



सत्यमेव जयते



50
YEARS

Empowered lives. Resilient nations.

Independent Mid-Term Review (2013-2015)

Country Programme Action Plan (2013-2017)
UNDP India





Independent Mid-Term Review (2013-2015)

Country Programme Action Plan (2013-2017)
UNDP India





Contents

1. Executive Summary of Findings & Recommendations	5
SECTION 1	9
2. Introduction	9
3. Summary of Methodology.....	10
4. Context.....	11
SECTION 2	12
5. CPAP Performance to Date (in the period 2013 – 2015).....	12
Outcome 1 - Poverty Reduction/Poverty Alleviation	13
Outcome 2 - Democratic Governance	14
Outcome 3 - Sustainable Development.....	15
Outcome 4 - Inclusion and Civil Society.....	18
CPAP Financing & Expenditure Overview	20
6. Partner Consultation & Assessment	21
SECTION 3	25
7. In Pursuit of Integrated Development Solutions	25
8. Critical Success Factors for Scalability	27
9. The Role of Development Support Services.....	30
SECTION 4	31
10. Conclusions	31
Annexes	33
A: Methodology.....	33
B: List of People Interviewed.....	35





1. Executive Summary of Findings & Recommendations

The MTR was conducted by an independent team under the guidance of the Department of Economic Affairs and UNDP. The eleven chief findings of this Mid-Term Review (MTR) are set out under two broad categories below. Four recommendations are within the short-term time horizon for UNDP consideration and a further seven suggestions relate to the medium to longer term.

SHORT-TERM OBSERVATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Overview of CPAP Progress 2013 – 2015

The first three years of the programme have witnessed good overall progress against the

Country Programme Action Plan (CPAP) outputs. UNDP is in a strong and trusted position in relation to its partnership with the Government of India. UNDP Country Office team, which has recently been through a restructuring process, has emerged stronger. Under a relatively new leadership team the UNDP office recognizes the requirement for ongoing incremental improvement that provides a consistent flow of scalable and integrated development solutions to be brought to the support of the Government. There is a solid and comprehensive programme of measures in place to achieve substantive outcomes in inclusive growth and poverty reduction, democratic governance, sustainable development, and gender

equality and inclusion, upon which further work can be built. Specific CPAP progress and detailed recommendations at the output level are set out in chapter 2.

2. Rapidly Changing Operating Context – 2013 - 2017

Since the 2013 – 2017 CPAP was designed there have been significant national and global developments. In May 2014 a new Government in India was elected and a series of new national priority programmes were launched. At the global level the September 2015 UN Development Summit in New York set out the new and ambitious 2030 Development Agenda incorporating 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). The preceding Financing for Development conference in Addis Ababa in July 2015 cemented a recasting of development financing away from traditional Official Development Assistance (ODA) towards domestic revenue generation and south-south cooperation. UNDPs own internal financial resources have also since diminished with the impact that the organization is no longer a significant 'donor' in the traditional sense, but rather a facilitator of development solutions, technical support and development knowledge management. The development discourse in India has also been more particularly directed towards scalability and final mile impact. The observations and recommendation of this MTR have attempted to take these changing circumstances into account.

3. Short-Term Considerations for Improved Project Governance

Results reporting on progress is strongest in GAVI and GEF financed projects. Whilst all of the projects included within the MTR demonstrated good levels of transparency and accountability

for results, the universal adoption of the UNDP standard format for results reporting would enable a completely harmonized approach to be taken. Whilst Project Steering Committees do meet at least annually, these platforms could be utilized for more effective stakeholder consultation, knowledge capture and dissemination of results, including for the early approval of the Annual Work Plan (AWP) at the commencement of the financial year. For those projects that have significant elements of procurement assistance, quarterly procurement and expenditure plans should be considered to improve efficiency and predictability in procurement and financial delivery.

4. South-South Cooperation

UNDP should continue to attach prominence to facilitating south-south cooperation platforms for knowledge exchange in key areas. These are greatly appreciated by all stakeholders since they offer a substantial contribution to learning, policy dialogue and to the identification of sustainable development solutions.

MEDIUM TO LONG-TERM OBSERVATIONS & RECOMMENDATIONS

5. UNDP as a Strategic Partner to India for SDG Attainment

Maintaining sustained and inclusive economic growth is one of the key challenges central to addressing growing inequalities. UNDP is well positioned to continue to assist at the national and state levels in the analysis of development challenges and in the promotion of comprehensive, integrated and inclusive development strategies and solutions. Within the context of the 2030 Development Agenda and in accordance with

UNDPs mandate, UNDP is in a strong position to provide lead support the Government of India attain its select SDG targets. Firstly, as a champion of 'leave no one behind' by 2030 and by strengthening its inclusive development and poverty reduction portfolio. Secondly, in providing lead UN support for the coordination and operationalization of the SDGs, in particular to support governance programmes contribution to the achievement of development results. Thirdly, through strengthened support in the Natural Resource Management (NRM), climate change and Disaster Response Management (DRM) arena. Aligned to national priorities, UNDP can further reinforce its support to Government for the identification, promotion and implementation of project scalability and final mile SDG impact.

6. 'Leave No-one Behind' – UNDP and Inclusive Development in India.

UNDP should give consideration to being the catalyst for a pan-UN social and economic inclusion programme. A combined advocacy and empowerment programme would be consistent with the 2030 Development Agenda and the pledge of all nations to 'leave no-one behind'. Further efforts should be made to also support the Government deepen its partnership with civil society that will enable inclusion and participation of a multitude of potentially marginalized and at risk groups of vulnerable poor. Such a programme would expand and learn from the valuable lessons and insights generated from the current approaches to HIV/AIDS, sex-workers, the transgender community, including scheduled tribal groups. With almost two full years before the commencement of the next UNDAF, time exists for the UN to consider, pilot, test and determine a unified position to supporting Government resolve to ensuring inclusive development and nationwide poverty alleviation by 2030.

7. Strengthening Programmatic Support in Democratic Governance for SDG Attainment

To improve coordination and coherence within the democratic governance pillar, the MTR recommends that consideration should be given to more closely aligning the projects in this part of the portfolio, even to the extent of streaming them into a single unified governance programme. Should this be actioned, it would lead to the adoption of a single AWP, bringing the various institutional strengthening approaches under one umbrella. Such an approach may also be more beneficial to Government counterparts and ensure that support for capacity building and development planning interventions, which helps to enable SDG attainment, is fully harmonized at the various tiers of Governance (National, State, District, Block, Panchayat). The oversight mechanism for the single governance programme would create the annual meeting of the governance Outcome Board, which would be a desirable mechanism to provide overall direction and leadership for development results in the whole governance sector.

8. UNDPs Contribution to Scalability and Final Mile Impact

Over successive programme cycles UNDP has brought a number of projects to scale in India, among them being the Human Development Report (HDR) methodology and DRM. There are other scalable project examples currently in the making, particularly in the steel and railways sectors. It is timely for UNDP to invest more heavily in these demonstration projects to bring them fully 'to scale' (see also point 9 immediately below). This will support the Government of India to adopt exemplar pilot initiatives and help drive them through all the stages of innovation, roll-out, scale-up, ultimately for nation-wide and final mile impact.

9. Managing the 'Knowledge Ecosystem' for Better Integrated, Scalable and Sustainable Development Solutions

The MTR more generally observed that the effect of UNDPs internal financial resources having diminished over recent years appears to be helping to transition the organization from being a traditional donor/development agency into an agency that supports the generation and promotion of integrated development solutions. As a result UNDP is becoming more creative and agile in terms of the application of its areas of comparative advantage and more conscious of the specific areas in which it brings added value to the Government's development agenda. To continue this transformation, UNDP should continue to reinforce its 'knowledge management ecosystem' to ensure the systematic documenting, consultation, reporting and learning that is required for the identification, intensification and upscaling of integrated development solutions. Projects which successfully demonstrate the integration of economic, social, environmental and institutional gains through the pursuit of development solutions will be especially prized since they offer the greatest overall impact and the potential for multiple SDG attainment. The MTR found a number of promising projects being cultivated in the NRM sector, where the fortunes of local populations and their natural environments are inextricably linked. The Energy and Environment unit has generated some very valuable insights in this respect - the Sindhurg Project in particular. The Tribal and Panchayat Projects are also potentially similar by design and provide further tremendous integrated development prospects. Approaches that adopt a more "commercial mindset" for calculating the multiplier effects and internal rates of return may prove helpful. In this way the real

tangible economic and social benefits arising from the investments made can be quantified, calculated and tracked.

10. Strategic Programme Design for Priority Development Results

The current CPAP has 63 indicators. In the next iteration of the CPAP consideration should be given to reducing the number of indicators to ensure greater focus on the highest national priorities, allied closely to the SDGs. Similarly, the following CPAP might consider focusing on a number of key areas where national programmes and multiple SDG impacts converge for greatest effect. Likewise, the annual Country Programme Management Board (CPMB) meeting could be used as a space to reflect on a selection of strategic initiatives focusing on 'scalability' and 'final mile' opportunities.

11. State Level Engagement

Within the final 2 years of the current CPAP, and with one eye on the next CPAP cycle, UNDP will need to engage more closely in consultations with Government as to how it can selectively best establish State level presence. Closer access to States will be an imperative for UNDP to ensure support is made available to initiate 'scalable replication' and ensure 'final mile' impact. Closer proximity to decision and policy makers at the State level is also required in the light of greater fiscal devolution and decentralization. Many of Indian's States are larger in population than many countries. Should approval be granted to strengthen UNDPs operational presence in the States then the TORs for the 'Head of Office' should be carefully crafted and solid hybrid UNDP Strategists/Programme Managers recruited.



SECTION 1

2. Introduction

The MTR was directed to focus on three particular aspects of UNDPs performance. First, an initial stock taking of progress of implementation of the CPAP. Second, in terms of any realignment that might be required within the final two years of the CPAP. Third, and most important, since the operating environment had shifted, to provide some directional pointers to assist the CO begin the process of framing the successor CPAP from 2018 onwards. In this regard the CO was particularly keen to learn more about issues of scalability and final mile impact.

Whilst the CPAP MTR is intended as an objective exercise to inform the UNDP CO of progress at the mid-point of the implementation cycle, what was apparent from reviewing the documentation in December 2015 was that much of 2013 was in fact a 'set up year', in which the Project Steering Committees (PSC) met to consider and approve the projects and key personnel were recruited. As a result project implementation in the first year of the CPAP reflected a lower level of implementation. The desk review component of the MTR consisted initially of the 2014 Annual Reports and the minutes of the single PSC that took place under each project. 2015 Annual Reports

were not available at the time of the MTR team being present in India in mid-January 2016, although a number of them were furnished to the MTR team in early February.

The MTR report structure reflects the TORs and subsequent discussions with Country Office Management. A summary of key findings and recommendations can be found in the Executive Summary. Section One of the report reflects the introductory, methodological and contextual elements of the undertaking. Section Two provides a fairly detailed reporting against most of the 63 CPAP output targets in the 4 main outcome areas, using the 15 sample projects as the basis. Importantly, this section also includes a summary of some of the most salient points made by UNDPs core partners, especially Government. Section Three outlines a more qualitative assessment in terms of the challenges being poised to UNDP to become more synergistic as provider of integrated development solutions. This includes the generation of insights gained through the MTR on how UNDP might strengthen its capacities to formulate an increasing number of demonstration projects capable of multiplication to scale. Section Four is dedicated to a short concluding statement capturing the core of the MTR.



3. Summary of Methodology

The MTR of the UNDP Country Programme Action Plan (CPAP) 2013 – 2017 took place from mid-December 2015 to end of January 2016. It commenced with a desk review of a sample of 15 out of some 30 plus projects in the complete UNDP CPAP portfolio. A two week in-country assessment was held between Tuesday 12 and Friday 22 January 2016. All internal UNDP teams were systematically consulted in a series of structured

face to face discussions. Integral to the mission, a field visit to Mumbai and Maharashtra State took place 15 – 17 January to consult five project implementation teams and State level officials to gauge actual progress ‘on the ground’. Consultations with key Government stakeholders took place principally in the week of 18 – 22 January 2016. A more detailed explanation of the methodology pursued can be found as Annex A.

4. Context

Since the 2013 – 2017 CPAP was designed there have been a number of significant national and global developments. In May 2014 a new Government in India was elected and series of new national priority programmes were introduced. There was also a subsequent shift towards the devolution of budgets to the State level by virtue of the 14th Financial Committee decision.

In September 2015 the UN Development Summit in New York set out and adopted the ambitious 2030 development agenda marking the conclusion of the MDGs and the adoption of the 17 SDGs. The preceding Financing for Development conference in Addis Ababa in July 2015 recast development financing for the long term turning attention away from traditional ODA towards domestic revenues and south-south cooperation. Toward the end of 2015 the COP 21 agreement reached in Paris contains significant implications for India in addressing its national climate change commitments.

Since 2013 UNDPs own internal financial resources have also diminished. This has led UNDP in the direction towards the pursuit of more integrated development solutions and a more agile organizational set up. Within

the development discourse in India there has been a growing shift towards inclusive growth, the scalability of national programmes (for example - skill India, digital India) all with a sharpened focus on final mile impact. The observations and recommendation of this MTR have tried to take these changing circumstances into account.

More generally, UNDP operations in India are unique to other national settings. India as a nation is vast in its scale and diversity. Many of India's States have populations far exceeding the average country size elsewhere. With considerable programme budgets now devolved to the State level there is greater opportunity from UNDP to engage in deeper and more strategic partnerships in support of SDG achievement at that and more local levels. There is similar prospect for deeper engagement in supporting saleable development initiatives and programmes that ensure final mile impact.

UNDP is recognized no longer as a major financing partner to the Government of India, but rather as a provider of technical assistance and a facilitator of sustainable development solutions. This was widely acknowledged in the various consultations with partners that participated in the MTR. Partners appreciate UNDP more for the technical solutions, expertise and innovations it brings, its flexibility, and its provision of important national and international south-south platforms. This knowledge base and know-how contributions greatly exceed the value of financial resources that UNDP is able to bring. Government at Federal and State level's made clear in the course of the MTR consultations that they look to UNDP increasingly for the technical, policy and operational support required to maximize development impact and arrive at sustainable development solutions. Where public funds are required to accelerate work in these areas UNDPs Development Support Services (DSS) is been used to good effect by Government counterparts.





SECTION 2

5. CPAP Performance to Date (in the period 2013 – 2015)

Using the 15 projects selected by the CO (as listed above) the MTR undertook a systematic desk review, which was then followed up with a series of structured consultations with the UNDP programme and project teams, duly

followed with discussions with key Government and other partners. As a gauge of progress the results of that review and those consultations are set out under the main CPAP outputs and their 63 respective indicators below.

Outcome 1 - Poverty Reduction/Poverty Alleviation

CPAP Output & Indicators	MTR Summary Assessment of Progress
<p>Effective policy options for inclusive growth, poverty alleviation and human development are provided to national partners by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Convening comprehensive stakeholder dialogues on key policy issues • Developing the capacities of CSOs led by marginalized groups for greater voice and visibility in policy making • Providing targeted technical assistance in strategic areas • Providing customized knowledge services and products based on international and national experiences • Undertaking policy research, analysis and advocacy on emerging challenges to inclusive growth and poverty alleviation • Establishing the International Center for Human Development in India to conduct research and advancement and dissemination of knowledge 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There is a clear acknowledgement from partners of the work being undertaken by UNDP in providing platforms for stakeholder policy discussion and knowledge exchange on key policy issues. UNDP is working at the Federal, State, District and Panchayat levels and with CSOs to support marginalized groups participation and visibility in policy making. • There is room in the final two years of the CPAP for UNDP to further strengthen its contribution in the areas of both inclusive growth and poverty alleviation. • A number of UNDP supported scalable demonstration models have been pursued. However, more work could be focused on demonstrating routes out of poverty for vulnerable and marginalized groups (including reference to the 7 classifications of multiple deprivation used by the Government). This would contribute greatly to the 'last mile' challenge. • Whilst the International Center for Human Development in India had been established, resourcing to secure its long-term sustainability has so far proved elusive.
<p>Scalable solutions for inclusion of marginalized groups are designed and implemented by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improving livelihood security in 10 left-wing extremism affected districts • Scaling up of the integrated women's empowerment model (SWAAYAM) to reach 2.2 million rural women • Generating evidence based responses for livelihood promotion, skill development and financial inclusion in flagship programmes (e.g., NRLM, NMEW, NULM, National Skills Mission, Innovations Council) • Developing strategies and models for pro-poor growth and equity in urban growth centres • Strengthening knowledge ecosystems for faster replication and scaling 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Governance and Accelerated Livelihood Support (GOALS) programme has been rolled out in a number of focus areas and making a significant contributions. It is supporting systems improvements in key national missions and provides a robust social mobilization approach vital for long-term poverty reduction • Greater emphasis could be placed on cultivating replicable models for accelerated livelihoods based on improved or integrated NRM solutions that are currently being pursued. Furthermore, UNDP is well placed to advance an integrated exemplar for comprehensive rural housing renewal. • A development strategy or model for pro-poor growth in urban areas would be welcome. Cost effective urban housing renewal would provide an excellent integrated package of land assembly, public-private finance, skills regeneration, sanitation and enterprise opportunities for UNDP. • Knowledge ecosystems are strongest in those projects that have attracted outside financing where accountabilities and reporting regimes are more rigorous, for example, GAVI and GEF. • Within UNDP core funded projects knowledge ecosystems could be further strengthened. This will help to strengthen the concept of the 'learning organization' and assist the generation and acceleration of replicable and scalable sustainable poverty reducing solutions.

Outcome 2 - Democratic Governance

CPAP Output & Indicators	MTR Summary Assessment of Progress
<p>Decentralized local governance frameworks, processes, and capacities are strengthened by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Providing technical support for strengthening the policy framework on decentralization • Supporting preparation of State / regional/district HDRs focusing on inequalities and inclusion • Supporting preparation of District Plans based on human development data and analysis • Strengthening statistical systems to monitor progress on development targets • Empowering elected representatives, particularly women, and those from the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes and strengthening Gram Sabhas 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Government feedback on the performance of governance programmes is generally very positive. UNDP is a trusted partner and technical assistance is considered high quality, dependable and flexible. UNDP assistance is indeed quite 'integral' to the work of some ministries. UNDP has invested significant efforts in producing protocols, training of trainers manuals, plans etc. The challenge for UNDP is to better record the impact of its interventions to measure improvements in performance, or impact for development results on the ground. • Care must be taken to ensure that UNDP assistance does not take on core functions, but remains independent to the extent that it can be advisory, temporary, and build capacities for eventual exit. • There is good take up of the HDR methodology at the national, regional, state, district and panchayat levels. The State of Karnataka has rolled out HDRs in all of its 29 districts • UNDP is very active in the sector and will need to continue to ensure complete coherence exists between capacity building, HDRs/data and development planning for SDG attainment. UNDP Support for the convergence approach will be important. • The planning and implementation loop (knowledge ecosystem) must be fully documented, lessons learned and models/best practice rolled out.
<p>Access to justice and entitlements under government programmes is enhanced for marginalized groups by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Demonstrating improved implementation of select national development schemes such as MGNREGA • Strengthening monitoring and evaluation framework for MGNREGP at national and state level. • Providing technical support to DoJ to ensure access to justice • Supporting LSAs and other authorities in providing improved services and justice delivery • Enhancing legal awareness of marginalized communities • Developing capacity of CSOs, CBOs, lawyers, law students, paralegals and communities to enhance legal awareness of marginalized groups. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Broad progress has been achieved in this outcome area through UNDP support to access to justice services. It may be desirable to strengthen links into other projects in the portfolio that are working with communities of the marginalized, for example, the GOALS (social mobilization component), Panchayat and Tribal projects. • In particular, UNDPs efforts to achieve increased awareness and access to justice services has been replicated in North Eastern States and Jammu & Kashmir. • Evidence was shown to the MTR at the Ministry of Rural Development concerning the revived uptake in the MGNREGA as a result of UNDPs assistance. • UNDPs support for the Tribal Communities was acknowledged. Ongoing work should support the realization and implementation of conservation and community forest resources within the tribal areas. • Initiatives such as tracking of under trials and awareness marginalized sections for legal aid can be scaled up at state level with stronger involvement of UNDP.

CPAP Output & Indicators	MTR Summary Assessment of Progress
<p>Service delivery of government schemes is strengthened by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Strengthening results-based Performance Management Systems in government Integrating competency-based leadership models in training of the Indian Administrative Service 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Government counterparts were content with UNDPs role in the strengthening core civil service results and competency based systems Notwithstanding Ministry satisfaction with UNDPs training modules, it would be useful to have accumulated more longitudinal evidence on the measurable benefits from having implemented the various training programmes.
<p>South-South cooperation and partnerships are strengthened by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Supporting the implementation of the Partnership Framework Agreement to enhance South-South Cooperation Providing knowledge sharing platform for national and international (South-South) experience sharing supporting ECI to facilitate sharing of India's electoral management experience with other countries and support training and knowledge sharing through IIIDEM 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Very good progress to report in this area. A number of partners gave testimony in diverse areas to excellent results in S/S & international exchange. UNDPs role in promoting S/S was especially appreciated in civil service leadership, elections (although the project was not covered in the MTR), there was a global convocation supported by UNDP taking place in Delhi in January 2016. Further areas for strengthening S/S would be in the climate change and DRM (urban) sectors.

Outcome 3 - Sustainable Development

CPAP Output & Indicators	MTR Summary Assessment of Progress
<p>Access to Clean Energy is expanded under-served communities and small-scale industry by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Providing technical assistance for formulation of guidelines and policies for provision of clean energy for productive uses Formulating policy frameworks to address barriers in expansion and scaling up energy access in rural areas for meeting household energy needs as well as for strengthening of livelihoods facilitating increased adoption of Solar Heating systems by industrial units Demonstrating solutions to reduce barriers for investment into biomass projects Enhancing availability of clean energy for domestic cooking and lighting for poor rural families 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Though the activities are being carried out as per the schedule the outcomes are not yet at a point for full scaling up. In a country with a large population deprived of access to clean energy, this output area has a tremendous potential in different sectors. Initiatives such as market development and promotion of solar concentrators for industrial process heating has a strong link to the market response. UNDP implementation is going as per the planned schedule, its penetration and potential for further scaling up depends largely on the background market conditions. With the changing orientation of the concerned ministry the focus seems to have shifted towards energy generation and the globally falling energy costs further made this initiative vulnerable on feasibility grounds. UNDP is well placed to support the availability of clean energy solutions for domestic cooking and lighting within poor communities. Further work is needed in this area.

CPAP Output & Indicators	MTR Summary Assessment of Progress
<p>Energy Efficiency measures are adopted by the Indian Railways, and by investors in Commercial Buildings and urban transportation by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Strengthening institutional capacities at various levels to implement energy efficiency programs for commercial buildings, railways and urban transportation demonstrating model buildings using energy efficient/clean technologies in five climatic zones Developing energy efficient non-traction and traction systems for the Indian Railways Enhancing capacities of railway personnel, elected officials from urban local bodies, professionals in urban transport and building construction. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Significant progress appears to have been made in scaling up of energy efficiency measures in Indian Railways. The development of energy management systems and its implementation in a phase-wise manner seems very successful and covers almost all railways divisions. Its vertical scaling up to include 500 substations for their complete automation with GPRS connectivity is a good example of expansion of the initiative. Further expanding energy efficiency activities over the other domains of railways such water pumping and station energy efficiency programme proves this initiative a success. Partnering with GEF the initiative to go solar with all the railway entities is a bold step towards not just energy efficiency in Railways but also contributes to the better performance of Indian Railways. This is a significant accomplishment. It is important to create an evidence based case study for the successful implementation of initiative which can be a good knowledge base for south-south cooperation and knowledge sharing
<p>Sustainable management of biodiversity and land resources is enhanced by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mainstreaming the landscape approach into development planning process of key biodiversity rich regions Supporting adaptive management strategies for multiple-use landscapes making management of natural resources more sustainable with the use of community-based approaches Strengthening capacities of key biodiversity governance institutions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> One excellent exemplar of NRM for social and economic inclusion and viable, sustainable community based development in progress (see below), the challenge now for UNDP is to multiply the number of successful NRM interventions. Work towards this output is closely allied to the work of the GOALS project, as well as to the roll out of the programme to support traditional tribal communities create and implement sustainable forest management plans based on integrated NRM/livelihoods solutions. There is an exciting agenda of work ahead for UNDP in this segment of the programme. Comprehensive and integrated approaches to bio-diversity and livelihoods are only just beginning to emerge. Here is an opportunity for greater synergy and improved methodologies within the final two years of the CPAP. At least two biodiversity institutions have so far been involved (in the above project) - the Department of Forestry appears to have been strengthened as a result, whilst the Oceanography institution has been engaged. An additional foundation has been established for coastal/ marine life conservation which is demonstrating institutional development and sustainability of a broader partnership. GEF financing has been utilized to successfully lever coastal marine biodiversity conservation and sustainable local economic development. UNDP has helped to facilitate partnerships for multi-stakeholder participation.

CPAP Output & Indicators	MTR Summary Assessment of Progress
<p>Phase-out of Ozone Depleting Substances is achieved by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Notifying industry partners of the amendment to the Ozone Depleting substances (Regulation and Control) rules 2000 to align with the accelerated phase-out schedule of HCFCs under the Montreal Protocol I • Facilitating compliance with the freeze in 2013 on the baseline level of the average of the years 2009 and 2010 and 10% reduction from the baseline in 2015, in line with accelerated phase out schedule of HCFCs supporting the HCFC Phase-out Management Plan (HPMP) Stage-I. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Projects in this discrete area of the portfolio have been progressing well and meeting all the targets of implementation well within time. • The capacity developed in the Montreal protocol implementation and UNDPs role in the same is well appreciated by the stakeholders/implementation partners. • There appears to be scope to further enhance UNDPs participation in the production domain (compliance of ozone depleting substances by addressing the production of such substances) instead of limiting itself to consumption domain.
<p>Climate change adaptation and community resilience to disasters is promoted by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Developing and implementing state level action plans on climate change in select state. • Supporting preparation of national communications and biannual update reports to UNFCCC • Integrating disaster risk reduction and climate change adaptation in key national schemes and programmes • Designing and implementing scalable community DRR and CCA models in 10,000 villages and 15 cities • Providing technical support to state and local governments in select cities and districts to adopt disaster and climate risk reduction measures and prepare holistic disaster management plans reducing vulnerabilities of the poor through disaster preparedness and enhanced community resilience through skill development 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Good progress and considerable future prospects assessed in this sector. • UNDP in partnership with GEF and the Swiss Development Agency has been successful in creating a knowledge base on the integration of climate change mitigation and adaptation in state planning by piloting in five states. • These efforts are currently being implemented in two sectors (Renewable energy and energy efficiency) and within five states. Though efforts are being extended to replicate it in the water sector it is important to carry the “good steps” forward to include all states and all sectors to realize the objective of climate change preparedness of states. • This invariably has an overlap with disaster risk reduction (DRR) and the prospect of strengthening an integrated approach. • The integration of DRR and Climate Change risk and management into state level plans is proceeding well within the urban sector. A target of all states could be set for the end of the next CPAP cycle. This might also include implementation in at least 4 core service lines, for example into education, health, transportation and urban planning/building control. Roll out to scale is incrementally proceeding. • The partnership with USAID shows promise to grow further still. This is a major upscale prospect, in particular the next iteration of the project as it reaches out to private sector inclusion in the partnership. • It is not yet fully established if the project has so far managed to reach out to the poorest to reduce vulnerabilities and enhance resilience through skills development. • Access of Global Green Climate Fund is critical for the states to achieve NAPCC targets and UNDPs role in facilitating the state is critical.

Outcome 4 - Inclusion and Civil Society

CPAP Output & Indicators	MTR Summary Assessment of Progress
<p>Tribal development strategies are improved and implemented by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Supporting the preparation of strategic framework for MoTA under the 12th Five-Year Plan Helping generate awareness and develop capacities of gram sabhas and forest rights committees on legislative frameworks most directly relevant to tribal groups, such as FRA and PESA Strengthening capacities of Tribal Resource Centres and tribal welfare departments to monitor policies and plans in select states Providing technical advice for integration of tribal issues into flagship development programmes of key line Ministries Generating strategic information on denotified tribes for drawing up programme frameworks. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Solid foundational work over successive CPAP cycles have established an area of growing possibility for UNDP. Excellent legal and advocacy work has contributed to the Tribal Communities entitlement basis having been established and protected against a test case private sector legal challenge. UNDP should support the completion of the Conservation and management plans for community forest resources in pilot communities, with proper baseline, implementation, monitoring, and documentation. A thorough and systematic approach will lead to replication and scalable solutions which is the ultimate goal. The request of the Maharashtra Secretary for Tribal Affairs is for UNDP not to cease its engagement at the plan-making stage, but to support in implementation also. UNDP should continue to strengthen the 'knowledge ecosystem' through the complete loop and document the key principles and learning as per the Sindhudurg project.
<p>HIV/AIDS affected populations experience less stigmatization and have improved access to entitlements and services by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Developing and operationalizing a comprehensive national level policy on social protection for people living with HIV and most at risk population groups Providing technical support to legal and policy frameworks which ensure stigma free HIV responses Building organisational capacities of networks of sexual minorities and PLHIVs for monitoring human rights programmes and redressal mechanisms. Ensuring greater interface between affected communities and policy makers developing strategies and models for effective inclusion of hard to reach populations like subsets of MSM groups, migrants and sex workers with HIV services 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work in this sector appears to be proceeding well. There is a strong partnership in place between UNDP and CSOs which has made considerable progress over recent years. At the time of the MTR it may be considered too early to tell if the operationalization of the national level policy is working fully to support people living with HIV effectively. The Single Window Model has been scaled up by NACO in 189 districts where it has set up district AIDS prevention units and the model is working. As a result more than 900,000 HIV affected people are getting access to benefits from central/ state government schemes. A detailed study could be done to look at the impacts on health and other social eco indicators or the efficiency of the system per se. Looking further ahead, there could be important positive lessons arising from the above project that could be feed into a more comprehensive UN wide pro-poor approach to supporting the legal, policy and service delivery challenges confronting India's marginalized and poor communities if the 2030 target 'leave no one behind' is to be met.

CPAP Output & Indicators	MTR Summary Assessment of Progress
<p>Women’s access to public services and programmes is expanded by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Establishing and strengthening state level resource centers for convergence among schemes and programmes for women’s empowerment • Improving the capacity of women’s collectives from marginalized groups to advocate for equal right to housing, land and property inheritance • Integrating gender concerns in select flagships programmes and policies supporting effective policy and legal frameworks to address multi-dimensional vulnerabilities of women with disabilities and in sex work. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There are some good examples of women’s empowerment featuring within DRM, HDRs, NRM, GOALS, Panchayats etc., • UNDP could dedicate further efforts to ensure even stronger integration of gender equality and women’s empowerment as a core feature of its programming in future as part of the SDG transformational agenda. • Even more detailed capture of development results reporting within the gender section of the Annual Reporting format would be appreciated.

Table 1. CPAP Financing & Expenditure Overview

CPAP Portfolio Programme Financing Overview in USD Millions							
CPAP Outcome Area	Total Target	Core Funds (target)	Core Funds (actual)	External (target)	External (actual)	Total Financing Gap	Total Delivery in CPAP period
Outcome 1. Poverty Reduction							
1. Policy options, inclusive growth, poverty eradication, human	10	10	11	0	3	(4)	14
2. Scalable solutions for inclusion of marginalized groups	70	15	5	55	6	59	11
Outcome 2. Democratic Governance							
3. Decentralized local governance frameworks	15.4	9.5	3	5.9	0	12	4
4. Access to Justice	11.5	5.5	2	6	-	0	2
5. Service Delivery	1.5	1.5	1		44	(43)	44
6. South/South partnerships	3.5	1.5	0	2	1	2	1
Outcome 3. Sustainable Development							
7. Access to clean energy – communities and industry	18	2	1	16	6	11	7
8. Energy efficiency in the Indian Railways	15		-	15	4	11	4
9. Sustainable management of biodiversity and land	26.5	4	1	22.5	19	7	20
10. Ozone depleting substances	20		-	20	17	3	17
11. Climate change adaptation	49	7	3	42	5	41	8
Outcome 4. Inclusion, Gender & HIV/AIDS							
12. Tribal development strategies	6	4	1	2	-	5	1
13. HIV/AIDS	5	3	1	2	0	3	2
14. Women's access to public services	8.59	2.59	-	6	-	9	-
CPAP Total	259.99	65.59	30	194.4	104	126	134

In terms of the overall financial progress of the CPAP, out of a total of US\$ 259 million for the five year period, by the end of the third year of the programme US\$ 134 million had been spent. This accounts for just over half of the anticipated programme. On the one hand, this might initially be of concern. On the other, it was noted within the body of the report above that year one (2013) of the programme was in part a set-up year, so a more limited expenditure rate would have occurred in that year. In addition, since that time, a new volume of financing has come on stream through the two major health sector programmes aimed at universalizing service delivery.

The only major cause of concern detected by the MTR through the financial lens is that US\$ 70 million was forecast to be raised in support of outcome 1.2 in the table above for 'scalable solutions for the inclusion of marginalized groups'. Over half way into the CPAP the financing gap for scalable solutions for the marginalized remains at nearly US\$ 60 million. This underpins the requirement for UNDP to be more enterprising in its pursuit of scalable demonstration models that can be used for inclusive development.



6. Partner Consultation & Assessment

Senior Government Officials at the Secretary, Joint Secretary and Deputy Secretary levels generously allocated time to the MTR. The overwhelming response from Government partners to UNDPs performance over period 2013 – 2015 was extremely positive (for the full list of partners consulted see Annexe B and C). UNDP is recognised as a trusted, valued, long-standing partner to the Government. UNDP is also working in a number of areas considered to be sensitive, for example, in

access to justice and the tribal communities. Partners repeatedly made mention of the quality of Technical Assistance provided, and to UNDPs dependability, interactive and responsive approach, and to its organisational flexibility. In several instances Government referred to UNDP ‘being part of us’. In overall terms these findings represent a strong vote of appreciation for the contribution that UNDP makes and is a very healthy position for UNDP to build from.

There was a ready acknowledgement from Government partners in particular that UNDP is no longer a major financier of development. Government views UNDP as a close development partner, providing technical assistance in priority areas, including access to knowledge platforms and know-how networks that assist in finding or honing comprehensive development solutions. In a number of instances Government engages UNDPs technical assistance through the Development Support Services (DSS) modality. There was a high degree of satisfaction expressed by the Government with the quality of DSS where they had been accessed. A summary of the comments made by partners in relation to particular projects or interventions made by UNDP is as follows:

Strengthening Capacities of Panchayati Raj Institutions

The Ministry of Panchayat greatly appreciated the contribution that was being made by UNDP. One area in which the Ministry considered UNDP could strengthen its support was in ensuring that the training programme and plan templates could now be fully implemented. Along these lines the Ministry considered that it would be highly beneficial if in the next phase of assistance if more field testing and learning could be generated from the practical application of the training and the template plans to ensure they are adaptable to the diverse regional and local contexts.

Strengthening National Capacities in Tribal Areas

The Tribal Affairs Department in the State of Maharashtra provided some important feedback to the MTR. Whilst also acknowledging the important contribution made by UNDP to the conservation and management plan for community forest resources, it was suggested that UNDP should not be content only with having helped

devise the forest management plan format for tribal communities. UNDP was encouraged to 'stay the course' and assist the Department in piloting implementation, observing the dynamics on the ground, carefully documenting of the impact, and feeding the lessons learned back into the policy and plan making cycle. In other words, 'to complete the life cycle' of the process. The Tribal Affairs Department are looking for a longer term partnership with UNDP that would assist in a comprehensive manner as tribal communities seek to design, implement and manage their conservation and management plan for community forest resources.

Governance & Accelerated Livelihoods

Senior Government Officials at the Ministry of Rural Development spoke highly of UNDPs contribution to core institutional systems that support the efficiency and effectiveness of the National Employment and Skills Development Programmes. Evidence was shown to the MTR demonstrating how the national programmes had been revived, in part attributable to the UNDP technical assistance that had been provided. Also under the umbrella of the GOALS programme, another Senior Government Official, whilst acknowledging UNDPs valued and longstanding assistance, suggested UNDP might benefit from consolidating some of its activities, focus on key areas that have proven to be effective in demonstration sites, especially for 'final mile' success, and concentrate on these for scalability. The social mobilization programme of the Ministry supported by UNDP was recognised as an important contributor to systematic poverty reduction.

Improving efficiency of Vaccination Systems in Multiple States

Feedback from the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare was also appreciative and encouraging. Whilst there had been some delays in the early phases of the immunization

project concerning procurement, these had been overcome. Since then a sound institutional relationship had been built between the Ministry, WHO, UNICEF and UNDP. The project had proceeded to run smoothly and the Ministry was upbeat about the next phase of the project which looked towards greater expansion.

Upscaling energy efficient production in small scale steel industry in India

The MTR visited one of the secondary steel manufacturers which had successfully implemented the energy efficient technology supported by UNDP. In a highly competitive market where proprietary knowledge is sacred, few intermediaries could have been trusted in the same manner in which UNDP has been to support the introduction of the energy efficiency technologies. UNDP was encouraged to continue to play this role for a longer period to provide a stream of technical support for future aspirants of EE technology. Typical of barriers to the introduction of initiative, including the costs of initial capital outlay, were overcome by the constant efforts of UNDP to persuade the first tranche of secondary steel manufacturers. Once the first cohort had been persuaded, the industry network of operators saw wisdom in championing its success and roll out. As a result, UNDP has cemented its position as a reputable partner to the secondary steel industry in India.

The Ministry of Steel (MoS) echoed these remarks, since it has been engaged with UNDP for the last two cycles of CPAP. In the current phase of implementation of EE technologies in the secondary steel industries, MoS partnered with UNDP to initially pilot 34 cases of EE technology. In the second phase this was scaled up to 300 units. The partnership is now aiming for further up-scaling to 1000 units.

According to MoS the role UNDP played has been both vital and timely. Though the drive for the new EE technology emerged from market indicators such as a rising energy price and increased competition in the steel markets, the catalysing role that UNDP played paved the way to success. The MoS has been energized in this sector by the injection of enthusiasm and sound project management resources brought to the partnership by UNDP. This has led to the rapid evolution of a flagship project for EE implementation in steel manufacturing and to what can be referred to as a 'success story'

Strengthening Human Resource Management of Civil Service

The Department of Personnel and Training (DoPT) has been engaged UNDP as a partner for a long time. DoPT expressed keenness in continuing this association at a critical juncture in the pursuit of transformative approaches towards Human Resources Management at various levels of governance (Federal, State, and right down to grass root levels). DoPT sees further potential for up-scaling its core competency based training and strengthening of HR management at Federal, State, District and Panchayat levels.

Increasing Access to Justice for Marginalised People

For the Ministry of Justice UNDP is viewed as a trusted partner that brings in 'a good technical team' and 'project management' expertise that has proven to be very effective over the years. It is felt that the valuable resources offered by UNDP could not be stretched to the optimum due to lack of funds. UNDP's role in initiatives such as access to justice in North East states and Jammu and Kashmir states was very well appreciated.

HCFC Phase-Out Management Plan (HPMP State-1) for Compliance with the 2013 and 2015 Control Targets

According to the Ozone Cell of MoEFCC the role UNDP plays in meeting the Montreal obligations for India are invaluable. The compliance efforts under the Montreal Protocol are divided into both the consumption and production measures. While UNDP's role as lead agency in consumption side measures was commended it was also suggested that UNDP would be encouraged to expand its presence into production side measures as well.

In this context, knowledge sharing is an important feature and UNDP's role in south-south knowledge sharing was felt to be 'indispensable'. The project has an embodied evaluation mechanism and the targets are reported to have been achieved.

Strategic Programmatic Engagement at State Level

A number of States that have been partnering with UNDP expressed their satisfaction. It became apparent in the discussions with several of the State Official and State Planning Advisors that additional UNDP capacity support and technical assistance would be welcomed. This included general support for governance strengthening, development planning (convergence approach) and monitoring.

Mention was also made of procurement support, gender, DRM, data management, technology and climate change. Not least, integrating the HDR and SDGs into development planning at the local level. In this regard, UNDP was encouraged to support State Level Development Planning better integrate social mobilization, social audit and participatory planning within the framework of the 'convergence approach'. Top-down and bottom-up process need to meet somewhere in the middle and UNDP was well placed to support the emergence of a stronger more coherent approach drawing on its experience and expertise from other countries.

Enhancing Institutional and community resilience to disasters and climate change

Maharashtra State and the Mumbai Urban Authorities are very content with UNDPs technical input in both its District level support and the ongoing urban programme of vulnerability assessments. Similarly USAID reported a very decent level of engagement with UNDP and had confidence in UNDPs staff team to report back on what was realistically attainable under the programme. A good degree of trust was evident between the project partners, both in New Delhi and at the level of the field in Maharashtra. There also appeared to be strong complementarity between the longer running district oriented DRM programme and the more recently funded urban DRM & Climate Change programme.



SECTION

3

7. In Pursuit of Integrated Development Solutions

The MTR prompted a series of healthy discussions within the UNDP programme teams. In overall terms there is growing appreciation within the programme units that they need to be systematically strengthening their interactions in order to pursue fully integrated development solutions. At present, programmatic and creative linkages between the four teams of Poverty

Reduction, Governance, and Energy/Environment and Business Development do exist, but could be further enhanced for the design and implementation of the integrated development solutions that UNDP now aspires for¹. The newly commissioned Ganga River Rejuvenation project will help galvanize the programme teams into more integrated ways of working. Similarly, within the

¹ See also p.50-55 of the UNDP Corporate Plan (2014 – 17) concerning institutional transformation

Governance unit there are a number of individual project streams that each produce similar material (training modules, planning templates etc.) that could be further strengthened to ensure the unit is contributing to a coherent 'whole of governance' system that is maximising its contribution to development results.

In the pursuit of Integrated Development Solutions one project that particularly stood out as potential exemplar summarized below to illustrate the integrated nature of the both the challenge and solution:

Mainstreaming Coastal and Marine Biodiversity Conservation into Production Sectors in the Sindhudurg Coast, Maharashtra

Covering around 27 square km (a coastline strip) in Maharashtra the GEF funded initiative commenced operations in 2012 and is now in its final year.

The initial focus of the project on the mangroves and the coral was met with suspicion and scepticism from the local fisher communities. Extensive outreach from the UNDP supported project team eventually brought the communities on board, and an innovation around the shape of the nets tested by the fishing community themselves was an early breakthrough. Better understanding and more collaborative management of the ecosystem of mangroves and bio-diversity has over several years of perseverance resulted in a win-win outcome for all. The symbiotic relationship between the mangroves, crabs, turtles, fish, prawns, oysters and mussels has enabled a proliferation of local livelihoods gains, including for women's economic empowerment.

At the heart of the project an integrated multi-trophic aqua-culture is emerging. Understanding the environment better has led to greater yields within smaller areas under 'cultivation'. As an example, crab 'farming' has been piloted in 6 sites, and subsequently rolled out to 9 sites, with 14 others currently planned.

Similar for mussels, prawns and oysters. Turtle hatchlings have also multiplied along with the extension to the mangroved areas. Income to the local communities has risen significantly, with the ultimate prospect of being able to export these 'fruits of the ocean' once sufficient quality and quantities have been achieved.

The project has since broadened to include rice cultivation on the coastal strips, the greening of the local tourist home-stays and the potential for bee-farming is being investigated. There has been an observed increase number of dolphins, whales and birds. Community awareness has also grown significantly.

Institutionally the project has also witnessed a strong partnership approach evolve with various State and scientific institutions each playing their part. A Foundation has been formally established to further advance the work, which has been successful at reaching out to the private sector.

The MTR did not have the luxury to investigate in detailed terms if there had been a thorough baselining and mapping of the complete picture of environmental, social, economic and institutional 'assets' that the project has given rise to. If this does exist, or can be estimated, it would provide a useful investment 'rate of return' which would be very helpful to assist in models for replication. Since India has 7,500km of coastline and one of the largest peninsulas anywhere in the world, this seems like a great place to begin a process of accelerated scalability building on the coastline ecology and multi-trophic aqua-culture. The 'Sindhudurg Project' may hold significant lessons and a key for good practise in pursuit of a genuinely integrated development approach.

There are also clear principles and practises exhibited in the project that could be extremely valuable for the tribal forest management planning as well as the GOALS project. In advancing the 2030 Development Agenda the project is also an exemplar in seeing multiple SDG targets attained.



8. Critical Success Factors for Scalability

The MTR brief also included a dimension related to the issue of scalability, since for UNDP to fully exercise its mandate in India, given the magnitude and scale of the development challenges it faces, UNDP has to be able to help design and implement development solutions that are capable of having nationwide impact.

In conducting the consultations with the UNDP teams it became apparent that those projects that had emerged 'at scale' or which were emerging as potentially successful 'to scale' initiatives (some over several CPAP cycles), were those that were able to achieve four critical success factors:

1. Begin any project with future scalability in mind.

UNDP needs to ensure that the design of projects proceeds with the goal of replication, expansion and scalability built in from the outset. This is extremely critical with regard to India, where scale is the only way to ensure development impact. Opportunities may at present be being missed by the operational teams charged with their delivery, as they are focused principally on delivering the stated objectives of the project. A broader perspective may need to be adopted that regularly contemplates the issue of succession and

replication to the next order of scale. UNDP may need to investigate this further to determine whether this is a factor or not. A strengthened approach might be one in which UNDP sets out to use the intervention as a vehicle to serve as a potential 'national pathfinder'. The operational team may then adopt a completely different mind-set which is more open to extension and expansion possibilities that help inform how the project can take the next steps necessary in its transition to scale.

2. Adopt an evidence-based approach to the 'knowledge ecosystem'

At the commencement of every intervention UNDP should ideally obtain baselines (from all perspectives - environmental, social, human, economic, institutional etc.) in order to better measure progress. This requires a more rigorous, socially scientific approach to measure mid-point and end point effect. For example, in chapter 6 above, in a few cases UNDP partners informed the MTR that UNDP did not always complete the learning loop of experiences gleaned in the process of implementation. Therefore the approach to learning must become more documented, more complete and able to demonstrate the integrated development solutions across all environmental, social, economic and institutional dimensions. This may also be extended to incorporate data that demonstrates the 'rate of return' on projects where that is valid. Such evidence is a powerful and compelling force in leading to replicable solutions. In this regard also we recommend UNDP consider adopting a more "commercial mind-set" to the extent that certain interventions can actually prove economic returns on initial 'investments' from whichever source, be it GEF, UNDP core resources or Government financing. The Sindhudurg is a live example of a project that has generated significant additional sustainable income streams to the local communities of many thousands of

rupees. The sum of these actual and projected income streams can be valued to clearly show that the initial GEF investment has been exceeded five to ten times over (and into perpetuity) within in a 5 – 7 year period. This makes replication of that project considerably more attractive to Government to invest in the next phase along the 'going to scale' continuum. The next logical evolution for that initiative would be further piloted in up to a dozen similar project sites in other nearby coastal areas.

3. Leadership.

It became very apparent to the MTR that one of the reasons projects fail or succeed is down to leadership. In this context the MTR found that leadership was required at three levels to ensure projects have the capacity to be taken to scale and/or better serve last mile impact. First, the Project Manager must have the vision to see the potential for the project in design stage, including its potential for replication (links to point 1 above). Second, the resilience and perseverance that is required at the level of project implementation and management, which also includes being adaptable to changing circumstances. For example, being able to see the livelihoods multiplier benefits within an environmental conservation project, as per the Sindhudurg initiative (as outlined in Chapter 7 immediately above). Third, in being able to take the project upon its completion, and armed with the compelling evidence marshalled from point 2 above, articulate and persuade stakeholders in higher authority that the project is an exemplar well worthy of being taken to the next level of scale. Often moving from one level or phase of replicability to the next presents a formable obstacle to scalability. UNDP may wish to investigate this observation further and put in place strategies and resourcing that enables pilot projects to be brought fully to scale through the various sequence of stages, ultimately for nation-wide impact.

4. Technologies & Innovation.

In a number of the most successful projects considered by the MTR two additional features were apparent. Firstly, that when undertaking any kind of activity unexpected discoveries, or 'side-effects' occur. This is a natural phenomenon in any scientific investigation or experimentation. In some cases the unexpected side-effects contribute much more to the value of the project than what was originally envisioned. For example, the proliferation of potential aqua-cultural activities in the Sindhudurg Project, or the ability to move to direct rolling in the steel mills proved revolutionary to those initiatives – though they were not anticipated in the outset or in the design phase. Secondly, the application of technologies to a sector

can be transformative and extremely powerful, and often underestimated in effect. The digitizing of the cold stores has enabled real time management for the supply and storage of vaccines across the chain is one example. The creation of the 'WhatsApp' knowledge networks that have been established in the GOALS, steel and Sindhudurg projects are proving highly beneficial innovations. – mini knowledge-sharing platforms in fact. The simple change in the square to diamond shaped gauge of the fishing nets was a strong but simple 'technology' factor assisting the early stages in the Sindhudurg project. The point here is to highlight the critically important role that technology plays in development, increasingly essential to the success of final mile interventions and scalability impact.

9. The Role of Development Support Services

At the time of the MTR the issue of Development Support Services was discussed in various forms. What appears to the MTR consultants is that the Government of India is able to take advantage of this facility where UNDP has a comparative advantage in Technical Assistance that it is able to place at the disposal of the Government, with applicable UNDP's

standard management fee. There were a number of instances that arose in consultation with the Government where it was evident that financing was available at federal or state level in order to utilize the UNDP DSS modality to tap into UNDP's technical assistance, knowledge ecosystems and development platforms.





SECTION 4

10. Conclusions

The MTR of the CPAP revealed a programme consisting of a fairly large portfolio of over 30 projects which is broadly on course to deliver the CPAP objectives. A strong team of committed professionals are successfully bringing adjustments that will yield further improvements to UNDP's performance over the years immediately ahead. Consultations with Government counterparts proved that UNDP is viewed as a dependable partner. The programme has some excellent projects in its arsenal. The Country Office management is right to be aspiring for even greater impact.

The new operating context at national and global level continues to be demanding, with a relatively new Government championing new national initiatives and bold global development agenda that has adopted 17 new and ambitious SDG targets. India has a central role to play in securing the global targets. For this reason 'leave no one behind' has a particular resonance and implication for UNDP if the inclusive growth and poverty eradication aspirations are to achieve their full effect in India. This MTR makes a number of observations and recommendations for both short and medium term

consideration that will help UNDP fully meet the goals of the current CPAP and lay important foundations for its successor.

The first area relates to UNDP assuming full leadership of the SDG agenda and to supporting Government at all levels. This will include advocacy, co-ordination, technical assistance and support for south-south platforms. It also entails working closely with the Government's national missions and programmes and helping to leverage the entire governance system for SDG attainment. UNDP is uniquely positioned to take a comprehensive and strategic approach to supporting the Government, and all partners, to accomplish the SDG agenda in India.

The second strongly encourages UNDP to continue to work towards strengthening its approach for the formulation and implementation of integrated development solutions. This requires a more creative and agile organisational set up to which UNDP is clearly moving towards.

The third area of focus relates to putting further measures in place that promote the systematic management of the internal knowledge ecosystem. This necessarily entails the full baselining and documenting of progress in the life cycle of the project from its various social, economic, environmental and institutional perspectives. It provides the evidence base for learning fully about the impact of development interventions and in determining if a project is capable and worthy of replication and expansion.

The fourth area, linked closely to the third above, entails greater attention to the successful cultivation

of demonstration projects that can be taken to scale and simultaneously achieve last mile impact. From the work of this MTR it is evident that projects go to scale by successfully navigating a series of 3 or 4 successive stages in their evolution. Allied closely to this are a number of critical success factors that appear to be central in most instances in which projects appear capable of realising their scalability. The formulation and implementation of integrated development solutions utilizing a robust knowledge ecosystem will also reinforce UNDPs ability to bring projects to scale that fully demonstrate last mile impact.

The fifth area for UNDPs consideration will be the move to establish a stronger State level presence. Strategic outreach to States will enable UNDP promote the SDGs throughout India and assist technically and through coordination support in their delivery and reporting. Closer access to States is also imperative for UNDP to assist in institutional strengthening for development results and be closer to the ground for the purposes of supporting the cultivation of opportunities for 'scalable replication' and 'final mile' impact.

To conclude, in addition to reporting on progress against CPAP targets, this MTR sought to bring forward observations that will continue to ensure UNDP remains equal to the evolving development challenges and priorities presented in India. Over the final two years of the existing CPAP the MTR has identified five areas for UNDP to further concentrate its thinking and shape its direction. These five areas will help to conclude the goals of the current CPAP, invest further in the transformation of UNDP, and lay important foundations for the successor programme for 2018 – 22.

Annex A: Methodology

Framing the MTR with UNDP Management/M&E team

Mid-December 2015: This inception report provides the basis of this first stage. It sets out the plan for undertaking the MTR and for generating sufficient information, either through desk review, or structured dialogue, with the respective stakeholders to the exercise.

Desk Review of Relevant Documentation

Mid-December 2015/early January 2016: Focussing on the 15 projects (see immediately below) selected as the representative sample for the exercise, the desk review provided the MTR with a chance to gauge project by project progress, general programmatic and financial performance against the stated CPAP targets.

The sample of projects included directly in the MTR with their respective units were as follows:

1. Strategic Planning Unit - Project No.00082275 Strategic Programmatic Engagement at State Level
2. Governance Unit - Project No.00088568 - Improving efficiency of Vaccination Systems in Multiple States
3. Governance Unit - Project No.00087627 - Increasing Access to HIV/AIDS Prevention and Care for Vulnerable People
4. Governance Unit - Project No.00086840 - Strengthening national capacities in tribal areas
5. Governance Unit - Project No.00086969 - Increasing Access to Justice for Marginalised People
6. Governance Unit - Project No.00086967 - Strengthening Capacities for Decentralized Planning (SCDP)

7. Governance Unit - Project No.00086965 - Strengthening Capacities of Panchayati Raj Institutions
8. Governance Unit - Project No.00086968 - Strengthening Human Resource Management of Civil Service
9. Governance Unit - Project No.00079936 - Strengthening Capacities for Human Development
10. Poverty Unit - Project No.00086964 - Governance & Accelerated Livelihoods
11. Energy & Environment - Project No.00087556 - Enhancing Institutional and community resilience to disasters and climate change
12. Energy & Environment - Project No.00085155 - HCFC Phase-Out Management Plan (HPMP State-1) for Compliance with the 2013 and 2015 Control Targets
13. Energy & Environment - Project No.00072738 - Mainstreaming Coastal and Marine Biodiversity Conservation into Production Sectors in the Sindhudurg Coast, Maharashtra
14. Energy & Environment - Project No.00077828 - Market Development and Promotion of Solar Concentrator based Process Heat Applications in India - CSH India (Concentrating Solar Heat applications)
15. Energy & Environment - Project No.00086974 - Upscaling energy efficient production in small scale steel industry in India

UNDP CO internal team consultations

The period of 12 – 15 January was used primarily for internal UNDP discussions on the three-year performance of the CPAP to date. Broadly as follows:

Tuesday 12th January:

Consultations with UNDP Management.

Wednesday 13th January:

Consultations with Poverty Reduction Team (Key Programme and Project personnel)

- i. Policy options, inclusive growth, poverty eradication, human development
- ii. Scalable solutions for inclusion of marginalized groups

Thursday 14th January:

iii. Consultations with Democratic Governance Team (Key Programme and Project personnel)

- a. Decentralized local governance frameworks
- b. Access to Justice
- c. Service Delivery
- d. South/South – partnerships

iv. Government & Civil Society, inclusion, women's empowerment/gender equality & HIV/AIDS.

- a. Tribal development strategies
- b. HIV/AIDS
- c. Women's access to public services

Friday 15th January:

v. Consultations with Sustainable Development Team (Key Programme and Project personnel)

- a. Access to clean energy – communities and industry
- b. Energy efficiency in the Indian Railways

- c. Sustainable management of biodiversity and land
- d. Ozone depleting substances
- e. Climate change adaptation

vi. Consultation with UNRC, UNDP Operations Team & UNDP Management

Consultation with Key Development Partners & Field Visit

16 – 21 January:

This period was used for consultations with key Government counterparts and development partners to be selected by the CO. This included state authorities, civil society, the private sector and development partners, principally on the subject of UNDP performance and the challenge of scalability.

Friday 22 January:

The End of week consultation with UNDP CO management and the UNDP CO staff

Report Preparation & Presentation of MTR Draft Findings and Recommendations

25 January – 2 February 2015:

In this period a full stock taking and write up of all consultations from the previous two weeks took place leading to the initial report presentation of findings, analysis and recommendations to UNDP CO management.

Annex B: List of People Interviewed

Sl.No.	Name	Designation
1	Mr. S. Abbasi	Joint Secretary, Ministry of Steel
2	Mr. Yuri Afanasiev	UN Resident Coordinator and UNDP Resident Representative
3	Dr. Mahesh Kumar Aggarwal	Deputy Commissioner -UIP, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare
4	Ms. S. Aparna	Principal Secretary, Department of Planning, Government of Gujarat
5	Ms. Sumeeta Banerji & Team	Assistant Country Director & Head (Democratic Governance)
6	Mr. Hugo Barillas	Procurement Specialist, Procurement Unit
7	Mr. Umesh Chawla & Team	Monitoring and Evaluation Team
8	Dr. Jaco Cilliers	Country Director, UNDP
9	Mr. Rajgopal Devara	Secretary, Tribal Development Department, Government of Maharashtra
10	Ms. Bakala Dey	Program Management Specialist, USAID India
11	Ms. Petal Dhillon	Deputy Secretary, Department of Economic Affairs (DEA)
12	Dr. A. Duraisamy	Director, Ozone Cell, Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change
13	Mr. Praveen Garg	Joint Secretary, Department of Economic Affairs and Former Joint Secretary, Department of Justice
14	Mr S. Gholap	Under Secretary, Department of Relief & Rehabilitation, Govt. of Maharashtra
15	Mr. Dilip Gode	Secretary, Vidharbha Nature Conservation Society (VNCS)
16	Dr. Naresh Goel	Deputy Director General (IEC, Mainstreaming), National AIDS Control Organization(Ministry of Health and Family Welfare)
17	Mr. Pradeep Goyal	Director, Agarwal Channels, Raipur
18	Ms. Momin Jaan	Programme Analyst, Strategic Planning Unit
19	Ms. Radhika Kaul Batra & Team	Chief of Staff, UN Resident Coordinator's office
20	Mr. Sanjay Kothari	Secretary, Department of Personnel & Training (DoPT)
21	Mr. T. Vijay Kumar	Special Chief Secretary to Government of Andhra Pradesh (Agriculture) (Former Additional Secretary to MoRD)
22	Mr. Alok Kumar	Additional Secretary, NITI Aayog
23	Ms Uma Mahadevan	Secretary, Department of Planning, Government of Karnataka
24	Mr. Kamal Lochan Mishra	Chief General Manager, Orissa State Disaster Management Authority
25	Ms. Sarada Muraleedharan	Joint Secretary, Ministry of Panchayati Raj (MoPR)
26	Ms. Alka Narang & Team	Assistant Country Director & Head of Unit (Poverty)
27	Mr. Mark Newton	Deputy Director/ Mission Disaster Response Officer, USAID India
28	Mr. Ashok Pai	Joint Secretary, Ministry of Tribal Affairs

INDEPENDENT MID-TERM REVIEW (2013-2015)
COUNTRY PROGRAMME ACTION PLAN (2013-2017) UNDP INDIA

Sl.No.	Name	Designation
29	Ms. Purnima	Head, KHOJ Melghat
30	Mr. G.B.Reddy	Special Secretary, Planning & Coordination, Government of Odisha
31	Dr. A.K Singhal	National Project Manager, Solar Project
32	Mr. Amarjeet Sinha	Additional Secretary (RD), Ministry of Rural Development (MoRD)
33	Ms. Preeti Soni & Team	Assistant Country Director & Head (Energy and Environment)
34	Ms. Payal Suri	Head, Resource Planning Unit
35	Mr. Ossama Tawil	Country Coordinator, UNAIDS
36	Dr. Usha Titus	Former Joint Secretary, Department of Economic Affairs (DEA)
37	Laxmi Tripathi	CEW Astitva, Transgender Community
38	Mr. Mangesh Tyagi	Principle Adviser, State Planning Commission, Government of Madhya Pradesh
39	Mr. N.Vasudevan	Chief Conservator of Forests (Mangrove Cell), Revenue & Forest Department, Government of Maharashtra
40	Ms. Marina Walter	Deputy Country Director, UNDP

Photo © Shashank Jayaprasad/ Ruhani Kaur/ Ranjan Rahi/ Ishan Tankha/ Prashanth Vishwanath/UNDP India and Chandan Khanna/ AFP



50
YEARS

Empowered lives. Resilient nations.

United Nations Development Programme

55 Lodi Estate, P.O. Box 3059

New Delhi - 110003, India

Tel: +91-11-46532333

Fax: +91-11-24627612

Email: info.in@undp.org

Visit: in.undp.org

Like: [f](https://www.facebook.com/UNDP.in) /UNDP in India

Follow: [t](https://twitter.com/UNDP_India) @UNDP_India



© UNDP India 2016. All rights reserved. Published in India.