far, nearly 12,000 women have benefited from this program. Farmers sign up every season for v-agri & v-aqua advisory services paying a token fee. Field officers make regular visits to fields/tanks and take digital pictures of crops/fishes/prawns which are transmitted through the internet to agri/aqua experts who analyze the images and expert





advice is delivered through the field officer to farmers on the same day. Around 1000 agri and 400 aqua farmers have benefited thus far.

E-education of Project Ashwini enabled reaching more number of schools at a time for imparting training in computer skills, spoken English, and special subjects like mathematics and sciences. The platform has been successfully utilized for imparting skill development training for women in a number of villages at a time. ICT is also extensively utilized for mass educational and awareness campaigns on health, hygiene, use of safe drinking water etc.

Factors Facilitating/Impeding the Production of Outputs

Factors facilitating the production of outputs are:

- Usage and reaching out with high end technology;
- People's participation, involvement and clear understanding the goals;
- Co-operation from the stakeholders;
- Support from the local community members;
- Enthusiastic commitment of the staff members; and
- Well designed project management plan

Extent of Operationalisation of the project recommendations

Ashwini facilitates access to broadband connectivity in more than 115 villages benefiting a population of more than 5 lakhs through a tie-up with Hospitals in nearby towns and Narayana Hrudayalaya (NH) in Bangalore, about 7000 patients received expert consultation in Gynaecology, Cardiology, Orthopaedic, Paediatric and General Medicine

Currently services delivered virtually are Mathematics, Science, English and Spoken English classes for 8th - 10th standards and computer literacy. About 10,000 students have benefited so far. Women are trained virtually in tailoring, embroidery, fabric painting etc., which helps them in income generation through selfemployment, wage employment or an increase in productivity. So far, nearly 12,000 women have benefited from this program.

Farmers sign up every season for v-agri & v-aqua advisory services paying a token fee. Field officers make regular visits to fields/tanks and take digital pictures of crops/fishes/prawns which are transmitted through the internet to agri/aqua experts who analyze the images and expert advice is delivered through the field officer to farmers on the same day. Around 1000 agri and 400 aqua farmers have benefited thus far.

This is one project that has continued successfully for more than 36 months after UNDP funding ended. The foundation is confident of making every centre financially viable over the next 12 to 18 months even with low population demand base. This project is also a fore runner for the CSC project and many of the lessons can be used to make the CSC project viable. There is a crying need to develop more content in multiple Indian languages as envisaged by India development gateway etc

Effect of Outputs/Results on the Target Groups of the Project

Outputs/Results from the various services of project are illustrated below:

• Agriculture and Aquaculture: Access to best in class experts and Last mile delivery of agriculture extension services. Field officers make regular visits to fields/tanks and take digital pictures of crops/fishes/prawns which are transmitted through the internet to agri/aqua experts who analyze the images and expert advice is delivered through the field officer to farmers on the same day. Around 1000 agri and 400 aqua farmers have benefited thus far.

This service has reduced their travel cost and time and increased productivity.

• Livelihoods: Women are trained virtually in tailoring, embroidery, maggam work, fabric painting etc. which helps them in income generation through self-employment, wage employment or an increase in productivity. About 12000 women have benefited. Most of rural women are now in a position to earn Rs.500 to 1000/- per month by way of self employment or employment under an entrepreneur

Trained in computer skills like DTP, MS Office, C Language, HTML Web Pages, etc., About 2000 youths received expert training and employed

- Health: Expert consultation in Gynaecology, Cardiology, Orthopaedic, Paediatric and General Medicine through a tie-up with Hospitals in nearby towns and Narayana Hrudayalaya (NH) in Bangalore, etc. About 7000 patients received expert consultation.
- Education: Currently services delivered virtually are Mathematics, Science, English and Spoken English classes for 8th
 10th standards and computer literacy. About 10000 students have benefited so far.

3.3.7 Project Sustainability Considerations

The mobilization of villagers to take avail of ICT services has been done by using different ICT awareness campaigns, using distribution of pamphlets about our services and applications to the villagers. We have trained all Ashwini centres operators (who are the key for success of Ashwini Project) in mobilizing villagers, technical operation know-how and rural ICT marketing strategies. These key mechanisms helped in moving towards sustainability of project results.

The Ashwini project works on a business model making for development with social returns. A fee of USD 2.50 per month per candidate for computer literacy training (for non-students) and a fee of USD 0.50 per student per month is charged. Personal video conferencing service is charged at USD 1.25 per hour and agricultural advice is made available at USD 1.25 for V-Agri registered farmers.

EVALUATING THE PROJECT

The project has been evaluated on five parameters viz. Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Results/Impacts and Sustainability which were further affirmed by subparameters illustrated in Table 18 that exhibits the evaluation in six categories of Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Moderately Satisfactory, Moderately Unsatisfactory, Unsatisfactory And Highly Unsatisfactory, accounting respectively for 6,5,4,3,2 and 1 points. The right most column substantiates the scores. The rating for each of the parameters was arrived at after averaging on the ratings for each of the sub-parameters. Similarly the overall evaluation rating were arrived at after averaging on the parameter ratings.



Figure 15 Evaluating the Project- eKrishi



KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE NEXT STEPS

SUSTAINABLE BUSINESS MODEL FOR ASHWINI

The current revenue model of Ashwini centers is not adequate to support their sustenance in long run. Its revenue mainly consists of contribution from members, charges for computer literacy training, video conferencing service, agri-advice which are quite low as compared to their expenses including salaries and operational & maintenance cost. It needs to be added that many of services provided by Ashwini are free. The project has grown in strength after its launch with a steady increase in services offered. Additional sources of revenue need to be contemplated. These could come from providing additional services through Ashwini as well as making some of the services chargeable at the right time.

STRATEGY FOR SCALABILITY OF THE PROJECT

The project is scalable within in the geographical area and within existing setup, but the costs and maintenance are the primary concerns in terms of replication. Also, loading the network with delivery of services (content) for above 6 hours is big challenge with current load on Ashwini network is around 2 to 3 hours. Considering all these aspects, a strategy for scalable model needs to be looked into.

STRATEGY FOR SUSTAINING ASHWINI AFTER IMPLEMENTATION OF CSCS IN THE AREA

As some of the services currently being provided by Ashwini would also come under the purview of CSCs which would be supported by government, sustenance of Ashwini may become a concern. Appropriate steps should be taken up to mitigate this situation.

ALIGNMENT WITH GOVT. SCHEMES

The services of Ashwini are currently not aligned to government schemes. It is suggested that such alignment options be explored to take advantage of effects of synergy that may thereby result.

COLLABORATION WITH GOVERNMENT AGENCIES

This could be done for support in areas such as information, funding, technical knowledge, cooperation etc.



3.3.8 Project Evaluation Matrix

							Table 18 Project Evaluation Matrix- Ashwini
EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
RELEVANCE							
Needs of the beneficiary captured							 Needs assessment study was carried out Beneficiaries covered are only those who are a part of Self-help group federations Alignment with Government could have been stronger
Relevant to needs & expectations of beneficiary							 Segmentation is loosely done however no formal procedure of segmentation seems to be carried out Offerings are tailored for these loosely designed done
Relevant to development priorities of Govt. of India							• It is loosely aligned with developmental priorities of GoI however not aligned to any specific development programme of the Government
Relevant to development priorities of concerned State Government							 It is loosely aligned with developmental priorities of Tamil Nadu Government however not aligned to any specific development programme
Identified problem has high incidence in area of focus							 Frequent and continuous incidences reported in the area Substantial number of individuals of the targeted vulnerable group (rural women) are affected Similar problem affecting vulnerable groups in other parts of the country
Correct & accurate identification of target stakeholders and/or correctly defined vulnerable groups							 Stakeholder segments including vulnerable groups such as women, unemployed youths etc. Not all individuals are covered
Adequacy of Government commitment to project							• The project is not receiving any financial or technical assistance from Government
Project relevance to ICT4D focus under the project							 The project has demonstrated what a wireless network with 2 Mbps capacity can deliver (reducing the cycle time of delivery) and transform the rural communities by supporting the rural citizens across all areas of development Video conferencing results in significant increase in reach of the conciliation services and decrease in cost and effort of rural people





		I	PROJEC	I-WISE	FINDIN	GS	
EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
EFFECTIVENESS							
Problem been stated correctly and distinctly							Problems identified, defined and documentedSelf validation of identified problems
Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries, users of the project are identified as stakeholders of the project							 Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries and users have been identified as stakeholders Roles and responsibilities of stakeholders have been detailed out
The assumptions, objectives, outputs and outcomes have been clearly articulated in measurable terms							 Objectives, outputs and outcomes vaguely identified. Certain assumptions articulated Subjective measurement terms in use
The linkages between objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was clear							• Logical linkages present but not documented
The project design allowed for flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment.							• Project design capable of adapting to and responding positively to most of the possible types of changes
Degree of support given by the Government towards integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme and other related projects							• Project objectives and goals not aligned with any specific programme of the Government.
Planning component of the project take into account the use of ICT for improved governance / service delivery in various areas through pilot initiatives, encouraging BPR, development local solutions and applications and encouragement of PPP model		•					 video conferencing for training and delivering other services to the rural people BPR is not relevant here as most of these services are new
The adequacy of institutional arrangements in attaining the long-term objective of the project. Also the infrastructural, logistical, and financial implication of sustaining the project objectives beyond the project duration/after completion of UNDP funding.							 Institutional bodies at village level have been set-up with defined roles and responsibilities for attaining long-term goals Required assets including PCs, application software, network connectivity etc. have been acquired and maintained properly Adequate financial arrangements are not in place for sustaining the project

EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Project's linkages, liaison, coordination and impact upon related activities under NeGP being implemented in the country.							 Loosely aligned with NeGP as illustrated by duplication of some of the services to be provided by CSC (Government's initiative) and negligible support and buy-in of Government
The project's assistance, relationship, relevance to and coordination with the pre- existing Project management system and staff							• The project utilizes both the pre-existing management system (at village level) as well as staff (pre-existing staff) effectively and coordinates with them effectively
Clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various institutional arrangements for overall programme management and implementation and the level of coordination between relevant players		•					 Roles and responsibilities of all of the stakeholders were defined clearly Management processes have been clearly laid down for proper coordination between the various players
Risk assessment and management of the project							Most of the potential risks were noted downMitigation strategies for identified risk was not documented
Efforts of stakeholders in support of the implementation of the project							 The project proposal submitted to UNDP was documented in coordination with most of the stakeholders with partial buy-in of certain stakeholders Most of the stakeholders have extended support as envisaged from them during the proposal stage.
Extent of conflict of interest either between stakeholders involved in the project or with outside agencies.							• CSC is being set up by the Government which would provide some of the services currently being provided by the project. Moreover CSCs would have direct ownership and support of the Govt. which this project does not have.
					EFFIC	IENCY	
Was a formal workplan made at the start of the project to determine the timeframe in which activities would be performed							Detailed workplan prepared for all important activitiesWeek wise timelines defined for each activity
Were resources made available to the project implementation agencies in accordance with the requirements of the workplan							• None of the key resources, only a few of the support staff replaced. However the replacements had similar qualification and experience as proposed ones
Extent of deviation in the project implementation in so far as timelines is concerned.							• Project implementation delayed by less than 15% of overall duration

82



Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Responsiveness of the project management to such deviations and flexibility to deploy resources							• Management taking some steps in terms of extra resources (time and effort) to somehow correct the course of implementation
Were any systems, processes, manuals etc made to govern the activities in the project among the different stakeholders							Written governing manual were not availableMost of the instructions were followed by the stakeholders
Extent to which Results Based Management has been used							 The project used various metrics to monitor and evaluate the activities at various stage of the project; however extensive usage of RBM was not observed.
Whether there was adequacy of steps taken to resolve any conflict of interest in or due to the project							 Generic process of following up with Government has been planned to resolve the conflict of interest arising due to setting-up of CSCs in the region by the Government. Marginal efforts towards addressing this issue during the conceptualization phase.
				RES	SULTS	/IMPA	CTS
Whether the project has produced its desired immediate outputs							• Majority (50% to less than 75%) of the immediate outputs achieved
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, use of the new outputs as against the traditional options)							• Most of the intended beneficiaries used the project output in more than 75% cases and in 25% or less cases used traditional options
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, percentage of the target population)							• About 50% of the intended beneficiaries utilized the project output
Extent of drop-outs from usage of the outputs by the intended beneficiaries							• Marginal (Less than 25%) drop-out from usage of outputs by the intended beneficiaries
Are there any unforeseen/ unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups							The project resulted in certain unforeseen positive effects caused which promote the existing developmental efforts in the region.

EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent of the project results on the target beneficiaries in terms of (a) Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, (b) Capacity Building, (c) Change Management, (d) Business Process Re-engineering, (f) Public Private Partnership, (g) Bridging the Digital Divide, and (h) Knowledge and Experience Sharing		•					 Excellence has been achieved in following areas relevant to the project: Citizen-centric service delivery: information availability, identification of trainings for an individual, information on agriculture related topics, etc. Capacity building and bridging the digital divide: of rural women in using ICT tools for their development such as usage of video conferencing for training Knowledge and experience sharing: beneficiaries are sharing their experiences using videos and voice mails
Extent of the project impact on the target groups in terms of (a) governance (improved efficiency, transparency and accountability), (b) citizen-centric service delivery (advantages of cost, time and convenience), (c) rural livelihoods (number of jobs, extent and sufficiency of employment), and (d) women's empowerment (increased knowledge, and use of the same to voice their concerns).		•					Excellence has been achieved in significant number of cases in following relevant areas: • Citizen centric service delivery • Women empowerment • Rural livelihood
Extent of significance of the project impact on the development of the region/country							 Indicators for development were defined during project conceptualization stage Word was spread across the region and volunteers from non-targeted areas also coming forward and expressing interest in using the benefits of the project.
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by marginalized communities							• Most of the marginalized communities have utilized the project output in more than 50% cases where they needed similar service
Extent to which capacities have been built in stakeholders during the project							• Capacities of the main have been built up to at least perform the necessary operational and maintenance activities assigned to them
				SL	JSTAIN	IABILIT	ΓΥ
Extent of ownership of stakeholders in the project							• Complete ownership of all the 'implementing and operating' stakeholders in the project
Degree of support given by the Government in integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme							 Project objectives and goals not aligned with any specific Government programme. No Government support available for the project.





Evaluation matrix	Нібнг Satisfactory	SATISFACTORY	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent of availability of inputs/resources required for the project (people, finances, infrastructure, equipments)							• Resources in all the four area - people, finances, infrastructure, equipments were completely available during the part duration of the project
Have any revenue streams been defined in the project to make it self-sustaining							• Revenue stream has been defined in details, however not all the possible areas have been captured properly and this may affect the sustainability in long-term post expiry of the funding.
Extent of success of such pre-defined revenue streams							Achieving most of the pre-defined revenue streams
Extent to which inventory of the assets created out of the grants received in the project have been properly maintained and transferred to the beneficiaries							• Assets received under the project such as PCs, internet modems, video conferencing equipments etc. have been maintained well and the staff have been trained in using and maintain these assets.
Degree of collaboration that has developed among stakeholders during the project							• Stakeholder management plan is well defined and have complete adherence during project execution (e.g. formal minutes of all management meetings are documented).
Extent to which government is willing to finance the project after its completion of the UNDP funding							No funding committed by the Government

3.4 e-Krishi (Agri-Business Centres)

86

Table 19 Introdu	ction-	e-Kri	shi
------------------	--------	-------	-----

Project Title	e-Krishi: IT-enabled Agri. Business Centres in Kerala	
Proponent Organisation	Department of Information Technology, Kerala	
Implementation State	Kerala, with a potentials of getting replicated all over the country	
Target Site for Pilot Project	Malappuram District in Kerala	
Theme of Project	Rural Livelihoods	
Target Population	50,000 farmers	and the second sec
Project Cost		
Funding Required for Project	14,600,000	
Time Required to Implement Project	3 Years	
Name(s) of Partner Agencies	Agriculture Department-Kerala, Akshaya Centres	

IMPACT OF THE PROJECT IN BRIEF

In line with the vision of the project, 135 revenue villages of Mallappuram district were covered through 145 e-Krishi centers housed in Akshaya Kendras. These e-Krishi centers through the web portal, call center and field based support have supported farmers in complete crop cycle including marketing.

OBJECTIVE AREAS	OUTPUTS	OUTCOMES
Identification of specific farmers and farming groups to enhance registration & postings by farmers on the eKrishi Portal	• 145 e-Krishi centers were setup; eKrishi Portal developed	Over 7000 farmers in Malappuram district registered who availed various e-Krishi services using the eKrishi centers and portal.
Identification of potential traders and agents to explore market opportunity.	 Registered 408 buyers-retail/ wholesale/exporters; 62 Institutional buyers and 2 NGOs 	Traders and agents have benefited using the e-Krishi portal which was able to aggregate, apart from other functionalities, different items posted by the farmers.
Utilization of media and Web to reach targeted farmers and provide information on demand to enhance productivity and quality.	 About 100,000 visits (50% revisits mostly farmers) in 1 year More than 5,000 answered queries 	Nearly 10% of farmers covered; Participation observed from experts, scientists & other officials. Increase in productivity/quality which popularised e-Krishi services.
Enhancement of awareness among small farmers, train on negotiation with middlemen.	• Agmark, roadshow with 14 blocks, 567 locations, 4 progs on Aksashvani.	Combination of registered external buyers and knowledge of market rates of produce led to farmers in better position to negotiate
Active enrolment of agricultural input (seeds, plantlets, fertilizers, pesticides, technology providers/consultant etc.) providers	• Enrolments of 4 Govt. Agencies and others related to agricultural input providers	Benefits from the registered agricultural input providers.

3.4.1 Project Background

Introduction to the Project

A large majority of initiatives take up in the agriculture sector have been directed at increasing the production and productivity of crop plants by promoting good agricultural practices and post harvest processing of harvested products. But in spite of increased productivity, the farmers were forced to be satisfied with only 20 to 40 % of the market price depending on the perishability of produce, with middlemen pocketing the rest.

Other methods lacked sustainability as they either depended on subsidies, or were designed for large scale farmers and not for small homesteads. It was in this context that Kerala State IT Mission the Apex ICT implementation agency in Kerala came out with a the idea "e-Krishi" to address gaps in agricultural information flow and transaction management.

e-Krishi is a market driven agricultural initiative through IT enabled Agri Business Centres in Kerala State that addressed the existing gap in agriculture information flow and transaction management, which were the gray areas in the agriculture sector.

The aim of the project was to establish a connected farmers' community throughout Kerala who have access to information on market demand, prices, good agricultural practices, quality agricultural inputs, expert advices supported by a technology enabled robust transaction platform that facilitates all their agricultural activities. The need to integrate activities from policy making to grass root implementation required an integrated platform incorporating various Government departments and other stakeholders at various sectors.

It envisaged facilitating and enabling farmers and other stakeholders through Agri-Business Centres to interact with agricultural service providers in the private, government and nongovernment sectors. The project provided a web-based solution enabling the small and medium farmers as well as owners of large land holdings.

Target groups

The primary target groups included:

- Farmers, Self Help Groups (SHG), Agri Buyers/ Exporters, Agriproduct Manufacturers
- Agri input providers with respect to Seeds, Plantlets, Fertilizers, Pesticides, Experts, Testing Laboratories, Agricultural equipments suppliers, Quality graders, Warehousing, Logistics providers etc
- Other stakeholders like Banks, Insurance agencies,



Documentation specialists, Accountants, Legal support providers, Payment Gateway services, Government offices/resources, Agricultural institutions, NGOs & IOs

Expected Benefits & Post Implementation Scenario

Expected benefits were categorized in three broad categories which are illustrated below:

Benefits to farmers

Farmers were expected to be impacted the most through the e-Krishi initiatives. The key benefits to the farmers were:

- Access to warehouse, markets with prevailing price information;
- Access to schemes, subsidies, modern agricultural methods, best practices, soil testing, seeds, plantlets, fertilizers, pest control;
- Facilities for grading agricultural produce and ensuring correct price for their produce;
- Logistics support, cost sharing possibilities;
- Access to micro credits;
- Agri-Insurance support/faster claim processing; and
- Access to Accounting practices, Documentation support.

Benefits to Agricultural Input Providers, Buyers

e-Krishi platform was envisaged to provide following benefits to the Agricultural Input Providers/Buyers:

- Buyers/exporters to post their pick up quantities by date by market-venue/warehouse;
- Plan logistics routes for collection of agri-produce in advance seeing the offer quantities from farmers in various locations;
- Contact farmers producing any specific crop and confirm purchases in advance facilitating better control over supplies;
- Select farmers for producing any specific variety of crops on contractual basis integrating supplies of seeds/plantlets, farm maintenance etc;

- Easy access to customers, facility for systematic campaigning/ demonstrations;
- Efficient management of schemes/ programs; and
- e- platform assisting in real time transactions.

Benefits to Agricultural Activists, NGOs, Government organization

Other target groups were envisaged to reap following key benefits:

- Informed decision making on policy issues;
- Facilitates Integrated approach;
- Dissemination of agri based interventions becomes more structured and precise and customized; and
- Faster and larger reach to stakeholders is ensured due to networking.

Post implementation Scenario

The most significant differentiator of this initiative was that this initiative was built on the already existing PPP model of Akshaya whose credibility were established by the communities themselves. Hence, the accessibility of the Agri-Business Center and its ownership by the community was no longer a challenge and the benefits expected out of the project were almost on an immediate basis. The expected benefits during post implementation scenario were envisaged to be:

- Increased yields converting non-performing agricultural assets to performing asset;
- Empowering small farmers with real time information, collective bargain of prices for his crops, agricultural engineering; knowledge & advice that is customized for the small farmer;
- Facilitating institutional credit, Performing agriculture support systems, Efficient and cost effective logistics support; and
- Bringing in documentation practice in Agriculture confirming quality of produce effecting in high value products.





Target area for Implementation

Piloting was done in all the panchayaths (102) of Malappuram District of Kerala State with the participation of the existing Akshaya e-Kendra Entrepreneurs. The details about the Akshaya centers are provided in the subsequent sections.

Infrastructure:

The facilities already available with Akshaya project was used for e-Krishi project. At the panchayath level the Akshaya centres (CSC of Kerala) were upgraded as e-krishi centres.

Connectivity of 1 Gbps Internet link to the Kerala state wide area network facilities directly connected to the state government offices linked to the e-Krishi centers. Full scale technology infrastructure at the data centre was available in the form of mail server, live communication server, multi casting and content repository management, web streaming server, data base server, back-up server. e-Krishi portal (<u>www.e-krishi.org</u>) was developed to fulfill the objective of the project, the main features of which were:

- Trade centre Farmers posting, buyers posting, search advertisement, search requirement, location based aggregation, future advertisement;
- Crop information;
- Weather information;
- Fertilizer recommendation;
- Planting materials availability;
- Market Prices Resource library;
- Ask an expert;
- Video on demand; and
- e-Krishi news.

e-Krishi Implementation Roadmap

Following were the step by step activities carried out for pilot implementation of e-Krishi in Mallapuram district:

• Establish e-krishi information centers in Akshaya e-Kendra

AKSHAYA CENTRES

Akshaya Centres (CSCs of Kerala) was established as an ICT access points, one for every 1000 families living in two/three municipal or Panchayat wards. Akshaya e-centres were initially provided with five computers and other infrastructure at a cost of Rs. 3-4 lakhs per centre and they were to be within 2-3 Kilometre distance from every household. Entrepreneurs from the locality with service orientation were to be selected, on the social entrepreneurship model for running the centres. Government of Kerala has declared Akshaya Centres as the last mile Service Delivery Point for all the e-governance services. The following programmes were rolled out through Akshaya network in Malappuram:

- e-Payment- Bills/due collection of Government Agencies and payments through Akshaya Centres. Presently 150 + Akshaya Centres are collecting payments through an online payment system with the support of SBI. Services include Kerala State Electricity Board, Kerala Water Authority, University fees etc.
- Training Programmes- Akshaya Centres are offering a variety of training programmes. After educating 6 lakh people in the district in the basic computer literacy training, a medium level office package called e-vidya is offered to 1.5 lakh people in the district. Intel Learn Programme is operational, 15000 students attended Intel Learn Training programme.
- Connectivity- Providing Connectivity to Government offices is another important activity of Akshaya Project. All the police stations of the district are now connected through Akshaya Network. Another 50 Government Offices are also connected through Akshaya Network. More Government offices will be connected soon using the network.
- Govt Data Entry works- Akshaya Centres are engaged for the Data Entry works of various govt departments. Registration details of birth, marriage, death etc have been digitized through Akshaya Centres. 6 lakhs records of Total Sanitation Programme, Land Record Computerisation etc are now being implemented through Akshaya Centres.

- Provide support services for conducting Agro-Clinics in collaboration with Department of Agriculture.
- Conduct Farmers meetings
- Conduct capacity building programs for Agricultural officers
- Provide portal based information services
- Training programs for farmers/farmers group
- Develop quality informative video programs and disseminate through e-centres/web and setting up of archival
- Content Generation on various crops
- Awareness programmes to farmers
- Facilitate distribution of planting materials
- Online advise on selection of planting materials
- Awareness programmes to entrepreneurs and farmers
- Linkages with soil testing labs
- Training to entrepreneurs
- Provide fertilizer recommendation based on soil test and preferred crop
- Demand driven online advisory services on pest/ disease management (query management system)
- Develop quality informative video programs and dissemination through various medias
- Coordinate with other agencies for the distribution of various publications (print) on pest/disease management
- Provide demand driven training/demonstration of various pest/disease management techniques
- Provide seasonal alert regarding pest/disease outbreak
- Awareness program on various harvesting techniques
- Training programs on application of different harvesting technologies and best practices
- Identification of potential buyers on selected commodities
- Provide Web based platform (portal) for advertising (postings) of their commodities and to attract potential buyers
- Establish a trade call centre for handling trade related enquiries

- Interaction/coordination with the existing governmental and nongovernmental agencies
- Conduct a field study on present marketing /distribution system and further opportunities
- Identification of location specific production of agricultural commodities with the help of GIS
- Establish a data collection mechanism to capture local market price
- Provide web enabled market/price information on various agricultural commodities from selected markets
- Training programs for selected Akshaya Entrepreneurs
- Awareness programs for farmers
- Collection and aggregation of all relevant information/documents on various schemes/subsidies/loans etc from various agencies and provide through the portal
- Provide guidance for preparing bankable projects
- Coordinate with concerned agencies for the promotion and implementation of organic certification
- Conduct training programs for selected farmers/selected crops on grading and quality standards
- Grouping of farmers based on location specific/crop specific etc with the help of GIS

e-Krishi Operating Model

The activities under program was planned to be run utilizing the ICT infrastructure and the existing linkages of the Akshaya entrepreneurs with the local community of farmers, Local Self Government institutions, the Government offices and the traders in the locality. The entire activity of e-Krishi revolves around the e-Krishi website (www.e-krishi.org) and e-Krishi Centres which is operated on a PPP model (through Akshaya centers).

The steps in effecting trade of agricultural products through ekrishi are:



- 1. The farmers post the products in the e-Krishi website at the E-Krishi centers. There is at least one e-krishi centre in every panchayath. There is no fee for posting. The farmer decides the price, quality and quantity of the produce and also give the contact address.
- 2. The postings are verified by the project office and only those which are worthy of posting in the website are posted and the others are rejected.
- The farmers can also decide for how many days the posting should remain active. There is also facility for forward posting (i.e. the farmer can post that the produce will be available on a specified future date).
- 4. Businessmen who see the posting can contact the farmers directly and fix the transaction.
- 5. The business community/processors etc. can also post their requirement in the site and once the farmers sees their requirement they can contact them and strike a deal.

Communication & Publicity Strategy

In order to publicize the project, Mission team adopted a multi tier strategy. Following were the steps taken towards communication & publicity strategy:

- 1. Distribution of leaflets and brochures: Prepared two brochures, one in Malayalam and other in English. These brochures were distributed among various stakeholders.
- 2. Articles /news appeared in News papers: The news and articles on e-krishi appeared in various print media and News papers gave wide publicity to the project.
- Press conferences: In connection with the visit of NISG members a press conference was organized. This also brought ekrishi into limelight.
- 4. Face to face interaction with farmers: In connection with farmers day, face to face interaction with farmers were

organized in 102 panchayats and 5 Municipalities in which project staff and trained entrepreneurs explained about e-krishi

- Orientation session in agriculture training programmes: It was made compulsory to arrange one session for e-krishi project in the entire training programme organized with the support of ekrishi project
- 6. Road Show: Roadshow covered 14 blocks in Malappuram. E-krishi entrepreneurs and Bhoomi club members organized village level meetings. Every panchayaths arranged a reception programme for the roadshow. The panchayath president, standing committee chairman, panchayath members, Agriculture officer, Agriculture assistant, bhumiclub members, farmers, e-krishi entrepreneurs attended the function. At every meetings e-krishi and agmarknet website were explained with the help of CDs, PowerPoint presentations and Leaf lets. All the officials of the Department of Agriculture, Animal Husbandry participated in the road show.

3.4.2 Project Strategic Objectives

The project envisages facilitating and enabling farmers and other Stakeholders through Agri Business Centres to interact with Agricultural Service Providers in the Private, Government and Non-Government sectors. The project provided a web-based solution enabling the small and medium farmers as well as owners of large landholdings. The project could set up a fairly large network of farmers by giving them instant access to a lot of information useful to them, including market demand, price, best practices, and expert advice on quality improvement.

The project was piloted in Malappuram district of Kerala through 146 Akshaya e-Kendras. Malappuram was basically an agrarian society with about 70 per cent of population depending directly or indirectly on agriculture for their livelihood. Nearly 50 per cent of

the working population was engaged either as cultivators or as agricultural laborers.

The main objectives of the project, as envisaged, are:

- To identify the specific farmers and farming groups to enhance the registration and postings by the farmers in the eKrishi Portal
- To identify potential traders and agents to explore the market opportunity.
- To utilize the power of media and Web to reach targeted farmers and provide various information on demand to enhance their productivity and quality improvements.
- To enhance the awareness among the small farmers and help them in better negotiation with middleman.
- To establish active enrollment of agricultural input (seeds, plantlets, fertilizers, pesticides, technology/methodology providers/consultant, test laboratories and so on) providers

Knowing that the success and sustainability of E-Krishi projects lies in adopting a participatory approach right from the project initiation stage, the Mission team at Malappuram district established a chain of **Bhoomi Clubs** - an association of farmers, agricultural officers, LSG, e-krishi officials etc-across the district.

3.4.3 Project Relevance Inputs

The necessity for development of e-Agriculture was clearly spelt out by the Report of the Commission on WTO concerns in Agriculture, headed by Dr. M. S. Swaminathan. In its report titled "Building a Sustainable Agricultural Trade Security System for Kerala" the commission observed, "The substrate conditions essential for building a sustainable Agricultural Trade System relate to the following parameters:

• Proactive State Policy, which while building a response to the WTO, must defend and extend the economic and developmental

gains achieved through state intervention and public action in the past. The state cannot afford to withdraw in the new, WTOregulated phase of Kerala's development. It must continue to play a role in public investment (in agricultural extension, and infrastructure development, for example) as well as in protecting the lives and livelihoods of those, particularly the poor peasantry and agricultural labour, threatened by the new trade regime.

- Productivity enhancement by bridging prevailing gap between potential and actual yields with technologies on the shelf.
- Quality Improvement through a quality literacy movement for producers and consumers, and by strengthening infrastructure for sanitary and phytosanitary measures for both domestic and export markets.
- Profitability Enhancement through concurrent attention to production efficiency and higher factor productivity, as well as to improved post-harvest technology, value addition and agroprocessing. Measures for value-addition will also include organic farming and the production and marketing of organic spices, tea, coffee and fruits.
- Sustainability Improvement, through attention to the ecological foundations essential for improving productivity in perpetuity, such as soil health care, water harvesting and efficient use and forest and agro-biodiversity conservation.
- Stability of production and income through proactive advice on trends in home and external markets and through appropriate public policy measures like market stabilization fund and insurance.

Further, the first meeting of the World Summit on the Information Society (WSIS) 2003, with participation of the World Bank and held under the high patronage of the UN Secretary-General, discussed mechanisms for harnessing the potential of Information and Communications Technology (ICT) to promote the development



goals of the Millennium Declaration, through cooperative efforts among the donor community, the private sector and government. In the WSIS Action Plan, under section C7 ICT applications: benefits in all aspects of life, and numbered "21. e-Agriculture", it was proposed to

- Ensure the systematic dissemination of information using ICTs on agriculture, animal husbandry, fisheries, forestry and food, in order to provide ready access to comprehensive, up-to-date and detailed knowledge and information, particularly in rural areas.
- Public-private partnerships should seek to maximize the use of ICTs as an instrument to improve production (quantity and quality).

In Kerala, while value addition methodologies like Organic and Biodynamic agriculture do have the potential to develop in Kerala, conventional agriculture was resulting in overexploitation of the natural resources.

Much was required to be done for a concerted move. In the Knowledge driven economies of the future, sustainable practices that leverage natural advantages of the region calls for integrated action was to be promoted. Good Agricultural Practices as was being considered by UN FAO assures IPM (Integrated Pest Management), INM (Integrated nutrient management), efficient use of water resources through micro irrigation, extensive documentation for the purpose of certification and labeling along with stringent laboratory backed monitoring of Chemical and Microbial residues in plant and animal products will become the Global norm.

Stakeholder	Role(s) Played
Department of Agriculture, Kerala	Supporting to create direct linkages of farmers with e-Krishi centres. During the initial phase of the project provided the market information which helped to attract many farmers to E-krishi centres. Subsequently, made the reporting more efficient and brought more markets / information.
Akshaya Centre	Service provider - link between buyer and seller
Indian Institute of Information Technology and Management- Kerala	Providing consultation and technological support
Kerala Agricultural University, CPCRI, TBGRI, CTCRI, VFPCK,	Information providers. Help the toll free centre to answer different questions
Horticultural Department, Rubber Board, Coconut Board	posed by the farmers
C-DIT(Centre for development in Imaging Technology)	Providing technological support
Panchayats	Funding for expansion of the project in other districts; support and participation in extending the services of the Akshaya Centre.
Agricultural Banks, South Malabar Grameen Bank, NABARD, Canara Bank, Co-operative Societies	Providing loans / financial assistances to farmers
Kudumbashree, Kera Samrakshana Samithy, Kurumulaku	Members of the bhoomi clubs. Locating products for marketing and its posting,
Samrakshana Samithy, Krishi Vinjana Kendra (KVK),	help in village level trading, act as a link between local farmers and e-krishi
Padasekara Samithy	office
	Table 21 Stakeholders and their Roles, excision

Deloitte.

Table 21 Stakeholders and their Role



Theme	Activities
Bridging the Digital Divide	At least one member in all the houses was given basic training on usage of computer and internet which helped in easy penetration of e-Krishi concept among the farmers. In addition, several farmers, traders and officers in the department of agriculture were also trained on internet usage.
Citizen-Centric Service Delivery	Agricultural library, Agricultural Clinique with the help of department of Agriculture, online advisory programme(farmers can post their doubts in the site at the e-Krishi centre), toll free call centre, trading of agricultural commodities and several e-pay facilities
Public Private Partnership	E-krishi centers are owned and operated by local entrepreneurs
Capacity Building	Workshops and training programs were conducted regularly for all stakeholders.
Change Management	The following tools were used to help individual to bring change: Media, roadshow, exhibitions, trainings, workshops, live demonstrations etc.
Business Process Reengineering	Because of the re-engineering efforts, the transformation of village trade process from middlemen centric process to web-centric process was achieved.
Knowledge/Experience Sharing	Following the success of the e-Krishi project at Malappuram district, the concept was expanded to five more districts in Kerala (Kasargod, Kannur, Calicut, Ernakulam and Kollam) with funds obtained from the budget allocation of the panchayat for ICT activities.
Others	Through the e-krishi portal and the regular training programs it was possible to popularize the several development activities of the government which were not getting adequate publicity among the villagers.

3.4.4 Project Effectiveness Inputs

Project Stakeholders and Envisaged Roles

Table 22 brings out the different stakeholders involved and the respective roles they played.

Risks and Mitigation Strategies

Following are the risk and mitigation strategies as defined for the project:

• **Regular supply** - Big businessmen used services of middlemen for getting regular supply of the products. It was not possible for many of the farmers to provide a regular and an uninterrupted

supply chain. This was one of the main difficulties faced during the operationalization of e-krishi. This was mitigated to an extent by the forward posting facility provided in the website.

- Middlemen The role of the middlemen is to aggregate the products by collecting the products from small and marginal farmers and selling to the big businessmen. During the process they amassed wealth at the expense of farmers. This was overcome to an extent by providing virtual aggregation facilities in the website whereby traders could get large commodities from a locality without help of middlemen.
- Large quantity Most of the big businessmen were not interested in small quantities of agriculture produce, so there was risk of





supply of large quantity and maintaining the trust of these businessmen. This was overcome by the virtual aggregation facility which was provided in the website.

- Logistics Interdepartmental cooperation During the initial faces of the operation of the e-krishi the project was considered as a stand-alone project without involvement of other agencies. This resulted in several operational difficulties as most of the products intended for marketing were under the department of agriculture, animal husbandry etc. Hence the e-krishi concept was later on modified incorporating all the different stakeholders involve in the agricultural trade.
- IT education Unlike many of the farmers who were conversant with Internet operations, traders, processers and many other stakeholders were not aware. This was overcome by providing a series of training sessions on how to use Internet.

3.4.5 Project Efficiency Inputs

Activities Performed in different Dimensions of Intervention: Table 22 summarises the main activities being performed in the different themes of intervention.

Project Management Approach

Kerala State IT Mission (KSITM) was looking after the project management of e-Krishi project whereas IIITM-K and C-DIT took care of the website related matters. Director, KSITM co-ordinated all the E-Krishi activities with the help of Head E-krishi. Two committees involved in the management of E-krishi are the State level implementation committee and the District level Coordination committee.

The State level implementation committee was headed by the Secretary, IT Department of Government of Kerala and has 12 members. The committee helps in creating a link with all the participating departments and is also responsible for making midway corrections if necessary. The committee meets once in six months

At the District level the District Project Office, Malappuram was the nodal agency for the implementation of the project. The District level committee headed by the District Panchayath President monitor and evaluate the project every quarter.

Extent of Usage of Local Expertise

All the e-krishi centres were owned and managed by local entrepreneurs. Among the entrepreneurs a sizable number were women. Similarly, a very high percentage (more than 60%) of the field workers, field co-ordinators etc. are women. In the website as well as during the training programmes special weightage was given to the local know how and technologies developed locally.

Management Processes Followed during the Project

The project was managed through set of management processes including regular meetings of stakeholders, monitoring and evaluation, preparation of RBM based LFA, project planning, trainings and capacity building.

Extent of Usage of RBM and Performance Indicators

RBM framework was being used for monitoring of the project. During the first week of every month, the RBM report is prepared and sent to concern agency. Monthly review of work of field coordinators and Bhoomi Club members was carried out by the project co-ordinator of the e-Krishi. Similarly, the work of e-Krishi entrepreneurs is reviewed on a regular basis and based on their performance they were categorised into A to E grades

3.4.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated

The project generated the following results and impacts:

- Increased transaction using e-Krishi website: The actual benefit of the E-Krishi project was noticed during 2008 when a large number of farmers posted their produce in the website and the number of businessmen using the online information for trading increased significantly.
- Conversion of fallow lands: In Malappuram, farmers were moving away from paddy cultivation as there was no assured market for their produce and the price offered for paddy was so low that it could not even meet the cost of cultivation. This resulted in farmers keeping their lands fallow. From 2007 paddy season, Government of Kerala through the Civil Supply Corporation started procuring the entire paddy ported by farmers in Malappuram district by paying Rs. 2-3 more than the current market rate. Apart from the increased price, this ensured an assured market for paddy. This resulted in more farmers cultivating fallow fields. The Department of Agriculture is now directly promoting the e-Krishi for posting of paddy by the farmers.
- Revival of closed down units (Mushroom): Department of Agriculture regularly conducts training programs for cultivation of mushroom. While financial support was provided by banks for starting mushroom production units, there was no support for marketing of the produce resulting in closing down of most of the units in absence of a regular buyer. Under e-Krishi project, all mushroom groves with infrastructure facilities and buyers who are interested in buying mushroom were brought under one umbrella.

An MOU was signed between the buyer and seller on the quantity, price, frequency of supply etc. Both the buyers and sellers made use of the forward posting and aggregation modules. Currently the mushroom cluster is operating successfully and nearly 100 kg of mushrooms is marketed daily @ Rs. 100 per Kg. Similar clusters were also formed for coconut farmers.

- Improved access to advice on managing the pests and diseases: Farmers require immediate management strategy once pests and diseases infect the crop. For this round the clock advice was required. Services of Agriculture officers were many a times not available as the farms are located is remote places. Now farmers were regularly using e-Krishi toll free centres (1800-425-1661) for getting the required advice as and when required. The fact that there was large number of repeat callers shows the popularity of the service.
- Improved access to agriculture information: Intervention of e-Krishi was steadily helping the farmers in this aspect. Now planting of crops and harvesting of the products by farmers were not directly linked with marketing. Using the e-Krishi portal, farmers can plan the harvest date based of the requirement of the buyers. At least some of the farmers were making use of the information provided in the portal to get a better price for their product.

The Kizhisseri e-Krishi centre initiated a noteworthy beginning in this line. They formed farmer groups of coconut farmers. These farmers' harvest and farm level value addition was done as a group. They also tied up with major buyers for selling their produce. This, apart from helping the farmers in getting better price for their produce also help in effective labour management as coconut puckers were in short supply in Malappuram district.

 Better access to agricultural projects: Every panchayath conducted location specific projects on various fields in agriculture. Most of the time details of these projects were not easily available to farmers. In order to overcome this, the



details of all the projects of each panchayath were made available at the e-Krishi centres. This, apart from giving better exposure of the projects to farmers gave also increased the frequency of visit of farmers to the e-Krishi centres.

• Comprehensive database of marketable Commodities: The current database of e-Krishi had details posted by farmers about the products available for sale. In Kerala, as homestead farming was popular, each household might have several crops

Parameters	Before Project	After Project
Online Trading of Agri-Produce	Nil or Very Low	Substantially Increased
Mushroom Cultivation	Units on the verge of Closure	Mushroom cluster operating successfully with 100kgs traded every day. Same for Coconut.
Online Advice on Agricultural practices	Nil or Very Low	Substantially Increased
Database coverage of homestead farmer's produce	Nil or Very Low	Substantially Increased
Increased coverage and price for paddy produce	Not possible earlier because of locational constraints for Mallapuram	Coverage for all paddy growers who accessed eKrishi with an additional income of Rs 1.50/kg.
Price information for crops cultivated in small quantities	Not possible earlier	Possible and being made use of now including Averhoea, arrow root etc

but the marketable supplies were very low. Because of which farmers never posted items available in small quantity on the website (e.g. Mango). In order to overcome this, comprehensive database of farms is being prepared and posted in the web. This helped in getting correct picture of the products available in a locality and in turn helped the merchants to aggregate the products required.

- Improved co-ordination logistics: One of the major achievements of e-Krishi project was the paddy procurement during 2007 season. Kerala Government, in order to help the paddy farmers, initiated a paddy procurement drive in two district of Kerala- Palakkad and Alappuzha. The procurement price was Rs. 8.50/Kg as against Rs.7/- in the local market. Malappuram district was not included the paddy procurement programme. When the Agriculture department contacted the civil supplies department (nodal agency in procurement) they refused as it is difficult to get bulk quantity of paddy in the stipulated time in Malappuram unlike in Palakkad and Alappuzha.
- Improved access to price & Market infrastructure: E-Krishi portal was providing details of market price on a daily basis. Apart from that, farmers were regularly contacting the toll free centre to get the price of commodities especially those of which were not listed in the market. Some of the products, which are traditionally cultivated in small quantity, did not used to have organized buyers. (eg. Averhoea, arrow root etc.). Through e-Krishi it was possible to link farmers producing such products with the processors directly.

Table 23 Impact of the Project- eKrishi

3.4.7 Project Sustainability Considerations

The sustainability of e-Krishi project was based on the sustainability of its parental organization Akshaya as the project had been conceived as piggy packed. E-Krishi was one among the different projects that are being operated in the Akshaya centres. From the Akshaya centres in Malappuram district, a screening process was carried out under which only best performing Akshaya centres were converted to e-Krishi centres.

Even though from the financial sustainability point of view, the e-Krishi project never conceived as a standalone model, however if the overall impact of the project and sustainability was considered, it could be regarded as highly successful given its continued success in the past six years in Kerala. Moreover, it was envisaged that at a later stage, e-Krishi would become the most financially viable project under Akshaya services once farmers start trading substantial quantity of agricultural products using the e-Krishi project.

Project Institutional Arrangements

The e-Krishi project was formulated and being operated with an adequate institutional arrangement to ensures the project sustainability. Further, the e-Krishi project tied-up with various institutions/bodies for its operations which included relevant Government agencies/departments, financial institutions/banks, Cooperative societies, NIC, Agmarknet and SHG groups.

Extent of Commitment/Involvement/Ownership of Stakeholders

There was an active participation from all the stakeholders involved in the e-Krishi project. Department of Agriculture and Department of Animal Husbandry had direct link with the target group i.e. the farmers. Hence from the very beginning, these departments have been actively involved in engaging with the farmers and providing guidance to the e-Krishi project. Assistant Director (Marketing) of the Agriculture Department helped the project by regularly providing market price/information from major markets of Malappuram District (Malappuram, Manjeri and Kottakkal markets) on all market days.

During the initial phase of the project, just by providing the market information it was possible to attract many farmers to E-krishi centres. Subsequently, to make the reporting more efficient and to bring more markets under the project, Assistant Directors of all the 14 Blocks of Malappuram were provided with broadband connectivity. This apart from enhancing the knowledge base of the offices also helped to improve their reporting capabilities.

From application development perspective, during the every phase of the website development, up-gradation, modification and involvement of stakeholders' views of all the existing stakeholders were taken into consideration.

Degree of Support Provided by the Government

Kerala state government played an important role in the success of the e-Krishi project and has been supportive of this initiative for the entire duration. At the state level, the State level implementation committee is headed by the Secretary IT Department of Government of Kerala and has 12 members drawn from the Departments of Agriculture, Kerala Agricultural University, Commodity Boards, etc. This committee helps in creating a link with all the participating departments and is responsible for making midway corrections if necessary.

At the central level too, Government of India was supportive of this project. The Ministry of Agriculture, Government of India sanctioned a project under Marketing Research and Information Network for Agmarknet Training Programmes through Akshaya. The



main objectives of the project were to equip the farming community in Malappuram district with market information on agricultural produces. It was aimed at training farmers and Akshaya entrepreneurs in using Agmarknet and E-krishi facilities and thereby facilitate farmers of the district to make use of information on the net to improve their marketing strategy.

Efforts to Replicate Project Results

Seeing the success of the e-Krishi project in Malappuram district, efforts have been made by the Government of Kerala to replicate the project in other districts. Government first decided to roll out the model as a text case in Kannur district during 2007 -08 period. Later seeing the successful implementation of the project in Kannur, the project was further extended to four more districts during 2008-09 period. Now, the Govt of Kerala has agreed to include ekrishi under the peoples plan programme from the next financial year onwards. In addition, government undertook following steps for its replication to other districts:

- Constituted a state level committee for replication
- Preparation of a model project and farm data questionnaire for peoples plan campaign (Janakeeyasuthranam)
- Presentation of the project at District/Block/Panchayath levels and its approval
- Selection and training of enumerators & data collection
- Modification of web site in local language
- Verification of data by Agricultural officer
- Uploading of data by trained e-krishi centres
- Formation of Bhoomi clubs and registration
- Discussion with LSG and Agricultural Department for starting collection/aggregation centre

EVALUATING THE PROJECT

The project has been evaluated on five parameters viz. Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Results/Impacts and Sustainability which were further affirmed by subparameters illustrated in Table 24 that exhibits the evaluation in six categories of Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Moderately Satisfactory, Moderately Unsatisfactory, Unsatisfactory And Highly Unsatisfactory, accounting respectively for 6,5,4,3,2 and 1 points. The right most column substantiates the scores. The rating for each of the parameters was arrived at after averaging on the ratings for each of the sub-parameters. Similarly the overall evaluation rating were arrived at after averaging on the parameter ratings.



Figure 18 Evaluating the Project- eKrishi

Deloitte

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE NEXT STEPS

SUSTAINABLE BUSINESS MODEL FOR e-KRISHI

Even though e-Krishi was conceived as one of the service offered by the Akshaya centres in Kerala and its individual financial and operational sustainability was considered as unviable, going forward it would be important that e-Krishi becomes self-sustainable if the project has to succeed at state level and later at national level. The following options can be explored:

- **Membership fees:** Once the project succeeds to generate wide interest among farmer and businessmen community and a certain critical number of transactions is achieved, then a revenue model can be worked out under which the farmers and businessmen who are availing the e-Krishi portal services will be required to pay a membership fee (it can either be onetime payment or annual fee).
- **Transaction charges:** For each successful transaction between the farmers and the businessmen, a certain amount can be collected from both the parties (either some percentage of transaction amount or a fixed amount).
- **Online advertising:** Considering the wide popularity of e-Krishi portal, it can also be used as a medium to carry relevant advertisements such as farm equipments, fertilizers, banks, insurance etc. This on one hand will provide an additional revenue generating opportunity; on the other hand, the farmers and other stakeholders will find pertinent advertisements catering to their needs at one single place.

REPLICATION OF e-KRISHI ACROSS THE STATE

The e-Krishi project has tremendous potential for expansion, hence similar e-Krishi centres can be setup in other districts too following the guidelines for selection of Akshaya Centres which would provide e-Krishi services. For smooth running of the projects in other districts, district committees need to formed for each district which would monitor the progress and achievements of e-Krishi projects. Further, in order to ensure the uniformity across districts, a common policy document needs to be prepared with details of Governance Structure, Monitoring & Evaluation framework, policies and procedures and responsibilities of stakeholders involved.

IMPLEMENTATION OF e-PAYMENT SYSTEM AS PART OF e-KRISHI PORTAL

Currently the system does not have a provision for online payment by the businessmen, making the entire payment process cumbersome and time consuming. Hence, the existing e-Krishi portal should be upgraded to enable online payments through credit card/debit card/internet banking etc.

ONLINE PURCHASE OF AGRICULTURAL INPUTS / CONSUMABLE

In addition to existing services and functionalities, the e-Krishi portal can be used to facilitate online purchase/sales of agricultural inputs/consumables such as seeds, fertilizers, pesticides, farm equipments etc. This facility would enable the online sales and purchase among the farmers (for old/used/spare items) as well as between farmers and businesses (for new items).

PUBLICITY & AWARENESS GENERATION AMONG FARMER COMMUNITY

In addition to the publicity and awareness program carried out till date, it is essential to carryout effective awareness generation programs among farmer community across the state to ensure that a much larger audience can be covered. The popular medium of communication such as mobile phones, television, local newspapers, and community radio can be used for the awareness programs.



3.4.8 Project Evaluation Matrix

							Table 24 Detailed evaluation matrix for ICT for e-Krishi
Evaluation matrix	Нібні Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
		REL	EVANC	E			
Needs of the beneficiary captured							 All beneficiaries are identified Requirements of the beneficiaries were captured through survey and filling up of Questionnaire Needs of beneficiaries were analyzed to incorporate as part of e-Krishi project.
Relevant to needs & expectations of beneficiary							 Segmentation is done based on the input received through the filled up questionnaire Project design partially tailored to the needs & expectations of all the segments
Relevant to development priorities of Govt. of India							 Agriculture is one of the top priority sector for Govt. of India e-Agriculture is identified as one of the state MMP by Govt. of India in its National e-Governance Plan (NeGP)
Relevant to development priorities of concerned State Government							 e-Krishi Project strongly aligned with and draws sustenance from currently operational developmental programme of Kerala Govt.
Identified problem has high incidence in area of focus							 Frequent and continuous incidences reported in the area Substantial number of individuals of the targeted vulnerable group (farmers) are affected Similar problem affecting vulnerable groups in other parts of the state/country
Correct & accurate identification of target stakeholders and/or correctly defined vulnerable groups							 Stakeholders properly segmented including the vulnerable segments and all individuals associated with segments In addition, provision is made to include other stakeholders.
Adequacy of Government commitment to project							• Government has played an important role for the success of this initiative. At the state level, project implementation committee is headed by the IT Secretary of Govt. of Kerala.



EVALUATION MATRIX	Нібні Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	HIGHLY UNSATISFACTORY	Remarks
							 State Agriculture department has been involved in project governance and implementation. Project has received all support from relevant government agencies in the form of technical expertise, information sharing, publicity, training and awareness generation programs for usage the E-Krishi services. Govt. has made provision financial assistance for roll out of the project through the ICT budget of Panchayats.
Project relevance to ICT4D focus under the project							• Presence of e-Krishi portal is vital for the success of this project, as without this information sharing/dissemination; transactions of agricultural produces would not be possible in real time basis.
		EFFEC	TIVEN	ESS			
Problem been stated correctly and distinctly							 Problems identified, defined and documented Validation of identified problems by the representative of few stakeholders
Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries, users of the project are identified as stakeholders of the project							 Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries and users have been identified as stakeholders Roles and responsibilities of all stakeholders have been detailed out
The assumptions, objectives, outputs and outcomes have been clearly articulated in measurable terms							 Objectives, outputs and outcomes vaguely identified. Certain assumptions articulated Subjective measurement terms in use
The linkages between objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was clear							Logical linkages present but not documented
The project design allowed for flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment.							 Project design capable of adapting to and responding positively to most of the possible types of changes
Degree of support given by the Government towards integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme and other related projects							• Project strongly aligned with national programme and Govt. has made provision to fund the project.





Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Μοderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Planning component of the project take into account the use of ICT for improved governance / service delivery in various areas through pilot initiatives, encouraging BPR, development local solutions and applications and encouragement of PPP model							 E-Krishi portal in Malayalam though was not there during pilot implementation, has been lunched subsequently. BPR: e-enablement of existing processes / delivery mechanism PPP model (with akshaya entrepreneur) to provide e-Krishi services to farmers
The adequacy of institutional arrangements in attaining the long- term objective of the project. Also the infrastructural, logistical, and financial implication of sustaining the project objectives beyond the project duration/after completion of UNDP funding.		•					 Institutional bodies such as Bhoomi club have been set-up with defined roles and responsibilities for attaining long-term goals Required assets including PCs, application software, network connectivity etc. have been acquired and maintained properly Adequate financial arrangements (e.g. from ICT budget of panchayats for roll out and maintaining the e-Krishi portal) are in place for sustaining the project
Project's linkages, liaison, coordination and impact upon related activities under NeGP being implemented in the country.							• Significantly aligned and synchronized with NeGP and its components. E-Agriculture is one of State MMPs as defined as part of NeGP. e-Krishi utilizes the infrastructure of Akshaya centers (CSCs of Kerala)
The project's assistance, relationship, relevance to and coordination with the pre-existing Project management system and staff							 Uses both the pre-existing management system as well as staff effectively but does not contribute towards the pre- existing cause.
Clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various institutional arrangements for overall programme management and implementation and the level of coordination between relevant players							 All institutional arrangements / stakeholders were considered Roles and responsibilities of all of the identified stakeholders were identified Management processes clearly laid down for proper coordination between the players Flexibility to incorporate more stakeholders / institutional arrangement does not exists
Risk assessment and management of the project							 Few of the potential risks noted down Mitigation strategies for identified risk laid down The risk management and mitigation plan was partially adhered



EVALUATION MATRIX	Нідні y Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Efforts of stakeholders in support of the implementation of the project							 The project proposal submitted to UNDP was documented in coordination with most of the stakeholders with partial buy-in of certain stakeholders e.g. Government Though there were initial glitches, most stakeholders have extended support as envisaged during the proposal stage.
Extent of conflict of interest either between stakeholders involved in the project or with outside agencies.							• Partial conflict of interest among the stakeholders of this project and conflict resolution process initiated prior to implementation of the project
		EFF	ICIENC'	Y			
Was a formal workplan made at the start of the project to determine the timeframe in which activities would be performed							Detailed work-plan prepared for all important activitiesWeek wise timelines defined for each activity
Were resources made available to the project implementation agencies in accordance with the requirements of the workplan							 Resources provided to the project in accordance with new requirements / change in project environment. There were backup in resources in case of exigency
Extent of deviation in the project implementation in so far as timelines is concerned.							• There were substantial delay in Project implementation compared to the overall project duration
Responsiveness of the project management to such deviations and flexibility to deploy resources							• Management taking some steps in terms of extra resources (time and effort) to correct the course of implementation
Were any systems, processes, manuals etc made to govern the activities in the project among the different stakeholders							 e-Krishi portal has been developed. Written governing manual available for e-Krishi Portal The instructions are followed by the stakeholders
Extent to which Results Based Management has been used							 Stage wise, stakeholder based RBM used. RBM being used as an important tool for making management decisions
Whether there was adequacy of steps taken to resolve any conflict of interest in or due to the project							• All potential conflicts completely resolved prior to the implementation stage
	R	ESULT	S/IMPA	CTS			
Whether the project has produced its desired immediate outputs							• The project has achieved significant (More than 75%) of immediate outputs including all the major outputs.



Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Μοderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, use of the new outputs as against the traditional options)							 Most of the intended beneficiaries utilized the project output in more than 50% cases where they needed similar service
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, percentage of the target population)							 Because of reluctance of the targeted beneficiaries i.e. the farmers, less than targeted beneficiaries utilized the e-Krishi services. However, the awareness among the beneficiaries is increasing with the continued success of the project.
Extent of drop-outs from usage of the outputs by the intended beneficiaries							• Marginal (Less than 25%) drop-out from usage of outputs by the intended beneficiaries
Are there any unforeseen/ unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups							 The e-Krishi project did not cause any unintended negative effect caused on the target groups On the contrary, a few unforeseen positive effects caused which promotes the existing developmental efforts in the state/region
Extent of the project results on the target beneficiaries in terms of (a) Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, (b) Capacity Building, (c) Change Management, (d) Business Process Re-engineering, (f) Public Private Partnership, (g) Bridging the Digital Divide, and (h) Knowledge and Experience Sharing							 All the seven areas are relevant to the project and excellence has been achieved for each one of them: At least one member in all the houses was given basic training on usage of computer and internet helping in bridging the digital divide. Agricultural library, Agricultural Clinique, online advisory programme, toll free call centre, trading of agricultural commodities and several e-pay facilities were established to achieve the citizen centric service delivery.
Extent of the project impact on the target groups in terms of (a) governance (improved efficiency, transparency and accountability), (b) citizen-centric service delivery (advantages of cost, time and convenience), (c) rural livelihoods (number of jobs, extent and sufficiency of employment), and (d) women's empowerment (increased knowledge, and use of the same to voice their concerns).							 All the four areas are relevant to the project and excellence has been achieved for each one of them Among the entrepreneurs a sizable number are women. Similarly, a very high percentage (more than 60%) of the field workers, field co-coordinators etc. are women.
Extent of significance of the project impact on the development of the region/country							• The E-krishi project has been successfully implemented in the Malappuram district in Kerala and has achieved the desired results for the development of the region especially



EVALUATION MATRIX	Нібні v Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							 the farmer community. Seeing the impact of the project, the government of Kerala has proposed to replicate the project in other districts of Kerala, which clearly shows the kind of success the project had on the development of local communities.
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by marginalized communities							 Most of the marginalized communities have used the project output in more than 75% cases and in 25% or less cases used traditional options
Extent to which capacities have been built in stakeholders during the project							• Capacities of all stakeholders build up to perform activities assigned to / expected of them.
		SUSTA	INABIL	ITY			
Extent of ownership of stakeholders in the project							• Complete ownership of all the 'implementing and operating' stakeholders in the project i.e. the local entrepreneurs owning the e-Krishi centres, DIT Kerala, Agriculture Department, KSITM etc.
Degree of support given by the Government in integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme							 E-Krishi project is strongly aligned with development priorities of government of India. Govt of Kerala has agreed to include eKrishi under the peoples plan programme from the next financial year onwards.
Extent of availability of inputs/resources required for the project (people, finances, infrastructure, equipments)							 Resources in all the four area - people, finances, infrastructure, equipments were completely available during the part duration of the project
Have any revenue streams been defined in the project to make it self-sustaining							 The revenue sources (such as transaction fees) have been identified for the purpose of financial sustainability However, it is yet to be defined and internally approved.
Extent of success of such pre-defined revenue streams							• E-krishi project has not been conceptualized as a self- sustaining revenue generating project.
Extent to which inventory of the assets created out of the grants received in the project have been properly maintained and transferred to the beneficiaries							• Assets received under the project such as servers, PCs, furniture etc. have been maintained well. The district head quarters/ e-Krishi centre's staff have been trained in using and maintaining these assets.

106



EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Μοderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Degree of collaboration that has developed among stakeholders during the project							 Stakeholder management plan is well defined during conceptualization stage and have complete adherence during project execution. Stakeholders were always involved during operational and strategic decision making.
Extent to which government is willing to finance the project after its completion of the UNDP funding							 There are no direct financial commitments by government of Kerala for the replication of the project. However, the funding for the future roll out of the project is to be achieved from the local government bodies i.e. Panchayats in villages.



3.5 Decentralized Rural Information System & Technology Initiatives (DRISTI)

Project Title	Decentralized Rural Information System & Technology Initiatives(DRISTI)	
Proponent Organisation	West Bengal State Rural Development Agency (WBSRDA) and the Panchayat $lpha$	
	Rural Development, Government of West Bengal	
Implementation State	West Bengal	
Target Site for Pilot Project	Burdwan District and State HQ	
Theme of Project	To provide an IT based solution for all the major functions of Panchayats	
	including micro planning at village level including civil society for promoting	
	transparency and accountability.	
Target Population	800,000	
Project Cost	Rs 144.89 Lakhs	
Funding Required for Project	Rs 144.89 Lakhs	
Time Required to Implement Project	24 months	٠.
Name(s) of Partner Agencies	Riddhi Management Services (Private Partner)	1
Table 25 Project Introduction- DRISTI		

IMPACT OF THE PROJECT IN BRIEF

Decentralized Rural Information Services and Technology Initiatives (DRISTI) piloted in Burdwan district to use ICT for strengthening rural decentralization; establishing a credible system of fund management and accounting; and generation and dissemination of information for ensuring social audit. DRISTI transformed the way various tiers within the government system transacts with each other and showed how information flow be it bottom to top and vice versa can support the broader rural decentralization, thereby creating a credible system of fund management and accounting.

OBJECTIVE AREAS	OUTPUTS	OUTCOMES
Better efficiency in managing various programmers and delivery systems	Implementation of IFMS and GPMS in all the Zilla Parishads, 99% of the Panchayat Samitis and more than half of the Gram Panchayats	Improved G2C services-time taken for delivering citizen centric services such as birth/death, trade registration etc. have been reduced significantly (>7 days to 1 day).
Providing decentralized information management through GIS at Block and Gram Panchayats	GIS based maps developed for 103 Gram Panchayats on PPP mode	ICT through GIS played a major role in bringing about integrated government. GIS technology enabled a user to 'drill down' from broad based aggregate plan down to a revenue village.
Creating better monitoring and compliance machinery, promoting social audit.	Developed more systematic approach for MIS, capacity building of 90 % of the functionaries.	Improved accounting system for PRIs, G2G communications and g schemes implementation by supporting capturing and updation of the action plans being implemented by PRI




3.5.1 Project Background

Introduction to the Project

Effective participation of people in their self-governance necessarily requires access to information regarding functioning of Panchayats. There was a wide gap between the information "haves" & "have-nots". To facilitate access to quality information in the process of strengthening decentralization, ICT plays a vital role. Lack of quality information flow from the upper tiers to the people at Panchayats or vice versa was a major issue in the rural development. Panchayats needed to play the role of "information provider". Local information database developed according to the need of the area, the World Wide Web and E-mail facility for information sharing with knowledge about using ICT (Information & Communication Technology) tools together could make a knowledge base for the rural community. Use of IT would bring more transparency in the functioning of the government and help people to participate in decision-making process. ICT was expected to give the poor a voice to demand Government support and reform. But it was also a fact that ICT interventions depend critically on how the rest of the economy functions. Thus it was necessary to have the Integrated Governance first before any egovernance can take place.

With the growth in scope and span of functioning of the PRIs it was felt that the technique of function of PRIs should be changed to modern direction to deliver better services to its stakeholders. The 'citizen as the shareholder' can now demand several information on the functioning of a government and also may provide several inputs to the government's policy-making process, while the 'citizen as a customer' can demand better services from local governments. It was felt that the traditional system for management and flow of data were not at all sufficient for the MIS activities of the Panchayat bodies. In this perspective the Department of Panchayat and Rural Development defined that IT should play a major role to play in strengthening the Information Management system at PRIs for its efficient functioning. Major objectives of the projects, as identified:

- Better efficiency in managing various programmers and delivery systems,
- Providing decentralized information management through GIS at Block and Gram Panchayats.
- Creating a better monitoring and compliance machinery,
- Promoting social audit.

Project components

Entire project was divided into four components, detail of which, are provided below:

- <u>Sub-Project-IA: Gram Panchayat Management System</u>-This subproject would provide a complete IT solution for transacting all the business of a Gram Panchayat. With this software total fund monitoring of a Gram Panchayat would be possible. The project would also provide general information relating to the Gram Panchayat and would provide a module for Assessment and collection of Tax and other non-tax revenues by the PRIs. It would also provide other utilities like information on Below Poverty Line population, Death and birth Registration, Trade registration and issue of certificates therefore so as to enable to create a reliable database on Poverty Assessment; vital statistics disintegrated up to village level.
- <u>Sub- Project IB: Decentralized Information Management</u> through GIS- The purpose of this component were:
 - To create a GIS based information network for enhanced information flow between Gram Panchayat, Panchayat Samiti, Block administration, line departments at block level, Zilla Parishad, District administration, selective line departments at the district level and the state.

- To enable all the stakeholders to monitor the development indicators at the grassroots level on a regular basis, procuring information at a shorter interval and planning and executing focused interventions based on recent information.
- Sub-Project-II: Integrated Fund Monitoring and Accounting System- This is a complete IT solution for the financial management for the upper two tiers of the PRI system, i.e. for the Panchayat Samiti and Zilla Parishads. Monitoring and accounting of the entire fund management of the upper two tiers of the PRI system was possible through this software. The solution itself would provide a communication module through



• Indicates Panchayat Samitis Considered for the project.

Figure 20 Coverage of DRISTI

which the incremental data for each day will be transmitted to the upper tier of the PRIs at a predefined hour of the day, through a dial-up network.

• Sub-Project-III: Government to citizen Interface: This project would focus on establishing a strong machinery to foster social audit, transparency and responsibility of the government to the civil society. It was envisaged that the entire business transaction by the three tiers Panchayat System would be possible through the IT solution provided by the Sub-Project-IA, IB and II above. The incremental data of daily transaction would be warehoused at the State Level. Here all the relevant information having bearing on public interest and involvement would be extracted, summarized and would be published through website for perusal of the entire civil society. This was an effort for promoting the social audit. The process would also generate and monitor an interface for online registration of grievance of any stakeholder through the departmental website www.wbprd.nic.in . The stakeholders would also be apprised about the action taken on the basis of the grievances expressed by them. Through another component of the project, all the notifications, circulars, guidelines issued by the department and case studies on best practices related to PRIs, SHG, Watershed Development, Sanitation, Public Health, Alternative Primary Education, etc. would be categorized and would be made available through the department's website.

The Panchayat and Rural Development Department implemented this sub-project in collaboration with the State Institute of Panchayat and Rural development, Kalyani, Nadia.

All the above sub-projects in tandem are expected to promote transparency and accountability and provide required information for micro planning at village level and will create an enabling environment for better compliance mechanism



Target Area of Implementation

The district of Burdwan, one of the western districts of the Burdwan Division, is situated between 22 56' and 23 53' North Latitude and between 86 48' and 88 25' East Longitude. The district lies mainly between the rivers, Ajoy, the Bhagirathi or Hooghly and the Damodor. It is bounded on the North by the Santhal Parganas, Birbhum and Murshidabad, on the East by Nadia, on the South by Hooghly, Midnapore & Bankura , and on the West by Purulia. The district has abundant natural resources, but on the other hand, it is a child labour district also and burdened with a sizeable number of temporary migratory people in all the seasons throughout the year.

The Project was implemented at 20 Panchayat Samitis of Burdwan District and 50 Gram Panchayats under these Panchayat Samitis. The GIS based Decentralised Information Management system would be implemented at Galsi-I, ,Galsi-II, Aushgram-II and Aushgram-I Panchayat Samitis covering 32 Gram Panchayats.

Project Functional Scope

The major scope of this project was empowering Rural Local Bodies for better democratic governance through

- Efficient functioning of the PRIs: The major functions include: Perform the statutory duties including registration of birth and death and issue of such certificates, implementation of various schemes so as to reach the benefit of the poverty alleviation programmes to the marginalized section without delay, establishment of an IT based solution for fund management
- **Providing integrated citizen services:** Efficient collection and management of resources (Assessment of Tax, Collection thereof, Non Tax revenues). Creation of Information Bank and network of information regarding a range of indicators which can be easily accessible and

regularly updated for interventions pertaining to a number of areas such as agriculture, livelihood, natural resources, education, health, sanitation, water supply and nutrition etc.

The functional scope of the project is described under heading of four inter-related sub-projects:

- Sub-Project-IA: Gram Panchayat Management System (GPMS): The GPMS was conceptualized as total software solution at the Gram Panchayat Level. Since GPMS would run at the village/GP level, it was proposed that (a) the solution must be implemented at a low-end computing environment with in-built redundancy to control fail-over time, (b) it must be easy to install and administer, (c) it must have a scope of easy customization and finally (d) it must be as simple as possible. At the same time it has to capture the whole gamut of business in GP. Following were the modules to be developed, as proposed, in the software:
 - o Annual Action Plan
 - Scheme Monitoring
 - Gram Panchayat Accounting System
 - Village Information Bank
 - Below Poverty Line Family Information
 - Public Utilities Module
 - o Strengthening the resource mobilization
 - Asset Management
- Sub Project IB Decentralized Information Management Through GIS for integrated governance: The functional scope of the project would be:
 - Information regarding a range of indicators could be easily available and regularly updated for interventions pertaining to a number of areas such as agriculture,

livelihood, natural resources, education, health, nutrition etc.

- The GPs would be acting as the nodal agencies for disaggregated information, based on which the blocks can plan and execute focused intervention in identified areas.
- Updated and easily navigable maps incorporated with recent information regarding public service delivery institutions would make both planning and monitoring easy at every possible level.
- SUB-PROJECT II Integrated Fund Monitoring And Accounting System (for Panchayat Samities): The state government introduced Computerized Financial Management System at Howrah Zilla Parishad and in 14 Panchayat Samities of the district as the pilot with the financial support of the Ministry of Information Technology, GOI. The Computer Maintenance Corporation Ltd. has developed the software for this purpose under the aegis of WEBEL and NIC West Bengal State Unit extended necessary technical support. The new system was found to be very much useful to the Zilla Parishad and the Panchayat Samities of the District since it has integrated various functional components including Accounting component and fund monitoring system. Not only that, this department was also reaping the benefit from the new system since all the latest financial monitoring parameters are being readily available. Now it is being strongly felt that if the model can be replicated to other districts and the Panchavat Samities of the state the efficiency can be enhanced to a considerable extent. Along with monitoring of implementation of all the Poverty alleviation programmes the current project proposes to develop suitable modules so as to capture all the data of

implementation of various poverty alleviation and rural development schemes right from formulation of the Annual Action Plan, formulation of projects, procure of materials, wage payment administration and to integrate the whole process with the accounting system .The IT solution would be able to meet the following objectives:

- Formulate Annual Action Plan.
- Capture all stages of purchase and procurement management.
- Inventory control of stocks and stores.
- Food grains management for different rural works programmes.
- Annual Budget and comparison expenditure with budgeted figure.
- Payment procedure.
- Generation of utilization Certificate.
- Generating MIS for management and control of the entire poverty alleviation programme.
- This component will be implemented at 20 selected Panchayat samities of Burdwan district.
- SUB-PROJECT III Government to Citizen: This project would focus on establishing strong machinery to foster social audit, transparency and responsibility of the government to the civil society. The steps suggested for implementation of the project are:
 - Step-I: Through application of the IFMS and GPMS software day-to-day financial and physical progress of the various activities of three tiers of the PRIs will be generated and through a dial up network the incremental data will be deposited in the State Server.
 - Step-II: The data such gathered will be analyzed and will be tabulated and presented in standardized formats to convey most meaningful information to the citizen



and the civil society. Such information will then be made available to all the stakeholders through the website of the department.

 Step-III: All the notifications, circulars, guidelines issued by the department and case studies on best practices related to PRIs, SHG, Watershed Development, Sanitation, Public Health, Alternative Primary Education will be categorized and will be made available through the department's website.

Communication & Publicity Strategy

The details of the projects, its objectives, expected outcomes publicized through the departmental web site. The progress of the DRISTI project has also been depicted with special emphasis on the GIS component through the web-site <u>www.trendsbengal.org</u>. Some of the features of GIS based initiative was also available in the web-site of the Panchayats and Rural Development of West Bengal (<u>www.wbprd.nic.in</u>). Sensitization workshop organized at Burdwan district with a cross section of stakeholders.

3.5.2 Project Strategic Objectives

With the growth in the scope and span of functioning of the PRIs it is felt that the technique of function of the PRIs should be changed to modern direction to deliver better services to its stakeholders. The 'citizen as the shareholder' can now demand several information on the functioning of a government and also may provide several inputs to the government's policy-making process, while the 'citizen as a customer' can demand better services from local governments.

It was felt that the traditional system for management and flow of data are not at all sufficient for the MIS activities of the Panchayat bodies. In this perspective the Department of Panchayat and Rural Development defined that IT has a major role to play in strengthening the Information Management system at PRIs for its efficient functioning.

Major objectives of the projects, as identified, are:

Stakeholder	Role(s) Played
Gram Panchayat	Being the lowest tier of the PRI system, undertook the responsibility of implementing the systems and reaching out to the citizens with relevant services.
Zilla Parishad, Panchayat Samities and Members	strengthen their service delivery mechanism, taking care of the issues of the rural people
General People in the Rural Areas	Reap the benefit of information as a matter of their right in the pursuit of democratic functioning of the PRIs. Enquiring information regarding various works and services such as getting benefit from the poverty alleviation programmes, getting social security schemes such NSAP, PROFLAL etc.
Riddhi Management Services	Helped in GIS and capacity building.
State Institute of Panchayats and Rural Development	Was responsible for capacity building of major stakeholders. Also took the responsibility for conducting the research work for need analysis and categorization of orders and circulars for making a web-enabled module.
NIC Kolkata	Was responsible for converting the GPMS software in regional language. They also took the responsibility for creating the web-enabled interface for the G2C component of the project.



- Better efficiency in managing various programmers and delivery systems,
- Providing decentralized information management through GIS at Block and Gram Panchayats.
- Creating a better monitoring and compliance machinery,
- Promoting social audit.

3.5.3 Project Relevance Inputs

Identification of Information and Services Needs

Information and services needs were identified through the following techniques:

- Participatory Members of Panchayat;
- Focus Group Discussions;
- Base line survey;
- Formal Meeting in Self Help Groups and Federations;
- Trainings and Workshops;
- Field Visit Questionnaire.
- The major information needs identified were the following
- Development programmes and schemes of the Government;
- Details for operation and maintenance of Micro Finance; and
- Accounting Data
- RHS database

The Major services needs identified were the following

- Self-Directed Learning for livelihood enhancement and legal empowerment
- Women Conciliation Centre for legal service to rural illiterate women
- ICLIS -web service to know about the development schemes
- Facilitation of Horizontal Transfer of Knowledge

3.5.4 Project Effectiveness Inputs

Project Stakeholders and Envisaged Roles

Table 27 brings out the different stakeholders involved and the respective roles they played.

Risks and Mitigation Strategies

- Challenge on adding more value addition to keep present state of enthusiasm - In house team had taken up the task of updating the software and e-government cell was proposed to be set up in the department of Panchayats and rural development.
- Problem of incorporating more citizen centric services GPMS utilities may be outsourced to the CSC and state government decided to construct the CSCs inside the Gram Panchayat office campus.
- Increasing demand for geographical scope A no cost extension of the project helped to cover all gram Panchayat at Burdwan district and rest of the district had been covered in the BRF or forthcoming World Bank Assisted Programme.
- ICT services with Government: Many of the online services with the government did not materialized as the latter was not in a position to receive the petitions and applications online. Since the government departments have not been fully computerized an appeal has been given to the government authorities by VIDIVELLI Federation for immediate attention and action.
- All level data needs to be incorporated to make a proper bottom up people's plan: Introducing a separate project for this.
- Trade off between faster replication and providing quality handling -Efforts are being made to institutionalize the initiative and post of block officer has been created at all Panchayat Samities level, who have been assigned with the work of providing handholding support.





3.5.5 Project Efficiency Inputs

Activities Performed in different Dimensions of Intervention:

Table 28 summarises the main activities being performed in the different themes of intervention.

Theme	Activities
Bridging the Digital Divide	Providing required computer and other computer related hardware devices to selected Gram Panchayats and Panchayat Samitis. In addition to this BPR was conducted for improving the functioning at rural level. Necessary capacity building measure were undertaken involving the officials and elected members of the PRIs
Citizen-Centric Service Delivery	Implementation of software application for generation of Birth, Death and Trade Certificate by the Gram Panchayats and making suitable BPR including changing rules and procedures for improve in service Delivery. A very comprehensive database of Rural Households was created for making SMART decision for selection of Social Assistance Programmes.
Public Private Partnership	Private partners have been entrusted with work of Capacity Building and supporting for making GIS Based tools for monitoring.
Capacity Building	DRISTI has significant contribution towards capacity building in the areas where the project was implemented. The Capacity Building measures included formal class room training both for use of normal computing tools and also for customized software. Capacity building initiatives out of the project have covered all major stakeholders. In addition, Manuals were created for use of ICT for Development.
Change Management	 Following are the initiatives which were undertaken for managing the change for implementation of the project Awareness building through Computer Based Training at State, district, Panchayat Samiti and Gram Panchayats. Identification of proactive persons at all the levels for extensive trainings and eventual motivation of other potential actors in the organization. Continuous in-house and off-campus reorientation trainings. Extensive handholding facilities at all the levels by frontline officials, trainers, and facilitators and also by some outsourced expert organizations in the field of change management. Web based information channels for to and fro feedbacks. E-mailing facilities for instant problem solution by the State/ district or the peer groups at Panchayat Samiti and gram Panchayats. Regular visits to the locations by the District/ state officials and trainers. Workshops/ interactions for continuous development and identification of problems being faced by the stakeholders at different locations. Promoting Extensive utilization of the Grievance Box in the website/ e -mailing for ventilating citizen's grievances from the end users.
Business Process	Business Process re-engineering has been conducted in form of Change of Rules, Change in Audit Procedure, and
Reengineering	System of Reporting (from manual to electronic after implementation of IT system).



Theme	Activities
Knowledge/Experience Sharing	Knowledge on the system, users experience, lessons learnt etc were shared with other interested parties (within or outside the pilot implementation area) through workshops, personal contact informal discussion, Group Meeting and Exposure Visits etc. Knowledge has also been shared with interested States regarding the use of system based accounting and other
	management of the GP functions.

Table 28 Theme-Based Activities (DRISTI)

Project Management Approach

Sub-Project-IA and Sub-Project-II was implemented through the following methodology:

A fully dedicated cell for IT intervention in the Panchayat and Rural Development was in charge of implementation the project. Structure of organization has been depicted in sec. 8.1 of the DPR. The detail of the team members is narrated in section 10.2 of the DPR. Besides, there are a host of functionaries at District, Panchayat Samiti and Gram Panchayat level to implement the project.

Development and customization of the software was taken up at state Head Quarters with the help of the team-members and in consultation with State Unit of the NIC. As may require from time to time, consultation had been taken from established firms and individual consultants, particularly for establishing communication network.

The implementation cell customized the database for each location on the basis of the additional information received from the respective location. The software and the database was installed at various locations by the programme support team of the Cell.

After installation of the software, the end users had been given a five-day training on use of computer and use of the application software. The training includes the process of taking back-ups,

maintaining records in the changed environment etc. The training was conducted at State Institute of Panchayats and Rural Development.

The end users then were kept under trial run for the use of the software for one month. During this period the end users had been asked to use the software for working with the real life situation. But they were kept under constant monitoring by a trained local entrepreneur who deals with data entry in the vicinity.

There was a **help line** at State Headquarter where the end-users may report their difficulty either over phone or by e-mail.

Sub-Project-IB was implemented in collaboration with Riddhi Management Services. The BDO, Panchayat Samiti members have been given training on basic computer and sensitization workshops have been organized on Decentralized Information Management. Then they have been provided with the WhizMap of their respective area populated with information of Census 2001 and have been asked to mark the public service institutions. They will also collect data on social sector with active support of the elected members of the PRIs. They will keep on updating the information on a regular basis. The database have been populated with these data. A Block Resource Person have been provided at each block to extend technical support.





In the second Phase, the mouza maps was collected and was scanned and partially vectorised. Then the mouza maps was stitched to form GP maps. Riddhi Management Services was then incorporated updated information on the delivery institutions, roads, railways, para boundaries, and natural boundaries.

Training was provided to the elected PRI members to use the information generated from the GIS based village information bank in micro-level planning and implementation of poverty alleviation programme.

Management Processes Followed during the Project

Following were the project management practices followed for the project:

- Preparation of workplan;
- Preparation of activity schedules for staff;
- Stakeholders meetings;
- Preparation of RBM based LFA;
- Time schedules for various project activities;
- Allocation of human resources;
- Implementation at the field level;
- Monitoring and reporting through the software application;
- Preparation of quarterly report;
- Preparation of training plan; and
- Follow ups.

Extent of Usage of Local Expertise

The usage of local expertise was substantially high. The technology team is housed within the department and any issued faced in the software application is dealt accordingly with the helping hand of NIC in certain cases. Locally available human resources as well as infrastructural resources were mostly used though there were limited procurement in Panchayats and Panchayats Samities. All the software applications were developed with English interface, but there is existence of a Bengali version of the GPMS but is not in use due to technical reasons. Moreover, certain terminology used are accounting and financial related which will be difficult for the user to use in local language, but the outputs from the applications like financial and accounting statements can be made in local language as this can be used for social audit and generally by the rural citizens.

Extent of Usage of RBM and Performance Indicators

Initially, M&E was kept with the help of MS Projects. In advanced stages RBM was introduced and followed as per the guidelines. This helped in preparing realistic work plan with appropriate activities and timeline.

3.5.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated

The project generated the following results and impacts:

- All the Zilla Parishads, 99% of the Panchayat Samitis and about half of the Gram Panchayats throughout the State have been covered under DRISTI output.
- Improved accounting system for PRIs after implementation of IFMS and GPMS
- Improved G2C sevices with installation of Utility part of GPMS software. Citizen centric services such as Birth/ Death registration, trade registration, the time taken was 7 days or beyond, the duration has been reduced to 1 day.
- Improved G2G communications; some of the steps undertaken towards this are - categorization and data entry of orders, circulars, guidelines and case studies on best practices for dissemination, generation of reports for public interest and dissemination through website, installation of communication software at various locations.
- GIS based maps developed for 103 Gram Panchayats on PPP mode

- Improved monitoring of PRI implemented schemes by supporting capturing and updation of the action plans being implemented by PRI
- More systematic approach for MIS has been developed which can be proved to be effective for promoting transparency and accountability.
- Capacity building of 90 % of the functionaries in the targeted location has been completed.

Factors impeding the production of outputs

During the implementation of the project there were some issues faced which are mostly related to change management. The stakeholders who were habituated in maintenance of records on ad-hoc basis without any focus systematic procedure where change reluctant and had not been willing to switch over to the changed procedure. In absence of complete reengineering of the business procedure, the complete benefit from the project could not be achieved.

At the time of replication of the software emphasis should be given on capacity building. The capacity building exercise was more effective where group-learning environment had been created. Gaps in business process re-engineering should be bridged before the replication in full swing is taken up

Extent of Operationalisation of the project recommendations

PRIs had little exposure to the digital advancement. The initiative has made the PRIs exposed to use of ICT for crucial activities. After implementation of the project, the performance of the ZP and PS evaluated directly from the outputs generated from IFMS and GPMS- two important products of DRISTI. Based on the performance of implementation of these two software, all the district were ranked and the result was published.

There were some policy level interventions during implementation of the project. Rules were changed to make the software generated outputs as acceptable to the audit. Recent study by World Bank on fiduciary risks of the PRIs took the progress of implementation of the software as an indicator of good accounts keeping and therefore as an indicator for lesser fiduciary risk.

There was existence of formal user groups for the services. Feedback of the users and other stakeholders were received through the various mechanisms including a separate mail id for support services. Based on the feedback WBSRDA also undertaken various actions, for example the whole institutionalisation process were carried out based on the feedback received from the users at various tiers, and also IFMS applications was development to the current levels with active user feedback.

3.5.7 Project Sustainability Considerations

The project focuses on institutional sustainability. Panchayat and Rural Development Department was implementing the project through West Bengal State Rural Development Society (WBSRDA), an organisation created to provide the necessary services to the department and to simplify implementation processes. The unit within WBSRDA managed the DRISTI project and was functioning independently for implementation of the project.

As the project envisaged strengthening of decentralization process, the better functioning of the PRIs, particularly in their endeavour to mobilize more revenue taping the local resource would enhance the local resource base, which in turn would fund the initiative to be sustainable in future. The project envisaged creation of in-built mechanism for sustainability so that a self-sustained unit of selfgovernance could be operationally efficient and fuel the





requirements of the components of the current project after phasing out by the proponent agency.

There were no charges for availing the services across all tiers, but P&RD through WBSRDA is contemplating at building processes within the system (Panchayat Raj) to support the costs of maintaining the services in future.

The project maintained project documentation in standard formats in terms of architecture and design related documents. This includes data flow Diagram for GPMS and IFMS; ER Diagram for GPMS and IFMS and source code documentation. For GPMS the user manual is in Bengali and has been proven to be helpful. The services offered under DRISTI have also taken up for replication by P&RD to other gram panchayats, panchayat samitis and zillas across West Bengal. The State Government is funding the roll out of the project to the entire state from its budgetary resources.

EVALUATING THE PROJECT

The project has been evaluated on five parameters viz. Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Results/Impacts and Sustainability which were further affirmed by subparameters illustrated in Table 29 that exhibits the evaluation in six categories of Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Moderately Satisfactory, Moderately Unsatisfactory, Unsatisfactory And Highly Unsatisfactory, accounting respectively for 6,5,4,3,2 and 1 points. The right most column substantiates the scores. The rating for each of the parameters was arrived at after averaging on the ratings for each of the subparameters. Similarly the overall evaluation rating were arrived at after averaging on the parameter ratings.



Figure 21 Evaluating the Project- DRISTI

Figure 22 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE NEXT STEPS

CREATION OF COMMON PLATFORM FOR THE SOFTWARE & DATABASES USED IN PANCHAYAT SAMITI:

There multiple software and databases are used at Panchayat Samiti level. To bring more user friendliness it is recommended to have a common platform for all the software and databases are in use. These would facilitate the user friendliness among the end users.

ISSUANCE OF FINAL CERTIFICATE/LETTER BY USING WATERMARK, LOGO, SYSTEM LOG ETC. FROM GPMS SYSTEM:

The look and feel of the final certificate/letter issued from the GPMS system should be improved so as to look like the original certificate like the one issued manually. Some of the ways this may be done could be by using watermark, coloured logo, system log etc.

DEVELOP IFMS SOFTWARE WEB BASED

Currently the IFMS software which is being used by Panchayat Samitis and Gram Panchayats are stand alone softwares implemented locally at each of the workstations. Considering the long term perspective and usage of the project, It is recommended to re-develop the same with web based application. This would facilitate maintaining the same version of the software with ease, reporting mechanism....

USAGE OF FTP FILE TRANSFER FOR FILE SHARING

In most of the cases, reports and any other documents etc. are being shared with Panchayat Samitis and Department with the help of physical submission of CDs. Since these results into loss of efforts and incovinience for the Panchayats / Panchayat Samitis, it is recommended to implement the mechanism of FTP file transfer to share the reports or any other documents.

SUSTAINABLE BUSINESS MODEL

The project is being implemented completely by the funding of Government/external agencies. Looking at the long term sustainability of the project and for rolling out across the state, it is important to work out a mechanism for self sustenance of the project. There may be some charges imposed to the users for availing the services; other than this department may look into other revenue generation schemes such as advertisements, services to the private players, PPP etc.

QUERY BASED CITIZEN INTERFACE TO CHECK SCHEME APPLICABILITY

Since the database on household is already created by the Department, there may be an interface developed for the citizen where in any person can give there own query. Based on this query system should generate result on what all government schemes would be applicable to him. In addition a guideline to apply for the respective schemes may be given online.

ONLINE WORK REGISTER IN GPMS

Though the GPMS software provides the financial status of the various government schemes / projects, it doesn't provide the physical progress/status of the projects/scheme. For this purpose, it is recommended the work register should be made online.

STANDARDISATION OF FIELDS THROUGH MASTER LIST

There are many fields / data fields which are being standardised through the master list. However, there are still some of the fields left open to user which is leading to different field name at different panchayats. Looking at the long term usability of the application, all these fields should be standardised so that in case of requirement of generation of any consolidated report, it may be done easily.





3.5.8 Project Evaluation Matrix

Table 29 Evaluation of the Project- DRISTI

Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks		
	RELEVANCE								
Needs of the beneficiary captured							 All beneficiaries were identified Requirements of the beneficiaries were captured and needs of beneficiaries were analyzed 		
Relevant to needs & expectations of beneficiary							 Segmentation is loosely done however no formal procedure of segmentation seems to be carried out Offerings are tailored for these loosely designed done 		
Relevant to development priorities of Govt. of India							• DRISTI Project strongly aligned with currently operational developmental program of Govt. of India		
Relevant to development priorities of concerned State Government							 Project strongly aligned with currently operational developmental program of West Bengal State Govt. 		
Identified problem has high incidence in area of focus							 Frequent and continuous incidences reported in the area Substantial number of individuals of the targeted vulnerable group are affected Similar problem affecting vulnerable groups in other parts of the state/country 		
Correct & accurate identification of target stakeholders and/or correctly defined vulnerable groups							 Stakeholders properly segmented including the vulnerable segments and all individuals associated with segments 		
Adequacy of Government commitment to project		•					 Government has played an important role for the success of this initiative. Panchayat and Rural Development Department, Govt. of West Bengal is the implementing agency of the project. Project has received all support from relevant government agencies in the form of technical expertise, information sharing, publicity, training and awareness generation programs Govt. made provision of financial assistance for roll out of the project throughout the state. 		



Evaluation matrix	Нібні Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks	
Project relevance to ICT4D focus under the project							• DRISTI demonstrated how ICT play a vital role in decentralization process and strengthen local government, also support the state in providing effective and timely support to the various tiers in government.	
	EFFECTIVENESS							
Problem been stated correctly and distinctly							 Problems identified, defined and documented Validation of identified problems by the representative of few stakeholders 	
Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries, users of the project are identified as stakeholders of the project							• Beneficiaries, users and operational partners identified as stakeholders	
The assumptions, objectives, outputs and outcomes have been clearly articulated in measurable terms							 Objectives, outputs and outcomes vaguely identified. Certain assumptions articulated Subjective measurement terms in use 	
The linkages between objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was clear							• Logical linkages present but not documented	
The project design allowed for flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment.							• Project design capable of modifying but only for certain not critical and small changes in the environment. May not be able to adopt for bigger changes.	
Degree of support given by the Government towards integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme and other related projects							• Project strongly aligned with national programme and Govt. has made provision to fund the project for its roll out across the state.	
Planning component of the project take into account the use of ICT for improved governance / service delivery in various areas through pilot initiatives, encouraging BPR, development local solutions and applications and encouragement of PPP model			•				 Use of ICT for improved governance/ service through: Localization of solution: Certain degree of localization planned such as use of local language for preparing the user manual. BPR: Recognizing the computerized accounting system as a substitute of manual system and accepting the output of the software as the legal document. Creating posts of District Information Analyst, Block Informatics Officer. 	





Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	SATISFACTORY	Moderately Satisfactory	MODERATELY UNSATISFACTORY	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
The adequacy of institutional arrangements in attaining the long-term objective of the project. Also the infrastructural, logistical, and financial implication of sustaining the project objectives beyond the project duration/after completion of UNDP funding.				1			 A few institutional agencies / bodies' set-up for attaining long-term goals, roles and responsibilities defined only for few of the identified stakeholders and management processes are not clearly laid out. Adequate financial arrangements in place for sustaining project
Project's linkages, liaison, coordination and impact upon related activities under NeGP being implemented in the country.							 Loosely aligned to NeGP and its components such as National and State MMPs and partially utilizes the infrastructure components (State Data Centers, SWAN and CSCs) No contribution towards achievement of NeGP's objectives
The project's assistance, relationship, relevance to and coordination with the pre- existing Project management system and staff							• Uses both the pre-existing management system as well as staff effectively but does not contribute towards pre-existing cause.
Clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various institutional arrangements for overall programme management and implementation and the level of coordination between relevant players		•					 All institutional arrangements / stakeholders were considered Roles and responsibilities of all of the identified stakeholders were identified Management processes clearly laid down for proper coordination between the players Flexibility to incorporate more stakeholders / institutional arrangement does not exist
Risk assessment and management of the project							 Few of the potential risks noted down Mitigation strategies for identified risk laid down The risk management and mitigation plan was partially adhered
Efforts of stakeholders in support of the implementation of the project							 The project proposal submitted to UNDP was documented in coordination with most of the stakeholders with partial buy-in of certain stakeholders e.g. state department of IT Though there were initial glitches, most of the stakeholders have extended support as envisaged from them during proposal stage.
Extent of conflict of interest either between stakeholders involved in the project or with outside agencies.							 Partial conflict of interest among the stakeholders of this project and conflict resolution process initiated prior to implementation of the project



Evaluation matrix	Нібні Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
				EFFIC	IENCY		
Was a formal workplan made at the start of the project to determine the timeframe in which activities would be performed							 Work-plan prepared for most of the important activities Month wise timelines defined for activities
Were resources made available to the project implementation agencies in accordance with the requirements of the workplan							 Resources provided to the project in accordance with new requirements / change in project environment. There was no significant resource change / replacement observed.
Extent of deviation in the project implementation in so far as timelines is concerned.							• There were little delay in Project implementation compared to the overall project duration
Responsiveness of the project management to such deviations and flexibility to deploy resources							• Management taking some steps in terms of extra resources (time and effort) to somehow correct the course of implementation
Were any systems, processes, manuals etc made to govern the activities in the project among the different stakeholders							 Software application such as GPMS and IFMS was developed. Written governing manual available both in English and Bengali The instructions are followed by the stakeholders
Extent to which Results Based Management has been used							 During the initial phase of the project RBM was not in use. Subsequently, RBM being used as an important tool for making management decisions
Whether there was adequacy of steps taken to resolve any conflict of interest in or due to the project							• Conflict resolution process initiated during implementation stage of the project
			RI	ESULTS	/IMPAC	TS	
Whether the project has produced its desired immediate outputs							• The project has achieved significant (More than 75%) of immediate outputs including all the major outputs.
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, use of the new outputs as against the traditional options)							• Most of the intended beneficiaries utilized the project output in more than 50% cases where they needed similar service





Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	MODERATELY UNSATISFACTORY	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, percentage of the target population)							 Because of reluctance of the targeted beneficiaries, less than targeted beneficiaries utilized the DRISTI services. However, the awareness among the beneficiaries is increasing with the continued success of the project.
Extent of drop-outs from usage of the outputs by the intended beneficiaries							 Marginal (Less than 25%) drop-out from usage of outputs by the intended beneficiaries
Are there any unforeseen/ unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups							 Major unintended effects caused by the project on target groups Very few unforeseen negative effects caused which impede the existing developmental efforts in the state/region
Extent of the project results on the target beneficiaries in terms of (a) Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, (b) Capacity Building, (c) Change Management, (d) Business Process Re- engineering, (f) Public Private Partnership, (g) Bridging the Digital Divide, and (h) Knowledge and Experience Sharing							• Of all the areas relevant to the project, excellence has been achieved in significant number (75% to 90%) of the cases
Extent of the project impact on the target groups in terms of (a) governance (improved efficiency, transparency and accountability), (b) citizen-centric service delivery (advantages of cost, time and convenience), (c) rural livelihoods (number of jobs, extent and sufficiency of employment), and (d) women's empowerment (increased knowledge, and use of the same to voice their concerns).							• Of all the areas relevant to the project, excellence has been achieved in significant number (75% to 90%) of the cases
Extent of significance of the project impact on the development of the region/country							 Indicators for development were defined during project conceptualization stage Indicators as defined were completely achieved Seeing the impact of the DRISTI project, the government of West Bengal has proposed to replicate the project across the state, which clearly shows the kind of success the project had on the development of local communities.
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by marginalized communities							 Most of the marginalized communities have used the project output in more than 75% cases and in 25% or less cases used traditional options



PROJE	CT-WISE	FINDINGS
-------	---------	----------

Evaluation matrix	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent to which capacities have been built in stakeholders during the project							 Capacities of all stakeholders build up to perform activities assigned to / expected of them.
			ç	SUSTAIN	IABILIT	Ϋ́	
Extent of ownership of stakeholders in the project							 Complete ownership of all the 'implementing and operating' stakeholders in the project i.e. the agencies across all tier of the Panchayat bodies
Degree of support given by the Government in integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme							• Aligned to Government's national development programme. State Government is funding the project for rolling out across the state.
Extent of availability of inputs/resources required for the project (people, finances, infrastructure, equipments)							 Resources in all the four area - people, finances, infrastructure, equipments were completely available during the part duration of the project
Have any revenue streams been defined in the project to make it self-sustaining							• No defined revenue steam observed.
Extent of success of such pre-defined revenue streams							No defined revenue steam
Extent to which inventory of the assets created out of the grants received in the project have been properly maintained and transferred to the beneficiaries							• Assets received under the project such as servers, PCs, application software, created user manuals etc. have been maintained well.
Degree of collaboration that has developed among stakeholders during the project							 Stakeholder management plan is well defined during conceptualization stage and have significant adherence during project execution. Stakeholders were occasionally involved during operational and strategic decision making.
Extent to which government is willing to finance the project after its completion of the UNDP funding							• Government of West Bengal already initiated the process of funding the roll out of the project across the state.





3.6 E-Procurement

	Table 30 Introduction- e-Procurement	
Project Title	Unified end-to-end e-Procurement Project	
Proponent Organisation	Centre for e-Government (CeG)	
Implementation State	Karnataka	1
Target Site for Pilot Project	State of Karnataka	
Theme of Project	Governance	E.m.
Target Population	All major Government departments of State of Karnataka	1
Funding Required for Project	Rs. 122 Lakh (From UNDP)	
Time Required to Implement Project	73 weeks	
Name(s) of Partner Agencies	Department of e-Governance (GoK)	



IMPACT OF THE PROJECT IN BRIEF

The unified end-to-end e-procurement system is one of its kind in the country with automation of entire procurement activities. This complete automation resulted in tremendous increase in transparency and speed of operations across all the government departments where it has been implemented.

OBJECTIVE AREAS	OUTPUTS	OUTCOMES
Improving transparency, efficiency and effectiveness in the public procurement	 Implementation and operation of e-Procurement system with: 3500 registered suppliers / contractors 1700 government users 2400 tenders worth Rs. 7000 crore handled 38 government departments / agencies Information accessibility to concerned officers, bidders and all citizens 	 Reduction of turn-around-time in tender processing and time for generation of customised MIS report Better decision support system Facilitated user-departments to obtain low bid values - savings to the extent of 10% as compared to the bid values obtained through manual processes Increased transparency
Provision of a unified platform for conducting all procurement related activities	 Unified end-to-end e-Procurement system: Catering to complete procurement cycle starting from intending to contract management Involving all types of Government procurement i.e. goods, works and services 	• Uniform procurement system, with provision of customization, for all Government departments and agencies
Creation of infrastructure for effective implementation of procurement policy of the State	 Access of information on procurement and status to all concerned i.e. government officers, bidders and citizens 2600 government officials and 900 suppliers trained on the usage of e-Procurement portal Required amendments in Karnataka Transparency in Public Procurement Act carried out 	 Clear picture to Government regarding its procurement activities in real-time Significant reduction in vendor cartelization Fare and fearless participation of vendors possible Reduction in corruption during procurement through transparency and information accessibility to all concerned (including bidders and citizens)



3.6.1 Project Background

e-Procurement - The Concept

The State Government of Karnataka (GoK) has taken the initiative to implement a unified e-Procurement system, which will be used as a shared infrastructure by all procurement entities (i.e. government departments, city and town Municipality Corporations, Societies and Companies under control of the State Government) in the State. The system has been designed to handle all procurement related processes required for procurement of goods, works and services entirely electronically in a fully integrated manner. Further, a single instance of the application will be configured to handle delegation of powers and workflow requirements of about 100 different procurement entities in the State. Such extensibility and flexibility of the software is an essential requirement if meaningful MIS reports have to be generated at the State level. This project is being implemented in a Private-Public-Partnership (PPP) mode, wherein the private partner is Hewlett Packard India Sales Private Limited.

The end-to-end e-Procurement system under implementation in GoK is conceptually divided into the following 5 key modules: i) Indent Management ii) e-Tendering iii) e-Auction iv) Contract Management and v) Catalogue Management

As per amendments made to the Karnataka Transparency in Public Procurement (KTPP) Act, the project Steering Committee headed by the Additional Chief Secretary of the State notified Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (a Society in GoK) to handle all its procurement valued Rs. 50 lakhs (about 125,000 USD) and above from the 13th of November 2007 using the unified e-Procurement system only.

Key Drivers

The key drivers for envisioning a unified end-to-end e-Procurement system are as follows:

- Development of infrastructure required for effective procurement policy implementation;
- Enhanced transparency in government procurement;
- Ease of access for contractor community;
- Availability of advanced procurement software to big, medium and small procurement entities alike; and
- Software to handle entire end-to-end procurement processes and not just tendering.

Key Issues

A single unified end-to-end e-Procurement system was not available in the State of Karnataka. However, some of the Government Departments / Agencies were using the e-Tendering solution to automate their tendering activities which starts from the stage of tender publishing and ends at the stage of tender opening. As the e-Tendering system translated the prevailing tendering processes into an automated mode without transforming the processes, the intended benefits could not be achieved. It was at that time that the system of unified end-to-end e-Procurement project was conceptualised in order to automate the entire procurement cycle starting from estimate / indent creation till the payment to the contractor / supplier.

3.6.2 Project Strategic Objectives

The project identified following specific objectives for the eprocurement project:

- To create transparency, efficiency and effectiveness in the public procurement;
- To provide a unified platform to conduct all procurement related activities;





- To create infrastructure for effective implementation of procurement policy of the State;
- To build capacities in government and supplier community;
- To provide common environment for all types of tenders;
- To handle entire procurement process online; and
- To involve less paper, thereby, adopting green working.

3.6.3 Project Relevance Inputs

Identification of Information and Services Needs

The information and services requirements of suppliers / contractors are identified through personal interactions during training sessions / e-Procurement seminars and workshops / helpdesk conversations. The government officials formally submit their requirements, which are subsequently discussed at Functional Requirement Specification (FRS) Committee / Project Monitoring Committee (PMC) / Steering Committee.

3.6.4 Project Effectiveness Inputs

Project Stakeholders and Envisaged Roles

The stakeholders involved in the project are as follows.

• Government Departments / Agencies (within Karnataka and Outside Karnataka)

- Suppliers / Contractors
- Citizens
- Banks
- Funding Agencies

Table 32 brings out the different stakeholders involved and the respective roles they played.

Risks and Mitigation Strategies

The identified risks had been dependence on Banks for timely upload of payment records to facilitate timely reconciliation of tender payments and customization requests from userdepartments. Also, the use of digital encryption card as a separate device for decryption of encrypted commercial bids is risky as there is likely possibility of a government official misplacing / losing the encryption card, in which case the tender needs to be cancelled and re-tendered.

3.6.5 Project Efficiency Inputs

Activities Performed in different Dimensions of Intervention:

Table 33 summarises the main activities being performed in the different themes of intervention.

	Table 32 Role played by validus stakenoidel
Stakeholder	Role(s) Played
Government departments/ agencies	Use the e-Procurement platform and suggest changes in the software application and other process
	related changes
Suppliers / Contractors	Submission of bids during tendering and submission of invoices / bills for payment
Citizens	Access information on various procurement activities undertaken the government
Banks	Online collection and reconciliation of tender payments
Funding Agencies	Fund the e-Procurement project in establishing the requisite infrastructure and work environment



Theme	Activities
Bridging the Digital Divide	The use of internet by suppliers / contractors all across the State of Karnataka has bridged the digital divide
Citizen-Centric Service	
Delivery	The project is G2B project and delivers supplier / contractor centric services
Public Private Partnership	The project is implemented on Public Private Partnership model wherein the revenue to the Private Partner is transaction-based.
Capacity Building	Training programmes are conducted on day-to-day basis for government officials and suppliers / contractors. Also, e- Procurement workshops / seminars are regularly organized to spread awareness and first-hand-knowledge on e- Procurement system.
Change Management	The project was instrumental in changing the attitude and mindset of government officials which has resulted in encouraged use of ICTs in government working.
Business Process Re- engineering	Some of the government procurement processes had been reengineered. For example, centralized supplier registration, centralized online tender payments, online workflows involving movement of files / documents to the concerned official and online EMD refunds credited directly into the account of supplier / contractor.
Knowledge/Experience Sharing	Series of e-Procurement workshops / seminars are organized to share knowledge and some learning gained through experience.

Table 33 Theme-based Activity List for eProcurement

Project Management Approach

The roll-out phase had been delineated into separate module-week schedule depicting the time lines for deployment of various modules in several government departments / agencies. A Gantt chart was prepared to display the likely time required to deploy various modules in user-departments. The first tender was published in the end of 2007 and within two-and-a-half years, the State of Karnataka has seen more than 50 government departments / agencies adopting the e-Procurement platform.

Extent of Usage of Local Expertise

Most of the outsourced skilled resources are local with equal gender ratio. The e-Procurement platform is developed on open source technologies using MySql database, JBPM and JBOSS. The e-Procurement portal pages can be opened in all browsers. However, the signing buttons are enabled only in Internet Explorer ver 6.0 and above.

Management Processes Followed during the Project

The implementation of the project involves project management processes are macro level and micro level. The macro level project management processes include phasing of the project (pilot and roll-out), drawing work-breakdown structure, preparing Gant Chart for sequencing the operations and designing SLAs for monitoring the implementation and subsequent maintenance of the project. The micro level project management processes include userdepartment studies, preparation of e-Procurement mapping document (organization chart, delegation of powers, workflows), processing digital signature certificates, payment reconciliation





schedules, EMD refund schedules and assign benchmarks to monitor internal performance.

Extent of Usage of RBM and Performance Indicators

The performance indicators in the form of module deployment timelines and problem resolving time, server uptime, growth rate of transactions etc. are a part of detailed Service Level Agreement (SLA). The SLA metrics have been categorized into module deployment SLAs and Operational SLAs. The project team is of the view that the RBM applies to operational SLAs and would be more effective after deployment of all modules in all government departments / agencies.

3.6.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated

Results/ impacts generated through e-Procurement

The Unified end-to-end e-Procurement system of Karnataka presently has over 3500 suppliers / contractors registered (including 10 international bidders) and over 1700 government users created having handled over 2400 tenders worth Rs. 7000 crore in 38 government departments / agencies. More than 2600 government officials and 900 suppliers have been trained on the usage of e-Procurement portal. The project resulted in reduction of turn-around-time in tender processing; creating a competitive bidding environment, reduction in bid value, reduction in time to generate customised MIS report and facilitated better decision support system.

Significance of the Results for the country or state

The e-Procurement project has facilitated the user-departments to obtain low bid values and save to the extent of 10% as compared to the bid values obtained through manual processes. As the procurement expenditure of Karnataka is to the tune of approximately Rs. 30000 crore, a saving of 10% translates to a saving of Rs. 3000 crore. The saving can be effectively used in other growth and development activities, thereby, providing more benefits to the citizens. Also, with reduced tender processing times and faster payments to suppliers / contractor, the project execution time reduces, thereby, producing faster project results.

Factors Facilitating/Impeding the Production of Outputs

Factors facilitating the production of outputs are:

- The provision of IT infrastructure (desktop computers, UPS, Multi-Functional Devices and broadband internet connections) to the user-departments on gap-filling approach helped in production of project outputs as it was felt very important for remote offices located across the State of Karnataka to be equipped with requisite IT infrastructure;
- Timely amendment in relevant act (Karnataka Transparency in Public Procurement Act) by the State Government; and
- Establishment of two training facilities at Bangalore and Dharwad ensured active participation as they catered to the southern part and northern part of Karnataka respectively.

Extent of Operationalisation of the project recommendations

The extent of operationalization of the project recommendations are illustrated below:

- The project conforms to the various functional requirement specifications (various core modules and supporting modules) and the technical requirement specifications (Data Centre, Security, PKI Infrastructure, Firewall etc.) as recommended in the Request for Proposal (RFP);
- The PKI Infrastructure has been implemented in its entirety to enable digital signing for all transactions;
- The Server installed complies the requirement of 2000 concurrent connects and 3000 transactions per hour;



- The encryption technology enabled encryption of documents and data at client machine prior to its travel on the internet, thus, facilitating secured transfer over internet; and
- The technical documents are stored in pieces in the Server, thus, prohibiting access to an intruder.

Unforeseen/Unintended Outputs Resultant from the Project The unintended outputs that have resulted due to e-procurement are:

• The e-Procurement project has resulted in the elimination of vendor cartelization, thus, promoting competitive bidding environment. To some extent, the lobby groups had lost the bargaining power to bag contracts based on political / administrative influences. However, this has not affected the implementation of e-Procurement system as numerous new suppliers / contractors within and outside the State of Karnataka actively participates in the tenders published in the e-Procurement portal.

3.6.7 Project Sustainability Considerations

A constant thrust has been being given in the areas of change management (particularly regarding attitude and mindset), training needs and IT infrastructure in order to remove the seams, which may spring up with time. The IT infrastructure will provide the requisite infrastructure for the trained government officials so that they can actively use them to process procurement activities in e-Procurement system.

Financial sustainability: The project is financially sustainable as a share of the tender processing fee, supplier registration fee and supplier renewal fee is retained by the Centre for e-Governance.

Legal sustainability: The project is legally sustainable as it is backed by the Karnataka Transparency in Public Procurement (KTPP) Act wherein Section 18-A mentions the implementation of e-Procurement.

Technical sustainability: The project technically sustainable as it has deployed PKI infrastructure facilitating users to signing digitally for all transactions.

Project Institutional Arrangements

The project is implemented by Centre for e-Governance (CEG), which is a Society formed under Karnataka Societies Registration Act. The CEG, headed by a senior civil services officer, is administratively controlled and monitored by the Department of Personnel and Administrative Reforms (DPAR), e-Governance. The CEG is assisted by e-Procurement Cell, which is constituted exclusively for e-Procurement project to handle the operational, accounting and other application issues. The e-Procurement Cell is headed by a senior government official and assisted by outsourced skilled resources. The decisions regarding software application and operational issues are taken at the level of Steering Committee, Project Monitoring Committee and Functional Requirement Specifications Committee depending on the nature and severity of the issue.

Degree of support provided by the Government to replicate project effort

Though the e-Procurement project was designed and developed for the State of Karnataka, the solution is being implemented in PSUs and other Central Government Departments / Agencies. For example, M/s Hindustan Aeronautics Ltd. (HAL) has adopted the e-Procurement platform to procure its goods and civil work projects. Several International bidders had registered in the e-Procurement portal and bid for tenders floated by HAL. Discussions with KIOCL, ITI, BEML and Cantonments are in the final stage and they would be adopting e-Procurement for their procurement activities.





EVALUATING THE PROJECT

The project has been evaluated on five parameters viz. Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Results/Impacts and Sustainability which were further affirmed by subparameters illustrated in Table 18 that exhibits the evaluation in six categories of Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Moderately Satisfactory, Moderately Unsatisfactory, Unsatisfactory And Highly Unsatisfactory, accounting respectively for 6,5,4,3,2 and 1 points. The right most column substantiates the scores. The rating for each of the parameters was arrived at after averaging on the ratings for each of the sub-parameters. Similarly the overall evaluation rating were arrived at after averaging on the parameter ratings.



Figure 23 Evaluating the Project- e-Procurement

Figure 24 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE NEXT STEPS

INFRASTRUCTURE FACILITIES FOR SMALL VENDORS

Going forward the e-Procurement would be made mandatory for most of the Government procurement. This would result in usage of the system by small vendors also. As small vendors may not be able to maintain IT infrastructure and manpower for such system, hence it is suggested that the Government set-up some facilities for such vendors e.g. kiosks with privacy options, manpower to help such vendors in registering and submitting bids (also with privacy options), etc.

PROVISION FOR VENDORS TO HAVE DIFFERENT NODAL PERSON (AND CORRESPONDING DIGITAL SIGNATURE) FOR DIFFERENT CATEGORIES

As a vendor may be dealing in multiple categories of work / service / product and may have different nodal persons for these categories. Hence it is suggested that instead of single digital signature for a vendor, an option should be available for a vendor, if desired by it, to register different digital signatures for different categories.

PROVISION FOR VENDORS TO CHANGE NODAL PERSON AND CORRESPONDING DIGITAL SIGNATURE

As presently large vendors register themselves through digital signature of one of its employees. However considering the mobility of manpower in the corporate world, the person may leave the company. In that case the company has to register itself again. To save the company from such unnecessary re-registration, an option could be given to companies to change the registered digital signature.

3.6.8 Project Evaluation Matrix

							Table 34 Detailed evaluation matrix for bangatore the	
Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks	
RELEVANCE								
Needs of the beneficiary captured							 Needs of All Possible beneficiary groups (including citizens, Govt. departments and private players) captured Formal procedure (meetings, discussion forums, etc.) followed. 	
Relevant to needs & expectations of beneficiary							 High correlation between departments' needs and project objectives Objectives and design captures needs of all beneficiary groups The project is suitable and capable to incorporate new or up-coming needs / expectations of beneficiaries even during execution period 	
Relevant to development priorities of Govt. of India							• Project designed to meet and fully aligned towards development priorities identified by Govt. of India's	
Relevant to development priorities of concerned State Government							• Project designed to meet and fully aligned towards development priorities identified by Govt. of Karnataka's	
Identified problem has high incidence in area of focus							• Procurement is a requirement of most of the Govt. departments	
Correct & accurate identification of target stakeholders and/or correctly defined vulnerable groups							• Precise and comprehensive definitions for stakeholders available	
Adequacy of Government commitment to project							• The project is a part of Government structure and its execution has been assigned to dedicated agency (e-Procurement Cell under the Centre for e-Governance)	
Project relevance to ICT4D focus under the project							• The project brings significant improvement / development of majority of the user departments and vendors through transparency, efficiency etc.	
				Ef	FECT	IVENES	5S	
Problem been stated correctly and distinctly							• Problem clearly defined with no or little scope of misunderstanding	







Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries, users of the project are identified as stakeholders of the project							 Roles and responsibilities and other details of each stakeholder group also identified Interaction and needs of each stakeholder group identified
The assumptions, objectives, outputs and outcomes have been clearly articulated in measurable terms							• Objectives and outcomes identified and defined in a clear and unambiguous manner. All assumptions articulated but impact is not clearly articulated
The linkages between objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was clear							• Logical linkages present but not documented
The project design allowed for flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment.							• Project design capable of adapting to and responding positively to most of the possible types of changes.
Degree of support given by the Government towards integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme and other related projects							• The project objectives are already part of the national e-governance plan
Planning component of the project take into account the use of ICT for improved governance / service delivery in various areas through pilot initiatives, encouraging BPR, development local solutions and applications and encouragement of PPP model	•						 Sophisticated ICT applications and tools used Localization of solution: ICT tools are user friendly and easy in handling for local users (department officials as well as vendors). PPP: PPP model (transaction based model for implementation vendor) implemented to ensure sustainability of the initiative
The adequacy of institutional arrangements in attaining the long-term objective of the project. Also the infrastructural, logistical, and financial implication of sustaining the project objectives beyond the project duration/after completion of UNDP funding.							• Infrastructure arrangement adequate for the entire planned duration
Project's linkages, liaison, coordination and impact upon related activities under NeGP being implemented in the country.							• The project derives its objectives from NeGP and directly contributes in achieving NeGP's goals and objectives
The project's assistance, relationship, relevance to and coordination with the pre-							• Uses the pre-existing management system effectively and coordinates with them effectively.



EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
existing Project management system and staff							
Clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various institutional arrangements for overall programme management and implementation and the level of coordination between relevant players	•						• Roles and responsibilities of all the institutional arrangements defined, in a formal and legally binding manner
Risk assessment and management of the project							 Proper risk assessment done periodically during the entire project duration. Risk mitigation planned to certain extent
Efforts of stakeholders in support of the implementation of the project							• Assessment of efforts of stakeholders done through formal procedure
Extent of conflict of interest either between stakeholders involved in the project or with outside agencies.							No conflict of interest involvedProcedure available to handle exceptions
					EFFIC	IENCY	
Was a formal workplan made at the start of the project to determine the timeframe in which activities would be performed							Detailed workplan prepared for all activities along with the resources responsible for performing the activities.Date wise timelines defined for each activity
Were resources made available to the project implementation agencies in accordance with the requirements of the workplan							• Almost all the resource requirement fulfilled as per plan
Extent of deviation in the project implementation in so far as timelines is concerned.							• Most of the major milestones have been achieved as per the work plan
Responsiveness of the project management to such deviations and flexibility to deploy resources							• Management taking necessary steps to reduce the delay by bring in additional resources, doing parallel work, or other corrective measures
Were any systems, processes, manuals etc made to govern the activities in the project among the different stakeholders							• Though instructions are clear and specific but not comprehensive





	_	0					
EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent to which Results Based Management has been used							• No RBM in use presently
Whether there was adequacy of steps taken to resolve any conflict of interest in or due to the project							• Adequate steps taken at right time to resolve all conflict of interest situations
				RES	SULTS	/IMPA(CTS
Whether the project has produced its desired immediate outputs							• More than 90% of immediate outputs achieved including all the major outputs
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, use of the new outputs as against the traditional options)							• Almost all the major department of the State Govt. are using the e- procurement application for all of their procurement above a defined value
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, percentage of the target population)							• Almost all the major department of the State Govt. are using the e- procurement application
Extent of drop-outs from usage of the outputs by the intended beneficiaries							• Significantly less drop-out from usage of outputs by the intended beneficiaries
Are there any unforeseen/ unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups							 Elimination of cartelization of vendors Helped in reduction of corruption during procurement process
Extent of the project results on the target beneficiaries in terms of (a) Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, (b) Capacity Building, (c) Change Management, (d) Business Process Re-engineering, (f) Public Private Partnership, (g) Bridging the Digital Divide, and (h) Knowledge and Experience Sharing		•					• Of all the areas relevant to the project, excellence has been achieved in most of the cases
Extent of the project impact on the target groups in terms of (a) governance (improved efficiency, transparency and accountability), (b) citizen-centric service delivery							• Of all the areas relevant to the project, excellence has been achieved in majority of the cases



EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Μοderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
(advantages of cost, time and convenience), (c) rural livelihoods (number of jobs, extent and sufficiency of employment), and (d) women's empowerment (increased knowledge, and use of the same to voice their concerns).							
Extent of significance of the project impact on the development of the region/country							Significant development of the region
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by marginalized communities							• NA
Extent to which capacities have been built in stakeholders during the project							• Capacities of most of the stakeholders (atleast the main stakeholders) built up to atleast perform the necessary activities assigned to / expected of them
				SL	JSTAIN	IABILIT	ГҮ
Extent of ownership of stakeholders in the project							Complete ownership of all the stakeholders in the project
Degree of support given by the Government in integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme							• The project derives its objectives from NeGP
Extent of availability of inputs/resources required for the project (people, finances, infrastructure, equipments)							• Resources or commitment available for the entire planned duration
Have any revenue streams been defined in the project to make it self-sustaining							• Revenue stream defined with proper basis and justification with taking into consideration possible revenue generation scope
Extent of success of such pre-defined revenue streams							Significant achievement
Extent to which inventory of the assets created out of the grants received in the project have been properly maintained and transferred to the beneficiaries							• Planned maintenance of the assets by well trained personnel





Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Degree of collaboration that has developed among stakeholders during the project							 Significant collaboration among stakeholders for operations as well as decision making related to the project
Extent to which government is willing to finance the project after its completion of the UNDP funding							• Government has taken up the entire project and run it completely including its roll-out and extension



3.7 Mahiti Mitra (Phase I and Phase II)

Table 35 Introduction-Mahiti Mitra

Project Title	Use ICT Interventions For Improving Self Governance With Panchayat Raj Institutions (Gram Panchayat) - Mahiti Mitra Phase I (MM-I) & Mahiti Mitra Phase II (MM-II)	
Proponent Organisation	Kutch Nav Nirman Abhiyan (KNNA)	
Implementation State	Gujarat	
Target Site for Pilot Project	Gujarat (Kutch)	
Theme of Project	Self-Governance	Sector of the se
Target Population	Primarily Panchayat Raj Institution, Panchayat body and Gram-Sabha	
Project Cost	MM - I → Rs 89,00,000 (Approx); MM - II → Rs 36,76,000 (Approx)	1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1
Funding Required for Project	MM - I → Rs 89,00,000 (Approx); MM - II → Rs 36,76,000 (Approx)	1
Time Required to Implement	MM - I (Jan'05 - Dec'07) [Excludes 1 Year no cost extension till Dec'08]	
Project	MM - II (Aug'08 - March'09)	

IMPACT OF THE PROJECT-IN BRIEF

Mahiti Mitra has effectively utilized the technological advances in information and communication to empower and link the village communities with macro trends in development without compromising their interests and sustaining their own cultural identities and diversities. Project Mahiti-Mitra is serving not only PRIs but also vulnerable group and marginal livelihood groups of the cluster.

OBJECTIVE AREAS	OUTPUTS	OUTCOMES
• Deployment of ICT to enhance the efficiency and transparency of local self-governance	• A total of 17 ICT enabled Mahiti Mitra Kendras (MMK) have been established provide various services to Citizens and the number is expected to grow in future.	 Considerable saving time and effort, which was earlier required for visiting district administrator's office. On an average there have been 10-12 visitors/ users per day to the Kiosks. 42% of the panchayats uses MMK for communication with district level panchayats and government officials Intermediary eliminated as various govt. officials visits MMK for issuing creeks passes, Maritime license etc.
 Development of capabilities of PRI and local communities for development planning 	 Setu Information Management System (SIMS) software system has been developed for recording village related data. Legal Education Portal has been developed Building of Para ICTD cadre 	 Effective village level planning based on through analysis of the demographic profile of the village. 67% of the total number of Panchayats covered under MMK uses the centre for various information and services Empowerment of people with legal clauses and provisions. Getting birth and death certificate which earlier took more than 6 months can now be obtained within a few weeks.

Table 36 Brief Impact of the Project- Mahiti Mitra **Deloitte**



3.7.1 Project Background

About KNNA-The Proponent Organisation

Kutch Nav Nirman Abhiyan (KNNA) is a network of about 30 rural development voluntary organizations in the district of Kutch. Having emerged from a natural calamity - the cyclone of 1998 - Abhiyan, as it is commonly known, has been in the forefront of disaster management and coordination during the cyclones of '98, '99, drought of 2000, and the massive earthquake of 2001. As a network of organizations, which belong to Kutch, KNNA played the role of a nodal coordination point for the rural relief and rehabilitation work that the district is only just completing.

Immediately after the tragic earthquake of 2001, KNNA envisaged need of a body which acts as a bridge between the affected people, NGOs, Government, and donor and enables them to dialogue more effectively with each other. This marked the beginning of the concept of 'SETU', the vernacular name for a bridge.

Further, in the immediate post-quake relief and rehabilitation (R&R) efforts, a unit called K-LINK (earlier known as KRIC- Kachchh Rehabilitation Information Centre) was created to coordinate the efforts of NGOs, Government and International aid agencies.

About SETU

Deloitte

The concept of SETU emerged from the chaos and distress of the earthquake, literally three days after January 26, 2001. SETU is a body which has been formed to act as a bridge between the affected people, NGOs, Government, and donors and enables them to dialogue more effectively with each other.

For each SETU, a Centre/ Kiosk has been set up which serves as a central place where people can assemble and discuss their issues.

There are 33 such centers as of date. Each SETU consists of a community development team having social workers, one person for supporting computer applications and volunteers drawn from the village cluster in which the SETU is situated. A SETU is set up for a cluster of 15-20 villages

Initially, SETU focussed on relief operations in the affected areas and later the focus shifted to development activities. The key functions currently undertaken by SETU include:

- Capacity building of panchayats for local self governance
- Interventions in education : creating cadre of community teachers and setting up of alternative school, activating village education committee
- Interventions in health : creating cadre of community health workers
- Activating connectivity in all Setus and with the district hub at k-link







• Interventions with special focus group of farmers, salt pan workers, fish workers, artisans.

About K-LINK

K-Link, the IT arm of KNNA, was created as a response to the coordination need felt post the Gujarat earth-quake. K-link adopts an innovative system for reaching 'Information' to the unreached by use of technology. K-Link provides comprehensive, reliable and updated socio-economic information on Kutch in order to service the needs of three major stakeholders - the Village Community, Government, and NGOs.

The K-link project was conceived and developed through a partnership between UNDP and KNNA with support from Gujarat State Disaster Management Authority (GSDMA).

The key activities of K-Link include:

- Information collection & dissemination using SETU Information Management System (SIMS)
- Generating maps using GIS
- Development of several tailor-made software

Recognition of ICT Kiosks Need

Under the Mahiti Mitra project, 18 ICT kiosks (Mahiti Mitra kendras) were planned to be set up at public places in cluster of villages, in order to harness ICT to further strengthen:

- Local self-governance in terms of auditing and monitoring government services and facilities,
- Support informed planning through technological tools such as the Geographical Information Systems and Village database and profiles, and
- Create close communication linkages between the Gram Panchayats and the district administration/Zilla Panchayat as well as other agencies.



Figure 25: Inter-relationship among KNNA, Setu, K-Link and Mahiti Mitra Centre





The Mahiti Mitra project was conceived as a pilot initiative to be executed by KNNA with K-LINK and the SETU Programme being the key programmatic constituents acting as the implementing arms for the project.

Figure 25 highlights the inter-relationship among KNNA, Setu, K-Link and Mahiti Mitra Centre

Project Description: Mahiti Mitra

Mahiti Mitra project has been implemented in two phases:

- Phase I primarily aimed at creation of 18 Mahiti Mitra Kendras (MMKs) near the SETU centres (cluster based) that provide a platform enabling the Gram Panchayat and Gram Sabhas to access various ICT applications including simple information tools and services to improve both their ability to self govern and generate better development opportunities based on a sound understanding of local conditions and people's needs.
- Phase II aimed at enhancement & augmentation of Mahiti-Mitra centres (established during Phase I) to develop them as resource support hub for CSCs and enable replication of Mahiti-Mitra concept in the State.

3.7.2 Project Strategic Objectives

The strategic objectives for the project (both Phase I and Phase II) are provided below:

Mahiti Mitra - Phase I

- Deployment of ICT as a tool for enhancing the efficiency and transparency of local self-governance.
- Tactfully using ICT to develop within PRIs an enhanced understanding and appreciation of their rights and responsibilities to enable informed decision-making in local self-governance and development, which was lacking.

- Providing digital networking of the remote areas to facilitate the platform for two-way communication between PRI/Gramsabha and Jilla Panchayat (JP)/ external agencies/ NGOs, to promote holistic development of communities.
- Development of capabilities of PRI and local communities to make effective use of ICT for development planning including micro-level natural resource management
- Building capacities of local communities to become meaningful partners in self e-governance initiatives and to decipher the information meaningfully.

Mahiti Mitra - Phase II

- Enabling other organizational members/ partners/ associates in Kutch and Gujarat to set up similar Mahiti Mitras models in their villages clusters
- Integration & up gradation of the services of existing Mahiti-Mitra models.
- Technological up gradation of existing hardware and software requirements of Mahiti-Mitra centers, based on the changing demand pattern of the community members.
- Building strategic partnership with Government to become meaningful partners in self e-governance initiatives, thereby aligning roles and responsibilities of Mahiti-Mitra to fall in line with those of CSCs in the state.

3.7.3 Project Relevance Inputs

Identification of Information and Services Needs

Since the SETU (which is the bridge between multiple organizations working in the region) is the promoter of Mahiti-Mitra kendras in the cluster, the project got the direct benefit of Setu's rapport with the community, thereby facilitating detailed stakeholder needs assessment. Thus the entire gamut of services launched under this project have been designed as a result of periodic and



ever evolving need assessment process carried out with identified stakeholder groups including - Government, Panchayat group, women folk, community clusters, children, senior citizens, etc.

Further, the domain specific knowledge was also integrated for the specific subject after testing the compatibility with the social and cultural norms before launching the services.

All the decisions under the project are taken by the panchayats of the cluster, thereby ensuring adequate buy in and needs assessment.

3.7.4 Project Effectiveness Inputs

Project Stakeholders and Envisaged Roles

Table 37 brings out the different stakeholders involved and the roles they played.

Risks and Mitigation strategies adopted:

- Inability to provide online G2C services since adequate automation of Government services has not been implemented in the district - In order to ensure delivery of G2C services at the doorstep of the community, the Mahiti Mitra kendras have been connected to the district administration office where one coordinator has been deployed by the KNNA who manually facilitates the processing of the request from the villagers at the district administration office.
- Irregular maintenance of the installed hardware / software of the SETU's and MM kendras - In order to ensure proper maintenance and upkeep of ICT infrastructure, internal pool of maintenance engineers has been developed by the KNNA that undertakes periodic checks to assess the performance of hardware / software installed across the SETUs and MM kendras.

- Lack of adequately skilled personnel to manage the MM kendras - KNNA provides training to the trainers located at the SETUs in managing MM kendras. These trainers in turn provide ongoing and periodic training and equip the MM personnel with adequate tools to manage the MM Kendras. This training includes skill building in the areas of interaction with end users, which in turn facilitates the ever evolving process of need assessment of the local communities, thereby enabling provision of services aligned to the current needs of the community.
- Poor bandwidth leading to bad connectivity KNNA has approached the broadband providers for better bandwidth to enable 'static-based services to be converted to web-based services'. However, concrete results have not fructified from this initiative.

3.7.5 Project Efficiency Inputs

Activities Performed in different Dimensions of Intervention Table 39 provides activities performed in different dimensions of interventions:






Stakeholder	Role(s) Played
Local Communities	End users and collaborator
Local Government	Service providers and facilitators
Gram Panchayat/ Gram Sabha	 Gram Pachayats/ Gram Sabhas being people's representatives at the village level have been responsible for Ensuring sense of ownership of the programme amongst the community Participating in decision making process of running the Mahiti Mitra Kendras like involvement in deciding on the kind of services to be provided through these kendras, selection of location of these kendras ensuring better accessibility to the local needs and information, etc. District Administration of Kutch District/ Government Departments One of the key requirements identified through the consultative stakeholder assessment was the requirement to ensure dissemination of information and services provided under various Government schemes. In this context District Administration of the Kutch has been made a key stakeholder of the project to ensure adequate cooperation/ facilitation in provision of services to the rural citizens/ groups. In providing services through the Kendras, links with a total of 30 Government departments have been established.
SETU and its members	 SETU played the following crucial role in the project: Undertook need assessment to identify the service needs of the members of the cluster. Local level monitoring of the Mahiti Mitra kendras. Acted as intermediary between the KNNA and the Mahiti Mitra information providers. Responsible for training Mahiti Mitra representatives and update them on periodic basis about the modifications in existing services or addition of services to the existing set-up.
Kutch Nav Nirman Abhiyan (KNNA)	 KNNA is the proponent organization which has been responsible for - Overall management of the project components Facilitating capacity building for SETU centres, including development of Kiosks. Financial governance of the project Implementation of monitoring systems Inducing Public Private Partnership for self-sustainability model

Project Management Approach

The project has one of the most robust project management approaches being followed. The inter-linkages of communication channels have been designed in a manner to ensure complete dissemination of information flow from top to bottom and grievance redressal mechanism from bottom to top to ensure appropriate concerns arising from the grass root level are taken care of.

The Table 38 Below provides a snapshot of the model being followed by KNNA to ensure smooth functioning of the project deliverables.





The resource allocation for effective and efficient planning, organising and management of the project include:

- Mahiti-Mitra Operators: One full time dedicated resource at centre to facilitate and interpret the needs of the key stakeholders and provide services to them ongoing basis.
- SETU: The overall responsibility of smooth implementation of the Mahiti-Mitra and training of MM personnel was taken by the members of the local SETU who being community workers are grounded to the local needs.
- K-Link: The central HUB for the project providing technical infrastructure and back stopping to facilitate project implementation.
- Subject Support Group: Consists of domain specialists and 30 member organizations that provide inputs on relevant subject. These include local experts from the region
- ICT Manager: Management of resources and coordination among various stakeholders, also ensures constant upgrading and proper maintenance of hardware / software requirements.





As part of the overall strategy of project management a multistakeholder participatory approach was adopted to ensure adequate collaboration and participation in the project activities.

Extent of Usage of Local Expertise

Locally available and honed expertise has been extensively utilized in the project including:

• Local knowledge available within the Gram panchayats/ sabhas were used for identification of appropriate location for Mahiti

Mitra centres and also for assessment of information and service needs of the communities.

- Software applications such as SIMS, Yojana Darshan, Vyapar, Legal education portal, etc were developed by local youth of Kutch.
- The subject support group included local experts in the area of animal husbandry, fisheries, etc.
- Local people were trained to work as computer operators at Mahiti Mitra Centres.

Table 39 Theme-based List of Activities- Mahiti Mitra I and II

Theme	Activities
Bridging the Digital Divide	Online availability and access of information about government policies/ scheme, usage for computer printed forms for applying for various government license/ availing benefits under government scheme (use of e-mails to share information and send scanned copies of the above filed in application form), etc
Citizen-Centric Service Delivery	 Mahiti Mitra centres provides multiple citizen centric services near the doorsteps of the villagers such as Dissemination of information about government schemes/ forms, Facilitating delivery of such G2C services at the doorstep of the community Co-ordination for obtaining fisheries/ creek license, Legal/ RTI guidance, etc. Further, the services design has high degree of alignment with user needs. This is evident from the variations in the services offered from one MMK to the other, catering to the targeted population and focusing on the local requirements/ needs, cross-cutting issues and businesses.
Public Private Partnership	 K-Link and Mahiti-Mitra are modelled as nodal points for various agencies to penetrate their services to reach rural citizens, as result of which various partnerships have shaped up, like: ISRO : Village Resource Centre (for providing video conferencing facility) C-DAC : Software Application Azim Premji Foundation : Multimedia education content INCOIS : Electronic Display Board for fisher folks
Capacity Building	 The following capacity building measures have been undertaken: Monthly workshop with Mahiti-Mitra operators at KNNA office in Bhuj Exposure visits for cross project learning Technical training Building of Para ICTD cadre from community



Theme	Activities
	• Provided skilled training in various sectors like software, hardware, application management, etc.
Change Management	 Management of the whole project activity is based on bottom to top approach leading to easy buy-ins and limited resistance In house technical personnel (including software developers) facilitated development and maintenance of the ICT infrastructure and applications including managing change requests in the application functionalities
Business Process Reengineering	 Provision of printed forms at MM kendras for applying under various government schemes leading to considerable saving in time and cost of going to district administration for form collection. Creation of local database and provision of Map based information (based n GIS) facilitating effective planning. Conversion and interpretation of various laws in local language under 'Legal Education Portal' facilitating people to know and understand various legal provisions.
Knowledge/Experience Sharing	 Setu Information Management System (SIMS) has facilitated knowledge creation and sharing, that has enabled information for village level planning and decision making The entire model of MM facilitates sharing of knowledge to community through SETU's centres and block level information managers and Mahiti-Mitra operators, ensuring knowledge exchange and flow across the beneficiary community.
Others	 The MM initiative has facilitated empowerment of the community by enabling provision of services at the doorstep of the MM Kendra including: Information about development work being undertaken by the Government in the region, thereby empowering communities to take up issues with the Government at the Local, State and National levels (an example of this is the Mundra ports agitation and its negative impact on the community, ecology and the general eco-system of the region) Information on pricing of fish produce - thereby directly benefiting the fisher community and reducing middle men Ongoing and ever evolving needs assessment process thereby enabling alignment of services to the current needs of the community Information availability of Animal Husbandry details Information availability on education, health, water sources and other social sector facilities available in the region.

Management Processes Followed during the Project

The project periodically conducted the following processes:

- Stakeholders meetings;
- Preparation of RBM based LFA;

- Preparation of work plan;
- Preparation of activity schedules for staff;
- Time schedules for various project activities;

Deloitte.

• Allocation of human resources;



- Implementation at the field level;
- Monitoring and reporting;
- Preparation of quarterly report;
- Preparation of training plan;
- Internal evaluation; and
- Follow ups.

Extent of Usage of RBM and Performance Indicators

Monitoring of the indicators is done to measure the performance of the each kendra and to promote competitiveness by formulating monthly performance reports.

KNNA has developed MIS software application which encapsulates the RBM indicators for monitoring performances periodically in terms of number of users of Mahiti Mitra kendras, revenue earned by each kendra, etc.

The centrally consolidated record profile of each centre is then shared with all Mahiti Mitra kendras in monthly meetings to induce competitiveness. Non performance of any centre, as indicated by



Figure 27 - Information Flow at MM Centers

the MIS software, is duly analysed and immediate course of correction is charted, as required.



3.7.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated

Under the phase I of the Mahiti Mitra project a total of 17 Mahiti Mitra kendras have been established with the help of KNNA, Setu & K-Link. These Mahiti Mitra kendras have been established at some central location (like close to the market, central bus stand, etc) in order to ensure their accessibility to the community and provide various services such as:

- Information about various Government schemes and
- Printing of copies of forms to avail the Scheme's benefits
- Legal guidance and co-ordination for legal assistance,
- Basic computer training to local populace
- Act as a nodal point for interaction between Government officers & rural people





• Act as a facilitation center for Government certificates/ licenses such as creek passes, land information, etc.

In Phase II, existing Mahiti Mitra centers were further strengthened in terms of:

- Para ICTD Cadre creation A total of 40 villages of Kutch have now got at least one computer literate person, having development sector perspective.
- Augmentation of existing services and technologies deployed including-
 - 4 additional services have been provided including:
 - Micro Insurance
 - Library
 - Multimedia Education
 - Mobile based Info dissemination
 - Installation of One PC and Laser Printer added to existing infrastructure of the Mahiti Mitra Kendras

Factors Facilitating/Impeding the Production of Outputs

Since the SETU (which is the bridge between multiple organizations working in the region) has been the promoter of Mahiti-Mitra kendras in the cluster, the project got the direct benefit of Setu's rapport with the community, thereby facilitating detailed stakeholder needs assessment and buy in.

Lack of automation at District Administration offices is impeding online availability of G2C services. Forms/ applications still need to be sent manually to the Government offices.

Extent of Operationalisation of the project recommendations

The key project recommendations have been fully operationalised. The technology has been carefully chosen with a view to ensure viability and reliability in the context of rural setting. The hybrid network scenario is there according to availability of basic infrastructure.

A brief of the information linkage, technology deployment and the software developed under the Mahiti Mitra project is provided below.

• Information flow: The information linkage of Mahiti Mitra Centers/ Kiosks is illustrated in Figure 27.

Figure 26 illustrates the information flow among various stakeholders i.e. rural end user, Mahiti Mitra Centers, K-Link and district administration.

- **Software Applications:** The software applications currently installed in computers at Mahiti Mitra centers are:
 - SETU Information Management System (SIMS): SIMS application acts as storehouse of household and village level information. The information stored in SIMS has been primarily collected through primary survey which is undertaken normally at the interval of 4-5 years. Various reports are generated from the application such as
 - Village population details
 - Migration details
 - Sex pattern
 - BPL details
 - Occupational details
 - Handicap persons details
 - Vulnerable group details
 - Crop information details
 - Water source information
 - Government official details
 - GIS based report, etc

The above reports provide the policy makers the required information for drawing various developmental policies including





village level development plan. Also the reports help in effective channelizing the efforts of various NGOs operating in the district. For e.g. NGO specializing in helping handicap people would focus on those villages which have large number of handicap people. The application is being developed in Visual Basic with SQL (Structured Query Language) as back-end. The reporting tool used is 'Crystal'.

- Yojanakiya Darshan provides information on various Government developmental schemes and polices. This application has been implemented in collaboration with 30 Government Departments. Some of the key features of this application include provision of regional language support; information about department structures and responsibilities; government schemes related information. Also application form for registering under various schemes can be downloaded and printed using this application, thus saving considerable time and efforts of villagers in visiting district administrators office for getting application forms.
- Mahiti-Mitra visitors recording system The application is used to collate information about visitors coming to Mahiti Mitra Kendra and the types of services availed by them and revenue collected. The reports generated from this application are used for various purposes such as amount of revenue collected, analysis of services in demand, etc. Further these reports are shared with other Mahiti Mitra Kendra to encourage competition amongst them.
- GIS based Decision Support System The application uses Census 2001 data to generate various query based reports in Map form (using MapObjects) for different indicators such as generation of Village Revenue Map, distance between two location, etc
- GIS based Natural Resource Management System This application is used for mapping, monitoring, assessment and management of natural resources such as ground water

assessment, etc. The application is utilized for preliminary planning and design work for all village cluster level projects.

- Legal Education Portal The application acts as legal education portal and provides plethora of legal information to the village level community including information about the constitution, Government structures, roles and responsibilities, police structure and responsibilities, human rights, labour laws, right to information, etc. The application is currently static (standalone), however a new portal is under development called e-Kanoon which would be web-based and have online connectivity with lawyers to provide online legal guidance.
- Multimedia based education Multimedia contents in local language based on class 1st to 7th standard curriculum have been developed in collaboration with EUREKA and Azim Premji Foundation. These multimedia CDs have transposed the traditional learning materials into electronic formats (with text, graphics, sounds, animation, etc) thereby enhancing the learning experience for the student.
- K-link information portal has been developed to facilitate the following services and information dissemination/ access:
 - Mail Service
 - Employment News
 - Help Desk
 - Discussion Board
 - Announcement.
 - Applicable laws

Effect of Outputs/Results on the Target Groups of the Project The outputs/ results of the project on the target group are as follows:

• Information & Service Access as RIGHT

Agaria's (saltpan workers) of Rann had a unique hazardous livelihood as over the years they became invisible with no official identity or recognition. The Mahiti Mitra Kendras facilitated the

process of getting formal Identity papers for all the 110 Agaria families working in the area. These families are now able to access the basic services of drinking water, health service, education, protective gear etc.

Services	Charges levied
Printing of forms for schemes, applications, SIMS	Charged for stationary/printing only
Market related information, weather forecast, info: Charged for stationary/printing only	Free consultation
Information related to panchayats (Panchayat websites)	Charged for stationary /printing only (free consultation)
Providing linkages with employment exchange for people to register from the kiosks	Charges based on fees
Organizing on-demand computer classes, workshops with children	Charges based on fees
Literacy through programmed software- classes	Charged for the classes
Helping panchayats to communicate, draft, interpret	Charged (as applicable)
Video conferencing	Charged for communication cost
Planning Tools	Charged partially (subsidized)
e-magazines, newspapers, web related info	Charged partially (subsidized)
TSdarfAingvandaphotorfacilityeetc	Charged

Table 41 Services and their charges

• Mediators Eliminated/ Cost & time Savings-

Most fishermen in the region were illiterate and depended on middlemen to get Creek pass, custom card, maritime license, transfer certificate. The Mahiti Mitra kendras now provide these services to fishermen community at 10 times lower price

• Vulnerable are supported

Access to basic welfare schemes and government officials has always beeen difficult. The Mahiti Mitra kendras have provided easy access to various Government welfare schemes like Old age pension, widow pension, welfare support for first delivery, disabled entitlements and I-cards.

• Panchayat & Gramsabha supported

In order to ensure speedy delivery of simple government certificate like the BPL number, birth & death certificates and Property assessment certificate, the Mahiti Mitra Kendras have collaborated with the Talati (who is responsible for keeping records of more than one village) by digitizating all the panchayat records. This has enabled more accurate and speedy generation of these government certificates.

• Facilitated spreading awareness among community for emerging issues like environment, industrialization, citizens' rights and access to information.

An overview of the impact of the project is provided in Table 40.

Unforeseen/Unintended Outputs Resultant from the Project

There has not been any major unforeseen/ unintended outputs resultant from the project.

3.7.7 Project Sustainability Considerations

A multi-pronged sustainability approach has been adopted by the project that not only looks at the financial sustainability but also looks at structural sustainability of the project/ interventions. Some of the key highlighters to project sustainability include:



• Gradually moving towards financial sustainability by implementation of the revenue generation model that takes into account adding new services by mapping the evolving needs mandated by the community. The business model currently being followed includes charging for the services that are provided as part of the project; however, the charges are likely to vary



Figure 28 Various initiatives of Abhiyan

across the various services. The charges levied for various services are provided in the Figure 28.

Parameters	Before Project	After Project
Points of Citizens' Interaction	Multiple-Different Departments/ Offices for different services	Single- Different services are coordinated from MMK
ICT Training	Nil or Very Low	Substantially Increased

Involvement of Middlemen	High	Nil or Very Low
Incidence of Corruption	High	Low
Information about Government Schemes	Available at administration office	Available online
Grievance Redressal	Slow & at times ineffective	Faster and effective
Data/ Information for Village level Planning	Not Available/ Available in scattered form	Available in the required format
Legal Knowledge	Rarely Available	Widely Available

Table 42 Comparison of Parameters before and after Project

• KNNA has had a series of successful collaborations and partnerships in developmental efforts with government at various levels, funding agencies and corporates. One of the prime reasons for successful implementation and continued sustenance of the ICTD initiative is that the initiative is embedded in a larger developmental agenda of the Abhiyan and its partners through various initiatives as shown in Figure 29 below. During the 1st phase of project Mahiti-Mitra, partnership with ISRO, C-DAC and APF are also developed.

Project Institutional Arrangements

Figure 28 provides description of institutional arrangements.





KNNA has a dedicated 'K-link Cell' for maintenance and development of the application software. KNNA has a wide spread of network of 30 organisations which play a vital role in servicing, collaborating, and creating relevant institutions for comprehensive management across the ambit of services provided.

Extent of Commitment/Involvement/Ownership of Stakeholders:

There has been active involvement of all the stakeholders during the course of the project ensuring adequate buy in. Villagers and Gram Panchayat played an important role in identification of information need and collection of data. In fact the SETU played an important role in social mobilization and communication & awareness creation among the rural population.

Degree of Support Provided by the Government: The Government of Gujarat has provided support to KNNA for their initiatives through financial help, deployment of experts, resolving issues, etc.

Efforts to Replicate Project Results: High level negotiations are being carried out to integrate local expertise of KNNA with the existing CSCs. Total of 20 MM kendras have been setup in Kutch (17 have been implemented with SETU which are funded by UNDP, DoIT-Gol,NISG and 3 are being replicated with other organisations in which 2 are funded by CARE, India and 1 is funded by NASSCOM foundation covering more than 300 villages in 8 blocks. These kendras have become single window coordination centre for various services of government (offline) business and others. Similar kinds of centres have also been replicated in other district by the parent organization.

The speedy replication of the model developed under this project proves the acceptability, effectiveness and efficiency of KNNA's.

EVALUATING THE PROJECT

The project has been evaluated on five parameters viz. Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Results/Impacts and Sustainability which were further affirmed by subparameters illustrated in Table 43 that exhibits the evaluation in six categories of Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Moderately Satisfactory, Moderately Unsatisfactory, Unsatisfactory And Highly Unsatisfactory, accounting respectively for 6,5,4,3,2 and 1 points. The right most column substantiates the scores. The rating for each of the parameters was arrived at after averaging on the ratings for each of the sub-parameters. Similarly the overall evaluation rating were arrived at after averaging on the parameter ratings.



Figure 30 Evaluating the Project- Mahiti Mitra I & II





KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

Online Back-End Linkage

Currently the software applications provide static information to rural people. There are no back-end linkages with the Government Department/ District Administration to facilitate online submission of various forms and other queries. The forms need to be manually deposited with the district administration which itself does not have ICT backbone to support or accommodate these services. There should be online back-end linkages of MM centres with Government Departments.

Single Data Source which is Build upon Existing Data

Some data in SIMS software are based on information collected by KNNA conducting primary survey and other data is based on 2001 census figures. It is recommended that the entire data should be based on one source of information to maintain consistency. Further, instead of collecting all data afresh, existing data available with census board, Ministries of Rural Development, Panchayati Raj, etc could be utilized and further build upon.

Integrated Approach for Developing IT Solution

KNNA has developed multiple isolated software applications such as SIMS, e-kanoon, Mahiti Mitra Visitors Record, VYAPAR, etc. KNNA needs to develop an integrated approach to software development so that various applications can share information with each other, thus avoiding duplication of data entry. Further, there should be proper documentation containing the requirements, architecture, and design of all software applications developed for future use and replicability.

GIS Based Application should be Linked with Land Records

GIS based information available in SIMS software should be linked with records available with Land Records Department so that ownership pattern of village land can also be available to facilitate effective village level planning and implementation of government schemes/ policies.

IT Course Completion Certification

Course completion certificates should be provided for computer courses conducted at the Mahiti Mitra Centers. This will provide accreditation to students.

Additional Services

The following additional services should be provided at Mahiti Mitra center to further enhance convenience of local people

- Instant availability of Government resolution (GR) at the Mahiti Mitra kendras especially the Panchayat-specific GR's.
- Photocopy, and Fax services should also be provided from these centers
- Availability of government stamp papers for purposes of preparing affidavits, etc

Other Recommendations

State Rural Development Department should take on this initiative of pro-active collection of data for effective village level planning- The proactive village level comprehensive data collection & compilation initiative currently being undertaken by KNNA for select villages of Kutch district should be replicated at the State level under the aegis of Department of Rural Development of the respective States. Timely availability of required information would facilitate more effective village level developmental planning and implementation monitoring.

CSC should be subsumed into Mahiti Mitra Centre-Mahiti Mitra centers, with its developmental focus, have huge buy-ins from the local rural communities. Instead of establishing CSCs afresh, existing Mahiti Mitra centers should be strengthened with the requisite infrastructure and manpower.

CSC is a good initiative but at national level Department of Information Technology and Department of Rural Development should work in consonance, so that CSC, in addition to earning profit, should be development focused and lead to welfare of local poor people. This will ensure early buy-ins from the local community which is essential for the success of CSC's initiatives.



3.7.8 Project Evaluation Matrix

							Table 43 Detailed evaluation matrix for Mahiti Mitra I & II					
Evaluation matrix	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks					
RELEVANCE												
Needs of the beneficiary captured							 All the services launched through the Mahiti Mitra kendras (MMK) have been the result of detailed and ever evolving need assessment carried out with different stakeholders like Panchayat group, women folk, children, senior citizens etc. As the needs arose from within the community their compatibility with the social and cultural norms was well tested before the introduction of any services. 					
Relevant to needs & expectations of beneficiary							• As the process of ever evolving needs assessment was built into the project design, the services that have been introduced across different kendras vary from one Kendra to the other, in order to cater to the decentralized needs and contextual considerations.					
Relevant to development priorities of Govt. of India							• Although the overall objective of the CSC (a national plan of the GOI under NeGP) is very similar to that of a MMK, however the implementation model is rather different as this one is backed by a developmental agenda rather than a purely revenue mode and thus it can be concluded that MM is loosely aligned with developmental priorities of GoI however not aligned to any specific development programme of the Government					
Relevant to development priorities of concerned State Government							• It is loosely aligned with developmental priorities of Gujarat Government however not aligned to any specific development programme					
Identified problem has high incidence in area of focus							 Village level planning and developmental initiatives (both by the Government and the Abhiyan) were greatly facilitated through adequate and timely availability of village level data (through SIMS). Rural community faced problems (both in terms of time & money spent) in getting creek passes, birth & death certificates, etc, which have now been coordinated through MMK. Rural community, which is mostly illiterate, has no proper means of getting information about government welfare schemes. MMK not only disseminated scheme information to rural people but also facilitated people in getting benefit under them. 					



Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highl ^y Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Correct & accurate identification of target stakeholders and/or correctly defined vulnerable groups							 Stakeholder segments including vulnerable groups such as fishing community, saltpan workers, other livelihood communities, cattle breeders, women, children, etc have been correctly and accurately identified. All individuals in the target areas are eligible to getting assistance from MMK.
Adequacy of Government commitment to project							 The local government collaboration in the form of arranging various officials visiting the MMK for issuing creeks passes, Maritime license etc has greatly ensured stakeholder convenience. Further, KNNA representative has been provided space in the local government office that has facilitated the activities undertaken by this representative to act as an interface between district administration and rural community in delivery of Government services to the local community in terms of information sharing, form submission, status tracking, receipt of government services, etc.
Project relevance to ICT4D focus under the project	•						 SIMS application software including GIS mapping tool facilitated detailed analysis of the demographic and other details of rural community to effective formulation of village level plans. Online availability of various Government Scheme related information including printed application forms helps in saving time and effort of visiting district administrator's office. Further, transmission of information/ query through e-mails to MM coordinator sitting at district administration reduces inconvenience of going to district office time and again.
	-			EI	FFECT	IVENE	SS
Problem been stated correctly and distinctly							 Problems identified and stated correctly with adequate methodologies adopted for recognizing these problems Informal and ongoing validation of problems areas by various stakeholder groups such as panchayats members and other rural community
Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries, users of the project are identified as stakeholders of the project							 Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries and users have been identified as stakeholders Roles and responsibilities of all stakeholders have been broadly defined
The assumptions, objectives, outputs and outcomes have been clearly articulated in measurable terms							• Most of the project outcomes were quantitatively defined such as number of MMKs to be established (i.e. 18), at least 25% of the district's Gram Panchayat members will be accessing the Setu kiosks, etc



Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
The linkages between objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was clear							• Logical linkages present
The project design allowed for flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment.							 Project design capable of adapting to and responding positively to most of the possible types of changes
Degree of support given by the Government towards integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme and other related projects							• As stated earlier the Government has collaborated with the KNNA to ensure service delivery proposed under the project, however even though the project is very similar to the CSC project of the Gol under the NeGP, there are distinct differentiators (like the project being significantly development centric) that make the MM project significantly different from the CSC project.
Planning component of the project take into account the use of ICT for improved governance / service delivery in various areas through pilot initiatives, encouraging BPR, development local solutions and applications and encouragement of PPP model		•					 The planning component of the project distinctly took into account the requirement of the ICT in improving governance, service delivery, process reengineering and collaborations in various areas and development of localized solutions. In this context it may be stated that Language localization facilitated buy-ins from rural populace Process reengineering was undertaken including use of e-forms, till such time forward linkages have not been established putting a person at the district government office facilitating departmental interaction and online transmission of query/ information, etc Formation of multiple collaborations/ partnerships as MMKs are modeled as nodal points for various agencies to penetrate their services to reach rural citizens, as result of which various partnerships have shaped up, like: ISRO : Village Resource Centre (for providing video conferencing facility) C-DAC : Software Application Azim Premji Foundation : Multimedia education content
The adequacy of institutional arrangements in attaining the long-term objective of the project. Also the infrastructural, logistical, and financial implication of sustaining the project objectives beyond the project duration/after completion of UNDP funding.		•					 KNNA and two of its programmatic constituents - K-LINK, and the SETU Program were the project implementing arm of the MMK pilot initiatives. K- Link was responsible for providing technical support, whereas SETU is responsible for community support. These arms already have committed funding. There exist Subject Support Group consisting of domain specialists and 30 member organizations to provide inputs on relevant subject Required assets including PCs, Servers, application software, network connectivity etc. have been acquired and maintained properly





Evaluation matrix	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							• Adequate financial arrangements (e.g. fee for various services rendered through MMK) are in place for sustaining the project
Project's linkages, liaison, coordination and impact upon related activities under NeGP being implemented in the country.							• The project has substantial linkages, learning and possible impact on NeGP's CSC project in terms of its success directly linked to the developmental agenda that the MMK took along with itself.
The project's assistance, relationship, relevance to and coordination with the pre- existing Project management system and staff							 The project utilized both the pre-existing management system (in form of KNNA's SETU, K-Kink and network organization) as well as staff (pre-existing staff of KNNA's staff) effectively. Infact these are integral part of the MM project. Additional personnel recruited for software development and managing MMK
Clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various institutional arrangements for overall programme management and implementation and the level of coordination between relevant players							 Roles and responsibilities of all of the stakeholders were defined clearly Management processes have been clearly laid down for proper coordination between the players such as KNNA provided ICT project manager, k-link was responsible for technical support, SETU was responsible for social mobilization, etc
Risk assessment and management of the project							 Most of the potential risks were noted down Mitigation strategies for identified risk have been laid down The risk management and mitigation plan was substantially adhered
Efforts of stakeholders in support of the implementation of the project							 The project proposal submitted to UNDP was documented in coordination with most of the stakeholders but complete buy-in of these stakeholders was not taken. Most of the stakeholders have extended support as envisaged from them during the proposal stage.
Extent of conflict of interest either between stakeholders involved in the project or with outside agencies.							• As already stated although the CSCs are being set up by the Government, all of them come with a pure revenue sharing model whereas MMK comes with a mix of revenue and developmental agenda and thus going forward - if possible the Government should piggy back on MMK rather than the other way round.
					EFFIC	IENCY	
Was a formal workplan made at the start of the project to determine the timeframe in which activities would be performed							• Basic work plan for broad level milestone prepared



EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Were resources made available to the project implementation agencies in accordance with the requirements of the work plan							• The project coordinator remained through-out the course of the project. A few of the support staff may have changes but these were replaced with other employees.
Extent of deviation in the project implementation in so far as timelines is concerned.							• Mahiti Mitra Phase-1 was planned to be completed within 2 years, however there was a one year no cost extension
Responsiveness of the project management to such deviations and flexibility to deploy resources							• Project management was responsive in taking steps to correct the course of implementation
Were any systems, processes, manuals etc made to govern the activities in the project among the different stakeholders							• The inter-relationship and key role of major stakeholders such as SETU and K-Link had been defined.
Extent to which Results Based Management has been used							 There has been regular meeting of KNNA governing board and project steering committee to monitor the progress of the project. The various services availed by locals from Mahiti Mitra kendras have been regularly monitored to identify areas of improvement.
Whether there was adequacy of steps taken to resolve any conflict of interest in or due to the project							 No major efforts had been undertaken to resolve the conflict of interest of the services provided by MMK with the services proposed to be provided by CSC
				RES	SULTS	/IMPAC	CTS
Whether the project has produced its desired immediate outputs							 Majority (50% to less than 75%) of the immediate outputs achieved 17 MMK setup A total of 40 villages of Kutch have now got at least one computer literate person
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, use of the new outputs as against the traditional options)							 67% of the total number of Panchayats covered under MMK uses the centre for various information and services 42% of the panchayats uses MMK for communication with district level panchayats and government officials Out of the target of 600 people 607 people were enrolled for computer education.





EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, percentage of the target population)							 On an average there would be 10-12 visitors/ users per day to the Kiosks and the number is expected to grow in future. About 50% of the intended beneficiaries utilized the project output
Extent of drop-outs from usage of the outputs by the intended beneficiaries							• No/ Marginal drop-out from usage of outputs by the intended beneficiaries
Are there any unforeseen/ unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups	•						 No unintended effect caused on the target groups A few unforeseen positive effects caused which promotes the existing developmental efforts in the state/region such as the local Mahiti Mitra and the Talatti decided to collaborate by digitizing all the panchayat records with the Mahiti Mitra to facilitate speedy preparation of government certificate for BPL number, birth, death certificates and Property assessment.
Extent of the project results on the target beneficiaries in terms of (a) Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, (b) Capacity Building, (c) Change Management, (d) Business Process Re-engineering, (f) Public Private Partnership, (g) Bridging the Digital Divide, and (h) Knowledge and Experience Sharing		•					 Excellence has been achieved in following areas relevant to the project: Bridging the Digital Divide: Online availability and access of information about government policies/ scheme, usage for computer printed forms for applying for various government license/ availing benefits under government scheme, use of e-mails to share information and send scanned copies of the above filed in application form, etc Citizen-centric service delivery: Dissemination of information about government schemes/ forms, co-ordination for obtaining fisheries/ creep license, legal/ RTI guidance, etc. Capacity building and bridging the digital divide: A total of about 40 rural people have been trained in use ICT tools to access information related to Government schemes Change Management: Use of bottom to top approach leading to easy buy-ins and limited resistance PPP: tie-up with ISRO, C-DAC, Asim Premji foundation etc for various facilities/ services
Extent of the project impact on the target groups in terms of (a) governance (improved efficiency, transparency and accountability), (b) citizen-centric service delivery (advantages of cost, time and convenience), (c) rural livelihoods (number of jobs, extent and sufficiency of employment), and (d) women's empowerment (increased knowledge, and use of the same to voice		•					 Excellence has been achieved in significant number of cases in following relevant areas: Governance (facilitating the process of governance by ensuring accountability at various levels, involvement of key stakeholders as collaborators) Citizen centric service delivery (Government service delivery through K-link) Rural livelihood (increased price of fish produce available to the fishing community)



EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
their concerns).							
Extent of significance of the project impact on the development of the region/country							 Indicators for development were defined during project conceptualization stage Word was spread across the country through representatives of 30 network organizations of KNNA.
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by marginalized communities							 Most of the marginalized communities have utilized the project output in more than 50% cases where they needed similar service
Extent to which capacities have been built in stakeholders during the project							• Capacities of the main stakeholders i.e. K-Link and MMK coordinator have been built up to atleast perform the necessary operational and maintenance activities assigned to them
				SL	JSTAIN	IABILIT	ΓY
Extent of ownership of stakeholders in the project							• Complete ownership of all the 'implementing and operating' stakeholders in the project including K-Link and SETU etc.
Degree of support given by the Government in integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme							• Project objectives and goals not aligned with any specific Government programme. MMK provides some of the information/ services proposed to be provided by CSCs.
Extent of availability of inputs/resources required for the project (people, finances, infrastructure, equipments)							• Resources in all the four area - people, finances, infrastructure, equipments were available during the major duration of the project
Have any revenue streams been defined in the project to make it self-sustaining							• Revenue stream has been defined in terms of fees structure for various services being rendered by MMK.
Extent of success of such pre-defined revenue streams							• Achieving almost 50% of the target
Extent to which inventory of the assets created out of the grants received in the project have been properly maintained and transferred to the beneficiaries							• Assets received under the project such as PCs, Servers, Printers etc. have been maintained well and the MMK staff has been trained in using and maintaining these assets.
Degree of collaboration that has developed among stakeholders during the project							 Stakeholder management plan was well defined and have complete adherence during project execution.





EVALUATION MATRIX	Нідні Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Μοderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							 Stakeholders including Gram Panchayat, District Administration, SETU Members, K-Link team were involved during operational and strategic decision making
Extent to which government is willing to finance the project after its completion of the UNDP funding							• No funding committed by the Government



3.8 Village Information System

	Table 44 Introduction- Village Information System
Project Title	Village Information System (VIS)
Proponent Organisation	Gujarat Informatics Limited
Implementation State	Gujarat
Target Site for Pilot Project	Implemented in 100 villages in 3 Talukas of Patan District and 2 Talukas of Mehsana Districts of North Gujarat.
Theme of Project	ICTs for Transforming Rural Governance
Target Population	Primarily the rural population / citizens, Panchayat Raj Institution,
	Panchayat body and Gram-Sabha etc.
Funding Approved for Project	INR 1,40,00,000 /-
Total Funding Received for Project	INR 98,58,888/-
Total Funding Utilized for Project	INR 80,15,245/-
Funding Approved for Project	INR 1,40,00,000

IMPACT OF THE PROJECT – IN BRIEF

VIS / e-Gram project is strongly aligned with the overall objective of the CSC (a national plan of the GOI under NeGP) and has the same priorities such as delivery of services to the citizens at their doorsteps, one stop solution for all the services of state departments, creation of employment opportunities, empowerment of the citizens, increase in transparency etc.

OBJECTIVE AREAS	OUTPUTS	OUTCOMES
Infuse five Es in governance: ease, economy, efficiency, effectiveness and ethics.	• VIS centres were created in 100 villages which is now a part of the e-Gram project and in total there are now around 13,695 e-Gram centres (including VIS centres) which are providing services (G2C) to the citizens.	 Bridging the digital divide between the urban and the rural sectors by converting right to information into a reality through access to digital information Improved access to the services of the departments. Increase in efficiency and economy as the services are delivered from these centres and the citizens need not travel to the respective departments for availing these services.
Enable prompt servicing of citizen requests and reduce time, effort and cost for availing the services Empower people through access to global communication	 Use of software applications at VIS / e-Gram Centres such as E-Gram certificate, RoR application, Electricity Bill Application, Panchayat Application, etc Appointment of Village Computer Entrepreneur (VCE) for VIS centres. Availability of video conference 	 Improved availability and access of information and multiple citizen centric services using online / offline mode such as Form 7x12, Form 8A, Birth Certificate etc. Increase in awareness amongst the citizens about the various services, schemes etc. of the government. Employment opportunities by appointing VCEs for operating the VIS / e-Gram centres and operating it on a revenue sharing model with the government. Increase in awareness about various aspects of health, veterinary, education, agriculture etc. with the use of video broadcasting / video conferencing



Deloitte

164

3.8.1 Project Background Background

Access to information becomes a key to healthy and dynamic democracy to ensure participation of all in development. The challenge lies in ensuring easy flow of public information to rural citizens irrespective of caste, class, and gender and literacy level. The satisfaction of information needs of the rural communities is challenging but possible. The most underserved - the rural poor live in the most expensive to serve areas, and they are often unable to afford these services at a price that makes them sustainable from a business perspective. The growing innovations in the use of Information and Communication Technologies have opened up new era of information dissemination. However, the objective of such initiatives needs to focus on satisfying the information needs of the poorest among poor and those who face difficulties in access to information necessary for improving and securing their life.

The Gujarat state government took up the challenge of setting up e-Governance program by providing computer based services to its people through projects such as e-Dhara, Mahiti Shakti, Talim the digital divide. Gyanganga, a pilot project to serve rural communities was developed on the basis of public-private partnership. Gyanganga provided first experience to rural people of Gujarat to access information through Internet services and thus introduce them to a new world of possibilities.

About GIL -The Proponent Organisation



GUJARAT INFORMATICS LIMITED e-powering the business

Gujarat Informatics Ltd. (GIL), the nodal agency for IT development in the state of Gujarat was started in February 1999, by the Government of Gujarat with a clear objective to promote IT and accelerate the process of E- Governance in the state. Along with the announcement of the IT policy, the Government has enabled GIL to effectively implement IT projects in the state.

Project Description- Village Information System (VIS) Encouraged by the performance of Gujarat State Wide Area

Rojgar and Jan Seva Kendras. The state government has planned to strengthen the e-Governance program and link it with various development initiatives through ICT based services and bring it to the doorsteps of rural communities and in the process bridge



Network (GSWAN), the state government has decided to take the program further to the doorstep of the rural people and to bring them closer to the government. As part of this initiative the State government decided to enlarge the use of ICT in rural areas through it ambitious





e-Gram and Village Information System (VIS) projects, with initial coverage of 1400 village across the state. As a pilot phase, Government decided to cover 100 villages of Patan and Mehsana districts of North Gujarat under the "Village Information System (VIS)".

VIS targeted to bridge the digital divide between the urban and the rural sectors, and to convert right to information into a reality through access to digital information, providing communication hubs at villages, and, thus, empowered people through access to global communication and information. This project aimed to provide a state level portal to the rural citizens of Gujarat for simplified, effective, efficient, integrated, faster, and economical, anytime-anywhere and transparent services for their needs and empower them with knowledge.

GIL conceptualised the delivery of services to the rural masses using ICT and hence bridge the digital divide between the urban and the rural Gujarat. Initial need assessment for VIS was carried out and the proposal was put forward to the UNDP for implementation of VIS in 100 villages from 3 Talukas of Patan District and 2 Talukas of Mehsana Districts of North Gujarat.

On approval of UNDP the VIS project was executed under the able guidance of Director e-Governance of GIL.

Current Status

These VIS centres have now been integrated under e-Gram Project and the total number of e-Gram centres is **13,695** including VIS centres. Out of these there are around 100 VIS centres in the District of Mehsana and Patan.

Now the ownership of the VIS (eGram) project has been handed over to eGram Vishwagram Society, an autonomous body, under the eGram Project. Political commitment at the highest level is ensured by bringing Gujarat's Chief Minister as Chairperson and under his guidance, a monitoring cell is dedicated to coordinate the day-to-day progress of the E gram mission. The monitoring cell is further organized into:

- State-level monitoring: Principal Secretary (Department of Panchayat) along with Development Commissioner with help of Officer on Special Duty are seeing this Project at the State level
- **District-level monitoring:** District Development Officers along with eGram Nodal Officer are seeing the project at the District level.
- Taluka and village-level monitoring: Taluka Development Officer and Talati are responsible at Taluka and Village level for Project Implementation.

VIS Service Portfolio:

The envisioned portfolio of services for VIS project targets the citizens, business and the government.

- Services delivered through e-Gram application / software includes various services of the Panchayat such as : Birth Certificate
 - Death Certificate
 - Domicile Certificate
 - Caste Certificate
 - Income Certificate
 - Character Certificate
 - Domicile Certificate
 - Property / House Tax Collection
- Services delivered for basic Right of Records (ROR) encompassing :
 - Form 7x12
 - o Form 8A
- Services delivered through the standalone DOS based application of GEB (Gujarat Electricity Board) includes:



- o Payment of Electricity Bill
- VCEs also provide data entry facilities for various organisations / Department. Currently some of the VCEs are carrying out data entry work for NREGA and Health Department.
- Video conferencing facility is used for health, education, veterinary, agriculture etc purposes.
- Other additional services being provided through VIS includes;
 - o Bio-data / Resume creation
 - Taking passport size photographs using webcam and getting it printed.
 - Internet surfing facilities for the citizens.
 - o Information on various services such as exam results etc.
 - o Print outs.

3.8.2 Project Strategic Objectives

The strategic objectives for the project are as follows:

- Infuse five Es in governance: ease, economy, efficiency, effectiveness and ethics
- Bridge the digital divide between the urban and the rural sectors
- Convert right to information into a reality through access to digital information
- Empower people through access to global communication and information
- Enable prompt servicing of citizen requests and reduce time, effort and cost for availing the services
- Provide communication hubs at villages
- Provide information on health care systems
- Provide Information on educational facilities in the nearby towns and in the State Capital
- Provide information on various job opportunities which are suitable for the local people

• Building capacities of local communities to become meaningful partners in self e-governance initiatives and to decipher the information meaningfully.

3.8.3 Project Relevance Inputs Identification of Information and Services Needs

Gujarat State Government had initiated various ICT projects in order to improve the efficiency and transparency of the working of different departments. Realising the importance of delivery of services to the citizens and bridging the digital divide between the urban and the rural, GoG carried out detailed assessment for bridging this divide.

Based on the stakeholder need assessment through discussions with the various departments, NIC, Panchayat, citizens and analysis of similar projects running across the country and in Gujarat, GoG decided to bank upon the concept of single window delivery of services to the rural masses. The initial set of services were identified which would have a major impact on the citizens and the approach for the project was finalised. The approach adopted for VIS consisted of the following broad aspects:

- Carrying out need assessment study for identifying the important parameters of the project.
- Preparation of comprehensive database.
- Identification of villages for the project
- Identification of the sites for the VIS centres
- Preparation of guidelines for appointment and identification of VCE (Village Computer Entrepreneur)
- Finalization and Procurement of ICT Infrastructure
- Development of Software application for the VIS project



3.8.4 Project Effectiveness Inputs

Project Stakeholders and Envisaged Roles

Table 46 brings out the different stakeholders involved and the roles they played.

Stakeholder Role(s) Played UNDP UNDP is the project sponsor for VIS project and continuously monitored the implementation of the project. GIL conceptualized the project and undertook pilot study. Gujarat Informatics Ltd. was the project nodal agency acting as intermediary between Development Commissioner Office and VCE. Earlier, GIL was the **GIL** (Gujarat Informatics Limited implementing agency and was responsible for complete execution of the project. However now the ownership of the project has been handed over to eGram Vishwagram Society. The various functions carried out by the society are such as: • Facilitate implementation of schemes • Manage private partnership components • Establish and operate Society Secretariat eGram Vishwagram Society Mobilize financial and non-financial resources • Ensure legal and policy measures • Co-ordinate with Government Departments/Agencies. NIC has provided the support by developing various software applications viz. e-Gram, e-Prima etc. NIC (National Informatics Center) NIC has also provided training to the users on these applications and is also providing application level support. NISG was the project executing agency. NISG has helped in building capacity of the VIS Project implementation team by having workshops for the same. NISG is also assisted by providing various NISG (National Institute for guidelines to be followed for execution of project and providing guidance on various issues as and when Smart Governance) requested. However now the project has been moved to eGram Project. VCE (Village Computer VCE operates the VIS centres on a PPP model. VCE provides services to the citizens by utilizing the VIS infrastructure. Enterprises) Gram Panchayats/ Gram Sabhas being people's representatives at the village level are responsible for • Ensuring adequate space for setting up VIS centres in the Panchayat premises. • Creating awareness about the project amongst the masses. Gram Panchavat/ Gram Sabha Participation in identification of VCEs. • Ensuring participation of all during broadcasting of various programmes. • Providing the services offered by the Panchayat through VIS centres such as birth/ death certificate etc.





Table 46 Project Stakeholders and their Roles

Stakeholder	Role(s) Played
Government Departments	 The State Government Departments are responsible for: Providing their citizen centric services through the VIS Centres / e-Gram. Assisting in business process re-engineering of their services or creation of a mode of delivery of the services from the centres.
TSTSP (Technical Support and Training Staff)	 TSTSP project under the e-Gram project provides technical support and training to VCEs. They are responsible for : Training to Village Computer Entrepreneur for Operation and Upkeep of Centre Hardware Management and Upkeep of Hardware New Software and New version of existing software Management of Small Business/ Office How to roll out Government to Citizen Business to Citizen Service Technical Support Service: This includes the following set of activities Regular Monthly Visit at Gram Panchayat Support to Computer Hardware Infrastructure Support for Software & Deployment of new Software Configuration for Internet Connectivity through VSAT Loading and updating Anti-virus Software Regular Monthly Back-up MIS regular reporting Co-ordination with Hardware Supplier for Support
Other Service Providers	 Some of the other service providers / agencies/ organisations / firms were hired for specific set of tasks. The details of these are provided below: Need Assessment Study was carried out by M/s SAVE (Saline Area Vitalisation Enterprise Limited) Family Survey, data entry and creation of initial database was carried out by Jayatma Informatics Private Limited and Gujarat Infotech Limited. Supply and Installation of computer hardware and peripherals was carried out by Acer India Pvt. Ltd. And ADINO Telecom. Internet Connectivity was earlier provided by BSNL (dialup connectivity), however now the internet connectivity is provided by Airtel (VSAT)

Risks and Mitigation strategies adopted:

• Need Assessment: Services considered to be suitable for the citizens might turn out to be only secondary in importance. Hence a professional firm was appointed (M/s SAVE) for carrying out the need assessment study for identification of the needs of the stakeholders in order to exponentiate the impact of the project. The study was carried out using survey methodology.



- Readiness of the Departments: Since most of the departments are not fully automated the integration of the e-Gram application for service delivery would be a challenge. In order to overcome this, initially only services of the departments which were ready were taken up such as Revenue Department for services of land records. Also some of the services of other departments were identified wherein semi-automated delivery of services was undertaken such as electricity department bill payment. For Panchayat services the initial database was created on top of which the e-Gram application was developed.
- Reliable Connectivity: Internet connectivity in the rural areas is an issue as the reach of the high bandwidth service providers is missing in the villages and also GSWAN could not be banked upon. Detailed analysis and pilot implementation of various options were considered such as nLogue, ADINO's RF connectivity and BSNL's dialup connectivity, but the results were not satisfactory. Later the VSAT connectivity of Airtel was opted for under the BOT model which now provides appropriate bandwidth to the VIS centres with internet bandwidth being approximately 256Kbps.
- **Optimal Identification of VCE:** Since the VCE is the actual person who would be operating the project and delivering the services to the citizens, the appointment of in-appropriate person would result in distortion of the image of the project.

Hence after careful planning and brain storming the guidelines for appointment of VCE was formulated. VCEs for VIS / e-Gram project were appointed on the basis of PPP model wherein a Local computer savvy youth was selected by Local Gram Panchayat in presence of Talati, TDO and Technical support Person.

• Lack of Technical & Training support: The VIS project banks upon the uptime of the ICT infrastructure as well as upgradation of existing skills for operation.

In order to mitigate the above mentioned risk the following set of activities were undertaken:

- Appointment of TSTSPs (Technical Support and Training Staff) for providing technical support and training to the VCEs.
- Signing of appropriate SLAs with the hardware and networking vendors.

3.8.5 Project Efficiency Inputs

Activities Performed in different Dimensions of Intervention

Table 47 provides activities performed in different dimensions of interventions:

Table 47 Theme-wise activities conducted during the project

Theme	Activities
Bridging the Digital Divide	Availability and access of information and services using online / offline mode. The village masses are able to avail services of the department such as Form 7x12, Form 8A, Birth Certificate, forms for various other services, knowledge dissemination using video broadcasting / video conferencing.
Citizen-Centric Service Delivery	 VIS / e-Gram centres provides multiple citizen centric services near the doorsteps of the villagers such as: Birth Certificate Death Certificate Domicile Certificate Caste Certificate Income Certificate



Theme	Activities
	Character Certificate
	Property / House Tax Collection etc.
	Form 7x12 and Form 8A
	Electricity bill payment
	Dissemination of information about government schemes/ forms.
	• Video conferencing facility is used for health, education, veterinary, agriculture etc purposes.
	Other additional services being are as provided below
	Bio-data / Resume creation
	 Taking passport size photographs using webcam and getting it printed.
	Internet surfing facilities for the citizens.
	 Information on various services such as exam results etc.
	Print outs.
	For VIS / e-Gram project implementation is being done along the PPP model where operations are outsourced but
	the government retains the control over the activities.
Public Private	Software: developed by NIC.
Partnership	Internet Connectivity: Inrough Bharti Airtel using BOT model.
	• Revenue model: VCES operate the centres on a revenue sharing model.
	• recinical support & fraining: Companies appointed under the ISTSP project such as HCL, Aptech, Nill, CMS
	and min. The following capacity building measures have been undertaken:
	• IT orientation programme broadcast through BiSAG studio catering to VCE. Gram Mitra, Talati, TSTSP etc.
	Basic training provided to all VCFs and have been re-trained by TLF (Taluka Level Executive)
	• Technical support staff for training and ICT infrastructure related troubleshooting was appointed as per the
	TSTSP (Technical Support and Training Staff) project under the e-Gram project. This technical support staffs
Capacity Building	have been hired through an open tender and the project was awarded to HCL. NIIT. Aptech, CMS & ITI for
	different districts. The total manpower under this project was around 588. The services provided by TSTSP can
	be classified into two broad areas provided below:
	• Training to Village Computer Entrepreneur for
	 Operation and Upkeep of Centre
	 Hardware Management and Upkeep of Hardware



Theme	Activities
	 New Software and New version of existing software
	 Management of Small Business/ Office
	 How to roll out Government to Citizen Business to Citizen Service
	 Technical Support Service: This includes the following set of activities
	 Regular Monthly Visit at Gram Panchayat
	 Support to Computer Hardware Infrastructure
	 Support for Software & Deployment of new Software
	 Configuration for Internet Connectivity through VSAT
	 Loading and updating Anti-virus Software
	 Regular Monthly Back-up
	 MIS regular reporting
	 Co-ordination with Hardware Supplier for Support
	• Since the entire project is devised on the assessment of needs of the citizens and the stakeholders and there is
Change Management	an adequate support from the Panchayat officials and the government which paved the for insertion of the importance and benefits of the project among the masses.
	• For delivering the services through VIS / e-Gram centres appropriate re-engineering of the processes were
Business Process	carried out wherever applicable such as in the case of issue of RoR Form 7x12 using biometric authentication
Reengineering	and stored signatures.
	 Provision of providing printed forms for various schemes and services of the departments.
Knowledge/Experience	• Usage of video conferencing / video broadcast facility is used for health, education, veterinary, agriculture etc
Sharing	purposes.

Project Management Approach

Gujarat Informatics Ltd. being the project nodal agency and the implementing agency executed the project but as such there was no standard project management approach adopted. However the project was executed under the able guidance of Director e-Governance of GIL.

However now the ownership of the VIS (eGram) project has been handed over to eGram Vishwagram Society, an autonomous body, under the eGram Project. Political commitment at the highest level is ensured by bringing Gujarat's Chief Minister as Chairperson and under his guidance, a monitoring cell is dedicated to coordinate the day-to-day progress of the E gram mission. The moniroing cell is further organized into:

- State-level monitoring: Principal Secretary (Department of Panchayat) along with Development Commissioner with help of Officer on Special Duty are seeing this Project at the State level
- **District-level monitoring:** District Development Officers along with eGram Nodal Officer are seeing the project at the District level.





• Taluka and village-level monitoring: Taluka Development Officer and Talati are responsible at Taluka and Village level for Project Implementation.

As part of the overall strategy of project management a multistakeholder participatory approach was adopted to ensure adequate collaboration and participation in the project activities. Regular review meetings are held at the taluka, district and state levels with the TSTSPs, VCEs and the Panchayat officials.

Extent of Usage of Local Expertise

Locally available and honed expertise has been extensively utilized in the project including:

- VCE is identified from the concerned village itself.
- Local knowledge available within the Gram panchayats/ sabhas were used for identification of VCEs.

Management Processes Followed during the Project

The project periodically conducted the following processes:

- Stakeholders meetings;
- Preparation of RBM based LFA;
- Implementation at the field level;
- Monitoring and reporting;
- Follow ups.

Extent of Usage of RBM and Performance Indicators

The entire VIS project was being monitored regularly on various parameters of RBM framework such as:

- Improved access to varieties of G2C and B2C services under one roof
- Improved access to government schemes
- Adequate transparency in panchayat administration
- Adequate Govt. Support in Village Level
- Adequate cost effective communication system

• Adequate expert advice in specialized services -Health/ Education/ Livelihood

Now as per the e-Gram project the performance of each VIS / e-Gram Centre is being monitored on the basis of regular MIS being generated for the number and type of services being delivered. A snap shot of the same is provided below:

3.8.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated

The state government rolled out e-Gram Project / Village Information System across around fourteen thousand villages with a total of 13,695 centres. Out of these there are around 100 VIS centres in the District of Mehsana and Patan.

These VIS centres have been established in the Gram Panchayat office itself and provide various services such as:

- Birth Certificate
- Death Certificate
- Domicile Certificate
- Caste Certificate
- Income Certificate
- Character Certificate
- Property / House Tax Collection etc.
- Form 7x12 and Form 8A
- Electricity bill payment
- Dissemination of information about government schemes/ forms.
- Video conferencing facility is used for health, education, veterinary, agriculture etc purposes.

Other additional services being are as provided below

- Bio-data / Resume creation
- Taking passport size photographs using webcam and getting it printed.



- Internet surfing facilities for the citizens.
- Information on various services such as exam results etc.
- Print outs.

Factors Facilitating/Impeding the Production of Outputs

Since the VIS / e-Gram project is under the ownership of e-Gram Vishwagram Society which has adequate participation of members from various cadres and direct involvement of the Panchayat enabled smooth implementation of the project. The leadership of the chief minister of the state provides the ready buy in for the project.

Active involvement of the stakeholders such as Gram sabha / Panchayat etc. enables the creation of awareness about the benefits of the project in the mindset of the masses and hence promotes the entire project.

Lack of automation of various state departments for enabling

					T	OP TE	VCE	DEC 09									
			E-Gram S	E-Gram Software Certificates			Income	Electricity Bill collection		Others b2c		ROR			Total		
Sr.No	Sr.No Name of E-Gram Panchayat	Name of VCE	No.of Issues	Income	VCE Income (80%)	Income	VCE Income (100%)	No of bill issue	Income	VCE Income (80%)	Income	VCE Income (100%)	No of Issues (7/12 and 8a)	Income	VCE Income (40%)	VCE Income (F5+H5+ K5+M5+P	Remarks
1	2	3	4	5	6	1	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18
1	Kamli	Patel Nilesh	103	1030	824	350	350	1087	7609	6087.2	0	0	47	470	188	7449	1.1
2	Jotana	Gansyam Dave	36	360	288	1150	1150	787	5509	4407.2	0	0	68	680	272	6117	
3	Mulasan	Ghanshyam Dodiya	0	0	0	1100	1100	0	Û	0	5000	5000	1	10	4	6104	1121
4	Linch	Bharatkumar Manilal Thakor	0	0	0	300	300	1109	5545	4436	0	0	336	3360	1344	6080	
5	Panchot	Patel Gaumit Mahendrabhai	110	1100	880	680	680	706	3530	2824	0	0	351	3510	1404	5788	1.1.1
6	Ranasan	Patel Nikhilkumar	206	2060	1648	325	212	812	4060	3248	350	350	53	530	212	5670	
7	Modhera	Shrimali Hitesh	35	360	288	830	830	991	4955	3964	0	0	99	990	396	5478	1111
8	Tundav	Solanki Jitendra	67	670	536	650	650	750	5250	4200	0	0	3	30	12	5398	
9	Fudeda	Suthar Gautamkumar	104	1040	832	402	326	866	4330	3464	0	0	21	210	84	4706	1.111
10	Ladol	Patel Priyakant	379	3790	3032	324	152	277	1385	1108	0	0	73	730	292	4584	
11	Maktupur	Desai Mehul	58	580	464	500	500	600	4200	3360	0	0	55	550	220	4544	1121
12	Madhi	Patel Nikulkumar	219	2190	1752	156	223	585	2925	2340	0	0	0	0	0	4315	
13	Kukanada	Patel Drupadkumar	377	3770	3016	175	175	147	735	588	0	0	40	400	160	3939	
14	Gorisana	Chaudhary Prahaladbhai	28	280	224	2800	2800	0	0	0	800	800	3	30	12	3836	

integration with the VIS /e-Gram centres impedes online delivery of G2C services.

Extent of Operationalization of the project recommendations

The key project recommendations have been fully operationalised the details of which are provided below:

- Need Assessment Study and Database Creation:
 - A Need Assessment study was carried out by M/s Saline Area Vitalisation Enterprise Ltd. (SAVE) for the project.
 - Similarly Gujarat Infotech Ltd and Jayatma Informatics Pvt. Ltd were appointed for carrying out Family Survey and Data Entry work in order to create a comprehensive database of all the 100 villages under VIS project.
- Co-location of VIS Centers within Panchayat office:
 - For VIS project in 100 villages the space in the Panchayat Building were identified and used for setting up of the VIS centers.
 - In total there are 13,695 e-Gram centres including VIS centres operating across Gujarat from Village Panchayat offices.

Hardware	Details
PC / Desktop Computers	• P IV 3.0 GHz, 160 GB Hard Disk, 512 MB RAM, Internal CD Writer, 56 K Internal Modem
Speakers	• Desktop speakers (right & left), usb powered.
UPS	• 2 hrs. Battery Backup
Printer	• All in one HP PSC 1315 inkjet printer with capabilities for scanning, printing and photocopying.
Web Camera	• Quantum web camera, usb powered with 5MP
	Table 48 Hardware and Software Details- VIS





Category	Availability	Bandwidth	Total (in		
	for	Available	Mbps)		
Data	1300 Concurrent User	up to 256 Kbps/site	22 Mbps		
VoIP	200 Concurrent User	16 Kbps/site	3.2 Mbps		
Video Conference	35 Channel	384 Kbps/Channel	13.5 Mbps		
Video Broadcast Channel	1 Channel	4 Mbps	4 Mbps		

• ICT Components:

Table 49 Bandwidth Availability- VIS

- Hardware:
 - Under the VIS project the centres were equipped with PC, UPS, usb compatible web camera, desktop speakers, mic and colored ink jet printer.

The following hardware and peripherals have been supplied and installed in the 100 VIS villages by Acer India Pvt. Ltd.

However with the introduction of utility payment service of Gujarat Electricity Board , an additional Dot matrix printer was also provided for enabling the delivery of electricity bill payment receipt.

Under the e-Gram project most of these centres have also been provided the laser jet printers.

Networking:

Deloitte.

 Various networking options for VIS centres were tried and assessed such as n-Logue, GSWAN, dialup and RF connectivity. Since last mile connectivity and the presence of GSWAN was an issue, the other option of n-Logue was evaluated which was also not viable for VIS. Hence finally the BSNL dialup and RF connectivity were finalised for VIS centres.

- Dialup connectivity of BSNL was provided in another 7 villages of Mehsana district and 26 villages of Patan district under the e-Gram project.
- ADINO provided RF based connectivity with linkages with GSWAN for 10 villages of Mehsana district under the VIS project. The following hardware and peripherals had been installed and commissioned by ADENO for RF based connectivity:
 - 17 Tabular Painted Mast/Tower
 - 17 three metre. Galvanised Pole
 - 3 Base Station / Repeater Station VIP 110-24, 11 MB Ethernet Bridge
 - 7 Remote Station VIP 110-24, 2 MB Ethernet Bridge
 - Antenna System for Base/Remote
 - Cable System for Base/ Remote
- However at present all the VIS centres have been provided



Figure 32- Network



wireless connectivity using VSAT of M/s Airtel under the e-Gram project, with a bandwidth pool of 22Mbps.

- This e-Gram connectivity infrastructure provides broadband Internet connectivity to 13693 Gram Panchayats / e-Gram centres (including VIS centres). The project is implemented as a Government Owned Infrastructure Network wherein the whole facility would be handed over to the e-Gram Vishwagram Society in good working condition after 60 months (BOT Concept).
- The capability and bandwidth availability under the VSAT connectivity is provided in Table 49 and the network architecture for the same is depicted in Figure 32.
- For Gram Panchayats Government of India has provided parallel VSAT network of ISRO for video broadcasting and two way audio communications. The architecture for the same is depicted in Figure 33:

Software Applications

For enabling effective, efficient and transparent service delivery various applications are developed for VIS / eGram project and Panchayat Department. In order to ensure the effectiveness of the same, first the services were identified and then some of the process were re-engineered and master data was created wherever applicable.

Business Process Engineering

To enable electronic delivery of services, the services of the departments were re-engineered such as of ROR. In the clear case of issuance of Form 7x12, the remote authentication of the land record is being remotely signed by the Mamlatdars. Once the application is submitted in the web based application of ROR, from VIS / e-Gram centre, the Mamlatdar confirms his identity based on his figure print which he authenticates from the NIC server using biometric device. Once the authentication of the finger print is done, automatically the pre-stored



Figure 33 - Flow of information

signature of the mamlatdar is fetched from the NIC server and is used for signing and authenticating the document. The record is then printed on the pre-printed stationery provided by the department and it has a pre defined serial number printed on it. The broad illustration of flow of information for the process is depicted in Figure 33.

 Software / Applications for VIS/ e-Gram: The applications / softwares for VIS /e-Gram project has been categorised below:

VIS Centres / e-Gram Centres Applications:

Some of the applications running at the VIS / e-Gram Centres are as follows:

E-Gram software:

Second Parallel Network: Ku Band





Software development has been carried out by NIC using VB as the front end and Ms Access as the backend. The application is a standalone application deployed on the Windows XP based desktop computers of the centres. This application provides various services of the Panchayat such as:

- Birth Certificate
- Death Certificate
- Domicile Certificate
- Caste Certificate
- Income Certificate
- Character Certificate
- Property / House Tax Collection etc.
- RoR application (<u>www.ror.guj.nic.in</u>)

It is a web based interface wherein the citizen can obtain the basic record of rights i.e. Form 7x12 and Form 8A. RoR



fetches the records from the e-Dhara software 'BhulekhSoft'.

• Electricity bill application

GEB (Gujarat Electricity Board) has provided a DOS based application with basic details of the bill payee of that particular village in Ms Access to all the VIS /e-Gram centres. The application is used to generate bills for payment of electricity bills.

- Google website for e-Gram(<u>www.e-gram.co.in</u>)
 This site has been created by google and can be surfed in gujrati. The site has links to each village web-page hosting rural digital content on agriculture, education and health.
 The website also provides email facility for the eGram / VIS operators. It also acts as an informative website.
- Panchayat Application:

For Panchayat under VIS project e-Prima *application* was developed by NIC on .NET technology. The application provides Gujarati interface too. Logins are provided up to Village Panchayat Level. Provision is also made for District user to enter the data related to all talukas under that district and Taluka users can also enter data of the Village Panchayats under them. Currently the data is being sent to the Taluka office from where the information is being entered into the e-Prima application.

 e-Prima facilitates easy maintenance of records related to Income / expenditure of PRIs. Grants received and generated from centre, state, own fund, Works carried out by them will be input to the system. Output can be seen in the form of reports like total grant received, financial progress of schemes, scheme wise works completed present status etc. Information gathered can be helpful to monitor the works carried out for development works in PRIs. It also allows access to State

level officials like Development Commissioner, local fund officials, Secretaries etc.

- VCEs (Village Computer Entrepreneur):
 - VCEs for VIS / e-Gram project are appointed on the basis of PPP model wherein a Local computer savvy youth is selected by Local Gram Panchayat in presence of Talati, TDO and Technical support Person based on the laid down guidelines. The VCE operates the centre and shares the revenue with the department, Panchayat as the case may be.
 - This model is advantageous from the perspective of enabling self employment, providing efficient & effective service to the citizens /public and generating additional income for the Panchayats.
 - The indicative charges on various services are provided in Table 50:

Type of Transaction	Charge to Citizen	VCE's Share	Panchayat 's Share	Departme nt's Share	Utility Provider to pay
Services of Panchayat (Birth / Death record/ Property Tax etc.)	10	8	2	0	0
Utility bill collection	7	6	1	0	7
ROR services (such as online land records)	15	10	2	3	0

Table 50 - Indicative charges for various services

Though there is a general sharing of 80:20 between the VCE and GoG, however the sharing amount varies from Panchayat to Panchayat. For other services such as internet surfing, printouts etc the entire revenue is held by the VCE.

Based on the discussions with VCEs and the stakeholders a VCE earning varies from INR 2000 to INR 15000 per month with an average earning of VCE being around INR 3000.

- Capacity Building & Awareness Creation
 - Capacity Building: Training
 - IT orientation programme broadcast through BiSAG studio catering to VCE, Gram Mitra, Talati, TSTSP etc.
 - Basic training provided to all VCEs and have been retrained by TLE (Taluka Level Executive).
 - Technical support staff for training and ICT infrastructure related troubleshooting was appointed as per the *TSTSP* (*Technical Support and Training Staff*) project under the e-Gram project. This technical support staffs have been hired through an open tender and the project was awarded to HCL, NIIT, Aptech, CMS & ITI for different districts. The total manpower under this project was around 588. The services provided by TSTSP can be classified into two broad areas provided below:
 - Training to Village Computer Entrepreneur for
 - Operation and Upkeep of Centre
 - Hardware Management and Upkeep of Hardware
 - New Software and New version of existing software
 - Management of Small Business/ Office
 - How to roll out Government to Citizen Business to Citizen Service
 - Technical Support Service: This includes the following set of activities
 - Regular Monthly Visit at Gram Panchayat
 - Support to Computer Hardware Infrastructure
 - Support for Software & Deployment of new Software





- Configuration for Internet Connectivity through VSAT
- Loading and updating Anti-virus Software
- Regular Monthly Back-up
- MIS regular reporting
- Co-ordination with Hardware Supplier for Support
- Awareness Creation

Awareness about the project and its benefit was created by using a mix of media channels, workshops and word of mouth.

			1	able JTTEE charges	- VIS FIUJECC
Type of Transaction	Charge to Citizen	VCE's Share	Panchayat's Share	Department's Share	Utility Provider to pay
Services of Panchayat (Birth / Death record/ Property Tax etc.)	10	8	2	0	0
Utility bill collection	7	6	1	0	7
ROR services (such as online land records)	15	10	2	3	0

Effect of Outputs/Results on the Target Groups of the Project

The outputs/ results of the project on the target group are as follows:

• Information Dissemination: The project enabled dissemination of information about the various services / schemes of the state departments to the citizens.

- **Citizen Centric Service Delivery:** The project was successful in delivering various services including the G2C services to the citizens / rural masses.
- Bridging the Digital Divide: The project enabled the use of ICT in delivering services as well utilization of the same for other functions such as knowledge dissemination, internet surfing, emails etc.
- **Employment Opportunity:** Appointment of VCE on revenue sharing model created employment opportunities.
- Panchayat e-Enablement: As per the project the various records of Panchayats are being digitised as well as the Panchayat is moving towards emode with applications such as ePrima. The Panchayat officials were trained on various aspects of IT as well application and hence are being gradually accustomed to the e-environment.
- Facilitated spreading awareness among community for emerging issues like health, environment, industrialization, citizens' rights and access to information.

Unforeseen/Unintended Outputs Resultant from the Project There has not been any major unforeseen/ unintended outputs resultant from the project.

3.8.7 Project Sustainability Considerations

A multi-faceted approach to sustainability approach has been adopted for the project which not only caters to the financial aspect but the institutional / structural aspect too. Some of the key highlights to project sustainability include:

• In reference to Financial Sustainability an appropriate revenue sharing model has been devised for various services being offered from the VIS Centres. Indicative charges and revenue sharing for services delivered are provided Table 51:

Though there is a general sharing of 80:20 between the VCE and GoG, however the sharing amount varies from Panchayat to



Panchayat. For other services such as internet surfing, printouts etc the revenue earned is not shared and is withheld by the VCE only.

Based on the discussions with VCEs and the stakeholders a VCE earning varies from INR 2000 to INR 15000 per month depending on the village, with an average earning of VCE being around INR 3000.

e-Gram Vishwagram Society is also undertaking efforts to rollout more G2C and B2C services which would increase the financial sustainability of the VIS / e-Gram project:

Parameters	Before Project	After Project	
Information Dissemination	Low	Increased manifolds through VIS / e-Gram centres and e- Gram Portal.	
Efficiency in Service Delivery	Only through the Departments	Substantially increased and provided at the doorsteps of the citizens	
Bridging the Digital Divide	High	Substantially reduced as the services are now provided in 14000 villages, with a total of 13,695 centres.	
Panchayat e- Enablement	Low	Increasing exponentially with the digitization of records and usage of applications such as e-Prima, Ms Office etc.	
Awareness Creation	Limited	Substantially increased with the use of video conferencing / broadcasting.	

• Sustainability of an ICT /e-Governance depends on the

Table 53 Impact of the Project- VIS Project

institutional / structural backbone that supports the project. For VIS / e-Gram project appropriate structures such as e-Gram Vishwagram Society, TSTSP has been put in place which acts as the spine of the entire project and are the supporting pillars for sustaining the project.

Project Institutional Arrangements:

For VIS project an appropriate Governance Structure was formulated consisting of two committees i.e. Steering Committee and Implementation Committee. The composition of these committees is provided in Table 52:

Steering Committee	Implementation Committee
• Principal Secretary,	Deputy Director
Panchayat Department	(Development Commissioner)
• Secretary, Science &	• Under Secretary (IT), Science
Technology Department	& Technology Department
Development Commissioner	CS & General Manager
• Additional Secretary,	Services, GIL
Science & Technology	• Manager (Projects), GIL
Department:	• Director (e-Governance), GIL
• Director (e-Governance),	(Member Secretary)
GIL (Member Secretary)	

Table 52 - Governance Structure

This has helped in better co-ordination for implementation of the project, as Panchayat Department, Development Commissionerate and Science & Technology Department are important stakeholders for the implementation of the Project. However, now the ownership of the VIS (e-Gram) project has been handed over to eGram Vishwagram Society, an autonomous body, under the eGram Project. Political commitment at the highest level is ensured by bringing Gujarat's Chief Minister as Chairperson and under his


guidance, a monitoring cell is dedicated to coordinate the day-today progress of the E gram mission. The monitoring cell is further organized into:

- State-level monitoring: Principal Secretary (Department of Panchayat) along with Development Commissioner with help of Officer on Special Duty are seeing this Project at the State level
- District-level monitoring: District Development Officers along with eGram Nodal Officer are seeing the project at the District level.
- Taluka and village-level monitoring: Taluka Development
 Officer and Talati are responsible at Taluka and Village level for
 Project Implementation.

Extent of Commitment/Involvement/Ownership of Stakeholders:

There has been active involvement of all the stakeholders during

EVALUATING THE PROJECT

The project has been evaluated on five parameters viz. Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Results/Impacts and Sustainability which were further affirmed by subparameters illustrated in Table 54 that exhibits the evaluation in six categories of Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Moderately Satisfactory, Moderately Unsatisfactory, Unsatisfactory And Highly Unsatisfactory, accounting respectively for 6,5,4,3,2 and 1 points. The right most column substantiates the scores. The rating for each of the parameters was arrived at after averaging on the ratings for each of the sub-parameters. Similarly the overall evaluation rating were arrived at after averaging on the parameter ratings.

the course of the project ensuring adequate buy in.

Degree of Support Provided by the Government

The Government of Gujarat has provided support to e-Gram Vishwagram Society for their initiatives through financial help, deployment of experts, resolving issues, etc.

Efforts to Replicate Project Results

The VIS projects was implemented in 100 villages and owing to the benefits that the arose out of the project i.e. VIS / e-Gram, the same was replicated in around fourteen thousand villages under the e-Gram project.



Figure 34 - Evaluating the Project- Village Information System



KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE NEXT STEPS

PROJECT LEVEL RECOMMENDATION

One Common Interface

Currently the services being offered through the VIS / e-Gram project are using different applications on varied architecture. In order to provide a one stop solution and providing ease of usage of application there is a need for development of a single application which have linkages / integration with other applications.

Single source of information

The project should have a single application which would enable the creation of central repository. This single source of information would assist in better planning for undertaking development activities and taking proactive measures.

Backend Automation

In order to ensure the optimal use of ICT for the project, initiatives should be taken for speedy automation of the state departments whose services have to be integrated with the application of the project. The integration could be utilize the exchange of information in the form of xml which would have the least impact on the applications to be integrated and would ensure the localization of the applications as per the requirements of the departments and as well as serve a bigger picture of a common platform of all the services of state departments.

Help Desk

In order to provide support to stakeholders, the project needs to have a proper help desk to be put in place which would deal with queries of the citizens, VCEs, state departments etc.

BPR

For all the services to be delivered from the VIS / e-Gram centres appropriate BPR exercise should be undertaken. The BPR exercise should focus on practicality of implementation and should enable speedy delivery of services to the stakeholders.

Increase in Portfolio of services

The service portfolio should be increased to cover most of the G2C and B2C services. The more the number of services the better would be sustainability of the centres and also would result in increase in number of footfalls and satisfaction levels.

POLICY LEVEL RECOMMENDATIONS

CSC should be subsumed into VIS /e-Gram Centres

VSI / e-Gram Centres with its grass root level of implementation and involvement of stakeholders has a huge buy-in from the rural masses. Instead of creating CSCs and affecting the revenue stream and viability of a project, it is recommended that all the services should be provided through one project only. VSI / e-Gram would be a better option for this single project, since they have been in operation at the rural level long before the CSC project was initiated and better aware of the needs of the rural stakeholders.





3.8.8 Project Evaluation Matrix

Table 54 - Detailed	evaluation	matrix for	Village	Information	System
Table Ja - Delalleu	evaluation	matrix rui	Village	mormation	Jystelli

EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks			
RELEVANCE										
Needs of the beneficiary captured							 All the beneficiaries of the project have been identified such as citizens, VCEs, Panchayats, State government departments. However national level need integration still needs to be looked into i.e. flow of the required information for creation of National level data repository. All of the services launched through VIS / e-Gram project are based on the ever evolving need assessment carried out with different stakeholders like Panchayat group, VCEs, citizens, government department etc. As the needs arose from within the community their compatibility with the social and cultural norms was well tested before the introduction of any services. 			
Relevant to needs & expectations of beneficiary							• The services / processes are designed as per the needs of the stakeholders which however remain consistent across all the centres for G2C services but vary w.r.t. B2C and other value added services.			
Relevant to development priorities of Govt. of India							• VIS / e-Gram project is strongly aligned with the overall objective of the CSC (a national plan of the GOI under NeGP) and has the same priorities such as delivery of services to the citizens at their doorsteps, one stop solution for all the services of state departments, creation of employment opportunities, empowerment of the citizens, increase in transparency etc.			
Relevant to development priorities of concerned State Government							• The project is strongly aligned with the development priorities of the State Government in terms of establishment of SMART Governance, citizen empowerment, increase in transparency, bridging the digital divide etc.			
Identified problem has high incidence in area of focus		•					 The availability of data ensures adequate village level planning and development initiatives. Based on this data and the experience from the project, some of the Panchayats have become proactive and have laid down the roadmap for development initiatives to be undertaken for further span of years. Rural community faced problems in getting the required information for various schemes/ services of the government and also had to go through the hardships for obtaining requisite documents for the land record, birth, death etc. The 			



EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							project enables the delivery of such services and information to the rural community with ease, efficiency and thus relieving them from the clutches of the 'Babus'.
Correct & accurate identification of target stakeholders and/or correctly defined vulnerable groups							• Stakeholder segments including vulnerable groups such as rural citizens, farmers, land owners, village community, Panchayat officials etc have been correctly and accurately identified.
Adequacy of Government commitment to project							• Government is providing financial, technical and infrastructural assistant for the project. The financial assistance is provided through e-Gram Vishwagram Society, technical assistance is through appointment of vendors for connectivity, technical support etc. and infrastructure assistance is offered by providing space in gram Panchayat for setting up the centres and procurement of ICT components for the operation of the centres and the project in totality.
Project relevance to ICT4D focus under the project							 Use of applications such as RoR interface for e-Dhara, e-Gram software for Panchayat services, e-Prima for Panchayats etc. have improved the service delivery and operational efficiency of the project. Online availability of various Government Scheme related information including printed application forms helps in saving time and effort of visiting state departments. However in order to harness the complete benefits of ICT the backend automation and integration is yet to take place.
					EFFEC	TIVEN	ESS
Problem been stated correctly and distinctly							 Problems relating to ICT have been documented in the form of MIS and are being catered to separately such as NOC room for VSAT connectivity ensures the uptime of the connectivity and their helpdesk ensures the resolution of the problems and the queries that may arise. Apart from the above there is a need to lay down proper methodology for documentation and resolution of problems relating to services of other departments to be rendered such as reduction in delay of authentication of Form 7x12 by Mamlatdar.
Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries, users of the project are identified as stakeholders of the project							 Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries and users have been identified as stakeholders Roles and responsibilities of all stakeholders have been broadly defined. However the roles and responsibilities of all the stakeholders are not clearly demarcated and documented.





EVALUATION MATRIX	Highley Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
The assumptions, objectives, outputs and outcomes have been clearly articulated in measurable terms							 The project objectives have been clearly laid down with project outputs being defined quantitatively such as number of centres that have been setup, number of VCEs appointed, software applications developed, ICT infrastructure details, policies and guidelines for appointment of VCEs. All of the outcomes of the project have not been quantified and still remain subjective in nature. As such no concurrent evaluation or feedback study has been conducted to extract the exact nature of the outcomes
The linkages between objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was clear							• Logical linkages are present but are not clearly documented.
The project design allowed for flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment.							 Project design capable of adapting to and responding positively to most of the possible types of changes
Degree of support given by the Government towards integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme and other related projects							• As stated VIS / e-Gram project is supported by the e-Gram Vishwagram society and is strongly aligned with the overall objective of the CSC (a national plan of the GOI under NeGP).
Planning component of the project take into account the use of ICT for improved governance / service delivery in various areas through pilot initiatives, encouraging BPR, development local solutions and applications and encouragement of PPP model							 The planning component of the project (VIS /e-Gram) took into account the use of ICT for improved governance/ service through: Localization of solution: The solutions developed were based on the needs of the stakeholders, some of the interfaces have bi-lingual support and even the database provides bi-lingual information. Some kiosks are installed at Taluka level for the use of the citizens. BPR: In some cases BPR exercise has been undertaken for improvement in governance and service delivery such as in the case of Form 7x 12. PPP: A considerable planning on adoption of PPP model for various components of the project has been looked at, such as in the cases provided below: Software: developed by NIC. Internet Connectivity: Through Bharti Airtel using BOT model. Revenue model: VCEs operate the centres on a revenue sharing model. Technical Support & Training: Companies appointed under the TSTSP project such as HCL, Aptech, NIIT, CMS and ITI.
The adequacy of institutional arrangements in attaining the long-term objective of the project. Also the infrastructural, logistical, and financial implication of sustaining the							• For VIS project an appropriate Governance Structure was formulated consisting of two committees i.e. Steering Committee and Implementation Committee. However, now the ownership of the VIS (e-Gram) project has been handed over to eGram Vishwagram Society, an autonomous body, under the eGram Project.



EVALUATION MATRIX	Ніднгу Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
project objectives beyond the project duration/after completion of UNDP funding.							 Political commitment at the highest level is ensured by bringing Gujarat's Chief Minister as Chairperson and under his guidance, a monitoring cell is dedicated to coordinate the day-to-day progress of the E gram mission. The monitoring cell is further organized into State-level monitoring cell, District-level monitoring cell and Taluka & village-level monitoring cell. The ICT Infrastructure acquired for the project is being adequately maintained as the VSATs are being operated under the BOT model, hardware & peripherals are being supported by the vendors and the TSTSP, application support is being provided by NIC & TSTSP. Financial arrangements are adequate to sustain the infrastructure arrangements during the initial duration of the project as most of the financial implications are being borne by the government. However in order to ensure the sustainability of the infrastructure from the revenues of the centres a considerable effort in increasing the services and hence the revenue at the centres needs to be taken. In order to ensure the same the government has already put in place an informative state portal and planning for state wide portal application for the centres is under process for integration of the services of various departments.
Project's linkages, liaison, coordination and impact upon related activities under NeGP being implemented in the country.							• The project has substantial linkages with various initiatives NeGP such as integration with various departmental applications. NIC Data centre is currently being used for replication of data and formation of comprehensive database. Wherever possible the feasibility of GSWAN was first analyzed.
The project's assistance, relationship, relevance to and coordination with the pre- existing Project management system and staff							• Uses both the pre-existing management system as well as staff effectively and coordinates with them effectively.
Clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various institutional arrangements for overall programme management and implementation and the level of coordination between relevant players							 Roles and responsibilities of all of the stakeholders were defined clearly however clear demarcation and documentation of the same needs to be carried out.
Risk assessment and management of the project							• Though most of risks were identified and mitigation plan was carried out, however there is no standard approach for the same being followed.
Efforts of stakeholders in support of the implementation of the project							• The project proposal submitted to UNDP was documented in coordination with most of the stakeholders but complete buy-in of these stakeholders was not taken.





Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							 Most of the stakeholders have extended support as envisaged from them during the proposal stage. However now under the e-Gram project there is an adequate support from the stakeholders due to formation of adequate institutional structure i.e. e-Gram Vishwagram Society which has participation right from the CM to the grass root level of Panchayats.
Extent of conflict of interest either between stakeholders involved in the project or with outside agencies.							 The e-Gram project and the CSC project are conceptualized on the similar kind of revenue model and services; hence clear demarcation of the basket of services for each of the project has not been laid out. As per the discussions with the TSTSP of Mehsana, VCEs and district Panchayat official of statistical division the government is working out on a model of bifurcating services between the two projects. As per the model it is likely that G2C services would be delivered by the VIS / e-Gram projects and B2C services would be delivered by the CSC projects. However even though the CSC project started in 2008, the CSC centres at Panchayat level are not completely operationalised with Implementing Agency like 3i Infotech Ltd have already backed out from the project which further strikes the intellect to imagine the subsuming of CSCs into e-Gram at the Panchayat level.
					EFF	ICIENC	Y
Was a formal work plan made at the start of the project to determine the timeframe in which activities would be performed							• Basic work plan for broad level milestone was prepared
Were resources made available to the project implementation agencies in accordance with the requirements of the work plan							• Adequate resources such as VCEs, TSTSPs etc. were provided for the project.
Extent of deviation in the project implementation in so far as timelines is concerned.							• VIS project was planned to be completed within a year, however the project was delayed and its operationalisation extended to around 3 years with final completion around December 2008.
Responsiveness of the project management to such deviations and flexibility to deploy resources							• Management was responsive in taking steps to correct the course of implementation by identifying various solutions such as in case of connectivity.



Evaluation matrix	Нібні v Satisfactory	SATISFACTORY	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks		
Were any systems, processes, manuals etc made to govern the activities in the project among the different stakeholders							• The roles and responsibilities were documented into manuals however certain guidelines such as appointment of VCEs were defined.		
Extent to which Results Based Management has been used							• There has been regular meeting of e-Gram Vishwagram Society and the VCEs, TSTSPs etc. for monitoring the progress of the project. The various services being delivered are regularly monitored to identify areas of improvement.		
Whether there was adequacy of steps taken to resolve any conflict of interest in or due to the project							• No major efforts have been taken so far, however there is a possibility of some demarcation to be laid down by the government.		
RESULTS/IMPACTS									
Whether the project has produced its desired immediate outputs							 Majority (50% to less than 75%) of the immediate outputs achieved i.e. all the 100 VIS centres are operational with adequate IT infrastructure and support but there is a considerable lag in the introduction of more G2C and B2C services at these centres. Training has been provided to all the VCEs and most of the Panchayat officials. 		
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, use of the new outputs as against the traditional options)							 Most of the intended beneficiaries utilized the services delivered under the VIS project in cases where they needed similar service. 		
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, percentage of the target population)							• There is an ever increasing number of footfalls form the services being offered from these centres which is likely to have a manifold growth with the introduction of more services.		
Extent of drop-outs from usage of the outputs by the intended beneficiaries							• There is a marginal drop-out in usage of the services of the centres in case the service is required on an urgent basis such as if there is a delay in authentication of RoRs from Mamlatdar, the citizen directly goes to the Taluka office for the records.		
Are there any unforeseen/ unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups							 No unintended effect caused on the target groups. A few unforeseen positive effects seen are the increase in awareness levels of the citizens and their adoption to the changed e-environment and demand for more such services. 		
Extent of the project results on the target beneficiaries in terms of (a) Citizen-Centric							Of all the areas relevant to the project, excellence has been achieved in significant number of the cases as highlighted below:		





EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	SATISFACTORY	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Service Delivery, (b) Capacity Building, (c) Change Management, (d) Business Process Re-engineering, (f) Public Private Partnership, (g) Bridging the Digital Divide, and (h) Knowledge and Experience Sharing							 Bridging the Digital Divide: Availability and access of information and services using online / offline mode. The village masses are able to avail services of the department such as Form 7x12, Form 8A, Birth Certificate, forms for various other services, knowledge dissemination using video broadcasting / video conferencing. Citizen-Centric Service Delivery: VIS / e-Gram centres provides multiple citizen centric services near the doorsteps of the villagers such as Birth Certificate, Death Certificate, Domicile Certificate etc. Public Private Partnership: For VIS / e-Gram project implementation is being done along the PPP model where operations are outsourced but the government retains the control over the activities such as in the cases: Software: developed by NIC. Internet Connectivity: Through Bharti Airtel using BOT model. Revenue model: VCEs operate the centres on a revenue sharing model. Technical Support & Training: Companies appointed under the TSTSP project such as HCL, Aptech, NIIT, CMS and ITI. Capacity Building: The following capacity building measures have been undertaken: IT orientation programme broadcast through BiSAG studio catering to VCE, Talati, TSTSP etc. Basic training provided to all VCEs and have been re-trained by TLE (Taluka Level Executive). Technical support staff for training and ICT infrastructure related troubleshooting was appointed as per the TSTSP (Technical Support and Training Staff) project under the e-Gram project. This technical support staffs have been hired through an open tender and the project was avarded to HCL, NIIT, Aptech, CMS & ITI for different districts. The total manpower under this project was around 588. The services provided by TSTSP can be classified into two broad areas i.e. providing technical support and training.



EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							• Knowledge/Experience Sharing: Usage of video conferencing / video broadcast facility is used for health, education, veterinary, agriculture etc purposes.
Extent of the project impact on the target groups in terms of (a) governance (improved efficiency, transparency and accountability), (b) citizen-centric service delivery (advantages of cost, time and convenience), (c) rural livelihoods (number of jobs, extent and sufficiency of employment), and (d) women's empowerment (increased knowledge, and use of the same to voice their concerns).							 Excellence has been achieved in significant number of cases in following relevant areas: Governance (facilitating the process of governance by ensuring accountability at various levels, involvement of key stakeholders as collaborators) Citizen centric service delivery for various G2C services. Rural livelihood by employing VCEs for operating the VIS centres. Women's Empowerment: By providing weightage to women in the criteria for appointment VCEs.
Extent of significance of the project impact on the development of the region/country							 Indicators for development were defined during project conceptualization stage
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by marginalized communities							• Most of the marginalized communities have utilized the project output in areas where they needed similar service
Extent to which capacities have been built in stakeholders during the project							 Capacities of all stakeholders build up to perform activities assigned to / expected of them
					SUSTA	INABIL	.ITY
Extent of ownership of stakeholders in the project							• Complete ownership of all the 'implementing and operating' stakeholders in the project including e-Gram Vishwagram Society and the VCEs.
Degree of support given by the Government in integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme							• Project objectives and goals are in line with NeGP programme and delivers most of G2C services as per the CSC plan.
Extent of availability of inputs/resources required for the project (people, finances, infrastructure, equipments)							• Resources in all the four area - people, finances, infrastructure, equipments were available during the major duration of the project
Have any revenue streams been defined in the project to make it self-sustaining							• Revenue stream has been defined in terms of fees structure for various services being rendered by VIS /e-Gram centres.
Extent of success of such pre-defined							• Considerable amount of revenue is being generated. However the revenue has





Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
revenue streams							been less than the predicted figure, due to lack of services.
Extent to which inventory of the assets created out of the grants received in the project have been properly maintained and transferred to the beneficiaries							• Assets received under the project such as PCs, Printers, web cameras etc. have been maintained well and the VCEs have been trained in using and maintaining these assets.
Degree of collaboration that has developed among stakeholders during the project							 Stakeholders were significantly involved during operational and strategic decision making.
Extent to which government is willing to finance the project after its completion of the UNDP funding							• Government is currently funding the project under e-Gram project.



3.9 Mahiti Manthana

	Table 56 Introduction- Mahiti Manthana
Project Title	Mahiti Manthana - ICT enabled Resource Centres for Mahila Samakya
Proponent Organisation	IT for Change (ITfC)
Implementation State	Karnataka
Target Site for Pilot Project	3 taluks of Mysore district (Nanjangud, Hunsur and Periyapatna taluks)
Theme of Project	Women Empowerment
Target Population	1,335,841
Time Required to Implement Project	Two years
Name(s) of Partner Agencies	Mahila Samakya - Karnataka



IMPACT OF THE PROJECT IN BRIEF

The Mahiti Manthana project is established in collaboration of Mahila Samakhya (MS) - an established grassroots initiative of the Government of India for empowering socially and economically disadvantaged women in rural areas through self-help group activity. At the village level, MS works by mobilising women and initiating sanghas (self help groups).

OBJECTIVE AREAS	OUTPUTS	OUTCOMES
Knowledge and capacity building needs of sangha women	 115 community video screenings and 72 weeks of radio on air on various subjects MSK staff are trained in entire production process An exclusive portal designed for knowledge and experience sharing 	• Increase in information and knowledge to rural and socially disadvantaged women about various important topics such as health, legal rights, education, social problems, gender, governance, collective strength
Communication, identity-building and information and communication needs of sangha women and adolescent girls	 5 village level Namma Mahiti Kendras and 2 Taluk hubs established In-house video producing and community screening facilities established 	 Empowerment of socially disadvantaged women through the use of ICTs Increased participation of women in local politics and governance Tremendous increase in confidence of women and their acceptability as decision makers by men
Building and sustaining capacities of Mahila Samkhya Karnataka resource persons	 Multi layered production process involving resource persons & staff of Mahila samakhya established One broadcast channel for half hour programme established for sangha women 	 Women are now able to collect produce and disseminate information through ICT tools Sangha's at the village level are geared to take over entire operations of NMKs fully
Strengthening linkages of Government and other agencies	• MSK staff and sangha women interact with Government departments for gathering important information on government services and programs	 Local community have access to information and certain services of the front line departments Front line Government departments slowly coaxed to become accountable and transparent Direct linkage and relationship established between MSK staff, sangha women and department officers





3.9.1 Project Background

Mahiti Manthana - The Concept

The Mahiti Manthana project was a response to a felt need of an established grassroots program - **Mahila Samakhya (MS)** - which was set up in 1989 to empower socially and economically disadvantaged rural women through self-help group activity. Mahila Samakhya (MS) is a program of the Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of Education, Government of India that works in 10 states in 60 districts, reaching more than 9,000 villages.

The Mahila Samakhya - Karnataka (MSK)

Mahila Samakhya combines the unparalleled reach of the government with high quality localized innovation at the grassroots level. In Karnataka, Mahila Samakhya works in 9 districts. Mahila Samakhya's empowerment strategy addresses the following theme areas - education, health, legal literacy, livelihoods, selfgovernance and community linkages to government institutions. Specific activities in the districts, under these themes correspond to local needs.

The strategy of Mahila Samakhya is to invest in setting up women's self help groups - sanghas - oriented towards empowerment activity, and support them organisationally and through knowledge and training resources. In many talukas, federations of sanghas have been set up. The vision is to eventually move from intensive hand-holding, towards enabling sanghas and federations that are relatively mature to become autonomous.

Need for Information and Communication Technology

The information and communication (I & C) processes in MSK were woven around activities that were human resource and human interaction intensive. However, it was felt that the empowerment goals of an organisation like MSK required the creative energies of human processes; meetings, training programmes, workshops and melas, which can constitute the core of knowledge and capacity transfer, allowing for personalised learning, open debates and consolidation of strategies.

Key Issues

At various levels, the organization experienced gaps and bottlenecks in information transfer, capacity building as well as in effective intra-organisational communication. Some of the key issues were:

- Limited repertoire of innovative training aids and of knowledge resources that are easily usable yet very effective;
- Priority to consolidate sangha activity in older villages and move on to newer ones, leading to thinning of human resource intensity of the intervention;
- Need for keeping taluka level federations motivated and equipped for them to support village level activity;
- The absence of organic linkages between women candidates in PRIs and sangha women despite great potential for common learning platforms;
- The limitations of the existing structure and processes, owing to resource constraints, to have sustained interactions with young girls/ kishoris, despite realization of this being the cutting edge priority area;
- Felt need for effective intra-organizational flow of information between and across village, taluka, district levels and the state office;
- Expressed need of sangha women to have greater access to information about government schemes and services and frustration with lack of responsiveness, transparency and accountability at the offices of the government; and

- Professional fatigue of grassroots facilitators and trainers.
- Plateau-ing of transformatory processes due to lack of process innovation.

3.9.2 Project Strategic Objectives

The Mahiti Mathana project was situated within the context of the activity of Mahila Samakhya, Karnataka, in Mysore district, within the overall goal of strengthening the information and communication processes of sanghas and federations. The project identified 7 specific objectives:

- Meet knowledge and capacity needs of sangha women;
- Address communication and identity-building needs of sangha women;
- Address information and communication needs of adolescent girls (kishoris);
- Build and sustain capacities of MSK Resource Persons;
- Enhance intra-organizational Information and Communication (I & C) processes and the Knowledge Management (KM) activity of MSK;
- Provide effective access to legal information/ expertise /help, as well as legal redressal and access to justice through a helpline, information management support, and linkages to processes for formal and informal justice dispensation; and
- Strengthen linkages to governmental and other agencies.

Seven components of the project

Corresponding to seven specific objectives, mentioned above, the

Mahiti Manthana project has 7 project components:

- Meeting knowledge and capacity needs of sangha women;
- Addressing communication and identity building needs of *sangha* women;
- Meeting I&C needs of adolescent girls (kishories);
- Building and sustaining the capacities of MSK resource persons;
- Enhancing intra-organizational I&C processes and knowledge management activity of MSK;
- Running helpline for information and access to redressal and justice; and
- Strengthening linkages to outside agencies

3.9.3 Project Relevance Inputs

Identification of Information and Services Needs

Information and services needs were identified through a detailed needs assessment exercise including:

- A detailed study MSK's documents;
- Discussions with MSK's personnel at various levels; and
- Focussed group discussions with snagha and federation members and kishories.

The major information and service needs identified were the following:

- 1. Greater access to information about government schemes and services;
- 2. Effective intra-organizational flow of information between and across village, taluka, district levels and the state office; and

Slakenoluer	Role(s) Played						
ICT for Change	Proponent organization: conceptualize, plan, design, manage and monitor the project.						
Mahila Samkhua Karnataka	Process ownership; personnel involvement; domain expertise; internal evaluation; sustaining the						
Mainta Sankiiya - Karnataka	project after pilot and replicating at other locations						
District Administration	Support linkages of sanghas with Govt. department; provide content for project activities;						
Panchayati Raj Institutions	Provide support to MSK's Resource centre activity						
Other government departments	Share information and content with sanghas						
	Table 57 Stakeholders and their Roles						



3. Training aids and knowledge resources;

3.9.4 Project Effectiveness Inputs

Project Stakeholders and Envisaged Roles

Table 57 brings out the different stakeholders involved and the respective roles they played.

Risks and Mitigation Strategies

The following represent the risks and their respective mitigation strategies.

• Acceptance of ICT at MSK level - MSK is an organisation which is highly human resource intensive in its work strategy. There is a lot of use of non digital platforms for its information and communication needs. The level of acceptance of ICTs as their own development strategy and claiming ownership over it was seen as a primary risk.

To mitigate this, participatory methodologies and structures which required regular consultations with them coaxing them to move towards ICT usage, with intensive hand-holding and demonstration of contextual benefits of use of ICTs were used.

• Socio-culture aspects and acceptance of ICT at Sangha level -Since sangha comprises mostly of the marginalised communities who are mostly illiterate, acceptance of ICTs was an even greater challenge at this level. Socio cultural aspects such as caste and patriarchy were anticipated as potential risks for the intervention.

Mitigation strategy was to be participatory from the start, create ownership structures at the village level and initiate collective and community oriented processes.

3.9.5 Project Efficiency Inputs

Activities Performed in different Dimensions of Intervention:

Table 58 summarises the main activities being performed in the different components of intervention and Table 59 summaries the theme wise activities performed.

 Table 58 Component-wise activities conducted during the project

<u>Theme</u>	Activities
	• Ownership of the Namma Mahiti Kendras (NMK - Our Information Centres) was ensured through an intensive participatory process of taking the consent of the sangha women and guaranteeing their participation at all stages of the interventions. This process also involved ascertaining the support of the village opinion leaders;
<u>Tele-</u> <u>centres</u>	• The decision makers of the activities of the NMK were the NMK Management Committee - this committee is constituted by all sangha women in the village including women from non-MSK sanghas;
	 Sangha women were built as the change agents in the village, challenging traditional patriarchal structures; and Leadership opportunities were created for young girls in the village, one young girl was selected to run the NMK, she then became the vital link between the sangha, the larger village community and the relevant government departments.
<u>Video</u>	 In the production process, development experience was prioritised over technical expertise. This was built on the premise that technical expertise could be demystified and learnt easily whereas it was important to establish the development approach at the start; The processes drew from the development experience of MSK to produce rich content; Simple formats of interviews with supportive visuals, role plays and success stories were used as part of the demystification process;



Theme	Activities
	• Powerful content that was relevant, informative, rooted and gender sensitive became to core of the videos produced; and
	MSK and sangha involvement at various levels established a participatory process of production.
	• A partnership with the Karnataka State Open University provided a platform on Gyan Vani FM for Kelu Sakhi's broadcast weekly;
	• The identity of the collective is strengthened by the use of this mass medium;
<u>Radio</u>	• Women's voices were validated when they found a legitimate space for themselves on radio;
	• Collective listening provided a collective learning space where individual experiences contributed to peer learning; and
	• A feedback process ensures that opinions and suggestions are incorporated into Kelu Sakhi.

Project Management Approach

Considering the complexities for managing project in such community based projects seeking participatory processes and change and involving other partner grassroots NGOs, project management was done to work within broad activity plans and time lines, while doing regular course-correction through collaborative processes. Within this overall context, the project was able to stick to broad timelines to a certain extend and a year's extension was sought and obtained to finish the project.

Extent of Usage of Local Expertise

The project seeks assistance of local experts in the area of content development, delivery and interaction with Government organizations:

- Content for radio and video components was created by local expertise, resource persons and Sangha women; and
- Support from Government frontline functionaries at the village level/gram Panchayat level/Taluk level.

Table 59 Theme wise activities performed

<u>Theme</u>	Activities
Bridging the Digital Divide	As Mahiti Manthana is an empowerment driven project, all the infrastructure and products and the ownership is of women in rural community contributing towards bridging the digital divide. • Kelu Sakhi - weekly broadcast - Collective listening at Sangha level • Village level NMKs • Video - Collective viewing at village
Citizen-Centric Service Delivery	 Village level NMKs cater to the needs of the community Kelu sakhi - produces programmes to generate awareness about citizenship Video - Front line department profiles are viewed by the community to seek higher accountability
Public Private Partnership	No private sector players was involved in the project at this stage, since there did not seem to be so much interest of this sector in the groups targeted which had very low purchasing power.
Capacity Building	Capacity building and demystifying technologies is a big part of the project. Multi layer capacity building has happened to MSK functionaries as well as Sangha women & Kishoris. Effort is to build enough in-house capacity among MSK functionaries for them to internalise and absorb the MM project activities in their regular work.



Theme	Activities
	One of the major issues with absorption of new ICTs in existing knowledge processes is the disruptions in existing
Change Management	nierarchies it causes. On one side the top-down relationship between MSK functionaries and sangha women change,
	while there are also subtle changes within MSK layers as junior members often take to technologies faster.
	With use of ICTs many knowledge processes in MSK changes, and the transition was carefully managed. (for instance,
Business Process Re-	to take a very simple example, meeting information now came over radio rather than postcards. Also weekly
engineering	meetings started getting organized around collective radio listening, putting a powerful knowledge context in the
	middle of each meeting
	• A portal designed exclusively for knowledge/experience sharing. www.content-commons.in
Knowledge/Experience	Research outputs have been shared
Sharing	• Process documents have been written for dissemination in the form of a coffee table book (in the process)
	• Regular workshops are held for sharing outcomes, as well through presentations at other workshops

Management Processes Followed during the Project

The project management methodology comprised of detailed planning, constant monitoring of ground activities and linkages across levels of geography. The iterative learning approach of management was adopted to ensure that the learning on the processes and technologies used is adapted for the next iteration.

The project monitoring was planned to be supported through a project tracking application as a module of the Content Management system. Information to be recorded over following data elements-

- Village/ taluka / district
- Sangha/ Mahasangha
- Sangha members
- Meetings
- Training programs
- Content viewing
- Content generation
- ICT interaction with Government and other agencies
- ICT deployment
- ICT usage

The activities, efforts/ resources, costs and timelines would be recorded for each of the above as applicable. Mid-line and end-line assessments are planned to understand the impact of the project on the constituency and to also enable meaningful collection of project metrics.

Extent of Usage of RBM and Performance Indicators

Step by step follow up of RBM and performance indicator is done. This helped in preparing realistic work plan with appropriate activities and timeline.

3.9.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated

Results/ impacts generated through NMKs

The project generated the following results and impacts:

- 5 village level centers and 2 Taluk hubs established;
- Each NMK covers 5 -6 villages as focussed outreach;
- Each NMK accessed by the community for information and services of the front line departments including entitlements and schemes;





- NMK MC revitalises participation in public spheres increasing the citizen centric approach. Rather than just services, more focus on obligations and rights;
- Front line departments slowly coaxed to become accountable and transparent;
- Reduction in cost for community, time saving, travel issues
- Speed of information delivery etc.; and
- Establishment of 7 management committees for NMKs that are dominated by sangha women had made strong empowerment impact.

Results/ impacts generated through Video

The project generated the following results and impacts:

- Multi layered production process involving, Mahiti Manthana team, grassroots staff of Mahila samakhya, Resource persons of Mahila samakhya established;
- Video screenings become a part of MSK events;
- Cluster resource person video resource kit is institutionalised;
- Collective viewing process at Sangha level established;
- Sanghas become the nodes for accessing community screenings;
- 17 in-house productions;
- 3 MSK staff direct films;
- 65 screenings so far in a year; and
- 115 screenings last year.

Results/ impacts generated through Radio

The project generated the following results and impacts:

- One broadcast channel for half hour programme established for sangha women;
- Mahila samakhya grassroots staff trained to record at field level and strategies in place for aiding them in taking up the entire production process;
- Collective listening process established at sangha level;

- Sangha women begin the know how to ideate for their own programmes;
- Feedback mechanism using mobile phone and as part of all Mahila Samakhya events established;
- 72 weeks on air (end November 2007 to end April 2008);
- Large number of programmes on a variety of subjects health, legal rights, education, social problems, gender, governance, collective strength etc.; and
- Over 150 folk songs recorded and broadcast.

Factors Facilitating/Impeding the Production of Outputs

Factors facilitating the production of outputs are:

- Participatory processes;
- Being a pilot project there was scope to review and re design;
- Having a mix of different expertise in the Organisation;





- Openness of MSK and Sangha women to explore ICTs; and
- Presence of a pool of leadership level women from the Sangha and the federation.

Factors impeding the production of outputs

Production of outputs is impeded by the following factors:

- Transfers of MSK personnel who were already trained and contributed to the project outputs;
- Time allocation by MSK for the project amidst their monthly mandate of implementing various projects and programmes;
- Seasonal agricultural livelihood pursuits of women made them unavailable for months together; and
- Caste and political activity around the project at community level.

Extent of Operationalisation of the project recommendations

The extent of operationalization of the project recommendations are illustrated below:

- Collaboration with local educational radio channels like Karnataka State Open University is a possibility present for many agencies;
- Radio and video content brings about legitimacy and vibrancy to the grassroots processes and the investment to do so is low;
- Participatory and ownership processes interwoven with ICT strategies create a sustainable intervention;
- Kishoris who have been pushed out of the system of education at an early age can pick up ICT skills easily; and
- Frontline departments respond better to audio visual sharing aiding in transparency.

Unforeseen/Unintended Outputs Resultant from the Project

Radio- The unintended outputs that have resulted due to radio are:

- Reach of Kelu sakhi broadcast is more than one district and we have observed layers of secondary audience who are enthused by the programme; and
- Non MS Sanghas and women who were not organised in Sanghas sought MSK to form them under MSK federations after listening to Kelu sakhi.

Video- The unintended outputs that have resulted due to video are:

- MSK units from other districts wanted the videos to share with their communities; and
- Community screenings have opened up requests from men at the village level to know more about local governance issues and department profiles.

NMK- The unintended outputs that have resulted due to NMK are:

- Requests from neighbouring villages has made us design outreach programme;
- Young women who were trained at the center have been appointed at block level agencies and Gram Panchayats; and
- Political parties saw the potential reach to community through NMK and have approached during elections.

3.9.7 Project Sustainability Considerations

The considerations to make the project sustainable are as follows:

- Collaboration with Mahila Samakhya Karnataka, an initiative of GoI, makes the project to a great extent scalable & sustainable;
- Handover process to MSK Mysore has been initiated;
- Sangha's at the village level are geared to take over running of NMKs fully; and
- ITfC has succeeded in evolving into a Center for Community Informatics and Development at Mysore, through which it will support many such ICTD interventions and organisations in the region.



Project Institutional Arrangements

The institutional arrangements of the project are mentioned below:

- Robust partnership with MSK institutionalised from the State level MS;
- Monthly meeting at district level for planning and reviewing of the project interventions; and
- Designing contextualized content jointly.

Degree of support provided by the Government to replicate project effort

EVALUATING THE PROJECT

The project has been evaluated on five parameters viz. Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Results/Impacts and Sustainability which were further affirmed by sub-parameters illustrated in Table 58 that exhibits the evaluation in six categories of Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Moderately Satisfactory, Moderately Unsatisfactory, Unsatisfactory And Highly Unsatisfactory, accounting respectively for 6,5,4,3,2 and 1 points. The right most column substantiates the scores. The rating for each of the parameters was arrived at after averaging on the ratings for each of the sub-parameters. Similarly the overall evaluation rating were arrived at after averaging on the parameter ratings.





Figure 36 Evaluating the Project- MAHITI MANTHANA





KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE NEXT STEPS

CONSTITUTION OR A GUIDING MANUAL FOR EACH SHG

As of now each SHG has a resolution note prepared at the time of their formation which works as a charter for the group. However, as volumes increase, a guiding document would be required for stakeholders to lay out roles and responsibilities for the participating stakeholders and to generally guide the SHG's operations, direction, issue resolution, conflict management etc.

SUSTAINABLE BUSINESS MODEL FOR VKCS

The current revenue model of VKCs is not adequate to support their sustenance post expiry of funding from external sources. Its revenue mainly consists of contribution from members, charges for printing, electricity bill collection & submission and computer classes which are quite low as compared to their expenses including salaries and operational & maintenance cost. Additional sources of revenue need to be contemplated. These could come from providing additional services through VKCs, information and content services such as information (agriculture, education, handicraft etc.) to farmers & other users using ICLIS, marketing etc.

Locally produced value-added products for example in food processing and their marketing, harnessing local crafts and the like could also be considered. ICT channels could be used for sale and promotion of these products and associated services. However, if such services are to be used, quality certification and standardization for above mentioned food processing products would be required too.

Ask a doctor service could also be provided through VKCs by tie-up with specialists whose details are already available with VIDIYAL (such as Veterinary doctors, eye specialists and hospitals).

STRATEGY FOR SUSTAINING VKCS AFTER IMPLEMENTATION OF CSCS IN THE AREA

As most of the services currently being provided by VKCs would also come under the purview of CSCs which would be supported by government, sustenance of VKCs may become a concern. Appropriate steps should be taken up to mitigate this situation. For example, VKCs may contract with government to run CSCs in their area using the existing infrastructure and resources or provide services that would not be covered under CSCs and that can make VKCs more popular than CSCs.

ALIGNMENT WITH GOVT. SCHEMES

The VKCs are currently not aligned to government schemes. It is suggested that such alignment options be explored to take advantage of effects of synergy that may thereby result.

COLLABORATION WITH GOVERNMENT AGENCIES

This could be done for support in areas such as information, funding, technical knowledge, cooperation etc.

REDUCING DEPENDENCE ON PRODUCTS SUCH AS SKYPE FOR VIDEO CONFERENCING AND COMMUNICATION

Alternatives such as g-Talk, Yahoo messenger etc. should also be explored as recent development at national level suggest that in near future Skype and similar services may be restricted due to various commercial and security implications.

DEVELOPMENT OF A PORTAL FOR PROMOTION, ADVERTISEMENT AND SERVICE DELIVERY

Construction and operationalisation of a comprehensive portal is suggested that would serve as the gateway for all information of activities related to the project plus other benefits that could be conceived while designing the same.





3.9.8 Project Evaluation Matrix

							Table 60 Detailed evaluation matrix for ICT for Women Conciliation Center	
Evaluation matrix	Нібні Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks	
RELEVANCE								
Needs of the beneficiary captured							 Needs of All Possible beneficiary groups (including citizens, Govt. departments and private players) captured Formal procedure (questionnaire, meetings, discussion forums, etc.). 	
Relevant to needs & expectations of beneficiary							 High correlation between citizens' needs and project objectives Objectives and design captures needs of all beneficiary groups The project is suitable and capable to incorporate new or up-coming needs / expectations of beneficiaries even during execution period 	
Relevant to development priorities of Govt. of India							 Project designed to meet and fully aligned towards development priorities identified in Govt. of India's budget 	
Relevant to development priorities of concerned State Government							 Project designed to meet and fully aligned towards development priorities identified in Govt. of Karnataka's budget 	
Identified problem has high incidence in area of focus							• The services provided are relevant to most of the citizens / residents of the pilot locations	
Correct & accurate identification of target stakeholders and/or correctly defined vulnerable groups							• Precise and comprehensive definitions for stakeholders available	
Adequacy of Government commitment							• The project is a part of Government structure (Mahila Samakhya) and its execution has been assigned to dedicated agency (MSK)	
Project relevance to ICT4D focus under the project							• The project brings significant improvement / development of majority of citizens through information availability, access of resources and services	
EFFECTIVENESS								





Evaluation matrix	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Problem been stated correctly and distinctly							Problem clearly defined with no or little scope of misunderstanding
Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries, users of the project are identified as stakeholders of the project							 Roles and responsibilities and other details of each stakeholder group also identified Interaction and needs of each stakeholder group identified
The assumptions, objectives, outputs and outcomes have been clearly articulated in measurable terms							• Objectives and outcomes identified and defined in a clear and unambiguous manner. All assumptions articulated but impact is not clearly articulated
The linkages between objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was clear							• Logical linkages present but not documented
The project design allowed for flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment.							• Project design capable of adapting to and responding positively to most of the possible types of changes.
Degree of support given by the Government towards integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme and other related projects							• The project objectives are already part of the national e-governance plan
Planning component of the project take into account the use of ICT for improved governance / service delivery in various areas through pilot initiatives, encouraging BPR, development local solutions and applications and encouragement of PPP model	•						 Sophisticated ICT applications and tools used Localization of solution: ICT tools are user friendly and easy in handling for local users. BPR: In-depth BPR to improve the convenience of users, reduce time & effort drastically, make available information & service any-time to anybody from any-where - practically
The adequacy of institutional arrangements in attaining the long-term objective of the project. Also the infrastructural, logistical, and financial implication of sustaining the project objectives beyond the project duration/after completion of UNDP funding.							• Infrastructure arrangement adequate for the entire planned duration
Project's linkages, liaison, coordination and impact upon related activities under NeGP being implemented in the country.							• The project derives its objectives from NeGP and directly contributes in achieving NeGP's goals and objectives



EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks	
The project's assistance, relationship, relevance to and coordination with the pre- existing Project management system and staff							• Uses the pre-existing management system effectively and coordinates with them effectively.	
Clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various institutional arrangements for overall programme management and implementation and the level of coordination between relevant players							• Roles and responsibilities of all the institutional arrangements defined, in a formal and legally binding manner	
Risk assessment and management of the project							Proper risk assessment done periodically during the entire project duration.Risk mitigation planned to certain extent	
Efforts of stakeholders in support of the implementation of the project							Assessment of efforts of stakeholders done through formal procedure	
Extent of conflict of interest either between stakeholders involved in the project or with outside agencies.							Certain degree of conflict of interest may be present.Basic procedure to handle exceptions present	
					EFFIC	IENCY		
Was a formal workplan made at the start of the project to determine the timeframe in which activities would be performed				 Detailed workplan prepared for all activities along with the resources responsible for performing the activities. Date wise timelines defined for each activity Gannt chart (or similar work plan charts) also prepared for better visual impact and monitoring 				
Were resources made available to the project implementation agencies in accordance with the requirements of the workplan							• Almost all the resource requirement fulfilled as per plan	
Extent of deviation in the project implementation in so far as timelines is concerned.							• Most of the major milestones have been achieved as per the work plan	
Responsiveness of the project management to such deviations and flexibility to deploy resources							• Management taking necessary steps to reduce the delay by bring in additional resources, doing parallel work, or other corrective measures	





Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Were any systems, processes, manuals etc made to govern the activities in the project among the different stakeholders							• Though instructions are clear and specific but not comprehensive
Extent to which Results Based Management has been used							Continuous RBM under usage
Whether there was adequacy of steps taken to resolve any conflict of interest in or due to the project							• Adequate steps taken at right time to resolve all conflict of interest situations
				RE	SULTS	/IMPA(CTS
Whether the project has produced its desired immediate outputs							• More than 90% of immediate outputs achieved including all the major outputs
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, use of the new outputs as against the traditional options)							• Sizable portion of citizens used the project output through Bangalore One
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, percentage of the target population)							• Sizable portion of citizens utilized the services through Bangalore One
Extent of drop-outs from usage of the outputs by the intended beneficiaries							 Significantly less drop-out from usage of outputs by the intended beneficiaries
Are there any unforeseen/ unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups							Yes it helped in reduction of corruption
Extent of the project results on the target beneficiaries in terms of (a) Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, (b) Capacity Building, (c) Change Management, (d) Business Process Re-engineering, (f) Public Private Partnership, (g) Bridging the Digital Divide, and (h) Knowledge and Experience Sharing		•					• Of all the areas relevant to the project, excellence has been achieved in most of the cases



EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Μοderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks	
Extent of the project impact on the target groups in terms of (a) governance (improved efficiency, transparency and accountability), (b) citizen-centric service delivery (advantages of cost, time and convenience), (c) rural livelihoods (number of jobs, extent and sufficiency of employment), and (d) women's empowerment (increased knowledge, and use of the same to voice their concerns).			•				• Of all the areas relevant to the project, excellence has been achieved in majority of the cases	
Extent of significance of the project impact on the development of the region/country							Significant development of the region	
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by marginalized communities							• No separate study conducted however sizable portion of such communities utilized the services	
Extent to which capacities have been built in stakeholders during the project							• Capacities of most of the stakeholders (atleast the main stakeholders) built up to atleast perform the necessary activities assigned to / expected of them	
				SL	JSTAIN	IABILIT	ГҮ	
Extent of ownership of stakeholders in the project							Complete ownership of all the stakeholders in the project	
Degree of support given by the Government in integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme							• The project derives its objectives from NeGP	
Extent of availability of inputs/resources required for the project (people, finances, infrastructure, equipments)							• Resources or commitment available for the entire planned duration	
Have any revenue streams been defined in the project to make it self-sustaining							• Revenue stream defined with proper basis and justification with taking into consideration possible revenue generation scope	
Extent of success of such pre-defined revenue streams							• Significant achievement	





Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	SATISFACTORY	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent to which inventory of the assets created out of the grants received in the project have been properly maintained and transferred to the beneficiaries							• Planned maintenance of the assets by well trained personnel
Degree of collaboration that has developed among stakeholders during the project							 Significant collaboration among stakeholders for operations as well as decision making related to the project
Extent to which government is willing to finance the project after its completion of the UNDP funding							• Government(through MSK) has taken up the project and is planning for its roll-out and extension in the state



3.10 Enterprise Development Service

	Table 61 Project Introduction- EDS	
Droject Title	Creating Rural Entrepreneurs through ICT-enabled Enterprise	
	Development Services	
Proponent Organisation	Development Alternatives (DA) - TARAhaat	
Implementation State	Punjab, M.P., U.P.	
Target Site for Pilot Project	Bathinda Cluster, Punjab & Tikamgarh Cluster, Bundelkhand	
Theme of Project	Rural Livelihoods	
Target Population	50,00,000 - 3 yrs post pilot included	
Project Cost		
Funding Required for Project	Rs. 14,961,500	÷.,
Time Required to Implement Project	24 months	1

IMPACT OF THE PROJECT IN BRIEF

Enterprise Development Services (EDS) create rural entrepreneurs through ICT enabled enterprise development services' focuses on providing entrepreneurship opportunities to youth, women, self-help groups, landless and small land holders. The project targeted at enhancing the capacity and skills of rural youth and women through complete solutions and holistic enterprise packages in the non-traditional agriculture and rural manufacturing sectors thereby creating large numbers of sustainable livelihoods.

OBJECTIVE AREAS	OUTPUTS	OUTCOMES
Provide opportunities for rural entrepreneurship through complete enterprise solutions, leading to the creation of large numbers of local jobs.	Development of training programmes Enterprise Development Programme (EDP) & Enterprise Package (EP)	In addition to have understanding business set-up, Potential entrepreneurs / trainees received hands on technical experience in the business they select, through an internship programme.
Develop a localised delivery mechanism that links to government and bank entitlement schemes for the potential entrepreneur and supports the TARAkendra owner to ensure sustainability of the model.	Training of around a thousand of entrepreneurs by linking them to markets, building their capacity through training and mentoring, helping them to access finance and providing them with knowledge sharing platforms.	Created employment opportunities, typically hiring 3-5 people to work in the enterprise. Strengthened existing linkages in the areas of finance and governance through the PPP, lead to more transparent and responsive policies and services in the long term.
Develop powerful delivery engines and support framework to create multiple enterprise packages that can be customised easily for a new geography or client group	EP and EDP for technical training plus market and financial linkages, an FAQ Database on best practices and solutions, an 'Ask the Expert' service for on-going business support	Improved standard of living of the entrepreneurs' families, typically enhancing their health, education levels and providing a safety net. The wealth they create had a trickledown effect within the local community over a period of time.





3.10.1 Project Background

Introduction to the Project

The groups that face the greatest difficulty in getting remunerative employment in the developing world are young people (ages 15 to 24) and women. Its especially serious problem for individuals who come from poor families, who tend to have little education; the consequence is low productivity jobs with very little pay, keeping them and their families trapped in the vicious cycle of poverty.

This is certainly true of India, where 15 million jobs are required outside the agriculture and government sectors every year. This immense economic need has a huge impact on society and the environment as individuals, especially youth; migrate to larger towns and cities, in search of employment. Unsustainable consumption practices are also leading to the rapid depletion of natural resources.

Both the Government of India and NGOs have been focusing on rural entrepreneurship as a key route to solving the need for economic and social empowerment. Small, local enterprises together account for the largest number of jobs in the country and have shown the positive impact that they can have on individuals and communities. The limitations of existing programmes have been the lack of meaningful and viable enterprise options and the inadequacy of market, technical and financial linkages. Most important, the need for capacity building support throughout an enterprises' life cycle, a facility that was largely non-existent.

Information and Communication Technology (ICT) has the possibility to remove some of the constraints as it substantially enhances the delivery of services at much lower cost than current resource intensive solutions. Sporadic initiatives across the country have shown the potential of ICT as a tool. This project on "Creating Rural Entrepreneurs through ICT enabled Enterprise Development Services" intends to design and test, in a systematic fashion, an entrepreneurship development mechanism using ICT that can be rolled out on a large scale.

Project Description

This project focused on **rural livelihoods** for youth, women, SHGs, landless and small land holders. While extensive research had been carried out on micro and mini enterprise development and a wealth of information and training material already exists in this area, there were very few examples of successful and sustainable programmes. This was primarily due to the cost of delivery of training, lack of market linkages and lack of on-going business support mechanisms available to first time entrepreneurs.

The comprehensive ICT based Enterprise Development Service (EDS) proposed would support an entrepreneur through every stage of the business life cycle. The components of the Entrepreneurship Development Service are:

- An Enterprise Package for technical training plus market and financial linkages
- An Entrepreneurship Development Programme in order to understand business set-up.
- An FAQ Database on best practices and solutions.
- An Ask the Expert service for on-going business support

Technical Architecture of Project

The web site www.tarahaat.com provides access to customer services as well as the internal network management system. In addition to the website, rich content and computer based training modules are provided to the centres through CDs. The additional applications such as the FAQ database, Ask the Expert and business yellow pages, required for EDS, will be integrated in to the existing system.

Figure 39 shows the data flow.



Software: The website and TARAhaat Management System are based on a Linux platform using Zope as the application software and Python as the programming language. My SQL was used as the database. The system had an off-line module in the TARAkendra with data passing to and fro in batch mode. This minimized the impact of unreliable connectivity.

Hardware: Existing infrastructure in TARAhaat's local offices and the TARAkendras were leveraged to deliver the packages of EDS developed. The TARAkendras were typically equipped with 3 Computers, Printer, Scanner, Webcam and Backup power supply.

Networking: LAN connectivity with all the computers within the TARAkendra were available, while external connectivity was achieved using dial-up or VSATs. All TARAhaat systems were web based allowing easy access from dispersed TARAkendras and external locations.

Delivery Channels: TARAhaat was envisaged will use the existing network of TARAkendras to deliver EDS. Access to the service will



Figure 39 Enterprise Development Service- Data Flow Diagram



be provided through off-line CBT modules and on-line knowledge based applications. The EDS is expected to be fully integrated into the existing systems and processes.

Figure 38 graphically represents the EDS process flow.

- Entrepreneur comes to the local TARAkendra through outreach/mobilisation activities.
- Entrepreneur is shown an introductory multi-media presentation on entrepreneurship opportunities.
- Entrepreneur details are recorded by the TARAkendra and logged in the MIS system.
- Entrepreneur details are sent to the TARAguru through the Ask the Expert system.
- TARAguru advises on the suitability of the enterprise package and suggests what the entrepreneur should do next.



- Entrepreneur attends training sessions using CBT and face to face interaction with the TARAguru. NISG Enabling Rural Entrepreneurs through Enterprise Development
- Entrepreneur evaluates the market for his/her self using the EDS learning through local market research, searching the FAQ database, Peer-to-Peer information network and the Internet.
- Entrepreneur attends hands-on training on the management skills, technical tools and production processes.
- Entrepreneur clears his/her doubts by interacting through e-mail or on-line with the TARAguru from the local TARAkendra.
- TARAkendra helps the entrepreneur set up the enterprise including links to technology suppliers and applications to financial institutions.
- Entrepreneur resolves on-going problems (technical, marketing, financial or managerial) through the FAQ, Ask the Expert and Peer-to-Peer information system.

Benefits of the Project:

The EDS was designed to incorporate best practice and where possible use existing content. ICT was being used as a powerful tool to implement EDS to deliver the following benefits:

- Provides consistent quality of delivery
- Offers rich learner-centric audio-video and interactive content
- Encourages self-paced learning
- Makes services accessible and affordable in remote villages and towns
- Reduces dramatically the cost of delivering services
- Makes marketing of local products and services easier through
 - easy communication
 - $\circ~$ access to information
 - \circ advertising
 - \circ e-commerce
- Replicates using modular

• Scales to larger audiences

3.10.2 Project Strategic Objectives

The Vision of this project is to enhance the capacity and skills of rural youth and women through complete solutions and holistic enterprise packages in the non-traditional agriculture and rural manufacturing sectors thereby creating large numbers of sustainable livelihoods.

With its focus on youth, women, Self Help Groups (SHGs), landless and small land holders, this project will use ICT to:

- Provide opportunities for rural entrepreneurship through complete enterprise solutions, leading to the creation of large numbers of local jobs.
- Develop a localised delivery mechanism that links to government and bank entitlement schemes for the potential entrepreneur and supports the TARAkendra owner to ensure sustainability of the model.
- Develop powerful delivery engines and support framework to create multiple enterprise packages that can be customised easily for a new geography or client group

3.10.3 Project Relevance Inputs

Needs Assessment Study was carried out with the following objectives:

- Assessment of the existing system of rural enterprise development
- In-depth market and value chain analysis of selected enterprises (Poultry farming and Micro-Concrete Roofing (MCR)



- Assessment of business practices adopted by rural entrepreneurs and identification of need gaps in enterprise training and entrepreneurship development
- Assessment of training and support required by both successful & struggling entrepreneurs (established businesses and start-ups)
- Identification of training needs of persons wanting to become entrepreneurs
- Identification of the triggers and barriers to entrepreneurship development (micro and mini) in the rural areas
- Assessment of the willingness and suitability of the ICT medium to the EDSS

The Needs Assessment Study was carried out in four broad phases. The first phase involved extensive literature survey and discussions with experts from leading entrepreneurship development institutes in the country. Some of the key findings of this phase point out to the lack of comprehensive enterprise and development support and particularly the need of support for existing small businesses to grow, diversify and manage their businesses more efficiently.

In the second phase, a massive exercise was undertaken to identify

the two enterprises that would serve as the enterprise portfolio for the pilot phase of the project. The same survey, carried out across numerous groups of people including key informants such as rural elites, local political leaders and popular youth to the marginalized including women, poor farmers, SC/STs and so on, also revealed a lot of the rural realities of enterprise selection, set-up and management. The two enterprises that have been selected for these two categories, respectively, are Poultry farming and Micro Concrete Roofing. These two enterprises have been selected keeping in mind the concerns of the rural community and the limitations of rural infrastructure. Some key criteria that these two enterprises satisfy include local consumption and relatively small gestation periods. Both these enterprises are also well suited to training delivery via the ICT medium.

The third phase was a particularly important phase wherein indepth value chain and market analyses were carried out for the two identified enterprises. The markets and business management practices specific to poultry and MCR enterprises respectively were studied carefully in both the selected regions of Punjab and Bundelkhand. Several tricks of the trade were learnt and key

Stakeholder	Role(s) Played
TARAkendras	Mobilize entrepreneurs and provide initial exposure to Enterprise options. Provide EDS training in the local language. Hand-hold the set-up of the enterprise and facilitate finance access for the entrepreneur. Provide on-going business support service to entrepreneurs. Provide feedback to TARAhaat for continuous improvement.
Territory Office Team	Field test and roll out of service. Scale the service within the territory catchment area. Build capacity, provide operational and marketing support, monitor and control delivery and operations of the TARAkendras.
Domain Experts	Provide basic, tested business plan and description of enterprise. Provide a comprehensive trainers guide for TARAgurus and TARAkendras. Train the trainers. Provide the initial FAQ database.
TARAgurus	Train the entrepreneurs. Respond to the Ask the Expert questions and enrich the FAQ database.
DA Head Office Team	Design services with domain experts. Develop partnerships with suppliers & buyers for the enterprise Table 63 Stakeholders and their Roles- EDS





observations of vulnerabilities, risk mitigation techniques and scope for improvement of business efficiency were assessed. All these learning have been incorporated and formed the core of the enterprise training package that is currently in the process of development. The idea behind this survey was to take a bottom-up approach to enterprise development.

The fourth and final phase was an equally critical phase where we shifted focus from the enterprise to the entrepreneur. The primary objective of the last stage of the needs assessment survey was to understand the needs of an entrepreneur in terms of personal skills development, managerial skills development and motivation. This survey enabled to identify the triggers and barriers to entrepreneurship development in rural areas and sketch a general profile of entrepreneurs. It helped to pin point specific gaps in entrepreneurship training, which have been detailed in the subsequent sections.

The needs assessment study was thus completed in four phases and the findings form the core of the design and development of this project. One key lesson from the entire study was that along with enterprise and entrepreneurship development, entrepreneurship support to existing businesses in the areas of efficient management and growth is a critical need. Therefore, to emphasize our focus on both these aspects, we have renamed the project to Enterprise Development and Support Services (EDSS).

3.10.4 Project Effectiveness Inputs

Project Stakeholders and Envisaged Roles

Table 63 brings out the different stakeholders involved and the respective roles they played.

Risks and Mitigation Strategies

Deloitte

In order to accelerate the dissemination of the programme institutional alliances must be forged to leverage DA / TARAhaat's

direct marketing programmes. Institutions such as the NYK and many civil society organizations (SHG network) are being mobilized to leverage their resources and members as participants in the recruitment of potential trainees. Programmes are in place.

Many trainees are not able to fulfill the criteria / eligibility norms set by the credit institutions. As a result the conversion rate of potential candidates for training versus actual trainees is relatively low. In order to improve conversion rates a two-pronged approach has been initiated. Improved screening of potential candidates for training has been introduced. While this increases the mobilisation time it filters out clients who have little potential to become entrepreneurs.

3.10.5 Project Efficiency Inputs

Activities Performed in different Dimensions of Intervention: Figure 41 summarises the main activities being performed in the



different themes of intervention.

Project Management Approach

The project governance structure is shown in Figure 40.

At every level of the organization targets and objectives are monitored to ensure that the objectives of the EDS programme are met. Roles and responsibilities are clearly defined and performance is monitored on a continuing basis. As appropriate weekly, fortnightly and monthly meeting provide inputs for programme enhancement and refinement as appropriate.

Extent of Usage of Local Expertise

Local consultants, called TARAgurus, are experts on a number of business or industry specific issues. They act as consultants providing assistance to existing and potential entrepreneurs. Typical services provided include assistance on writing project proposal, advice on marketing, financing and so on. A network of these will be established as the programme expands geographically.

TARAgurus travel extensively to provide support to the EDS trained entrepreneurs. Since the locations served are remote, maintaining on the ground quality assurance programmes is logistically difficult and expensive. Accordingly DA / TARAhaat will develop a robust web-based support system to support and manage the TARAguru Network. Funding for this is outside the ambit of the current UNDP / NISG programme

Extent of Usage of RBM and Performance Indicators

Step by step follow up of RBM and performance indicator is done. This helped in preparing realistic work plan with appropriate activities and timeline

3.10.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated

Factors Facilitating/Impeding the Production of Outputs

EDS is designed to be a set of computer based training modules combined with knowledge management tools and FAQ databases. Delivery will be a mix of interactive classroom training and facilitated self-learning. The ICT tools that will be developed for use will be:

- Computer Based Training (CBT)
- E-mail
- Internet
- Searchable FAQ Database
- Knowledge Management Tool
- Automatic Alerts
- Business Yellow Pages
- TARAhaat Management System (software)

Theme	Activities
Bridging the Digital Divide	 Made services accessible and affordable in remote villages and towns
	Made marketing of local products and services easier
	Offers rich learner-centric audio-video and interactive content
Citizen-Centric Service	The TARAkendra is the principal point of delivery for the EDS services. The EDP and EP training imparted in a
Delivery	classroom environment through LCD projectors and laptops.



Theme	Activities
Public Private Partnership	PPP concept was implemented by imparting the training through the support of panchayat/local NGO/Govt. Institutes like School etc. Under this model, the community mobilization is done by the partners
Capacity Building	 The management structure was built around the functions - product development, operations, marketing, training and support services During the implementation of the project, main focus was institutional tie-ups. The field and marketing executives was little difficult to manage with a wide geographic spread of services - so the there were additional dependency on to existing human resources at the field level Domain specific training was provided to the TARAgurus; product and mobilization training to the centre personnel In addition the changes to the systems and processes was incorporated into the TARAkendra and Territory Office manuals and a specific training conducted on them. Training on the enterprise package was integrated with entrepreneurship development and provided to customers by the TARAguru using a mix of classroom, CBT and hands-on lab training.
Change Management	In the TARAhaat context, EDS was part of the overall mission of the organization. In addition, new services meant additional financial benefit to the franchisee and the related TARAhaat profit centre and were usually very well received by them. To overcome any resistance, involvement and communication was built in from different functions and personnel through the Product Development Life Cycle.
Business Process Reengineering	BPR was carried out in terms of traditional way of training delivery to the entrepreneur. The comprehensive and unique ICT based EDSS proposed supported entrepreneurs through every stage of the business life cycle.
Knowledge/Experience Sharing	Every aspect of this programme has incorporated mechanisms for direct feedback from the local communities served by EDS. Since the project was conceived by Development Alternatives-TARAhaat as a market driven programme, to meet the real needs of rural communities, the EDS has been designed via bottom up inputs from potential beneficiaries and service providers within the rural communities. Product development was preceded by an extensive phase of community based needs assessment and subsequently, at every key stage of product development, active piloting or dialogue with community stakeholders has taken place to ensure a useful and relevant end product.
Others	NA

Figure 41 Theme-Based Activities for EDS

Factors impeding the production of outputs

The rigorous, community inputs, field testing and extensive research and analysis were critical in developing viable and effective solutions to many of the issues identified. Many issues, however, remain outside the control of civil society institutions and are dependent on third party solutions. In most instances DA / TARAhaat found that discussions and demonstrations of the service with potential alliance partners and service providers, for example



local financial and government institutions, resulted in a willingness to work with the programme and expedite or assist potential entrepreneurs in establishing their enterprise. However it should be noted that solutions remain highly dependent on the personal goodwill and understanding of individuals, and it will take time to build institutional acceptance of the programme.

It is therefore anticipated that while many of the issues noted below will continue to influence the rate at which the programme will scale up, over time, as evidenced over the past year in Bundelkhand, the local institutional support for the EDS programme will grow and will begin to mitigate or even negate the negative impact of these external factors. In addition mitigating new strategies are in place, where practicable, to ensure that the targets established for the programme are met." Over this past year we have become increasingly sceptical that there is a widespread commitment to change the status quo. However we remain committed to keep on attempting to make a difference and generating a groundswell to support change Key impediments include:

- Lack of transparency of rural credit markets, and concomitant entrepreneur cynicism is a major barrier to establishing and even expanding, small enterprises.
- Conservative socioeconomic structure in Bundelkhand, and in most rural communities in India, dampens overall demand for the programme.
- Access to credit (lack of credit provider institutions such as MFI's)
- Pervasive lack of credit worthiness of many aspiring rural entrepreneurs.
- Bureaucratic structure remains complex and often beyond the capacity of rural individuals to negotiate the complexities of starting a new enterprise.
- Identification of potential & serious trainees remains a challenge.

• Existence of parallel training institutions that deliver free or subsidized training (so called welfare approach rather than sustainable approach).

Extent of Operationalisation of the project recommendations

The extent of operationalisation of the project recommendations is demonstrated from the following facts:

- The rural community is unwilling to accept wholly ICT based programme delivery. Despite the programmes ability to respond to individual students questions, through the FAQ and AtE services, they demand a human face. They welcome the use of ICT to provide multimedia training; they view it as an enabler and a pedagogic tool, but remain comfortable and engaged in a facilitator driven classroom environment. While over time individual expectations will change, especially as a generation used to the use of computer technology grows, the programme, if it is to achieve its scale and viability objectives MUST accommodate this demand.
- More livelihood opportunities have to be explored and additional EP packages created to effectively meet the demand for this service from divergent demographic segments. In order to accelerate the geographic spread of the programme, partnerships and alliances with appropriate technical training institutions must be forged to ensure that trainees receive suitable technical training close to home.
- The EDS programme was conceived as a permanent programme and once funding support ceases the robust business model in place will support continued product and geographic expansion. Accordingly there is no exit strategy. In reality we have an expansion and growth strategy.
- During the past year TARAhaat's network of TARAkendras has expanded out of its initial geographic footprint of Punjab, Haryana and Bundelkhand into Jharkhand, Bihar, Chhattisgarh and outside the Bundelkhand districts of Madhya Pradesh and


Uttar Pradesh. This expanding network of TARAkendras provides a powerful platform for the delivery of EDS services. In addition the expansion of alliance partners also presents a major expansion opportunity independent of the geographic reach of the TARAkendra Network.

Effect of Outputs/Results on the Target Groups of the Project

The project contributed significantly to

- Poverty reduction of communities living in and around the vicinity of the project
- Participation Contribution of the project of the local communities in natural resource management and decision making processes
- Gender sensitivity or equal participation of men and women and boys and girls in decision making processes

3.10.7 Project Sustainability Considerations

The pilot project created a framework, engines and tool kit for delivery as a base for future enterprise packages that can be rolled out much faster through different networks. The strength of the EDS was the extensive use of ICT that allows easy replication.

While the focus of this pilot was on women, SHGs, unemployed youth, landless and small land holders, the experience from this project and the enterprise packages can be adapted to meet the needs of other audiences e.g. other CIGs as well as contextualised to other geographies. The methodology and software developed can also be applied to develop numerous other enterprise packages having a multiplier effect on the number of rural enterprises created. Development Alternatives and TARAhaat seems to be committed to developing these enterprises as business plans and integrating them with the national expansion of TARAhaat. This is quite clear from the fact that EDP training services has already been launched in Bihar.

The product was received very positively by other organizations and CSRs operating in rural areas. They offer the potential of future partnerships and alliances to accelerate the rollout. During the past year EDS activities had been expanded to Chhatarpur, Datia and Tikamgarh districts of Madhya Pradesh. EDS activities are now functional in five districts of Bundelkhand expanded from the two districts namely Jhansi and Lalitpur last year. Some of this expansion had been done by mobilising other institutions to offer the services through the PPP model which provides a dynamic approach for a rapid replication and expansion

Based on the work done to date the following sources of revenue enable the EDS programme to be sustainable over the long run.

- Training Fees and support charges
- Advertisement & Sponsorships
- Fees to suppliers / vendors of enterprises set up
- Consultancy fees to TARAguru (entrepreneur mentor)
- User Charges for web based support services
- Revenue share from entrepreneur's product/service marketed through the network of TARAhaat's kiosks
- User Charges for web based support services
- Consultancy fees and support charges from other training organizations

Apart from above sources, following consideration must be taken in order to sustain the verve of EDS activities -

- Implementing Result based community mobilization approach
- Manage the EDS service as an SBU
- Identifying other Organizations/Institutions which are working on the promotion of self employment/entrepreneurship and



developments.

collaborating with them so that additional financial support can be ensured

Since the DA / TARAhaat strategy calls for significant enhancements and expansion of the EDS programme after NISG-UNDP funding is over, new sources for investment would have to be sourced to supplement the cash flow from operations to fund these

EVALUATING THE PROJECT

The project has been evaluated on five parameters viz. Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Results/Impacts and Sustainability which were further affirmed by subparameters illustrated in Table 64 that exhibits the evaluation in six categories of Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Moderately Satisfactory, Moderately Unsatisfactory, Unsatisfactory And Highly Unsatisfactory, accounting respectively for 6,5,4,3,2 and 1 points. The right most column substantiates the scores. The rating for each of the parameters was arrived at after averaging on the ratings for each of the sub-parameters. Similarly the overall evaluation rating were arrived at after averaging on the parameter ratings.



Figure 42 Evaluating the Project- EDS





KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE NEXT STEPS

NATIONAL LEVEL TIE-UP WITH BANKING AND FINANCIAL INSTITUTION

For the financial assistance of the entrepreneur, individual currently needs to approach the banking and financial institution on case to case basis. It is understood that in many of these cases, TARAhaat need to intervene to facilitate the processing of the same. Instead of approaching case to case basis, it is suggested to have national level tie up with some of the banking and financial institutions. This is also important from the perspective of future roll-out of the project in the other regions.

INITIATE THE PARTNERSHIP WITH OTHER INSTITUTIONS /ORGANIZATIONs WHO DELIVER TRAININGS

Though there are few cases of the tie up observed with some of the institutions for delivery of the trainings, there is further scope to tie up with the institutions/organizations which deliver trainings in rural areas. This way EDP/EP package would have better reach and coverage.

ANIMATION WORK IN THE VIDEO IS SOMEWHAT STATIC, IT SHOULD BE MADE MORE DYNAMIC AND LIVELY

The animation work in the video of the training package looks to be somewhat static; this could be further improved and made more dynamic and lively.

BANDWIDTH FOR REPLICATION OF THE SAME

There should be a concrete plan for replication of the project to other parts of the country. In addition to the funding arrangements, measures should be taken in terms of institutional structure and capacity building of TARAhaat so as to handle the roll-out of the project.

TO HAVE A BETTER REACH TIE UP SHOULD BE DONE WITH GOVT. AGENCY- for delivery through panchayat/CSC

The initiative is currently not aligned to government schemes. It is suggested that such alignment options be explored to take advantage of effects of synergy that may thereby result.

3.10.8 Project Evaluation Matrix



Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							civil society organization which are already working in the similar area.All these data and information were analyzed and captured in the Needs Assessment Report
Relevant to needs & expectations of beneficiary							 Segmentation was done however no formal procedure of segmentation seems to be carried out Offerings are tailored for these needs captured for various segments
Relevant to development priorities of Govt. of India			•				 It is aligned with developmental priorities of Gol Skill development initiative however not aligned to any specific development programme of the Government It is aligned to the activities of some of the following ministries: Ministry of Labour and Employment - Skill Enhancement and upgradation MSME - promotion of enterprises and small businesses in rural areas Ministry of Women & Child Development - Empowerment of women, SHG etc.
Relevant to development priorities of concerned State Government							• Though there is no policy level dialogue with stake government to work in collaboration, activities of the project is in line with the various state Govt program of small business development, women empowerment etc.
Identified problem has high incidence in area of focus		•					 Frequent and continuous incidences reported in the area. There are various organizations already working in the area though there were very few success stories. However the project approach was completely different in terms of working with the individuals specifically after training supports, mentoring and follow ups etc. Substantial number of individuals of the targeted vulnerable group (rural women) are affected.
Correct & accurate identification of target stakeholders and/or correctly defined vulnerable groups							 Stakeholder segments including vulnerable groups such as tribal communities, minority groups etc. For identification of the stakeholders, the inputs were received from village opinion leaders, civil society organizations and other local institutions which are already working in the similar areas.
Adequacy of Government commitment to project							 The government commitment to the project was very poor. The proper cooperation and financial assistance were not received as per the expectations. The specific cases may be mentioned for banking and financial institutions and local Govt. agencies The national level alliance could have been worked out for facilitating the





EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Project relevance to ICT4D focus under the project							 The project was completely conceptualized based on ICT4D focus. The output of the projects EDP, EP, Web based support services etc are completely ICT based. ICT was used to remove some of the constraints as it substantially enhances delivery of services at much lower cost than earlier resource intensive solutions.
				E	FFECT	IVENES	SS
Problem been stated correctly and distinctly							 Problems identified, defined and documented Validation of identified problems was done internally within DA groups and externally through the consultation workshop with the stakeholders largely with civil society organizations.
Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries, users of the project are identified as stakeholders of the project							 Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries and users have been identified as stakeholders Roles and responsibilities of all stakeholders have been detailed out in the DPR Formally documented in the proposal during project conceptualization stage
The assumptions, objectives, outputs and outcomes have been clearly articulated in measurable terms							 Objectives, outputs and outcomes identified. Certain assumptions articulated Subjective measurement terms in use Defined and monitored through RBM
The linkages between objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was clear							• Logical linkages present but not documented.
The project design allowed for flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment.							 Project design capable of adapting to and responding positively to most of the possible types of changes. For example, the location for the pilot implementation was initially decided as Tikamgarh district of MP. However, looking at the positive linkages of areas the same was implemented successfully in Lalitpur and Jahansi.
Degree of support given by the Government towards integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme and other related projects							 Project objectives and goals aligned with developmental priorities of Gol Skill development initiative There were recent initiatives by DA to integrate some of the similar initiatives by other organizations including Govt. agencies However more needs be done on propagating the concepts of the project



EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Μοderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							across different level
Planning component of the project take into account the use of ICT for improved governance / service delivery in various areas through pilot initiatives, encouraging BPR, development local solutions and applications and encouragement of PPP model		•					 All the products /output of the project were developed in the local language and local context. BPR was done in terms complete revamp of traditional way of delivering training program. As a PPP model partnership was done with Nehru Yuva Kendra under Ministry of Youth affairs and District Industry Centre under MSME, Employment Exchange Burro under Ministry of labour and employment.
The adequacy of institutional arrangements in attaining the long-term objective of the project. Also the infrastructural, logistical, and financial implication of sustaining the project objectives beyond the project duration/after completion of UNDP funding.			•				 Utilization of DAs network and partnering with new partners for attaining long-term goals The output of the project has been used as part of Tarahaat business model for long term sustainability. Project infrastructure and knowledge resources created under the project is in use. For long term sustainability of the project a small amount is charged from the participants. In training manuals, sponsorships and advertisement from corporate are encouraged.
Project's linkages, liaison, coordination and impact upon related activities under NeGP being implemented in the country.							• No linkages with the NeGP were established.
The project's assistance, relationship, relevance to and coordination with the pre- existing Project management system and staff							 The existing delivery channels of DA group were used The output of the project is integrated with other products of DA group for better outreach.
Clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various institutional arrangements for overall programme management and implementation and the level of coordination between relevant players				•			 Roles and responsibilities of all of the stakeholders were defined clearly, though roles and responsibilities of internal stakeholders seems to be not documented Management processes have been laid down but not very clearly documented.
Risk assessment and management of the project							 Most of the potential risks were noted down Mitigation strategies for identified risk have not been laid down clearly Documentation of the risk and mitigation plan was not there completely.
Efforts of stakeholders in support of the implementation of the project							 Most of the stakeholders have extended support as envisaged from them during the proposal stage.





Evaluation matrix	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							• The cooperation from banking and financial institutions was not as good as it was envisaged.
Extent of conflict of interest either between stakeholders involved in the project or with outside agencies.							 There were certain conflict of interest with DIC, NGOs and Other training providers: As they were providing similar training courses. The problem was solved with the product portfolio
					EFFIC	IENCY	
Was a formal workplan made at the start of the project to determine the timeframe in which activities would be performed							 Detailed work-plan prepared for all important activities as part of DPR Month wise timelines defined for each activity Quarterly targeted list of activities and their tracking used to be done using RBM
Were resources made available to the project implementation agencies in accordance with the requirements of the work-plan							 None of the key resources, only a few of the support staff replaced. However the replacements had similar qualification and experience as proposed ones Done as per the plan and resource utilization certificates were produced.
Extent of deviation in the project implementation in so far as timelines is concerned.							• As per DPR 36 months, project extend with the request of NISG another 12 months
Responsiveness of the project management to such deviations and flexibility to deploy resources							• Formal time extension of the project was received, it was no cost extension.
Were any systems, processes, manuals etc made to govern the activities in the project among the different stakeholders							 Every activity/action of the project was governed by the manuals and guidebooks (e.g. operational manual, mobilization manual, installation manual, trainer guidebook etc.) The instructions are followed by the stakeholders
Extent to which Results Based Management has been used							• Tools as specified by the NISG, timely RBM reports have been submitted and were extremely useful for the project monitoring
Whether there was adequacy of steps taken to resolve any conflict of interest in or due to the project							Reasonable steps were taken
				RE	SULTS	/IMPAC	



Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks	
Whether the project has produced its desired immediate outputs							• More than 90% of the immediate outputs achieved	
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, use of the new outputs as against the traditional options)							• Most of the intended beneficiaries used the project output in more than 75% cases and in 25% or less cases used traditional options	
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, percentage of the target population)							• About 25% of the intended beneficiaries utilized the project output	
Extent of drop-outs from usage of the outputs by the intended beneficiaries							 Marginal (Less than 25%) drop-out from usage of outputs by the intended beneficiaries About 20% of the conversion rate. 	
Are there any unforeseen/ unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups		•					The rigorous, community inputs, field testing and extensive research and analysis were critical in developing viable and effective solutions to many of the issues identified. Many issues, however, remain outside the control of civil society institutions and are dependent on third party solutions. In most instances DA / TARAhaat found that discussions and demonstrations of the service with potential alliance partners and service providers, for example local financial and government institutions, resulted in a willingness to work with the programme and expedite or assist potential entrepreneurs in establishing their enterprise. However it should be noted that solutions remain highly dependent on the personal goodwill and understanding of individuals, and it will take time to build institutional acceptance of the programme.	
Extent of the project results on the target beneficiaries in terms of (a) Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, (b) Capacity Building, (c) Change Management, (d) Business Process Re-engineering, (f) Public Private Partnership, (g) Bridging the Digital Divide, and (h) Knowledge and Experience Sharing		•					 Excellence has been achieved in following areas relevant to the project: Citizen-centric service delivery: through NGO partners, community organizations, panchayats, Mobile trainers. Capacity building and bridging the digital divide: Through TARAguru, in order to nurture the concept of advocacy and over time to generate a level of self-sufficiency among the trainees so that they can stand on their own feet another initiative has also been launched to establish local Entrepreneur Forums. PPP: tie-up with Credit Institutions / Bank, Government Institutions, Academic and Educational Institutions and □ Civil society organizations. Knowledge and experience sharing: Through conference, career guidance workshops etc 	





EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	SATISFACTORY	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent of the project impact on the target groups in terms of (a) governance (improved efficiency, transparency and accountability), (b) citizen-centric service delivery (advantages of cost, time and convenience), (c) rural livelihoods (number of jobs, extent and sufficiency of employment), and (d) women's empowerment (increased knowledge, and use of the same to voice their concerns).							 Excellence has been achieved in significant number of cases in following relevant areas: Governance Women empowerment Rural livelihoods
Extent of significance of the project impact on the development of the region/country							 Indicators for development were defined during project conceptualization stage It helped in employment generation, local economic development, improved behavior of the people in the region
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by marginalized communities							 Most of the marginalized communities have utilized the project output in more than 50% cases where they needed similar service Participation of the minorities in the project were 62% against the target of 20%
Extent to which capacities have been built in stakeholders during the project							 Training and awareness done for the persons were established, though there were external helps provided from DA from time to time The testimonials of the stakeholders helped to bring in more people for the EDP program
				รเ	JSTAIN		ГҮ
Extent of ownership of stakeholders in the project							• Complete ownership of all the 'implementing and operating' stakeholders in the project including beneficiaries, field staff, partnering NGOs/CBOs etc.
Degree of support given by the Government in integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme							• No direct support from Govt.
Extent of availability of inputs/resources required for the project (people, finances, infrastructure, equipments)							• Resources in all the four area - people, finances, infrastructure, equipments were completely available during the part duration of the project



Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Have any revenue streams been defined in the project to make it self-sustaining							 Following revenue stream was proposed: Integration with similar theme line project and tarahat business model Participant fees for each of training delivery Sponsorship in the training manuals
Extent of success of such pre-defined revenue streams							• Revenue stream though were quite successful on overall basis, participants were reluctant to pay the training fees due to the poor economic situations in the region
Extent to which inventory of the assets created out of the grants received in the project have been properly maintained and transferred to the beneficiaries							• Assets acquired through the grants of the project such as PCs, servers, UPS. LCD monitors etc. along with other equipments are maintained properly and being used by DA for the purpose these were procured during pilot phase.
Degree of collaboration that has developed among stakeholders during the project							 Stakeholder management plan is well defined and have complete adherence during project execution (e.g. formal minutes of all management meetings are documented). Some of the collaboration resulted with the stakeholders are regional rural bank, regional employment exchange, UP Udyog mandal etc. Though these collaborations are individual level, a better approach could have been if these could have been done at national level.
Extent to which government is willing to finance the project after its completion of the UNDP funding							• No funding committed by the Government, initiatives for the same was also not taken up. However partnership with some of the private players is being explored and resulted some good result.





3.11 e-Justice

Project Title	e-Justice	
Proponent Organisation	Centre for Good Governance	
Implementation State	Andhra Pradesh	
Target Site for Pilot Project	Mahbubnagar District	
Theme of Project	Access to Justice	
Target Population	Citizens accessing Mandal Samakhyas, Mandal/Taluk Legal services	
	authorities, rural e-seva centres, civil society groups and the legally	
	marginalized.	
Project Cost	Rs. 148,000.00	
Funding Required for Project	Rs. 148,000.00	
Time Required to Implement Project	24 Months	
Name(s) of Partner Agencies	National Institute of Smart Government (NISG)	

Table 66 Introduction- eJustice Project

IMPACT OF THE PROJECT IN BRIEF

e-Justice project piloted in 2 districts of Mahabubnagar and Krishna in Andhra Pradesh to create a citizen centric approach for providing access to justice through ICT, by facilitating access to justice through legal awareness and greater interaction between the actors involved in the justice delivery system and the litigant or any person who has a legal query.

OBJECTIVE AREAS	OUTPUTS	OUTCOMES
Facilitate access to justice through legal awareness and greater interaction between the actors involved in the justice delivery system and the litigant or any person who has a legal query with special focus on the rural folk in general and rural women folk in particular	A website developed under the project (<u>www.ejustice.org.in</u>). Simplified version of laws (60) made available both off-line and on-line (through website).	Website developed under the pilot project would have usage in other parts of Andhra Pradesh as well. However, service delivery in pilot area now continues through a slightly different mode (i.e. through the LSAs concerned)
Promote legal awareness through an electronic interface by presenting key legislations in a simple manner and by simplifying relevant judgments, certain procedural regulations and enlightening on the existence of alternative remedies and making the same available to the general public through information Kiosks;	Database containing simplified version of laws was developed both in English and Telugu. In addition to website, established 4 kiosks for dissemination of legal information through LSAs.	Empowerment of the marginalised rural folk (especially the women among them) by providing required information regarding their rights and entitlements and various laws programmes of Governments protecting / promoting these rights and entitlements, litigation-free village.
Coordinate with other actors and to involve their participation so as to create a framework integrating the existing state and non-state actors in the administration of justice	More than 1200 paralegals were trained in collaboration with District LSAs.	Training and sensitization workshop for staff, paralegal volunteers as also extant & prospective beneficiaries helped in popularization and future usage of the project output.
Provide a feedback mechanism and elicit suggestions from people for achieving the above for further incorporation of pragmatic solutions	Feedback mechanism established with the help of field workers, LSAs and website.	Helped in introduction of a new process on the value-chain of access to information about seeking justice.
Deloitte.		

Table 65 Brief Impact of the Pro

3.11.1 Project Background

Introduction to the Project

It is the legal jargon that distances a layman from understanding and utilizing law as a tool for empowerment and redressal of problems. If 'laws' were to be made for the benefit of the common man, every effort should be made to eliminate the obstacle called 'legal jargon'. If legal jargon is an important obstacle, the lack of awareness of the existence of appropriate legislations occupying the field is yet another. The problem is further compounded when, people with adequate knowledge of law exploit the legally illiterate, a scenario we would like to term as "legal marginalization". Legal marginalization could happen to anyone, though its incidence could be greater among the socially and economically marginalized.

Project Functional Scope

The project aimed at promoting legal awareness through an electronic interface by presenting the key legislations in a simple manner and by simplifying relevant judgments, certain procedural regulations and enlightening on the existence of alternative remedies and making the same available to the general public through information Kiosks.

Hence, under the e-Justice Project, it is proposed to develop a legal information database which would present simplified versions of the legal enactments, case laws, and procedures that are relevant to people especially women and the marginalized sections of society. This data base will be hosted on a central server and the same will be installed in the kiosks housed at Mandal/Taluk offices of the Legal Services Authority or the Mandal Mahila Samakhyas (federation of self help groups of the poor) offices. The updates of the legal information database can be downloaded into these by synchronization with the central server through the internet. The public at large faced with a legal query can approach these kiosks.



Figure 44 Main Features of eJustice Project

Deloitte

Project Geographical Scope

The project was piloted Mahbubnagar District of the State of Andhra Pradesh located 120 Kms from Hyderabad. Mahbubnagar is located between 16° and 17° N, latitudes and 77° and 79° E, longitudes. The district has been chosen for the pilot project in view of the following reasons:

- Mahbubnagar District has the lowest literacy rate in Andhra Pradesh
- Mahbubnagar District is one of the most backward Districts in the state of Andhra Pradesh

The existence of an efficient justice system is undoubtedly central to development. There is a crucial link between rule of law, poverty eradication, human rights and sustainable human development. Providing legal information for judges, lawyers, prosecutors and public defenders and increasing the availability of legal information to the public are seen as factors facilitating access to justice. (UNDP)



- The district is industrially backward. Generally cottage and village industries are present.
- Proximity of the district to Hyderabad where the high court is situated. Hyderabad is also where the Bar Council of Andhra Pradesh and Andhra Pradesh Legal Services Authority's are situated.

Technical Architecture of the Project

The e-Justice Architecture consists of 2 Blocks; the central block and the remote clients block. The central block consists of the e-Justice portal server (act as a gateway to serve the information to the Kiosks) and the e-Justice Business Server (for business processing).



Figure 46 eJustice Architecture



Figure 45 Geographical Coverage- eJustice Project

Kiosk Database: Kiosk database was a program that contains all the information regarding the Kiosks such as the Kiosk registration information and the subscription information.

Kiosk Manager: The Kiosk manager was a program for managing the Kiosk database. It facilitates two types of tasks (1) facility for addition/removal/modification of the Kiosk information and (2) managing the subscription information.

eJustice Repository Manager: The e-Justice repository manager contained the legal database which will be updated on a regular basis.



Remote Client Block: The remote client block was the one where all the Kiosks are located. The geographic spread of this block would be initially selected Mandals of Mahbubnagar. The systems in Kiosks had internet connectivity using a dial-up connection. They had e-Justice local database installed and running e-Justice Kiosk application. The e-Justice Kiosk application would have offline functioning programs with online synchronization facility. The system could connect to the e-Justice Portal server at regular intervals.

Software: Web based software application developed in Java which had advantages in terms of portability, security and reliability. The RDBMS used was PostgreSQL, which is an open source software offering not only considerable cost advantage but also reliability.

Security Features: Some of the security features which were available are password based authentication, role-based services, data encryption etc.

Delivery Channels: The application developed was made accessible to the rural and semi-urban people through Mandal Samakhyas located in all the Mandals in Mahbubnagar district. The Kiosks were set up in the Mandal/Taluk offices of the Legal Services Authority. In the areas where the4 Mandal Samakhyas or Legal Services Authority were not active, the Kiosks could be housed with the Self Help Groups / village organization. The project would also use the facility of proposed e-Seva certres.

3.11.2 Project Strategic Objectives

The Vision of the project was to create 'a citizen centric approach for providing access to justice through Information Communication Technology'. The Goals of the project were to facilitate access to justice through legal awareness and greater interaction between the actors involved in the justice delivery system and the litigant or any person who has a legal query. The Objectives of the project were to:

- Facilitate access to justice through legal awareness and greater interaction between the actors involved in the justice delivery system and the litigant or any person who has a legal query with special focus on the rural folk in general and rural women folk in particular;
- Promote legal awareness through an electronic interface by presenting key legislations in a simple manner and by simplifying relevant judgments, certain procedural regulations and enlightening on the existence of alternative remedies and making the same available to the general public through information Kiosks;

Table 67 Stakeholders and Their Roles

Stakeholder	Role(s) Played
District Administrations and District Rural	DRDA authorities of the 2 districts covered under the pilot initiative provided assistance with setting
Development Agency (DRDA)	up of kiosks
Mandal-level Authorities	Helped with organisation of workshops, awareness campaigns, mobilising participation in these
Legal Service Authorities (State / District	Provided necessary inputs along the value-chain of service delivery to the beneficiaries; hosting of
/ Mandal levels)	the e-Justice kiosks in some cases.
	Provided knowledge and human resource inputs for preparing knowledge resource for the project.
NGOs / CBOs	Also helped with mobilisation of the beneficiaries and provided support for dissemination and
	organisation of training programmes /campaigns etc.
District Coordinators, Kiosk Operators and the Para-legal Volunteers	Field Implementation / Operationalization



Theme	Activities
Bridging the Digital Divide	Kiosk and intermediary (kiosk operator services) making the web-enabled service accessible to the rural folk.
Citizen-Centric Service Delivery	Services identified through the needs assessment exercise was delivered to the citizen with the help of Kiosks; extensive use of local language, awareness building for the successful implementation of the same.
Public Private Partnership	Sense of partnerships was developed for implementation of the project between the government organizations and not-for-profit sector organizations.
Capacity Building	Project field staff, Para-legal volunteers were trained to handle the query and help citizens
Change Management	The concept and channel of service delivery proposed in the project were tried first time in the country. For managing the change and for the success of the project training and publicity was done at village level.
Business Process Reengineering	N.A. Introduction of a new service for providing information about the legal / judicial processes / procedures
Knowledge/Experience Sharing	Though portal, kiosks, kiosk operators, para-legal volunteers (trained for this purpose), dissemination and capacity building workshops, preparation of resources like handbooks / CDs containing simplified / summarized laws which were widely distributed through the kiosks, various dissemination and mobilization campaigns and such like.
Others	N.A.

68-ACTIVITIES IN DIFFERENT I NEMES

- Coordinate with other actors and to involve their participation so as to create a framework integrating the existing state and non-state actors in the administration of justice; and
- Provide a feedback mechanism and elicit suggestions from people for achieving the above for further incorporation of pragmatic solutions.

3.11.3 Project Relevance Inputs

Identification of Information and Services Needs

Needs of the beneficiaries were captured through multistakeholders consultation workshop wherein right activists and legal experts, legal service authority representatives and the NGOs who work with the direct beneficiaries. Simplified and summarised laws and rules had been identified in consultation with key

implementing stakeholders that were in line with the needs of the key beneficiaries identified for the project.

Further, after identification of locations and key prospective beneficiaries, field visits had been undertaken to identify the needs and to get a hang of the delivery model that would be most suited for achieving the project objectives. These surveys were conducted through para-legal workers who have been trained under the project initially. The team interacted with 150-200 people of 10 villages of shaadnagar mandal to identify their information need vis-à-vis legal awareness related to land issues, dwary, maintenance, opinion about judiciaries etc.

Mahila Samakhya members (SHG) were also contacted to understand the issues related to gender issues. Other inputs received from Police stations, legal services authorities regarding



the matters on which cases were registered on the earlier said issues.

3.11.4 Project Effectiveness Inputs

Project Stakeholders and Envisaged Roles

Table 67 brings out the different stakeholders and their roles.

Risks and Mitigation Strategies

The major risk during implementation of the project was dominant groups at the local level seeking to disrupt the initiative. The same was mitigated by ensuring a buy-in from the Government and obtaining the cooperation of the district administration and the mandal-level authorities.

3.11.5 Project Efficiency Inputs

Activities Performed in different Dimensions of Intervention:

Table 68 summarises the main activities being performed in the different themes of intervention.

Project Management Approach

Multi-stakeholder participatory approach was adopted to mobilize local communities to collaborate in the project activities. Meetings were organized with SHGs, right activists and legal experts, legal service authority representatives and the NGOs. Following are the



activities carried out towards the management of the project:

• Identifying strong cause-effect linkages at the core of the



Figure 47 eJustice Portal

problem encountered.

- Tapping local resources as much as possible.
- Reaching out directly to the beneficiaries as much as possible.
- Exploring and delivering on the commonalities / complementarities of the services that were sought to be provided as project deliverables / benefits.
- Ensuring that the resources generated by the project (knowledge and infrastructural) do not lie unutilized after project gets over.
- The degree of adherence of the project to the planned project timelines was in accordance with what it was projected to be earlier.

Extent of Usage of Local Expertise

There was significant usage of locally available expertise in the project. All the avenues were explored and both individual (project personnel and Para-legal Volunteers, public officials) as well as institutional (LAS, CBOs) level expertise were utilized.





Management Processes Followed during the Project

The project periodically conducts the following processes:

- Stakeholders meetings;
- Preparation of RBM based LFA;
- Preparation of workplan and activity schedules for staff;
- Time schedules for various project activities;
- Allocation of human resources;
- Implementation at the field level;
- Monitoring and reporting;
- Preparation of quarterly report and training plan;
- Internal evaluation; and
- Follow ups.

Extent of Usage of RBM and Performance Indicators

Step by step follow up of RBM and performance indicator is done. This helped in preparing realistic work plan with appropriate activities and timeline.

3.11.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated

Following are the results / impact generated by the project: <u>Simplified laws:</u> A database containing simplified version of laws has been developed. The database has been made developed both in English and Telugu and made available both off-line and on-line. The on-line version of the database is the user friendly website developed under the project (<u>www.ejustice.org.in</u>). The features of the website include:

- Downloads of simplified versions of important acts
- Audio of the provisions of the Indian Penal Code, 1860 rendered in Telugu
- FAQ format.
- A knowledge Bank consisting of Important
- Judgments, Forms, Pleadings and legal articles
- Legal News & Updates
- Links to important websites

• List of Paralegals trained under the project

- Frequently Asked Questions
- A narration of success stories under the project

Training of Paralegal volunteers and conduct of Awareness workshops was taken up to improve knowledge about legal enactments, structure of the court, citizen rights etc. More than 1200 paralegals were trained under the Project in the districts of Krishna and Mahbubnagar. These trainings were conducted with the active collaboration of the District Legal Services Authorities in the respective districts.

Improved access to justice systems: Establishment of kiosks and dissemination of legal information through IEC information was the envisaged methodology for improving citizen's access to justice systems. Kiosks were set up in 4 select mandals each in the districts of Krishna and Mahbubnagar. The locations selected were public places often visited by people like the offices of the Mandal Parishad, e-seva centres. However, in the headquarters of each district, the kiosks were set-up in the offices of the District Legal Services Authority so that forwarding of cases and replying of queries by the DLSA would be easy.

Factors Facilitating/Impeding the Production of Outputs

Following are the factors/activities which helped to achieve the outputs:

- Simplification and translation of laws into telugu
- Training of paralegal volunteers
- Awareness through workshops
- Establishment of kiosks
- IEC information dissemination
- Reply to legal queries posed by citizens by experts
- Forwarding of cases to the Legal Services Authority



• Establishing linkages between the citizens, LSA, Mandal Samakhyas, Rural Department

Extent of Operationalisation of the project recommendations

The personnel employed by CGG were on the basis of a time-bound contract. That delivery mechanism had to be discontinued after the pilot project concluded in July 2008.

The infrastructural / logistical elements were essentially made for developing the portal and for setting up the kiosks for service delivery at the cutting edge. The portal continues to be hosted by CGG. The kiosk infrastructure has been handed over to legal Service Authorities who were key partners during project implementation as well and whose mandate is akin to the objectives set for the e-Justice project. LSAs would be using the project "products" in carrying out their function of providing information about legal matters and further free legal aid, if need be.

At times people approached the kiosks with completely different set of expectations - some of which were met. Some couldn't be met. Such emerging aspects as awareness about NREGA and RTI came to be taken on board during the project implementation and had their positive consequences for many beneficiaries. Effect of Outputs/Results on the Target Groups of the Project The key effects of the outputs of the project on the identified target groups are:

- Simplified Laws
- Improved knowledge about Justice Systems
- Improved access to justice systems
- Reduced dependency on legal representatives
- Improved legal aid
- Improved linkages amongst various agencies.

3.11.7 Project Sustainability Considerations

The issue of sustainability was much discussed and debated. However, given the nature and type of the project, it was felt that

- The project would not be able to get revenue for sustenance.
- There was no existence of consistent 'user groups' to enable collection of user charges
- The nature of the project was such that a revenue model may not be a workable model.

Therefore, it was decided that the project be handed over to an Institution working in the area of facilitating "Access to Justice". The Legal Services Authority was therefore felt to be the most appropriate authority to take over the kiosks.

EVALUATING THE PROJECT

The project has been evaluated on five parameters viz. Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Results/Impacts and Sustainability which were further affirmed by subparameters illustrated in Table 69 that exhibits the evaluation in six categories of Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Moderately Satisfactory, Moderately Unsatisfactory, Unsatisfactory And Highly Unsatisfactory, accounting respectively for 6,5,4,3,2 and 1 points. The right most column substantiates the scores. The rating for each of the parameters was arrived at after averaging on the ratings for each of the sub-parameters. Similarly the overall evaluation rating were arrived at after averaging on the parameter ratings.



Figure 48 Evaluating the Project- eJustice



KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE NEXT STEPS

SUSTAINABLE BUSINESS MODEL FOR eJUSTICE

The current revenue model of eJustice is not adequate to support its sustenance post expiry of funding from external sources. Currently the users are not charged for the services obtained at the kiosks. The revenue streams are sale of books, CDs and print outs which mainly focus the legal fraternity. This revenue streams is not enough to compensate the recurring expenses. Additional sources of revenue need to be contemplated to induce replication.

INTEGRATION WITH e-SEVA / CSCS IN THE AREA

For future roll out / replication of the project, options should be explored for setting up eJustice Kiosks in the e-Seva centres/CSCs. This would be in line with the vision of Government for e-Seva/CSC, where citizens would be coming to avail host of Government services.

INTEGRATION OF KIOSK WITH DISTRICT LSA

There should be online integration of District LSA and e-Justice kiosks to forward and track the cases till its closure. Also, it should look at building institutionalized communication channels with LSA and other agencies involved in administration of justice.

FURTHER ENHANCEMENT OF SCOPE

e-Justice should also look into using other forms of ICTs to reach the citizens and support the judiciary in the broader aspect of 'Legal Aid' which has become vital for ensuring access to justice especially marginalized sections of society, where-in Legal awareness and Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR) systems are its 2 major constituents which the project focuses. For instance it can look into use of V-SAT based video conferencing technologies for both legal awareness, as well use it effectively for ADR supporting the District LSA which are functional. This will also make access to justice at the doorstep of citizens where-in online courts will also become a reality. This can ensure more coverage into areas where accessibility is difficult and support the socio-economically backward who are legally marginalized.



3.11.8 Project Evaluation Matrix

Table 69 Detailed evaluation matrix for ICT for Women Conciliation Center

EVALUATION MATRIX	HIGHLY Satisfactory	SATISFACTORY	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks			
RELEVANCE										
Needs of the beneficiary captured			•				 Needs of the beneficiaries were captured through multi-stakeholders consultation workshop wherein right activists and legal experts, legal service authority representatives and the NGOs who work with the direct beneficiaries Individual representation of beneficiaries was not there To elicit opinion, queries the team interacted with 150-200 people of 10 villages of shaadnagar mandal to identify their information need vis-à-vis legal awareness related to land issues, dwary, maintenance, opinion about judiciaries etc. Mahila Samakhya members (SHG) were also contacted to understand the issues related to gender issues Other inputs received from Police stations, legal services authorities regarding the matters on which cases were registered on the earlier said issues. These surveys were conducted through para-legal workers who have been trained under the project initially. 			
Relevant to needs & expectations of beneficiary							 Segmentation of the services w.r.t the beneficiaries were done. Categorization of the laws Offerings are tailored w.r.t the above segmentation. 			
Relevant to development priorities of Govt. of India							• It is loosely aligned with developmental priorities of GoI. It has some alignment to women empowerment and poverty alleviation. In terms of citizen centric development.			
Relevant to development priorities of concerned State Government							 It is loosely aligned with developmental priorities of state Govt. The then chief minister of AP lunched the 1st kiosk of this project; however effort from Govt. is missing for replication the project in the other areas. 			
Identified problem has high incidence in area of focus							 Frequent and continuous incidences reported in the area. The input is based on field surveys and consultation with stakeholders with due consideration of diverse regional coverage. Substantial number of individuals of the targeted vulnerable group are 			



Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							affected. • Similar problem affecting vulnerable groups in other parts of the country
Correct & accurate identification of target stakeholders and/or correctly defined vulnerable groups							 Stakeholder segments including vulnerable groups such as dowry-affected women, widows etc. Not all individuals are covered
Adequacy of Government commitment to project				•			 Government support and cooperation was received in terms of appropriate guidance for and participation in the project events and activities from time to time. Special mention can be made to the timely support received from district administration and legal service authorities for setting up kiosks and its operations. No financial commitment from the govt was envisaged for the project and hence not received; UNDP was the sole funding agency for the pilot project and the accounts of the project was audited by UNDP
Project relevance to ICT4D focus under the project							 Two key ICT tolls were deployed: Knowledge sharing portal for project as a whole Decentralized information dissemination and service delivery through mandal(taluk / tehsil) level kiosks which had an e-enabled (H/w & s/w) logistical arrangement in place.
				E	FFECT	IVENE	SS
Problem been stated correctly and distinctly							 Problems identified, defined and documented Validation of identified problems were done through the consultation workshop with the stakeholders and field surveys.
Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries, users of the project are identified as stakeholders of the project							 Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries and users have been identified as stakeholders Roles and responsibilities of all stakeholders have been detailed out in the DPR MoU was signed subsequently with NISG which further spelt about the roles and responsibilities.
The assumptions, objectives, outputs and outcomes have been clearly articulated in measurable terms							 Objectives, outputs and outcomes identified. Certain assumptions articulated Subjective measurement terms in use



EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
The linkages between objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was clear							• Logical linkages present but not documented.
The project design allowed for flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment.							 Project design capable of adapting to and responding positively to most of the possible types of changes However, during project pilot implementation stage there was no requirement of such change and project got implemented as it was conceptualized.
Degree of support given by the Government towards integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme and other related projects							 Project objectives and goals aligned with programme of the state and central Government. However more needs be done on propagating the concepts of the project across different level There were some recent interest from some of the Govt. agencies (e.g. CDAC, P&RD- WB etc.) for implementation / roll out of the project.
Planning component of the project take into account the use of ICT for improved governance / service delivery in various areas through pilot initiatives, encouraging BPR, development local solutions and applications and encouragement of PPP model		•					 The project was clearly rooted in the local context and all the field personnel of the projects were the inhabitants of the areas where project was implemented who understood the developmental concepts and the context of the project. All the products of the project including portal was made available in the local language. BPR is not relevant here as the new concept/process was introduced to bridge the identified gap and ICT tools have been introduced for efficient delivery of the services. A variant of PPP model were emerged in terms of cooperation among GOs and not for profit private organizations.
The adequacy of institutional arrangements in attaining the long-term objective of the project. Also the infrastructural, logistical, and financial implication of sustaining the project objectives beyond the project duration/after completion of UNDP funding.			•				 Institutional bodies such as LSAs, NFOs, SHGs Federation at mandal levels (Mandal Mahila Smakhyas) etc. have been assigned with defined roles and responsibilities for attaining long-term goals Project infrastructure and knowledge resources created under the project has been handed over to the Legal Service Authority of the concerned districts which are being used for the similar objective that of the project. However for expansion of the coverage/extension of resources need to be looked into separately. Keeping in mind the objective of the project, nature of the service provided and the fact that it was pilot face, the revenue model was not incorporated during this face. However, this may be considered during roll out of the project for long term sustainability with due attention to the





Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							operationalization details.
Project's linkages, liaison, coordination and impact upon related activities under NeGP being implemented in the country.							• No linkages with the NeGP were established.
The project's assistance, relationship, relevance to and coordination with the pre- existing Project management system and staff							• The existing institutional set up was co-opted with for delivery of the services
Clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various institutional arrangements for overall programme management and implementation and the level of coordination between relevant players							 Roles and responsibilities of all of the stakeholders were defined clearly Management processes have been clearly laid down for proper coordination between the players such as CGG, NISG, LSA, District Coordinators, Kiosk operators etc.
Risk assessment and management of the project							 Most of the potential risks were noted down Mitigation strategies for identified risk have been laid down The risk management and mitigation plan was substantially adhered Documentation of the risk and mitigation plan was not there.
Efforts of stakeholders in support of the implementation of the project							 The project proposal submitted to UNDP was documented in coordination with most of the stakeholders with partial buy-in of certain stakeholders e.g. Government Most of the stakeholders have extended support as envisaged from them during the proposal stage.
Extent of conflict of interest either between stakeholders involved in the project or with outside agencies.							• No Major conflict of interest. e-Seva is being set up by the Government which would be the common platform for availing government services. Things need to be sorted out on how this project effort can be integrated with the e-Seva initiative.
	EFFICIENCY						
Was a formal workplan made at the start of the project to determine the timeframe in which activities would be performed							 Detailed workplan prepared for all important activities Month wise timelines defined for each activity
Were resources made available to the project implementation agencies in							• None of the key resources, only a few of the support staff replaced. Resource availability as per the plan and resource utilization certificate was



EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
accordance with the requirements of the workplan							produced.
Extent of deviation in the project implementation in so far as timelines is concerned.							• As per DPR Project duration is of 24 months, project completed in 37 months
Responsiveness of the project management to such deviations and flexibility to deploy resources							 Management taking some steps in terms of extra resources (time and effort) to somehow correct the course of implementation Formal extension of the project was received, fund received accordingly.
Were any systems, processes, manuals etc made to govern the activities in the project among the different stakeholders							 Written governing manual available for eJustice Kiosk operations, Legal Service Authority and Administrator. The instructions are followed by the stakeholders
Extent to which Results Based Management has been used							 Continuous RBM under usage at every stage. The assessment of the implementation of the project by CGG during the midterm evaluation has been based more on qualitative aspects.
Whether there was adequacy of steps taken to resolve any conflict of interest in or due to the project							• No conflict of interest was encountered.
				RES	SULTS	/IMPAC	CTS
Whether the project has produced its desired immediate outputs							• Majority (50% to less than 75%) of the immediate outputs achieved
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, use of the new outputs as against the traditional options)							• Most of the intended beneficiaries used the project output in more than 75% cases and in 25% or less cases used traditional options
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, percentage of the target population)							• About 50% of the intended beneficiaries utilized the project output
Extent of drop-outs from usage of the outputs by the intended beneficiaries							 Marginal (Less than 25%) drop-out from usage of outputs by the intended beneficiaries





Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Are there any unforeseen/ unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups							 Provisioning of information beyond what was expected was done Provisioning of additional information related to RTI, NREGA etc were the positive unintended effect of the project.
Extent of the project results on the target beneficiaries in terms of (a) Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, (b) Capacity Building, (c) Change Management, (d) Business Process Re-engineering, (f) Public Private Partnership, (g) Bridging the Digital Divide, and (h) Knowledge and Experience Sharing		•					 Excellence has been achieved in following areas relevant to the project: Citizen-centric service delivery: information availability Capacity building and bridging the digital divide: of CGG consultants, of district coordinators, kiosk operators, para-legal volunteers as also prospective beneficiaries. PPP: with the private partners being 'not-for-profit private sector entities'. No business entity was involved Knowledge and experience sharing: through portal, kiosks, handbooks, CDs - in local language.
Extent of the project impact on the target groups in terms of (a) governance (improved efficiency, transparency and accountability), (b) citizen-centric service delivery (advantages of cost, time and convenience), (c) rural livelihoods (number of jobs, extent and sufficiency of employment), and (d) women's empowerment (increased knowledge, and use of the same to voice their concerns).		•					Excellence has been achieved in significant number of cases in following relevant areas: • Governance • Citizen centric service delivery • Women empowerment
Extent of significance of the project impact on the development of the region/country							 Indicators for development were defined during project conceptualization stage It germinated the seed of empowerment; increased awareness about the rights entitlement, laws and related governmental initiatives by Government.
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by marginalized communities							 Most of the marginalized communities have utilized the project output in more than 50% cases where they needed similar service Project outputs (User guide on simplified laws) were completely targeted for marginalized communities and was utilized widely (more than 75%).
Extent to which capacities have been built in stakeholders during the project							• Capacities of the core implementation stakeholders i.e. Beneficiaries, field staff, LSAs, representative of partnering NGOs/CBOs etc. have been built up to perform the necessary operational and maintenance activities assigned to them



EVALUATION MATRIX	Нібні Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
				SL	JSTAIN	IABILI7	Ϋ́
Extent of ownership of stakeholders in the project							 Complete ownership of all the 'implementing and operating' stakeholders in the project including beneficiaries, field staff, LSAs, representative of partnering NGOs/CBOs etc.
Degree of support given by the Government in integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme							 All supports which were requested were received from the district/mandal authorities, legal service authorities and other Government agencies
Extent of availability of inputs/resources required for the project (people, finances, infrastructure, equipments)							• Resources in all the four area - people, finances, infrastructure, equipments were completely available during the part duration of the project
Have any revenue streams been defined in the project to make it self-sustaining							• Revenue stream was proposed initially, however the same was not implemented due to the reasons mentioned earlier. All the cost during pilot implementation was funded by UNDP.
Extent of success of such pre-defined revenue streams							• Revenue stream defined initially, but not implemented
Extent to which inventory of the assets created out of the grants received in the project have been properly maintained and transferred to the beneficiaries							• Assets acquired through the grants of the project such as PCs, servers, UPS. LCD monitors etc. along with other equipments handed over to the respective LSAs and maintained properly.
Degree of collaboration that has developed among stakeholders during the project							 Stakeholder management plan is well defined and have complete adherence during project execution (e.g. formal minutes of all management meetings are documented). Stakeholders including field staff, LSAs, representative of partnering NGOs/CBOs were involved at different stage during operational decision making
Extent to which government is willing to finance the project after its completion of the UNDP funding							• No funding committed by the Government, initiatives for the same was also not taken up.





3.12 ICT for Women Conciliation Centre

	Table 70 Introduction- ICT for Women Conciliation Centre
Project Title	ICT in WCC: Strengthening e- governance to Life Long Learning Project
Proponent Organisation	VIDIYAL
Implementation State	Tamil Nadu with potential of replication all over India
Target Site for Pilot Project	Theni District in Tamil Nadu
Theme of Project	Women's Empowerment
Target Population	The project focused on 4000 women members of SHGs and their families
Project Cost	Rs. 41,17,000.00
Funding Required for Project	Rs. 40,00,000.00
Time Required to Implement Project	Six Months
Name(s) of Partner Agencies	Arul Anandar College, Karumathur, Madurai



BRIEF IMPACT OF THE PROJECT

Government of India has been focusing on many development and welfare programmes through direct interventions, grants and subsidies. Most programmes have limitations in reaching poorer sections of the rural society due to asymmetry in information and high transaction costs. Studies suggest that development can be achieved only through the informational empowerment of the communities, enabled through social capital such as Self-Help Groups (SHGs).

OBJECTIVE AREAS	OUTPUTS	OUTCOMES
Self-Directed Learning in legal, constitutional and human rights among poor women	3,600 person-hours of formal learning	Tremendous increase in negotiation power as evidenced by quantum increase of financial assistance extended by local banks, particularly in Marketing, Agricultural and Animal products. 500 women for Milch Animal and 100 Women for Goat Rearing applied to IOB Theni. Women now familiar with judiciary officials and the procedures
Orienting WCC with ICTs and enabling interactions with less transaction cost.	10 locally produced VCD materials 26 WCC Meetings conducted using ICT 96 locally produced Voice Mail materials	There are 650 women folk regularly hear voicemail which will amount to enhanced information not only on the user but also further family members.
Helping women identifying eligibility in development programme (ICLIS)	Touch Screens used in three centres for accessing multi-media based ICLIS software package.	For the first time nearly 20 women members have applied for development schemes after consulting ICLIS The credit flow has gone up to 3 Crores
Strengthening horizontal transfer of knowledge in legal, constitutional and human rights through structured mobile phone conversations.	600 hrs of conversations relevant to legal, constitutional, human rights and livelihood through horizontal transfer of knowledge 60 hours of interaction with legal experts and WCC; and	80% of the household property in the name of SHG Women. There are cases registered by the women in the Bodi Legal Aid Services Authority after orientation and video conferencing. Such incidences paved way for few more women to approach Women Conciliation Center (WCC) for redressal. The ICT induced learning has motivated women members to admit themselves as computer trainee in order to claim themselves as computer literates.



VIDIYAL AND THE WOMEN CONCILIATION CENTRE

VIDIYAL is a Non-Governmental Organisation (NGO) working for the past 20 years with Self-Help Groups (SHGs), numbering more than 250 with nearly 4000 members. These SHGs are federated into an organization called VIDIVELLI which supports VIDIYAL. VIDIYAL's experience shows that SHGs when empowered with legal awareness and backing of legal institutions in conciliation and judiciary, they are able to strengthen the role of women in social and economic process.

Through the federation and SHGs VIDIYAL is involved in various activities including the Women Conciliation Centre (WCC). This Centre has been approved by The High Court of Madras and supported by Munsif - Cum - Magistrate Court at Bodi. National Legal Services Authority (NALSA) has recognized the activities of the WCC as a part of its National Legal Literacy Mission programme.

3.12.1 Project Background

The Self-Help Group Movement of VIDIYAL

The SHG movement of VIDIYAL has been taking place for more than 10 years and the annual turnover of credit and saving among the 4000 women is nearly Rs. 50 million. The strong SHG movement indicates not only a structured social capital, but also a cognitive social capital.

The Women Conciliation Centre (WWC)

VIDIYAL is running a Women Conciliation Centre (WCC) that has been approved by The High Court of Madras and supported by Munsif - Cum - Magistrate Court at Bodi. The centre operates once in a week and addresses nearly 100 to 200 cases every month.

Recognition for the WCC

The National Legal Services Authority (NALSA) has recognized the activities of the WCC as a part of its National Legal Literacy Mission programme. Under WCC, the rural women are able to meet the legal aid cell in villages and address issues in the following areas:

- Marriage, Dowry harassment and domestic violence;
- Property Dispute including land dispute; and
- Divorces and Alimony.

Issues Faced

In the format of the WCC meetings described above, the following are some of the issues being faced:

- The WCC is operating in a face-to face manner in which the Legal Aid Cell from the Munsif - Cum - Magistrate Court at Bodi meets the women once in a week. However most women are involved in agricultural labour activities and are residing far from WCC: they find it difficult to spend time/resources interacting with WCC.
- Conventional face-to-face training has limitations in equipping SHG members with various issues of legal and judiciary system.
- Their legal awareness is limited and conventional face-to-face training has limitations in equipping them with various issues.

Early Successes for VIDIYAL

VIDIYAL has strong linkages with the banking sector, including the Indian Overseas Bank (IOB), whose substantial business of the Rasingapuram branch office is through the SHGs and the Federation. VIDIYAL has been working with IOB, with the hypothesis that if rural credit is blended with appropriate capacity building the performance of credit would be much better vis-à-vis productivity, returns and non-performing assets (NPA) levels. Capacity building would also enlarge market for bank credit among women and among other marginalized section of the rural poor.

ICTs can facilitate the life-long capacity building process in a spatial-temporal context in the form of Technology-Mediated Open and Distance Education and Learning (Tech MODE). IOB is already





supporting VIDIYAL's activities through a credit to the women groups. VIDIYAL with the support of Commonwealth of Learning has already initiated Lifelong Learning in micro enterprises development.

However, while economic empowerment through microfinance and micro enterprises are taking place, there is a need to strengthen the role of women in terms of their rights and enhance their negotiation power in legal, constitutional and human rights at various levels-household, village and enterprise. Therein lies the genesis of this assignment.

Information and Communication Technology

Information and Communication Technology (ICT) can play a major role in strengthening the awareness as well as interaction process. In particular, VIDIYAL envisages the blending of computers and mobile phones since mobile phone can address last mile issues. SHGs can also contribute substantially to development process, if they are appropriately empowered in governance issues. Hence it is appropriate to promote development through SHG by integrating ICT and e-Governance.

Government of India's Programmes

Government of India has been implementing many development

and welfare programmes through direct interventions, grants and subsidies. Studies show that most of these programmes have limitations in reaching poorer sections of the rural society due to asymmetry in information and high transaction costs.

The Information and Communication Technology for Development (ICT4D) approach through programmes like Mission 2007, Common Service Centre (CSC), etc. are attempting to address these issues (supply side interventions). However, it has been clearly perceived that development can be achieved only through the empowerment of the communities (demand side interventions).

Project Description

VIDIYAL has integrated the following theoretical perspectives in the present project:

• A Change in the Capacity Building Approach

The project attempts to bring about a paradigm shift in capacity building process, with the formal institutional based- face-toface- training being only a facilitation process. Using ICTs, the emphasis will be in promoting self-directed personal strategic learning which would lead to Lifelong learning (L3). Through this project, VIDIYAL will extend the L3 concept to issues such as legal, constitutional and human rights. Such an initiative will help to enhance the negotiation power of the women with various

VIDIYAL'S EARLY SUCCESSES WITH THE IOB AND THE COMMONWEALTH OF LEARNING

IOB which has already realized the potential of cognitive social capital is interested in the concept of Lifelong Learning (L3) and is supporting VIDIYAL's activities through a credit to the women groups. VIDIYAL with the support of Commonwealth of Learning has already initiated Lifelong Learning in micro enterprises development. Using ICTs such as computers and mobile phone and through Open and distance learning, women have been trained in enterprise development. This has encouraged the banks to support the women's groups with credit for starting the micro enterprises. The women adopt innovative strategies in capacity building. Most learning materials are produced locally by the women in the form of VCDs with some SHGs running the Television Cable Channel. These Women SHGs have dedicated one hour every day in telecasting learning materials in the cable television. Women have learnt skills of enterprises and have started enterprises including goat-rearing (total outlay of Rs. 1.22 crores), and pure drinking water factory (outlay of Rs. 20 lakhs).





stakeholders. The capacity building through ICT based ODL for the villagers is different from the structured formal ODL programmes for students. Unlike the students who are studying for certificates, degrees and diplomas, the villagers would look forward to strengthen their immediate livelihood security. They demand location-specific, need based learning in the context of their social and economic value chain and resist any centralized, supply-oriented training programmes. ICT can play a major role in managing such diversity and help in preparing locally relevant learning materials. In this process, the villagers are seen as partner in the learning process, rather than mere students.

In the present project major portion of the learning contents will prepared in consultation with the local community. In addition to the vertical transfer of knowledge (i.e. from experts to the villagers), the learning also takes place through horizontal transfer of knowledge. The villagers through interacting with one another in the community, continuously learn. ICT helps to broaden the canvass for horizontal transfer of knowledge.

• Reducing the Transaction Costs

The ICT will also help to reduce the transaction costs in the operation of WCC. At present, the face to face conciliation centre attracts 20 to 30 participants every week. With the introduction of ICT, the WCC will be able to attract participation 80 to 100 women every week. The increase in the scale will help to reduce the transactions costs.

• Enhanced Awareness of the Developmental Schemes Government of India has been focusing on many development and welfare programmes through direct interventions, grants and subsidies. Studies show that most of these programmes are not accessible to many segments of rural society due to asymmetry in information. The absence of single window system and high

STAGES	CHRACTERISTICS	ICT COMPONENT DESCRIPTION
INFORM	Providing information about various activities, decision-making processes and decisions of government.	Using Mobile Phone based Voice mail, the project will provide information on legal, constitutional and human rights to 4000 women members. ThIS will encourage self-directed lifelong learning among women regarding various governance issues.
INTERACT	Interaction enables citizen to respond to the information.	Using Mobile phones, the project will enable women participants to interact with legal and human right experts. FAQs will help the participants to understand the legal, constitutional and human rights.
TRANSACT	Transaction will enable citizens to transact with government online services. This will help to reduce transaction costs in delivery.	Using Village Knowledge Centres in three nodal points and mobile phones, women will be able to file complaints in the WCC and fix the time for conciliation. ICLIS will help them to identify appropriate development programmes and apply.
FACILITATE	Facilitation is a process whereby common citizens can play a role in decision- making process. It enables horizontal and vertical dialogues, discourses and public engagement.	Online Video conferencing between three VKCs will help the village women to take part in conciliation and discussions with Legal Aid Cell. The women will also share their experience with other women members using structured conversation through mobile phones.
The 72 Descript	ion of ICT Components- VIDIYAL	



social, economic and financial transaction costs further enhance the problem. With hundreds of development programmes operating simultaneously through hundreds of departments and agencies, it would be difficult for an ordinary Indian citizen to know about all these development programmes for which she/he is eligible.

In the above scenario VIDIYAL, in collaboration with Arul Anandar College would establish a model of Indian Citizen Eligibility Identification System (ICLIS). The proposed model will contain details on all the government programmes and the specific eligibility criteria, the model application forms, other details of obtaining the development benefits. Knowledge on the above will be designed in a web-based mode and made available in the test site both user friendly front-end touch screen mode and also direct internet access mode simultaneously.

The content and the software will be developed by Arul Anandar College and the unit establishment and maintenance will be done by VIDIYAL in the target area. The unique dimension of ICLIS is its ability to take development to the doors of people. When the citizens know their eligibility status, this know-how will enable them to enhance their livelihood. Meanwhile the basic thrust of egovernance initiative will be easily realized in such initiatives. From an eGovernance perspective, the above interventions could be considered to belong to every stage in the continuum of eGovernance. Table 72 elaborates this.

3.12.2 Project Strategic Objectives

The following were identified as the main strategic objectives for the project:

- Promoting Self-Directed Learning in legal, constitutional and human rights among poor women using mobile phones;
- Orienting the present Women Conciliation Centre with ICTs and enabling large scale interactions with less transaction cost. This would be done with the establishment of Village Knowledge Centres;
- Helping the women members identifying their eligibility in various development programme of state and central government using Indian Citizen eligibility Identification System (ICLIS); and
- Strengthening the horizontal transfer of knowledge in legal, constitutional and human rights through structured mobile phone conversations among women.

3.12.3 Project Relevance Inputs

Identification of Information

Table 74 Project Stakeholders and their Roles

Stakeholder	Role(s) Played
Vidivelli Women Self Help Group Federation	End users, collaborator & Management and Operations of VKC through management committees
IFFCO -AIRTEL	Broadcasting the mobile Voicemails
Arul Anandar College	Development of ICLIS software and capacity building of women SHG members
Bodi Taluk Legal Aid Services Authority	Support Women Conciliation Center (WCC) and Legal Teleconferencing
Common Wealth of Learning (COL)	Life Long Learning (L3) for SHG women using ODL principles through mobile phones and computers
MSSRF	Guidance and capacity building to establish VKC
Representatives of Panchayat Raj Institutions	Support and participation in extending the services of the VKC to other target groups
NIC - Theni, Collector office	Guidance and advice for organizing Video Conferencing



and Services Needs

Information and services needs were identified through the following techniques:

- Participatory Rural Appraisal;
- Focus Group Discussions;
- Base line survey;
- Formal Meeting in Self Help Groups and Federations;
- Trainings and Workshops;
- Inputs into feedback registers from visitors to the VKC; and
- Field Visit Questionnaire.

The major information needs identified were the following

- Development programmes and schemes of the Government;
- Information on Legal issues and procedures;
- Details for operation and maintenance of Micro Finance; and
- Data on Agriculture and allied activities

The Major services needs identified were the following

- 1.Self-Directed Learning for livelihood enhancement and legal empowerment
- 2.WCC for legal service to rural illiterate women
- 3.ICLIS -web service to know about the development schemes
- 4. Facilitation of Horizontal Transfer of Knowledge

3.12.4 Project Effectiveness Inputs

Project Stakeholders and Envisaged Roles

Table 74 brings out the different stakeholders involved and the respective roles they played.

Risks and Mitigation Strategies

- Problem of availability of broadband connection in 2 villages -Discussion were initiated and sensitization about the cause of the project was made to BSNL authorities and within a short span of time the broadband connection was given.
- Lack of qualified and trained personnel to manage VKC -Orientation and Technical Training was provided to the locally available prospective women candidates.
- Sustainability of VKC The center also provide various other income generating services in order to sustain itself.
- ICT services with Government: Many of the online services with the government did not materialized as the latter was not in a position to receive the petitions and applications online. Since the government departments have not been fully computerized an appeal has been given to the government authorities by VIDIVELLI Federation for immediate attention and action.
- Election interference: There were two Elections both for Lok Shaba and Bye-Election for the State Assembly have been conducted during the project period.
- Approaching government officials during the election period (4 months out of 6 months project period) becomes rather difficult for getting details about various schemes Efforts were made through personal intervention and other sources to obtain details.

3.12.5 Project Efficiency Inputs

Activities Performed in different Dimensions of Intervention: Table 75 summarises the main activities being performed in the different themes of intervention.

Table 75 Theme-wise activities conducted during the project

Theme	Activities
Bridging the Digital	Village Knowledge Centers, Video Conferencing, mobile Voice Mails, Computer Training, Touch Screen, Mobile
Divide	Phones, ICLIS -web service
Citizen-Centric Service	Free Legal Aid, Accessibility to Development Programmes, Services at the Door Steps, Information supply on Micro



<u>Theme</u>	Activities
Delivery	Finance, Agriculture, Marketing, Animal Husbandry, Health and Sanitation, Employment Opportunities, Details on Education, Software Training, Mobile Recharging, Internet facilities, Providing various Govt. various format for obtaining certificates and approval, Discussion with the experts through video conferencing etc.
Public Private Partnership	Partnership between Vidivelli Women Federation, IFFCO - AIRTEL, Arul Anandar College, Madurai, Bodinayakkanur Taluk Legal Aid Services Authority, Common Wealth of Learning with VIDIYAL.
Capacity Building	Orientation to VIDIVELLI Federation on VKC, Orientation training on computer to VKC Staff, Video Conferencing, Women Conciliation Center, Voice mails, use of Mobile Phones. Visit to Mysore - IT for Change Visit to MSSRF - Sempatti to operate and maintain VKC for e-learning and e-Governance. Workshop on Women legal Rights Training on Govt. Schemes and Programmes Training on Constitution and Human Rights Training on Microfinance, Training on Livelihood
Change Management	The following tools used to help individual to bring change: VKC, Voicemail using Mobile Phones, Video conferencing, personal contact, Informal discussion, Group Meeting and Exposure Visits, Women Conciliation Center, Touch screen, Demonstration, Internet browsing, computer literacy
Business Process Reengineering	 Feed Back from beneficiaries and users through vocal and maintenance of Feed back register Regular meeting and conferences with women and Federation along with technical experts Provisions for suggestion through personal contact and informal discussions. Regular analysis on the attendance, usage and benefits reached Committees appointed for periodical evaluation
Knowledge/Experience Sharing	Knowledge on Micro finance, Agriculture, Development Programmes, Animal Husbandry, Legal Issues and Procedures, Sharing with Fellow Group Members, Federation Members and Family and other members of the community through personal contact informal discussion, Group Meeting and Exposure Visits
Others	 Services at the Door Steps through VKCs which Minimizes the Cost: Supportive Education for School Children and Special Education for Slow Learners Accessibility to Pure and Safe drinking Water through Community Water Purification Center Collection and Payment of Monthly Electric Charges for the consumers Weather Forecast Vegetable Market Rate on Daily basis for the farmers Examination Results for University and School Students



Theme

· Results for Competitive and other Job orientated Exams

· Providing details on Employment opportunities and Related Formats.

Project Management Approach

Multi-stakeholder participatory approach was adopted to mobilize local communities to collaborate in the project activities. VIDIYAL organized meetings with SHGs, Village Level Federations and local Panchayat Raj representatives.

Activities

For each VKC a management committee has been formed, consisting of women leaders of SHGs representing different villages, to take care of the VKCs operational and management aspects. Internal project monitoring committee has been formed to periodically review and monitor the activities as per the work plan prepared.

Local communities contribute a portion of the budget required for setting up of the VKCs. Operational expenses including office rent, staff salary and electricity charge is also borne by the community. The criteria for selection of the villages for establishing VKCs included:

- Grade of SHG's;
- SHG participation level especially with Vidiyal;
- Co-operation of Panchayat leaders;
- Availability of accessible office room with power connections;
- Local needs and problems;
- Support of the Federation; and
- Management aspect of VKC and overall willingness of the community.

Extent of Usage of Local Expertise

The project seeks assistance of local experts in the area of legal, agricultural and veterinary science. Additionally, indigenous knowledge for treatment of animals of rural elderly women is also used frequently.

Women SHG members are encouraged to be the anchors for voice mail and videos on social themes. Even the knowledge workers for VKCs are selected from educated women of the villages.

Management Processes Followed during the Project

The project periodically conducts the following processes:

- Stakeholders meetings;
- Preparation of RBM based LFA;
- Preparation of workplan;
- Preparation of activity schedules for staff;
- Time schedules for various project activities;
- Allocation of human resources;
- Implementation at the field level;
- Monitoring and reporting;
- Preparation of quarterly report;
- Preparation of training plan;
- Internal evaluation; and
- Follow ups.

Extent of Usage of RBM and Performance Indicators

Step by step follow up of RBM and performance indicator is done. This helped in preparing realistic work plan with appropriate activities and timeline.

3.12.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated

The project generated the following results and impacts:

- 3,600 person-hours of formal learning;
- 10 locally produced VCD materials;
- 96 locally produced Voice Mail materials which are regularly mailed to 250 SHGs and 300 members;



- 26 Women Conciliation Centre Meetings conducted using ICT;
- 600 hrs of conversations relevant to legal, constitutional, human rights and livelihood through horizontal transfer of knowledge;
- 60 hours of interaction with legal experts and WCC; and
- Touch Screens used in three centres for accessing multi-media based ICLIS software package.

Factors Facilitating/Impeding the Production of Outputs

Factors facilitating the production of outputs are:

- People's participation, involvement and clear understanding the goals;
- Co-operation from the stakeholders;
- Support from the local agencies;
- Enthusiastic commitment of the staff members; and
- Well designed project management plan such as participatory preparation of RBM and work-plan with realistic timelines.

Factors impeding the production of outputs

Production of outputs is impeded by the following factors: Two elections held during the project period;

- Slow response of the Government telecom company's officials for broad band connectivity;
- Slow speed of the broad band connectivity;
- VKC staff attrition;
- Frequent Interruption of power supply in the VKCs; and
- Low level of computerization in Govt. departments to provide online services.

Extent of Operationalisation of the project recommendations

The extent of operationalization of the project recommendations are illustrated below:

Institutional

- Establishment and maintenance of VKC;
- Improved quality of service;

• Working in coordination with various stakeholders;

- Increased community participation;
- Increased experience in implementing and operating ICT projects for community development;
- Increased expertise in preparation of voice mail, video films and related products;
- Enhanced resource allocation and capacity building; and
- Goodwill of the agency and federation has been established.

Infrastructural

- Four VKC's has been established;
- 250 mobile phones distributed to Women SHG leaders;
- Computers with installed software at office for training purposes;
- Internet connectivity;
- 200 voicemails; and
- 15 videos on social theme.

Financial

• VKCs have started generating revenue by providing services to villagers such as printing, information, electricity bill collection and submission.

Logistical

- Resource persons;
- Technical skill of the personnel;
- Training materials;
- Still camera;
- LCD projector;
- Web camera;
- Mobile phones; and
- Head phones.

Effect of Outputs/Results on the Target Groups of the Project The key effects of the outputs of the project on the identified target groups are:



Expected outcome 1: The negotiating and bargaining power of the women among the SHGs will increase especially when dealing with banks, governments and marketing agencies. The effects on this outcome were:

- There is an increase in the negotiation skills of women as evident by the quantum increase of financial assistance extended by local banks;
- Higher levels of bargaining and negotiation power for marketing of agricultural and animal products as members are informed on daily basis on such issues;
- 650 women regularly receive voicemail on topics beneficial not just for them but also for their family members;
- Women are now familiar with judiciary procedures and related local officials of the Government as is apparent from the number of cases registered by women in the Bodi Legal Aid Services Authority after getting orientation through video conferencing. It encouraged more women to approach Women Conciliation Center (WCC) for redressal than before;
- Level of negotiation skills has improved;
- Nearly 20 women members have applied for development schemes after getting information from ICLIS this is first of its kind in the area;
- Motivated women members to enrol themselves as computer trainee and to encourage their children (more than 100) to pursue computer learning; and
- 500 women for Milch Animal and 100 Women for Goat Rearing have applied to Indian Overseas Bank (I.O.B) Theni for financial assistance.

Expected outcome 2: At the household level, assets owned by women will increase.

• 80% of the household property is in the name of SHG women.

Expected outcome 3: Total credit flow of Rs. 2 crores from various financial institutions for micro enterprises.

• The credit flow has gone up to 3 Crores (including the financial assistance sought from Indian Overseas Bank, Theni.)

Expected outcome 4: The project will become a role model for Legal Aid Cells and NALSA.

• It has become a role model as evident by the level of participation and outcome.

Unforeseen/Unintended Outputs Resultant from the Project

The unintended outputs that have resulted due to the project are:

- High level of usage by students for educational purposes;
- Increased services to youth for employment opportunities and accessing results of competitive exams;
- Marketing data on vegetables and flowers to the farmers;
- Registration of non-target groups with Women Conciliation Center (WCC) for legal redressal; and
- 20 male farmers from the project area and 200 farmers from Dindigul District (outside the project area) requested for getting voicemail services.

3.12.7 Project Sustainability Considerations

The considerations to make the project sustainable are as follows:

- Total Credit flow of Rs. 2 crores from various financial institutions for micro-enterprises;
- The negotiating and bargaining power and skills of women among the SHGs will increase especially when dealing with banks, government department and marketing agencies;
- At the household level, assets owned by women will increase; and
- The project will become a role model for Legal Aid Cells and NALSA.


Project Institutional Arrangements

The institutional arrangements of the project are mentioned below:

- Preparing the Federation to take up the project components;
- Staff orientation and training;
- Eliciting the participation;
- Allocation of responsibilities;
- Public relations work;
- Facilitating the stakeholders;
- Agreement between various stakeholder especially for Voice mail service and ICLIS;
- Production of VCD's on social themes;
- Arranging for resource persons;
- Monitoring and evaluation process;
- Monthly and quarterly reports preparation and submission;
- Establishment of VKCs in four villages;
- Video conferencing facility at Rasingapuram office;
- Technical training and support to VKC staff; and
- Partnership with AAC for development of ICLIS.

Extent of Commitment/Involvement/Ownership of Stakeholders

Various stakeholders have the following commitments, involvement and ownership in the project:

Federation

- Evolves criteria to establish VKC's at the village;
- Involved in selection of 4 out of 6 candidate villages;

- Decision making related to building/house for VKCs;
- Selection of staff for the VKC from the local village and to finalize the service conditions; and
- Owns VKC after successful establishment

IFFCO - AIRTEL

- Accepted to venture the voice mail on experimental basis and planned to get feedback from the beneficiaries. However subsequently agreed to broadcast the voice mails on regular basis.
- Installed towers at required locations; and
- Provided Master SIM to the VIDIYAL.

Bodi Legal Aid Services Authority

• Committed to provide free legal services. Also agreed to offer orientation, training, conducting awareness camps, on the spot registration of cases and counselling services to individuals.

Arul Anandar College

• Agreed to design user friendly ICLIS for rural people and to include new Governmental schemes / projects as and when introduced.

Degree of Support Provided by the Government

Government departments and agencies are providing following support to the project:

- Support extended by BODI Legal Aid Services Authority on Legal matters;
- Providing information on various schemes of the govt. development departments;



- Bridging the digital divide by establishing and promoting ICT and e-Governance;
- Promotion of knowledge capital so that community can participate in the development process with the government; and
- Bringing rural community into the main stream so that national development becomes a reality.

Efforts to Replicate Project Results

Following cases showcase the efforts put in to replicate the project results in other areas:

- Appeal has been made to the District Administration to replicate such projects and also to promote more online services;
- Request sent to NABARD and Indian Overseas Bank to include the concept of LIFE LONG LEARNING (L3F) in their policy; and
- Voice mail services extended to more than 200 male farmers residing outside the project area.



EVALUATING THE PROJECT

The project has been evaluated on five parameters viz. Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Results/Impacts and Sustainability which were further affirmed by subparameters illustrated in Table 76 that exhibits the evaluation in six categories of Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Moderately Satisfactory, Moderately Unsatisfactory, Unsatisfactory And Highly Unsatisfactory, accounting respectively for 6,5,4,3,2 and 1 points. The right most column substantiates the scores. The rating for each of the parameters was arrived at after averaging on the ratings for each of the sub-parameters. Similarly the overall evaluation rating were arrived at after averaging on the parameter ratings.



Figure 50 Evaluating the Project- VIDIYAL





KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE NEXT STEPS

CONSTITUTION OR A GUIDING MANUAL FOR EACH SHG

As of now each SHG has a resolution note prepared at the time of their formation which works as a charter for the group. However, as volumes increase, a guiding document would be required for stakeholders to lay out roles and responsibilities for the participating stakeholders and to generally guide the SHG's operations, direction, issue resolution, conflict management etc.

SUSTAINABLE BUSINESS MODEL FOR VKCS

The current revenue model of VKCs is not adequate to support their sustenance post expiry of funding from external sources. Its revenue mainly consists of contribution from members, charges for printing, electricity bill collection & submission and computer classes which are quite low as compared to their expenses including salaries and operational & maintenance cost. Additional sources of revenue need to be contemplated. These could come from providing additional services through VKCs, information and content services such as information (agriculture, education, handicraft etc.) to farmers & other users using ICLIS, marketing etc.

Locally produced value-added products for example in food processing and their marketing, harnessing local crafts and the like could also be considered. ICT channels could be used for sale and promotion of these products and associated services.

However, if such services are to be used, quality certification and standardization for above mentioned food processing products would be required too.

Ask a doctor service could also be provided through VKCs by tie-up with specialists whose details are already available with VIDIYAL (such as Veterinary doctors, eye specialists and hospitals).

STRATEGY FOR SUSTAINING VKCS AFTER IMPLEMENTATION OF CSCS IN THE AREA

As most of the services currently being provided by VKCs would also come under the purview of CSCs which would be supported by government, sustenance of VKCs may become a concern. Appropriate steps should be taken up to mitigate this situation. For example, VKCs may contract with government to run CSCs in their area using the existing infrastructure and resources or provide services that would not be covered under CSCs and that can make VKCs more popular than CSCs.

ALIGNMENT WITH GOVT. SCHEMES

The VKCs are currently not aligned to government schemes. It is suggested that such alignment options be explored to take advantage of effects of synergy that may thereby result.

COLLABORATION WITH GOVERNMENT AGENCIES

This could be done for support in areas such as information, funding, technical knowledge, cooperation etc.

REDUCING DEPENDENCE ON PRODUCTS SUCH AS SKYPE FOR VIDEO CONFERENCING AND COMMUNICATION

Alternatives such as g-Talk, Yahoo messenger etc. should also be explored as recent development at national level suggest that in near future Skype and similar services may be restricted due to various commercial and security implications.

DEVELOPMENT OF A PORTAL FOR PROMOTION, ADVERTISEMENT AND SERVICE DELIVERY

Construction and operationalisation of a comprehensive portal is suggested that would serve as the gateway for all information of activities related to the project plus other benefits that could be conceived while designing the same.



3.12.8 Project Evaluation Matrix

							Table 76 Detailed evaluation matrix for ICT for Women Conciliation Center
Evaluation matrix	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
					RELEV	ANCE/	
Needs of the beneficiary captured							 Beneficiaries covered are only those who are a part of Self-help group federations Alignment with Government could have been stronger Other civil society organizations working in similar areas were not covered / contacted
Relevant to needs & expectations of beneficiary							 Segmentation is loosely done however no formal procedure of segmentation seems to be carried out Offerings are tailored for these loosely designed done
Relevant to development priorities of Govt. of India							• It is loosely aligned with developmental priorities of GoI however not aligned to any specific development programme of the Government
Relevant to development priorities of concerned State Government							 It is loosely aligned with developmental priorities of Tamil Nadu Government however not aligned to any specific development programme
Identified problem has high incidence in area of focus							 Frequent and continuous incidences reported in the area Substantial number of individuals of the targeted vulnerable group (rural women) are affected Similar problem affecting vulnerable groups in other parts of the country
Correct & accurate identification of target stakeholders and/or correctly defined vulnerable groups							 Stakeholder segments including vulnerable groups such as dowry-affected women, widows etc. Not all individuals are covered
Adequacy of Government commitment to project							• The project is receiving coordination assistance in form of availability of information on Government programmes etc. however is not receiving any financial or technical assistance
Project relevance to ICT4D focus under the project							 Voice SMSs brings relevant information to women anywhere, anytime without sacrificing their time and money Video conferencing results in significant increase in reach of the conciliation services and decrease in cost and effort of rural women





		I	PROJEC	I-WISE	FINDIN	GS	
EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
		•		EI	FFECT	IVENES	55
Problem been stated correctly and distinctly							Problems identified, defined and documentedSelf validation of identified problems
Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries, users of the project are identified as stakeholders of the project							 Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries and users have been identified as stakeholders Roles and responsibilities of all stakeholders have been detailed out
The assumptions, objectives, outputs and outcomes have been clearly articulated in measurable terms							 Objectives, outputs and outcomes vaguely identified. Certain assumptions articulated Subjective measurement terms in use
The linkages between objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was clear							• Logical linkages present but not documented
The project design allowed for flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment.							• Project design capable of adapting to and responding positively to most of the possible types of changes
Degree of support given by the Government towards integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme and other related projects							• Project objectives and goals not aligned with any specific programme of the Government.
Planning component of the project take into account the use of ICT for improved governance / service delivery in various areas through pilot initiatives, encouraging BPR, development local solutions and applications and encouragement of PPP model							 Voice SMS for information dissemination, video conferencing for women conciliation, touch screens for application usage, application to let a women know about the Govt. schemes for which she is eligible BPR is not relevant here as most of these services are new PPP (with Airtel) to provide voice mail services to rural women
The adequacy of institutional arrangements in attaining the long-term objective of the project. Also the infrastructural, logistical, and financial implication of sustaining the project objectives beyond the project duration/after completion of UNDP funding.							 Institutional bodies such as SHG Federation, SHGs, VKCs etc. have been set- up with defined roles and responsibilities for attaining long-term goals Required assets including PCs, Master SIM card, Touch Screens, application software, network connectivity etc. have been acquired and maintained properly Adequate financial arrangements (e.g. financial tie-up with Airtel for



Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							operation of voice mails) are in place for sustaining the project
Project's linkages, liaison, coordination and impact upon related activities under NeGP being implemented in the country.							 Loosely aligned with NeGP as illustrated by duplication of services to be provided by CSC (Government's initiative) and negligible support and buy-in of Government
The project's assistance, relationship, relevance to and coordination with the pre- existing Project management system and staff							• The project utilizes both the pre-existing management system (in form of SHG federation and SHG's and their relation with VIDIYAL) as well as staff (pre-existing staff of VIDIYAL) effectively and coordinates with them effectively
Clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various institutional arrangements for overall programme management and implementation and the level of coordination between relevant players							 Roles and responsibilities of all of the stakeholders were defined clearly Management processes have been clearly laid down for proper coordination between the players such as SHGs, SHG federation and Vidiyal
Risk assessment and management of the project							 Most of the potential risks were noted down Mitigation strategies for identified risk have been laid down The risk management and mitigation plan was substantially adhered
Efforts of stakeholders in support of the implementation of the project							 The project proposal submitted to UNDP was documented in coordination with most of the stakeholders with partial buy-in of certain stakeholders e.g. Government Most of the stakeholders have extended support as envisaged from them during the proposal stage.
Extent of conflict of interest either between stakeholders involved in the project or with outside agencies.							• CSC is being set up by the Government which would provide some of the information services currently being provided by the project. Moreover CSCs would have direct ownership and support of the Govt. which this project does not have.
					EFFIC	IENCY	
Was a formal workplan made at the start of the project to determine the timeframe in which activities would be performed							 Detailed workplan prepared for all important activities Week wise timelines defined for each activity
Were resources made available to the project implementation agencies in accordance with the requirements of the							• None of the key resources, only a few of the support staff replaced. However the replacements had similar qualification and experience as proposed ones





Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
workplan							
Extent of deviation in the project implementation in so far as timelines is concerned.							• Project implementation delayed by less than 15% of overall duration
Responsiveness of the project management to such deviations and flexibility to deploy resources							• Management taking some steps in terms of extra resources (time and effort) to somehow correct the course of implementation
Were any systems, processes, manuals etc made to govern the activities in the project among the different stakeholders							 Written governing manual available for Federation and SHGs to govern the project activities The instructions are followed by the stakeholders
Extent to which Results Based Management has been used							• Continuous RBM under usage at every stage. The key activities followed are a)Formation of Steering committee, b) Maintenance of records and attendance, c)Regular and periodical visits, d)VKC management committee constituted and monthly meeting is conducted, e)Submission of accounts and reports by the VKC staff to the Federation, f)Twice weekly visit by the technical staff to VKC, g) Feed back received for Voice mail about the content and clarity, h) Teleconferencing of staff and the SHG members to the central office, i) Follow up programme for ICLIS beneficiaries by the staff and j)Internal monitoring committee for periodical review at every month
Whether there was adequacy of steps taken to resolve any conflict of interest in or due to the project							 Generic process of following up with Government has been planned to resolve the conflict of interest arising due to setting-up of CSCs in the region by the Government. Marginal efforts towards addressing this issue during the conceptualization phase.
				RE	SULTS	/IMPAC	CTS
Whether the project has produced its desired immediate outputs							• Majority (50% to less than 75%) of the immediate outputs achieved
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, use of the new outputs as against the traditional options)							• Most of the intended beneficiaries used the project output in more than 75% cases and in 25% or less cases used traditional options



Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, percentage of the target population)							• About 50% of the intended beneficiaries utilized the project output
Extent of drop-outs from usage of the outputs by the intended beneficiaries							 Marginal (Less than 25%) drop-out from usage of outputs by the intended beneficiaries
Are there any unforeseen/ unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups							 The project resulted in certain unforeseen positive effects caused which promotes the existing developmental efforts in the region including: 20 male farmers (non-targeted beneficiaries) in the project area and 200 farmers in Dindigul District (non-targeted region) volunteered for voicemails and now getting the benefits The ICT induced learning has motivated the women members to encourage their children (more than 100) to pursue computer learning Registration of Non-target groups with Women Conciliation Center (WCC) for legal redressal. Promoted greater involvement of youth for employment opportunities and results of competitive exams
Extent of the project results on the target beneficiaries in terms of (a) Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, (b) Capacity Building, (c) Change Management, (d) Business Process Re-engineering, (f) Public Private Partnership, (g) Bridging the Digital Divide, and (h) Knowledge and Experience Sharing		•					 Excellence has been achieved in following areas relevant to the project: Citizen-centric service delivery: information availability, identification of schemes eligible for an individual, information on agriculture related topics, etc. Capacity building and bridging the digital divide: of rural women in using ICT tools for their development such as usage of mobile for accessing voice mails, PCs (using touch screens) to access information related to Government schemes and work PPP: tie-up with Airtel to provide voice mails free of cost to all the beneficiaries and charging marginal money in case of repeat listening of the voice mail Knowledge and experience sharing: beneficiaries are sharing their experiences using videos and voice mails
Extent of the project impact on the target groups in terms of (a) governance (improved efficiency, transparency and accountability), (b) citizen-centric service delivery (advantages of cost, time and convenience), (c) rural livelihoods (number of jobs, extent and sufficiency of employment), and (d) women's empowerment (increased		•					Excellence has been achieved in significant number of cases in following relevant areas: • Citizen centric service delivery • Women empowerment • Rural livelihood





EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
knowledge, and use of the same to voice their concerns).							
Extent of significance of the project impact on the development of the region/country							 Indicators for development were defined during project conceptualization stage Word was spread across the region and volunteers from non-targeted areas also coming forward and expressing interest in using the benefits of the project. This is evident from the fact that 200 farmers from Dindigul District (non-targeted region) volunteered for voicemails and are now availing the benefits
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by marginalized communities							 Most of the marginalized communities have utilized the project output in more than 50% cases where they needed similar service
Extent to which capacities have been built in stakeholders during the project							• Capacities of the main stakeholders i.e. VKS staff and SHG members have been built up to atleast perform the necessary operational and maintenance activities assigned to them
				Sl	JSTAIN		ГҮ
Extent of ownership of stakeholders in the project							• Complete ownership of all the 'implementing and operating' stakeholders in the project including SHG Federation, SHGs, VKS staff, SHG members, rural women, Airtel etc.
Degree of support given by the Government in integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme							• Project objectives and goals not aligned with any specific Government programme. The partner had approached the Government for support (in terms of converting the VKCs into CSCs) but Government has not agreed to this support yet.
Extent of availability of inputs/resources required for the project (people, finances, infrastructure, equipments)							• Resources in all the four area - people, finances, infrastructure, equipments were completely available during the part duration of the project
Have any revenue streams been defined in the project to make it self-sustaining							• Revenue stream has been defined in details (including membership fees from the women, fees for usage of ICT infrastructure and applications such as service to identify eligible schemes, printing, exam results, computer training etc. However not all the possible areas have been captured properly and this may affect the sustainability in long-term post expiry of the funding from UNDP



Evaluation matrix	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent of success of such pre-defined revenue streams							• Achieving atleast 75% of the target
Extent to which inventory of the assets created out of the grants received in the project have been properly maintained and transferred to the beneficiaries							• Assets received under the project such as PCs, touch screens, camera, internet modems, Master SIM (for sending Voice mails) etc. have been maintained well and the VKC staff have been trained in using and maintain these assets.
Degree of collaboration that has developed among stakeholders during the project							 Stakeholder management plan is well defined and have complete adherence during project execution (e.g. formal minutes of all management meetings are documented and signed by the stakeholders). Stakeholders including SHG Federation, SHG, VKC staff and operational partners such as Airtel were involved during operational and strategic decision making
Extent to which government is willing to finance the project after its completion of the UNDP funding							• No funding committed by the Government





3.13 Mobile Information Technology for Rural Advancement - MITRA

Table 77 Introduction-MITRA

Project Title	MITRA (Mobile information technology for Rural Advancement)
Proponent Organisation	PEDO
Implementation State	Rajasthan
Target Site for Pilot Project	Dungarpur District in Rajasthan
Theme of Project	Leveraging Mobile Based Management Information System for Women's Empowerment through Microfinance.
Target Population	1400 Tribal women's Self-Help Groups consisting 24,000 women members.
Project Cost	Rs. 75,59,200.00
Funding Required for Project	Rs. 60,00,000.00
Time Required to Implement Project	Six Months
Name(s) of Partner Agencies	NA



IMPACT OF THE PROJECT-IN BRIEF

Project MITRA has effectively & efficiently used mobile technology to automate complicated accounting and information processing needs of a rural micro-finance institution, given the remote locations and limited financial means of the small SHGs..

OBJECTIVE AREAS	OUTPUTS	OUTCOMES
Introduce information communication technology in tribal area	 Mobile handset and thermal printer has been provided in each SHG One desktop with internet connection is installed in each federation. 	 Direct entry of data in to the server from the source of information lead to avoidance of error Computerized receipts bring in more faith in SHG members Online access to account information at the federation centres provides real time information access
Develop & educate local women to utilize information communications technology and to promote self sustained, self managed women's organisation.	 A team of 25 trainers has been trained to organize group level induction courses for SHGs User manual for both mobile and web applications are prepared 	• ICT training has facilitated at least one member of each SHG group to operate mobile phone and thermal printers to records transaction data and generate computerized receipts. This has reduced dependency of SHG member on external agency/ person to record keeping.
Develop efficient, user friendly and transparent system for primary stakeholders (SHG) for providing micro financing services.	• ICT application has been developed to automate record keeping of SHG transactions.	 Increase efficiency- per community workers savings 10 days in a month due to automation in book keeping which can be utilized in livelihood generation. Reduction of cost of processing of receipt and compilation of accounts Increased accountability of person operating mobile & generating receipts



3.13.1 Project Background

About PEDO-The Proponent Organisation

People's Education and Development Organization (PEDO) was established in Dungarpur, Rajasthan in the year 1987-88 after a series of draughts with a mission to 'Strengthen value based people's institution to utilize existing resources for poverty alleviation and environmental up-gradation'. PEDO promoted **MICROFINANCE** program among rural women with a view to accumulate local resources/ saving and provide funds for investment in agriculture sector and asset building for sustainable livelihood.

Structure of PEDO's Microfinance Network

PEDO's microfinance network has a three tier structure comprising of:

- <u>Tier One</u> Self Help Group (SHG) Comprising of maximum of 20 women members of a village.
- Tier Two Cluster Comprising of maximum of 20 SHGs
- Tier Three- Federation- Comprising of maximum of 8 clusters

PEDO provides assistance to all these institutions for their effective functioning.

Table 79 provides high level description of the organizational set up and role of the above structures:

Accounting & MIS Requirements of Microfinance Operations

The registers/ records maintained at each level of microfinance institutions are as follow:

- Self Help Group level: Cash Books, Member's Diaries, Ledger, Bank Accounts, Meeting Minutes, Receipts and Attendance.
- Cluster Level: Consolidation of groups' accounts, Income expenditure sheets, Financial and loans status sheets, group level livelihood projections.

PEDO's Outreach in Microfinance Program

- Village Covered: 520
- Total No. of Groups: 2121
- Total No. of Clusters: 92
- Total No. of Federations: 12
- Total Members: 35941 (only one member for one households)
- Total Savings: Rs. 76 million
- Total Loan (Bank): Rs. 434 million
- Total amount of Loan disbursed: About Rs. 530 million
- Total No. of Loans: 88082
- Average loan size: Rs. 6035
- Repayment Rate: 91%
- Total Loan at risk: 3%
- Federation Level: Consolidation of Clusters' accounts, Income Expenditure records, loan repayment records, risk loans, loan verifications, auditing of accounts

Prior to introduction of ICT, all the accounts, records and other MIS were manually recorded and consolidated at various levels.

Issues Faced

PEDO has found that one of the main stumbling blocks for the development of microfinance has been the capacity to handle the complicated accounting and information processing needs i.e. acquiring and collating data from a variety of field sources, maintaining records and performing periodic updates and processing. This usually proves to be an unmanageable burden for most SHGs.





Tiers	Role and Focus
SHG Members	 Timely deposition of saving and loan repayment Collect hand written receipt and maintain personal account Attend regular group meeting and maintain discipline of the group
SHG (20 SHG Members) - TIER ONE SHG Leadership Elected from members -President -Treasurer PEDO staff Field Trainer (One Field Trainer for 20 SHGs or one cluster)	 Conducting SHG meetings Collecting Savings and Repayment of loans Issuing to the members for all transaction Book keeping and Generating Account statements Depositing Cash to the Banks Disbursing small loans (up to Rs.5000) Verification of loan utilization Discussion and identification of Livelihood promotion activities.
Cluster (20 SHGs) - TIER TWO Cluster Leadership- Elected from SHG leadership -President -Secretary PEDO staff -Field Trainer (one for Every Cluster)	 Conducting Cluster meetings Checking and Consolidation of SHGs' Accounts and Generating Clusters account statements Planning of Livelihood promotion activities Marketing of SHG products Sanctioning Larger loans (More than Rs 5000) Monitoring the performance of Repayments of SHGs
Federation (8 Clusters)- TIER THREE Federation Leadership Elected from Cluster leadership -Federation President -Executive body (consisting the leaders of Cluster) PEDO staff -Member Secretary -Accountant	 Review and Planning for SHGs and Clusters for livelihood, bank loans, marketing, previous meeting minutes and attendance, loan over-dues and Savings Financial Monitoring of Clusters and SHGs Policy Decisions Coordinating Auditing of SHGs and Cluster accounts Event Organization for Foundation day and other occasions Budgeting and collecting contributions by SHGs and Clusters Developing linkages with banks and other departments Conflict Resolution Developing livelihood activities, marketing of products and technical support to SHGs

Moreover, given the remote locations and limited financial means of these small SHGs, computerization appears to be immensely



difficult. Also, the group leaders did not have the training and education to properly maintain records or produce regular reports using computers

In order to overcome the above difficulties, **PROJECT MOBILE INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY FOR RURAL ADVANCEMENT (MITRA)** was conceived and executed by PEDO with support from United Nations Development Program, Department of Information Technology (Government of India) and National Institute for SMART Government (NISG) as part of the ICT4D initiatives in India. The project leverages mobile technologies for setting up a management information system for women's empowerment through microfinance.

Project Description- Mobile Information Technology for Rural Advancement (MITRA)

The vision of the project MITRA is to promote self sustained, self



managed women's organization for Social and Economic Empowerment by establishing a transparent and easily accessible Management Information System (MIS) that can be utilized to develop an ownership of Women's Institution which has helped in educating local women's cadre to utilize ICT.

The project uses mobile & web technology to automate the tasks of recording and consolidation of data pertaining to all SHG transactions. The technical architecture of MITRA is illustrated in Figure 52.

A mobile handset and a thermal printer have been provided to members of SHG. The mobile handset is connected with thermal printer using Bluetooth mechanism. During the SHG meeting, data pertaining to various transactions such as payment of fee, repayment of loan, deposition of savings, etc of each SHG member is entered into the software application installed in the mobile handset. After the completion of data entry of any transaction two copies of the transaction receipt are generated from the attached printer, one for the member and other for the federation for their records.

Once the SHG meeting is over, the transaction data stored in the mobile handset is then transferred to central server using SMS. For each transaction an SMS is send to the central server which automatically updates accounting and members records. Also, data is automatically consolidated at SHG level, cluster level and also at federation level leading to considerable saving in time, efforts and cost involved in manual consolidation of records. Members can view their records online at the computers installed at the Federation centres.







3.13.2 Project Strategic Objectives

The key strategic objectives of the project include:

- Introduce information communication technology in tribal area
- Develop and educate local women to utilize information communications technology and to promote self sustained, self managed women's organisation for Social and Economic Empowerment.
- Develop efficient, user friendly and transparent system for primary stakeholders (SHG) for providing micro financing

services.

3.13.3 Project Relevance Inputs

Identification of Information and Services Needs

The following information and service needs are identified for the project:

• Capacity Building - One of the crucial stumbling blocks for the development of microfinance has been capacity building to

Table 80 Project Stakeholders and Roles- PEDO

267

Stakeholder	Role(s) Played
SHG members	End user as well as project implementers. Select SHG members are trained to operate mobile device and attached printers to provide digital receipts to members.
Ekgoan Technologies	Development of mobile based software and Web based software for MIS One year service, and support in procurement of required hardware
Vodafone	Mobile network providers for dissemination of information from mobile handset to central server.
Federation of Cluster	Facilitate online viewing of SHG data using computer and internet facility
PEDO	PEDO played a crucial role as implementing agency. It's roles include the following - project conceptualization, vendor selection, information need identification, project management and monitoring, etc

handle the complex nature of accounting and information processing needs and effective data management from various field sources. Therefore capacity building of SHG members was identified as a basic need for promotion of microfinance.

• Management Information System (MIS) - Need has been felt to implement and outsource integrated top-to-bottom MIS for managing SHG operations. This would enable data processing and management tasks to be handled by more capable and trained staff, while maintaining the overall ownership and management of their institution.

• **Digital Receipt Providing System** - Clear need was identified for setting up of digital receipt providing system for transactions for increased transparency and faith of the members.

The above mentioned information and service needs have been

Table 81 Theme-based Activities (PEDO)

Theme	Activities
Bridging the Digital	Information flow through phone by SMS to central server to automate record keeping of SHG transactions
Divide	Computerized receipts to SHG Members for all transactions undertaken by them
Citizen-Centric Service	Online access of account information to SHG members at Federation centres
Delivery	Computerized receipts bring in more transparency and faith in SHG members
Public Private Partnership	 Partnership with M/s ekgoan technology for mobile and web software development Vodafone for mobile connectivity Banks to enable SHGs to avail loans at a concessional rate
Capacity Building	• First induction /orientation was conducted with core group of PEDO and Federation level leaders, their secretaries and field level accountant regarding the use of mobile based MIS system and generation of various reports and accounts.
	 A team of 25 trainers has been trained to organize group level induction courses for SHGs User manual for both mobile and web applications are prepared to facilitate data entry and report generation At federation level people have been trained in computer and internet usage.
	Parallel implementation of both manual and automated system.
Change Management	Awareness creation campaign among SHG to ensure acceptability of mobile technology
	• Overcoming the internet connectivity issue at remote locations by use of mobile technology to automate information flow.
Business Process	 Direct entry of data in to the server from the source of information leading to avoidance of error Automatic consolidation of information SHG-wise/ Federation-wise saves considerable time and efforts in manual consolidation.
Reengineering	• Online access to account information and download facility of account statement at the federation centres provide real time access of information to SHG members
	• Time saving of each worker due to automation of record keeping that has been now been utilized in livelihood activities.
Knowledge/Experience Sharing	 In many platform experience has been shared and many NGOs and government department has approached to use this system
Others	First time community was able to use mobile phone for SHG accounting exercise



identified through collaborative pool of need identification through following techniques -

- Focus Group Discussions
- Formal meetings with SHG member
- Discussion with SHG, Cluster & Federation leadership team
- Trainings and workshops, etc

The technology outsourced partner agency Ekgaon Technologies deputed their expert team to identify the need and user-friendly system of MIS on Mobile.

3.13.4 Project Effectiveness Inputs

Project Stakeholders and Envisaged Roles

Table 80 brings out the different stakeholders involved and the roles they played.

Risks and Mitigation Strategies

The major perceived project risks & mitigation strategy are as follow:

- Risk of Increase in Hardware Cost: Increase in cost and maintenance of mobile phones and hardware utilities (server, computers, UPS) used for project may jeopardise project progress. To overcome this and to ensure procurement of all necessary hardware, budget can be re-allocated from other less important activity to hardware procurement.
- Weak Mobile Signal. Weak signals disrupt transfer of data from mobile handset to central server. To overcome this, mobile handset is provided with additional storage capacity to store the transaction and send SMS from the place where adequate signals are available. Further, mobile network providers would be requested to install towers to improve signals.
- Unavailability of Power: Frequent power cuts can disrupts functioning of computers installed at federation & headquarter

level. To overcome this adequate power back is provided at both levels.

• Data Security: Data security is crucial and loss of data could be disastrous for the functioning of microfinance operations. To overcome this, it is envisaged to take regular back of data maintained at central server.

3.13.5 Project Efficiency Inputs

Activities Performed in different Dimensions of Intervention

Table 81 lists out activities performed under different dimensions of intervention

Project Management Approach

PEDO has ensured effective planning, organizing, and management of resources to achieve the laid down goals and objectives. Project was managed by the core team of PEDO and timely completed as per the plan.

The feedback has constantly been obtained from SHG members during monthly meetings.

Extent of Usage of Local Expertise

There has been considerable involvement of local expertise in the form of involvement of SHG members coupled with help provided by PEDO staff.

The software application (both mobile and web based) has been developed and customized with adequate input from SHG, Cluster and federation members.

SHG members have been trained to effectively use the new devises (mobile handsets, Bluetooth printer, etc.) and generate receipts on site. Further, IT experts for application and server maintenance are recruited locally. Data digitization is also undertaken by local youth of Dungarpur, Rajasthan.



		Table 82 Tiers, ICT and Roles
Tiers	ICT Introduction	Role And Focus
SHG Members	• Mobile generated receipt will be provided for all transaction	 Timely deposition of saving and loan repayment Collect mobile receipt and access account information online at federation centre Attend regular group meeting and maintain discipline of the group
SHG (20 SHG Members) SHG Leadership Elected from members -President -Treasurer PEDO staff Field Trainer (One Field Trainer for 20 SHGs or one cluster)	 Field trainers, who attend all the meeting of the SHG in the Cluster, are provided with mobile based management information system and blue 	 Conducting SHG meetings Collecting Savings and Repayment of loans Issuing digitized receipts to the members for all transaction Updating account information through mobile updater Automatic up dation of account books Depositing Cash to the Banks Disbursing small loans (up to Rs.5000) Verification of loan utilization Discussion and identification of Livelihood promotion activities.
Cluster (20 SHGs) Cluster Leadership- Elected from SHG leadership -President -Secretary PEDO staff -Field Trainer (one for Every Cluster)	tooth receipt printer. He/ she needs to provide receipt to the members against all the transaction and report them to the central hub	 Conducting Cluster meetings Automatic Consolidation of SHGs' Accounts and Generating Clusters account statements Monitoring the performance of SHGs by pre-generated account statement and presenting the same to SHG Planning of Livelihood promotion activities Marketing of SHG products Sanctioning Larger loans (More than Rs 5000) Monitoring the performance of Repayments of SHGs
Federation (8 Clusters) Federation Leadership Elected from Cluster leadership -Federation President -Executive body (consisting the leaders of Cluster) PEDO staff -Member Secretary -Accountant	• Federation accountant will be provided with a computer, printer and internet connectivity. He/ she may browse and print accounts of a group/ individual member (modification/ deletion of any entry is allowed only in exception circumstances)	 Review and Planning for SHGs and Clusters for livelihood, bank loans, marketing, previous meeting minutes and attendance, loan over-dues and Savings Financial Monitoring of Clusters and SHGs by pre-generated account statement and presenting the same to SHG/ Cluster Policy Decisions Coordinating Auditing of SHGs and Cluster accounts through pre-generated account statement Event Organization for Foundation day and other occasions Budgeting and collecting contributions by SHGs and Clusters Developing linkages with banks and other departments Conflict Resolution Developing livelihood activities, marketing of products and technical support to SHGs





Management Processes Followed during the Project

The project periodically conducts the following processes:

- Stakeholders meetings;
- Preparation of RBM based LFA;
- Preparation of work plan;
- Time schedules for various project activities;
- Allocation of human resources;
- Monitoring and reporting;
- Preparation of quarterly report;
- Preparation of training plan;
- Internal evaluation;

Extent of Usage of RBM and Performance Indicators

The project was being monitored quarterly with intermediate bimonthly achievement targets set for the entire team. Also, quarterly reporting to the funding agency was carried out, providing the status of the funds utilized and the progress made in project activities and achievement of the scheduled deliverables.

The evaluation of the project was carried out based on defined performance indicators to assess the utility of the project implementation and to assess work progress against estimates and scheduled plans.

3.13.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated

Table 83 provides high level impact/ changes due to implementation of the project at each level of the microfinance institution (changes in role/ focus has been highlighted, this table should been seen in conjunction with table 82 describing roles/ focus areas of these institutions in the past)

Factors Facilitating/Impeding the Production of Outputs Key facilitating factors include:

• Wide spread acceptability of implementing agency i.e. PEDO

- Co-operation from the stakeholders
- Availability of mobile network even at remote locations
- Enthusiastic commitment of the staff members; and

Factors impeding the production of outputs are:

- Slow response of the telecom company's officials for broad band connectivity at federation centres; Slow speed of broad band;
- Weak mobile network at a few extremely remote locations
- Massive data digitisation of past records.

Extent of Operationalization of the project recommendations

• Both Mobile & Web application have been developed. MITRA web application is built on Model View Controller (MVC) framework sing PHP and MySQL. The technologies that were being used for the development of the application include PHP 5.2, MySQL 5.0, XHTML, Apache 2.1, CSS, JavaScript, PEAR, CURL

Parameters	Before Project	After Project
ICT Awareness	Nil or Very Low	Substantially Increased
Duplication of efforts in accounting and info-processing	High	Nil or Very Low
Consolidation of Cluster/ Federation Accounts	Manual	Automatic
Online accessibility of Account Information	Non-existent	Accessed online
Processing cost of receipts and accounts compilation	High	Low
Mobile phone usage	Nil or Very Low	Substantially Increased

Table 83 Impact of the Project- PEDO



		Table 84-Hardware Procured
ltem	Unit	Place
HEADQUARTER LEVEL		
Server	1	Dungarpur
GSM Modem	1	Dungarpur
Personal Computer	1	Dungarpur
Internet Connection broad band (BSNL)	1	Dungarpur
FEDERATION LELEL		
Personal computer with UPS.	8	Mada, Bichhiwara, Genji, Dhambola, Mandali, Pith, Kuan
Dot-matrix printer	8	and Jasela
Internet connection	8	
Mobile phone	70	
Bluetooth printer	70	

Table 82 provides details of hardware procured:

MIS Based Report Generation

External loan ledger for member

External loan ledger for group

Internal loan ledger

Monthly saving report

• The various reports/ registered that can be generated from the system is provided in Table 83.

Effect of Outputs/Results on the Target Groups of the Project

The key benefit of the project is as follows:

- Increase efficiency- per community workers savings 10 days in a month due to automation in book keeping which can be utilized in livelihood generation activities.
- More transparency as SHG member can cross-check their accounts information online at federation office
- Increased accountability of person operating mobile devise and generating receipts
- Reduction of cost of processing of receipt and compilation of accounts
- **Reduce human error** as information is directly updated through mobile SMS leading to minimum human intervention.

The key outcomes of the project include:

- Knowledge is power and easy & timely access of information leads to substantial empowerment of the SHGs
- More time devoted in livelihood activities
- Increase trust in the function of microfinance programme
- · Increase capacity of community workers

Table 85-List of Records Generated From the System

Accounting Information Based Report Generation

External loan ledger- group

Internal loan ledger

Investment Member history • Timely review and feedback to SHG/ federation performance

An overview of the impact of the project is provided in **Error! Reference source not found.**

Unforeseen / Unintended Outputs Resultant from the Project

Usage of mobile and computers for record maintenance and MIS generation lead to wide spread dissemination of ICT knowledge among rural women.

Deloitte

Assets Misc income Capital **Operating expenses** Cash book Other expenses Deposits Pass book Depreciation Retained earning **Development fund** Savings Dividend Services charges External loan ledger Subscription

Monthly reports

Balance sheet Loan aging analysis

Misc income



Capital

Cash book

Investment

Misc income

Saving report

Member history

Deposits

ANALYSIS Expert and Report Generation and facilitator to the federation office ACCOUNTS AND I.T. OFFICER 1 No.s. Maintenance of server Hub, Security and Training.	•••••
FEDERATION LEADERSHIP I he Institutional	onal
CLUSTER LEADERSHIP structure has a	sa
SHG I FADERSHIP	с.,

No

Deloitte

adverse effects have recorded owing to the fact that the project is only six months old.

3.13.7 Project Sustainability Consideration

Fee is collected from each SHG members to incur administrative and running expenses of cluster/ federation. Maintenance expenses of software and hardware are budgeted in the federation budget. Fee collection is sufficient to bear the running and maintenance cost of software and hardware installed under the project. Further, a sum of Rs 75,000/- has been deposited by every foundation in fixed deposit to replace hardware after three year

Figure 53-Project Institutional Arrangement

field of microfinance and IT experts. Although the software has been developed by 'Ekgoan technologies', it is currently being operated by local people.PEDO's core team is providing necessary training and advice for wide spread penetration of Mobile Technology.

Degree of Support Provided by the Government

There has not been any substantial support rendered by the Government, although the Ministry of Communication & Information Technology has been involved in various project implementation process as well as local level district administration.

Project Institutional Arrangements

Extent of Commitment/Involvement/Ownership of Stakeholders There has been active involvement of all stakeholders during Table 86-Evaluating the Project- MITRA

EVALUATING THE PROJECT

The project has been evaluated on five parameters viz. Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Results/Impacts and Sustainability which were further affirmed by subparameters illustrated in Table 87 that exhibits the evaluation in six categories of Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Moderately Satisfactory, Moderately Unsatisfactory, Unsatisfactory And Highly Unsatisfactory, accounting respectively for 6,5,4,3,2 and 1 points. The right most column substantiates the scores. The rating for each of the parameters was arrived at after averaging on the ratings for each of the sub-parameters. Similarly the overall evaluation rating were arrived at after averaging on the parameter ratings.





domain expert in the

planning, implementation, monitoring and management of the project. All the recurring expenses are borne by the federation through contribution of SHG members. Federation has allocated special funds to repair and manage hardware after the project period.

After completion of the project the cost to manage the project has been budgeted in the federation.

Efforts to Replicate Project Results

India has millions of SHG, and no such mobile based financial accounting and monitoring system is currently operational anywhere else. This system can serve as a boom for management of SHG movement for poor community. Various government agencies and NGO have contacted PEDO for replication of the projects.

Figure 54-Key Recommendations for Next Steps

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE NEXT STEPS

Although the project is contributing immensely towards providing enormous benefits through facilitation of ICT to the beneficiaries, however the following observations can be incorporated to further strengthen the project activities:

Database Security

• There should be adequate provision of data-base security and back up to prevent loss of data due to hacking, crash, malfunctioning of the software application.

Faster Processing

- The software in the mobile handsets provided to the beneficiaries has both English and local language leading to time-consuming activity in processing and printing of receipts. Therefore, it is recommended that the processing and printing should only be done in regional language
- There are multiple forms in the mobile software for different transaction leading to duplicate entry of general information and multiple receipts to SHG members. It is recommended that there should be one consolidated form for capturing all the transactions details undertaken by a member and she should be provided with only one receipt instead of multiple receipts

Further Extension of Application

- The project should be extended with on-line linkages with banks facilitating wide scale acceptance of the technology used under implementation of project.
- The fund flow from SHG towards Clusters / Federation is not mobile based and instead manual data is prepared and maintained. Thus, fund flow mechanism should be completely automated through use of mobile devise to increase transparency in the process.
- Currently only one-way communication is facilitated from mobile to the server. However to spread information sharing on broad scale, two-way communication channel should be implemented so that server information can be accessed through mobile devices.





3.13.8 Project Evaluation Matrix

							Table 87-Detailed evaluation matrix for MITRA					
EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks					
RELEVANCE												
Needs of the beneficiary captured			•				 Information and service needs have been identified through collaborative tool of need identification through following techniques - Focus Group Discussions Formal meetings with SHG's and Federations Trainings and workshops Participatory Rural Appraisal The technology outsourced partner agency Ekgaon Technologies deputed their expert team to identify the need and user-friendly system of MIS on Mobile. 					
Relevant to needs & expectations of beneficiary							 Project objectives captured all the key needs and expectations in terms of requirement of maintenance of accounting records, data consolidation and MIS generation. Beneficiaries were segmented into SHG members, SHG, Clusters and Federation, 					
Relevant to development priorities of Govt. of India							• Project was loosely aligned with developmental priorities of Gol however not aligned to any specific development programme of the Government					
Relevant to development priorities of concerned State Government							• Project was loosely aligned with developmental priorities of Rajasthan Government however not aligned to any specific development programme					
Identified problem has high incidence in area of focus							 There are approx. 40000 SHG members covered under PEDO's microfinance programme. One of the main stumbling blocks for the development of microfinance has been the capacity to handle the complicated accounting and information processing needs, acquiring and collating data from a variety of field sources, maintaining these records and performing periodic updates and processing. Similar problems have been faced by other NGOs dealing with public money. 					
Correct & accurate identification of target stakeholders and/or correctly defined vulnerable groups							 Stakeholder segments including vulnerable groups such as SHG members, SHG, Clusters and Federation, etc were identified. Each SHG member can view their accounts statement online. Further, data is consolidated at SHG, Cluster & federation level. 					



EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks		
	New SHG member, SHG, Cluster, Federation can a master data.		• New SHG member, SHG, Cluster, Federation can also be added into the master data.						
Adequacy of Government commitment to project							 Government assists as and when some coordination is required with other agencies 		
Project relevance to ICT4D focus under the project - Automatic account updation & consolidation, online availability statement, etc would not be possible without the use of ICT		• Automatic account updation & consolidation, online availability of account statement, etc would not be possible without the use of ICT							
EFFECTIVENESS									
Problem been stated correctly and distinctly							 Problems of difficulty faced in member record maintenance and consolidation were identified Informal validation of problems areas by various stakeholder groups such as SHG members, Cluster/ Federation head etc 		
Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries, users of the project are identified as stakeholders of the project							 Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries and users have been identified as stakeholders Roles and responsibilities of all stakeholders have been broadly defined 		
The assumptions, objectives, outputs and outcomes have been clearly articulated in measurable terms							 Objectives, outputs and outcomes were not defined in quantitative terms Measurement model: Subjective measurement terms / model 		
The linkages between objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was clear							Logical linkages present but not documented		
The project design allowed for flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment.							 Project design capable of adapting to and responding positively to most of the possible types of changes such as change in language, change in data input screens, etc. 		
Degree of support given by the Government towards integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme and other related projects							• Project objectives and goals not aligned with any specific programme of the Government.		
Planning component of the project take into account the use of ICT for improved governance / service delivery in various							 Transaction receipts are generated in local language to facilitate buy-ins from SHG members Use of mobile network connectivity instead of internet connectivity to 		





EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks	
areas through pilot initiatives, encouraging BPR, development local solutions and applications and encouragement of PPP model							 overcome internet connectivity/ bandwidth problems at remote places. Auto updation and consolidation of Accounting Data leads to substantial saving of time & efforts. Partnership with Vodafone to provide mobile SIMS at concessional rate has been worked out. 	
The adequacy of institutional arrangements in attaining the long-term objective of the project. Also the infrastructural, logistical, and financial implication of sustaining the project objectives beyond the project duration/after completion of UNDP funding.	rangements tive of the , logistical, aining the roject IDP funding.		 Institutional Sustainability The institutional structure has a blend of both domain expert in the field of microfinance and IT experts. SHG members have been trained to operate mobile devices to data collection & receipt generation PEDO's core team is providing necessary training and advice Financial Sustainability Fee is collected from each SHG members to incur administrative and running expenses of cluster/ federation A sum of Rs 75,000/- has been deposited by every foundation in fixed deposit to replace hardware after three year 					
Project's linkages, liaison, coordination and impact upon related activities under NeGP being implemented in the country.							No major contribution towards achievement of NeGP's objectives	
The project's assistance, relationship, relevance to and coordination with the pre- existing Project management system and staff							 Existing micro-finance institutional structure i.e. SHG, Cluster, Federation & PEDO was being used for implementation of the project. Mobile & Web software application were procured from a third party vendor-M/s ekgoan technology 	
Clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various institutional arrangements for overall programme management and implementation and the level of coordination between relevant players							 Roles and responsibilities of all of the stakeholders were defined clearly Management processes have been clearly laid down for proper coordination between the stakeholders such as PEDO, Federation Leadership, Cluster Leadership and SHG etc 	
Risk assessment and management of the project							• Data is stored at a central server with inadequate security (no firewalls, etc) and back-up, leading to significant risk of loss of crucial financial data. This risk has not been adequately mitigated.	
Efforts of stakeholders in support of the implementation of the project							 The project proposal submitted to UNDP was documented in coordination with most of the stakeholders but complete buy-in of these stakeholders was not taken. Most of the stakeholders have extended support as envisaged from them 	



EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks		
							during the proposal stage.		
Extent of conflict of interest either between stakeholders involved in the project or with outside agencies.							• No initiatives currently operational with the same individuals have the same goals and objectives		
EFFICIENCY									
Was a formal workplan made at the start of the project to determine the timeframe in which activities would be performed							 Workplan prepared for most of the important activities Month wise timelines defined for activities 		
Were resources made available to the project implementation agencies in accordance with the requirements of the workplan							• None of the key resources, only a few of the support staff replaced. However the replacements had similar qualification and experience as proposed ones		
Extent of deviation in the project implementation in so far as timelines is concerned.	in the project so far as timelines is • There had been no major delays/ deviations i schedule		• There had been no major delays/ deviations in the project implementation schedule						
Responsiveness of the project management to such deviations and flexibility to deploy resources							• Management taking some steps in terms of extra resources (time and effort) to somehow correct the course of implementation		
Were any systems, processes, manuals etc made to govern the activities in the project among the different stakeholders							 Written governing manual available for application software Regular process of project feedback during monthly meeting of SHG, Cluster & Federation 		
Extent to which Results Based Management has been used							 There has been regular meeting of SHG, Cluster and Federation to discuss various issues/ problem faced The project was evaluated at the end of each quarter to assess the direction in which the project is going and reporting to funding agency about the project progress. 		
Whether there was adequacy of steps taken to resolve any conflict of interest in or due to the project							• There has not been any major conflict of interest		
				RES		/IMPAC			





						1		
Evaluation matrix	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks	
Whether the project has produced its desired immediate outputs							• The mobile and web software application have been able to automate data processing, record consolidation and MIS generation	
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, use of the new outputs as against the traditional options)							• Since it was the first year of the usage of mobile technology for automatic updation of the accounts, parallel records are being maintained both manually and in computerized form.	
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, percentage of the target population)			•				 Transaction receipts for all SHG members are generated through the printer attached to the Mobile. Accounts are updated directly through mobile SMS SHG members are able to view their accounts statement, & SHG, Cluster & Federation leadership team can online view the consolidated accounts. However, since this was the first year of implementation of the project, not many SHG members/ leadership team are accessing records online. 	
Extent of drop-outs from usage of the outputs by the intended beneficiaries							• Since the project is just six months old, no major drop-out witnessed	
Are there any unforeseen/ unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups							 No such adverse effects have recorded owing to the fact that the project is only six months old. Printed receipts and availability of computers have created awareness/ knowledge about computer among rural population. 	
Extent of the project results on the target beneficiaries in terms of (a) Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, (b) Capacity Building, (c) Change Management, (d) Business Process Re-engineering, (f) Public Private Partnership, (g) Bridging the Digital Divide, and (h) Knowledge and Experience Sharing		•					 All the seven areas are relevant to the project. Excellence has been achieved in following areas relevant to the project: Bridging the Digital Divide: Online access of account information to SHG members and computerized receipts to SHG Members Capacity Building: SHG member, leaders and PEDO's field workers has been trained in using mobile phone and computer Change Management: Parallel implementation of both manual and automated system. Awareness creation campaign among SHG to ensure acceptability of mobile technology BPR: Time saving of each worker is five days in a month that has been utilizing in livelihood activities. Overcoming the internet connectivity issue at remote locations by use of mobile technology to automate information flow. Direct entry of data in to the server from the source of information leading to avoidance of error Knowledge/Experience Sharing: In many platform experience has been shared and many NGOs and government department has approached to use 	



EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory Highly Vinsatisfactory Bewarks		Remarks	
							this system	
Extent of the project impact on the target groups in terms of (a) governance (improved efficiency, transparency and accountability), (b) citizen-centric service delivery (advantages of cost, time and convenience), (c) rural livelihoods (number of jobs, extent and sufficiency of employment), and (d) women's empowerment (increased knowledge, and use of the same to voice their concerns).		 Excellence has been achieved in significant number of cases in following relevant areas: Improved Governance: Accounts are updated efficiently. More accountability of mobile operator. Easy accessibility of information enhances transparency. Citizen centric service delivery as automatic updation and consolidation of accounts leads to considerable saving in time and efforts. Women Empowerment through online access to information. 						
Extent of significance of the project impact on the development of the region/country							 Indicators for development were defined during project conceptualization stage Indicators as defined were significantly achieved Word was spread across the region / country 	
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by marginalized communities							 Only Computerized receipts are provided to SHG members Some of SHG members are viewing their accounts online from computers available at federation office. 	
Extent to which capacities have been built in stakeholders during the project							• Capacities of the main stakeholders i.e. SHG members have been built up to at least perform the necessary operational and maintenance activities assigned to them	
				SU	JSTAIN	IABILIT	ΓY	
Extent of ownership of stakeholders in the project							• Complete ownership of all the 'implementing and operating' stakeholders i.e. SHG group & PEDO.	
Degree of support given by the Government in integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme							 Project objectives and goals not aligned with any specific Government programme. 	
Extent of availability of inputs/resources required for the project (people, finances, infrastructure, equipments)							• Resources in all the four area - people, finances, infrastructure, equipments were mostly available during the major duration of the project	





Evaluation matrix	Ηιghly Satisfactory	SATISFACTORY	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks	
Have any revenue streams been defined in the project to make it self-sustaining							 Revenue stream has been defined in terms of annual membership fees structure from SHG members to ensure regular maintenance of the System A sum of Rs 75,000/- has been deposited by every foundation in fixed deposit to replace hardware after three year 	
Extent of success of such pre-defined revenue streams							• The project is operational for less than six months and do not require any major recurring expenses. The extent of success of the above pre-defined revenue stream could not be accessed	
Extent to which inventory of the assets created out of the grants received in the project have been properly maintained and transferred to the beneficiaries							• Assets received under the project such as Mobile phones, hand held printers, PCs, Servers, Printers etc. have been maintained well and the PEDO/ SHG staff has been trained in using and maintaining these assets.	
Degree of collaboration that has developed among stakeholders during the project							• Stakeholders including PEDO, SHG members, Cluster/ Federation leadership team etc were involved during operational and strategic decision making	
Extent to which government is willing to finance the project after its completion of the UNDP funding							• No funding committed by the Government	



3.14 Using ICT for Improving Livestock Productivity - NANDINI

Table 88 Introduction- NANDINI

Project Title	Using ICT for improving livestock productivity - NANDINI	
Proponent Organisation	OCAC	
Implementation State	Orissa	
Target Site for Pilot Project	Jagatsinghpur and Balikuda Block of Jagatsinghpur District	
Theme of Project	Rural Livelihood	
Target Population	About 14,500 farmers	
Project Cost	Rs. 45,00,190	
Funding Required for Project	Rs. 45,00,190	1.1
Time Required to Implement Project	Six months	1
Name(s) of Partner Agencies	NA	1

IMPACT OF THE PROJECT IN BRIEF

At present, veterinary services are being provided to the end-user in a fire-brigade approach with farmers not having ready access to institutions that are sparsely located. In Veterinary practice, it is advisable to follow a preventive model to avoid production loss. A successful preventive treatment model should provide the livestock owner and other stakeholders a system of alerts for farm animals for achieving optimum productivity.

OBJECTIVE AREAS	OUTPUTS	OUTCOMES
Information to farmers/veterinarian and other stakeholders to make them aware of vital information on livestock and ultimately help improve productivity of crossbred cows.	 Livestock information system developed and accessible to officers, service providers, farmers etc. LI gets vital information regarding Artificial Insemination, Pregnancy diagnosis points, information on birth of calves, vaccination schedule, advance de-worming etc. SMS alert and to-do list for farmers/providers Systematizing process for rendered services 	 Increased productivity through timely service delivery at vulnerable points in the productive and reproductive life cycle of the CB cows. Monitoring of reproductive disorders, total protection of health of animals as well as sustained genetic gain etc. would be possible out of the project. Demand driven supply of farming system input, better pricing of animals and animal produce. Development of entrepreneurship quality among various stakeholders.
Identify outstanding potential animals for strategic breeding policy.	• The decision support system for implementation of effective breeding policy earmarked.	 Able to identify outstanding animals with respect to production and reproduction parameters and could be used for selective breeding programmes.
Help desk support and other benefits to farmers, Veterinary Staff, Govt. and Business houses in an integrated manner.	 Help Desk services through a toll-free number extended by vets to integrate citizen-centric service delivery mechanism under the project. Helpdesk support on grievance redressal of farmers in both emergency and normal cases. Awareness generation drive undertaken. 	• Monitoring and Evaluation of services would support adequate exposure for adoption of better policies to bring welfare of farmers





3.14.1 Project Background

A sizeable proportion of rural households in Orissa invest in cattle herding for a living. Livestock sector, therefore, is a significant source of income for the rural poor. However, the sector progresses essentially on a "fire-brigade" approach, which is to say, that problems related to livestock are addressed only after they arise whereas prevention is considered universally the best way to approach this issue.

Intervention of ICT in productivity mechanism is an innovative initiative by which the inter-calving period and dry period could be reduced for improvement of livestock productivity. Taking this as a tool, the reproductive cycle of crossbred cows can be monitored in order to improve their productivity capacity.

NANDINI - The Concept

The project envisages intervention of Information & Communication Technology in the reproductive life cycle of crossbred animals to augment their productivity. Through this project, interventions for timely insemination, pregnancy diagnosis, post partum oestrus, peak yield, scheduled vaccination; de-worming, nutritional treatment measures and health coverage can be monitored, which are essential for optimum productivity.

Issues Faced

The key issues before the implementation of the project were:

- Clinic centered and curative services: The service delivery mechanism of the government was mainly clinic centred and focused on curative services rather than preventive and capacity building;
- Poor productivity of the dairy animals resulting in making dairy farming as a non-remunerative enterprise;
- Long distances to obtain services from service providing centres;

3.14.2 Project Strategic Objectives

The following were identified as the main strategic objectives for the project:

- To provide information push to farmers/veterinarian and other stakeholders; the main objective of the project was to make the farmers aware of the vital information on the livestock and ultimately help improve the productivity of crossbred dairy cows;
- The short term target was to reduce inter-calving and dry period through use of Information technology for timely artificial insemination, pregnancy diagnosis, post partum oestrus, peak

yield, scheduled vaccination; deworming, preventive nutritional measures and health coverage of crossbred animals;

- The long term target was to identify outstanding genetic potential animals for adoption of strategic breeding policy; and
- To provide Help desk support and other benefits to farmers, Veterinary Staff, Govt. and Business houses in an integrated manner through this project.





	Table 90 Stakeholders and Roles- NANDINI
Stakeholder	Role(s) Played
Farmers	Timely provide information such as pregnancy, vaccination history, insemination history, birth of calves etc. of their livestock to the Government for proper decision making and timely dissemination of information on livestock health, productivity improvement etc.
Veterinarian	Undertake proper planning for delivery of services and extend timely services to the livestock using information received though this system. Monitor reproductive disorders, protection of health of animals as well as sustain genetic gain through this project.
Livestock Inspectors	Render timely services to farmers upon receiving information regarding Artificial Insemination points, Pregnancy diagnosis points, information on birth of calves, vaccination schedule, advance programme of de-worming through this project.

3.14.3 Project Relevance Inputs

Identification of Information and Services Needs

Information and services needs were identified through a detailed survey. Database of animals and farmers were obtained out of survey and field visits by the facilitators engaged under the project. During the survey work, sometimes the surveyors faced difficulties to collect the personal information of the farmers and some of the farmers hesitated to express their socio-economic background etc. However, the concept was later on well understood by the farmers.

Table 91 Stakeholders and their Roles

Bridging the Digital Divide	The digital communications have ensured the project to avail the outputs. So it is absolutely necessary for all stakeholders.
Citizen-Centric Service Delivery	All services have been fruitfully rendered to the citizen during the project period. Effort is being made to provide other vital services through farmer's corner which is exclusive service delivery channel for the farmers.
Public Private Partnership	PPP mode will definitely bring more effectiveness in the present initiative.
Capacity Building	Capacity building is strongly recommended for all stakeholders and it will help the target group to get involved in the process.
Change Management	The change management part is highly supportive yardsticks for the target group by which the objectives of the project could be accomplished. This has been suitably emphasized during implementation of the project.
Business Process Reengineering	The Project will support to the market economy and Govt. The existing process has been re-engineered and the project aims at sustainable livelihood support to the poor farmers. So whatever methods are required for the purpose will be adhered to in course of long term implementation of the project.
Knowledge/Experience Sharing	This part is highly recommended for success of the project. Everyday new concepts come to the mind of experts and this application is fully flexible to adopt the welfare measures. Knowledge and experience sharing are indispensable for the target groups and all associated stakeholders.
Others	The project has created a platform for the farmers to observe, invest and get the livelihood.



The major service needs identified were the following

- Enhance productivity of crossbred cows by reducing calving interval and dry period;
- Timely service delivery at vulnerable points in the productive and reproductive life cycle of the cross-bred cows;
- Monitoring and evaluation of services rendered by Department of Animal Husbandry and Veterinary Services; and
- Identification of outstanding animals with respect to production and reproduction parameters.

3.14.4 Project Effectiveness Inputs

Project Stakeholders and Envisaged Roles

Table 90 brings out the different stakeholders involved and the respective roles they played.

Risks and Mitigation Strategies

Deloitte

- Collection of data from farmers: The farmers were reluctant to give personal information like BPL no., land holding and animal holding details. However subsequently when they were made aware of benefits and effectiveness of the system they expressed their willingness to add their detailed information and even agreed to give annual subscription to avail timely services.
- **Development of a designated software** to make it a production oriented device. But later on it provided cost effective strategies for service delivery to the farmers.
- **Resistance from veterinary officials:** The veterinary professional felt it as an extra burden initially but later on after being aware of the benefits and based on their experience of using the system they started cooperating and utilising the system.

3.14.5 Project Efficiency Inputs

Activities Performed in different Dimensions of Intervention:

Table 91 summarises the main activities being performed in the different themes of intervention.

Project Management Approach

The project management approach followed for the project was identification of stakeholders at primary level and all the important decisions during initiation, planning and execution of ICT interventions were taken on the basis of the pursuit of interest of the stakeholders. During the effective management of the project it has been confessed that all stakeholders have essential contribution for getting the desired output. The survey work took adequate time to touch the accuracy and authenticity. Besides, the timelines of the project have been strictly adhered in a planned manner. The project timeline has been slightly deviated owing to overcoming the challenges.

Extent of Usage of Local Expertise

There is a clear need for training programmes and guidelines to strengthen the awareness of the needs of both men and women, for application of the technology. Effort has been made for extending the good impact on both men and women. It will improve the success of technology transfer for both women's enterprise and common enterprise in livestock sector. Effort has also been made for basic inputs on technology transfer to indigenous peoples covered under the project and who can control the impacts of science and technology on their societies and help build and strengthen native legal, technical, management and systems relating to livestock sector.

Management Processes Followed during the Project

The project management process outlined for the project include initiation of preliminary activities of the pilot, then necessary planning for survey and collection of real and actual data from field and other operational planning of the pilot was completed. The project execution on the basis of data management and performance recording was done with reference to the standardized parameters of reproductive life cycle. Data validation was undertaken followed by evaluation. The lesson learnt was also sent to data repository section and final observation of the output was made i.e. reduction of calving interval and dry period as well as augmentation of health coverage through fertility camp and mass sensitization of health issues & nutritional treatment.

Extent of Usage of RBM and Performance Indicators

Result based management has been properly prioritized during planning and implementation of the project. The entire effort for the outputs has penetrated into the mind of the farmers and service providers so that the performance indicators of the project are clear to all stakeholders.

3.14.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated

Factors Facilitating the Production of Outputs

Factors facilitating the production of outputs are:

- Standardization of parameters of crossbred animals pertaining to their reproductive life cycle;
- Cooperation of the Farmers and other stakeholders; and
- Concentration of crossbred cattle population.

Factors impeding the production of outputs

As the project is one of the innovative initiatives in the country in this domain and implemented for the first time by addressing the reproductive life cycle of crossbred animals, it needs some more time for giving the need based services to the farmers through farmer's corner, and other allied services so far as the parameters of the reproduction cycle of crossbred animals is concerned.

Extent of Operationalisation of the project recommendations

The technology solutions for the project is a great success in relation to production of exception reports which has systematically strengthened the productivity elements and paved the way to properly monitor the reproductive cycle of crossbred cows. The parameters of the reproductive life cycle of crossbred animals have been standardized by reducing the dry period and inter-calving period. The application has been fruitfully established dependency of laymen on the project based mandates. The service providers have comfortably created friendly environment among the farmers. The timely informative advisory services have been effectively sent to farmers through the intervention of technology solutions. The decision support system for implementation of effective breeding policy has been earmarked.

Unforeseen/Unintended Outputs Resultant from the Project

The non target groups have been addressed properly who have expressed their willingness for investment in livestock sector. So far as the market economy is concerned, the non target groups have been influenced enough for attention of the government through this project for the benefits of the livestock farmers.

3.14.7 Project Sustainability Considerations

The project results are obvious to the stakeholders that have been admired by the farmers and all other stakeholders. The farmers will not hesitate to subscribe per annum to get hold of requisite services for their animals. The Govt. of Orissa has endeavored to replicate the project in other needy areas of the state. Effort is being made to ensure sustainability of the project results by way of extending information dissemination services to the target groups.





	PROJECT-WISE	FINDINGS
able 93 Pre-Project and Post-Project Comparison for Nandini		

Parameters	Need	Before Project	After Project
Age at sexual maturity	18 months	No scope	Full tracked
Artificial Insemination	100%	40-50%	80%
Peak yield	55-70 days	Not tracked	Full tracked
Pregnancy diagnosis	60-90 days	20%	60%
Drying off	300 days	Sporadic	100%
Parturition	Attend/record	30%	100%
Repeat breeders	100%	20%	90%
Deworming/Vaccination	100%	70-80%	100%
Health coverage	100%	40-50%	80%

Project Institutional Arrangements

The project was conceived in the minds of some experts when the livestock scenario was unorganized service delivery practice just meant for clinic centered and curative rather than preventive.

EVALUATING THE PROJECT

The project has been evaluated on five parameters viz. Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Results/Impacts and Sustainability which were further affirmed by subparameters illustrated in Table 92 that exhibits the evaluation in six categories of Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Moderately Satisfactory, Moderately Unsatisfactory, Unsatisfactory And Highly Unsatisfactory, accounting respectively for 6,5,4,3,2 and 1 points. The right most column substantiates the scores. The rating for each of the parameters was arrived at after averaging on the ratings for each of the sub-parameters. Similarly the overall evaluation rating were arrived at after averaging on the parameter ratings.

Keeping this in view, the implementation strategy was devised followed by institutional arrangements. In order to supervise and monitor the project, a Technical Committee was formed and Domain Specialists were consulted to standardize the parameters on the reproductive life cycle of the crossbred animals.

Accordingly a software was developed. All institutional arrangement like deployment of manpower, junior programmers and Enumerators was done. As survey work was focal point of the pilot, the requisite enumerators were engaged with training, orientation and mock survey etc. The Veterinary offices were supplied with up to date infrastructure like computer with furniture and dedicated Internet services etc. to access the web based application and data up-dation etc. The software had to produce fortnightly "To Do" list and various exception reports starting from Livestock Inspectors at GP level to Director, AH & VS at State Level.

Extent of Commitment/Involvement/Ownership of Stakeholders The Departmental officers have extended their maximum cooperation for success of the mission. The service providers are committed and the Departmental officers have strongly supporter of the project for which the replication of the project is taken to



Figure 55 Evaluating the Project- NANDINI



the final stage to effect implementation in other districts. The ownership of the project has been embraced by the Department

itself which has been perceived during the planning process in course of execution of the project.

Figure 56 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE NEXT STEPS

CONSTITUTION OR A GUIDING MANUAL FOR EACH SHG

As of now each SHG has a resolution note prepared at the time of their formation which works as a charter for the group. However, as volumes increase, a guiding document would be required for stakeholders to lay out roles and responsibilities for the participating stakeholders and to generally guide the SHG's operations, direction, issue resolution, conflict management etc.

SUSTAINABLE BUSINESS MODEL FOR VKCS

The current revenue model of VKCs is not adequate to support their sustenance post expiry of funding from external sources. Its revenue mainly consists of contribution from members, charges for printing, electricity bill collection & submission and computer classes which are quite low as compared to their expenses including salaries and operational & maintenance cost. Additional sources of revenue need to be contemplated. These could come from providing additional services through VKCs, information and content services such as information (agriculture, education, handicraft etc.) to farmers & other users using ICLIS, marketing etc.

Locally produced value-added products for example in food processing and their marketing, harnessing local crafts and the like could also be considered. ICT channels could be used for sale and promotion of these products and associated services.

However, if such services are to be used, quality certification and standardization for above mentioned food processing products would be required too.

Ask a doctor service could also be provided through VKCs by tie-up with specialists whose details are already available with VIDIYAL (such as Veterinary doctors, eye specialists and hospitals).

STRATEGY FOR SUSTAINING VKCS AFTER IMPLEMENTATION OF CSCS IN THE AREA

As most of the services currently being provided by VKCs would also come under the purview of CSCs which would be supported by government, sustenance of VKCs may become a concern. Appropriate steps should be taken up to mitigate this situation. For example, VKCs may contract with government to run CSCs in their area using the existing infrastructure and resources or provide services that would not be covered under CSCs and that can make VKCs more popular than CSCs.

ALIGNMENT WITH GOVT. SCHEMES

The VKCs are currently not aligned to government schemes. It is suggested that such alignment options be explored to take advantage of effects of synergy that may thereby result.

COLLABORATION WITH GOVERNMENT AGENCIES

This could be done for support in areas such as information, funding, technical knowledge, cooperation etc.

REDUCING DEPENDENCE ON PRODUCTS SUCH AS SKYPE FOR VIDEO CONFERENCING AND COMMUNICATION

Alternatives such as g-Talk, Yahoo messenger etc. should also be explored as recent development at national level suggest that in near future Skype and similar services may be restricted due to various commercial and security implications.

DEVELOPMENT OF A PORTAL FOR PROMOTION, ADVERTISEMENT AND SERVICE DELIVERY

Construction and operationalisation of a comprehensive portal is suggested that would serve as the gateway for all information of activities related to the project plus other benefits that could be conceived while designing the same.




3.14.8 Project Evaluation Matrix

Table 94 Detailed evaluation matrix for ICT for Women Conciliation Center

Evaluation matrix	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks	
RELEVANCE								
Needs of the beneficiary captured							 Beneficiaries covered are only those who are a part of SHG federations Alignment with Government could have been stronger Other civil society organizations working in similar areas were not covered / contacted 	
Relevant to needs & expectations of beneficiary							 Segmentation is loosely done however no formal procedure of segmentation seems to be carried out Offerings are tailored for these loosely designed done 	
Relevant to development priorities of Govt. of India							• It is loosely aligned with developmental priorities of GoI however not aligned to any specific development programme of the Government	
Relevant to development priorities of concerned State Government							• It is loosely aligned with developmental priorities of Tamil Nadu Government however not aligned to any specific development programme	
Identified problem has high incidence in area of focus							 Frequent and continuous incidences reported in the area Substantial number of individuals of the targeted vulnerable group (rural women) are affected Similar problem affecting vulnerable groups in other parts of the country 	
Correct & accurate identification of target stakeholders and/or correctly defined vulnerable groups							 Stakeholder segments including vulnerable groups such as dowry-affected women, widows etc. Not all individuals are covered 	
Adequacy of Government commitment to project							• The project is receiving coordination assistance in form of availability of information on Government programmes etc. however is not receiving any financial or technical assistance	
Project relevance to ICT4D focus under the project							 Voice SMSs brings relevant information to women anywhere, anytime without sacrificing their time and money Video conferencing results in significant increase in reach of the conciliation services and decrease in cost and effort of rural women 	
EFFECTIVENESS								





Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Problem been stated correctly and distinctly							Problems identified, defined and documentedSelf validation of identified problems
Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries, users of the project are identified as stakeholders of the project							 Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries and users have been identified as stakeholders Roles and responsibilities of all stakeholders have been detailed out
The assumptions, objectives, outputs and outcomes have been clearly articulated in measurable terms							 Objectives, outputs and outcomes vaguely identified. Certain assumptions articulated Subjective measurement terms in use
The linkages between objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was clear							• Logical linkages present but not documented
The project design allowed for flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment.							• Project design capable of adapting to and responding positively to most of the possible types of changes
Degree of support given by the Government towards integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme and other related projects							• Project objectives and goals not aligned with any specific programme of the Government.
Planning component of the project take into account the use of ICT for improved governance / service delivery in various areas through pilot initiatives, encouraging BPR, development local solutions and applications and encouragement of PPP model		•					 Voice SMS for information dissemination, video conferencing for women conciliation, touch screens for application usage, application to let a women know about the Govt. schemes for which she is eligible BPR is not relevant here as most of these services are new PPP (with Airtel) to provide voice mail services to rural women
The adequacy of institutional arrangements in attaining the long-term objective of the project. Also the infrastructural, logistical, and financial implication of sustaining the project objectives beyond the project duration/after completion of UNDP funding.							 Institutional bodies such as SHG Federation, SHGs, VKCs etc. have been set- up with defined roles and responsibilities for attaining long-term goals Required assets including PCs, Master SIM card, Touch Screens, application software, network connectivity etc. have been acquired and maintained properly Adequate financial arrangements (e.g. financial tie-up with Airtel for operation of voice mails) are in place for sustaining the project





Evaluation matrix	Highl y Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Project's linkages, liaison, coordination and impact upon related activities under NeGP being implemented in the country.							 Loosely aligned with NeGP as illustrated by duplication of services to be provided by CSC (Government's initiative) and negligible support and buy-in of Government
The project's assistance, relationship, relevance to and coordination with the pre- existing Project management system and staff							• The project utilizes both the pre-existing management system (in form of SHG federation and SHG's and their relation with VIDIYAL) as well as staff (pre-existing staff of VIDIYAL) effectively and coordinates with them effectively
Clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various institutional arrangements for overall programme management and implementation and the level of coordination between relevant players							 Roles and responsibilities of all of the stakeholders were defined clearly Management processes have been clearly laid down for proper coordination between the players such as SHGs, SHG federation and Vidiyal
Risk assessment and management of the project							 Most of the potential risks were noted down Mitigation strategies for identified risk have been laid down The risk management and mitigation plan was substantially adhered
Efforts of stakeholders in support of the implementation of the project							 The project proposal submitted to UNDP was documented in coordination with most of the stakeholders with partial buy-in of certain stakeholders e.g. Government Most of the stakeholders have extended support as envisaged from them during the proposal stage.
Extent of conflict of interest either between stakeholders involved in the project or with outside agencies.							• CSC is being set up by the Government which would provide some of the information services currently being provided by the project. Moreover CSCs would have direct ownership and support of the Govt. which this project does not have.
					EFFIC	IENCY	
Was a formal workplan made at the start of the project to determine the timeframe in which activities would be performed							 Detailed workplan prepared for all important activities Week wise timelines defined for each activity
Were resources made available to the project implementation agencies in accordance with the requirements of the workplan							• None of the key resources, only a few of the support staff replaced. However the replacements had similar qualification and experience as proposed ones





EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent of deviation in the project implementation in so far as timelines is concerned.							• Project implementation delayed by less than 15% of overall duration
Responsiveness of the project management to such deviations and flexibility to deploy resources							• Management taking some steps in terms of extra resources (time and effort) to somehow correct the course of implementation
Were any systems, processes, manuals etc made to govern the activities in the project among the different stakeholders							 Written governing manual available for Federation and SHGs to govern the project activities The instructions are followed by the stakeholders
Extent to which Results Based Management has been used		•					• Continuous RBM under usage at every stage. The key activities followed are a)Formation of Steering committee, b) Maintenance of records and attendance, c)Regular and periodical visits, d)VKC management committee constituted and monthly meeting is conducted, e)Submission of accounts and reports by the VKC staff to the Federation, f)Twice weekly visit by the technical staff to VKC, g) Feed back received for Voice mail about the content and clarity, h) Teleconferencing of staff and the SHG members to the central office, i) Follow up programme for ICLIS beneficiaries by the staff and j)Internal monitoring committee for periodical review at every month
Whether there was adequacy of steps taken to resolve any conflict of interest in or due to the project							 Generic process of following up with Government has been planned to resolve the conflict of interest arising due to setting-up of CSCs in the region by the Government. Marginal efforts towards addressing this issue during the conceptualization phase.
				RES	SULTS	/IMPAC	CTS
Whether the project has produced its desired immediate outputs							• Majority (50% to less than 75%) of the immediate outputs achieved
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, use of the new outputs as against the traditional options)							• Most of the intended beneficiaries used the project output in more than 75% cases and in 25% or less cases used traditional options
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, percentage of the target population)							• About 50% of the intended beneficiaries utilized the project output





EVALUATION MATRIX	Highl y Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent of drop-outs from usage of the outputs by the intended beneficiaries							• Marginal (Less than 25%) drop-out from usage of outputs by the intended beneficiaries
Are there any unforeseen/ unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups	•						 The project resulted in certain unforeseen positive effects caused which promotes the existing developmental efforts in the region including: 20 male farmers (non-targeted beneficiaries) in the project area and 200 farmers in Dindigul District (non-targeted region) volunteered for voicemails and now getting the benefits The ICT induced learning has motivated the women members to encourage their children (more than 100) to pursue computer learning Registration of Non-target groups with Women Conciliation Center (WCC) for legal redressal. Promoted greater involvement of youth for employment opportunities and results of competitive exams
Extent of the project results on the target beneficiaries in terms of (a) Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, (b) Capacity Building, (c) Change Management, (d) Business Process Re-engineering, (f) Public Private Partnership, (g) Bridging the Digital Divide, and (h) Knowledge and Experience Sharing		•					 Excellence has been achieved in following areas relevant to the project: Citizen-centric service delivery: information availability, identification of schemes eligible for an individual, information on agriculture related topics, etc. Capacity building and bridging the digital divide: of rural women in using ICT tools for their development such as usage of mobile for accessing voice mails, PCs (using touch screens) to access information related to Government schemes and work PPP: tie-up with Airtel to provide voice mails free of cost to all the beneficiaries and charging marginal money in case of repeat listening of the voice mail Knowledge and experience sharing: beneficiaries are sharing their experiences using videos and voice mails
Extent of the project impact on the target groups in terms of (a) governance (improved efficiency, transparency and accountability), (b) citizen-centric service delivery (advantages of cost, time and convenience), (c) rural livelihoods (number of jobs, extent and sufficiency of employment), and (d) women's empowerment (increased knowledge, and use of the same to voice their concerns).							Excellence has been achieved in significant number of cases in following relevant areas: • Citizen centric service delivery • Women empowerment • Rural livelihood



EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent of significance of the project impact on the development of the region/country							 Indicators for development were defined during project conceptualization stage Word was spread across the region and volunteers from non-targeted areas also coming forward and expressing interest in using the benefits of the project. This is evident from the fact that 200 farmers from Dindigul District (non-targeted region) volunteered for voicemails and are now availing the benefits
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by marginalized communities							• Most of the marginalized communities have utilized the project output in more than 50% cases where they needed similar service
Extent to which capacities have been built in stakeholders during the project							• Capacities of the main stakeholders i.e. VKS staff and SHG members have been built up to atleast perform the necessary operational and maintenance activities assigned to them
				SL	JSTAIN	IABILIT	ГҮ
Extent of ownership of stakeholders in the project							• Complete ownership of all the 'implementing and operating' stakeholders in the project including SHG Federation, SHGs, VKS staff, SHG members, rural women, Airtel etc.
Degree of support given by the Government in integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme							• Project objectives and goals not aligned with any specific Government programme. The partner had approached the Government for support (in terms of converting the VKCs into CSCs) but Government has not agreed to this support yet.
Extent of availability of inputs/resources required for the project (people, finances, infrastructure, equipments)							• Resources in all the four area - people, finances, infrastructure, equipments were completely available during the part duration of the project
Have any revenue streams been defined in the project to make it self-sustaining							• Revenue stream has been defined in details (including membership fees from the women, fees for usage of ICT infrastructure and applications such as service to identify eligible schemes, printing, exam results, computer training etc. However not all the possible areas have been captured properly and this may affect the sustainability in long-term post expiry of the funding from UNDP
Extent of success of such pre-defined revenue streams							• Achieving atleast 75% of the target





Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent to which inventory of the assets created out of the grants received in the project have been properly maintained and transferred to the beneficiaries							• Assets received under the project such as PCs, touch screens, camera, internet modems, Master SIM (for sending Voice mails) etc. have been maintained well and the VKC staff have been trained in using and maintain these assets.
Degree of collaboration that has developed among stakeholders during the project							 Stakeholder management plan is well defined and have complete adherence during project execution (e.g. formal minutes of all management meetings are documented and signed by the stakeholders). Stakeholders including SHG Federation, SHG, VKC staff and operational partners such as Airtel were involved during operational and strategic decision making
Extent to which government is willing to finance the project after its completion of the UNDP funding							No funding committed by the Government



3.15 Mobile - Government

Table 95 Introduction- m-Gov.

Project Title	Mobile based ICT for e-Governance supporting Decentralization
Proponent Organisation	West Bengal State Rural Development Agency (WBSRDA) and the
	Panchayat & Rural Development, Government of West Bengal
Implementation State	West Bengal
Target Site for Pilot Project	54 Gram Panchayats in 5 blocks of 2 districts in West Bengal
Theme of Project	Governance
Target Population	
Project Cost	
Funding Required for Project	Rs 50.00 Lakhs
Time Required to Implement Project	12 months
Name(s) of Partner Agencies	



BRIEF IMPACT OF THE PROJECT

The m-Gov project piloted in South 24 Paraganas and Purulia districts of West Bengal envisaged to facilitate access to quality information in the process of strengthening decentralization thereby contributing to good governance by putting in place an effective interactive communication channel aiding decentralization at various levels in Government and PRI's using mobile forms of ICT.

OBJECTIVE AREAS	OUTPUTS	OUTCOMES
Support in transfer of information on planning, management, and the raising and allocation of resources from the state government to subordinate levels of the government and PRIs	Platform of SMS server with the SMS enterprise application software at the State level and mirrored across district and levels with client application software established	The project connected the layers in the government using ICT and tried to remove blocks in information dissemination and collection which were earlier manual based.
Make available to PRIs information on financial resource allocation, predictability of amounts available to PRI's and fund balances with subordinate levels of government and PRIs.	Alert services regarding issue of any order related to financial resource allocation, institutional arrangements etc.	It has aided all the layers of Government in programme management of schemes, financial and physical progress monitoring of PRIs, and citizen services.
Provide information on government initiatives on PRIs and SHGs, and their capacity building. Availability of information on government service delivery to citizens.	Framework and systems to train, technically and technologically augment, trouble shoot, and setup information management system developed	To improve access to services 513 mobile phones in 5 blocks were provided PRI functionaries. 410 PRI functionaries and government officials were provided training of 2 days on application usage.
Setup mechanisms for monitoring of various programmes of government and PRIs by involving the Gram Unnayan Samiti and citizens.	Access and use to information on utilization certificate for fund, compliance and performance status of the PRIs and subordinate levels of government	The services design has a high degree of alignment with user needs especially ambulance information for citizens and for PRI functionaries in reduction of response time, information dissemination costs and time for gathering information.





3.15.1 Project Background

Introduction to the Project

The outreach of e-Government has been low in India owing to the fact that computers are still not affordable by a vast majority of people. However, mobile penetration rates have been rising steadily in recent times. Though the range of possibilities over mobile as the interface is limited it is felt that for many services which could be extended over the mobile, the mobile would be a preferred option owing largely to a much wider reach.

The West Bengal State Rural Development Agency (WBSRDA) which is an agency under the Panchayats and Rural Development Department of the Government of West Bengal has been a department which has tried to reach the common man with the available resources. WBSRDA's proposal targeted at disseminating information to the common man using the best and cheapest means of communication for the government through this project.

The project highlights the usage of the mobile/handheld device for two way communication between the government and the PRI functionaries and to disseminate the information to the PRI functionaries and also use the handheld device to update the database of the citizen spread in each of the selected pilot locations. The project was scalable and it wishes to start with Short Message Service and later grow up to send and receive the MMS and also the video in the times to come when the affordability of the service was in the reach to proliferate information on health, education, sanitation etc. for the best usage of the funds at the grass root level of the PRIs the Gram Panchayats where the actual 70% of populace live. The proposal relates to a pilot at Blocks and 54 Gram Panchayats only out of the 341 Blocks and 3354 Gram Panchayats in West Bengal. WBSRDA has purposefully chosen the 54 Gram Panchayats which have a varied mix of locations wherein they have practical difficulties to either power, roads, extreme conditions of weather or are otherwise remote.

Technical Architecture of Project

Mobile phones using Short Messaging Services (SMS) can take e-Governance to the masses in the shortest possible time. Sufficient infrastructure already exists in rural areas to provide this service. With the TRAI plan of 250 million phone lines by 2007 giving a tele-



Figure 57 Technical Archiecture for the m-Gov Project



density of one phone for 6 persons in rural areas makes possible to extend e-Governance to cover the most parts of rural areas.

An SMS server with the SMS enterprise application software will be setup at the State level and mirrored across district and levels with client application software. The application will require a database to store all its configuration and messaging data in a secure storage. Strategically it will be designed for open back-end type operations, it will support the industry standard databases like Microsoft SQL Server, Oracle and My SQL (ver 4.1.8 or higher). The application will provides Microsoft COM based APIs to develop and integrate with custom applications. The following is SMS enterprise framework:

The SMS enterprise will be is a high performance and highly scalable software. The software will allows to control the speed since many SMPP service providers will not allow sending messages above a specified throughput. SMS enterprise can be integrated with almost any type of software with a short messaging requirement.

This simple technology to deliver TEXT could be put to powerful and useful end user application. SMS can be used & incorporated to provide useful services like sending alerts, notifying and sending greetings, running query-based services (interactive), etc.

Two types of functions can be carried out:

- 1) PUSH and
- 2) PULL through the architecture.

Major Challenges

The following were identified as the major challenges in the implementation of project:-

- Rural citizens are not accustomed to use SMS service though they have mobile phones for a long time.
- To inform structured query by the citizens to get the information from query based SMS.
- The challenge ahead of the project is wider replication it has already began and the building/sustaining capacities at tiers to make the system deployed effective in the long run.
- The convergence of the various ICT tools for taking up other activities of the departments and other line departments in terms of providing effective impetus for rural development.

Critical Success Factors

The following were identified as the Critical Success Factors in the implementation of project:-

- Low cost and user friendly mobiles were deployed.
- Leadership from the top echelon of the Department.
- Acceptability of the PRI functionaries.
- Less time for capacity building of the end users.
- Visibility of the output from sent SMS in the website at real time.

The use of mobile based ICT applications has removed layers in data/information collection, processing and timely action (reducing the response time) especially in implementation of development programmes of the government.

3.15.2 Project Strategic Objectives

The vision of this project was to facilitate access to quality information in the process of strengthening decentralization thereby contributing to good governance which can increase people's opportunities for participation in economic, social and political decisions; assist in developing people's capacities; and enhance government responsiveness, transparency and accountability. The mission was to put in place an effective





interactive communication channel aiding decentralization at various levels in Government and PRI's using mobile forms of ICT.

With its focus on various levels in P&RD department, line departments, PRI functionaries the objectives of the project were to use Mobile forms of ICT to:

- Support in transfer of information on planning, management, and the raising and allocation of resources from the state government to subordinate levels of the government and PRIs.
- Make available to PRIs information on financial resource allocation, predictability of amounts available to PRI's and fund balances with subordinate levels of government and PRIs.
- Make available to PRIs, subordinate levels of government and state government the compliance and performance status of the PRIs and subordinate levels of government.
- Provide information on government initiatives on PRIs and SHGs, and their capacity building.
- Make available to citizens information on government service

delivery including that of utilities, infrastructure, education, health and social welfare, and law and protection through the PRIs.

- Setup mechanisms for monitoring of various programmes of government and PRIs by involving the Gram Unnayan Samiti and citizens.
- Establish supportive information channels to support disaster management including mitigation, alert, response and rehabilitation
- Establish supportive information based participatory mechanisms and systems for citizen feed back and promote social audit.

3.15.3 Project Relevance Inputs

Identification of Information and Services Needs

Information and services needs were identified through the following techniques:

- Participatory Rural Appraisal;
- Focus Group Discussions;

Table 97 Stakeholders and Roles- mGov

Stakeholder	Role(s) Played
Official Functionaries of the PRIs	Support and participation in extending the services to other target groups, lead for development of the software, establishing network with the help of experts and consultants, implementing the project by system study, installation of the software, imparting training to the facilitators at District, blocks and end users, fund management of the project.
Official Functionaries of the Government	Promoting economic development and social justice
Community Based Organizations & Civil Society Organizations	Mobilization of the people for formulating village based micro planning activities
General People at Large	Take the benefit of information
West Bengal State Rural Development Agency (WBSRDA)	Expansion of IT intervention, liaison with the field level functionaries for trouble shooting, addressing feedbacks and extending handholding to the functionaries, fund management of the project.
NISG	Financial and technical support in the running of the project, Active Supervision during the running of the project, Resource support during the project in terms of technical manuals and other resources, Evaluation and appraisal of the project.



- Base line survey;
- Formal Meetings with various stakeholders;
- Trainings and Workshops;

3.15.4 Project Effectiveness Inputs

Project Stakeholders and Envisaged Roles

Table 97 brings out the different stakeholders involved and the respective roles they played.

3.15.5 Project Efficiency Inputs

Activities Performed in different Dimensions of Intervention:

Table 98 summarises the main activities being performed in the different themes of intervention.

Theme	Activities
Bridging the Digital Divide	The use of mobile based ICT applications through Push and Pull SMS by using SMS service of authorised service provider and and later grow up to send and receive the MMS and also the video.
Citizen-Centric Service Delivery	Citizens can obtain financial information pertaining to PRI's on local basis. Government orders can also messaged to various levels make available to citizens information on government service delivery including that of utilities, infrastructure, education, health and social welfare, and law and protection
Capacity Building	A separate cell has been formed within the Panchayat and Rural Development to the Government of West Bengal for expansion of IT intervention. One Joint Secretary heads the cell. One Deputy Secretary of the Department exclusively supervises the Cell. Besides the Cell gets regular service of one officer of West Bengal Civil Service for looking after the various functional aspects related to application of IT solution in Panchayats' works.
Change Management	 Awareness building through Computer Based Training at State, district, Panchayat Samiti and Gram Panchayats. Identification of proactive persons at all the levels for extensive trainings and eventual motivation of other potential actors in the organisation. Continuous in-house and off-campus reorientation trainings Extensive handholding facilities at all the levels by frontline officials, trainers, and facilitators and also by some outsourced expert organisations in the field of change management. Web based information channels for to and fro feedbacks. E-mailing facilities for instant problem solution by the State/ district or the peer groups at Panchayat Samiti and gram Panchayats. Regular visits to the locations by the District/ state officials and trainers. Workshops/ interactions for continuous development and identification of problems being faced by the



Theme	Activities
	 stakeholders at different locations. Promoting Extensive utilisation of the Grievance Box in the website/ e -mailing for ventilating citizen's feedback or the feedbacks from the end users.
Business Process Reengineering	 Feed Back from beneficiaries and users through vocal and maintenance of Feedback register Regular meeting and conferences with women and Federation along with technical experts Provisions for suggestion through personal contact and informal discussions. Regular analysis on the attendance, usage and benefits reached Committees appointed for periodical evaluation
Knowledge/Experience Sharing	Knowledge has been shared with other districts and states regarding usage of SMS based services of this project.
	Table 98 Theme-Based Activities- mGov

3.15.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated

The following project outputs were generated at the end of pilot implementation of the project:

- Platform of SMS server with the SMS enterprise application software at the State level and mirrored across district and levels with client application software was established;
- Customization of application software and data porting for services was offered;
- Framework and systems to train, technically and technologically augment, trouble shoot, and setup information management system developed;
- 54 PRI's and 200 government functionaries/ departments had access and use alert services regarding issue of any order related to financial resource allocation, predictability of amounts available to PRI's and fund balances with subordinate levels of government and PRIs;
- 54 PRI's and 200 government functionaries/ departments had access and use to information on utilization certificate for fund, compliance and performance status of the PRIs and subordinate levels of government;

- 54 PRI's and 200 government functionaries/ departments had access and use alert regarding issue of any instruction related to institutional arrangement; and
- 54 PRI's and 200 government functionaries/ departments will have access and use alert messages regarding natural calamity and release of water from dams for preparedness on disaster mitigation.

Extent of Operationalisation of the project recommendations

The services provided through this project supports all tiers in local governance that is gram panchayat at village level, panchayat samiti at block level, zilla panchayat at district level and the state department. It has aided all layers in programme management of schemes, financial and physical progress monitoring of PRIs, and citizen services. The following were the key recommendations which were envisaged and are implemented:-

• The project connected the layers in the government using ICT, and have tried to remove blocks in information dissemination and collection which were earlier manual based. This information (data based) required manual processing which delayed response time.



- No service time frame existed as only the implementation processes and guidelines are taken care through BPR. An implicit service time frame does exist which is based on earlier conventional delivery and is not institutionalized. A time frame for services and systems based on ICT to check compliance needs to be put in place.
- 2,480 PRI functionaries and government officials from 7 blocks in 3 districts had been targeted through the project in the pilot phase. To improve access to services 513 mobile phones in 5 blocks were provided PRI functionaries. 410 PRI functionaries and government officials were provided training of 2 days on application usage and the technical features.
- The services design has high degree of alignment with user needs especially ambulance information for citizens and for PRI functionaries in reduction of response time, information dissemination costs and time for gathering information.
- All the services are in English, Bengali services are currently not been provided due to technical reasons. But WBSRDA is looking at rolling out services in Bengal before the end of the year.

Effect of Outputs/Results on the Target Groups of the Project

In West Bengal, as in other parts of India access to information and communication technologies continues to grow at high speed, especially with the growth rate of mobile subscribers. Use of mobile technology in e-Governance can reinforce good governance towards more efficient, effective, open and decentralized government. More broadly, it can support in providing better services to the citizen and reinforcing process flexibilization intraand inter administrative and government-wise.

The following outputs were focused:

- Alert regarding issue of any order related to release of fund;
- Alert regarding issue of any instruction related to institutional arrangement;

- Updates regarding receipt of Utilization certificate for fund;
- Alert message regarding natural calamity and release of water from dams for preparedness on disaster mitigation.

Project Sustainability Considerations

Panchayat and Rural Development Department is implementing the project through WBSRDA, an organisation created to provide necessary services to the department and to simplify implementation processes. The unit within WBSRDA managing the project is a team of 2 civil servants of state cadre, 2 government employees and 8 employees on contract. This team functions independently and is not of conventional structure.

- Formal explicit process defining the roles of various employees within this team implementing and managing project existed.
- Top champions of the project had continued from the start of the project.
- Formal user groups for the services were available, with feedback of the users and other stakeholders.
- WBSRDA would take care of the implementation, but there should be a SLA with the application and hardware service providers and the SLA for support services for the above.
- Amenability of the programme through PPP model should be there, but it may have implications on cost and time.
- The team within WBSRDA handling the project had members across all domains with expertise in technology and government processes required for implementing this highly process driven project and also have created environment for process reengineering and institutionalisation.
- There were no charges for tools/services across all tiers, but PRDD through WBSRDA is contemplating at building processes within the system (Panchayat Raj) to support the costs of maintaining the services. Currently WBSRDA is collecting SMS charges from the users at district level.



 Apart from the support to be received from contingency components of Centrally Sponsored programmes & recommendation of National level Finance Commission, this project would also contribute to improved resource mobilization by the PRIs. There had been a visible improvement in resource mobilization by the PRIs, which had improved from Rs. 3700 Lakhs to Rs. 4800 Lakhs from 2002-03 to 2003-04. A computer based MIS available with PRIs would contribute to further enhancement of resource mobilization.

EVALUATING THE PROJECT

The project has been evaluated on five parameters viz. Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Results/Impacts and Sustainability which were further affirmed by subparameters illustrated in Table 98 that exhibits the evaluation in six categories of Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Moderately Satisfactory, Moderately Unsatisfactory, Unsatisfactory And Highly Unsatisfactory, accounting respectively for 6,5,4,3,2 and 1 points. The right most column substantiates the scores. The rating for each of the parameters was arrived at after averaging on the ratings for each of the subparameters. Similarly the overall evaluation rating were arrived at after averaging on the parameter ratings.



Table 99 Evaluating the Project- mGov Figure 58 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE NEXT STEPS

ENHANCEMENT OF m-GOV Application

For m-Gov application of NREGS, there could be addition some fields like volume, caste etc. In addition, scheme-wise spending should be sent by mobile. Only wage payment data is sent; material spent, physical progress can't be sent or tracked through m-Gov application. This should be also be incorporated.

AUTOMATIC ALERT/REMINDER

System should be able to send Automatic alert/reminder to the individual in mobile for sending the data/report

SUSTAINABLE BUSINESS MODEL

The project is being implemented completely by the funding of Government/external agencies. Looking at the long term sustainability of the project and for rolling out across the state, it is important to work out a mechanism for self sustenance of the project. There may be some charges imposed to the users for availing some of the services; other than this department may look into other revenue generation schemes such as advertisements, services to the private players, PPP etc.



3.15.7 Project Evaluation Matrix

				1			Table 100 Project Evaluation Matrix- mGov
EVALUATION MATRIX	Нібні Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
				RELEV	ANCE/		
Needs of the beneficiary captured							 All beneficiaries were identified Requirements of the beneficiaries were captured and needs of beneficiaries were analyzed
Relevant to needs & expectations of beneficiary							 Segmentation is loosely done, no formal procedure of segmentation seems to be carried out Offerings are tailored for these loosely designed done
Relevant to development priorities of Govt. of India							• m-Gov Project aligned with currently operational developmental program of Govt. of India
Relevant to development priorities of concerned State Government							• Project strongly aligned with currently operational developmental program of West Bengal State Govt.
Identified problem has high incidence in area of focus							 Frequent and continuous incidences reported in the area Substantial number of individuals of the targeted vulnerable group are affected Similar problem affecting vulnerable groups in other parts of the state/country
Correct & accurate identification of target stakeholders and/or correctly defined vulnerable groups							• Stakeholders not properly segmented including the vulnerable segments and all individuals associated with segments
Adequacy of Government commitment to project							 Government has played an important role for the success of this initiative. Panchayat and Rural Development Department, Govt. of West Bengal is the implementing agency of the project. Project has received all support from relevant government agencies in the form of technical expertise, information sharing, publicity, training and awareness generation programs
Project relevance to ICT4D focus under the project							 m-Gov demonstrated how ICT play a vital role in decentralization process and strengthen local government, also support the state in providing effective and timely support to the various tiers in





EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							government.
			E	EFFECT	IVENE:	SS	
Problem been stated correctly and distinctly							 Problems identified, defined and documented Validation of identified problems by the stakeholders was not observed
Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries, users of the project are identified as stakeholders of the project							• Beneficiaries, users and operational partners identified as stakeholders
The assumptions, objectives, outputs and outcomes have been clearly articulated in measurable terms							 Objectives, outputs and outcomes vaguely identified. Certain assumptions articulated Subjective measurement terms in use
The linkages between objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was clear							• Logical linkages present but not documented
The project design allowed for flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment.							• Project design capable of modifying but only for certain not critical and small changes in the environment. May not be able to adopt for bigger changes.
Degree of support given by the Government towards integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme and other related projects							• Project strongly aligned with national programme and Govt.
Planning component of the project take into account the use of ICT for improved governance / service delivery in various areas through pilot initiatives, encouraging BPR, development local solutions and applications and encouragement of PPP model							 Use of ICT for improved governance/ service through: Localization of solution: Certain degree of localization planned such as use of local language for preparing the user manual. BPR: SMS based reporting and data updation.
The adequacy of institutional arrangements in attaining the long-term objective of the project. Also the infrastructural, logistical, and financial implication of sustaining the project objectives beyond the project							• A few institutional agencies / bodies' set-up for attaining long- term goals, roles and responsibilities defined only for few of the identified stakeholders and management processes are not clearly laid out.



Evaluation matrix	Нібні Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	MODERATELY UNSATISFACTORY	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
duration/after completion of UNDP funding.							
Project's linkages, liaison, coordination and impact upon related activities under NeGP being implemented in the country.							 Loosely aligned to NeGP and its components such as National and State MMPs and partially utilizes the infrastructure components (State Data Centers, SWAN and CSCs) No contribution towards achievement of NeGP's objectives
The project's assistance, relationship, relevance to and coordination with the pre- existing Project management system and staff							• Uses both the pre-existing management system as well as staff effectively but does not contributes towards the pre-existing cause.
Clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various institutional arrangements for overall programme management and implementation and the level of coordination between relevant players							 All institutional arrangements / stakeholders were considered Roles and responsibilities of all of the identified stakeholders were identified Management processes clearly laid down for proper coordination between the players Flexibility to incorporate more stakeholders / institutional arrangement does not exists
Risk assessment and management of the project							 Potential risks seems to unidentified and not noted down Mitigation strategies for risk not laid down
Efforts of stakeholders in support of the implementation of the project							• The project proposal submitted to UNDP was documented in coordination with most of the stakeholders with partial buy-in of certain stakeholders e.g. state department of IT
Extent of conflict of interest either between stakeholders involved in the project or with outside agencies.							• Partial conflict of interest among the stakeholders of this project and conflict resolution process initiated prior to implementation of the project
				EFFIC	IENCY		
Was a formal workplan made at the start of the project to determine the timeframe in which activities would be performed							 Work-plan prepared for most of the important activities Month wise timelines defined for activities
Were resources made available to the project implementation agencies in accordance with the requirements of the workplan							 Resources provided to the project in accordance with new requirements / change in project environment. There were very few resource change / replacement observed.





EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent of deviation in the project implementation in so far as timelines is concerned.							• There were little delay in Project implementation compared to the overall project duration
Responsiveness of the project management to such deviations and flexibility to deploy resources							• Management taking some steps in terms of extra resources (time and effort) to somehow correct the course of implementation
Were any systems, processes, manuals etc made to govern the activities in the project among the different stakeholders							 Software application integrating with SMS server was in place Written governing manual available both in English and Bengali The instructions are followed by the stakeholders
Extent to which Results Based Management has been used							 During the initial phase of the project RBM was not in use. Subsequently, RBM being used as an important tool for making management decisions
Whether there was adequacy of steps taken to resolve any conflict of interest in or due to the project							• Conflict resolution process seems to have initiated during implementation stage of the project
			R	ESULTS	/IMPAC	CTS	
Whether the project has produced its desired immediate outputs							• The project has achieved significant (More than 75%) of immediate outputs including all the major outputs.
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, use of the new outputs as against the traditional options)							• Most of the intended beneficiaries utilized the project output in more than 50% cases where they needed similar service
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, percentage of the target population)							 Because of reluctance of the targeted beneficiaries, less than targeted beneficiaries utilized the m-Gov project services. However, the awareness among the beneficiaries is increasing with the continued success of the project.
Extent of drop-outs from usage of the outputs by the intended beneficiaries							 Marginal (Less than 25%) drop-out from usage of outputs by the intended beneficiaries
Are there any unforeseen/ unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups							 Major unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups Very few unforeseen negative effects caused which impede the existing developmental efforts in the state/region



PROJECT-W	SE FINDINGS
-----------	-------------

Evaluation matrix	Нібні Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks		
Extent of the project results on the target beneficiaries in terms of (a) Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, (b) Capacity Building, (c) Change Management, (d) Business Process Re- engineering, (f) Public Private Partnership, (g) Bridging the Digital Divide, and (h) Knowledge and Experience Sharing		•					• Of all the areas relevant to the project, excellence has been achieved in significant number (75% to 90%) of the cases		
Extent of the project impact on the target groups in terms of (a) governance (improved efficiency, transparency and accountability), (b) citizen-centric service delivery (advantages of cost, time and convenience), (c) rural livelihoods (number of jobs, extent and sufficiency of employment), and (d) women's empowerment (increased knowledge, and use of the same to voice their concerns).		•					• Of all the areas relevant to the project, excellence has been achieved in significant number (75% to 90%) of the cases		
Extent of significance of the project impact on the development of the region/country							 Indicators for development were defined during project conceptualization stage Indicators as defined were completely achieved 		
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by marginalized communities							• Most of the marginalized communities have used the project output in more than 75% cases and in 25% or less cases used traditional options		
Extent to which capacities have been built in stakeholders during the project							 Capacities of all stakeholders build up to perform activities assigned to / expected of them. 		
	SUSTAINABILITY								
Extent of ownership of stakeholders in the project							• Complete ownership of all the 'implementing and operating' stakeholders in the project i.e. the agencies across all tier of the Panchayat bodies		
Degree of support given by the Government in integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme							• Aligned to Government's national development programme. State Government is considering to fund the project for rolling out across the state.		





Evaluation matrix	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent of availability of inputs/resources required for the project (people, finances, infrastructure, equipments)							• Resources in all the four area - people, finances, infrastructure, equipments were available during the part duration of the project
Have any revenue streams been defined in the project to make it self-sustaining							• No defined revenue steam observed.
Extent of success of such pre-defined revenue streams							No defined revenue steam
Extent to which inventory of the assets created out of the grants received in the project have been properly maintained and transferred to the beneficiaries							• Assets received under the project such as servers, PCs, application software, created user manuals etc. have been maintained well.
Degree of collaboration that has developed among stakeholders during the project							 Stakeholder management plan is conceptualized but not documented. Stakeholders were occasionally involved during operational and strategic decision making.
Extent to which government is willing to finance the project after its completion of the UNDP funding							• Government of West Bengal seems to be considering of funding the roll out of the project across the state.



Project Title	Centre for Development Process Innovations through ICTs - Community	
	Radio Unit	
Proponent Organisation	IT for Change	
Implementation State	Karnataka & also close partnership with a NGO in a neighbouring state	
Target Site for Pilot Project	Three taluks of Mysore district and one outside Karnataka	
Theme of Project	Women's Empowerment and Governance	
Target Population	-	
Project Cost	Rs. 50.00 Lakhs	
Funding Required for Project	Rs. 30.00 lakhs	
Time Required to Implement Project	12 months	
Name(s) of Partner Agencies	Mahila Samakhya, Karnataka and a couple of other NGOs	
Table 101 Project Introduction- Community Radio	Unit	-

3.16 Centre for Development Process Innovations through ICTs - Community Radio Unit

BRIEF IMPACT OF THE PROJECT

The main strategy and activity of the CRU project was to enhance the capacities of Mahila Samakhya and 2 partners in community by transferring knowledge and building capacity for empowerment, and enhance awareness about community radio amongst development organisations.

OBJECTIVE AREAS	OUTPUTS	OUTCOMES
Establish an innovation and resource centre for (1) experimenting with various techno- social elements and models of community radio suited to the needs of different communities and development agencies and (2) share these learnings, through workshops as well as on-site and remote ICT-aided engagements	Creating new models for Community Radio. Broadcasting and sustaining audio program with an identity that is of the Vikasana organisation and community and that strengthens both	A new culture of sharing was developed, sharing of content making processes and the systems around producing radio programs. The space on platforms such as Gyan Vani helped realising alternate models of community radio. Also proposed a collective license for community radio with a number of stakeholders, both organisations and communities that can manage a single radio station, thereby reducing investment costs as well as optimising use of infrastructure.
Work in close partnership with 2 NGOs: one in Mysore, where the Centre is based; and one outside Karnataka.	Partnership with the NGOs as well as government functionaries and panchayat representatives.	The participation on radio has made information available that is necessary for building awareness regarding their entitlements, worked to enhance citizenship, increased participation in governance.
Strengthen the CR component of the Mahiti Manthana project - Kelu Sakhi - both, as a critical field of the Centre's learning as well as for up-scaling it across the region.	Creating platforms for marginalised voices, communities have found a space in mainstream media; it is also a space that they provided inputs to.	Kelu Sakhi proved that the marginalised could participate with great ease and expertise in media and that their participation legitimised their presence on the air waves. Community radio became a legitimate space for marginalised communities and this space did not discriminate on the basis of caste, religion or education.
310 —		Dalai



3.16.1 Project Background

Introduction to the Project

To develop ICTD approaches and models that overcome the limitations of the dominant models requires giving central importance to key concepts of development like empowerment, participation, rights and citizenship. These alternative, or complementing, models need to take a 'social shaping of technology' approach or a 'community shaping of technology' approach. Such experimentation will then provide the basis of appropriate ICTD theory, while suggesting generic techno-social systems appropriate to development activity, which then need to be contextually adapted in different development processes.

'Centre for Development Process Innovations through ICTs', (CDPII), aimed to capture the opportunities provided by the new ICTs for development, through designing processes for 'technology appropriation' by development agencies and communities. This was sought to be done by (1) experimenting in relation to varied development conditions to develop appropriate 'generic' technosocial process innovations (2) share these learnings, and (3) help development agencies and communities apply them through contextual adaptations.

While the Centre would develop comprehensive ICT strategies using a mix of different technology possibilities, for the sake of internal specialization, it would function with three distinct Units, built over three sets of ICT opportunities for development, namely, community radio (CR), community video and community computing.

The core idea is of a 'process innovation laboratory', which would work with development agencies through a dynamic approach that designs, implements, gleans insights and ploughs back learnings in the area of ICTs for development. The learnings that were developed by the Centre will be widely shared - including through a close hands-on engagement with a few select NGOs - by developing appropriate organisational, networking and knowledge management processes within, and in the ecology of, the Centre. The CR Unit of the Centre will specifically undertake the above activities in relation to CR opportunities opened up by the recent CR policy liberalisation in India, and the support being given by many development agencies, including governments, for setting up CR activities.

Functional scope:

The broad scope of the project aims to experiment with contextual adaptation of new ICTs in development practice, construct models of best practices from techno-social innovations in development processes, and transfer these learnings to development agencies, including helping them with contextual implementation of these models and innovations, in manner that promotes equitable and socially just development.

The adoption of new ICTs in transforming the information and communication architecture of and around communities, including power distribution between its various nodes and actors, gives new opportunities for gender equal development, and the Centre's activity will have this agenda central to all its activities.

The mission of the community radio unit of the CDPII is to engage in the above activities in the area of community radio. As for substantive themes, women's empowerment and governance - in the community-based aspects of 'participation' and 'demanding accountability' from public institutions - remain central to all activities of the Centre and its CR unit.

Definition of Services to be offered

The services for the development agencies are of

- Providing information resources and specific skill training,
- Capacity building on specific technical and techno-social aspects
- Designing and embedding systems and processes and
- Hands-on engagement for process innovation and transformation.

For communities this translates into new information and communication processes with potential for transforming power relationships, and for immediate gains through greater effectiveness in development activities through using CR possibilities.

3.16.2 Project Strategic Objectives

Following are the objectives of the CR Unit of the CDPII

- Establish an innovation and resource centre for (1) experimenting with various techno-social elements and models of community radio suited to the needs of different communities and development agencies and (2) share these learnings, through workshops as well as on-site and remote ICT-aided engagements.
- Work in close partnership with 2 NGOs one in Mysore, where the Centre is based, with intensive interactions to get a weekly program going on Karnataka State Open University FM radio and one outside Karnataka, relying on on-site visits by our team and internships at the CDPII of personnel of the partnering NGO to enable them to use CR possibilities in their work, as well as to develop more learnings for the CDPII.
- Strengthen the CR component of the Mahiti Manthana project -Kelu Sakhi - both, as a critical field of the Centre's learning as well as for up-scaling it within Mahila Samakhya's Karnatakawide, and India-wide, institutional network along with other components of Mahiti Manthana.

3.16.3 Project Relevance Inputs

Identification of Information and Services Needs

Information and services needs were identified through a needs assessment study. All the information needs seemed to be centred more around government schemes as well as income generation activities. This exhaustive list was prepared based on the needs assessment study which gives ready data for designing programs for this wide target group. Information needs of the sanghas were classified as below:

- Government and governance
 - $\circ\;$ How to approach government departments, where are they
 - Information about government schemes
 - o Information about law
 - How to get a BPL card
 - $\circ~$ How to get a ration shop to the village
 - $\circ~$ How to get a bus to the village
 - How to get a PHC to the village
 - How to get cooking gas connection
 - About taluk panchayat
 - Gram panchayat
 - $\circ~$ Rules and regulations of running a ration shop
 - Information about building toilets
 - o About grama sabhe
 - How to get an income certificate
 - Agriculture, agricultural seeds, schemes
- Other
 - o health and cleanliness information
 - $\circ~$ about children's growth and development
 - \circ dowry
 - $\circ~$ about education why children should be sent to school
- Sangha
 - \circ information about starting a sangha
 - o maintaining accounts





- bank transactions
- \circ how to take loans
- \circ how to sustain and make the sangha grow
- Livelihoods
 - o information on irrigation, borewells
 - \circ employment opportunities without migrating
 - o women's milk cooperative
 - silk worm cultivation
 - \circ animal husbandry
 - \circ horticulture
 - \circ tailoring
 - o trainings
 - marketing products made by women
 - \circ about organic farming

Overall, the needs assessment data lended itself to very deep analysis and provided a very good basis for understanding the target group for the radio intervention. Some immediate applications of this analysis were:

- Perceptions of empowerment would aid in developing characters for the radio program compere. Gender nuanced thinking could be encouraged, stereotypes that have emerged need to be dismissed. The subtle differences in perceptions between men and women were known and this knowledge allows to shape dialogue in an inclusive and positive manner rather in an approach that excludes.
- The long list of information needs was a ready list of programs and campaigns that need to be produced
- The identity of a sangha seems to be around savings and around income generation activities. Radio could support in building and

strengthening the sangha identity that was more empowerment centered, encourages collective strength, if the organisation so decides.

• Village problems gave us a peek into the lives of the women and men that the program would address. They also provided us with raw material to extract radio solutions and interventions.

3.16.4 Project Effectiveness Inputs

Project Stakeholders and Envisaged Roles

Table 103 brings out the different stakeholders involved and the respective roles they played.

Risks and Mitigation Strategies

- Since this project is heavily dependent on partnerships, the pace of the project will be determined by the partner NGOs.
- Getting formal MoUs with KSOU since this involves lots of bureaucratic steps to be followed
- Grassroots NGOs running with their own development projects giving time and prioritizing ICTD interventions
- The risk regarding the appropriate and facilitative evolution of CRA related polices of central and state governments is sought to be mitigated by taking up necessary advocacy work in partnership with other organisations, and maintaining links with policy actors, something that IT for Change is already engaged in.

3.16.5 Project Efficiency Inputs

Activities Performed in different Dimensions of Intervention: Table 104 summarises the main activities being performed in the

Stakeholder	Role(s) Played
Partner NGOs	Collaborate and co-create knowledge processes with respect to their own CR initiative
Other development agencies	Participate actively in knowledge sharing events
Mahila Samakhya	To continue participation and create structures and skills for effective active engagement
	Table 103 Stakeholders and their Roles- CRU

different themes of intervention.

Project Management Approach

Project management in such community based projects seeking participatory processes and change, and involving other partner grassroots NGOs, is a complex process. It is possible only to work within broad activity plans and time lines, while doing regular course-correction through collaborative processes. Within this overall context, the project was more or less able to stick to broad timelines, though some time extension was sought and obtained to finish the project.

Extent of Usage of Local Expertise

Content for radio is created by local expertise, resource persons and Sangha women for MSK. Vikasana and SVYM work with the entire marginalised communities and involve them right from the planning stage. Stress is on equitable representation of women in the project management groups.

Table 104 Theme-based Activity List- CRU

Theme	Activities
Bridging the Digital	• Kelu sakhi: continuation of Mahiti Manthana component to reach out to the rural Sangha women and communities
Divide	• Radio platforms for partner organisations - To reach out to the marginalised communities they work with
Citizen-Centric Service Delivery	• Kelu sakhi - produces programmes to generate awareness about citizenship
Public Private Partnership	ΝΑ
Capacity Building	Capacity building and demystifying technologies is a big part of the project. Multi layer capacity building has happened to MSK functionaries, Vikasana Organisation and Swami Vivekananda Youth movement functionaries.
Change Management	 Reaching out to the entire community with a new communication strategy Strengthen the Organisational effectiveness through radio Creating a platform for sharing and voicing opinions for the community Strengthening collectives and building new linkages amongst collectives by promoting collective listening as a institutional strategy
Business Process Reengineering	 Organisation uses traditional, human intensive communication strategy and we want them to use radio for this Information dissemination from the organisation to the community is a long process and there is articulated gap in the same. Reaching out to the entire community with same quality information is the felt need of the organisation.
Knowledge/Experience Sharing	 A portal designed exclusively for knowledge/experience sharing www.content-commons.in Intensive process documentation Partnerships based on experience of Kelu Sakhi
Others	NA



Management Processes Followed during the Project

The project periodically conducted the following processes:

- Stakeholders meetings and Preparation of RBM based LFA;
- Preparation of activity schedules for staff;
- Time schedules for various project activities;
- Allocation of human resources;
- Monitoring and reporting;
- Preparation of quarterly report;
- Internal evaluation; and Follow ups.

Extent of Usage of RBM and Performance Indicators

RBM was extensively used as monitoring and reporting mechanism throughout the project period. Monthly/quarterly reporting from field and project unit was done.

3.16.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated

- Creating platforms for marginalised voices: Kelu Sakhi proved that the marginalised could participate with great ease and expertise in media and that their participation legitimised their presence on the air waves. Community radio became a legitimate space for marginalised communities and this space did not discriminate on the basis of caste, religion or education.
- Empowerment and legitimacy: Through Mahiti Manthana and CRU, marginalised communities have found a space in mainstream media, not only found a space for their voices, it is also a space that they provide inputs to. The opening up 'airspace' for the marginalised and the following legitimacy shakes the sanctified space of the media institution itself. This space also recognised the inherent wisdom in communities and the power in their opinions. The whole process has proved to be highly empowering for these communities for whom acceptance in the mainstream is a daily struggle.

- Making governance transparent: The participation of government functionaries and panchayat representatives on radio has made information that is necessary for building awareness about citizenship and regarding their entitlements has worked to enhances citizenship, increased participation in governance made structures more accountable
- Robust information and communication strategies: Through this project, the three partner organisations have the insights to build robust information and communication strategies for development. These strategies would be rooted in participatory methodologies and keep rights-based approaches in mind.
- A new culture of sharing: The sharing of content making processes and the systems around producing radio programs cross fertilises the learning of the respective three NGOs. This encourages a culture of linkages and sharing between development organisations. At this point in the history of the development world when technology inclusion to project panning is nascent, it is important for the culture of sharing and scaling up learning to become the foundation for practice.
- Demystified technology: The NGOs associated with CRU have found the use of audio recording equipment and computers easy and have learnt these technologies through a very simple approach. In fact they picked up the basics in a couple of sessions. This is proof that technology is not the monster it is made out be nor is it a kingdom for elites.
- Use of all possible platforms: CRU believed that all possible platforms should be used and therefore we have reached an inprinciple agreement with the Vice Chancellor of KSOU that the organisations that we partner with in the CRU project will be provided broadcast space in the Karnataka Sate Open University radio channel Gyan Vani. We believe that these approaches will strengthen the CR dialogue
- New models for Community Radio: The space on platforms such as Gyan Vani help realise alternate models of community radio,

opening up possibilities for interactions with other existing infrastructure for radio. CRU also proposed a collective license for community radio with a number of stakeholders, both organisations and communities that can manage a single radio station, thereby reducing investment costs as well as optimising use of infrastructure.

Factors Facilitating/Impeding the Production of Outputs Factors which helped:

- Interest shown by the partners to have their own radio initiative
- Commitment from the leadership especially from Vikasana and Mahila Samakhya
- Recruitment of grassroots personnel by Mahila Samakhya

Factors which obstructed:

- Change of leadership and hence change of priorities with respect to Swami Vivekananda Youth Movement (SVYM)
- Resignation of existing Vice Chancellor of KSOU (Karnatak State Open University). As this happened during the formalisation of partnership with KSOU to aid in broadcast of partner NGO programmes, this has caused great inconvenience.

Extent of Operationalisation of the project recommendations

Extent of project Operationalisation of recommendations are mentioned below:

- Collaboration with local educational radio channels like Karnataka State Open University is a possibility present for many agencies.
- We feel that development agencies can easily pick up technical skills as they have the expertise of development issues.
- Radio content brings about legitimacy and vibrancy to the grassroots processes and the investment to do so is low.

- Participatory and ownership processes interwoven with ICT strategies create a sustainable intervention
- Frontline departments respond better to audio visual sharing aiding in transparency.
- Formation of core groups for radio production using the existing human resource available in the organisation successfully demonstrates the sustainability and possibility for scaling of such projects.
- Basing the entire project design on organisational structure of partners
- Partner organisations have the socio technical know how to handle the component through various capacity building programmes
- Designing of project needs is in tandem with partner organisation's activities and human resource requirements
- Infrastructure need of this project is one time requirement for buying the field recording and producing equipment under a small budget with a small recurring administrative cost which can be incorporated under their existing budget.

3.16.7 Project Sustainability Considerations

- Since this is a collaborative project with Mahila Samakhya Karnataka which is an initiative of Ministry of Human resources and Department of Education, GoI, scalability and sustainability is possible to a great degree.
- Handover process to MSK Mysore has been initiated.
- Vikasana has its own institutional mechanism in place to take the initiative forward.
- ITfC has succeeded in evolving into a Center for Community Informatics and Development at Mysore, through which it will support many such ICTD interventions and organisations in the region.





EVALUATING THE PROJECT

The project has been evaluated on five parameters viz. Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Results/Impacts and Sustainability which were further affirmed by subparameters illustrated in Table 105 that exhibits the evaluation in six categories of Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Moderately Satisfactory, Moderately Unsatisfactory, Unsatisfactory And Highly Unsatisfactory, accounting respectively for 6,5,4,3,2 and 1 points. The right most column substantiates the scores. The rating for each of the parameters was arrived at after averaging on the ratings for each of the sub-parameters. Similarly the overall evaluation rating were arrived at after averaging on the parameter ratings.



Figure 59 Evaluating the Project- Community Radio Unit

Figure 60 Key Recommendations for the Next Steps

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE NEXT STEPS

PARTNERSHIP WITH GOVT. AGENCIES

ITfC should explore the possibility of partnering with state IT department for smooth replication of the project in other areas and also to get assistance for removing some of the burden of the implementation. Similarly, partnering with some of the other Govt. relevant department may be helpful to host some of the programs jointly.

TIE UP WITH OTHER NGOs

Apart from partnering with the two NGOs for this project, ITfC should explore the possibility to tie up with some more NGOs so that the program may be replicated/ rolled out across the state/country.

LIVE 'ASK THE EXPERT' PROGRAM

There could be a live program organized where experts from various areas may be invited. Listener can call a number and ask their queries to get the answer.

SUSTAINABLE BUSINESS MODEL FOR CRU

The current revenue model of CRU is not adequate to support their sustenance post expiry of funding from external sources. Additional sources of revenue need to be contemplated. These could come from providing additional services through CRUs, advertisements etc.



3.16.8 Project Evaluation Matrix

							Table 105 Project Evaluation Matrix- CRU			
EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks			
RELEVANCE										
Needs of the beneficiary captured							 Beneficiaries covered are the two new partners along with the existing parter MSK Mysore. Meetings and workshops were conducted to understand the needs of the partners and their stakeholders. Other civil society organizations working in similar areas were not covered / contacted 			
Relevant to needs & expectations of beneficiary							 Segmentation is loosely done however no formal procedure of segmentation has been carried out Offerings are tailored for these loosely designed done 			
Relevant to development priorities of Govt. of India							• This project is directly impacting the GoI priority of Women empowerment, enhancement of citizenship and right based approach and governance at gram panchayat and taluk level.			
Relevant to development priorities of concerned State Government							 This project is directly impacting the GoI priority of Women empowerment, enhancement of citizenship and right based approach and governance at gram panchayat and taluk level. In addition, this project would impact marginalized farmer, women empowerment, tribal welfare, improvement in health and education of rural community etc. 			
Identified problem has high incidence in area of focus							 Frequent and continuous incidences reported in the area Substantial number of individuals of the targeted vulnerable group (rural women) are affected Specific areas include governance, rights, health, education etc. 			
Correct & accurate identification of target stakeholders and/or correctly defined vulnerable groups							 Workshop was conducted through which the stakeholders were identified Stakeholder segments including vulnerable groups were looked into. Further the needs and area of interest of the stakeholders of the stakeholders were also formally mapped 			
Adequacy of Government commitment to project							• Formally government was not part of the project so no question of direct commitment			







Evaluation matrix	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							• One of the partner of the project is MSK, under the MHRD, Gol which has a formal commitment for the implementation of the project.
Project relevance to ICT4D focus under the project							• Project focus on community radio is in relevant to the ICTD focus
				E	FFEC	FIVENE	SS
Problem been stated correctly and distinctly							 Problems identified, defined and documented through needs assessment and in DPR Problems being validated by partners/stakeholders through core group meeting and subsequently process mapping exercise being carried out
Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries, users of the project are identified as stakeholders of the project							 Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries and users have been identified as stakeholders Roles and responsibilities of all stakeholders have been detailed out in the needs assessment document.
The assumptions, objectives, outputs and outcomes have been clearly articulated in measurable terms							 Done using the RBM model Objectives, outputs and outcomes vaguely identified. Certain assumptions articulated Subjective measurement terms in use
The linkages between objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was clear							Logical linkages present but not documented
The project design allowed for flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment.							 Project design capable of adapting to and responding positively to most of the possible types of changes Project Institutional structure, capacity building plan etc. can cater to any of such changes in future.
Degree of support given by the Government towards integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme and other related projects							 For Kelu sakhi, there is discussion going on with MHRD, Gol for up-scaling the program at national level
Planning component of the project take into account the use of ICT for improved governance / service delivery in various							 The project (CDPII - CRU) approach has been facilitating empowerment processes through ICTs. Partner organizations have been engaged with various sections of marginalized communities. Radio was envisioned to be used for



Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
areas through pilot initiatives, encouraging BPR, development local solutions and applications and encouragement of PPP model							 revitalizing the organizational information and communication processes as well as give an effective platform for marginalized voices. BPR: all the partners follow human resource intensive I and C strategies and Radio was envisioned to change that. Their I & C processes banked on information sharing from representative members to the masses which in itself is prone to dilution of information passed. Radio was planned to effective information transfer to all through its reach and the quality of information shared would be the same.
The adequacy of institutional arrangements in attaining the long-term objective of the project. Also the infrastructural, logistical, and financial implication of sustaining the project objectives beyond the project duration/after completion of UNDP funding.		•					 Capacity building of the partner organisation to design their own radio strategy was planned from the start up itself. The project based itself on ownership model and was co owned by partners. Joint committees were constituted to look at the overall progress towards having a sustainable strategy. The design of the project is based on building on existing resources. Existing staff from various levels were trained and open source software was used to minimize costs as well as to have a robust replicable model. Infrastructure needs of the project were one time investment with respect to buying the handheld recorder and mic and this requires minimum administrative cost. As for IT for Change the implementing organization - the resources were utilized to build capacities of the internal team to become a resource group. In this context fund mobilization will continue with different donors and we will be a center facilitating ICT usage for development
Project's linkages, liaison, coordination and impact upon related activities under NeGP being implemented in the country.							 Loosely aligned with NeGP as illustrated by duplication of services to be provided by CSC (Government's initiative) and negligible support and buy-in of Government
The project's assistance, relationship, relevance to and coordination with the pre- existing Project management system and staff							• The project utilizes both the pre-existing management system as well as staff effectively and coordinates with them effectively
Clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various institutional arrangements for overall programme management and implementation and the level of coordination between relevant players							 Roles and responsibilities of all of the stakeholders were defined clearly Management processes have been laid down for proper coordination between the players



	Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks				
R	isk assessment and management of the roject							 Most of the potential risks were noted down Mitigation strategies for identified risk have not been clearly laid down 				
E	fforts of stakeholders in support of the nplementation of the project							 The project proposal submitted to UNDP was documented in coordination with most of the stakeholders with partial buy-in of certain stakeholders e.g. Government Most of the stakeholders have extended support as envisaged from them during the proposal stage. 				
E s c	xtent of conflict of interest either between takeholders involved in the project or with utside agencies.							No major conflict of Interest				
I	EFFICIENCY											
V t v	Vas a formal workplan made at the start of he project to determine the timeframe in /hich activities would be performed							 Detailed workplan prepared for all important activities Month wise timelines defined for each activity 				
V p a v	Vere resources made available to the roject implementation agencies in ccordance with the requirements of the vorkplan							• None of the key resources, only a few of the support staff replaced.				
E ii c	xtent of deviation in the project nplementation in so far as timelines is oncerned.							• Project implementation delayed by less than 15% of overall duration				
R t r	esponsiveness of the project management o such deviations and flexibility to deploy esources							• Management taking steps in terms of extra resources (time and effort) to somehow correct the course of implementation				
V n a	Vere any systems, processes, manuals etc nade to govern the activities in the project mong the different stakeholders							 www.content-commons.in was created as a resource sharing platform across development agencies Training modules were prepared extensively for contextual learning of required socio technical skills Systems and processes developed: Pre production, production and post production mechanisms, feedback mechanism, institutional core group formation, production groups (recording, scripting and editing groups) etc. 				



Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent to which Results Based Management has been used							• Continuous RBM under usage at every stage of the project. Monthly and quarterly reports were generation for monitoring and evaluation purpose.
Whether there was adequacy of steps taken to resolve any conflict of interest in or due to the project							• No major conflict was observed
				RE	SULTS	5/IMPA	CTS
Whether the project has produced its desired immediate outputs							• Majority (50% to less than 75%) of the immediate outputs achieved
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, use of the new outputs as against the traditional options)							• Most of the intended beneficiaries used the project output in more than 75% cases and in 25% or less cases used traditional options
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, percentage of the target population)							• About 50% of the intended beneficiaries utilized the project output
Extent of drop-outs from usage of the outputs by the intended beneficiaries							• Marginal (Less than 25%) drop-out from usage of outputs by the intended beneficiaries
Are there any unforeseen/ unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups							Νο
Extent of the project results on the target beneficiaries in terms of (a) Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, (b) Capacity Building, (c) Change Management, (d) Business Process Re-engineering, (f) Public Private Partnership, (g) Bridging the Digital Divide, and (h) Knowledge and Experience Sharing		•					 Through Kelu sakhi, citizenship enhancing programming goes on air regularly. This has resulted in increased participation in local governance. Vikasana's programming needs are the same as well, Capacity building is a major strategy of the project Core group, and production groups are constituted at the partner organisation level Multi pronged production cycles are designed to give increased access to community members training modules, content sharing web portals have been made accessible to partners.
Extent of the project impact on the target groups in terms of (a) governance (improved							The primary approach of the project has been to facilitate the empowerment of the marginalized communities that the partners work with. Mahila Samakhya has





Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks			
efficiency, transparency and accountability), (b) citizen-centric service delivery (advantages of cost, time and convenience), (c) rural livelihoods (number of jobs, extent and sufficiency of employment), and (d) women's empowerment (increased knowledge, and use of the same to voice their concerns).							used its radio for enhancing citizenship, for promoting participation in local governance, for legitimizing the voices and opinions of the rural communities and for transferring relevant contextualized information. Vikasana is ready with their own programme which envisions to enhance livelihoods, empowers its community and aids in strengthening local governance. SVYM wants its radio to mobilize the tribal community, create change agents amongst the youth and enhance transparency in governance.			
Extent of significance of the project impact on the development of the region/country							• No significant impact yet observed in the region/country			
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by marginalized communities							• Most of the marginalized communities have utilized the project output in more than 50% cases where they needed similar service			
Extent to which capacities have been built in stakeholders during the project							• Capacities of the main stakeholders have been built up to atleast perform the necessary operational and maintenance activities assigned to them			
SUSTAINABILITY										
Extent of ownership of stakeholders in the project							• Complete ownership of all the 'implementing and operating' stakeholders in the project.			
Degree of support given by the Government in integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme							• Department of IT have that community radio should be included and scaled across all the csc schemes			
Extent of availability of inputs/resources required for the project (people, finances, infrastructure, equipments)							• Not all the resources in all the four area - people, finances, infrastructure, equipments were completely available during the duration of the project			
Have any revenue streams been defined in the project to make it self-sustaining							• Social sustainability has been a key premise on which the project was based. Since this intervention does not need huge resources, financial sustainability was built into the strategy.			
Extent of success of such pre-defined revenue streams							Achieving atleast 75% of the target			
Extent to which inventory of the assets created out of the grants received in the							• Assets received under the project have been maintained well in terms of asset registers			



EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Μοderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
project have been properly maintained and transferred to the beneficiaries							
Degree of collaboration that has developed among stakeholders during the project							• Stakeholder management plan is defined and have adherence during project execution
Extent to which government is willing to finance the project after its completion of the UNDP funding							• No direct funding committed by the Government. However, Mahila samakhya has been in the process of scaling up the project across all the districts it works in. Mahila samakhya kerala is interested to replicate the model.




3.17 ICT School for Women's Empowerment

Table 106: Introduction- ICT School for Women's Empowerment

Project Title	ICT School for Women's Empowerment		
Proponent			
Organisation	SEWA		
Implementation State	Gujarat		
Target Site for Pilot	Gujarat (Districts covered were Ahmadabad, Gandhinagar, Mehasana, Kheda, Anand,		
Project	Surendranagar, Banaskantha, Patan, Kutch, Sabarkantha, Vadodara)		
Theme of Project	Women's Empowerment		
Target Population	3,65,000 SEWA members and other rural communities in the above districts	No. of Concession, No. of Conces	
Project Cost	50,00,000 INR		
Funding Required for			
Project	50,00,000 INR		1.1
Time Required to	22 Woolks		1
Implement Project	32 Weeks		
Name(s) of Partner	Smaille Chailebuile Village Kandra (for astablishment of CLC in Ribar)		3
Agencies	Sindjik Shakshink vikas kenura (for establishinent of CLC in Binar)		

IMPACT OF THE PROJECT IN BRIEF

ICT School for Women's Empowerment project has been able to effectively use information & Communication Technology (ICT) to further empower rural women and neglected community for livelihood generation, socio-economic security and self-sustainability.

	OBJECTIVE AREAS	OUTPUTS	OUTCOMES
	Provide ICT based skills training to 160 women and rural community members	• Successfully trained 184 rural women & community members as master trainers on identified subjects	• ICT training has facilitated in livelihood generation and social upliftment of rural women. Based on these trainings, 77 (42% of the total trainees) have got direct employment and 18 (10% of the total trainees) participants have started their own microenterprises and earning about 2500-5000 Rs. a month.
	Generate audio-visual content under Community Media for spreading awareness	 Collected and setup a big archive of more than 500 local community media programs in audio and video formats on different socio-economic subjects 	• The approval for procurement of license from the concerned Government department for setting up community radio station in the identified ICT Schools is still in progress.
	Setting up Community Learning Centre (CLC) in	• Established Community Learning Centre (CLC) at Jhanjharpur, Madhubani, Bihar in association with the local Organisation	• The people of Bihar has started taking benefits of the multi-purpose training (including ICT) provided at CLC to generate livelihood. About 12 names were registered for ICT training on the inauguration date of the centre.
De	oitte.		JLJ

Table 108 Brief Impact of the Project- ICR for Women's Empowermen

3.17.1 Project Background

About SEWA - The Proponent Organisation

Self-employed Women's Association (SEWA) is a trade union registered in 1972. It is an organisation of poor, self-employed women workers. These are women who earn a living through their own labour or small businesses. They do not obtain regular salaried employment with welfare benefits like workers in the organized sector.

Through its various movement and campaigns, SEWA has also helped local communities in capacity building, development, and their social and financial security. Today, SEWA has a membership of more than 1.1 million women members and is a strong, largest national level union of poor self employed women spread across seven states in India and 14 districts in Gujarat, most of these districts are situated in arid and semi arid zones.

The districts covered under SEWA are- Ahmedabad, Gandhinagar, Mehasana, Kheda, Anand, Surendranagar, Banaskantha, Patan, Kutch, Sabarkantha, Vadodara. SEWA has established **Community Learning Centre (CLC)** at various locations which are envisaged as a 'hub' or centre of activity for a cluster of ten to fifteen villages.

About Community Learning Centre (CLC's)

Community Learning Centre has evolved as a multi-purpose training centre running a wide variety of activities to uplift rural, poor women and children who had no access to formal education and livelihood opportunities. The CLCs are Learning Centers for different needs of different villages:

• Skill Trainings: The CLCs provide space for the livelihood cooperatives. Artisans, Gum Collectors, RUDI Vendors, Salt Workers, etc. may have their workshops at CLCs.

- Wellness Education: On topics such as child health, nutrition, hygiene, maternal, etc.
- Education on social issues: Such as women's rights, gender relationships, literacy programs.
- Disaster Preparedness Education: On-going community education about the dynamics of disasters and their repercussions, Posters and short films, explain to community members where to go when an emergency alarm is heard, Signs around the centre inform community members of contingency plans, etc.

CLC has helped thousands of women and people belonging to underprivileged communities to have an access to livelihood.

Recognition of ICT Training Need

Besides the existing services rendered through CLCs for women empowerment, SEWA recognized the need to introduce Information & Communication Technology (ICT) to further empower rural women and neglected community for livelihood generation, socioeconomic security and self-sustainability.

Use of Internet, Mobile phone, SMS, MMS can build capacities of the women community in their respective trades, contribute to their development as leaders and implementers, and enormously enhance their confidence. Further ICT also provides an additional opportunity of income generation.

The existing set-up of CLCs could be further strengthened (by providing hardware as well as ICT trained teachers) to shoulder the responsibility of imparting ICT training to women and other weaker sections of the society at a concessional rates.





Project Description: Evolution of ICT School for Women's Empowerment

The main purpose and scope of the project was to help women and local communities earn livelihood in a self sustainable manner over a long time.

The ICT School for Empowerment of Women provides the following five factors, which can help and encourage self sustainable and enduring means of livelihood generation:

- Strengthens capacity building in locations which have long been neglected by developmental processes due to various constraints including the isolation of villages.
- Access to latest resources and information the need for latest information and resources would be satisfied by the CLCs and the Community Radio Stations or Community media, which are part of the ICT School.
- Help local entrepreneurs get financial assistance by arranging for micro-credit through various agencies.
- Vocational trainings in areas like digital journalism, mobile repairing, and photography will create new livelihood opportunities for local communities and would contribute significantly to direct livelihood generation. This, coupled with training in areas like Rural Entrepreneurship, would enhance the livelihood generation potential of the women and underprivileged classes.
- **Coordinate with local government bodies** like panchayats and local authorities, (through community involvement activities and through community radio programs) and would work with them for building a strong framework for institutional support.

The project focused on developing the CLCs as ICT schools to build capacity and provide trainings to the women members of SEWA and local communities in various ICT based applications.

Each CLC has been equipped with 4-5 computers.

CASE STUDY

One such example has been Vanitaben (she comes from a remote area of Kutch where one cannot find proper conveyance till miles) who had studied up to 7th class only. She was unmarried and living with her mother and had no source of income. When she got to know that SEWA is implementing computer literacy project with Microsoft India, in her village Naredi (there were no computers in Naredi and nearby villages), she showed her interest to join the computer training program which included long travel in challenging circumstances. After receiving training, now she can repair computers on her own. She can do data entry work also by which she earns significant income for her family. She received TOT (Training of Trainers) and is presently coaching other members. Simultaneously she started taking part in the other SEWA activities and this facilitated her to know more about the outside world as she used to come to Ahmedabad every month to attend monthly meeting. This in turn, has transformed her life and boosted her inner confidence. She has been called by the village Sarpanch to help them in their computer work. She is self-reliant and lives with dignity. Even her mother is respected by all villagers. Examples like this have helped inspire populace to seek such trainings. For ex, in each SSK in Mehsana district there is continuous waiting list for trainees. They feel that there should be more computers and training batches. The SSK team has solved this problem when they received hardware training and themselves assembled working computers from old and unusable computers.



The curriculum for the training has been made based on the needs of the members. For example a savings record keeping member was given extensive training on excel, whereas a craft member was taught designing. All trainings included the basic computer literacy module and office trainings.

Initially the training has been provided to select members of SEWA from professional private ICT training institute using 'Train the Trainer' Model.

These trained members became ICT trainer in the CLCs to impart ICT training to a large section of neglected community at a concessional rate.

3.17.2 Project Strategic Objectives

The key strategic objectives of the project include: Goal#1: ICT Skills Training

Providing ICT based skills training to women and rural community members, which would enable them in upgrading their ICT skills & knowledge with the objective of generating livelihood through ICT skills. SEWA will provide training to a total of 160 (One Hundred Sixty) participants in different ICT based training during the project period.

Goal#2: Community Radio or Community Media



use for spreading awareness among poor women and rural communities.

Goal#3: Setting up Community Learning Centre (CLC) in state of

Generate audio-visual content under Community Media, which will	Bihar Table 109 Project Stakeholders and their Roles
Stakeholder	Role(s) Played
Rural women, Farmers, salt, workers, students, embroidery workers and people engagement in traditional livelihood	Direct beneficiaries, end users, collaborator & Management and Operations
Central and district level SEWA team	Facilitator
Public/ Private Computer Training Institutes	Impact ICT training to women in different software and hardware domains
Microsoft Corporation	Partner ICT training course certifying agency (Microsoft Unlimited Potential Course Certification)
Smajik Shaikshnik Vikas Kendra	Implementation partner for establishment of CLC in Bihar



Visit the identified communities and assess the potential of ICT and CLC in the segmented area. After assessment of the areas, SEWA will invite a team of these communities who are interested in setting up CLC in their area. SEWA will provide exposure and trainings to this team at CLCs in Gujarat and teach them on techniques of setting up CLC and conducting different activities at CLC to help and support women and rural communities in Bihar. SEWA will also support this team in setting up CLC by handholding and on the job training by visiting the locations.

Goal#4: Augmentation of the existing CLC's:

The Community Learning Centers established at the cluster of villages will be the major vehicle of achieving the goals. The centers are located at the villages and hence best for providing the services as per the requirement of the community. Under this project around 20 CLC's will be augmented with computers and UPS along with connectivity.

3.17.3 Project Relevance Inputs

Identification of Information and Services Needs

SEWA followed bottom up approach in identifying issues and requirements to design the project.

All information requirements were identified by the villagers themselves. The needs and requirement has been captured during:

- Village meetings
- Orientation workshop SEWA

The major training and information needs identified were the following:

- ICT Based Skill Training
- Language Training
- Communication Training
- Government Information

Market Information

Further, particular ICT courses on which training would be imparted have been identified based on broad assessment of demand for a particular computer skill (DTP, Tally, MS Office, etc). For assessing demand, local employers were contacted and also newspaper vacancies were analyzed.

3.17.4 Project Effectiveness Inputs Project Stakeholders and Envisaged Roles

Table 109 brings out the different stakeholders involved and the roles they played.

Risks and Mitigation Strategies

The major risks & mitigation strategy is provided below:

• Natural Calamities - The potential risk within the project is natural calamities; natural calamity may divert people's attention from development initiatives to rescue operation leading to project failure.

SEWA through its other developmental initiatives would expedite the relief operations and encourage its member to participate in the project. However such calamities did not occur during project period till date.

• License from Government for Community Radio Station - There was risk of delay in getting requisite approvals for procurement of license from the concerned Government department for setting up community radio station in the identified ICT Schools. To minimize the impact of the above delay, necessary ground work has been carried out by identifying the need of the villagers, their response, awareness, team identification, skill up gradation, etc. so that at time of license availability broadcasting can be commenced immediately.





 Lack of qualified and trained ICT personnel at CLC - CLCs do not have adequate number of ICT trained personnel to impart training to large number of rural community.
 As risk mitigation, expert ICT training has been provided to select members at Public/ Private ICT training institutes following 'Train the Trainers Model', wherein the trained personnel can further impart ICT training at CLCs to large number of rural population at a nominal fee.

 Problem of availability of internet connection - Few CLC's are not equipped with basic internet connection facilities as there is no provision of internet in such remote locations.
 As a mitigation strategy, steps have been taken by negotiating with BSNL to provide internet facilities in such remote locations.





3.17.5 Project Efficiency Inputs

Activities Performed in different Dimensions of Intervention Table 110 lists activities performed in different dimensions of interventions:

Project Management Approach

SEWA followed an integrated approach where information,

technical know-how, skill up gradation and social upliftment were primary focus areas and are taken care of.

A team of SEWA personnel was responsible for identification and execution of agreement with private sector ICT training providers for providing Table 110 Theme-wise activities conducted during the project

Theme	Activities
Bridging the Digital Divide	 Made computers available to the rural community including arrangement for computer mela (fair) so that the people from rural community can buy a computer or a laptop at 0% interest loan. Pocket PCO was also introduced. Conceptualized and launched Magic jack for international outstation calls at affordable price. Especially in the two district i.e. Mehsana & Anand Collected and setup a big archive of more than 500 local community media programs in audio and video formats on different socio-economic subjects.
Citizen-Centric Service Delivery	 Established CLC in Bihar Computer library in certain CLC's have been established ICT training facilitated citizen to earn livelihood either through local employment or business
Public Private	• ICT training has been given to the community by various private computer educational centers.
Partnership	Microsoft certification has been provided through these CLCs under a tie-up with Microsoft Corporation
Capacity Building	 Provision of skilled training in various sectors like software, hardware, embroidery, photography, etc. Adopting 'Train the Trainer Model' to ensure wide spread dissemination of knowledge. A group of 16 semiliterate rural women with maximum education of 7th to 10th class has been trained as Rural Journalist to generate content for community media locally
Change Management	• Management of the whole project activity based on bottom to top approach. Villagers were involved at all stages of the projects viz. Planning, implementation & monitoring ensuring adequate change management and buy in, in the overall project planning and implementation structure
Business Process Re- engineering	 Moving away from service provider location of training to training at CLC - thereby leading to saving on account of travel cost, time, etc Mechanism of regular feedback on training courses from the trainee to identify need to improvement Adoption of 'Train the Trainer' model to ensure availability of a large number of ICT trained teachers to provide training to community at large
Knowledge / Experience Sharing	 Regular computer trainings programme have been organised at CLCs. Organized 5 (Five) Computer Melas in 5 districts of Gujarat, where importance and benefits of ICT was showcased through various mediums like lectures, audio, video etc. More than 1200 people have participated in these Melas
Others	• Undertaken process documentation in documentary form which will be beneficial for our future learning's and to generate awareness among the villagers.



training in various ICT courses.

For implementing project activities the overall structure was formed comprising of one project coordinator followed by district level team leader and organizer followed by spearhead team and village leaders.

Bottom up approach was followed in which all the needs coming from the bottom and in implementation process SEWA's central team play a role of facilitation.

Regarding project timeline, all the activities were planned in conjunction with community so as to ensure community members buy-ins and availability.

Extent of Usage of Local Expertise

Local entrepreneurs, panchayat members, district administration officials have been contacted to identify ICT skills in high demand and to finalize training courses to be imparted to the SEWA member. This has ensured prompt employment of trained women after completion of the course.

A few SEWA members trained from private ICT training institute have been imparting ICT training at CLCs.

A network of SEWA's 1.1 million women folk has been used for communication and awareness creation about the benefit of ICT knowledge in earning livelihood.

Management Processes Followed during the Project

The project periodically conducts the following processes:

- Stakeholders meetings;
- Preparation of RBM based LFA;
- Preparation of work plan;
- Time schedules for various project activities;
- Allocation of human resources;
- Monitoring and reporting;
- Preparation of quarterly report;

- Preparation of training plan; and
- Internal evaluation.

Extent of Usage of RBM and Performance Indicators

Monitoring and evaluation (M&E) are the foundations to measure the success of any project. For this project, SEWA developed proper M&E mechanism.

At each stage of implementation of project activities some indicators to monitors the impacts on the community were outlined.

After each training session feedback has been obtained from the trainees about the proficiency of trainers, adequacy of course content, etc so that necessary timely action for improvement could be undertaken.

3.17.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated

The output/ result of the project is provided below:

- Successfully trained 184 rural women & community members as master trainers on identified subjects.
- Trained a group of 16 semiliterate rural women with maximum education of 7th to 10th class as



Deloitte

Rural Journalist to generate content for community media locally.

- Organized 5 (Five) Computer Melas in 5 districts of Gujarat, where importance and benefits of ICT was showcased through various mediums like lectures, audio, video etc.
- More than 1200 people have participated in these Melas.
- Linked local hardware vendor and SEWA Bank though which rural communities are getting computers on loans at 0%.
- Pocket PCO (use mobile phone for public calls) has been introduced for micro entrepreneurs in 2 districts. This activity



has been initiated with an association with a cellular company, who has provided mobile phones on concessional rates and SEWA District Associations has helped micro entrepreneurs to avail loan facilities to procure phones.

- More than 200 Pocket PCOs has been procured by these micro entrepreneurs which is providing them fair income to sustain.
- Establishment of Community Learning Centre (CLC) at Jhanjharpur, Madhubani, Bihar in association with the local Organisation " Samajik Shaikshanik Vikas Kendra (SSVK) and

Parameters	Before Project	After Project
ICT Awareness	Nil or Very Low	Substantially Increased
ICT Training to Women/ rural community member	Nil or Very Low	Substantially Increased
ICT Knowledge as a tool to livelihood generation	Nil or Very Low	Substantially Increased
CLC concept in Bihar	Non-existent	One CLC established in Bihar
Availability of Computer	Rarely Available	Widely Available
Mobile phone usage	Nil or Very Low	Substantially Increased

benefitting rural communities with ICT based services. The CLC is functional since July, 2009 and rural communities have started taking benefits of revolutionary ICT services.

Factors Facilitating/Impeding the Production of Outputs

There are several factors which helped SEWA to achieve project outputs. The major factor which helped was community attachment and faith in the implementing agency i.e. SEWA.

Second factor was SEWA's integrated approach requiring regular participation of community members during the course of the project ensuring widespread awareness creation and acceptability of the project.

Last but not the least, all along the project there has been active community participation facilitating smooth execution of the project.

Effect of Outputs / Results on the Target Groups of the Project The key outcome of the project includes:

• ICT training facilitated livelihood generation either through external employment or self employment. Some of the trained members of were employed with local IT training institutes and

other organizations as data entry operators. Based on these trainings, 77 (42% of the total trainees) have got direct employment and 18 (10% of the total trainees) participants have started their own microenterprises and

Sitting in my remote village, ICT is my gateway to developing a better understanding of markets which helps me and the women associated with the centre to deliver good quality output for the market. ICT is not just a platform for growth but it is an expression of self-confidence and self-respect

> Says...Gauribhen Village Bhaktura, Dist. Patan

Table 111-Pre & Post Project Parameter Synopsis

earning about Rs. 2500-5000 a month.



- ICT training instilled a sense of empowerment among women. Women who were hardly recognized in their societies, now respected in their community for their ICT skills and creativity. The younger women feel they were able to approach the job market with greater confidence.
- ICT hardware at CLC created knowledge and awareness of latest ICT tools among rural people. In various computer melas organized by SEWA, more than 550 desktop and laptop computers have been purchased by local community members to use in their trades, microenterprises and for children.
- Increase usage of mobile phone for communication lead to considerable saving of time and efforts of rural women. Women are using telephone (and sometimes even the fax to communicate across district offices) to fix up meetings of their group, logistics setting for travel and appointment seeking with government and other officials in different locations. Mobile phones were also used in micro enterprises by the women and even in agricultural-produce selling.

An overview of the impact of the project is provided in Table 111.

Extent of Operationalization of the project recommendations

The extent of operationalization of the project recommendations are as follows:

- ICT skill training- Training has been imparted to 184 rural persons as against the target of 160 people. The key ICT courses on which training was imparted include:
 - Digital Journalism
 - Tele Caller Training
 - Video & Voice Editing
 - Digital Documentation
 - GIS & MAPs Developing
 - Web Designing
 - Maintaining Accounts (Training on Tally software)

- Screen Printing
- Computer Hardware Training and Orientation
- Mobile Repairing
- Language Training
- Advanced Computer Training
- DTP training
- Completion of the course curriculum and required documentation- The overall course curriculum and timelines of various ICT training courses, specifically for training modules related to Mobile Repairing, Tally software, Web designing, Hardware, Screen printing, languages have been finalized. Experienced and competent resource persons have also been identified for imparting training on the above courses.
- Operational manual of the CLC have been completed This manual is for the coordinator of the center as guidance to run the CLC's. The manual is also helpful for the leaders of SEWA so they can make the optimum usage of the center
- Establishment of CLC in Bihar- CLC is functional since July, 2009 and rural communities have started taking benefits of revolutionary ICT services.
- Community Radio- License for Community Radio has already applied, which are under process of confirmation from Ministry of Information & Broadcasting since last one and half year. The content development is in progress
- Up-gradation of CLC- 10 CLCs have been upgraded by providing internet and hardware set-up.

Unforeseen/Unintended Outputs Resultant from the Project

Besides providing training to rural women for livelihood generation, the project leads to wide-spread dissemination of ICT knowledge and awareness among rural population.





3.17.7 Project Sustainability Considerations

In order to ensure long term continuity of any project financial sustainability is must. In order to ensure financial sustainability of this project, several avenues of revenue generation have been identified and implemented. This includes:

- ICT Training fee- CLC charges concessional fees for imparting ICT training in various courses. Lower fee is charged from SEWA member as compared to non-members.
- Fee for other ICT services- CLC charges fee for various other services rendered by it such as printing, document typing, internet access charges, etc

Project Institutional Arrangements

There has been well defined institutional structure for operation and maintenance of CLC which involves local community members only. SEWA's central team plays a role of facilitator and regular guidance and support in functioning of CLC.

A centralized ICT Cell at the main office of SEWA in Ahmadabad is established to provide ICT related support to CLCs. Further, the 'Train the Trainer Model' of training ensured that adequate number of trained personnel would be available in CLCs for imparting

further trainings.

Extent of Commitment/Involvement/Ownership of Stakeholders From each stage of the project i.e. planning, implementation, monitoring and management, the community is actively involved and act as spearheads for identification and prioritizing their needs.

Degree of Support Provided by the Government

No major support has been extended by local government during the course of the project.

However, there has been regular involvement of local Panchayat members and other government officials during the course of implementation of the project. The main reason behind this was to avoid duplication of work and to assist government in their developmental work.

Efforts to Replicate Project Results

The project has already witnessed replication by means of setting up a CLC in Bihar. SEWA team in association with the local organisation Samajik Shaikshanik Vikas Kendra (SSVK) has established a CLC in Bihar. The CLC is functional since July, 2009 and rural communities have started taking benefits of ICT services.

EVALUATING THE PROJECT

The project has been evaluated on five parameters viz. Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Results/Impacts and Sustainability which were further affirmed by subparameters illustrated in Table 112 that exhibits the evaluation in six categories of Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Moderately Satisfactory, Moderately Unsatisfactory, Unsatisfactory And Highly Unsatisfactory, accounting respectively for 6,5,4,3,2 and 1 points. The right most column substantiates the scores. The rating for each of the parameters was arrived at after averaging on the ratings for each of the sub-parameters. Similarly the overall evaluation rating were arrived at after averaging on the parameter ratings.



Figure 61 Evaluating the Project- ICT School for Women's Empowerment



KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE NEXT STEPS

PROJECT SPECIFIC RECOMMENDATIONS

Formal Backward Linkages with ICT Training Institute- Identify various ICT training institutes and formalise training terms so that training in various types computer courses can be imparted at a concessional rate as and when need arise.

Formal Forward Linkages with Prospective Employers - There should be proper linkages with prospective employers, including local entrepreneurs, Government bodies etc, to identify ICT training skills in demand and facilitate ICT trained people to get quick employment. **Universal Acceptance of ICT training Certificate provided by SEWA** - The certificate awarded by SEWA after successful completion of ICT courses should be recognised across the country. This would increase employment avenues for people trained in SEWA operated CLCs.

POLICY SPECIFIC RECOMMENDATIONS

Some key factors, for effective implementation of ICT in rural areas to bridge the digital divide, which should be considered as implementation polices for expansion and replication is as follows:

Improves efficiency, quality of services & technological literacy - To keep the pace with current technology and take optimum benefit, it is necessary to constantly train/ update rural women & communities with the latest developments. These trained women would become owners and implementers of this updated technology in rural areas and contribute in bridging the digital divide.

Information generation, collection & dissemination for economic security - (a.) Creates a databank with complete information of village and community members on their personal and day-to-day using patterns of commodities and daily needs. (b.) This databank should also comprise of real-time information of government, specialized & open markets for agriculture produce, information of government data & schemes, services related to finance, health, insurance, education, etc which is currently not prevalent in the existing setup. Rural communities are crucial stakeholders who update the data bank with local information.

Linkages with corporate sectors for rural market promotion & expansion

Based on the rural databank and services required by rural women & communities, linkages can be made with corporate sectors and other organization for necessary services like healthcare, insurance, agriculture, information & communication & other technology based requirements. **Development of communication channels, virtual communities & social networks**

- Formation of different groups of women & rural communities according to their trade, locality, areas, etc. Groups can share and ask their required information on various platforms like communication channels, virtual community, social networks etc. Development of information platforms which continuously sends updated information on daily prices of agriculture products and commodities, news & event information, etc through various mediums like SMS, emails, radio programs to the defined group of farmers, home based workers, traders etc.
- Voice based web applications should also be developed enabling rural women & communities to share and ask for their required information through local and mobile phones

One point clearing centre for all Information & Communication related requirements

- Centre equipped with databank and connectivity should preferably act as 'one point clearing centre'
- Centre to provide all requisite information like Government data & schemes, employment, education, weather, agriculture etc.
- Centre can also act as a platform to ensure communication with respective Government departments and help rural women & communities to obtain benefits from existing information and schemes as appropriate.





3.17.8 Project Evaluation Matrix

EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks						
RELEVANCE													
Needs of the beneficiary captured							 Need assessment carried out through village meetings and Orientation Workshops held by SEWA. ICT based skill training imparted through CLC's have been identified based on broad assessment of demand for a particular computer skill. 						
Relevant to needs & expectations of beneficiary							 The curriculum for training modules related to Mobile Repairing, Tally software, Web designing, Hardware, Screen printing, languages have been designed on basis of assessment of the ICT skills in demand. The relevance of the training courses can be gauged from the fact that based on these trainings, 77 (42% of the total trainees) have got direct employment and 18 (10% of the total trainees) participants have started their own microenterprises and earning about Rs. 2500-5000 a month. Increasing number of women participation justifies the relevance of the project. 						
Relevant to development priorities of Govt. of India							• The project strives to empower women through ICT training to facilitate livelihood generation, which aligns to the Gol's current operational development programme for upliftment of women.						
Relevant to development priorities of concerned State Government							• The current developmental priority area of Gujarat Govt. partly focuses on upliftment of women and ensuring self-sustainable models for the women. This project was an attempt in that direction						
Identified problem has high incidence in area of focus							 ICT training to women provides ample of job opportunities in areas like data entry, Govt. office accountants, etc. Substantial number of individuals of the targeted vulnerable group (rural women) are affected 						
Correct & accurate identification of target stakeholders and/or correctly defined vulnerable groups							• Rural women (such as artisans, agri workers, embroidery workers, etc) were identified as the target group for imparting ICT training.						
Adequacy of Government commitment to project							• Local Panchayat members/ district administration was involved for the purpose of identification of ICT skills in demand and providing employment to ICT trained workers.						



Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks					
Project relevance to ICT4D focus under the project							• Adequate ICT infrastructure (i.e. trainers, hardware & software) is essential in CLCs for imparting ICT training to rural people.					
EFFECTIVENESS												
Problem been stated correctly and distinctly							 Problems have been clearly identified, defined, and proper process documentation is carried out. Informal validation of identified problems through various community members. 					
Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries, users of the project are identified as stakeholders of the project							 Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries and users have been identified as stakeholders Roles and responsibilities of all stakeholders have been provided but lack clear detailing to fix accountability. 					
The assumptions, objectives, outputs and outcomes have been clearly articulated in measurable terms							The objectives have been clearly defined and linked to outputs and outcomes identified.However, Subjective measurement terms is being used					
The linkages between objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was clear							• Logical linkages have been planned and implemented but not documented					
The project design allowed for flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment.							 Project design capable of adapting to changes articulated through evolving trends. For example - ICT training courses/ course curriculum can be amended based on new development in IT technology, etc Vocational training courses such as mobile repairing, digital journalism, photography, etc. were introduced to meet market demand and enhance the livelihood generation potential of women and underprivileged classes. 					
Degree of support given by the Government towards integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme and other related projects							• No major supported has been extended by the local Govt. during the course of the project.					
Planning component of the project take into account the use of ICT for improved governance / service delivery in various areas through pilot initiatives, encouraging BPR, development local solutions and applications and encouragement of PPP							 ICT training courses were identified based on IT skill requirement of local demand. BPR- CLCs are equipped with peripherals like video camera, speakers, etc. to enable video conferencing to disseminate information related to health, agriculture, skin issues to the identified group 					





Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	SATISFACTORY	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
model							 Majic Jack has been introduced recently to enable international outstation calls at affordable prices. Train the Trainer Model has been implemented to ensure widespread dissemination of knowledge. PPP Idea - Provides specially designed SIM Cards for Pocket PCO application. Motorola - Provides low cost mobile phones at a concessional rate which support the above mentioned SIM cards to enable implementation of Pocket PCO. (with Idea and Motorola) to provide Pocket PCO services to rural women Microsoft Corporation: Partners ICT training courses and certification agency (Microsoft Unlimited Potential Course Certification)
The adequacy of institutional arrangements in attaining the long-term objective of the project. Also the infrastructural, logistical, and financial implication of sustaining the project objectives beyond the project duration/after completion of UNDP funding.		•					 A centralized ICT Cell at the main office of SEWA in Ahmadabad is established to provide ICT related support to CLCs. 'Train the Trainer Model' of training ensured that adequate number of trained personnel would be available in CLCs for imparting further trainings. Financial sustainability of this project, several avenues of revenue generation have been identified such as fee for training course, etc Assets created are properly kept
Project's linkages, liaison, coordination and impact upon related activities under NeGP being implemented in the country.							• No major contribution towards achievement of NeGP objectives
The project's assistance, relationship, relevance to and coordination with the pre- existing Project management system and staff							 SEWA's existing network is utilized for project implementation. Further, a centralized ICT Cell at the main office of SEWA in Ahmadabad is established to provide ICT related support to CLCs.
Clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various institutional arrangements for overall programme management and implementation and the level of coordination between relevant players							 Roles and responsibilities of all of the stakeholders were defined clearly Management processes have been clearly laid down for proper coordination between the players such as CLC's, SSVK's and SEWA. SEWA's central team plays a role of facilitator and provides constant guidance and support in functioning of CLC.
Risk assessment and management of the project							 The potential risks attached to the project have been clearly identified. Mitigation strategies for identified risk have been laid down The risk management and mitigation plan was substantially adhered



Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Efforts of stakeholders in support of the implementation of the project							 The project proposal submitted to UNDP was documented in coordination with most of the stakeholders but complete buy-in of these stakeholders was not taken Most of the stakeholders have extended support as envisaged from them during the proposal stage.
Extent of conflict of interest either between stakeholders involved in the project or with outside agencies.							• No conflict of interest has been witnessed
					EFFIC	IENCY	
Was a formal workplan made at the start of the project to determine the timeframe in which activities would be performed							 Detailed workplan prepared for all important activities has been detailed. Month wise timelines defined for each activity
Were resources made available to the project implementation agencies in accordance with the requirements of the work plan							 The resource placement is adequate as per the requirement. None of the key resources, only a few of the support staff replaced. However the replacements had similar qualification and experience as proposed ones
Extent of deviation in the project implementation in so far as timelines is concerned.							• Project implementation delayed by less than 5% of overall duration. The delay is primarily due to difficulties faced in establishment of CLC in Bihar.
Responsiveness of the project management to such deviations and flexibility to deploy resources							 SEWA has achieved commendable accomplishments in a short duration. Management taking some steps in terms of extra resources (time and effort) to somehow correct the course of implementation and ensure effectiveness and efficiency of the project.
Were any systems, processes, manuals etc made to govern the activities in the project among the different stakeholders							• Vaguely written instructions available to govern the project activities.
Extent to which Results Based Management has been used							 Results are being measured by specially designed Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E) by SEWA which is used at every stage of implementation of project activities. 184 women as against the target of 160 women were trained during the course of the project





		F	PROJEC	T-WISE	FINDIN	IGS	
EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Whether there was adequacy of steps taken to resolve any conflict of interest in or due to the project							• No major conflict of interest originated from project implementation
				RES	SULTS	/IMPA0	CTS
Whether the project has produced its desired immediate outputs							 Successful training has been imparted to 184 rural women as master trainers on identified subjects. Establishment of CLC at Jhanjharpur, Madhubani, Bihar in association with respective local organizations. There has been delay in getting requisite approvals for procurement of license from the concerned Government department for setting up community radio station in the identified ICT Schools.
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, use of the new outputs as against the traditional options)							 ICT training has been provided to 184 women. Based on these trainings, 77 (42% of the total trainees) have got direct employment and 18 (10% of the total trainees) participants have started their own microenterprises and earning about Rs. 2500-5000 a month. Innovations like - Pocket PCO, Majic Card, etc. trends were widely accepted by the community members.
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, percentage of the target population)							• A large number of rural communities have been enrolled for various ICT training courses. There has been overwhelming response to various ICT training courses imparted from CLCs by both SEWA member and non-members
Extent of drop-outs from usage of the outputs by the intended beneficiaries							• No/ Marginal drop-out of students enrolled for ICT training courses.
Are there any unforeseen/ unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups							 No unintended adverse effect caused on the target groups Besides providing training to rural women for livelihood generation, the project leads to wide-spread dissemination of ICT knowledge and awareness among rural population. The project attracted participants from the non-target group which promoted the existing developmental efforts in the state / region.
Extent of the project results on the target beneficiaries in terms of (a) Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, (b) Capacity Building, (c) Change Management, (d) Business Process							 Excellence has been achieved in following areas relevant to the project: Citizen-centric service delivery: (a.) Established CLC in Bihar and (b.) Computer library in certain CLC's have been deployed Capacity building and bridging the digital divide: (a.) IT training to 184



Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Re-engineering, (f) Public Private Partnership, (g) Bridging the Digital Divide, and (h) Knowledge and Experience Sharing							 women using 'Train the Trainer' model (b.) Innovative solutions like - Pocket PCO and Majic Jack was introduced, (c.) Provision for skilled training on ICT and vocational trainings, and (d.) Group of 16 semiliterate rural women trained to generate content in context of local community. PPP: tie-up with (a.) Idea to provide specially designed SIM Cards for Pocket PCO's (b.) Motorola to provide low cost mobile handsets to run Idea SIM Cards and (c.) Microsoft Corporation tie up for Microsoft certification. Knowledge and experience sharing: (a.) Regular computer training programmes organized at CLC's and (b.) Organized five computer melas in 5 district of Gujarat.
Extent of the project impact on the target groups in terms of (a) governance (improved efficiency, transparency and accountability), (b) citizen-centric service delivery (advantages of cost, time and convenience), (c) rural livelihoods (number of jobs, extent and sufficiency of employment), and (d) women's empowerment (increased knowledge, and use of the same to voice their concerns).		•					Excellence has been achieved in significant number of cases in following relevant areas: • Citizen centric service delivery • Women empowerment • Rural livelihood
Extent of significance of the project impact on the development of the region/country							 Indicators for development were defined during project conceptualization stage Word was spread across the region and volunteers from non-targeted areas also coming forward and expressing interest in using the benefits of the project.
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by marginalized communities							 A large number of rural people (both SEWA members as well as non-members) are visiting CLC for various purposes such as Attend various skill development courses (IT, mobile repairing, etc) Attend video conferencing session of their interest and discussed issues with the faculties such as health issues are discussed with health experts, etc
Extent to which capacities have been built in stakeholders during the project							 Capacities of the main stakeholders i.e. SEWA staff and CLC members have been built up to at least perform the necessary operational and maintenance activities assigned to them. Regular capacity building exercise is undertaken by SEWA to ensure effectiveness of initiatives undertaken.





Evaluation matrix	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks					
SUSTAINABILITY												
Extent of ownership of stakeholders in the project							• Complete ownership of all the 'implementing and operating' stakeholders in the project including SEWA, SSVK's staff, CLC members, rural women, Microsoft Corporation, Idea Cellular, etc.					
Degree of support given by the Government in integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme							• Since the project objectives and goals not aligned with any specific Government programme no major support extended by the government.					
Extent of availability of inputs/resources required for the project (people, finances, infrastructure, equipments)							• Resources in all the four area - people, finances, infrastructure, equipments were mostly available during the course of the project					
Have any revenue streams been defined in the project to make it self-sustaining							• Revenue stream has been defined in details (including membership fees from the women, computer training course fees, and applications such as service to identify eligible schemes, printing, exam results, etc. However not all the possible areas have been captured properly and this may affect the sustainability in long-term post expiry of the funding from UNDP.					
Extent of success of such pre-defined revenue streams							• Substantial revenue id being generated from imparted various services from the CLC. However the data is not readily available					
Extent to which inventory of the assets created out of the grants received in the project have been properly maintained and transferred to the beneficiaries							• Assets received under the project such as Operating Systems, Wide lens cameras, printers, servers, internet modems, softwares, etc. have been maintained well and the CLC staff has been trained adequately to use and maintain these assets.					
Degree of collaboration that has developed among stakeholders during the project							 Stakeholder management plan is well defined and has complete adherence during project execution. Stakeholders including CLC staff, rural women, community members and operational partners such as Microsoft Corporations, Idea Cellular, etc., were involved continuously during operational and strategic decision making 					
Extent to which government is willing to finance the project after its completion of the UNDP funding							No funding committed by the Government					

Table 112 Project Evaluation Matrix- SEWA



3.18 Real Time Provisioning of Fishing Zone Information

	Table 113 Introduction- Real Time Provisioning of Fishing Zone Information							
Project Title	Real Time Provisioning of Fishing Zone (PFZ) Information							
Proponent Organisation	Indian National Centre for Ocean Information Services (INCOIS), Ministry of Earth Sciences (MoES), Govt. of India, Hyderabad							
Implementation State	Gujarat							
Target Site for Pilot Project	Gujarat; Covering 5 Major Fishery Villages in Kutch district viz. Jakhau Port, Nana Laija, Mundra Port , Bhadreshwar & Kandla Port							
Theme of Project	Livelihood/ Early Warning							
Target Population	Fishermen and other coastal community living along the above 5 coastal villages of Kutch District, Gujarat							
Project Cost	Rs.40,00,000							
Funding Required for Project	Rs.40,00,000							
Time Required to Implement Project	30 Weeks							
Name(s) of Partner Agencies	Bharat Electronics Limited (BEL), National Institute of Smart Government (NISG), Kutch Nav Nirman Abhiyan							



IMPACT OF THE PROJECT-IN BRIEF

The project is aligned with and draws sustenance from currently operational development programme of Govt. of India. The project lies under the scope of The Ministry of Earth Sciences formulated programme to provide the fishing community with credible advisories on Potential Fishing Zones (PFZ) which forms part of the "Common Minimum Programme (CMP)" of the Government of India. The project is designed in a way to serve the coastal population through the use of ICT and its focus is mainly on the population living in the coastal areas

(OBJECTIVE AREAS	OUTPUTS	OUTCOMES
•	 Serve the coastal population through the ICT facilities Provide credible information on the Ocean Resources and Ocean State 	 Electronic Display Boards are installed and fully operation in 5 Major Fishery Villages in Kutch district viz. Jakhau Port, Nana Laija, Mundra Port, Bhadreshwar & Kandla Port. 	 Reduction in searching time for the shoals will be reduced tremendously due to the usage of the PFZ information which is being provided through the EDB's Fishing operations now yield high Catch Per Unit Effort (CPUE) and net profit compared to their normal fishing operations based on their traditional knowledge Fishermen are benefitted by a safe navigation back to their home through the Ocean State information
•	 Alert and suggest the coastal community in occurrence of any Disasters like Tsunami's, etc 	• Operationalization of Early Warning Alert System	• The entire coastal community living in and around the village can be alerted about the occurrence of disaster events like Tsunami's by activating the Siren system that is audible up to 2 kms diameter range and subsequently ad-hoc and the audio messages will be provided for further course of actions during the event.





3.18.1 Project Background

About INCOIS - The Proponent Organization

The Indian National Centre for Ocean Information Services (INCOIS) is an autonomous body under the Ministry of Earth Sciences (MoES), Government of India, registered as a Society under the Andhra Pradesh (Telangana Area) Public Societies Registration Act 1350, Fasli at Hyderabad on February 3, 1999. The affairs of the Society are managed, administered, directed and controlled, subject to the Bye laws of the Society, by the Governing Council.

The mission of INCOIS is to provide ocean data, information and advisory services to society, industry, government and scientific community through sustained ocean observations, and constant improvements through systematic and focused research in information management and ocean modeling. INCOIS acts as a nodal agency in India for providing the real-time information on Potential Fishing Zones (PFZ), Ocean State Forecast, and Early Warning information for Tsunami's



INCOIS, in its pursuit for organisational excellence, national relevance and international significance, translates the scientific knowledge into useful products and services through synergy and knowledge networking with centres of excellence in ocean

sciences, atmospheric sciences, space applications and information and communication technology.

With the judicious mix and match of Information and Communication Technologies, it has been planned to provide an effective and affordable solution to millions fishermen by providing real-time information on effective way of fishing and for safe navigation.

Issues Faced -

The fisheries sector has been recognized as a powerful income and employment generator as it stimulates growth for number of subsidiary industries and serves as a source of cheap and nutritious food, at the same time it is an instrument of livelihood for a large section of economically backward population of the country. More than 6 million fishermen and women in the country depend on fisheries and aquaculture for their livelihood.

The ocean is very dynamic in its nature and the fishing activity in the marine environment is a challenging task as the fish shoals keep dwindling and move further offshore. Effective fishing can only be carried out when a precise and timely forecast is available on location of the fish shoals. The various problems being faced by fishermen community includes -

- a) Delay in information focused on fishery advisories and other ocean state related information. This information is unable to reach the end users in time because of the traditional modes of communication viz. telephone, fax, etc.
- b) The fishermen community having very less literacy or no literacy are unable to interpret the available data resources.
- c) India with its Unity in diversity has several coastal languages, thus one common language does not penetrate deep amongst

the locals due to which they are not able to understand any information being provided to them.

Taking into consideration the above mentioned issues i.e. nonavailability of real-time data which is understandable in local languages, a novel concept of Electronic Display Boards (EDBs) has been designed and developed which were installed at the fishing villages under the project coverage areas. These boards provide the real-time information on locations of the fish aggregations / fish schools, ocean state and tsunami early warnings in their local language.

Project Description -Electronic Display Boards

INCOIS was the implementing agency of the project. INCOIS has framed the concept of the system and provided the necessary requirement input to BEL for designing of the system. INCOIS was responsible for development of prototype EDB system and testing of this system. In addition to this, INCOIS also provides real-time satellite images to the community

including the daily cloud cover images and various other ocean related information. EDB have been installed at near coastal areas and various Ocean related information is being displayed on these EDB using satellite communication. The present pilot project has mainly concentrated on the five major fishery villages in the kuchchh district. viz. Jakhau Port, Nana Laija, Mundra Port, Bhadreshwar and Kandla Port targeting mainly the fishermen community and other coastal living population.



3.18.2 Project Strategic Objectives

The overall object was to serve the coastal population through the use of ICT. The focus of the project was mainly on the population who lives in the coastal areas. The key objectives of the project include:

- Serve the coastal population through the ICT facilities
- Provide credible information on the Ocean Resources and Ocean State
 - Potential Fishing Zone (PFZ) Advisories
 - Ocean State Forecast (OSF) Forecast on Winds and Waves
 - o Other Ocean related and Fisheries Information
- Alert and suggest the coastal community in occurrence of any Disasters like Tsunami's, etc.
 - Tsunami Advisories / Watch / Warnings
 - Voice Messages
 - Siren system

3.18.3 Project Relevance Inputs

Identification of Information and Services Needs

In the first phase of the project, assessment of needs and interests of the community has been undertaken.

KNNA has carried out the survey to know the needs of the community in consultation with the local fishery associations and based on which sites have been selected for installation of the Electronic Display Boards (EDBs) on pilot basis. The locations of the sites are Jakhau, Nana Laija, Mundra Port, Bhadreshwar and Kandla Port.



3.18.4 Project Effectiveness Inputs

Project Stakeholders and Envisaged Roles

Table 115 brings out the different stakeholders involved and the roles they played.

Risks and Mitigation Strategies

Risks

The two major risks faced by the project are provided below:

- Non-availability of AC power supply to the electronic display boards
- Non-utilization of the EDBs

Mitigation Strategies

• In order to overcome the situation of unavailability of power, an uninterrupted power supply with a capacity of 2KVA with Intelligent Power Management System has been provided to the board to serve the board for 2 hours (except LCD Panel), in case of power failure locally. If the installation location is remote with no AC power supply available, technical feasibility for integrating the system with the solar panels was carried out and the system was designed accordingly.

• The mitigation for non utilization of EDB is to create awareness among the community on the necessity of keeping up the Board continuously and on utilization of the information being provided through the board. A preliminary awareness was initiated to the community during the inauguration of the Electronic Display Board in Bhadreshwar. More awareness campaigns / workshops need to be organized immediately as the fishing season has just started and the requisite information can be largely beneficial to the fishermen.

3.18.5 Project Efficiency Inputs

Activities Performed in different Dimensions of Intervention Table 116 provides activities performed in different dimensions of interventions:

Table 115 Project Stakeholders and their Roles

Stakeholder	Role(s) Played
Kutch Nav Nirman Abhiyan (KNNA)	Played the role of local coordinator of the project. Carried out the local field survey to derive the needs of the community in consultation with the local fishery associations and based on their feedback the sites have been strategically selected for installation of the Electronic Display Boards (EDBs).
Indian National Centre for Ocean Information Services (INCOIS)	Implementing Agency of the project. INCOIS has framed the concept of the system and provided the necessary requirements input to BEL for designing of the system. INCOIS has funded initially to develop a prototype EDB System and tested the system as per the requirements. INCOIS is the only nodal agency in India for providing the real-time information on Potential Fishing Zones (PFZ), Ocean State Forecast, and Early Warning information for Tsunami's. In addition to this, INCOIS also provides real-time satellite images to the community including the daily cloud cover images and various other ocean related information free of cost to the end users through these Electronic Display Boards.
Bharat Electronics Limited (BEL)	Partnered Agency with INCOIS for procurement and integration of all the components and to bring out a rugged, marine graded EDB system. Bulk producing of the entire EDB System is also entrusted to BEL which includes both Hardware and Software components.
Fishermen and other coastal community	End user of the information displayed on EDBs

Bridging the Digital DivideEDBs have been designed in such a way that the end user doesn't require the knowledge of ICT facilities. The EDB helps seamlessly all the coastal community irrespective of their literacy level. Also these boards are designed to cater multi-lingual support and hence the user community can easily understand the information being provided through the boards.Citizen-Centric Service DeliveryAll the services that are provided by INCOIS are for the coastal community, especially fishermen community and for their better livelihood.Public Private PartnershipINCOIS being the autonomous organization under Ministry of Earth Sciences, Government of India has partnered with Government agencies (M/s. Bharat Electronics Limited) and NGO Organization (Kutch Nav Nirman Abhiyan) for this project. The local fishermen associations, port authorities and fishery department are also involved in the project.Capacity BuildingA short-term training has been provided to the staff of KNNA during the period 16/03/2009 to 18/03/2009 on operations of the EDB system and the web-based server application. Also a user name and password has been provided to KNNA for accessing server application over internet and to upload the content to the board and also explained the facilities that are available in the software. An inaugural programme had been arranged by KNNA during which the Joint Secretary, DoIT inaugurated the display board at Bhadreswar. Representative from INCOIS participated and explained the utilization and benefits of Electronic Display Boards. However due to the closure of the fishing season, more awareness campaigns are not conducted and the same are planned during the present fishing season.Change ManagementThe Technical and Financial Evaluation (TFE) committee, constituted by Director, INCOIS has evaluated the tec
Citizen-Centric Service DeliveryAll the services that are provided by INCOIS are for the coastal community, especially fishermen community and for their better livelihood.Public Private PartnershipINCOIS being the autonomous organization under Ministry of Earth Sciences, Government of India has partnered with Government agencies (M/s. Bharat Electronics Limited) and NGO Organization (Kutch Nav Nirman Abhiyan) for this project. The local fishermen associations, port authorities and fishery department are also involved in the project.Capacity BuildingA short-term training has been provided to the staff of KNNA during the period 16/03/2009 to 18/03/2009 on operations of the EDB system and the web-based server application. Also a user name and password has been provided to KNNA for accessing server application over internet and to upload the content to the board and also explained the facilities that are available in the software. An inaugural programme had been arranged by KNNA during which the Joint Secretary, DoIT inaugurated the display board at Bhadreswar. Representative from INCOIS participated and explained the utilization and benefits of Electronic Display Boards. However due to the closure of the fishing season, more awareness campaigns are not conducted and the same are planned during the present fishing season.The Technical and Financial Evaluation (TFE) committee, constituted by Director, INCOIS has evaluated the technical approach of the proposals and finalized the present design. However no specific change management processes are involved, as the EDB system designed and developed is itself a product that is ready for installation. Any changes in the product will be evaluated by the TFE Committee or further recommendations.
Public Private PartnershipINCOIS being the autonomous organization under Ministry of Earth Sciences, Government of India has partnered with Government agencies (M/s. Bharat Electronics Limited) and NGO Organization (Kutch Nav Nirman Abhiyan) for this project. The local fishermen associations, port authorities and fishery department are also involved in the project.Capacity BuildingA short-term training has been provided to the staff of KNNA during the period 16/03/2009 to 18/03/2009 on operations of the EDB system and the web-based server application. Also a user name and password has been provided to KNNA for accessing server application over internet and to upload the content to the board and also explained the facilities that are available in the software. An inaugural programme had been arranged by KNNA during which the Joint Secretary, DoIT inaugurated the display board at Bhadreswar. Representative from INCOIS participated and explained the utilization and benefits of Electronic Display Boards. However due to the closure of the fishing season, more awareness campaigns are not conducted and the same are planned during the present fishing season.Change ManagementThe Technical and Financial Evaluation (TFE) committee, constituted by Director, INCOIS has evaluated the technical approach of the proposals and finalized the present design. However no specific change management processes are involved, as the EDB system designed and developed is itself a product that is ready for installation. Any changes in the product will be evaluated by the TFE Committee for further recommendations.
Capacity BuildingA short-term training has been provided to the staff of KNNA during the period 16/03/2009 to 18/03/2009 on operations of the EDB system and the web-based server application. Also a user name and password has been provided to KNNA for accessing server application over internet and to upload the content to the board and also explained the facilities that are available in the software. An inaugural programme had been arranged by KNNA during which the Joint Secretary, DoIT inaugurated the display board at Bhadreswar. Representative from INCOIS participated and explained the utilization and benefits of Electronic Display Boards. However due to the closure of the fishing season, more awareness campaigns are not conducted and the same are planned during the present fishing season.Change ManagementThe Technical and Financial Evaluation (TFE) committee, constituted by Director, INCOIS has evaluated the technical approach of the proposals and finalized the present design. However no specific change management processes are involved, as the EDB system designed and developed is itself a product that is ready for installation. Any changes in the product will be evaluated by the TFE Committee for further recommendations.
Change Management The Technical and Financial Evaluation (TFE) committee, constituted by Director, INCOIS has evaluated the technical approach of the proposals and finalized the present design. However no specific change management processes are involved, as the EDB system designed and developed is itself a product that is ready for installation. Any changes in the product will be evaluated by the TFE Committee for further recommendations.
Business Process ReengineeringInformation which was earlier either not available or available through telephone/ fax after considerable lapse of time can now be provided on a real time basis. Siren instead of verbal/ written messages for tsunami warning could be very effective for fisherman community who are mostly illiterate
Knowledge/Experience Sharing The knowledge and experience has been shared with various institutes/ communities
Others NA Table 116 There will Activities





Project Management Approach

The project identifies INCOIS as the implementing agency, KNNA as the local coordinator and NISG as the project developing, monitoring and assessing agency.

Project management was being carried out by INCOIS in collaboration with NISG. However, KNNA managed the activities at the field level.

In case of any changes to be incorporated or to be developed to the existing system, Technical and Financial Evaluation Committee (TFE) constituted by Director, INCOIS evaluated the technical feasibility and then recommends accordingly.

The financial management has been carried out by INCOIS as per its auditing rules and regulations.

The project period has been planned for 30 weeks from date of sanction of the project. INCOIS, KNNA and NISG jointly formulated an activity plan along with the time lines. INCOIS completed the design, development, supply, installation and commissioning of the product i.e. EDB within the time frame.

Extent of Usage of Local Expertise

There has been a blend of local insights with expertise formulating the technology platform. Based on the information requirement of fishermen and other coastal community, the entire system has been developed with the help of the Private and Government organizations in the country & the entire technology has been procured locally from the country itself. The information that is being provided through these EDBs has been completely developed with the expertise of scientists at INCOIS.



Management Processes Followed during the Project

The project periodically conducts the following processes:

- Stakeholders meetings;
- Preparation of RBM based LFA;
- Preparation of work plan;
- Time schedules for various project activities;
- Allocation of human resources;
- Monitoring and reporting;
- Preparation of quarterly report;
- Preparation of training plan;
- Internal evaluation;

Extent of Usage of RBM and Performance Indicators

INCOIS has been monitoring the project activities and performance, especially during the phase of development of the product i.e. Electronic Display Board. Solution Requirement Specifications (SRS)



document has been made and project blueprint is designed as per the specifications mentioned in the SRS document, also a prototype board was developed initially as per the SRS Document.

Acceptance Test Procedures (ATP) was prepared and was adopted in checking each and every hardware component of the board, software modules and their functionalities with respect to SRS document.

The demonstration of the functionalities of prototype board in verified and approved. However, INCOIS suggested few modifications in the software modules which were incorporated and installed in the Central server at INCOIS.

Further in order to ensure timely execution of the project, INCOIS, KNNA and NISG formulated an action plan during their visit to INCOIS and made time lines for each detailed activity of the project.

In addition to meeting the timelines and actions formulated in the meeting, quarterly progress reports were prepared and submitted to NISG. NISG has been actively involved in monitoring the project. NISG was invited during the prototype demonstration of the project and also arranged for the project assessment by external agencies.

3.18.6 Project Results/Impacts Generated

The key project results are as follow:

• Successful Setup & Operationalization of 5 EDBs: EDB are installed and fully operation in 5 Major Fishery Villages in Kutch district viz. Jakhau Port, Nana Laija, Mundra Port, Bhadreshwar & Kandla Port. The EDB Systems are very helpful to the fishermen community in getting near real-time information on the locations of fish aggregation zones, wave and wind status in the ocean from shore-20 kms, 20-50 kms and 50-100kms. In addition to this, the fishermen can get any other relevant information on the weather, fish market prices, etc.

• Operationalization of Early Warning Alert System: The entire coastal community living in and around the village can be alerted about the occurrence of disaster events like Tsunami's by activating the Siren system that is audible up to 2 kms diameter range and subsequently ad-hoc and the audio messages will be provided for further course of actions during the event.

Factors Facilitating/Impeding the Production of Outputs

The key factors impeding the production of desired output include:

- Lack of awareness among fishermen community
- High rate of illiteracy among coastal community
- Irregular updation of information on EDBs
- Display of Statistical information instead of interpreted messages leading to difficulty in understanding
- Considerable distance between fishing area and location of EDBs

However, wide-spread acceptance of KNNA and its network organisations facilitated awareness creation of the project among coastal communities.

Extent of Operationalization of the Project Recommendations Operationalization of the Project

The project has been planned and executed in four phases as per the assessed requirement

• Phase I - First phase was initiated with the basic assessment of needs and interests of the community. KNNA has carried out the survey to extract the needs of the community in consultation with the local fishery associations and based on which sites have been selected for installation of the Electronic Display Boards (EDBs) on pilot basis. The locations of the sites are Jakhau, Nana Laija, Mundra Port, Bhadreshwar and Kandla Port.



- Phase II The second phase involved activities related to the conduct of pre-installation site surveys. INCOIS has conducted the survey with its partners M/s. Bharat Electronics Limited (BEL) for assessing the feasibility of the site for installation of the boards in terms of the availability of power, communication signal strength, security, community population, etc.
- Phase III- The third phase involved the procurement of Hardware & Software required for the system. INCOIS adopted the government rules and regulations for the procurement of the equipments, as open tender process with 2 part bid system were floated. Technical and Financial Evaluation (TFE) committee was constituted of experts for evaluation of the bids. After evaluation of bids, the tender is awarded to the lowest bidder who has technically qualified. Thus, all the components of the system were procured and integrated at BEL and designed keeping in mind the weather proof and temper proof enclosure. The system

basically consists of Display (LCD & LED Panels), Communication equipment (Worldspace & GPRS), Single Board Computer and other equipments. The power backup facility was made available to the system with 2KVA UPS system and also used for back up to the system (excluding the LCD Panel) during power failure. In addition to the above, **Siren system and World space Antenna** have been installed at the roof of the site locations. The siren is activated only in case of emergency arising due to disaster events and the alarm is audible up to 2 kms diameter.

• Phase IV - Fourth phase involved installation, testing and operationalisation of the system. A web-based application has been developed for updating the EDB System remotely from INCOIS or from anywhere with the access to internet. Test data on Potential Fishing Zones (PFZ), Ocean State Forecast (OSF) along with their corresponding satellite pictures and model output pictures are being transmitted regularly and the status of



Conceptual Diagram

Functional Block Diagram



351

the peripherals and data uploaded time are being monitored. After the successful testing of the systems all the EDBs are made fully operational.

EDB are installed and fully operation in 5 Major Fishery Villages in Kutch district viz. Jakhau Port, Nana Laija, Mundra Port , Bhadreshwar & Kandla Port

Technical Architecture of the system

Figure 65 shows the conceptual architecture of the system. The functional block diagram of the system has been shown in the Figure 65 depicting the basic components used to develop the EDB System. The system mainly consists of a Central Server (CS) at INCOIS, EDBs at remote locations and communication equipments.

The PFZ, OSF information is displayed on the LCD panel along with any optional attached Pictures, audio messages and video messages. Multi-lingual text information is also displayed in the LED Panel.

LCD panel also displays Ad-hoc message, a type of special message to be conveyed to the community, during the transmission of which, the LCD screen stops current displaying images and shows the Ad-hoc message for a pre-defined scheduled time after which it resumes the previous data (text, images, etc.). Ticker message containing various basket of information is displayed in the bottom of the LCD Panel and in the LED Panel.

An Industrial Siren with audible range of 2 Kms diameter is also installed to provide alerts to the coastal population in case of any disaster event like Tsunami's.

Communication:

All the content created by the content creators is disseminated to the remote EDB through two modes of communication as shown in the Figure 65. The Satellite communication through WorldSpace satellites functions as primary mode and the HTTP communication through GPRS network as secondary mode of communication.

The content is then broadcasted to all EDBs through primary mode. The content designed for a particular EDB will be accepted by that particular EDB or group of EDBs through a unique identification number provided to the EDBs. The content received by the EDB will be acknowledged back to the CS through GPRS network. In case of failure of data reception, due to any technical reason, the EDB contacts the CS through GPRS network and pulls the data from the server. Also all the status of the peripherals is communicated to the Server periodically through GPRS network and the administrator can monitor them.

Effect of Outputs/Results on the Target Groups of the Project The key outcomes of the project include:

- The fishermen will get up-to-date information on the potential fishing grounds, ocean state and disaster information through the fastest mode
- The reduction in searching time for the shoals will be reduced tremendously due to the usage of the PFZ information which is being provided through EDB's
- The fishing operations will yield high Catch Per Unit Effort (CPUE) and net profit compared to their normal fishing operations based on their traditional knowledge
- The fishermen can have a safe navigation back to their home through the Ocean State information
- The fishermen can decide on venturing into the sea for fishing operations and can save their lives by knowing the up-to-date information on the occurrence of the disaster events and state of the ocean





Parameters	Before Project	After Project
ICT Awareness	Nil or Very Low	Substantially Increased
Information of potential fishing grounds	Non- Available	Available
Catch Per Unit Effort (CPUE) and net profit	Low	High
Early warning system about Tsumani	Non-existent	Siren is activated in case of emergency arising due to disaster events and the alarm is audible up to 2 kms diameter.

Table 117 - Pre & Post project parameter synopsis

Since the EDBs are recently installed and Oct-Nov 09 being the first fishing season after its installation, the outputs and outcomes of the projects needs to be further confirmed.

Further the studies conducted by INCOIS in Kerala State reveals the following

- On an average 50% reduction in search time indicates that annual savings on account of diesel consumption for
 - Mechanised vessels is about Rs.6.0 lakhs,
 - Motorised boats is Rs.1.95 lakhs and
 - Small Motorised boats is Rs. 1.65 lakhs.
- The increase in CPUE for vessels using PFZ advisories is about 3-4 times more than those vessels fishing in non-notified locations. The corresponding increase in income is about 4-5 times for



vessels fishing in notified fishing locations as compared to those fishing in non-notified location.

• The percentage success rate of PFZ advisories is about 95% for pelagic operations such as ring seining and gill netting and 85% for bottom trawling operations.

An overview of the impact of the project is provided in



Parameters	Before Project	After Project
ICT Awareness	Nil or Very Low	Substantially Increased
Information of potential fishing grounds	Non- Available	Available
Catch Per Unit Effort (CPUE) and net profit	Low	High
Early warning system about Tsumani	Non-existent	Siren is activated in case of emergency arising due to disaster events and the alarm is audible up to 2 kms diameter.
	т	able 447 Dec C Dect and is at a second to a second

Table 117 - Pre & Post project parameter synopsis

Unforeseen/Unintended Outputs Resultant from the Project

There has not been any major unforeseen/ unintended outputs resultant from the project.

3.18.7 Project Sustainability Considerations

For sustenance of the project, necessary mechanisms have been put in place. INCOIS has taken up the EDBs concept as part of its XI Plan programme of Potential Fishing Zone (PFZ) Mission project of INCOIS, which is recognized as "Common Minimum Programme (CMP)" of Govt. of India. As part of the XI Plan, INCOIS planned to install 200 such EDBs during its 5 year plan period. Also the number may increase further keeping in view of the overwhelming response and demand from the fishermen community.

Project Institutional Arrangements

INCOIS acted as the Implementing agency in partnership with M/s. BEL which is the facilitating agency for product development and installation. INCOIS has been responsible for regular updation of information on EBDs. KNNA played the role of intermediary by acting as local coordinators and interacting institute with the local fishermen community / end users.

The EDBs installed under the project have been made under a comprehensive maintenance for the next three years. After the project period these boards will be maintained and will be made operational by INCOIS in collaboration with the local stakeholders and with their support. The costs towards the period maintenance and operationalisation of these EDBs after project period will be borne by INCOIS only.

Extent of Commitment/Involvement/Ownership of Stakeholders

Indian National Centre for Ocean Information Services (INCOIS) has been the prime responsible agency for complete development of the product, installation and maintenance of EDBs for the next three years. Kutch Nav Nirman Abhiyan (KNNA) has played the role of creating awareness, motivating the fishermen to use the technology, educating them about the benefits and effective utilization of the services being provided through the boards. Also KNNA in collaboration with INCOIS will organize awareness campaigns towards the above.

National Institute for Smart Government (NISG) which was the overall coordinator of the project was responsible for monitoring and evaluating (technical and financial) the project. NISG directly



coordinates with KNNA and INCOIS for monitoring, evaluation and assessing the project progress and achievements.

Degree of Support Provided by the Government

The Government of India played a crucial role in functioning of the project as they provide periodic grants and deployed experts to ensure project effectiveness and efficiency. Government of Indian has formulated few projects as part of "Common Minimum Programmes" of Government of India and Research Projects. In fact 'Electronic Display Boards', a key component of the project, are generated as part of the above government initiated projects under the umbrella of Ministry of Earth Sciences (MoES).

Efforts to Replicate Project Results

With growing acceptance of the technology implemented as part of the project and the benefits attached with, the EDB's are widely being accepted by the fishermen. In addition to the 5 EDB systems commissioned under the present pilot project, INCOIS has also installed 40 EDB Systems all along the Indian coastline and Islands. Further, keeping in view the overwhelming response from the fishermen and other coastal communities, state governments, etc., INCOIS plans to install similar EDB Systems all along the Indian Coastline. INCOIS has initiated planning for installation of another 50 boards immediately. In this regard, INCOIS has already started the process of procurement of the boards.

Figure 67 Evaluating the Project- Real Time Provisioning of Fishing Zone (PFZ) Information

EVALUATING THE PROJECT

The project has been evaluated on five parameters viz. Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Results/Impacts and Sustainability which were further affirmed by subparameters illustrated in Table 118 that exhibits the evaluation in six categories of Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Moderately Satisfactory, Moderately Unsatisfactory, Unsatisfactory And Highly Unsatisfactory, accounting respectively for 6,5,4,3,2 and 1 points. The right most column substantiates the scores. The rating for each of the parameters was arrived at after averaging on the ratings for each of the sub-parameters. Similarly the overall evaluation rating were arrived at after averaging on the parameter ratings.



KEY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE NEXT STEPS

Regular Up-dation of Information - In order to carry out effective fishing, it is important to carry out precise and timely forecast on location of the fish shoals. The ocean state related information made available to the end user would meet its primary objective only if information is timely disseminated in EDBs. However, during our visit and interaction with fishermen community representatives, it was found that the information was not updated regularly which ultimately decreases the reliability of fishermen on such devices. Hence, it is recommended that there should be regular updation of data on the EDBs.

Customized Mobile Based Application Specially Designed for Fishermen - The routine activity of fishermen to carry out effective fishing requires them to sail in ocean for approx 8 days per trip. However, information from Electronic Display Boards (EDB's) entitles the fishermen to capture only current information. Hence, customized mobile based application with 'two-way communication platform' should be installed in the beneficiaries' mobile phone, which they will keep during navigation. Through mobile phone fishermen can get information about the location with maximum Catch Per Unit Effort (CPUE) and also update them with the latest happenings in ocean and would alert them on occurrence of disaster events.

Awareness Campaigns -More awareness campaigns / workshops should be organized immediately to increase the size of target group and ensure benefits delivered by INCOIS through EDB's are being utilized by maximum beneficiaries. Also, KNNA being local coordinator should ensure conduct periodic workshops in collaboration with INCOIS to facilitate knowledge sharing with the fishermen community.

Display of Interpreted Messages instead of Statistical Information - Currently only statistical information about direction of wind, ocean state, catchment area, etc are being displayed on EDBs. It is recommended that in addition to statistical figures, useful interpreted messages in local language should be displayed on the board for easy understanding of fishermen

Use of EDBs for Communication & Awareness Creation Campaign: Additional facilities for uploading various contents, i.e. images, small audio and play videos locally, etc, should be provided in EDBs so that the same LCD could be used for broadcasting informative audio/ visual clips.

Ease of Accessibility to EDB by Fishermen: In order to increase the footfall and number of beneficiaries benefiting out of EDB's, the EDB's should be installed at points cornering coastal areas with maximum population of fishermen community. The problem of electricity can be dealt with by initializing power management system by integrating the Solar Panels to ensure less power consumption and keep up with the environment friendly requirements and high bandwidth internet connection can be provided by the local service provider. Currently, these EDB's are beyond the reach of fishermen community who reside around the coastal areas and coupled with lack of transportation facility leads to inaccessibility on behalf of the fishermen, thus dissolving the benefits delivered by EDB.





3.18.8 Project Evaluation Matrix

							Table 118 Project Evaluation Matrix- INCOIS			
EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	SATISFACTORY	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks			
RELEVANCE										
Needs of the beneficiary captured		•					• The project was initiated with the basic assessment of needs and interests of the community. KNNA has carried out the survey to extract the needs of the community in consultation with the local fishery associations and based on which sites have been selected for installation of the Electronic Display Boards (EDBs) on pilot basis. The locations of the sites are Jakhau, Nana Laija, Mundra Port, Bhadreshwar and Kandla Port.			
Relevant to needs & expectations of beneficiary			•				 Services provided have been mapped on the basis of need assessment survey carried out by KNNA. The information flashed on the EDB's meet basic requirements of fisherman community such as identification of potential fishing zone, ocean state forecast and other ocean related information. It also provide information/warning about any disaster such as tsunami, etc However, the project design is not completely tailored to the needs & expectations of the beneficiaries primarily due to the following reasons: During sailing fisherman normally spend continuous 7-8 days in sea and they are unable to access any information displayed on the EDBs located at distant places by way of SMS messages, etc. Only static information is displayed on EDBs which may be difficult to understand by illiterate person. 			
Relevant to development priorities of Govt. of India							• The project is aligned with and draws sustenance from currently operational development programme of Govt. of India. The project lies under the scope of The Ministry of Earth Sciences formulated programme to provide the fishing community with credible advisories on Potential Fishing Zones (PFZ) which forms part of the "Common Minimum Programme (CMP)" of the Government of India.			
Relevant to development priorities of concerned State Government							• The project is closely aligned to the operational development programme of Govt. of Gujarat to provide incredible information to the fishery communities across villages.			
Identified problem has high incidence in area of focus							 More than 6 million fishermen and women in the country depend on fisheries and aquaculture for their livelihood. In Kutch district also, a substantial population living in coastal areas is totally dependent of fisheries for their livelihood. 			



EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks	
							• The problem of non availability of timely ocean related information not only lead to difficultly in identifying potential fishing zone but also jeopardize the safety of fishermen in sea.	
Correct & accurate identification of target stakeholders and/or correctly defined vulnerable groups							 Stakeholder segments includes vulnerable group of fishermen, saltpan workers, etc. All individuals in the target areas are eligible to viewing information displayed on EDBs. 	
Adequacy of Government commitment to project							 The Project formally included as part of Govt. of India initiative to provide the fishing community with credible advisories on Potential Fishing Zones (PFZ) which became part of the "Common Minimum Programme (CMP)". Indian National Centre for Ocean Information Services (INCOIS), an autonomous body under the Ministry of Earth Sciences (MoES), Government of India, acts as a nodal agency in India for providing the real-time information on Potential Fishing Zones (PFZ), Ocean State Forecast, and Early Warning information for Tsunami's The Govt. also provides periodic grants and deploys experts to ensure project effectiveness and efficiency 	
Project relevance to ICT4D focus under the project							 Usage of ICT is essential to expedite the dissemination of ocean related information to the coastal community. All the content created by the content creators is disseminated to the remote EDB through two modes of communication - (a.) The Satellite communication through WorldSpace satellites functions as primary mode and (b.) The HTTP communication through GPRS network as secondary mode of communication 	
EFFECTIVENESS								
Problem been stated correctly and distinctly							 Problems have been clearly identified, defined, and proper process documentation is carried out. Self validation of problems by ICOIS/ KNNA. 	
Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries, users of the project are identified as stakeholders of the project		•					 The following nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries and users have been identified as stakeholders: INCOIS- Implementing Agency of the project & has framed the concept of the system KNNA- Plays the role of local coordinator NISG-Project monitoring agency BEL- Bulk producing of the entire EDB System 	





EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							$_{\odot}$ Fishermen community-End user of information displayed on EDBs
The assumptions, objectives, outputs and outcomes have been clearly articulated in measurable terms							 The objectives and output of the project have been clearly defined. Project outcome such as reduction in searching time for shoals, etc are defined in qualitative terms However, subjective measurement terms are being devised and implemented.
The linkages between objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was clear							• Logical linkages have been planned and implemented but not documented
The project design allowed for flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment.							• Project design capable of modifying but only for certain not critical and small changes in the environment. May not be able to adopt for bigger changes due to the heavy technical and communication architecture attached to the project.
Degree of support given by the Government towards integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme and other related projects							• Project strongly aligned with national programme to provide the fishing community with credible advisories on Potential Fishing Zones (PFZ) which became part of the "Common Minimum Programme (CMP)" of the Government of India and Govt. has also agreed to provide periodic funding to the project.
Planning component of the project take into account the use of ICT for improved governance / service delivery in various areas through pilot initiatives, encouraging BPR, development local solutions and applications and encouragement of PPP model			•				 Improved Service Delivery- Ocean related information which was earlier either not available or available through telephone/ fax after considerable lapse of time can now be provided on a real time basis through EDBs BPR - Siren instead of verbal/ written messages for tsunami warning has been effective for fisherman community who are mostly illiterate Local solution- Localisation up to State level existed as information on EDBs is displayed in Gujarati language. However, since the fishermen community in Kutch coastal area normally understand Kucthi language, which is different from Gujarati, it is difficult for them to understand information displayed on the board.
The adequacy of institutional arrangements in attaining the long-term objective of the project. Also the infrastructural, logistical, and financial implication of sustaining the project objectives beyond the project duration/after completion of UNDP funding.							 Financial Sustenance: For sustenance of the project, necessary mechanisms have been put in place. INCOIS has taken up the EDBs concept as part of its XI Plan programme of Potential Fishing Zone (PFZ) Mission project of INCOIS, which is recognized as "Common Minimum Programme (CMP)" of Govt. of India. The costs towards the period maintenance and operationalisation of these EDBs after project period will be borne by INCOIS only.



EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	SATISFACTORY	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							 However, no revenue generating stream has been identified for the project Infrastructural Sustenance: The EDBs installed under the project have been made under a comprehensive maintenance for the next three years. After the project period these boards will be maintained and will be made operational by INCOIS in collaboration with the local stakeholders and with their support. Institutional Sustenance KNNA, a local NGO, would play the role of intermediary by acting as local coordinators INCOIS would provide the necessary technical and financial support to the project after the project period.
Project's linkages, liaison, coordination and impact upon related activities under NeGP being implemented in the country.							• Low contribution towards achievement of NeGP's objectives and does not utilize its components such as National and State MMPs.
The project's assistance, relationship, relevance to and coordination with the pre- existing Project management system and staff							 The existing structure of INCOIS is mostly used for project implementation Similarly, existing network of KNNA is tapped for local co-ordination.
Clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various institutional arrangements for overall programme management and implementation and the level of coordination between relevant players			•				 Roles and responsibilities of all of the stakeholders were defined INCOIS acts as the implementing agency; KNNA plays the role of intermediary by acting as local coordinators and contributes in awareness programmes, motivates the fishermen to use the technology, etc. and ensures proper coordination and robust management structure. NISG is the overall coordinator of the project and is responsible for monitoring and evaluating the project.
Risk assessment and management of the project							 Most of the potential risks attached to the project have been identified, which include Non-availability of AC power supply to the electronic display boards Non-utilization of the EDBs Risk mitigation strategies for the above identified risk have been laid down and adhered to.
Efforts of stakeholders in support of the implementation of the project							 The project proposal submitted to UNDP was documented in coordination with most of the stakeholders but complete buy-in of these stakeholders was not taken. Stakeholders have extended partial support as is apparent from low usage of




EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	UNSATISFACTORY	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							information displayed on EDBs
Extent of conflict of interest either between stakeholders involved in the project or with outside agencies.							• No initiatives are currently operational with the same individuals who have the same goals and objectives.
					EFFIC	IENCY	
Was a formal workplan made at the start of the project to determine the timeframe in which activities would be performed							Detailed workplan prepared for all important activities.Milestone based timelines have been defined.
Were resources made available to the project implementation agencies in accordance with the requirements of the work plan							• None of the key resources, only a few of the support staff may have been replaced. However the replacements had similar qualification and experience as proposed ones
Extent of deviation in the project implementation in so far as timelines is concerned.							• Project implementation delayed by less than 15% of overall duration
Responsiveness of the project management to such deviations and flexibility to deploy resources							• Management taking some steps in terms of extra resources (time and effort) to somehow correct the course of implementation
Were any systems, processes, manuals etc made to govern the activities in the project among the different stakeholders							 Roles of various stakeholders had been defined; however formal manuals to govern the activities in the activities in the project among stakeholder did not exist. System and procedure exists for regular transmission of data from ICOIS Hyderabad centre to various EDBs. However, it was observed that information displayed on EDBs is not regularly updated.
Extent to which Results Based Management has been used		•					 Thus, RBM is being continuously used at every defined stage of the project. INCOIS has been monitoring the project activities and performance, especially during the phase of development of the product i.e. Electronic Display Board. Solution Requirement Specifications (SRS) document has been made and project blueprint is designed as per the specifications mentioned in the SRS document. Also a prototype board was developed as per the SRS Document. Further, Acceptance Test Procedures (ATP) has been prepared and adopted in checking each and every hardware component of the board,



EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
							software modules and their functionalities with respect to SRS document. • To ensure timely execution of the project, INCOIS, KNNA and NISG formulated an action plan during their visit to INCOIS and made time lines for each detailed activity of the project. In addition to meeting the timelines and actions formulated in the meeting, quarterly progress reports were prepared and submitted to NISG. NISG has been actively involved in monitoring the project.
Whether there was adequacy of steps taken to resolve any conflict of interest in or due to the project							• There was no major conflict of interest.
				RES	SULTS	/IMPAC	CTS
Whether the project has produced its desired immediate outputs					•		 Currently, the information displayed on EDBs has not been widely used by fishermen community primarily due to the following reasons: Fishermen community is mostly illiterate to interpret the information provided on the boards Lack of awareness among fishermen community about the utility of information broadcasted on EDBs EDBs have been recently installed and it is the first fishing season since their installation. Acceptability of information displayed on EDBs will take some time.
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, use of the new outputs as against the traditional options)							• Most fishermen are still relying on traditional ways for identification of potential fishing areas, ocean forecast, etc.
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, percentage of the target population)							• Only few fishermen are utilizing the information displayed on EBD for planning their sailing schedule & place.
Extent of drop-outs from usage of the outputs by the intended beneficiaries							• Since this is the first fishing season since the installation of EBD, the extent of drop-outs could not be gauged.
Are there any unforeseen/ unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups							 No unintended effect caused on the target groups Very few unforeseen positive effects caused which promotes the existing developmental efforts in the state/region





EVALUATION MATRIX	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Extent of the project results on the target beneficiaries in terms of (a) Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, (b) Capacity Building, (c) Change Management, (d) Business Process Re-engineering, (f) Public Private Partnership, (g) Bridging the Digital Divide, and (h) Knowledge and Experience Sharing			•				 Excellence has been achieved in following areas relevant to the project: Citizen-centric service delivery: Information which was earlier either not available or available through telephone/ fax after considerable lapse of time can now be provided on a real time basis Bridging the digital divide: (a.) EDBs have been designed in such a way that the end user doesn't require the knowledge of ICT facilities. (b.) EDB's are designed to cater multi-lingual support and hence the user community can easily understand the information being provided through the boards Capacity Building - Short term training has been imparted to KNNA on operations of the EDB system and the web-based server application BPR -Siren instead of verbal/ written messages for tsunami warning could be very effective for fisherman community who are mostly illiterate
Extent of the project impact on the target groups in terms of (a) governance (improved efficiency, transparency and accountability), (b) citizen-centric service delivery (advantages of cost, time and convenience), (c) rural livelihoods (number of jobs, extent and sufficiency of employment), and (d) women's empowerment (increased knowledge, and use of the same to voice their concerns).			•				 Excellence has been achieved in significant number of cases in following relevant areas: Citizen centric service delivery - Real time availability of ocean related information Rural livelihood - The fishermen community has been benefited by means of increased profits from their fishing operations using modern ICT techniques and attract better prices for their output
Extent of significance of the project impact on the development of the region/country							 Indicators for development were defined during project conceptualization stage However, currently the impact of the project of target group is very limited as only a few fishermen are utilizing the information provided on EDBs
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by marginalized communities							• A few marginalized communities (i.e. fishermen group) have utilized the output once however again started using the traditional options
Extent to which capacities have been built in stakeholders during the project							• Short term training has been imparted to KNNA on operations of the EDB system and the web-based server application.
SUSTAINABILITY							
Extent of ownership of stakeholders in the project							• Ownership of all the 'implementing' stakeholders i.e. INCOIS in the project





EVALUATION MATRIX	Ηιghly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Μοderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory	Remarks
Degree of support given by the Government in integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme							 The project is the part of the "Common Minimum Programme (CMP)" of the Government of India. INCOIS, an autonomous body under the Ministry of Earth Sciences (MoES)-Government of India, would bear the maintenance and operational cost of EDP after the project period.
Extent of availability of inputs/resources required for the project (people, finances, infrastructure, equipments)							• Resources in all the four area - people, finances, infrastructure, equipments were mostly available during the duration of the project
Have any revenue streams been defined in the project to make it self-sustaining							 No revenue stream has been defined for making project self-sustainable. INCOIS would provide funding for operational and maintenance cost of the project after the project period.
Extent of success of such pre-defined revenue streams							• There is no defined revenue stream for the project
Extent to which inventory of the assets created out of the grants received in the project have been properly maintained and transferred to the beneficiaries							 Assets created are well maintained over a period of time The EDBs installed under the project have been made under a comprehensive maintenance for the next three years.
Degree of collaboration that has developed among stakeholders during the project							 Stakeholder management plan is well defined during conceptualization stage and have complete adherence during project execution. Stakeholders were generally involved during operational and strategic decision making.
Extent to which government is willing to finance the project after its completion of the UNDP funding							 INCOIS, an autonomous body under the Ministry of Earth Sciences (MoES)-Government of India, would bear the maintenance and operational cost of EDP after the project period. Further, as part of the XI Plan, INCOIS planned to install 200 such EDBs during its 5 year plan period.





4. Comparative Analysis of Findings

Table 119 and Figure 69 bring out a comparative ranking of the nineteen projects that have been evaluated in terms of the five broad parameters of Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Results/Impacts and Sustainability on a scale of 1 through 6.

Name of the Project	Efficiency	Effectiveness	Results/Impact	Relevance	Sustainability	Average Total Evaluation Score
i-CoSC	3.60	4.40	4.70	4.80	4.10	4.32
e-Krishi	4.86	4.36	4.90	5.25	4.38	4.75
DRISTI	4.29	3.86	4.40	4.50	4.00	4.21
e-Procurement	4.43	5.12	4.89	5.50	5.38	5.06
Bangalore-One	4.71	5.07	4.80	5.38	5.38	5.07
Ashwini	3.43	3.71	4.70	3.75	3.50	3.82
Mahiti Mitra (I and II)	3.60	4.40	4.70	4.60	4.00	4.26
Village Information System	3.60	4.40	4.60	4.80	4.00	4.28
Mahiti Manthana	4.30	5.00	4.80	5.10	5.30	4.90
Enterprise Development Service	4.57	3.79	4.30	4.13	3.75	4.11
e-Justice	4.71	3.93	4.70	4.13	3.25	4.14
ICT for Women Conciliation Centre	4.14	4.00	4.80	4.00	3.88	4.16
MITRA	4.40	4.00	4.80	4.50	4.00	4.34
ICT School for Women Empowerment	3.80	4.10	4.80	4.40	3.90	4.20
Real Time Provisioning of Fishing Zone Information	4.00	4.00	3.60	4.90	4.00	4.10
Mobile Government	4.00	3.29	4.30	4.13	3.38	3.82
Community Radio Unit	4.14	4.14	4.00	4.13	3.63	4.01
NANDINI	4.14	4.00	4.80	4.00	3.88	4.16

Table 119 Comparative Evaluation of the Projects







5. CASE STUDIES AND SUCCESS STORIES FROM THE PROJECT

Table 120 Best Practices and Lessons Learnt from the Pilot ICTD Projects

Case Study/ Success Story

BANGALORE ONE

A much-hailed initiative, **Bangalore One** bears out the efficacy of careful planning, execution and support from the government for a project of this nature.

Project Background



that accorded the highest importance to citizen convenience, (f) structuring the right partnership arrangements with the banks including the fund flow structures and profit-sharing arrangements, (g) following up with a careful monitoring of adherence to service levels that were well-drafted to start with, and (h) getting the appropriate policy and operational support from the government at the highest levels, even if it required discontinuance of other service centre to lend credence to the principle of "all services under one roof".

Realisation of Benefits

Outputs and Outcomes have been highly promising. Not only have the citizens been helped in terms of fewer number of visits in a customerfriendly atmosphere, it has also brought about very high levels of transparency, accountability and collaboration. The fact that many more new centres were required to come up only shows the increasing number of footfalls into the centre. Higher compliance of submission of returns, higher efficiency, a higher level of confidence that stakeholders have prompted the government to encourage all departments to verifying the need for rolling out online citizen-centric services. More importantly the whole initiative has become completely self-sustainable.

Lessons Learnt/Best Practices from the Case Study

The following is a list of best practices or lessons that can be drawn from the initiative.

• <u>COLLABORATION WITH WELL-DEFINED ROLES IS THE KEY</u>: Since any one party does not bring on board all required competencies it is best to collaborate; however for any such collaboration to be synergistic it is best that the stakeholders who collaborate have well-defined roles that are known to all.



- <u>CITIZEN SERVICE MUST ENCOMPASS ALL DIMENSIONS</u>: It is better to treat citizen service provision in a holistic way considering all dimensions of the same, including, in this case, front office service provision, policy support, well-defined SLAs, electronic queuing and the like.
- TAKE CITIZEN INPUT BEFORE YOU START OFFERING THEM SERVICES: It is always better to take citizen inputs through mechanisms like surveys, group work, questionnaires etc to identify their requirement of services before services are offered to them.
- <u>WELL-DEFINED SLA:</u> The Service Delivery parameters must be known (for example, time taken to deliver, number of physical visits etc) and well-crafted into a Service Level Agreement that is available to all so that everyone knows what to expect.
- <u>THE IMPORTANCE OF CHOICE</u>: It is very important for service providers to give to their constituencies proper choice in the services to the extent possible. Typically, possible choices could include payment choices (payment by Cash, Card, Money Transfer and the like) or choices in terms of channel (Internet, Mobile, Kiosks etc).
- <u>ADOPT PILOT APPORACH TO EXPAND LATER</u>: Before going for an elaborate rollout of the initiative, it is important that we test out a few things at a pilot level, for example, piloting with a few locations or with a limited number of services before expanding.

ASHWINI

The proof of the pudding, they say, is in the eating. The one fact that can indisputably establishes the success of this initiative is that the project continues to be successful a full 36 months after the UNDP funding was over. What strikes one about this project is the continued participation, ownership of the project by communities and the project conceptualisation that aimed at making interventions towards long-term empowering solutions to rural communities.



Project Background

The Ashwini project would be known for its meticulous conceptualisation in terms of the service offerings that were to be made towards (a) long-term empowerment of communities through interventions in education, (a) medium-term interventions towards livelihood generation, and (c) immediate initiatives such as ICT-assisted health

provision. Each of these groups of services required identifying the information and expertise needs of the communities, formation of a string of partnerships with different information and expertise providers in line with the requirements identified earlier, ensuring a significant amount of content production through the partners, putting in place a robust ICT infrastructure and technical resources over which the information and services provision would work as faultlessly as possible and drawing up a self-sustainable business plan on which to run the initiative.

Even more important was the fact that the stakeholders here were participating in the exercise not as beneficiaries but as stakeholders who owned the initiative. In fact not only were the service offerings to be provided came as a result of discussions with communities, the latter had the complete say in how the Ashwini centres would be run including the choice of people who would be employed there, often employing





women in the process, thereby making for their empowerment too.

Benefits Realised

The exercise has not only resulted in access to broadband connectivity in more than 115 villages through Ashwini centres thus benefiting a population of more than 5 lakhs of the 2 districts of Andhra Pradesh (East Godavari and West Godavari districts), the service delivery has also empowered communities through (a) providing education (classes in various subjects of 8th-10th standards and computer literacy) some of which will increase their employability, (b) providing immediate medical help by tying up with hospitals for delivery of the services in the area of Gynaecology, Cardiology, Orthopaedic, Paediatric and General Medicine (with about 7000 persons receiving expert consultation), and (c) improving livelihood generation possibilities by training communities, especially women in tailoring, embroidery, fabric painting, and by providing advisory services to both agri and aqua farmers.

Best Practices/Lessons Learnt

The following is a list of best practices or lessons that can be drawn from the initiative.

- <u>COMMUNITIES AS STAKEHOLDERS NOT BENEFICIARIES</u>: While involving communities as beneficiaries as an approach would be purely top-down with often communities seeing themselves as outsiders, roping them in as stakeholders makes for a much higher level of ownership and is often a quantum leap over the earlier model.
- <u>COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT AT EVERY STEP</u>: Ensuring that the community is involved at every step means for their continued involvement and ownership and is instrumental in a big way towards making the effort successful.
- <u>ROBUST ICT INFRASTRUCTURE WITH REDUNDANCY</u>: When these new ideas are being tried out the first time, it often has to battle scepticism in society. Extra effort must be made to ensure that the service being promised is indeed delivered faultlessly.
- <u>EMPOWERING THROUGH DEVELOPMENT OF CORE SKILLS</u>: Better than providing immediate help in terms of matchmaking services, for example in employment, would be to strengthen the core skills of people which would keep them in good stead in their professional lives and increase their long-term employability.
- ENSURING THE RIGHT PARTNERSHIPS ARE IN PLACE: For services that require expertise to come in from several quarters always ensure that the right partnerships are in place before promises are made towards providing these services.
- <u>STREAMLINED OPERATIONS</u>: It is important to streamline operations once they have been rolled out with an agency properly looking at these operational aspects. In this case, for example, scheduling sessions and targeting different geographical areas was instrumental for its success. Not only did this regulate service provision it also ensured that servers did not crash due to overload.



E-KRISHI (AGRI BUSINESS CENTRES)

The project is one of the most celebrated case studies in the usage of ICT for development wherein an economic problem was spotted, an unmet need was realised, a solution then conceptualised and finally implemented. In the implementation too, what strikes is (a) that existing infrastructure was used to the hilt, and (b) the project was pilot and graduated by degrees, both functionally and geographically.

Planning



The project envisaged the facilitating and enabling of farmers and other Stakeholders through Agri Business Centres to interact with Agricultural Service Providers in the Private, Government and Non- Government sectors through a web-based solution enabling the small and medium farmers as well as owners of large landholdings on the one end interacting with a host of buyers and expertise providers on the other end, facilitated by other support agencies.

Essentially, piloting in Malappuram, a city in North Kerala that once depended predominantly upon agriculture and where farmers were mostly small and marginal, the project planned to use a web-based platform to bring together stakeholders of the sector including (a) farmers (as sellers of produce or seekers of advise), (b) agriculture input providers (as providers of agricultural inputs, for example, fertilisers, genetically improved varieties etc), and (c) agriculture buyers (as people who would buy the produce that farmers would offer to sell). Innovative features like forward posting and virtual aggregation was also provided to meet the specific requirements of Malappuram where farmers needed to be assured of sale before they began investing in farming and to be able to aggregate the produce that was coming in from different sources.

The web-based platform would also double up as one that would be the single most preferred point of reference for all information farmers and other stakeholders relevant would seek in the sphere of agriculture and related subjects. The infrastructure that was to be used was the one already existing, that of the Common Service Centres, called the Akshaya Centres.

Realisation of Benefits

Project benefits that were realised have shown up in following areas of impact

- Increased transaction using e-Krishi website: A large number of farmers have posted their produce in the website and the number of businessmen using online information for trading has increased considerably since the project began.
- Conversion of fallow lands: In an area where farmers were moving away from paddy cultivation owing to unremunerative pricing and keeping their lands fallow, the Government of Kerala through the Civil Supply Corporation started procuring paddy ported by farmers in Malappuram district by paying Rs. 2-3 more than the current market rate. This resulted in more farmers cultivating fallow fields.
- Revival of closed down units (Mushroom): While training and expertise was being provided by the Department of Agriculture for cultivation of mushroom, there was no support for marketing of the produce resulting in closing down of most of the units in absence of a regular





buyer. The e-Krishi platform brought all mushroom growers with infrastructure facilities and interested buyers under one umbrella. In fact an MOU has been signed between the buyer and seller on the quantity, price, frequency of supply etc. with both buyers and sellers making use of the forward posting and aggregation modules. Similar clusters were also formed for coconut farmers.

- Improved access to advice on managing the pests and diseases: Farmers require immediate management strategy once pests and diseases infect the crop. With this project farmers were regularly using e-Krishi toll free centres for getting the required advice as and when required. The fact that there was large number of repeat callers shows the popularity of the service.
- Better access to agricultural projects: Every panchayath conducted location specific projects on various fields in agriculture with details of these projects not being available most of the time. With e-Krishi details of all the projects of each panchayath were made available at the e-Krishi centres. Apart from giving better exposure of the projects to farmers gave also increased the frequency of visit of farmers to the e-Krishi centres.
- Comprehensive database of marketable Commodities: In Kerala, as homestead farming was popular, each household would have several crops but the marketable supplies were very low thus discouraging farmers from posting their information on the web. However, with e-Krishi a comprehensive database of farms was prepared and posted in the web.
- Improved access to price & Market infrastructure: E-Krishi portal provides details of market price on a daily basis. Apart from that, farmers were regularly contacting the toll free centre to get the price of commodities especially those of which were not listed in the market. Some of the products, which are traditionally cultivated in small quantity, did not use to have organized buyers. (eg. Averhoea, arrow root etc.). Through e-Krishi it was possible to link farmers producing such products with the processors directly.

Lessons Learnt/Best Practices

- <u>USE EXISTING INFRASTRUCTURE</u>: Since every project is essentially a new idea requiring investment possibilities should be explored on whether existing infrastructure could be used to support it in the initial stages. Then when the initiative stabilises, different options of scaling up could be considered.
- <u>START SMALL AND SCALE FAST</u>: It is always better to begin small, test the offerings in the real world and then move ahead. In this case, for example, the scaling up took place not just in terms of the area that was covered but also the crops that would be focused on (for example, in this case, coconuts and mushroom).
- INVOLVE COMMUNITIES FOR WHOM THE PROJECT EXISTS: Since communities would be central to the initiative they must be involved at every stage including when the initiative is being planned.
- <u>GOVERNMENT AS A SUPPORT DURING BUSINESS INCUBATION</u>: A new idea of this kind may require support from the government at least in the initial days of incubation. Government support (like in this case in the form of a support price for rice) helps a great deal and may even be required.
- USE INNOVATIVE FEATURES WHILE BRINGING BUYERS AND SELLERS TOGETHER ON A VIRTUAL PLATFORM: Use innovative features to attract



participants on the initiative, something that provides them real value-added services (in this case, for example, Virtual Aggregation services to aggregate small produce on the e-Krishi platform and forward posting as has been explained earlier.)

MAHITI MANTHANA

The Mahiti Manthana project represents a very good example of initiative that has enlivened, enthused an already existing programme of Mahila Samakhya Karnataka (MSK) through innovative usage of ICT towards empowering rural women through collective listening, learning and ideating on issues of their direct concern by interventions aimed at improving their knowledge base on a range of issues including women's legal rights. Along the way by piloting initiatives through young girls it has intervened early in their lives towards making them more aware and confident.

Planning

The Mahiti Manthana project was a response to a felt need of an established grassroots program - Mahila Samakhya (MS)

- which was set up to empower socially and economically disadvantaged rural women through self-help group (SHG) activity. MS is a program of the Ministry of Human Resource Development, Government of India that works in 10 states in 60 districts, reaching more than 9,000 villages. MSK combines the unparalleled reach of the government with high quality localized innovation at the grassroots level in Karnataka in 9 districts, in the themes of education, health, legal literacy, livelihoods, self- governance and community linkages to government institutions. MSK intended to invest in setting up women's self help groups - sanghas - oriented towards empowerment activity, and support them organisationally and through knowledge and training resources.

It was in this set up that the Mahiti Manthana implemented its ICT-based interventions; using ICT as a platform and as a medium to empower women Self-Help groups (SHGs) through development and sharing of knowledge content using television, radio etc. Whereas generation of content came in through partnership with educational institutions, involvement of experts and sharing of real life experiences, sharing of this knowledge came through the usage of media like Community Radio at centres called the Namma Mahiti Kendras or through broadcast media like FM radio. The one most important thing about this initiative is that it is entirely run and managed by women with young girls being entrusted with managing the NMKs. Making young girls mange NMKs not only empowers them in terms of knowledge but it also developed their confidence through knowledge and a position of responsibility.

Realisation of Benefits

Other than the immediate direct benefits arising in terms of establishment of NMKs, hosting of Community Radio sessions or Video Screening sessions focussing almost always on issues of socio-economic relevance, the programme has directly resulted in an increase in information and knowledge to rural and socially disadvantaged women about various important topics such as health, legal rights, education, social problems,





gender, governance, collective strength. It has also facilitated an increased participation of women in local politics and governance even as it has led to a tremendous increase in confidence of women and their acceptability as decision makers by men. Through sharing of legal knowledge from legal experts it has also helped them with confidence to interact with government and be aware of their rights.

Best Practices/Lessons Learnt

- USE ICT AS A LOW-COST TOOL FOR GENERATION AND SHARING OF CONTENT: Information and Communication Technologies qualify as low cost tools with which to generate and share content with very little initial investment unlike other modes for a similar purpose. Use ICT as a tool especially for knowledge empowerment of disadvantaged communities.
- COMMUNITY RADIO AND VIDEO ARE IMPORTANT CHANNEL CHOICES FOR THEIR TREMENDOUS REACH: Community Radio and Video are important channels to reach to large audiences; this is true not only because of their reach but also for the fact that they could be used for unlettered people as well. Besides, their power to convince is much more than other media.
- COLLABORATION WITH AN EXISTING GOVERNMENT-FUNDED INITIATIVE IMPROVES SIGNIFICANTLY THE SCALABILITY & SUSTAINABILITY: Collaboration and alignment with existing government funded long term schemes and programmes not only makes for the project's longterm sustainability, but also for their geographical and functional scalability.
- TAP THE POTENTIAL OF EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS: educational institutions offer themselves as important players with whom collaboration arrangements can be worked out as against non-governmental and corporate entities. Not only will they light on the financial load but they could also serve as centres for innovation.
- NMK FOR COLLECTIVE LEARNING, LISTENING AND IDEATING: Community Centres can often also serve as important places where communities can gather for collective learning, listening and ideating.
- ICT-ENABLED LEARNING ALSO GIVES A CHOICE TO INCLUDE YOUTH, SPECIALLY GIRLS, WHO HAVE DROPPED OUT OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROCESS: ICT-enabled learning as against any formal schooling or learning process can serve as important means through which youth who, for some reason, have dropped out of the regular educational channel, can be roped into the process of learning.

COMMUNITY RADIO UNIT

This project represents an opportunity that was tapped wherein socio-technical research in the sphere of Community Radio (CR) would be made to arrive an innovative information and services delivery products and, working in partnership with NGOs and the citizens, applying the new solutions for testing with already successful test beds that are available with other projects. The broad scope of the project aims to experiment with contextual adaptation of new ICTs in development practice, construct models of best practices from techno-social innovations in development processes, and transfer these learnings to development agencies, including helping them with contextual implementation of these models and innovations, in manner that promotes equitable and socially just development.



Project Background

The project can essentially be seen as one that capitalises on the strengths and opportunities presented by powerful media like Community Radio, that has the capacity to reach across to large audiences without any discrimination on the basis of caste, religion or education, exploring scaling up and innovative applications on these platforms, testing them out on the test beds of existing projects like Mahiti Manthana, and then spreading awareness about them.

The project conceptualised working in tandem with a couple of NGOs, one in Mysore where the centre is base and one outside Karnataka, besides being able to use interns at the institution itself to enable them to use CR possibilities in their work, as well as to develop more learnings for the CDPII. The information and services needs were identified through a needs assessment study, which revealed that all such needs mostly seemed to be centred around government schemes as well as income generation activities. This gave ready data for designing programs for this wide target group. The content for radio would be created by local expertise, resource persons and Sangha women for MSK. Communities, including marginalised ones, would be involved right from the planning stage and the stress would be more on equitable representation of women in the project management groups.

Results emerging from the exercise would then be used for upscaling the existing "Kelu Sakhi" programme of the Mahiti Manthana, besides spreading awareness about the same within the communities and sharing them with NGOs, and undertaking capacity building on specific technical and techno-social aspects.

Realisation of Benefits

As a result of the project a new culture of sharing has developed, involving the sharing of content making processes and the systems around producing radio programs. The space on platforms such as Gyan Vani helped realising alternate models of community radio. A collective license for community radio has been operationalised with a number of stakeholders, both organisations and communities that can manage a single radio station, thereby reducing investment costs as well as optimising use of infrastructure.

The participation on radio has made information available that is necessary for building awareness regarding their entitlements, worked to enhance citizenship, increased participation in governance.

Kelu Sakhi proved that the marginalised could participate with great ease and expertise in media and that their participation legitimised their presence on the air waves. Community radio has become a legitimate space for marginalised communities and this space does not discriminate on the basis of caste, religion or education.

Best Practices/Lessons Learnt





- <u>A LOT IS POSSIBLE WITH COMMUNITY RADIO</u>: Community Radio and Video are ICT platforms that do not discriminate. More importantly, even the uneducated can participate and partake of the benefits. Whatever we have seen of Community Radio is very little of the immense possibility that this platform presents of exploiting the air waves. At a larger level CR presents the potential of changing the power equations within the society as well.
- EXISTING ICTD PROJECTS CAN ALSO BE USED AS TESTBEDS: Moving something out of the research house into the production environment requires a lot of testing. Untested products may well do more damage than good. It is always better to have existing well-running projects as test beds for the exercise; if the innovation does not work out it could be discontinued while if it goes through it could well enhance the effectiveness of the existing projects, besides paving the way for adoption at new places.
- LARGE NGO'S OFFER AN OPPORTUNITY TO SCALE UP GEOGRAPHICALLY: Partnering and piloting ideas with large Non-Governmental Organisations is helpful at least in as much as successful ides adopted in one place could be easily replicated elsewhere where the NGO would be operational.

ENTERPRISE DEVELOPMENT SERVICE

This celebrated project was a result of in-depth conceptualisation of the needs of the stakeholders of the area in which it was to piloted facilitates by a comprehensive needs assessment exercise and a role-based collaborative exercise involving community members, experts (TARAgurus), TARAkendra operators, training providers and the village community at large particularly in a place where rural employment levels were high.



Conceptualisation and Planning

Today in India, rural unemployment is a big problem, particularly among people in the age group of 15-45 years as the capacity of absorb the growing numbers of people is diminishing. Naturally, opportunities had to be found to create

employment or entrepreneurship in the rural areas members in this age-group. Both the Government of India and NGOs have been focusing on rural entrepreneurship as a key route to solving the need for economic and social empowerment. Small, local enterprises together account for the largest number of jobs in the country and have shown the positive impact that they can have on individuals and communities. The limitations of existing programmes have been the lack of meaningful and viable enterprise options and the inadequacy of market, technical and financial linkages.

To address the above problems and bridge existing gaps in the linkages in market, technical and financial requirements, the project brought together over an ICT-enabled platform, stakeholders that included technical expertise providers, financial and credit institutions, buyers and sellers of produce, besides rural youth, women, SHGs, landless and small land holders. The comprehensive ICT based Enterprise Development Service (EDS) proposed would support a rural entrepreneur through every stage of the business life cycle through the development of (a) an Enterprise Package for technical training plus market and financial linkages, (b) an Entrepreneurship Development Programme to understand



business set-up, (c) an FAQ Database on best practices and solutions, and (d) an Ask the Expert service for on-going business support. The project was to be piloted at a couple of locations before being scaled up to more locations.

Realisation of Benefits

The project has contributed to a set of business entrepreneurs selected through an internship programme in whom has been developed an understanding of business set-up and hands on technical experience in the business potential entrepreneurs, besides building up their linkages to financial and credit institutions. The project has created employment opportunities, typically hiring 3-5 people to work in the enterprise. It has strengthened existing linkages in the areas of finance and governance, and has led to more transparent and responsive policies and services in the long term. The project has improved standard of living of the entrepreneurs' families, typically enhancing their health, education levels and providing a safety net. The wealth they create is expected to have a trickledown effect within the local community over a period of time.

Best Practices/Lessons Learnt

- TARGET IDEAS WITH A LOW GESTATION PERIOD: In rural areas with limited resources, it is better to target ideas with low gestation period for the results to be shown quickly. Waiting a long time for the results to become apparent may discourage people particularly when ideas fail
- IDENTIFY SKILLS THAT ARE CONDUCIVE TO BE ACQUIRED THROUGH REMOTE ICT-ENABLED TRAINING DELIVERY: ICT provides us a very good opportunity to shrink distances; the training seeker (the trainee) and the training provider (the trainer) would be interacting over an ICT-enabled interface. However, care must be taken to ensure that only those areas are taken up that are conducive to such exchange over an ICT-enabled platform.
- EXPLOIT THE BENEFITS OF DEMONSTRABLE PILOT EXERCISES: Demonstrable pilot exercises offer us a great opportunity to convince people of the efficacy of new ideas. These must be tried over everything else.
- ICT-ENABLED INTERACTIONS CAN ONLY AUGMENT, NEVER SUBSTITUTE REAL-LIFE INTERACTIONS, PARTICULARLY WHERE LIFE-SKILLS ARE INVOLVED: Even if ICT-enabled service provision has become so much more comfortable and low-cost, we must bear in mind that these can only augment actual real-life interfaces; they can never really substitute them.
- THE ICT-ENABLED MULTIPURPOSE TELECENTRE (IN THIS CASE, THE TARAKENDRAS) CAN FORM THE NUCLEUS OF A LOT OF ACTIVITIES IN THE RURAL HINTERLAND OF THE COUNTRY: In the rural hinterland an ICT-enabled multipurpose centre can actually form a social and cultural nucleus for all activities in the village. Besides, being a social aggregation centre such centres can form the nucleus of a large set of activities in the village. Offerings from an ICT-enabled project can take advantage of he number of footfalls that would thereby increase...
- <u>RELENTLESSLY EXPLORE REVENUE STREAMS TO ENSURE THAT IDEAS REALISED THROUGH DONOR SUPPORT OUTLIVE THE DONOR SUPPORT</u> <u>PERIOD:</u> Multipurpose centres have a lot of potential owing to the increasing number of footfalls; in order that projects do not die with the donor funding all kinds of revenue-generating sources must be identified and tried out with fund for it.



SUCCESS STORIES AND BEST PRACTICES FROM THE PROJECTS

Case Study/ Success Story

NANDINI

This case study represents a wonderful example where interventions that aimed at exploiting ICT's potential to shrink distances has been used to the hilt in a sector whose outputs had a major bearing on the livelihood and hence welfare status of the population. Not only was the capacity of ICT to bridge distances was used but also the ability of ICT to make possible the availability of veterinarians' services at multiple locations across the region of interest.

Conceptualisation and Planning

Veterinary services were being provided to the end-user in the selected villages in a fire-brigade approach with farmers not having ready access to institutions that are sparsely located. In Veterinary practice, it is advisable to

follow a preventive model to avoid production loss. A successful preventive treatment model should provide the livestock owner and other stakeholders a system of alerts for farm animals for achieving optimum productivity.

It was under this background that this project aimed at using ICT to bring together stakeholder groups like livestock farmers, veterinary doctors and Livestock Inspectors to provide timely information and services that aimed at reducing the inter-calving and the dry periods in cross-bred cows. The idea was to (a) collect vital statistics related to cross-bred cows, (b) standardise the main parameters of cross-bred cows, (c) based on the standardisation issue timely alerts and reminders, (d) get farmers to call inspectors when important milestones in a cow's reproductive lifecycle is reached, and (e) call the service of Vets either over an ICT-based network or physically whenever the need arose.

Along the way it also offered generic Helpdesk services for farmers whenever they wished to know anything.

Realisation of Benefits

The project has resulted in the following benefits

- Increased productivity through timely service delivery at vulnerable points in the productive and reproductive life cycle of the CB cows.
- Monitoring of reproductive disorders, total protection of health of animals as well as sustained genetic gain etc. would be possible out of the project.
- Demand driven supply of farming system input, better pricing of animals and animal produce.
- Development of entrepreneurship quality among various stakeholders.
- Able to identify outstanding animals with respect to production and reproduction parameters and could be used for selective breeding programmes.
- Monitoring and Evaluation of services would support adequate exposure for adoption of better policies to bring welfare of farmers





Best Practices/Lessons Learnt

WHILE IDENTIFYING A PROBLEM SELECT ONE THAT IMPACTS THE GREATEST NUMBER OF PEOPLE: Once a region has been identified it is desirable that a problem whose resolution would impact the greatest number of people. In this case, for example, in the selected two villages, most people cultivated cross-bred cows as livestock which was also their most important source of income; as such, in so far as this region was concerned this would impact the greatest number of people.

IF A PROBLEM IS LARGELY CONCENTRATED IN A SINGLE AREA IT OFFERS AN OPPORTUNITY TO EXPLOIT ECONOMIES OF SCALE: Where service providers are limited in number and physical visits may be required, economies of scale can be exploited in areas where such service seekers are highly concentrated.

THE SYSTEM OF MOBILE-BASED ALERTS AND NOTIFICATIONS OFFERS US A UNIQUE OPPOTUNITY TO MAKE PRE-EMPTIVE INTERVENTIONS: Mobilebase alerts and notifications offer us a unique way by which pre-emptive interventions can be made before the problem rather than people being caught unawares.

ENSURE THAT ALONG WITH OTHER INTERVENTIONS AN AWARENESS GENERATION DRIVE IS ALSO UNDERTAKEN EXPLOIT THE FACT THAT MOBILE PENETRATION RATES ARE MORE THAN PC PENETRATION RATES AND INCREASING

MOBILE GOVERNMENT

The project offered another example of how the mobile phone could be used as a device to bridge distances between the government and places that are geographically far-flung and otherwise have poor infrastructure availability.

Conceptualisation and Planning

The m-Gov project piloted in South 24 Paraganas and Purulia districts of West Bengal envisaged to facilitate access to quality information in the process of strengthening decentralization thereby contributing to good governance by putting in place an effective interactive communication channel aiding decentralization at various levels in Government and PRI's using mobile forms of ICT.

The project sought to connect government agencies with populations located in remote areas through information and services provided over the mobile phone. In the process the project also established a two-way communication between the government and the people. Whereas the government offered rural local government bodies (the Panchayati Raj Institutions or the PRI) intimations of fund allocation, recent orders passed, important alerts and reminders, the PRIs provided them with financial and physical progress monitoring, utilisation certificates, intimations of any disasters, feedback on the services, besides requesting them for trouble shooting help.

Realisation of Benefits





- The project connected the layers in the government using ICT and tried to remove blocks in information dissemination and collection which were earlier manual based.
- It has aided all the layers of Government in programme management of schemes, financial and physical progress monitoring of PRIs, and citizen services.
- To improve access to services 513 mobile phones in 5 blocks were provided PRI functionaries. 410 PRI functionaries and government officials were provided training of 2 days on application usage.
- The services design has a high degree of alignment with user needs especially ambulance information for citizens and for PRI functionaries in reduction of response time, information dissemination costs and time for gathering information.

Best Practices/Lessons Learnt

- AN EXCLUSIVE EARMARKED GROUP OF DEDICATED INDIVIDUALS RATHER THAN EX-OFFICIO POSTS IS BETTER FOR OPERATIONALISATION OF ICT <u>INITIATIVES</u>: Success or failure of these initiatives is dependent on performance of individuals rather than of organisations. It is very important for that reason to have an exclusive group of people who are dedicated and committed to spearhead such initiatives at least in the initial stages of not all through.
- <u>MOBILE IS OFTEN THE MOST VIABLE MEDIUM FOR FAR-FLUNG AREAS</u>: Infrastructure availability is not the same everywhere and particularly in remote areas it is often poor. The poor economic condition of people often prevents them from owning computers; however, mobiles are increasingly becoming indispensable largely regardless of economic position of people even as mobile coverage continues to expand and largely covers most parts of the country. Therefore, mobile as a medium is often the best way to communicate with people residing in remote areas.
- FOR INSTANT MESSAGING MOBILE SERVICES ARE OFTEN THE BEST OPTION: Since mobiles are carried on person in case of emergency mobiles are often the best way to communicate instantly.
- <u>USE THE MOBILE PHONE FOR TWO-WAY COMMUNICATION</u>: Mobiles could be better used if a two-way communication is established over the same. While government agencies would like to extend services over mobiles, for citizens too it offers an excellent platform to convey their feedback over mobile phones.
- <u>PROPERLY CRAFT SERVICE LEVEL AGREEMENTS WITH SERVICE PARAMETERS</u>: To bridge the gap between service expectation and service delivery it is always better to associate services with metrics. It is also equally important to have Service Level Agreements in place with hardware and software providers whenever their services are being used.
- FOR EMERGENCY SERVICES A FORMAL OR INFORMAL ACKNOWLEDGEMENT IS IMPORTANT: Citizens resort to emergency services in times of a problem. In such cases it is always better to communicate to them that their message requesting help has been received. In this case, for example, sent SMS could be seen on the web interface provided.
- CONTINUED FUNCTIONING OF IMPORTANT PEOPLE AS CHAMPIONS OF THE PROJECT IS IMPORTANT: While the choice of people at the top level



to drive the initiative is important it is equally important that they be continued and not changed frequently.

ICT FOR WOMEN CONCILIATION CENTRE

This case study highlights how a comprehensive approach at empowerment can indeed go a long way towards women empowerment through steps involving (a) ICT-enabled production, sharing and transfer of knowledge on various issues of real-life importance, (b) bringing home the latest programmes and projects of the government for women empowerment and their conditions of eligibility, made possible by ICT, and (c) using ICT to shrink distances ands bring together conciliatory justice and rights by appropriate innovative applications of ICT, particularly mobile phones.



Conceptualisation and Planning

Government of India has been focusing on many development and welfare programmes through direct interventions, grants and subsidies. Most programmes have limitations in reaching poorer sections of the rural society due to asymmetry in information and high transaction costs. Studies suggest that development can be achieved only through the informational empowerment of the communities, enabled through social capital such as Self-Help Groups (SHGs). It was with this premise that VIDIYAL, an NGO working with Self-Help Groups (SHGs) took up the task of bringing together SHGs, Women Conciliation Centres, IFFCO -AIRTEL, Arul Anandar College and legal experts to meet objectives:

- Promoting Self-Directed Learning in legal, constitutional and human rights among poor women using mobile phones;
- Orienting the present Women Conciliation Centre with ICTs and enabling large scale interactions with less transaction cost with the establishment of Village Knowledge Centres;
- Helping the women members identifying their eligibility in various development programme of state and central government using Indian Citizen eligibility Identification System (ICLIS); and
- Strengthening the horizontal transfer of knowledge in legal, constitutional and human rights through structured mobile conversations.

Prior to this VIDIYAL found that major services needs of communities were the following (through comprehensive need assessment exercises

- Self-Directed Learning for livelihood enhancement and legal empowerment
- WCC for legal service to rural illiterate women
- ICLIS -web service to know about the development schemes
- Facilitation of Horizontal Transfer of Knowledge

Realisation of Benefits

The above objectives were achieved as follows

• Self-Directed Learning for livelihood enhancement and legal empowerment, through the production of local content developed in and by the communities themselves





- WCC for legal service to rural illiterate women, (a) by using ICT to connect distant women to the WCCs which otherwise would not take place as women would be too busy, and (b) by women approaching legal experts over ICT channels
- ICLIS -web service to know about the development schemes, developed through a software developed by the educational institute and used liberally by the communities to find out their eligibility for different governmental programmes
- Facilitation of Horizontal Transfer of Knowledge, or the spread of knowledge within the community by locally produced content being distributed using channels provided by ICT

Best Practices/Lessons Learnt

- <u>USE INNOVATIVE PRODUCTS LIKE VOICE MAIL ETC TO REACH OUT TO DISADVANTAGED SECTIONS</u>: The reach of services must be enhanced by using innovative products like voice mail etc to reach out to disadvantaged sections of the community (educationally disadvantaged here)
- all round empowerment: Empowerment must be attempted for the long, medium and short term respectively through, providing education, knowledge about government schemes to delivery of justice in case of emergent social problems like dowry harassment and the like
- <u>MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE FOR VKC</u>: Village Knowledge Centres or Internet Centres need to be managed by communities themselves; however it is also desirable that management structures are put in place so that terms of participation are as equitable and structured as is possible
- NEGOTIATING AND BARGAINING POWER OF THE WOMEN AMONG THE SHGS WILL INCREASE ESPECIALLY WHEN DEALING WITH BANKS, <u>GOVERNMENTS AND MARKETING AGENCIES</u>: ICTD opportunities often involve collaboration among various bodies, often banks and marketing agencies. these are good avenues through which the negotiating power of communities, particularly women, is seen to improve
- HORIZONTAL AND VERTICAL KNOWLEDGE TRANSFER: Knowledge transfer must take place for greater spread both horizontally and vertically. Whereas vertical knowledge transfer takes place when an external expert provides knowledge, horizontal transfer happens when communities share knowledge amongst themselves
- <u>CONTENT AT COMMUNITY AND SOFTWARE AT EDUCATION</u>: If content needs to be produced at the community level itself then educational institutes provided a good and inexpensive avenue through which to produce technology applications like softwares

INTEGRATED COMMUNITY RESOURCE CENTRES

Background of the Project:

Himachal Pradesh is a sparsely populated State with difficult topographical and climatic conditions. Inhabitant of the State needs to travel miles and has to run from pillar to post to avail various governmental services such as land registration, birth/ death certificate, licences, etc.

To overcome the above problem, ICT was recognised as an important enabler for providing governmental services at the doorstep of rural community. This led to the conceptualisation of INTEGRATED COMMUNITY SERVICE CENTRE (i-COSC), an ICT enabled centre, to serve as a single window to access various governmental services. These centres have now been rechristened as SUGAM CENTRES. Under I-COSC project, 16 Sugam centres at district, sub-division, tehsil and sub-





tehsil level covering 7.21 lac population and 5131 sq km of area have been established. Sugam centre provides approx 33 online and offline services including issuance of driving license, arms license, property registration, etc.

Realisation of Benefits:

Sugam Centre, as the name suggests, has added to the convenience of citizens as they are now not required to travel miles to avail the Government services. The following are the key benefits of i-CoSC initiative to the stakeholders:

- One Stop Shop for various Government Services: All citizens related services and information are provided under single roof cutting across different tiers of administration. The services are provided across the counter of Sugam centres, eliminating the requirement of people to visit various offices/ officials in the process chain for verification / attestation of documents.
- Empowerment of citizens: The availability of updated information about mandi rates of the identified commodity, exam results, tourism related information, etc leads to empowerment of citizens.
- Faster Grievance Redressal Mechanism: The e-Smadham software has been developed and implemented for recording and monitoring grievances of citizens. This leads to reduction in the response time in addressing grievances by the concerned departments.
- Bridging Digital Divide: Touch Screen Kiosks have been installed at all Sugam centres to facilitate citizens to access internet, send e-mail, etc. thereby bridging the digital divide between the rich and the poor.
- Greater Transparency and Accountability: Regular monitoring and tracking of citizens' service request in the software systems installed at Sugam centres leads to reduction in corruption and enhanced transparency.
- Elimination of the Middlemen: The ease with which various government services, such as driving licence, arms licence, property registration, can be availed from Sugam centres leads to elimination of the middlemen, who breeds inefficiencies in the service delivery mechanism.
- Ease of maintaining records using computers instead of manual entries: The automated data processing through computer entries results in lesser manual work and cuts down on paper usage on part of the implementing agency. Various Management Information Reports can now be generated with a click of a button to facilitate real-time monitoring of the performance of various agencies/ department involved in the Government to Citizen Service delivery.
- Reduction in costs of service delivery: Single delivery channel is used for delivering multiple government services leading to reduction in cost of service delivery through different channels.

Best Practices / Lessons Learnt:

The following is a list of best practices or lessons that can be drawn from the initiative:

• <u>CITIZEN INPUT BEFORE OFFERING SERVICES</u>: It is better to take citizens inputs prior to project implementation through citizen interaction mechanisms like surveys, focus group discussion, etc to identify their requirement of services before services are offered to them. Such inputs are beneficial to assess the citizen's readiness to shift to next level in the technology and to ascertain their ability to pay for



such services.

- <u>ALL SERVICES UNDER ONE ROOF</u>: Services which were rendered by multiple departments should be brought under one roof. This leads to considerable savings in time and efforts required in availing these services.
- EFFECTIVE CAPACITY BUILDING AND CHANGE MANAGEMENT: The staffs of various departments (involved in provision of citizen services) have to be effectively trained by way of interactive sessions on how to provide citizen centric services in a friendly manner.
- <u>QUEUE MANAGEMENT SYSTEM TO EFFECTIVELY MANAGE HUGE FOOTFALL</u>: Queue Management System facilitates effective management of huge footfall and enhances convenience of the Citizens visiting these centers for getting government to Citizen (G2C) services.
- <u>CONSTANT CITIZEN FEEDBACK ON SERVICES OFFERED</u>: The regular citizen feedback helps in improving the service delivery design and maps the satisfaction level of the citizens availing the services.
- <u>PROJECT SUSTAINABILITY</u>: The project's long term economic and institutional sustainability should be taken into consideration while formulating the project framework. Nominal service charges should be levied on the citizens for availability various benefits under the projects. Further, project institutional structure should have clear line of authority and responsibility.
- <u>LEADERSHIP FROM THE TOP AND INVOLEMENT OF ALL STAKEHOLDERS</u>: Top management/ senior officials should be continuously involved during the project life cycle so as to provide guidance and to ensure that bottleneck, if any, can be removed promptly. Further, all stakeholders of the projects should be involved in the decision making process so that conflicts, if any, can be identified and resolved amicably.

MAHITI MITRA (PHASE I AND II)

Background of the Project:

Mahiti Mitra project envisaged the creation of the ICT kiosk, known as Mahiti Mitra Kendra, to enhance the efficiency and transparency of local self-governance through informed decision-making & better understanding of their rights and responsibilities. As part of the project 17 Mahiti Mitra Kendras have been established, with each Kendra catering to a cluster of approx. 15-16 villages.

Realisation of Benefits:

Mahiti Mitra has effectively utilized the technological advances in information and communication to empower and link the village communities with macro trends in development without compromising their interests and sustaining their own cultural identities and diversities. Project Mahiti-Mitra is serving not only PRIs but also vulnerable group and marginal livelihood groups of the cluster. The following are the key benefits of Mahiti Mitra initiative to the stakeholders:

• Information & Service Access as RIGHT: Agaria's (saltpan workers) of Rann had no official identity or recognition and thus are deprived from the benefits of various government services/ schemes. The Mahiti Mitra Kendras facilitated the process of getting formal Identity papers for all the 110 Agaria families working in the area. These families are now able to access the basic services of drinking water, health service, education, protective gear etc.





- Saving in time and efforts: Considerable saving of time and effort of the rural citizens, who were earlier required to visit district administrator's office for getting information/ availing services. Mahiti Mitra kendra through its Yojana Darshan software, can access and provide information about various government schemes/ projects to citizens.
- Mediators Eliminated: Most fishermen in the region were illiterate and depended on middlemen to get Creek pass, custom card, maritime license, transfer certificate. The Mahiti Mitra kendras have now provided these services to the fishermen community in time and at 10 times lower price. These Mahiti Mitra Kendras serve as an interface between citizens and administrative department in provision of various government services.
- Vulnerable are supported: Access to, basic welfare schemes and services have always been difficult. The Mahiti Mitra kendras have facilitated easy access to various Government welfare schemes like Old age pension, widow pension, welfare support for first delivery, disabled entitlements, etc.
- Panchayat & Gramsabha supported: In order to ensure speedy delivery of simple government certificate like the BPL number, birth & death certificates and Property assessment certificate, the Mahiti Mitra Kendras have collaborated with the Talati (who is responsible for keeping records of more than one village) by digitizating all the panchayat records. This has enabled more accurate and speedy generation of these government certificates.
- Facilitated Better Planning and Resource Utilization: The demographic, geographical and other information have been duly captured into an automated Setu Information Management System. Various reports can be easily generated to facilitate effective village level planning and resource allocation.

Best Practices / Lessons Learnt:

- <u>BUILD ON EXISTING PARTNERSHIPS AT THE PROJECT LEVEL</u>: The existing partnership with other similar local agencies active in welfare of citizens should be leveraged to understand the priorities of the citizens and to spread awareness about the services offered by a project.
- <u>USE OF REGIONAL LANGUAGE</u>: IT application should be developed in local/ regional language so as increase its adaptability among local citizens. People are more receptive to contents developed in local languages.
- <u>USE OF INFORMATION INTERMEDIARY IN CASE OF LIMITED ACCESS TO TECHNOLOGY</u>: Lack of automation at District Administration offices may impede the online availability of G2C services. To overcome this, till the time government departments are not fully computerised to provide online services to the citizens, services of an information intermediary should be availed, who serves as an interface between citizens and government. This leads to ease in getting information/ availing services.
- <u>MULTIPLE SERVICES UNDER ONE UMBRELLA</u>: Services which were rendered by multiple departments are now provided through one centre system leading to considerable savings in time and efforts required in availing these services.
- EFFECTIVE CAPACITY BUILDING: The staffs of various ICT kiosks should be effectively trained by way of interactive sessions to provide citizen centric services in a friendly manner.





- <u>COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT AT EVERY STEP</u>: Ensuring that the community is involved at every step means for their continued involvement and ownership and is instrumental in a big way towards making the effort successful.
- <u>COLLABORATION WITH LOCAL GOVERNMENT</u>: Collaboration with local government facilitates smooth flow of information between citizens and the administration. It also expedites the G2C, G2B and G2G service delivery.
- <u>STRONG TECHNICAL SUPPORT GROUP</u>: A strong technical support group ensures prompt resolution of software and hardware problems. It not only reduces the downtime but also leads to enhancing the reliability of the ICT kiosks.

REAL TIME PROVISIONING OF FISHING ZONE INFORMATION

Background of the Project:

The fisheries sector has been recognized as a powerful income and employment generator, as it stimulates growth of a number of subsidiary industries, serves as a source of cheap and nutritious food, and acts as an instrument of livelihood for a large section of economically backward population of the country. More than 6 million fishermen and women in the country depend on fisheries and aquaculture for their livelihood.

Real Time Provisioning of Fishing Zone Information Project is designed to serve the fisheries sector through the use of ICT. The project envisaged installation of Electronic Display Boards (EDBs) at the fishing villages.

Realisation of Benefits:

EDBs are very helpful to the fishermen community as they provide near real-time information on locations of the Potential Fishing Zones (PFZ), and early warnings of tsunami in local language. The following are the key benefits of the project:

- Increased Efficiency: EDB provides fishermen up-to-date information on the potential fishing grounds. This led to significant reduction in search time for the shoals and tremendous increase in Catch Per Unit Effort (CPUE)
- Safe Navigation: EDB provides ocean state forecast to the fishermen. Based on this information, the fishermen can now avoid venturing into the ocean for fishing operations during turbulent time.
- Early Alerts of Disasters: The entire coastal community living in and around the village can be alerted in advance about the potential disaster, such as Tsunami's, by activating the Siren system that is audible up to 2 kms diameter range. Also, audio messages can be broadcasted to guide the community in the event of any disaster.
- Awareness Creation: During normal time EBD boards and audio system are used to broadcast messages related to various social issues to create awareness among fishermen community.

Best Practices / Lessons Learnt:

• <u>USER FRIENDLY SOLUTION</u>: The front end on any ICT application should be designed in such a way that the end user doesn't require the knowledge of ICT and should cater seamlessly to the community by large, irrespective of their literacy level. Further, the use of local language increases the adaptability among local citizens as people are more receptive to contents developed in local languages.



- <u>SELECTING PARTNERS WITH COMPLEMENTARY STRENGTHS</u>: The project partners should be selected in such a way that each partner brings in complementary knowledge and expertise that as a whole is essential for successful implementation of the project.
- INNOVATIVE ENVIRONMENT FRIENDLY SOLUTION: Solar energy is abundant in rural areas. While designing any ICT project, emphasizes should be laid on the use of solar panel that ensures the use of natural and clean source of energy.
- <u>CO-OPERATION FROM CENTRAL GOVERNMENT</u>: The overall guidance and support of the central government benefits the project outcomes as it facilitates deployment necessary resources and ensures early of disputes, if any.
- <u>AWARENESS CAMPAIGNS</u>: To create awareness and to educate the beneficiary community on effective use of latest technologies, several awareness campaigns and user interaction workshops need to be conducted. This would ensure maximum realisation of benefits being availed from the operating project.

VILLAGE INFORMATION SYSTEM (VIS)

Background of the Project:

The Gujarat state government took up the challenge of setting up e-Governance program by providing computer based services through the Village Information System (VIS) to the doorsteps of rural communities.

Government of Gujarat (GoG) has carefully planned the entire initiative of setting up VIS / e-Gram centers across Gujarat. The various steps undertaken involved (a) Carrying out need assessment study for identifying the important parameters of the project, (b) Preparation of comprehensive database, (c) Identification of villages for the project, (d) Identification of the sites for the VIS centres, (e) Preparation of guidelines for appointment and identification of VCE (Village Computer Entrepreneur), (f) Finalization and Procurement of ICT Infrastructure, (g) Development of Software application for the VIS project, (h) Identification of capacity building requirements for officials of Panchayat Department and VCE.

Realization of Benefits

The following are the key benefits of the project:

- Information Dissemination: The project enabled dissemination of information about the various services / schemes of the state departments to the citizens.
- Citizen Centric Service Delivery: The project was successful in delivering various services including the G2C services to the citizens / rural masses.
- Bridging the Digital Divide: The project enabled the use of ICT in delivering services as well utilization of the same for other functions such as knowledge dissemination, internet surfing, emails etc.
- Employment Opportunity: Appointment of VCE on revenue sharing model created employment opportunities.
- Panchayat e-Enablement: As per the project the various records of Panchayats are being digitised as well as the Panchayat is moving towards





e-mode with applications such as ePrima. The Panchayat officials were trained on various aspects of ICT as well IT application and hence are being gradually accustomed to the e-environment.

• Facilitated spreading awareness among community for emerging issues like health, environment, industrialization, citizens' rights and access to information.

Lessons Learnt/Best Practices from the Case Study

The following is a list of best practices or lessons that can be drawn from the initiative.

- INVOLVEMENT OF STAKEHOLDERS AND CLEAR ROLE DEFINITION: The stakeholders at all levels i.e. government, Panchayats, operators, citizens etc. needs to be involved in the project with clear definition of roles and responsibilities, aiding smooth operation of the centres.
- <u>PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP</u>: Private partners such as banks, etc should be roped in so that not only private sector expertise can be utilized but also adequate resources can be generated for project implementation.
- PRIORITIZATION OF SERVICES: The services to be offered to citizens should be prioritized based on the inputs of the citizens.
- <u>PROVISION OF ICT SUPPORT GROUP</u>: ICT support group should be constituted to promptly troubleshoot the technical snags in the operations of the centres

ICT SCHOOL FOR WOMEN'S EMPOWERMENT

Background of the Project:

ICT School for Women's Empowerment project has been able to effectively use information & Communication Technology (ICT) to further empower rural women and neglected community for livelihood generation, socioeconomic security and self-sustainability.

The project focused on developing the existing Community Learning Centres (CLCs) as ICT schools to build capacity and provide trainings to the women members of Self-employed Women's Association (SEWA) and local communities in various ICT based applications/ tools. Local entrepreneurs, panchayat members, district administration officials have been contacted to identify ICT skills in high demand and finalize training courses to be imparted through CLC centres. **Realisation of Benefits:**

The following are the key benefits of the project:

- Facilitated Livelihood Generation: ICT training has enabled rural women to earn monthly income of about Rs 2,500 to Rs 5000 by starting their own business or by working for local entrepreneurs, Panchayats, etc
- Women Empowerment: ICT training instilled a sense of empowerment among women who were hardly recognized in their societies. They are now respected in their community for their ICT skills and creativity. The younger women feel they were able to approach the job market with greater confidence.
- Considerable Saving of Time and Efforts: Women are using telephone (and sometimes even the fax to communicate across district offices) to







fix up meetings of their group, for logistics setting for travel and appointment seeking with government and other officials in different locations. Mobile phones are also used in micro enterprises by the women and even in agricultural-produce selling.

• ICT Awareness and Penetration: SEWA organized various computer melas in which more than 550 desktop and laptop computers have been purchased by local community members to use in their trades, microenterprises and for children.

Best Practices / Lessons Learnt:

- <u>BUILD ON THE EXISTING INFRASTRUCTURE</u>: The existing infrastructure should be used for providing the new services/ facilities to the community, leading to considerable saving in capital as well as operational costs.
- <u>LEVERAGE EXISTING KNOWLEDGE AND EXPERIENCE</u>: The knowledge and experiences gained during implementation of a project should be leveraged while emulating the similar project in other locations.
- <u>MUTUALLY BENEFECIAL LINKAGES WITH CORPORATE SECTORS</u>: Based on the requirements of the rural communities, direct linkages should be established with corporate sectors for provision of necessary goods/ services such as mobile phones, mobile connectivity, etc at concessional charges. These linkages are beneficial for both rural community and private partners.
- <u>TRAIN THE TRAINER MODEL</u>: In a country marred with limited number of qualified ICT trainers, 'Train the Trainer' model provides a good alternative for preparing an army of trained teachers to provide training to community at large.
- <u>PERIODIC FEEDBACK</u>: The mechanism of periodic feedback on services offered helps to identify existing gaps in the service delivery platform and hence helps in improvement of service delivery.
- <u>COLLABORATION WITH TRAINING COURSES CERTIFYING AGENCIES</u>: The certification of training courses from renowned brands, such as Microsoft, etc, helps in better recognition of the trained resources in the market and increases their employment opportunities.
- <u>PROJECT SUSTAINABILITY</u>: In order to ensure long term continuity of any project financial sustainability is must. Avenues of revenue generation need to be identified and implemented. These avenues may include concessional fees for imparting training, nominal charges for print-out/ letter typing, etc.

ICT SCHOOL FOR WOMEN'S EMPOWERMENT

Background of the Project:

People's Education and Development Organization (PEDO) was established in Dungarpur, Rajasthan in the year 1987-88 after a series of draughts with the main objective to promote microfinance. One of the main stumbling blocks for the development of microfinance was the capacity to handle the complicated accounting and information processing needs, given the remote locations and limited financial means of the small Self Help Groups.

In order to overcome the above difficulty, Project MITRA - Mobile Information Technology for Rural Advancement was conceived and executed. Project MITRA has effectively & efficiently used mobile technology to automate complicated accounting and information processing needs of a rural micro-finance institution.







Realisation of Benefits:

The following are the key benefits of the project:

- Increased efficiency: ICT brings in considerable savings in time and efforts required to maintain books/ records of micro finance transactions. Increased efficiency leads to approx. 10 days saving per month of community workers due to automation in book keeping that can now be utilized in livelihood generation activities.
- Increased transparency & accountability: Information is sent to the data bank in front of the account holder and a computerized receipt is provided to SHG members for every transaction. Also, the SHG member can cross-check their accounts information online anytime at the federation office.
- Reduction of cost: Automated processing of receipt and online compilation of accounts has resulted in bringing down operation costs as it cuts down on both manpower requirement and paper work.
- Minimal human error: Direct entry of data in to the server from the source of information leads to avoidance of human error.
- Women Empowerment: Microfinance members, who are women, can now online accesses their account information and download account statement at the federation centres. Real time access of information to women leads to their empowerment.

Best Practices / Lessons Learnt:

- EXPERIENCE SHARING SESSIONS: A periodic experience sharing session should be organized involving majority of the stakeholders to understand the problems that are faced by them and to share the success stories. This will facilitate easy adaption to changed environment.
- <u>BLEND COMMUNICATIONS APPROACHES</u>: Given the limitation of web connectivity in remote locations, mobile network connectivity can be leveraged to facilitate real time exchange of information.
- <u>PREPARATION OF BUSINESS PLAN FOR SUSTAINABLE MODEL</u>: Before rolling out the project, a business plan should be developed to ascertain major revenue generating avenues. It is advisable to collect appropriate fees from each member to cover the administrative and running expenses.
- TRAIN THE TRAINER MODEL: In a country marred with limited number of qualified ICT trainers, 'Train the Trainer' model provides a good alternative for preparing an army of trained teachers to provide training to community at large.
- <u>MUTUALLY BENEFECIAL LINKAGES WITH CORPORATE SECTORS</u>: Based on the project requirements, direct linkages should be established with corporate sectors for provision of necessary goods/ services such as mobile phones, mobile connectivity, etc at concessional charges. These linkages are beneficial for both rural community and private partners.



6. ICTD Project- The Evaluation of the Implementation Partner

6.1 The Role of the Stakeholders

The following is a brief description of the stakeholders involved in this project and their respective roles.

UNDP as the Funding Agency: UNDP has provided funding support of USD 5 million to facilitate procurement of goods/ services required for implementation of pilot initiatives including capacity building of stakeholders and project management. Besides timely disbursement of funds, UNDP also provided overall guidance in successful implementation of pilot initiatives.

Ministry of Communications & Information Technology (MOCIT), Government of India as the Executing Agency: The MOCIT is the executing agency for the project, and is responsible for the overall management including of planned results and for the use of UNDP funds.

Department of Information Technology (DIT), MOCIT has provided the necessary support in terms of ensuring State Government's collaboration in setting up an implementation team at the National Institute of SMART Governance (NISG), and in establishing linkages between the project and the broader ICT for development policy formulation processes.

National Institute for Smart Government (NISG) as the Implementing Agency: NISG is the main implementing agency for the ICTD project. UNDP (on behalf of MOCIT) has signed a Project Cooperation Agreement with NISG, defining the roles and reposonsibilities of both parties in implementation of ICTD project. NISG has supported MOCIT in the selection of the pilots, assessment, management, documentation and dissemination of lessons learnt to different groups, agencies and State Governments. NISG partnered with Government, private sector, advocacy groups, training institutions, NGOs, PRIs and other civil society groups in successful implementation of pilot initiatives.

NISG has received funds from UNDP based on the authorisation of MOCIT, and disbursed the same to project implementation partners in accordance with the contractual arrangements. NISG has also maintained accurate records and documents in respect of all expenditures incurred out of the funds made available by UNDP. NISG is responsible for effective monitoring of the implementation of the pilot projects and gathering of information from the project partners to provide consolidated project progress status to UNDO and MOCIT. NISG prepares quarterly consolidated financial report based on the inputs received from implementing partners and submits it to MOCIT for endorsement for further submission to UNDP.

NISG is also responsible for maintenance of complete and accurate records of equipments, supplies and other properties purchased with UNDP funds and for periodic physical verification.

However, the following are the key observations in the management audit reports (for year 2008 and 2009) pertaining to overall project management and monitoring role of NISG:

- Non maintenance of separate bank account to ensure compliance with UNDP guidelines and better monitoring of project funds.
- Non maintenance of separate records regarding source of fixed deposit leading to ambiguity in ascertaining whether the project



funds are kept in fixed deposit or in the saving bank account. This may lead to non credit of interest earned on project funds to the project funds.

- Under/ over utilization of project budget without approval of UNDP. Also no formal/ standard budget is available at NISG
- Non-submission or delay in submission of various reports required to be submitted to UNDP as per the Project Cooperation Agreement. Also, there are instances of non-submission or delay in submission of reports by project implementation partners.
- No physical verification of non-expendable properties. Also title over the assets lying with project implementation partner after closure of the project has not been undertaken.
- Charging of expenditure of another project to UNDP project funds without approval from UNDP/ DIT.
- Non completion of financial closure of completed final initiatives.
- Non maintenance of minutes/ documentation of some workshops/ meeting held during the course of the project.

6.2 Year-wise Expenditure Incurred on account of the ICTD Project

The Table 121 brings out the year-wise expenditure incurred on account of the project.

Year	UNDP Core	SIDA	Total
2003	769270.00	0	769270.00
2004	1096029.00	0	1096029.00
2005	805068.50	0	805068.50
2006	1527239.00	208873.49	1736113.00
2007	69397.14	247778.36	317175.50
2008	490898.00	(31539.94)	459358.10
2009	212522.00	69615.00	282137.00

Year	UNDP Core	SIDA	Total			
2010 ³	31160.00	0	31160.00			
Total	5001584.00	494726.91	5496311.00			
Table 121 Year-Wise Expenditure Figures on account of the Project						

Whereas the above represents the year-wise expenditure figures incurred on the project, the following sections represent the findings of the audit work done for the two years of 2008 and 2009.

6.3 Project Details and Management Audit Report of 2008

Project Title	ICT for Development
Executing Agency	Ministry of Communication and Information Technology
Implementation Partner	National Institute of Smart Governance
Start Date	October 1, 2003
Estimated End date	June 30, 2009
Funding Agency	United Nations Development Programmes SIDA
Budgeted	UNDP- INR 4,50,55,843.00
Expenditure	SIDA- INR 1,03,25,000.00

Table 122 ICTD Project Details at a Glance

The auditors reviewed the operations of the project for the year 2008 period covering the following areas:

- Financial Management
- Institutional Arrangement, Project Progress and Rate of Delivery
- Procurement of Goods and Services



 $^{^{\}rm 3}$ Figures for the year 2010 are only budgeted figures and are not actual expenditure incurred.

- Human Resources Selection and Administration
- Management and use of equipment / inventory
- Asset Management
- Record keeping Systems and General Administration and Information System
- Management Structure
- Follow Up Action Plan

6.3.1 Auditor's Comments (Year 2008)

Table 123 brings out the Auditor's comment on each of the above parameters

Name of the Criteria	Auditor's Comment
Financial Management	 No separate Bank Account was being maintained in respect of the project funds. Since the Implementation Partner (IP) had not maintained the records regarding the source of Fixed Deposit, it was not clear whether project funds were kept in the savings account or in Fixed Deposits. Further, no interest was credited to the SIDA Funds during the period under audit. IP has over / under utilized the various Budget Heads and has not obtained the approval from UNDP regarding such variances. IP has not submitted the Financial Reports in respect of SIDA Funds, Annual Progress Report and Annual Inventory Report to UNDP.
Project Progress and Rate of Delivery	IP had not received the various reports from the Sub Implementing Partners as per the agreement entered into with them.
Procurement	IP had not conducted the physical verification of

Name of the Criteria	Auditor's Comment
of Goods and Services	the assets procured out of the project funds during the period under audit.
Human Resources Selection and Administration	According to the audit work undertaken on the areas specified above, auditors were of the opinion that the overall rating of the functioning of the projects was satisfactory except audit issues mentioned in this table.
Record keeping Systems and General Administration and Information System	Many controls are operating effectively; however, opportunities exist to strengthen controls in a few key areas.

Table 123 Summary of Auditor's Comments for Year 2008

Deloitte

6.3.2 Utilisation of Funds (Year 2008)

Funds for the project have been sourced mainly from two sources

- UNDP Core Fund
- SIDA Fund

The utilisation of these funds is as follows for the year 2008 UNDP Core Fund

Type of Expenduture	Budgeted(in INR)	Actual(in INR)	Variation (in %)
Consultancy, Seminars and Workshops	890,000.00	650,147.00	26.95%
Documentation	2,100,000.00	2,239,707.00	(6.65%)



Type of Expenduture	Budgeted(in INR)	Actual(in INR)	Variation (in %)
Pilot Initiatives	38,265,843.00	30,004,657.00	21.59%
Project Management	2,300,000.00	3,348,265.00	(45.58%)
Training ICTD	200,000.00		100.00%
Monitoring and Evaluation	1,300,000.00	1,387,594.00	(6.74%)
Total	45,055,843.00	37,630,370.00	

Table 124 Utilisation of UNDP Core Funds, 2008

SIDA Fund

Type of Expenduture	Budgeted(in INR)	Actual(in INR)	Variation (in %)
Pilot Initiatives	9,400,000.00	5,450,000.00	42.02%
Project Management	675,000.00	160,968.00	76.15%
Monitoring and Evaluation	250,000.00	250,000.00	
Total	10,325,000.00	5,860,968.00	

Table 125 Utilisation of SIDA Funds, 2008

6.4 Project Details and Management Audit Report of 2008

Project Title	ICT for Development		
Executing Agency	Ministry of Communication and Information Technology		
Implementation Partner	National Institute of Smart Governance		
Start Date	October 1, 2003		
Estimated End date	June 30, 2009		

Funding Agency	United Nations Development Programmes SIDA
Budgeted Expenditure	US \$ 245,269.00
Actual Expenditure	US \$ 282,137.45

The auditors reviewed the operations of the project for the year 2008 period covering the following areas:

- Financial Management
- Institutional Arrangement, Project Progress and Rate of Delivery
- Procurement of Goods and Services
- Human Resources Selection and Administration
- Management and use of equipment / inventory
- Asset Management
- Record keeping Systems and General Administration and Information System
- Management Structure
- Follow Up Action Plan

6.4.1 Auditor's Comments (Year 2009)

Table 126 brings out the Auditor's comment on each of the above parameters.

Name of the Criteria	Auditor's Comments
Financial Management	 Separate bank account was not being maintained Interest earned on the bank account was not credited to the funds Advance to NISG was recorded as expenditure in Combined Delivery Report Expenditure of SIDA project was charged to UNDP Core funds without approval from UNDP / DIT





Name of the Criteria	Auditor's Comments		
	 No standard budget was available at NISG level There was variance between budget and actual expenditure 		
Institutional Arrangement, Project Progress and Rate of Delivery	 There was non submission / delay in submission of various reports There was non receipt / delay in receipt of reports from sub implementing partners Financial closure of pilot initiatives was not completed There was non-maintenance of minutes / documentation of workshops / meetings held 		
Procurement of Goods and Services	No Observation		
Human Resources Selection and Administration	No Observation		
Asset Management	 Transfer of title over assets lying with sub implementing partners not undertaken after the closure of project Physical verification of non expendable properties not undertaken Transfer of title over assets lying with implementing partner not undertaken 		
General Administration	No Observation		
Information System	No Observation		
Follow Up	No Observation		

Name of the Criteria	Auditor's Comments	
Action Plan		
6.4.2 Utilisatio	Table 126 Summary of Auditor's Comments for Year 2009 on of Funds	

Funds for the project have been sourced mainly from two sources

- UNDP Core Fund
- SIDA Fund

The utilisation of these funds is as follows for the year 2009.

UNDP Core Fund

Type of Expenduture	Amount Carried Over(in INR) ⁴	Actual(in INR)	Variation (in %)
Adjustment After Statutory Audit		14113.00	Not Available
Project Management		2167132.00	Not Available
Pilot Initiatives		9337000.00	Not Available
Consultancy Seminars and Workshops	17,943,595.00	1448003.00	Not Available
Training		0	Not Available
Documentation		164293.00	Not Available
Travel (Foreign)		1415794.00	Not Available
Contingency		23288.00	Not Available

⁴ This represents the amount carried over from the immediately preceding year. Moreover the item-wise budgetary allocation figures are not available (unlike for the year 2008) for this year.





Type of Expenduture	Amount Carried Over(in INR) ⁴	Actual(in INR)	Variation (in %)
Monitoring and Evaluation		216613.00	Not Available
UNDP Expenses		0	Not Available
Travel National (UNDP/DIT)		13702.00	Not Available
Total	17,943,595.00	14,799,938.00	
	Table	127 Utilisation of UNE	OP Core Funds, 2009

SIDA Fund

Type of Expenduture	Budgeted(in INR) ⁵	Actual(in INR)	Variation (in %)
Project Management	9,587,983.00	879,983.00	Not Available
Pilot Initiatives		8,708,000.00	Not Available
Total	9,587,983.00	9,587,983.00	
	Table 128 Utilisation of SIDA Funds, 2009		

Limitation of the Study

For neither of the two years 2008 and 2009 project-wise budgeted and actual expenditure figures were available and have accordingly not been represented in this report.

6.5 Financial Analysis of the Project Expenditure

The overall budget of UNDP for ICTD project was USD 5 million. Figure 74 illustrates allocation of budget under various categories of expenditures/ outcomes.

A total of USD 5,001,584 has been spent by UNDP on this project including a budgeted amount of USD 31,160 for the year 2010. The year-wise disbursement of project funds by UNDP is provided in Figure 72.

A high level analysis of actual project expenditure based on utilization certificates for year 2008 and 2009 reveals that:

• Approx. 74% of the total project funding has been spent on actual implementation of pilot initiatives across 19 projects. It encompassing creation of infrastructure, capacity building of the citizens and other project activities. However according to the budget allocation 92% of the project fund was envisaged to be



Figure 70 Year-Wise Amount Disbursed on the Project



⁵ This represents the amount carried over from the immediately preceding year. Moreover the item-wise budgetary allocation figures are not available (unlike for the year 2008) for this year.

spent on pilot initiatives including development of solutions and applications.

- Approx. 10% of the total project funding has been spent on project management activities including fee of the implementing partners. However, project management personnel cost was budgeted at 2% of the total project funds.
- Expenditure on consultancy and seminars accounts for approx. 4% of the total project funding. It covers expenses incurred on organizing various workshop/ seminars to facilitate project implementing agencies in effective execution of projects. The actual expenditure is in excess of 2% of the project funds originally planned to be spent on multi-stakeholders consultation.
- Actual expenses on project documentation accounted for 4% of the project funds as against the planned expenses of 2% of the project funds.
- Monitoring and evaluation accounted for 3% of the project expenditure as against the budgeted amount of 2% of the project funds.
- Foreign travel accounted for 6% of the overall project expenditure, although the same has not been specifically budgeted.







The above analysis is based on expenditure pattern as revealed by the utilization certificates for the year 2008 and 2009.


7. Annexure I: Terms of Reference for the Evaluation

	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory			
RELEVANCE									
Needs of the beneficiary captured	 In ADDITION to the Satisfactory measures: Analysis: to make the beneficiary needs a part of project objectives / targets / goals Mode: ALSO experts in the field (beneficiary wise) contacted to get more deep understanding of the needs of the beneficiary segments Coverage: Follow-ups for need identification conducted for capture new / upcoming needs. 	 Coverage: Needs of All Possible beneficiary groups captured Mode: Formal procedure (such as questionnaire, meetings, discussion forums, etc.) followed. Also Government reports / Expert's reports, Sector analysis reports and other relevant documents referred. Documentation: Needs (including minutes) formally documented and reviewed by beneficiary groups 	 Coverage: Needs of major beneficiary groups captured Mode: Formal procedure (such as questionnaire, meetings, discussion forums, etc.) followed to capture needs Documentation Needs (including minutes) formally documented 	 Coverage: Needs of few of the major beneficiary groups captured Mode: Formal procedures (such as questionnaire, meetings, discussion forums, etc.) followed to capture needs Documentation: Needs (including minutes) formally documented 	 Coverage: Needs of few of the beneficiary groups captured Mode: Mostly informal procedure used to capture needs Documentati on: No formal documentatio n of needs prepared 	 No effort put towards capturing beneficiary needs - formally/in- formally for any beneficiary group 			
Relevant to needs & expectations of beneficiary	In ADDITION to the Satisfactory measures: • Project suitable & capable to	• Beneficiary need & Project objective correlation: Project objectives capture key	• Beneficiary need & Project objective correlation:	• Beneficiary need & Project objective correlation: Project objectives capture	• Design to capture needs: Project	 Project designed and conceptualize d without 			



	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory
	incorporate new or up-coming needs / expectations of beneficiaries even during execution period	 needs and expectations (at-least more than 80% needs) Design to capture needs: Project designed to cater to key needs & expectations Beneficiary segments: Objectives and design captures needs of ALL beneficiary segments 	 Project objectives capture key needs and expectations (at-least more than 60% needs) Design to capture needs: Project designed to cater to key needs & expectations Beneficiary segments: Objectives and design captures needs of major beneficiary segments 	some needs & expectations of the • Design to capture needs: Project designed to cater to few important needs & expectations • Beneficiary segments: Objectives and design captures needs of few beneficiary segments	designed to cater to some needs & expectations	considering the actual needs and expectations of beneficiaries
Relevant to development priorities of Govt. of India	• Project designed to meet or contribute towards development priorities identified in Govt. of India's 5 year plan	 Project designed to meet and fully aligned towards development priorities identified in Govt. of India's current (or the project inception year's) budget 	 Project designed to partially align towards development priorities identified in Govt. of India's current (or the 	• Does not meet / align towards developmental priorities but designed for same sectors	 Project designed to partially align towards development priorities identified in Govt. of India's 	• Project does- not aligns to any of the development priorities of Govt. of India





	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory
			project inception year's) budget		current (or the project inception year's) budget	
Relevant to development priorities of concerned State Government	• Project designed to meet or contribute towards development priorities identified in State Govt.'s 5 year plan	• Project designed to meet and fully aligned towards development priorities identified in State Govt.'s current (or the project inception year's) budget	• Project designed to partially align towards development priorities identified in State Govt.'s current (or the project inception year's) budget	• Does not meet / align towards developmental priorities but designed for some sectors	 Project designed to partially align towards development priorities identified in State Govt.'s current (or the project inception year's) budget 	• Project does- not align with any of the development priorities of State Govt.
Relevant to UNDP four focal theme	• Completely meeting satisfactory parameters for more than one themes	 Aligned to themes: Aligned to at-least one of the themes Degree of alignment: Targeting and gearing to achieve all the objectives and aims of the theme 	 Aligned to themes: Aligned to at- least one of the themes Degree of alignment: Targeted to achieve all but actual working seems to meet 	 Aligned to themes: Aligned to at-least one of the themes Degree of alignment: Targeted to achieve all but achieving less 50% of the objectives / aims of the theme(s) 	 Aligned to themes: Slightly aligned to one of the themes Degree of alignment: Targeted to achieve 30% of the 	 Aligned to themes: Not aligned to any of the four themes; OR Degree of alignment: aligned to a theme during conceptualizat ion/ project



	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory
			less 75% of the objectives / aims of the theme(s)		theme's objectives/ai ms but actually achieving even less	inception but actual working does not aligns to the theme
Identified problem has high incidence in area of focus	In addition to the satisfactory data: • Problem affecting vulnerable groups in other parts of the State / Country; And / Or • Affected individuals: More than 75% individuals of the vulnerable group affected in last 3-5 years	 Incidence: Continuously high / frequent incidences reported in the area of focus for more than 5 years. Affected individuals: 40% or more (estimated) individuals of the target vulnerable group affect with the problem over past few years Reliability of data: Figures based on Govt. records / reliable research studies and/or on incidences reported directly by the target vulnerable group and/or commonly known problem but no official records available. 	 Incidence: Continuously high / significant number of incidences every month in the area. Affected individuals: 30% or more (estimated) individuals of the target vulnerable group affect with the problem over past few years Reliability of data: Figures based on Govt. records / reliable 	 Incidence: Significantly high /few incidences every month in the area for more than 5 years. Affected individuals: 30% or more (estimated) individuals of the target vulnerable group affect with the problem over past few years Reliability of data: No documented record available but substantiated by reliable persons of the area. 	 Incidence: Few cases reported now and then. Affected individuals: restricted to few individuals of the vulnerable group Reliability of data: No data / reports / comments of reliable persons available to substantiate the incidence level. 	 Incidence: Rare cases of reporting of such incidence in the area. Affected individuals: the phenomenon restricted to few individuals of the vulnerable group Reliability of data: No data / reports / comments of reliable persons available to substantiate the incidence level.





	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory
			research studies and/or on incidences reported directly by the target vulnerable group.			
Correct & accurate identification of target stakeholders and/or correctly defined vulnerable groups		 Stakeholder identification: Scientific tools for segmentation & targeting and sample size calculation used Stakeholder definition: a precise and comprehensive definition for stakeholders available 	 Stakeholder identification: some kind of segmentation & targeting of beneficiary done Stakeholder definition: no formal definition available but certain general indicators available to identify individuals as part of the stakeholder group 	 Stakeholder identification: No formal exercise done but stakeholder groups identified during project conceptualization by interacting within and outside the project team Stakeholder definition: no formal definition available but certain general indicators available (documented) to identify individuals as part of the stakeholder group 	 Stakeholder identificatio n: Common sense / general understandin g used to classify and identify stakeholders Stakeholder definition: no definition / indicators available (documented) to identify individuals as part of the stakeholder group 	• Stakeholder identification : No effort out towards identification



	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory
Adequacy of Government commitment to project	 In addition to the satisfactory parameters: The Project formally included as part of Govt. machinery / structure; OR Dedicated officials / agency assigned to assist the project; OR Special provisions made for the project implementation and success; 	 Financial assistance: Grants / loans / gifts or other assistances - with financial implications - provided / committed by Govt. for the project; and Technical assistance: Technical expertise and / or personnel provided / committed by the Govt. for the project; and Coordination/ motivational support provided as and when required 	 Either of Financial or Technical assistance provided by the Govt. Coordination / motivational assistance also provided 	• Coordination assistance: Government assists as and when some coordination is required with other agencies	 Interaction with Government just for information / updation purpose 	• No interaction with Government regarding the project
Project relevance to ICT4D focus under the project	In addition to the satisfactory parameters: • ICT usage results in significant scale of a) earning / learning potential 'OR' b) better management / operation of existing work 'OR' c) radically improved way of accessing information / resources for a	 ICT4D focus: ICT tools being used in the project targeted towards development of beneficiary group Development potential: significant improvement / development of majority of members of the beneficiary group - such as information availability, access of 	 ICT 4D focus: ICT tools being used in the project targeted towards development of beneficiary group Development potential: marginal improvement / 	 ICT being used just for the sake of use by the beneficiary group with no developmental implications Development potential: marginal improvement / development and that too just for a minority section of the beneficiary 	 ICT being used but with no direct impact on the development of the targeted beneficiary group or just for internal administrativ e purposes 	• ICT not being used at all for the project implementatio n



	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory		
	majority section of the targeted beneficiary group	resources and / or services including Govt. services	development of majority section of the beneficiary group 'OR' significant development of a minority section of the group	group				
EFFECTIVENESS								
Problem been stated correctly and distinctly	In addition of the satisfactory parameters: • Problems are defined in such a manner that they are mutually exclusive but collectively exhaustive.	 Problem identification: Scientific method of problem identification used. Problem definition: Problem clearly defined with no or little scope of misunderstanding Problem validation: Formal validation of problem definition from experts and from the targeted beneficiary groups 	 Problem identification: Generally acceptable method of problem identification used. Problem definition: Problem clearly defined however scope of misunderstandin g exists Problem validation: 	 Problem identification: Problem identified through discussion with few members of stakeholder groups Problem definition: Problem definition: Problem document but not defined clearly and comprehensively Problem validation: No problem validation or informal problem validation 	 Problem identificatio n: Problem identified either by the project team itself or through informal discussion with few stakeholders. Problem definition: Problem not defined and documented properly 	 No formal process adopted to identify problem Problem not defined anywhere 		



	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory
			Informal validation of problem definition from experts and from the targeted beneficiary groups		• Problem validation: No validation done	
Nodal agencies, operational partners, beneficiaries, users of the project are identified as stakeholders of the project	In addition to satisfactory parameters: • Roles and responsibilities and other details of each stakeholder group also identified • Interaction and needs of each stakeholder group identified	• Beneficiaries, users, operational partners and nodal agencies identified as stakeholders	• Beneficiaries, users and operational partners identified as stakeholders	• Beneficiaries as well as users identified as stakeholders	• Only beneficiaries identified as the stakeholders	• No stakeholder group identified
The assumptions, objectives, outputs and outcomes have been clearly articulated in measurable terms	In addition to satisfactory parameters: • Time bound targets specified for each measurement parameter • Scenario based targets defined i.e.	• Identification: Objectives and outcomes identified and defined in a very clear and unambiguous manner. All possible assumptions clearly articulated along with their impacts on	• Identification: Objectives and outcomes identified and defined in a clear and unambiguous manner. All assumptions	 Identification: Vague objectives and outcomes identified. Certain assumption articulated. Measurement model: Subjective measurement terms 	 Identificatio Nague definitions and objectives and outcomes identified Measuremen t model: No 	• Project objectives, outputs, outcomes and assumption not articulated at all



	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory
	targets defined for all possibilities of conversion of assumptions into reality	outcomes. • Measurement model: Objective measurement terms defined clearly with targets	articulated but impact is not clearly articulated • Measurement model: Measurement terms through objective but with certain degree of subjectivity involved	/ model	measurement model or target identified	
The linkages between objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, expected outcomes and impact was clear	 In addition to the satisfactory parameters: Clear presentation of the linkages available Impact of each one on the other is clearly thought of and presented 	• Logical linkages present and defined properly	• Logical linkages present but not documented	• Linkages present but not apparent	 Linkage between them is absolutely absent 	 Objectives, inputs, activities, outputs, outcomes and impact not defined
The project design allowed for flexibility in responding to changes in the project environment.	• Project design capable of adapting to and responding all possible types of changes, positively without deviating from the core	• Project design capable of adapting to and responding positively to most of the possible types of changes.	• Project design capable of modifying but only for certain not critical and small changes in the	• Project design quite rigid with little or no possibility of incorporating changes in environment	• Project design available but at a rudimentary stage	 Project design not available



	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory
	objectives.		environment. May not be able to adopt for bigger changes.			
Degree of support given by the Government towards integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme and other related projects	• Govt. proposing to start a nationwide (sector specific) program on the basis of or inspired from the project.	 Govt. inclined towards integrating the project objectives, goals and concept into related programme and / or projects at National level; OR Govt. proposing to start a Statewide (sector specific) program on the basis of or inspired from the project. 	 Govt. inclined towards integrating the project objectives and goals into related programme and / or projects at State level; OR Govt. inclined towards integrating certain portion of project objectives, goals and concept into related programme and / or projects at National level; 	• Govt. inclined towards integrating the project objectives and goals into related programme and / or projects at local level (within district)	 Project objectives and goals not worthy enough for the Government to integrate them at any level. 	• No support and interaction with Government
Planning component of the project take into account the use	In addition to satisfactory parameters;	• Level of ICT usage planned: Advanced level of ICT usage	• Level of ICT usage planned: Advanced level	• Level of ICT usage planned: Certain level of to improve	• Preliminary level of ICT usage	• Preliminary level of ICT usage planned





	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory
of ICT for improved governance / service delivery in various areas through pilot initiatives, encouraging BPR, development local solutions and applications and encouragement of PPP model	 Level of ICT usage planned: highly sophisticated ICT applications and tools planned. Localization of solution: However such advanced ICT tools are planned to be user friendly and easy in handling for local users. BPR: In-depth BPR to improve the convenience of users, reduce time & effort drastically, make available information & service any-time to anybody from any- where - practically PPP: PPP model ensure sustainability of the initiative 	 planned. Localization of solution: Advanced degree of localization planned such as touch screens for illiterates, community radio in local languages etc. BPR: Proper BPR exercise to improve governance and service delivery PPP: PPP model planned 	of ICT usage planned. • Localization of solution: Certain degree of localization planned such as use of local language. • BPR: e- enablement of existing processes / delivery mechanism • PPP: no PPP model planned	governance / service delivery. • Localization of solution: No planning towards localization or pilot testing done.	planned for improving governance and / or service delivery	and that too not towards improving governance and service delivery but just as administrative and communicatio n tool
The adequacy of institutional arrangements in attaining the long- term objective of the project. Also the	 In addition to the satisfactory parameters, adequacy of arrangement to handle cases of 	 Infrastructure arrangement adequate for the entire planned duration 	 Infrastructure arrangement adequate atleast for near future 	 Infrastructure arrangement adequate atleast for immediate requirement of the project 	 Partial infrastructure arrangement atleast for immediate requirement 	 Infrastructure arrangement not adequate not even for immediate requirements





	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory
infrastructural, logistical, and financial implication of sustaining the project objectives beyond the project duration/after completion of UNDP funding.	additional requirements / project extension				of the project	
Result Based Management (RBM) and performance indicators have been used as project management tools	 In addition to satisfactory parameters: RBM used at periodic intervals to modify project design and execution to improve performance 	 Performance indicators: Comprehensive, unambiguous, measurable indicators defined RBM: Advanced RBM available 	 Performance indicators: Comprehensive set of indicators which are clear and specific RBM: Fundamental RBM available 	Performance indicators: Clear and specific performance indicators but not comprehensive enough to cover all areas of performance	• Performance indicators: Wispy performance indicators available	• No RBM and performance indicators available
Project's linkages, liaison, coordination and impact upon related activities under NeGP being implemented in the country.	• Becomes a part of the infrastructure / system of NeGP and directly contributes in achieving NeGP's goals and objectives.	 Aligned to the objectives, concept and schema of NeGP. Uses NeGP infrastructure / systems for achieving its own goal and also contributes / assists NeGP in achieving its goals. 	 Aligned to the objectives, concept and schema of NeGP. Uses NeGP infrastructure / systems for achieving its goal. 	• Weak linkage with NeGP.	• Remotely aligned with NeGP but has no impact on its activities	• No relation or linkage with NeGP
The project's	• Project is designed in	• Use both the pre-	• Use both the	• Uses both the pre-	• Uses either of	• Does not



	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory
assistance, relationship, relevance to and coordination with the pre-existing Project management system and staff	a way that it incorporates the pre- existing management system and staff in best possible ways for overall effectiveness. It uses the capabilities of staff and the system without over- burdening them and as per their improved skill sets.	existing management system as well as staff effectively and coordinates with them effectively.	pre-existing management system as well as staff effectively but does not contributes towards the pre-existing cause.	existing management system as well as staff but over- burdens them or uses them ineffectively	the pre- existing management system or staff	considers the pre-existing management system and staff
Clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various institutional arrangements for overall programme management and implementation and the level of coordination between relevant players	• Roles and responsibilities of all the institutional arrangements defined, in a formal and legally binding manner	• Roles and responsibilities of all the institutional arrangements defined, in a formal manner	• Roles and responsibilities of only the major institutional arrangements defined, in a formal manner	• Roles and responsibilities of only the major institutional arrangements defined however in an informal manner	 Roles were identified, informally, for major institutional arrangements however detailed responsibiliti es were not defined 	• No clear roles and responsibilitie s defined at any stage of the project
Risk assessment and management of the project	• Periodic risk assessment and mitigation planned followed to manage risks.	 Proper risk assessment done periodically during the entire project duration. Risk mitigation planned 	 Proper risk assessment done periodically during the 	• Proper risk assessment done - once during the entire project duration.	• Sketchy risk assessment done -once during the entire	• No risk assessment done



	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory
		to manage risk	entire project duration. • Risk mitigation planned to certain extend		project duration	
Describe and assess efforts of stakeholders in support of the implementation of the project	In addition to the satisfactory parameters: • In-depth effort analysis performed periodically to analyze the efforts and performance of each stakeholder (at- least the main stakeholders)	 Description: Description of roles and responsibilities of all stakeholders available Effort assessment: Assessment of efforts of all stakeholders done through formal procedure 	 Description: Description of roles and responsibilities of all stakeholders available Effort assessment: Some basic assessment of effort put in by few stakeholders done through informal procedure 	 Description: Description of roles and responsibilities of few stakeholders available Effort assessment: No assessment done 	 Description: Vague description of stakeholders roles and responsibiliti es available Effort assessment: No assessment done 	 Description: No documentatio n on the description of stakeholders roles and responsibilitie s Effort assessment: No assessment done
Extent of conflict of interest either between stakeholders involved in the project or with outside agencies.	• No conflict of interest involved - the roles, responsibility, functions, benefits, profile, requirement etc. corresponding to	 No conflict of interest involved Procedure available to handle exceptions 	 Certain degree of conflict of interest may be present. Basic procedure to handle exceptions 	• Conflict of interest may have arisen couple of times but sorted down after discussions between stakeholders	Many conflict of interest identified during the course of project development	• Many conflict of interest identified during the course of project development





	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory		
	 each stakeholder is well defined and agreed upon. Well documented procedure for handling any exceptions is available 		present		and implementati on but sorted down after discussions between stakeholders	and implementatio n. No procedure to handle the conflict of interest situations.		
EFFICIENCY								
Was a formal workplan made at the start of the project to determine the timeframe in which activities would be performed	In addition to the satisfactory parameters: • Activities further broke down into smallest possible activities and date wise timelines defined for all of these	 Detailed workplan prepared for all activities along with the resources responsible for performing the activities. Date wise timelines defined for each activity Gannt chart (or similar work plan charts) also prepared for better visual impact and monitoring 	 A detailed workplan prepared for all the activities to be performed. Timelines (week / month level) defined for each activity Gannt chart also prepared advanced understanding and analysis 	• Workplan prepared for Level 1 activities and time period required to complete the activities defined	• Basic workplan for broad level milestone prepared	• No workplan was made		
Were resources made available to the project implementation agencies in accordance with the	In addition to the satisfactory parameters, • Additional resources provided to the project in accordance	• 100% resource requirement as per workplan provided to the project implementation	• Less than 15% resource requirement as per workplan not fulfilled	• Less than 30% resource requirement as per workplan not fulfilled	• More than 450% resource requirement as per workplan not	• More than 60% resource requirement as per workplan not fulfilled		





	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory
requirements of the workplan	with new requirements / change in project environment. • Backup resources kept ready for exigency cases				fulfilled	
Extent of deviation in the project implementation in so far as timelines is concerned.	 Project implementation running before schedule; OR At-least 100% adherence to work plan 	 Project implementation delayed by less than 10% of overall duration; OR Broad milestones being achieved but delay of more than 10% in few sub-activities 	 Project implementation delayed by less than 20% of overall duration; OR Broad milestones being achieved but delay of more than 20% in few sub-activities 	• Project implementation delayed by more than 20% of overall duration	• Work plan not adhered to during project implementati on	• Actual implementatio n independent of work plan
Responsiveness of the project management to such deviations and flexibility to deploy resources	• Pro-active measures by management to identify and rectify delay well in advance	• Management taking necessary steps to reduce the delay by bring in additional resources, doing parallel work, or other corrective measures	• Management taking some steps in terms of extra resources (time and effort) to somehow correct the	• Delayed identified but no corrective response from the management	 Management though interested / willing to but not able to measuring the implementati 	• Management not even remotely interested in managing implementatio n timelines





	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory
			course of implementation		on performance w.r.t. work plan	
Were any systems, processes, manuals etc made to govern the activities in the project among the different stakeholders	 In addition to the satisfactory parameters: Act, rules, legally bounding guidelines, etc. available to govern the activities A governing structure within the project team to solve any type of operational conflicts or issues 	 Availability & quality: Clear, unambiguous and comprehensive set of instructions in form of a written document. Accessibility: Easy accessibility of the document to all relevant stakeholders 	 Availability & quality: Though instructions are clear and specific but not comprehensive. Accessibility: Easy accessibility of the document to select few only 	 Availability & quality: Vague instructions available to govern the project activities Accessibility: Accessibility of the document to all stakeholders is not easy and 	• Availability: No standard governing manual / record however some kind of institutional framework available for governing the activities	• No governing manual (written or otherwise) available
Extent to which roles and responsibilities of different stakeholders participating in the project were made clear during the implementation	• Roles and responsibilities of all the stakeholders defined, in a formal and legally binding manner	• Roles and responsibilities of all the stakeholders defined, in a formal manner	• Roles and responsibilities of only the major stakeholders defined, in a formal manner	• Roles and responsibilities of only the major stakeholders defined however in an informal manner	 Roles were identified, informally, for major stakeholders however detailed responsibiliti es were not defined 	 No clear roles and responsibilities defined at any stage of the project
Extent to which Results Based Management has	• Stage wise, stakeholder based RBM used. RBM being	• Continuous RBM under usage i.e. at every stage, milestone etc.	• RBM being used at a preliminary stage only after	• Results being measured at the end of the project	 Results being measured however not 	 No system available to measure



	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory
been used	used as an important tool for making management decisions		key milestones	implementation when the scope of using them for better management is quite insignificant	utilized for taking any management decision	results available
Whether there was adequacy of steps taken to resolve any conflict of interest in or due to the project	• In addition to Satisfactory parameters, steps taken to reduce chances of future occurrences of such conflict of interest situations	• Adequate steps taken at right time to resolve all conflict of interest situations	• Partial resolve of conflict of interest situations	• Inadequate steps taken to resolve certain conflict of interest situations	• Conflict of interest identified but no steps what-so-ever taken to address them	• No mechanism to identify conflict of interest in or due to the project
Extent to which already available resources have been deployed (people, infrastructure, equipments etc)	 In addition to the satisfactory parameters, available resources upgraded where ever possible to fulfill the requirements of the project 	• Efficient deployment of available resources based on their availability, skills and capabilities	• Deployment of a portion of available resources as per their skills and capability	• Available resource deployed to fill the gaps but not in a manner to utilize them efficiently	• Available resource deployed in an unplanned manner	• No resource management; haphazard resource deployment
Extent of participation of the government in the project	 In addition to the satisfactory parameters, Government ownership is also present 	• Participation of Government in technical and financial support	• Limited participation of the Government mainly in terms of coordination, approval or information purposes	• Limited participation of Government mainly to oversee that it does not results in any undesired effects on the community	 Government aware but no interaction with them for conceptualiz ation, development 	Government not even aware of the project





	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory			
					or implementati on				
	RESULTS/IMPACTS								
Whether the project has produced its desired immediate outputs	• All of the desired immediate outputs of the project have been achieved	• More than 90% of immediate outputs achieved including all the major outputs	• At-least all major outputs achieved however the overall output achievement is less than 75%	• Less than 50% of immediate outputs achieved	• Less than 80% of immediate outputs achieved	Immediate outputs not even measured			
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, use of the new outputs as against the traditional options)	 Most of the intended beneficiaries permanently started utilized project output instead of traditional options 	 Most of the intended beneficiaries used the project output in more than 75% cases and in 25% or less cases used traditional options 	• Most of the intended beneficiaries utilized the project output in more than 50% cases where they needed similar service	• Few beneficiaries utilized the output once however again started using the traditional options	• None of the beneficiaries have utilized the project output	 Intended beneficiaries not even aware about the project outputs 			
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by the intended beneficiaries (that is, percentage of the target population)	• Almost 100% of the intended beneficiaries utilized the project output	• More than 75% of the intended beneficiaries utilized the project output	• About 50% of the intended beneficiaries utilized the project output	• Less than 30% of the intended beneficiaries utilized the project output	 Less than 10% of the intended beneficiaries utilized the project output 	• None of the intended beneficiaries utilized the project output			



	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory
Extent of drop-outs from usage of the outputs by the intended beneficiaries	• No drop-out from usage of outputs by the intended beneficiaries	• Less than 25% drop-out from usage of outputs by the intended beneficiaries	• Less than 50% drop-out from usage of outputs by the intended beneficiaries	• More than 75% drop- out from usage of outputs by the intended beneficiaries	• 100% drop- out from usage of outputs by the intended beneficiaries	• None of the intended beneficiaries utilized the project output
Are there any unforeseen/ unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups	• No unforeseen negative effect caused however few unforeseen positive effects noticed	• No unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups	• Few insignificant unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups	• Certain insignificant unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups	• Significant unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups	 Lots of significantly large unintended effects caused by the project on the target groups
Extent of the project results on the target beneficiaries in terms of (a) Citizen-Centric Service Delivery, (b) Capacity Building, (c) Change Management, (d) Business Process Re-engineering, (e) Public Private Partnership, (f) Bridging the Digital Divide, and (g) Knowledge and Experience Sharing	• All the seven areas are relevant to the project and excellence has been achieved for each one of them	• Of all the areas relevant to the project, excellence has been achieved in 90% of the cases	• Of all the areas relevant to the project, excellence has been achieved in 75% of the cases	• Significant deficiencies identified in 30% of the areas that are relevant to the project	• Significant deficiencies identified in 50% of the areas that are relevant to the project	• Significant deficiencies identified in 75% of the areas that are relevant to the project





	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory
Extent of the project impact on the target groups in terms of (a) governance (improved efficiency, transparency and accountability), (b) citizen-centric service delivery (advantages of cost, time and convenience), (c) rural livelihoods (number of jobs, extent and sufficiency of employment), and (d) women's empowerment (increased knowledge, and use of the same to voice their concerns).	• All the four areas are relevant to the project and excellence has been achieved for each one of them	• Of all the areas relevant to the project, excellence has been achieved in 90% of the cases	• Of all the areas relevant to the project, excellence has been achieved in 75% of the cases	• Significant deficiencies identified in 30% of the areas that are relevant to the project	 Significant deficiencies identified in 50% of the areas that are relevant to the project 	• Significant deficiencies identified in 75% of the areas that are relevant to the project
Extent of significance of the project impact on the development of the region/country	• Significant development of not only the region of implementation but other parts of the country as well	• Significant development of a region	• Significant development of a specific community / sub-region	• Contribution to marginal development of the region as well as country	 Contribution to marginal development of the region 	• No impact on the development of the region or country



	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory
Extent of utilization of the project outputs by marginalized communities	• Most of the marginalized communities permanently started utilized project output instead of traditional options	• Most of the marginalized communities used the project output in more than 75% cases and in 25% or less cases used traditional options	• Most of the marginalized communities utilized the project output in more than 50% cases where they needed similar service	• Few marginalized communities utilized the output once however again started using the traditional options	• None of the marginalized communities have utilized the project output	• Marginalized communities not even aware about the project outputs
Extent to which capacities have been built in stakeholders during the project	• Multi-tasking capacities have been built-up in stakeholders during the project, in order to perform tasks even in case of unavailability of the primary responsible stakeholder	• Capacities of all stakeholders build up to perform activities assigned to / expected of them	 Capacities of most of the stakeholders (atleast the main stakeholders) built up to atleast perform the necessary activities assigned to / expected of them 	• Capacities of few stakeholders built up however it may not be upto the level to enable them to perform the necessary activities assigned to / expected of them	 Inadequate capacity build up that too only for for few stakeholders 	• Capacities of none of the stakeholders built up
		SUSTA	INABILITY			
Extent of ownership of stakeholders in the project	• Complete ownership of all the stakeholders in the project	• Complete ownership of all the 'implementing and operating' stakeholders in the project	• Ownership of all the 'implementing' stakeholders in the project	• Ownership of only a handful of stakeholders	 Partial ownership of few stakeholders 	• No ownership of the stakeholders in the project





	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory
Degree of support given by the Government in integrating the project objectives and goals into the national development programme	• Project objectives and goals upgraded as new line items in national development programme	• Project objectives and goals completely adopted in an existing item on national development programme	• Project objectives and goals partially adopted in existing item on national development programme	• Government considering to adopt a small portion of the project objective and goals in the national development programme	 Project objectives and goals not considered worthy or becoming a part of national development programme 	 Project objectives not aligned to Government development program
Extent of availability of inputs/resources required for the project (people, finances, infrastructure, equipments)	 In addition to the satisfactory parameters, commitment available for providing resources in case of additional requirements / project extension 	• Resources or commitment available for the entire planned duration	• Resources or commitment available atleast for near future	• Resources available atleast for immediate requirement of the project	• Partial availability atleast for immediate requirement of the project	• Resources not available even for immediate requirements
Have any revenue streams been defined in the project to make it self- sustaining	 In addition to satisfactory parameters, innovative revenue generation possibilities also designed 	• Revenue stream defined with proper basis and justification with taking into consideration possible revenue generation scope	• Revenue stream defined however the possible areas have not been captured properly	• Revenue stream defined on unpractical / unachievable targets	• Revenue stream defined but without any basis or justification	• No defined revenue steam
Extent of success of such pre-defined revenue streams	• Achieving more than the target	• Achieving 100% of the target	• Achieving atleast 75% of the target	• Revenue stream achieving less than 50% of the target	• Revenue stream not yet started	No defined revenue steam





	Highly Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unsatisfactory
Extent to which inventory of the assets created out of the grants received in the project have been properly maintained and transferred to the beneficiaries	• In addition to the satisfactory parameters, proper plan to enhance the capacity of the assets for the use of beneficiaries	• Planned maintenance of the assets by well trained personnel.	• Unplanned maintenance of the assets however the assets are in good shape	• Asset maintenance is poor however no mechanism or planning to transfer them to the beneficiaries	 Assets maintenance is quite poor and the assets are not even expected to complete standard life span 	• Assets not even purchased yet
Degree of collaboration that has developed among stakeholders during the project	• Stakeholders have a very well managed and coordinated working and management relation between them	• Significant collaboration among stakeholders for operations as well as decision making related to the project	 Stakeholder collaboration is quite good in terms of already decided project operation however not for decision making 	 Some kind of mechanism of collaboration available but the actual collaboration between different stakeholders is significantly less 	• No formal collaboration mechanism present for the stakeholders to collaborate	• Stakeholders are not collaborating properly and have major conflicts between them
Extent to which government is willing to finance the project after its completion of the UNDP funding	• Government to take up the entire project and run it completely including its roll-out and extension	• Government to completely fund the entire future expenses of the current project	• Government to partially fund (atleast 50% of the expected future funding requirements) or make similar arrangements	 Government not to provide funds but provide some kind of incentive or subsidy for the project 	• Government funding limited to a one time grant (less than 30% of near future requirements)	• No possibility of Government funding





ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This assignment for us was actually a suite of 18 different assignments accounting for the 18 different projects that were to be terminally evaluated. Naturally, then, an exercise of these proportions could not have been completed without the cooperation of the stakeholders.

Thanks are due to all project stakeholders, in particular, to the project owners spread across the length and breadth of the country. Specifically, we would like to thank **Mr Amit Chakroborty** (Manager, Projects, National Institute of Smart Government), and **Mr Anil Belani** (Director, Department of Information Technology, Government of India) for their unwavering cooperation and support throughout the exercise. Thanks are also due to **Mr Skankar Aggarwal**, IAS, Joint Secretary, Department of Information Technology, Government of India, for his kind words of guidance during the presentation made to the DIT/UNDP in the course of this assignment. Thanks in equal measure are due to **Ms Prema Gera**, Assistant Country Director and Head, Poverty Unit, UNDP India, for her support right through the course of the assignment and in making available and sharing valuable lessons that UNDP had learnt on its other projects with similar persuasion.

Above all, the Deloitte team would like to thank **Mr Hari Mohan**, Programme Associate, Poverty Unit, UNDP India without whose cooperation and support, an exercise of this magnitude would not have been possible. Right from the beginning till the very end.









