 Schweizerische Eidgenossenschaft
Confédération suisse
Confederazione Svizzera
Confederaziun svizra

Swiss Agency for Development
and Cooperation SDC



LEAVE NO ONE BEHIND

BUDGETING OF SDG 11 INDICATORS

FINAL REPORT

JANUARY 2021



**Leave
No One
Behind**

United Nations House

Skanderbej Street, Gurten Building, 2nd floor, Tirana, Albania

Tel.: +355 (4) 2250 205, 2250 224, 2250 234

This report is commissioned by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), in Albania in the framework of the UN Joint Programme ‘Leave No One Behind’ which is supported by the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC).

Opinions and views expressed in this report do not necessarily reflect those of the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) or the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC)

Prepared by:

Ilir Ciko MBA/MPA

Executive Summary

Albania is fully committed to the implementation of the 2030 Agenda. The Albanian Parliament has unanimously approved a resolution confirming the country's commitment to 2030 Agenda as it plays an important role in monitoring achievement of the SDGs. Institutional mechanisms have been established to feed in the Sustainable Development Goals in the National Strategy for Development and Integration, as well as in the sector strategies, policies and legislation. The Law no. 22 "On Social Housing", approved by the Parliament of Albania on May 3rd, 2018, aims to achieve the harmonization of the national and international legislation regarding the right to adequate housing, which in international practices is achieved through several legal and budget instruments.

The implementation of this law in Albania, goes in tandem with achieving the SDG Target 11.1 which extends in the policy area of the social housing in the 2030 Agenda and reported by the progress with the SDG Indicator 11.1.1 that reveals the proportion of urban population living in the three dimensions related to housing – slums, informal settlements and inadequate housing. Common practices from other countries reveals that measurement of the SDG Indicator 11.1.1 is typically limited only to its first dimension (slums) while the other two dimensions are often overlooked, and this is also the case for Albania. In addition, the Albanian legislation on social housing has no definitions for the term '*slums*' (which also cannot be translated in a single corresponding word in the Albanian language), and this poses another challenge on using this indicator to measure and report progress toward SDG 11.

Despite these and other challenges elaborated in the report, statistical data and information relating to the housing conditions in Albania are currently available, primarily through the Population and Households Census and the Households Budget Survey, conducted periodically by INSTAT. However, The information obtained through these surveys requires further alignment with the adopted methodology for the SDG Indicator 11.1.1, which eventually would support the authorities to: (i) obtain a baseline assessment of the current situation in Albania in terms of SDG Target 11.1 on social housing, (ii) enable the utilization of this indicator to monitor the progress in achieving the SDG 11 in Albania, (iii) establish clear links between the indicator and the effective policy statement, goals and programs on social housing in Albania, (iv) determine long term vision and intermediate targets associated with specific budgets to achieve these goals, and (v) include Albania in the list of reporting countries for indicator SDG Indicator 11.1.1, which would enable cross-countries analysis and comparisons.

Definition of the SDG Indicator 11.1.1

The SDG indicator 11.1.1 "Proportion of urban population living in slums, informal settlements, or inadequate housing" (Tier I) has been used in the past to monitor the implementation of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and due to its relevance, particularly in developing countries, it was subsequently integrated among other indicators in the SDGs framework as a proxy for achieving SDG Target 11.1 "By 2030, ensure access for all to adequate, safe and affordable housing and basic services and upgrade slums".

The definition of the SDG Target 11.1 explicitly takes in consideration the affordability dimension of the housing. However, the SDG indicator 11.1.1, proposed to monitor the implementation of the SDG Target 11.1, under the adopted methodology, has a less relevant connection with this important dimension (as embedded in the inadequate housing component). In addition, no other SDG indicators are currently being proposed to monitor the progress made by 2030 on the affordability dimension of the SDG Target 11.1. As a result, even if countries like Albania were to utilize the same methodology currently adopted by the UN (UN-Habitat) for data collection on the SDG Indicator 11.1.1, these efforts would practically result insufficient to adequately monitor the affordability dimension of the housing, which from the other side is closely linked to the policy area of social housing.

The current definition of the SDG indicator 11.1.1 “Proportion of urban population living in slums, informal settlements, or inadequate housing” is based on the premises that spatial inequalities contribute to the segregation of particular population groups, which resemble poverty and/or inadequate life conditions. Furthermore, the definition of this SDG indicator addresses the concerns on rapid urbanization, which if not well managed, could lead to more informal settlements and poverty.

The core substance of the SDG Target 11.1 calls for prosperous and inclusive cities, able to reduce spatial inequalities through the right public policies in place. To develop and implement such public policies it is necessary to identify and quantify the slums in any particular area and therefore the proper definition of the slums (and similarly, informal settlements and inadequate housing) is especially important in order to ensure that the SDG indicator 11.1.1 measures in the same way the progress in all the countries implementing the 2030 Agenda. This section summarizes the agreed definitions of these three components of the SDG Indicator 11.1.1:

I. Slums

The agreed definition classifies a ‘slum household’ as one in which its inhabitants are prone of one or more of the following ‘household deprivations’, based on United Nations (2007) definitions:

- **access to improved water** - A household is considered to have access to improved drinking water if it has sufficient amount of water for family use. A sufficient amount is the availability of at least 20 liters/person/day. The following criteria are used to determine the access to improved water:
 - a. Piped connection to house or plot
 - b. Bore hole
 - c. Public stand pipe serving no more than 5 households
 - d. Protected dug well
 - e. Protected spring
 - f. Rain water collection
 - g. Bottle water
- **access to improved sanitation facilities** - A household is considered to have access to improved sanitation according to the following criteria:
 - a. Direct connection to public sewer
 - b. Direct connection to septic tank
 - c. Poor flush latrine
 - d. Ventilated improved pit latrine

- e. Pit latrine with slab
- **sufficient-living area** (not overcrowded) - A dwelling unit is considered to provide a sufficient living area for the household members if there are fewer than four people per habitable room. Additional indicators of overcrowding have been proposed: area-level indicators such as average in-house living area per person or the number of households per area; housing-unit level indicators such as the number of persons per bed or the number of children under five per room may also be viable.
- **durable housing** - A house is considered as 'durable' if it is built on a non-hazardous location and has a structure permanent and adequate enough to protect its inhabitants from the extremes of climatic conditions. The following criteria are used to determine the structural quality/durability of dwellings:
 - a. Permanency of structure
 - b. Permanent building material for the walls, roof and floor
 - c. Compliance of building codes
 - d. The dwelling is not in a dilapidated state
 - e. The dwelling is not in need of major repair
 - f. The dwelling is not located on a steep slope
 - g. The dwelling is not located on or near toxic waste
 - h. Location of house (hazardous)
 - i. The dwelling is not located in a flood plain
 - j. The dwelling is not located in a dangerous right of way (rail, highway, airport, power lines).
- **security of tenure** - the right of all individuals and groups to effective protection by the State against arbitrary unlawful evictions. Secure tenure can be made evident through formal or informal mechanisms in codified law and in customary law. The following criteria are used to determine security of tenure:
 - a. Evidence of documentation that can be used as proof of secure tenure status
 - b. Either de facto or perceived / protection from forced evictions

II. *Informal Settlements*

Although the informal settlements are often referred interchangeably with slums, they are defined by three distinct, main criteria, discussed above in the definition of slums. These are:

1. Inhabitants have no security of tenure vis-à-vis the land or dwellings they inhabit, with modalities ranging from squatting to informal rental housing,
2. The neighborhoods usually lack, or are cut off from, formal basic services and city infrastructure, and
3. The housing may not comply with current planning and building regulations, is often situated in geographically and environmentally hazardous areas, and may lack a municipal permit.

Informal settlements can be occupied by all income levels of urban residents, affluent and poor.

III. Inadequate Housing

The Article 25 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights includes housing as one of the components of the right to adequate standards of living for all. The United Nations Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights’ general comments No.4 (1991) on the right to adequate housing and No.7 (1997) on forced evictions have underlined that the right to adequate housing should be seen as the right to live somewhere in security, peace and dignity. For housing to be adequate, it must provide more than four walls and a roof, and at a minimum, meet the following criteria:

- Legal security of tenure, which guarantees legal protection against forced evictions, harassment and other threats;
- Availability of services, materials, facilities and infrastructure, including safe drinking water, adequate sanitation, energy for cooking, heating, lighting, food storage or refuse disposal;
- Affordability, as housing is not adequate if its cost threatens or compromises the occupants’ enjoyment of other human rights;
- Habitability, as housing is not adequate if it does not guarantee physical safety or provide adequate space, as well as protection against the cold, damp, heat, rain, wind, other threats to health and structural hazards;
- Accessibility, as housing is not adequate if the specific needs of disadvantaged and marginalized groups are not taken into account (such as the poor, people facing discrimination; persons with disabilities, victims of natural disasters);
- Location, as housing is not adequate if it is cut off from employment opportunities, health-care services, schools, childcare centers and other social facilities, or if located in dangerous or polluted sites or in immediate proximity to pollution sources; and
- Cultural adequacy, as housing is not adequate if it does not respect and take into account the expression of cultural identity and ways of life.

To monitor progress in achieving the SDG Target 11.1, the **SDG Indicator 11.1.1 is a composite indicator which groups the definition of slums and informal settlements, and includes the component of affordability from the definition of adequate housing**, as shown per below. Nevertheless, as noted in this report, SDG Indicator 11.1.1 is often referred to the incomplete format of “Proportion of urban population living in slums”, which does not include the informal settlements and the inadequate housing dimensions of the SDG Target 11.1.

Slums / Informal Settlements	DEFINITION: Household where the inhabitants suffer one or more of the following ‘household deprivations’: 1) Lack of access to improved water source, 2) Lack of access to improved sanitation facilities, 3) Lack of sufficient living area, 4) Lack of housing	MEASUREMENT: <i>Security of Tenure:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proportion of households with formal title deeds to both land and residence. • Proportion of households with formal title deeds to either one of land or residence. • Proportion of households with agreements or any document as a proof of a tenure arrangement.
-------------------------------------	--	--

	<p>durability and, 5) Lack of security of tenure).</p>	<p><i>Adequate water:</i> A settlement has an inadequate drinking water supply if less than 50% of households have an improved water supply:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • household connection; • access to public stand pipe; • rainwater collection; with at least 20 liters/person/day available within an acceptable collection distance. <p><i>Access to sanitation:</i> A settlement has inadequate sanitation if less than 50% of households have improved sanitation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • public sewer; • septic tank; • pour-flush latrine; • Ventilated improved pit latrine. <p>The excreta disposal system is considered adequate if it is private or shared by a maximum of two households.</p> <p><i>Structural quality of Housing and location:</i> Proportion of households residing on or near a hazardous site. The following locations should be considered:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • housing in geologically hazardous zones (landslide/earthquake and flood areas); • housing on or under garbage mountains; • housing around high-industrial pollution areas; • housing around other unprotected high-risk zones (e.g. railroads, airports, energy transmission lines). <p><i>Structural quality of the housing and permanency of the structure:</i> Proportion of households living in temporary and/or dilapidated structures. The following factors should be considered when placing a housing unit in these categories:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • quality of construction (e.g. materials used for wall, floor and roof); • compliance with local building codes, standards and bylaws. <p><i>Sufficient living area / Overcrowding:</i></p>
--	--	---

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proportion of households with more than two persons per room.
Inadequate housing	DEFINITION: Proposed to complement the slums/informal settlements measuring affordability of housing at the global level.	MEASUREMENT: <i>Affordability:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proportion of households with net monthly expenditure on housing exceeding 30% of the total monthly income of the household.

Based on the above definitions, the SDG indicator 11.1.1 “Proportion of urban population living in slums, informal settlements, or inadequate housing”, measures: (i) the proportion of urban population living in slums and/or informal settlements; and (ii) proportion of urban population living in inadequate housing as measured by the affordability of housing. Often, this indicator refers only to its reduced definition “Proportion of urban population living in slums” although this format only partially represents the methodology for this indicator. Moreover, there are also other challenges while considering this indicator, for example:

- Difficulties to agree on some definitions and characteristics when referring to deteriorated housing conditions, often due to political or economic considerations.
- Lack of appropriate tools at national and city levels to measure all the components required by the SDG Indicator 11.1.1, sometimes resulting in the underestimation of deteriorated housing units.
- The complicated relation between security of tenure with land and property makes it a difficult, but vital, aspect to include in the different surveys, and thus, to measure and monitor.
- Indicator 11.1.1 does not capture homelessness.

The legal framework

The Albanian Parliament has adopted the Law No.22 / 2018 "On Social Housing", designed to support the social housing programs in Albania. The law was drafted with UNDP assistance as part of UNDP’s contribution to furthering the domestic social inclusion agenda. The law aims at creating opportunities for adequate and affordable housing for a safe, dignified and peaceful life, relying on the solvency of individuals and families in need of housing and in need of state aid. It intends to provide a tailored approach to the needs of people with disabilities, the elderly, children and other groups, by reducing the efforts of these groups to meet their specific housing needs.

The social housing programs foreseen in the law include: 1) the Social Housing Rental Program, SHR (BSQ); 2) program to Enhance the Conditions of Existing dwellings or construction of new ones; 3) the Affordable Dwelling Unit program, ADU (BKU); 4) the Area Development program for Housing purposes; 5) the Temporary Shelter (accommodation) program; 6) the Specialized Housing program. Besides existing programs like BSQ and BKU, this law brought about several innovations including the creation of a public fund for social housing, the introduction of the meaning, role and status of the social owner, provision of a points-based criteria system of assessing the eligibility of the applicants, the Temporary Shelter program,

the Specialized Housing program, and other specific obligations that the law imposes on the local governments and on the private sector contributions relevant to social housing.

While the law in its first part elaborates in details issues related to affordability of housing (Article 3), adequate housing (Article 4), or security of tenure (Article 5), the law does not provide adequate reference and is missing a definition for the slums, which would enable and support the preparation, development and implementation of the secondary legislation, pursuant to the 2030 Agenda definitions, and enable monitoring of the related indicator under the SDG Target 11.1. Moreover, no clear definition exists in the Albanian language for the term '*slum*', which poses an additional challenge for implementing the specific targets of Goal 11.

In order to overcome this issue, it is recommended to introduce the concept of '*slums*' in future revisions of the Law on Social Housing. The '*slums*' term is broadly used across most countries of the world, and its status is regularly reported by countries at far more advanced economic development stage than Albania. Based on consultations with experts and professional interpreters '*shtëpi në gjendje të mjerueshme*' is proposed as the most suitable definition in the Albanian language for the term '*slums*'. The legal and technical definition of the '*slums*' in the law should follow the definitions elaborated in the first section of this report, in accordance with the SDG indicator 11.1.1 methodology and guidelines, and by reflecting the specific features of the Albanian context.

Monitoring the SDG indicator 11.1.1 in Albania

Albania's Baseline Report on the Sustainable Development Goals, at the time of publication in 2017, reported that the SDG indicator 11.1.1 was not monitored in Albania. Lack of definition for slums in the Albanian legal framework, relevance of slums in the Albanian social, economic and demographic context, and the lack of any data on this indicator, based on the definition of the global SDG indicator 11.1.1, were among the main reasons the Baseline Report on SDGs in Albania reported that this indicator was not monitored in Albania.

A follow-up work to the Baseline Report on the SDGs in Albania, aiming to establish indicators passports for the SDG indicators in Albania (2019), based on discussions with the experts from the Ministry of Finance and Economy and INSTAT, reported that the Households Budget Survey (which is conducted on annual basis by INSTAT) specifies a level of 24% for the global SDG indicator 11.1.1 (slums/informal settlements). The report however, notes that: "...the indicator reported by HBS appears to mis-measure the global SDG indicator 11.1.1. Definition of '*slums*' in national standards is not the same as per global standards and further work is required to align the national indicator with the methodology for the SDG Indicator 11.1.1".

The reported SDG Indicator 11.1.1, based on domestic monitoring through the Households Budget Survey, appears to reveal the level of slums in Albania in 2018, without a direct reference to slums, but by using the global definitions of slums as interpreted by the results of the survey. It does not include the informal settlements and inadequate housing components of the SDG Indicator 11.1.1. Furthermore, no mid-term (2024) or long term vision (2030) have been established for this indicator in Albania.

Indicator	<i>SDG indicator</i>	<i>11.1.1 Proportion of urban population living in slums, informal settlements or inadequate housing</i>	
Indicator type	<i>High Level / Impact / Result /</i>	<i>Nivel i Larte (OZHQ)</i>	
Document reference	<i>Strategic document referring the indicator</i>	<i>SDG Global Indicators Framework https://unstats.un.org/sdgs/indicators-list/</i>	
Connection to NSDI (Pillar)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. GJASHTË PRIORITETET E QEVERISË 2. ANETARESIMI NE BE 3. QEVERISJA E MIRË, DEMOKRACIA DHE SHTETI I SË DREJTËS 4. RRITJA PËRMES STABILITETIT MAKRO-EKONOMIK DHE FISKAL 5. RRITJA EKONOMIKE PËRMES RRITJES SË KONKURRUESHMËRISË DHE NOVACIONIT 6. INVESTIMI NË KAPITAL NJERËZOR DHE KOHEZION SOCIAL 7. RRITJA PËRMES PËRDORIMIT TËQËNDRUESHËM TË BURIMEVE DHE ZHVILLIMIT TË TERRITORIT 		6. INVESTMENT IN HUMAN CAPITAL AND SOCIAL COHESION
Objective in NSDI	<i>Definition in NSDI</i>	-	
Corresponding policy	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Kur ka Strategji vendoset titulli sic eshte tek Dokumenti excel "Mapping NSDI_MTBP for IPSIS", Kolona 17 2. Kur nuk ka Strategji vendoset titulli sic eshte ne SKZHI te dokumenti "Mapping NSDI_MTBP for IPSIS", Kolona 7 		
Specific objective	<i>"Mapping NSDI_MTBP for IPSIS"</i>		
Indicator	<i>Policy/Sector/Legal act/bylaw/employment/property/implementation measure</i>		

Connection with Acquis Communautaire		Chapter 19		
Source of information	HBS / Census			
Responsible institutions.	INSTAT	INSTAT	INSTAT	
	Participating institutions	MFE	MIE INSTAT	
Methodology				As per the 2030 Agenda, to guide the development of the appropriate policies and programmes for ensuring access for all to adequate housing and the upgrading of slums, it is necessary to identify and quantify the proportion of the population that live in slums, informal settlements and those living in inadequate housing.
Frequency				
				Annual (HBS)
Nature of indicator	<p><i>Incremental - Indicators of an increasing nature are intended to be reported for each reporting period only at the value of the progress made during the current reporting period. "number of trainings completed". For the mentioned indicator, it is more appropriate to report the value of the progress made only in the current reporting period.</i></p> <p><i>Cumulative - For some indicators, it is more appropriate to report the total value of the indicator for each reporting period rather than how the value has changed since the last reporting period. An example might be a road project from point A to point B. The indicator is "How much% of the work is completed" and is set to report data on a quarterly basis. For the expert who has to report a value on the indicator each quarter, it</i></p>	Declining		

	<i>is easier to report the value of the last date rather than the progress made by the indicator on a quarterly basis. "</i>			
Direct or composite		<i>Direct</i>		
Formula		-		
Disaggregation				
Trend		<i>Declining</i>		
Baseline	<i>Year</i>	2018		
	<i>Value</i>	24%		
Target	<i>Year and value</i>		2020-	
	<i>Year and value</i>		2021-	
	<i>Year and value</i>		2022-	
	<i>Year and value</i>		2023-	
	<i>Year and value</i>		2024-	<i>The indicator reported by HBS appears to mismeasure indicator 11.1.1. Definition of 'slums' in national standards not the same as</i>

				<i>per global standards. Further work is required to align the national indicator with the methodology for 11.1.1</i>
Target	<i>Year and value</i>			
Baseline	<i>Year and value</i>		2019-	
SDG		11		SDG 11
SDG Target	<i>Year and value</i>	11.1	-	-

Figure 1: SDG indicators 11.1.1 passport in Albania

The Household Budget Survey is conducted by INSTAT at the household level and provides an overview of the socio-economic situation of the Albanian households. The results of the survey are used to update the Consumer Price Index and Final Consumption calculation households as an important aggregate of GDP by the expenditure method. The Household Budget Survey was conducted for the first time in 1999-2000 and was limited only for urban areas, continuing later on in 2006-2007, 2008-2009 and every year since 2014. From 2006-2007 the survey is conducted across the Albanian territory including urban and rural areas.

The survey in 2019 had a sample of 9,360 households, out of which 7,235 households responded to the questionnaire. While the sample may be deemed as suitable to achieve the primary goal of the survey – revealing valuable information on the consumption side of the households expenditure – it appears rather insufficient to represent the real housing conditions, and particularly the conditions of slums cases across the entire territory of Albania. Moreover, the relatively modest population sample utilized in the HBS is clearly insufficient to capture the slums conditions in the country, and it bears the risk of considerable deviations in the results from year to year due to the changes in the sample selection.

Although the publication of the Household Budget Survey does not provide explicit information related to slums, the questions included in its questionnaire shed some light and lead to the value used for SDG Indicator 11.1.1. The housing section in the survey, among others, includes questions on:

- Type of the household
- Access to improved water supply in the household
- Access to improved sanitation in the household
- Legal status of the household
- Number of rooms
- Availability of adequate space (per person)

ANKETA E BUXHETIT TË FAMILJES NË SHQIPËRI		ABF / 2
Seksioni 2: TË DHËNA MBI BANESËN		
STATUSI I PËRDORIMIT TË BANESËS		
9. Në cilin vit erdhi familja juaj në këtë banesë për herë të parë?		□ □ □ □
10. Cili është statusi legal i përdorimit të banesës?		
Pronar ose duke u bërë pronar (sa më shumë huadhërdit)	<input type="checkbox"/>	1>>P.13a
Duke u bërë pronar por në pritje të legalizimit	<input type="checkbox"/>	2>>P.13a
Më qera nga një person privat	<input type="checkbox"/>	3
Më qera nga shteti	<input type="checkbox"/>	4
Jeton falas ose e ka në përdorim	<input type="checkbox"/>	5>>P.13a
Tjetër (specifikoni p.sh. bashkëpronar etj. _____)	<input type="checkbox"/>	6>>P.13a

Figure 2: Questionnaire of the Household Budget Survey, 2019 (in Albanian). Courtesy, INSTAT

Seksioni 2: TË DHËNA MBI BANESËN

A) BANESA KRYESORE

KARAKTERISTIKAT E BANESËS		
1. Lloji i banesës (për t'u plotësuar nga anketuesi bazuar në vërtetimin e tij/saj):		
Shtëpi për një familje	<input type="checkbox"/>	1
Banesë në një ndërtesë me më shumë se 15 apartamente	<input type="checkbox"/>	2
Banesë në një ndërtesë me më tepër se 15 apartamente	<input type="checkbox"/>	3
Banesë në një ndërtesë jo për banim por të përdorur për banim (shkollë, barska etj.)	<input type="checkbox"/>	4 >> P.5
Tjetër (Specifikoni _____)	<input type="checkbox"/>	5 >> P.5
2. Në cilin vit është ndërtuar banesa? (nëse nuk e di shkruaj 9997)		

3. Cila është sipërfaqja e përdorur nga familja juaj?		
	m ²	_____
4. Sa dhoma të banesës përdoren nga familja juaj? (duke përfshirur: kuzhinë, balkon, kondoret, barqet)		
	Nr.	_____
SHËRBIMET E BANESËS		
5. A ka kjo banesë:	PO=1	JO=2
Kuzhinë të veçanta	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
WC brenda banesës	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
WC jashtë banesës	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Dush	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sistem të ujit të pijshëm	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Ujë të ngrohtë	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Energji elektrike	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sistem kanalizimi të ujërave të zeza	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Ngrohje qendrore në banesë ose në ndërtesë	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Linjë telefonike	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Linjë internet	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Garazh	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Depo	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Papafingo	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Balkon	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Platformë të pjerrtë (për persona me aftësi të kufizuara)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Ashensor	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Oborr	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
6. Nëse uji i ngrohtë është i disponueshëm në banesë, çfarë lloj instalimi apo pajisjeje përdorni?		
Boxer elektrik	<input type="checkbox"/>	1
Sistem ngrohjeje individual (gaz, naftë etj.)	<input type="checkbox"/>	2
Sistem ngrohjeje qendror (gaz, naftë etj.)	<input type="checkbox"/>	3
Panеле diellore	<input type="checkbox"/>	4
Tjetër (Specifikoni _____)	<input type="checkbox"/>	5
7. Në çfarë mënyre sigurohet kryesisht ngrohja në këtë banesë?		
Sistem ngrohje qendrore në ndërtesë (gaz, naftë etj.)	<input type="checkbox"/>	1
Sistem ngrohje qendrore në banesë (gaz, naftë etj.)	<input type="checkbox"/>	2
Kondicioner, kalonfer, sobë me dru dhe pajisje të tjera të veçanta për ngrohje	<input type="checkbox"/>	3
Tjetër (Specifikoni _____)	<input type="checkbox"/>	4
8. Cilat janë burimet që përdoren kryesisht për ngrohje në këtë banesë?		
Naftë, gasoil ose lëndë të tjera djegëse të lëngshme	<input type="checkbox"/>	1
Gaz	<input type="checkbox"/>	2
Energji elektrike	<input type="checkbox"/>	3
Dru, qymyr dhe materiale të tjera të ngurta	<input type="checkbox"/>	4
Të tjera (specifikoni si panеле diellore, etj. _____)	<input type="checkbox"/>	5

According to the INSTAT experts, the non-fulfillment of any of the above conditions qualifies the reported house as a 'slum', although the term 'slum' is not yet defined in the Albanian legislation and this qualification is not fully compatible with the definition of 'slums' at the global level (as observed above, slums is defined as household where the inhabitants suffer one or more of the following 'household deprivations': 1) Lack of access to improved water source, 2) Lack of access to improved sanitation facilities, 3) Lack of sufficient living area, 4) Lack of housing durability and, 5) Lack of security of tenure). Nevertheless, this definition is currently the best approximation to the SDG Indicator 11.1.1 based on the available data from the national surveys.

It should be noted however, that the Household Budget Survey is designed to exclude from the questions on household conditions the participants in the sample living in barracks, dormitories or modified settlements (such as abandoned industrial buildings etc.), thus making its results even more distant from the reality of persons living in slums or similar housing conditions.

Another relevant source of data on housing conditions in Albania, derives from the Population and Households Census, conducted by INSTAT every ten years. While the structure of the Census questionnaire is similar to the one used in the Households Budget Survey, it provides a few more details on living conditions in the households but some important elements of the SDG indicator 11.1.1 definition, are still missing (security of tenure/durability/affordability etc.). The main disadvantage on relying on the Census results for the purpose of budgeting through the SDG indicator 11.1.1 is its infrequent periodicity (every 10 years, the most recent in 2011) while the key advantage is that differently from the HBS, the Census provides a far more accurate picture of the housing conditions across the country, as it based not on a specific sample – like the HBS, but on the information collected from every recorded household in the country.

PYETËSORI I NDËRTESESË

1 Cili është lloji i ndërtesës?

1 Shtëpi e veçuar, e ndarë

2 Shtëpi pjesërisht e veçuar

3 Shtëpi në rend ose tarracore (me të paktën tri banesa të lidhura apo të ngjitura, secila me hyrje të veçantë)

4 Pallat ose bllok apartamentesh

5 Ndërtesë për bashkësi kolektive

6 Ndërtesë e ndërtuar fillimisht jo për qëllime banimi ▶ SHKO TEK PYETËSORI I BANESËS

7 Lloj tjetër ndërtesë për banim

1 Barakë


2 Tendë

3 Furgon (Karavan) ▶ SHKO TEK PYETËSORI I BANESËS

4 Kasolle

5 Tjetër

2 Cili është viti i ndërtimit të ndërtesës?

1 Viti i ndërtimit 

2 NUK E DI

3 A ka ashensor ndërtesa?

1 PO

2 JO

PYETËSORI I BANESËS

1 Cili është lloji i banesës?

1 Banesë e zakonshme

2 Lloj tjetër banesë ▶ SHKO TEK 3

2 Cili është statusi i banimit?

1 Banesë e zakonshme e banuar nga një apo më shumë persona me vendbanim të zakonshëm

2 Banesë e zakonshme e banuar vetëm nga persona që nuk përfshihen në Censur (trup diplomatik etj.)

3 Banesë e destinuar për qëllime dytësore apo sezonale

4 Banesë e pabanuar

3 Cili është sistemi kryesor në dispozicion i furnizimit me ujë?

1 Rrjet ujësjellësi brenda banesës

2 Rrjet ujësjellësi jashtë banesës, por brenda ndërtesës

3 Rrjet ujësjellësi jashtë ndërtesës

4 Sistem i llojit tjetër

5 Pa asnjë lloj sistemi

4 Cili është lloji i tualetit në përdorim?

1 WC me ujë të rrjedhshëm brenda banesës

2 WC me ujë të rrjedhshëm jashtë banesës, por brenda ndërtesës

3 WC me ujë të rrjedhshëm jashtë ndërtesës

4 Tjetër lloj tualeti

5 Asnjë lloj tualeti


5 A keni dush ose vaskë në banesën tuaj?

1 PO


2 JO

6 Sa është numri i dhomave për banim në këtë banesë?

Nuk duhen përfshirë verandat, ballkonet, tualetet, korridorët, depot ose dhomat më të vogla se 4m²

Numri i dhomave për banim 

7 Sa është gjithsej sipërfaqja e këtyre dhomave?

 m²

8 Cili është lloji kryesor i ngrohjes?

1 Ngrohje qendrore brenda ndërtesës

2 Ngrohje qendrore individuale brenda banesës

3 Stufë

4 Oxhak

5 Ngrohës elektrik

6 Kondicioner

7 Të tjera

8 Nuk ka ngrohje ▶ SHKO TEK LISTA 1

9 Cili është lloji kryesor i energjisë së përdorur për ngrohje?

1 Me dru

2 Me qymyr

3 Me naftë, mazut

4 Me rrymë elektrike

5 Me gaz

6 Me panel diellor

7 Tjetër lloj energjie

Figure 4: Population and Household Census Questionnaire, 2011 (in Albanian). Source: INSTAT

SDG Indicator 11.1.1 measurement on global and regional level.

The platform of the Global SDG Indicators Database, which provides access to data compiled through the UN System in preparation for the Secretary-General's annual report on "Progress towards the Sustainable Development Goals", disseminates data on the SDG Indicator 11.1.1 for 135 countries (last updated October 7th, 2020). Albania is currently not included in the list of the reporting countries.

It should be noted that historical data over the period 2000-2018 for the SDG indicator 11.1.1, is only limited to the measurement of the "Proportion of urban population living in slums" (variable EN_LND_SLUM), which reports only the proportion of the urban population living in slums. As mentioned above, this information is again insufficient to represent the SDG Indicator 11.1.1 according to the definition and methodology of this global SDG indicator (the measurement does not include informal housing and inadequate housing components of the SDG indicator).

Another important source of information that collects and publishes progress on achieving the SDGs at the global level is the Sustainable Development Report 2020, which includes the SDG Index and Dashboards, an annual review of countries' performance on the 17 Sustainable Development Goals, published by Sachs et al. (2020): The Sustainable Development Goals and Covid-19. Sustainable Development Report 2020. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Although this report and its SDG Dashboard is rich in information on achieving the SDG by all the countries, the SDG Indicator 11.1.1 is not included in its list of the monitored indicators.

An assessment of the available online local sources on the utilization of SDG Indicator 11.1.1 in the countries of the region reveals that most countries currently are not tracking this indicator according to its global definition. The Statistical Office of Montenegro (MONSTAT) reports that the indicator is not available and is planned for introduction during the period 2019-2024¹. Nevertheless, the United Nations Global SDG Database reports that the proportion of urban population living in slums, in Montenegro was 27.1% in 2018. The same source reveals that this indicator during the same year was 8.3% in North Macedonia, 7.6% in Bosnia Herzegovina, 3.6% in Serbia, 8.6% in Turkey, 12.1% in Romania and 3.7% in Slovenia².

Another similar example to the situation in Albania is the case of North Macedonia. As noted in the above paragraph, the United Nations Global SDG Database reports data for SDG Indicator 11.1.1. However, when referring to the report Voluntary National Review on SDGs³ (May 2020), the statistical annex reveals that what North Macedonia reports as the SDG Indicator 11.1.1 in fact is the national indicator: "Population living in a dwelling with a leaking roof, damp walls, floors or foundation or rot in window frames of floor by poverty status", which again is related, but different from the definition of the global SDG Indicator 11.1.1.

None of the countries in the region or elsewhere appear to use this indicator for budgeting purposes.

¹ <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1462901117307232>

² <https://unstats.un.org/sdgs/indicators/database/>

³ <https://epi.org.mk/wp-content/uploads/2020/07/North-Macedonia-VNR.pdf>

Conclusions and recommendations

Through the current statistical surveys Albania collects information that relates to the SDG global indicator 11.1.1 “Proportion of urban population living in slums, informal settlements, or inadequate housing”. This information derives annually from the Households Budget Survey and as described in this report, its results are not intended to report progress on achieving SDG Target 11.1. Furthermore, the methodology of the survey is not based on the definitions and the methodology for the SDG Indicator 11.1.1. The outcome of this survey is not fully aligned with the definition of the global SDG indicator 11.1.1 and the population sample utilized to conduct the Households Budget Survey poses another challenging issue when the results of the survey are used to understand the progress with achieving the SDG indicator 11.1.1. From the research conducted, other countries in the region face similar issues in reporting the progress with SDG 11 due to limitations and/or incompatibility with the definition of the SDG global Indicator 11.1.1 and there is no evidence that any country uses the progress with this indicator for budgeting housing programs.

Recommendation 1: *Although the results of the annual Households Budget Survey are useful to understand the living and housing conditions in Albania, due to the inconsistencies between purposes and definitions of the survey’s methodology and SDG indicator 11.1.1’s methodology, as well as by the deviations deriving from the sample selection and representation, such results should be used prudently when considering the utilization of HBS data and results to understand and interpret progress made in upgrading slums, or other aspects of housing conditions, as reported by the SDG Indicator 11.1.1. The inconsistencies in methodology and sample selection, as well as the practices from other countries suggest that at this stage the results on housing conditions deriving from the Households Budget Survey cannot be used as a quantitative performance indicator for effective budgeting purposes in social housing programs.*

The Albanian legislation on the social housing or any other secondary legislation has no official definitions for the ‘slum’ term and this poses another challenge in achieving the SDG 11 as the concept of slum is essential to the definition of the SDG Target 11.1 for all the countries, including developing and advanced economies.

Recommendation 2: *To enable progress monitoring in achieving SDG Target 11.1 in Albania and to mainstream the SDGs in the national context, future revisions of the Law No.22/2018 "On Social Housing" should integrate the definition of the slums, in accordance with the globally accepted definitions described in details in this report and the specific features of the Albanian context. It is proposed that ‘shtëpi në gjendje të mjerueshme’ could be used as the best possible approximation of the term ‘slums’ in the Albanian language.*

The Population and Households Census is another possible source of information that provides relevant data on the global SDG Indicator 11.1.1 in Albania. The methodology for data collection in the Census related to the quality of the households is similar with the methodology used in the Households Budget Survey, which provides results that are only partially compatible with the definition of the SDG Indicator 11.1.1. However, the main advantage of the Population and Households Census over the Households Budget Survey is its much larger scale that includes all the recorded households in the country, and not a selected sample as it is used in the Households Budget Survey. From the other side, the disadvantage of

the Census is its infrequent periodicity (cc. every 10 years), the latest census was held in 2011 and the next one will likely take place during 2022.

Recommendation 3: *The Ministry of Finance and Economy (and the UN-INSTAT joint working group) might consider useful discussing with INSTAT on further aligning the methodology of the Population and Households Census, with the methodology for the global SDG Indicator 11.1.1 in order to ensure that the results of the census provide also a solid and useful baseline for the SDG Indicator 11.1.1 in Albania. Despite the fact that the next census will take place after at least 10 years, a baseline with reliable data is very important to understand the current housing conditions and supports the Ministry of Finance and Economy to plan long term programs and budgets, establish intermediate targets and monitor the implementation during the interim period until the next Census takes place.*

Considering the above, the following are the available options for utilizing the SDG Indicator 11.1.1 to plan and budget accordingly, as part of the budgeting process of PBA, for the implementation of the SDG Target 11.1:

- a. Utilize the information on housing conditions as provided by the Households Budget Survey as a proxy for monitoring progress on SDG Indicator 11.1.1 to plan and budget accordingly, as part of the budgeting process of PBA, for the implementation of the SDG Target 11.1 (this option might include a possible further alignment of the HBS methodology with the SDG Indicator 11.1.1 metadata, based on discussions with INSTAT).
 - I. Advantages: Annual data available, aligned with the process of PBA preparation, no additional costs.
 - II. Disadvantages: Methodology not fully aligned, sample small and may not capture slums, may report erratic/inconsistent results on SDG 11, not consistently used by other countries, difficult if not impossible to be used as a performance indicator for budgeting purposes, no best practices from other countries.
- b. Use the data on housing conditions as provided by the Population and Households Census to monitor progress on SDG Indicator 11.1.1 and to plan and budget accordingly, as part of the budgeting process of PBA, for the implementation of the SDG Target 11.1 (this option might include a possible further alignment of the census methodology with the SDG Indicator 11.1.1 metadata, based on discussions with INSTAT).
 - I. Advantages: no sampling involved but full snapshot of the country is captured by the census, no additional costs (except for possible further alignment of methodology), slums properly captured in the survey.
 - II. Disadvantages: Runs every 10 years (next one in 2022, the other one after the completion of the 2030 Agenda), difficult/impossible to track progress in the interim period, not aligned with PBA preparation cycle, no best practices from other countries.
- c. Use administrative data from national and local institutions to determine the baseline, 2030 and intermediate targets for the SDG Indicator 11.1.1 to plan and budget accordingly, as part of the budgeting process of PBA, for the implementation of the SDG Target 11.1.
 - I. Advantages: no sample but real/full data on slums, independent from HBS/census processes, can be aligned with PBA preparation cycle

- II. Disadvantages: Difficult to manage, requires additional resources and costs, reliance on timely input/cooperation from municipalities, time consuming.
- d. Organize/conduct new survey to monitor SDG Indicator 11.1.1 and use the data to plan and budget accordingly, as part of the budgeting process of PBA, for the implementation of the SDG Target 11.1.
 - I. Advantages: independent from HBS/census processes, can be aligned with PBA preparation cycle, more realistic and consistent data, may be fully aligned with the methodology for the global SDG Indicator 11.1.1
 - II. Disadvantages: Costly, difficult to manage, time consuming.
- e. Combination of any of the above

Recommendation 4: *Based on the advantages and disadvantages of the options above, it is recommended to consider Option b, to establish a realistic baseline for the SDG Indicator 11.1.1 through the Population and Household Census. Long term objectives (i.e. 2025-2030) and intermediate targets could be established based on the baseline results and the social housing budget commitments in the PBA while results could be matched with annual administrative records and validated in the next Census.*