

**Inter-Governmental**

**Roles in Service Delivery**

Afghanistan

Sub-National Governance Study Paper No. 3

November 2013

Michael J. Meyer and Abdul Moien Jawhary

Table of Contents

1. Acronyms and Abbreviations 1
2. [Executive Summary 3](#_Toc371350492)

C. Background and Methodology 9

D. [Public Sector Profile in Afghanistan 8](#_Toc371350493)

1. Current Structure of the Public Sector 11

2. Service Delivery Issues: Previous Findings [10](#_Toc371350495)

3. [UNDP Support 12](#_Toc371350496)

E. Overview of Sectoral Functional Assignments [13](#_Toc371350497)

[1. Education 13](#_Toc371350499)

[2. Health Care 15](#_Toc371350500)

[3. Rural Roads 16](#_Toc371350501)

[4. Water Supply and Sanitation 17](#_Toc371350502)

[5. Vital and Civil Registration 19](#_Toc371350503)

[6. Land Registration 20](#_Toc371350504)

[7. Irrigation 22](#_Toc371350505)

[8. Agricultural Extension 24](#_Toc371350506)

[9. Energy 27](#_Toc371350507)

[10. Disaster Management 29](#_Toc371350508)

F. [Assessment of Current Assignments 32](#_Toc371350509)

[1. Education Sector 32](#_Toc371350511)

[2. Health Care 34](#_Toc371350512)

[3. Rural Roads 36](#_Toc371350513)

[4. Water Supply and Sanitation 38](#_Toc371350514)

[5. Civil and Vital Registration 40](#_Toc371350515)

[6. Land Registration 41](#_Toc371350516)

[7. Irrigation 43](#_Toc371350517)

[8. Agricultural Extension 45](#_Toc371350518)

[9. Energy 47](#_Toc371350519)

[10. Disaster Management 49](#_Toc371350520)

[G. Alternative Approaches to Improve Service Delivery 53](#_Toc371350521)

[1. Education Sector 56](#_Toc371350511)

[2. Health Care 58](#_Toc371350512)

[3. Rural Roads 59](#_Toc371350513)

[4. Water Supply and Sanitation 60](#_Toc371350514)

[5. Civil and Vital Registration 61](#_Toc371350515)

[6. Land Registration 62](#_Toc371350516)

[7. Irrigation 63](#_Toc371350517)

[8. Agricultural Extension 64](#_Toc371350518)

[9. Energy 6](#_Toc371350519)5

[10. Disaster Management 67](#_Toc371350520)

H. Conclusion 69

I. References 71

Acronyms and Abbreviations

ANDMA Afghanistan National Disaster Management Authority

ANDS Afghanistan National Development Strategy

*ARAZI*  Afghanistan Land Management Authority

ASGP Afghanistan Sub-National Governance Programme

AUWSSC Afghanistan Urban Water Supply and Sewage Corporation

CAWSS Central Authority for Water Supply and Sewerage

CDC Community Development Council

CSO Central Statistics Office

DABS *Da Afghanistan Breshna Sherkat* (National Electric Power Company)

DDA District Development Assembly

GIRoA Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan

IARCSC Independent Administrative Reform & Civil Service Commission

IDLG Independent Directorate of Local Governance

M&E Monitoring and evaluation

MAIL Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock

MEW Ministry of Energy and Water

MoCI Ministry of Commerce and Industries

MoCN Ministry of Counter Narcotics

MoE Ministry of Education

MoEc Ministry of Economy

MoF Ministry of Finance

MoFA Ministry of Foreign Affairs

MoHE Ministry of Higher Education

MoI Ministry of Interior

MoJ Ministry of Justice

MoLSAMD Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs, Martyrs, and Disabled

MoM Ministry of Mines

MoPH Ministry of Public Health

MPW Ministry of Public Works

MoRR Ministry of Refugees and Repatriations

MRRD Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development

MoTCA Ministry of Transport and Civil Aviation

MUDA Ministry of Urban Development Affairs

MoWA Ministry of Women’s Affairs

NABDP National Area Based Development Project

NEPA National Environment Protection Authority

NERAP National Emergency Rural Access Programme

NGO Non-Governmental Organization

NIBP National Institution Building Programme

NPP National Priority Programme

NRAP National Rural Access Programme

NSDP National Skills and Development Programme

NSP National Solidarity Programme

PC Provincial Council

PDCU Programme Development Coordination Unit

PIU Programme Implementation Unit

SBU Strategic Business Unit

SN Sub-National

SNG Sub-National Governance (or Sub-National Government)

SNGDP Sub-National Governance Development Programme

TWG Technical Working Group

UNDP United Nations Development Programme

UNOPS United Nations Office for Projects Services

USAID United States Agency for International Development

WASH Afghanistan National Rural Water, Sanitation and Hygiene

# **Executive Summary**

This study was prepared for the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) country office in Afghanistan, to provide input for the operationalization of its recently-drafted Sub-National Governance Development Strategy (SNGDS) for Afghanistan. Its purposes were: (i) to map out the existing public service delivery roles or functional responsibilities of provinces, districts, municipalities, and national ministries; (ii) to assess the extent to which the current assignment of responsibilities is clear, coherent, and consistent; and (iii) where warranted, to suggest more appropriate assignments of responsibility. It addresses institutional arrangements and service delivery in 10 sectors:

1. Education 6. Land Registration

2. Health Care 7. Irrigation

3. Rural Roads 8. Agricultural Extension

4. Water Supply & Sanitation 9. Energy

5. Vital and Civil Registration 10. Disaster Management

This study was based on literature reviews, interviews with public officials and development partners, and visits to five target provinces and one district. It found that efforts have been made to enhance the capacity of public institutions to provide essential services to citizens, resulting in some improvements in public perception of government performance–particularly with regard to education. Nevertheless, **services and capacities are still inadequate**, poor in quality, and typically inefficient or ineffective.

**National ministries and authorities play key roles** in Afghanistan’s centralized system of government, particularly in the areas of planning, decision-making, and service delivery. In practice, however, **most are unable to fulfill them**. This reflects widespread weaknesses in professional and institutional capacity, problems of communication and coordination, and cumbersome procurement and budgetary financial management practices. Compounding these weaknesses, there are sometimes “gaps” between related laws, rendering the legislation incomplete and ineffective, especially in the higher education and land registration sectors. Despite the inability of central institutions to respond adequately to local needs, it is unlikely the centralization of decision-making, in particular, will be relinquished in the near future.

**At provincial and district levels**, public institutions’ performance and service quality are dependent on various factors including: (i) the influence and expertise of provincial and district governors; (ii) the level of coordination and cooperation between stakeholders in each sector; (iii) efficiency of sector’s respective central ministries or independent authorities; (iv) the effectiveness of their monitoring and evaluation (M&E) practices; (v) the levels of expertise of provincial and district officials; (vi) the availability of adequate financial, human and technical resources at local levels; (vii) remuneration; (viii) clarity in roles and responsibilities; (ix) the potential for inappropriate influence by powerful individuals; and above all (x) the safety and security situation.

**Municipalities** still function under outdated legislation enacted in 2000, which does not fully address the present and increasing needs for public service delivery. In addition, municipalities face shortages of professional human resources, owing mainly to low remuneration. There are also significant overlaps evident in the roles and responsibilities between municipalities and some sector ministries, particularly in water and sanitation.

**Key Findings by Sector**

In general, service delivery is impeded by inadequate budgetary provisions at provincial and district levels, cumbersome and centralized financial management and procurement procedures, and the limited technical capacity of public officials at both central and sub-national levels (related in part to low remuneration). Additional observations by sector include:

*Education*: Education facilities in remote and insecure areas receive particularly limited resources to improve or expand their services. Teachers are inadequately educated, and their numbers are insufficient – particularly for female teachers. Communication and coordination between sector officials is weak. The Ministry of Education’s (MoE) M&E practices in districts, provinces and the centre are insufficient. Pre-school education support is limited to Kabul and a handful of other major cities. There is to date no law supporting higher education in the country or enforcing the improvement of management at higher education institutions.

*Health Care*: Public health care facilities in the country do not meet the health care service needs of the public, and service quality is poor. HIV/AIDS and elderly health care are areas of particular concern that will require much more attention from the Ministry of Public Health (MoPH). Coordination between MoPH and its provincial directorates is weak, and M&E functions are not systematic. There are no benefits for health care personnel who provide services in remote or insecure areas. Pharmacy establishment procedures are lengthy.

*Rural Roads*: There is little or no coordination between the various rural road development programmes and institutions, both at the centre and in the provinces. Although Rural Roads is not identified as a sector in the Afghanistan National Development Strategy (ANDS), it is one of the agriculture and rural development sector objectives. There is to date no rural access policy or related multi-year plan for the country. Norms or standards are as yet undeveloped, and little or no funding has been considered for maintenance or upgrading.

*Water Supply and Sanitation*: Public service delivery in this sector has slowed as a result of the transition from the water supply and sanitation general directorate into the for-profit Afghanistan Urban Water Supply and Sewage Corporation (AUWSSC). Coordination between AUWSSC and municipalities, energy, and telecommunication departments is poor. AUWSSC’s technical capacity for service delivery is weak in provinces and districts, and there is almost no service delivery in the sanitation sector in rural areas.

*Civil and Vital Registration*: In addition to the general inadequacy of budgetary provisions at sub-national levels, provincial and district departments lack dedicated office buildings. Birth, death, and marriage registration is rarely practiced in provinces and districts. There is limited coordination and cooperation between related authorities on finalizing the draft and law enforcement for the provision of electronic ID cards.

*Land Registration*: Land registration does not yet have an updated and valid law. There is some legal ambiguity and limited cooperation between relevant state institutions and law enforcement authorities in applying penalties related to illegal occupation of land. In districts and provinces, land registration documents or archives are either non-existent or have been destroyed.

*Irrigation*: The shortage of financial resources at provincial and district levels is particularly damaging for infrastructure maintenance. Some regional irrigation directorates do not yet have office buildings, vehicles, or related tools and equipment. The government has been unable to halt the degradation of water flow in the A*mu Darya* River basin.

*Agricultural Extension*: At national and provincial levels, influential and powerful individuals interfere with the sector’s regular service delivery in communities. M&E practices of the Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock (MAIL) over its sub-contracted projects are weak. While there are shortages of irrigation water in some parts of the country, almost 70 percent of irrigation water flows beyond the control of the related authorities in this sector.

*Energy*: Insecurity in energy project areas discourages potential investors from providing better services in this sector. Central government has been inefficient in providing adequate energy supply services to rural populations in provinces and districts. Public servants in the energy sector have limited technical capacity to properly maintain the diesel electricity generators provided to the communities.

*Disaster Management*: There is inadequate attention from related government institutions to finance and technically support disaster risk management activities. The Afghanistan National Disaster Management Authority (ANDMA) has historically been weak in terms of institutional capacity for service delivery and coordination with donors. Strategic commodities and relief goods warehouses are insufficient in the provinces and districts. There are varying disaster management guidelines observed across the country. Insecurity has been a major challenge in providing timely and effective services to the communities hit by disasters.

**Overview of Suggestions**

This study suggests a number of ways to improve service delivery to the public, such as:

● Increased financial and technical support, as well as greater delegation, to provincial departments. Capacity improvement and the provision of office space are particularly needed for health care, irrigation, land registration, and water supply and sanitation.

● Provision and/or fuller enforcement of laws, rules, and regulations related to service delivery.

● Strengthening of M&E through annual retreats, establishment of performance-based measurement mechanisms, and frequent monitoring exercises.

● Effective communication and cooperation, and establishment of updated and reliable management information systems, all within the management structures of the service providing ministries/agencies.

● Greater involvement of municipalities, especially in education, water supply, energy, health care, and vital and civil registration. There should be a review and reconsideration of the roles and responsibilities of municipalities in service delivery both at provincial and district levels.

● Improvements in the responsiveness and effectiveness of public service delivery at SN level will not be possible without first achieving broad-based agreement on the country’s SN institutional and fiscal architecture.

1. Background and Methodology

The UNDP office in Afghanistan has recently developed a Sub-National Governance and Development Strategy (SNGDS), aimed at two broad sets of objectives:

**Pillar A – Building capable and responsive sub-national government Institutions for service delivery.** This pillar aims to promote the capacities of sub-national executive institutions at Provincial, District and Municipal levels to provide basic services in an accountable, inclusive, responsive manner, while ensuring more involvement of women.[[1]](#footnote-1) This pillar may be viewed as promoting the “supply” of good, conflict sensitive local governance and accountable service delivery.

**Pillar B – Empowering the population, subnational civic groups and sub-national elected bodies to hold sub-national governments accountable, ensuring stabilization, peace-building, and inclusion.** This pillar aims to ensure that the population, representative bodies, and civil society organizations have the ability to engage with, influence and hold sub-national government institutions accountable for the effectiveness, quality, and equity of public service delivery. This pillar will seek to ensure that marginalized and vulnerable groups are part of prioritizing and monitoring service delivery. It may be viewed as promoting the “demand” for good local governance and accountable service delivery.

This study was commissioned as input to the operationalization of Pillar A, for which UNDP expects to design an on-budget programme for capacity building support at provincial and district levels. The purposes of the study are: (i) to map out the existing distribution of public service delivery roles or functional responsibilities of provinces, districts, municipalities, and national ministries; (ii) to assess the extent to which the current assignment of functional responsibilities is clear, coherent, and consistent; and (iii) where warranted, to suggest more appropriate assignments of responsibility. It addresses institutional arrangements and service delivery in 10 functional sectors:

1. Education 6. Land Registration

2. Health Care 7. Irrigation

3. Rural Roads 8. Agricultural Extension

4. Water Supply & Sanitation 9. Energy

5. Vital and Civil Registration 10. Disaster Management

**Methodology and Approach:** This report is based on an extensive background literature review, interviews with public officials and donor representatives in Kabul, and field visits. The initial inception report was adjusted to include visits to the targeted provinces and districts (within limitations of time, security, and availability of sector officials), and to ensure complementarity with an ongoing World Bank (WB) study, which looks at the assignment of responsibilities at district and sub-district (cluster CDC and CDCs) levels. An interview with the relevant official, in addition to document collection and review/integration of current issues of WB research, was taken into account in this regard.

In addition to material from GIRoA, the WB, and other development partners, the study drew extensively upon documentation for the UNDP’s SNGDS, SN governance policy, and second Afghanistan Sub-National Governance Programme (ASGP-II). Consultations were conducted with UNDP officials, programme managers, and experts plus relevant ministerial representatives in Kabul. Similar consultations also took place in five provinces (Balkh, Herat, Kabul, Nangarhar, and Wardak), and one district with provincial councils, governors or deputy governors, sector line directorates and departments, other provincial and district-level public service providing institutions and officials, district council members, mayors, and some other community leaders. The team also consulted with programme advisors and managers of ASGP-II, the National Institution Building Programme (NIBP), and the National Area Based Development Project (NABDP) in the selected provinces.

The responsibility for the contents and views expressed in this study rests exclusively with the authors and does not reflect any other commitment.

1. Public Sector Profile in Afghanistan**[[2]](#footnote-2)**
2. **Current Structure of the Public Sector**

### According to the Constitution of Afghanistan, sector service responsibilities rest with the executive branch of the government, which is made up of the President, ministries, and independent directorates or authorities. Within the executive branch, the President nominates all national line ministers (who are subject to confirmation by parliament), and appoints all provincial governors, district governors, and heads of independent national authorities and commissions. The Constitution provides for direct election of only two types of government executives—the President, and the mayors of municipalities. However, in practice no municipal elections have yet been held, and mayors are also appointed by the President. The President’s executive powers extend to government legislative activities, budget institutions, and bringing about changes in cabinet.

There are 25 ministries and 24 independent commissions or national authorities within the organogram of the central government.[[3]](#footnote-3) The ministries are responsible for delivering sector services. Ministries have considerable control over the operational and budgetary processes of their offices across the country, and each plays a role in carrying out governmental services outlined in the constitution. The service delivery roles and responsibilities of Afghanistan’s sector ministries include: public law and order maintenance, budgeting and financial affairs, devising and implementing strategies and programmes for social, cultural, and economic progress, protecting independence, territorial integrity, and safeguarding the interests of the country. The foundation of all laws in Afghanistan is compliant with the Constitution adopted in 2004, including the requirements of the Islamic religion.

Afghanistan’s national development objectives are described in the Afghanistan National Development Strategy (ANDS), and have been arranged under the key pillars of security, governance and rule of law and human rights, and economic and social development. The ANDS provides for 17 sector strategies for the period 2008-2013, which in turn fit within eight sub-pillars of security, good governance, infrastructure and natural resources, education and culture, health and nutrition, agriculture and rural development, social protection, and economic governance and private sector development. There are also 6 cross-cutting strategic themes: counter-narcotics, anti-corruption, capacity development, gender equity, environment, and regional cooperation.

At the 2010 London Conference, the Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan (GIRoA) committed itself to better implementing ANDS through prioritizing national programmes and clustering its ministries and independent national authorities. A number of ministerial level meetings and consultations followed, and the government developed 22 National Priority Programmes (NPPs) and associated clusters including: governance, security, infrastructure development, private sector development, agriculture and rural development, and human resources development. As of late 2013, 21 of the 22 NPPs have been finalized and endorsed by the Joint Coordination and Monitoring Board, a body co-chaired by the Minister of Finance and the UN Special Representative of the Secretary-General in Afghanistan.

The Independent Directorate of Local Governance of Afghanistan (IDLG) is the lead agency cooperating with other stakeholders in implementing the SN Governance Policy, and coordinating the SN governance cluster. Provincial governors are the highest authority at provincial level and are appointed by the President in consultation with the IDLG and the Senior Appointment Committee. Provincial governors report to both the President and IDLG.

Provincial governors have two main roles in service delivery:

*1. Supervision and leadership of line departments/district offices*. Provincial governors supervise implementation of activities delegated to provincial line departments. They are further expected to ensure that provincial line departments deliver their required service delivery mandates. Governors do not play an operational or day-to-day management role in the implementation of service delivery plans – this responsibility rests with line department heads.

*2. Special implementation responsibilities*. Provincial governors have the authority to implement programmes through their offices in cases where no mandated agency of that type is available at provincial level.

According to SN governance policy, provincial governors are further required to consult and negotiate provincial-related official and sectoral affairs and issues on a regular basis with provincial councils. Provincial governors are mandated to coordinate and supervise the activities of district governors, and administratively support, facilitate, and supervise the activities of provincial line ministry departments.

Line ministries’ provincial departments constitute a de-concentrated, second level of governance of national ministries, which is expected to provide essential and advanced services in the provinces. Thus, provincial departments of each ministry represent the ministry in the provinces. Each is, as a general rule, managed by a director. The number of employees in each department varies institutionally and structurally according to the sector line ministries’ organizational structure, human resource policies, and volume and type of expected services (ideally *structure follows function*). Provincial departments of each sector report to both provincial governors’ offices and to their own line ministries, which in practice causes duplication, overlap, lack of coordination, and fragmentation. Provincial line ministry directors are appointed through central ministries, in collaboration with the Independent Administrative Reform & Civil Service Commission (IARCSC).

In principle, provincial line departments and district offices execute their sections of the provincial plan, through those activities planned and budgeted in their sectors, and delegated to them by their parent ministries. They operate existing programmes and assets, and implement new development projects, when delegated to them. In order to allow provincial line departments and district offices to execute this role, they are provided with limited financial authorities, e.g. procurement authorities.[[4]](#footnote-4) *In practice, however, the provincial plan typically has no direct connection with the national budget and most line departments have little influence on the budget process, the adequacy of the budget financing allocations they receive, or when they receive them*.

District governors are representatives of central government and implement its laws, policies, directives, and programmes at district level. They are further required to support, facilitate, and administratively supervise representative district level departments within the sectors. District governors are appointed through IDLG and the IARCSC under an open competition recruitment policy and IDLG regulations. They report to both to IDLG and to the governors of provinces to which their districts are administratively attached.

Provincial Councils (PCs) are directly elected. Members of provincial councils are community representatives from all districts, and their numbers vary between provinces according to the number of districts per province. As elected representative bodies, PCs play a consultative role in provincial governance. PC’s are consulted during the process of preparing provincial budgets, providing recommendations and ultimate approval of budgets prior to submission to central government. As noted, provincial budgets do not have much impact on the national budget process under current procedures.

Municipalities have legally defined mandatory and optional functions, according to an IDLG report.[[5]](#footnote-5) Mandatory functions include: municipal socio-economic development planning, implementing basic municipal infrastructure and social services, and generating revenue. Encouraging private sector investment and corporate partnership for service delivery are optional. In carrying out their functions, Municipalities are responsible for, *inter alia*: assuming executive authority of the municipal administration, ensuring that basic services are delivered and service delivery plans successfully implemented, ensuring that all municipal officials and organizational units discharge their duties, formulating policy guidelines and executive orders to ensure that the municipality executes its functions, appointment of municipal administration employees, coordination with central government and ensuring participation of and consultation with the municipal population. Roles and inter-relationships between municipalities and organizations at other levels of governance include:

1. *Central level*. IDLG is responsible for developing policy and building municipalities’ capacity; the Ministry of Urban Development Affairs (MUDA) supports urban planning and sets service standards for municipal services
2. *Sub-national level*. The Mayor of a Provincial Municipality will execute his or her tasks independently of the provincial governor, although he/she will consult with the governor and provincial council as needed, coordinate and integrate municipal and provincial development plans towards effective implementation, and serve as a member of the Provincial Development Committee (PDC).

### Service Delivery Issues: Previous Findings

In 2008, the IARCSC identified a number of factors contributing to the weak performance of Afghanistan’s public administration at sub-national levels, including: “… lack of coordination amongst decision making bodies, limited human resource capacity, lack of effective communication between the capital and provinces, recruitment of employees based on personal relations and regardless of competencies, lack of skills throughout civil service, insufficient salaries to attract and recruit competent and skilled personnel, losing expert and professional personnel to international organisations and donor institutions with good pay as well as job interferences in government agencies.”[[6]](#footnote-6) Despite efforts in recent years by GIRoA and its development partners, only limited progress has been made on improving the effectiveness and inclusiveness of SN governance and service delivery. As a result provincial departments, districts, and villages are not meaningfully empowered. The World Bank (April 2011) identified both recent improvements and continued shortcomings in service delivery in selected districts and provinces, as a result of recent GIRoA and donor interventions (see Figure 1).[[7]](#footnote-7)

|  |
| --- |
| **Figure 1. World Bank Survey of Perceptions on District-Level Service Delivery, 2011**   * Services related to the general administration of the district (district governor, finance) seem to have received focused attention over the past 3 years in terms of training and operational support. This leads to a greater integration/coordination of the district departments in general, and the beginning of a standardization of administrative and financial processes. * Services that have been streamlined under a specific technical framework, such as education and health, show a higher degree of standardization and equitable distribution across the districts, even if staff skills need continuous attention and upgrading. * Significant achievements have been made in the construction or rehabilitation of key access and productive infrastructure (power, water and roads). However, these are not planned nor estimated at the district level (or even at the provincial level). The inclusion of such assets in the district only helps to get an idea of the level of economic comfort available in the district, and the potential for a more dynamic economic development. The construction of a main national road may have a very positive impact on the district (Balkh), or may have a very limited one (Qargaye). Therefore the investment linked to such infrastructure may not be the best indicator of the degree of equitable distribution of resources. Maintenance budgets for such infrastructure are limited, and will eventually need to be planned at the regional or provincial levels. * Agricultural and rural development activities are the least standardized across the districts, and are difficult to quantify and cost. |

1. **UNDP Support**

**UNDP’s Second Afghanistan Sub-National Governance Programme** (ASGP-II) is a multi-donor programme that supports the government of Afghanistan in SN governance and state building at national, provincial, district, and municipal levels. It contributes to Pillar 2 of the ANDS (Governance, Rule of Law, and Human Rights). ASGP-II’s key objective is to strengthen the abilities of democratic state and government institutions to govern and ensure quality public service delivery at the SN level through advocacy, policy advice, and capacity development. ASGP-II works with its main government partner, IDLG, and through a network of provincial governors’ offices, provincial councils, district governors’ offices and municipalities. ASGP-II works towards four outputs:

1. National systems, procedures and legal frameworks to implement, coordinate and monitor SN governance policy are in place,
2. Provincial and district governors’ offices have the capacity to lead and develop plan, programme and implement strategies for improving governance, development and security in accordance with the ANDS;
3. Municipalities have the institutional and organizational framework and capacity to collect increasing revenue and deliver basic public services by 2014. **[[8]](#footnote-8)**

### 

### UNDP’s Sub-National Governance and Development Strategy (SNGDS), described in the previous section, was developed in 2013 to provide a strategic and directional framework to guide future programme development and policy advisory support by UNDP in this area over the next 5-8 years, through and beyond the Transition. The SNGDS aims to build accountability, inclusiveness, responsiveness and – ultimately – the legitimacy of SN state institutions, far from Kabul, which constitute the only interface of the state with which the majority of Afghanistan citizens can hope to interact. The core themes and principles underlying the strategy are:

1. The SNGDS will directly support the policies of GIRoA and will empower Afghanistan institutions to lead the implementation of the local governance NPP and other governance NPPs, such as the *Urban Management Support Programme* and *Transparency and Accountability*.
2. Activities under Pillar A (Building capable and accountable sub-national government Institutions for service delivery) will be designed to work through statutory SN government institutions and procedures, ideally through on-budget assistance.
3. UNDP and partner institutions will focus on *what needs to change.* Capacity building efforts will include the development of guidelines, procedures, and protocols, which translate policy and regulations to a practical level.
4. Similarly, where SN capacity building under Pillar A entails piloting new procedures, these will be crafted so as to be: (i) both “policy-innovative” and replicable, (ii) consistent with the statutory framework, and (iii) adaptable to differing local contexts (including conflict).
5. Activities under both Pillars will be designed and implemented to: (i) build on the lessons of what works in Afghanistan and what doesn’t; (ii) be flexible, especially in light of both changing local security, and of the evolution of politics and policy on SNG; (iii) do no harm, be sensitive to social dynamics, promote women’s involvement, and (iv) ensure embedded comprehensive capacity-development.
6. Lastly, the programme will be designed so as to complement – not duplicate – activities of other partners, will be aligned with the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF), and will leverage UNDP’s specific comparative advantages.

# Overview of Sectoral Functional Assignments

This section summarizes the assignments of responsibility among public institutions, within each of the 10 targeted functional sectors of public service delivery. The summaries are based on a systematic study of available and enforced laws, policies, charters, and strategies providing the legal framework for the roles and responsibilities of government institutions. In addition, other instruments such as organograms and staff reference terms were assessed to map more detailed characteristics of the existing functional service delivery responsibilities of ministries, authorities, provinces, districts and municipalities. The focus is in general on the *de jure* assignment of responsibilities rather than the *de facto* situation.

## Education

|  |
| --- |
| **Legal Framework:** Education services in Afghanistan are delivered to citizens within the framework of: The Constitution of Afghanistan**,** adopted in 2004; Education Law,enforced in 1387 (2008); Afghanistan National Development Strategy (ANDS) for 2008-2013; National Priority Programmes (NPPs); and Municipal Law. |
| **Service Delivery Roles and Responsibilities** |
| **The Ministry of Education (MoE):** At national level, MoE is the highest authority to design policies, administer, direct, and apply educational objectives; and is responsible for managing issues related to primary education and training levels lower than a bachelor degree in the country. MoE has the following responsibilities and authorities:   1. Organize and plan for pre-school, intermediate (basic), secondary, technical-professional, vocational, artistic, and formal Islamic education, teachers training, literacy and basic practical education, and education by correspondence. 2. Establish and equip public schools, *Madrasas,[[9]](#footnote-9)* technical-professional, vocational, artistic, and teachers training institutions, centers for literacy, and schools for students with special needs, with or without dormitory, and in accordance with communities’ needs. 3. Provide learning and supplementary teaching materials. 4. Establish libraries, laboratories, cultural centers, information technology, and playgrounds, and provide sports equipment, in accordance with educational institutions’ needs. 5. Issue graduation certificates to graduates as stated in education law. 6. Issue licenses to establish private domestic educational institutions – both combined and international – and also play an oversight role.     MoE sets the dates of the school year in different climatic regions, the number of weekly teaching hours, student numbers per class, curriculum, educational plan, evaluation system and examination of education levels, in accordance with related rules. MoE also specifies admission requirements, educational level standards for teachers, lecturers, and *Modaresan,[[10]](#footnote-10)* and the principal methods of evaluation and examination in other academic/professional fields of specialization.  MoE establishes educational dormitories within government’s financial capabilities and in accordance with its related regulations, and provides publicized educational entertainment programmes on radio and TV for children and adults. The ministry further provides and applies effective training programmes for teachers, lecturers and *Modaresan* whilst in service and prior to admission into service. MoE establishes the academic board and its publishing office, and provides for developing educational curricula and teaching materials.  MoE also provides support services to improve Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) including: Agriculture, Livestock and Veterinary, Business Education, Construction and Engineering, Fine Arts, and Special and Inclusive Education. At  national level, and depending on societal needs and available funding, MoE establishes and conducts basic education and literacy programmes, with special focus on marginalized and deprived citizens.  Furthermore, MoE is responsible for the overall mobilization of financial, technical, and human resources to operate its education machinery, apparatus, and resources with a focus on better access to quality education. MoE is expected to maintain regular communication and coordination with other related education service providers, stakeholders, and donors across the country, and ensure that provincial directorates, district departments, and schools have adequate resources and are properly providing their services.  **The Ministry of Higher Education (MoHE):** At national level, and with the emphasis on providing quality and responsive higher education to the country’s growth and developmental needs, MoHE supports, coordinates, promotes, and oversees universities and institutes for higher education (above high school grade 12), and public and private community colleges.  **The Ministry of Women’s Affairs (MoWA):** At national level, MoWA plays an oversight and policy-making role, influencing and coordinating with government to promote parity, equity, and equality at all levels of education, for girls and for women.  **The Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs, Martyrs and the Disabled (MoLSAMD):** Besides its other broad mandates at national level, MoLSAMD provides support to skills development, pre-primary schools, and orphanages in the education sector, and leads and supports the National Skills and Development Programme (NSDP). |
| **Provinces:** In all 34 provinces of Afghanistan, MoE delivers services through provincial education directorates. Employee professional categories and numbers per province vary according to population, number of schools, students and teachers, as well as the volume and type of education services available.  Provincial directorates of education are expected to provide the following services:   * Lead and coordinate all education-related activities in the province and ensure that services are in line with education legislation and other MoE policies. * Manage general education, vocational and religious schools, teacher training programmes and centers, and literacy programmes across the province. * Provide financial, technical, and human resources including staff salaries and recruiting teachers; and supply textbooks, teaching materials, furniture, and teaching venues to schools. * Establish new schools in the province in coordination and communication with MoE and the provincial governor’s office. * Oversee and monitor activities in public and private schools and regularly communicate with school administrations in the province. * Provide regular capacity enhancement support services to teachers, and in-service teachers training programmes, and manage school, directorate and department staff in districts. * Maintain educational information and schools-related data within its jurisdiction. * Regularly report to MoE in Kabul on status, progress, opportunities, and concerns; and maintain regular communication, coordination and cooperation with MoE to ensure that all related directives, regulations and procedures are properly implemented in provinces and districts. * Communicate and coordinate with provincial governors and sector services directorates, and conduct and manage education sector working group meetings.   Provincial line departments report to provincial governors and provincial councils and are accountable for performance management and quality assurance. |
| **Districts:** Education departments employ between 3 and 5 officials per district. District departments and employees receive their running costs and salaries through education provincial directorates, and accordingly report back to them on their progress and sector situation concerns on a monthly basis. District department roles in service delivery include:   * Supply and distribution of textbooks and stationery to district schools. * Logistics and maintenance services for district education facilities. * Monitoring the activities of community-based schools. * Regular communication and cooperation with provincial education directorates. * Participation in district level development committee meetings, and regular communication and coordination with schools’ management committees. |
| **Municipalities**: In addition to their mandated service delivery functions, municipalities also play a key role in promoting education and literacy in their jurisdiction through the provision of services such as:   * Support libraries, social places, sports, and activity centers and parks. * Consult with provincial or district education authorities when issuing business licenses for training centers and schools. * Can recommend names or name changes to places within their jurisdiction. * Provide cleaning, sanitation, and greening services to areas where education facilities operate. * Allocate, sell, exchange, or grant land for education facilities. * In cooperation with related authorities, assist in water supply to education facilities. * Conduct tree planting exercises, festivals, and other functions for school students. * Promote general education and vocational training. |

## Health Care

|  |
| --- |
| **Legal Framework:** Health care services in Afghanistan are delivered within the framework of: the Constitution of Afghanistan; Public Health Lawof2009; National Health Care and Nutrition Policy; Health and Nutrition Sector Strategy of ANDS; Human Resources Development Cluster of NPPs; Strategic Plan of MoPH for 2011–2015; and Municipal Law. |
| **Service Delivery Roles and Responsibilities** |
| **The Ministry of Public Health (MoPH):** At national level, MoPHhas the following roles and responsibilities:   1. Health sector policy development, planning and budgeting, strategy development, setting norms, standards, and guidelines, and health care financing. 2. Human resources supply, management, and development. 3. Coordination and creation of Public-Private Partnerships. 4. Implementation of health laws and regulations, monitoring, evaluation, and quality assurance, health care research, diseases surveillance, and systems accreditation. |
| **Provinces:** Directorates of public health are headed by a director in each province. The provincial directorate of public health has the following roles and responsibilities:   * Lead the Provincial Public Health Coordination Committee and chair health care Technical Working Group (TWG) meetings, represent MoPH and enforce its laws, rules and regulations in the province. * Monitor and evaluate provincial and district health care facilities’ service delivery and environmental health control. * Mass immunization through Expanded Public Immunization (EPI); TB, Malaria, and HIV/AIDS testing and protection services. * Public awareness and treatment services for drug addicts. * Health Management Information (HMI), nutrition, reproductive health, and pharmacy services.   Provincial directorates for public health report to MoPH, provincial councils, and provincial governors. |
| **Districts:** In districts with health care facilities, public health coordinators have the following roles and responsibilities:   * Regular coordination and communication with public health service providers in the district. * Regular coordination and communication with the provincial directorate of public health. * Cooperate with service providing teams and missions such as EPI, and monitor missions, researchers, and surveyors. |
| **Municipalities**: Municipalities play a preventive role in health care sector service delivery, and accordingly perform the following services:   * Solid waste management; cleaning roads, ditches, septic tanks, parks, footpaths, and public streams. * Control and monitor sanitation of restaurants, hotels, and grocery markets; and allocate premises for butcheries and abattoirs. * Allocate land for graveyards, hospitals, and health care facilities, and control stray dogs. * Regularly communicate and cooperate with MoPH and other public health service providers for the improvement of heath care services in cities, manage diseases prevention, control drinking water resources, manage environmental protection services such as tree planting and greening, and establish and support health and fitness clubs. |

## Rural Roads

|  |
| --- |
| **Legal Framework:** Rural road services in Afghanistan are delivered within the framework of: the Constitution of Afghanistan; Afghanistan National Development Strategy (ANDS); NPPs; and the Strategies of Ministries of Rural Rehabilitation and Development (MRRD), and the Ministry of Public Works. |
| **Service Delivery Roles and Responsibilities** |
| **The Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development (MRRD)** is mandated to build and improve rural infrastructures including rural roads (tertiary or village roads).  **The Ministry of Public Works (MPW)** also contributes to road construction in rural areas (secondary roads), especially in building roads between provinces and districts.  Both MRRD and MoPW co-chair and jointly implement the National Rural Access Programme (NRAP), initiated in mid-2002, which builds, rehabilitates, and maintains rural roads. NRAP has a Programme Development and Coordination Unit (PDCU) in the Ministry of Finance (MoF). **Other ministries**, namely the Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock (MAIL), Ministry of Energy and Water (MEW), Ministry of Mines, Ministry of Counter Narcotics (MoCN), MoE, MoPH and the National Environmental Protection Authority (NEPA), **are also identified as cooperating government agencies in rural road development**.  At national level, both MRRD and MPW have Programme Implementation Units (PIUs) for appropriate management and implementation of NRAP. A national programme coordinator (who also leads the PDCU) monitors their activities and progress. When required, the United Nations Office for Project Services (UNOPS) also contributes to the programme as a consulting agency in project implementation, contracting private or social entities, and technical support in developing standards, norms, and options for rural roads.  NRAP’s objectives are to: 1) Establish a quality rural road network that connects all villages to basic rural infrastructure such as health care facilities, schools, and markets, 2) Provide increased employment opportunities through using labour-intensive methods and private sector-led approaches for all works, and 3) Enhance communities’ and private sector capacity to manage, deliver, and maintain public transportation facilities through in-service capacity development. |
| **Provinces:** NRAP and the National Emergency Rural Access Programme (NERAP) are implemented through 9 regional offices located in Nangarhar, Herat, Balkh, Kunduz, Badakhshan, Bamyan, Kandahar, Paktia, and Kabul. Each office, managed by a regional coordinator, covers service delivery for between 1 and 5 surrounding provinces. However, MRRD and MPW provincial line directorates manage the programme administratively. NRAP’s 34 provincial offices are linked to regional offices, which serve through their administrative staff and regional, provincial and quality control engineers. Programme performance is reviewed by PDCU, PIUs, MoF, and when expected by donors. MRRD and MPW provincial line departments report to provincial councils and provincial governors and are accountable for service delivery in rural access road development. |
| **Districts:** NRAP does not have district offices. The District Development Assembly (DDA) or Community Development Council (CDC) will request those rural roads services required for a particular district or village in their annual plans, in line with NRAP criteria and according to available resources. Services are rendered via sub-projects and implemented by private or social contractors such as NGOs, construction companies, and/or CDCs. It is intended that in all instances, when assessment or implementation of a sub-project in a district is in progress, the provincial or (when required) regional technical or administrative employees of the programme should perform regular site visits. Provincial units of NRAP and officials of MRRD are responsible to follow-up these sub-projects’ implementation in the relevant provinces. |
| **Municipalities**: Municipalities do not play a role in building or maintaining rural roads. |

## Water Supply and Sanitation

|  |
| --- |
| **Legal Framework:** Water Supply and Sanitation services are delivered to the public within the framework of: the Constitution of Afghanistan; Afghanistan National Development Strategy (ANDS); The Water Law of the Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan; Afghanistan Urban Water Supply and Sewage Corporation (AUWSSC) Policy; Afghanistan National Rural Water, Sanitation, and Hygiene (WASH) Policy, issued in 2010; Public Health Law; Municipal Law; National Health Care and Nutrition Policy; NPPs; the Strategies of MRRD, MoPH, MUDA and MoM; and Provincial Development Plans (PDPs). |
| **Service Delivery Roles and Responsibilities** |
| **High Council of Water:** At national level, the High Council of Water (or Supreme Council for Water Affairs and Management) is mandated to coordinate and provide facilities for water supply programme implementation, development and use of water resources. It is described in greater detail in the section on **Irrigation**.  **Ministry of Urban Development (MUDA):** At national level, MUDA is mandated to provide drinking water, construct water purification and reticulation infrastructure, and manage wastewater facilities in the cities according to the accepted norms and standards and in cooperation with MEW, MoM, MoPH, MAIL, and NEPA.[[11]](#footnote-11)  **Afghanistan Urban Water Supply and Sewage Corporation (AUWSSC):** The general directorate for water supply and sewagefunctions as a state-owned enterprise under the overall governance and supervision of a board (consisting of MUDA, MoF, NEPA, MoEc, and Kabul Municipality). The general directorate consists of operations, technical and financial departments, which manage and support the activities of its Strategic Business Units (SBUs) in its zonal offices. AUWSSC is mandated to produce, purify, distribute, protect, monitor and supervise potable water (and its waste management system) used in households, commercial or public buildings across the country. At national level, AUWSSC is currently working to maintain the capital assets formerly of CAWSS (Central Authority for Water Supply and Sewerage Corporation), including real estate, major water utility infrastructure, inventory, and more. MoF also supports the SBUs of AUWSSC to receive outstanding dues of CAWSS customers, and train, manage, and pay wages of all CAWSS employees transferred to them.  **Ministry of Mines (MoM):** MoM is mandated to plan and conduct surveys, explorations, and research on underground water resources, develop water pollution protection systems, and specify chemical and bacteriological norms and standards in cooperation with MoPH and NEPA.  **Ministry of Public Health:** MoPH monitors and controls the quality of drinking water in compliance with international norms.  **Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development (MRRD):** MRRD, in cooperation with MEW, MoPH, MoM, MAIL, MUDA and NEPA, is responsible for providing drinking water to villages, wastewater-cleaning systems by government and non-government organizations, and constructing small-scale water supply facilities according to established norms and standards.  **National Environment Protection Agency (NEPA):** In this sector, NEPA supervises and protects land water surfaces from pollution, and monitors water quality in cooperation with MAIL, MEW, MUDA, MRRD, MoPH, and MoM.[[12]](#footnote-12) |
| **Provinces:** According to MUDA’s policy,AUWSSC’s Strategic Business Units(SBUs)in Balkh, Nangarhar, Kabul, Kandahar, Khost, Kunduz, Bamyan, and Herat play the role of zonal directorates. For example, in Balkh province the directorate, besides Mazar city, also serves the provincial capital cities of Samangan, Jawzjan, Saripul, and Faryab. Institutionally, each SBU has three departments: operation, technical and finance. SBUs are managed by directors, but differ in number of staff, e.g. Mazar SBU has a staff complement of 35, and varies according to the volume of work and types of expertise required for projects under their jurisdiction. SBUs in zonal provinces operate independently from each other and report to the general SBU directorate in Kabul. As state-owned enterprises and sector entities working within provinces, SBUs also report to provincial governors’ offices. |
| **Districts:** AUWSSC SBUs based in major zonal cities have established sub-SBUs in the districts. However, this depends on the implementation of the operational plans of the respective SBUs in any particular district. For example, the SBU in Balkh, besides sub-SBUs in the surrounding provinces of the zone, has sub-SBUs in Kholm, Balkh, and Andkhoi districts. The number of technical and administrative staff in a district office varies between SBUs according to their particular needs, expertise and volume of work required in a given water and sanitation facility. MRRD directorates in districts and villages promote the implementation of WASH policy recommendations and related projects through their various programmes, which are implemented and coordinated by CDCs or private companies. In addition, a number of national and international NGOs also provide drinking water and sanitation services in the districts. |
| **Municipalities**: According to the Municipalities Law, with particular reference to the sanitation sector, municipalities play a key role in sanitation, and are expected to provide a number of related services, including:   * Solid waste management, garbage cleaning and disposal. * Wastewater management; septic tanks, drainages management and disposal. * Control of drinking water resources, rabies control, and other related activities. * Sanitary control of public baths, latrines, sports clubs and public swimming pools.   Sanitation departments are mandated to establish, equip and manage a functional and efficient cleaning and sanitation team within their jurisdiction. |

## Vital and Civil Registration

|  |
| --- |
| **Legal Framework:** Vital and Civil Registration services in Afghanistan are delivered to the citizens within the framework of: the Constitution of Afghanistan, Civil Registration Law, NPPs, and the Afghanistan National Development Strategy (ANDS). |
| **Service Delivery Roles and Responsibilities** |
| **The General Directorate for Civil Registration and Foreign Citizens’ Affairs** operates within the **Ministry of Interior (MoI)** under its Deputy Ministry for Administrative Affairs. The general directorate (through about 2100 employees across the country) is mandated to provide civil and vital registration services through the following central and provincial directorates:   1. Directorate for Civil Registration: provides national identification cards; name changes, displacement and registration services. 2. Vital Statistics Directorate: registers and reports birth, death, marriage, and divorce; records migration statistics and offers related services. 3. Directorate for Foreign Citizens’ Affairs: responsible for records, statistics, and related services to embarking or disembarking expatriates visiting or working in Afghanistan, at the country’s airports and borders. Handles requests and provides services relating to citizenship registration and termination. The organizational structure also includes regional archives covering the civil and vital registration affairs of about 6-10 provinces.   The government recently established another general directorate under the Deputy Ministry of Administration Affairs in MoI for provision and distribution of electronic national identification cards *(Tazkira.)*[[13]](#footnote-13) The directorate has not yet been able to provide this service to citizens.  **The Central Statistics Office (CSO):** The CSO, besides its other mandated services, also collects, analyses, prepares and publishes civil and vital registration related data and statistics. |
| **Provinces:** In each province, civil registration affairs departments are included in the structure of the provincial security office and provide its related services to the public. In provinces bordering neighboring countries, the civil registration affairs departments also provide services related to foreign citizens’ affairs. Provincial line departments for civil registration report to both provincial councils and provincial governors. Provincial CSO departments also assemble and report civil and vital registration data and statistics to their head office in Kabul.  The new general directorate for provision and distribution of electronic identification cards has not yet commenced its operations or service delivery in the provinces. |
| **Districts:** District offices for civil and vital registration employ up to 4 officers per district who provide services to citizens. |
| **Municipalities**: Municipalities support and cooperate with civil and vital registration general directorates in different cities for planning and implementing service delivery.  Municipalities also support registrars and citizens through community representatives, and inform authorities of citizen identification, births, deaths, weddings and divorces by provision of legal documents in their areas of jurisdiction. |

## Land Registration

|  |
| --- |
| **Legal Framework:** Land Registration services in Afghanistan are delivered within the framework of: the Constitution of Afghanistan; Law on Managing Land Affairs of 2008, and other associated regulations; National Land Policy**,** adopted by the Council of Ministers on September 3, 2007; NPPs; and the Afghanistan National Development Strategy (ANDS). |
| **Service Delivery Roles and Responsibilities** |
| **Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock (MAIL):** At national level, MAIL is mandated with the management of land affairs. Technically and administratively, MAIL leads and directs the identification and management of all land ownership affairs. MAIL, MoF, MEW, Afghanistan Geodesy and Cartography General Authority, and local stakeholder institutions have a shared responsibility in the identification, implementation and management of the land ownership affairs.  **Central Land Affairs Management Commission:** For the purpose of better cooperation and timely provision of professional and administrative assistance towards implementation of local land disputes, a central commission for management of land affairs has been assigned with the following composition: Minister of MAIL (Chair), Director General of land affairs management of MAIL (Deputy), representative of the Supreme Court, Director of Agricultural Extension of MAIL, Director of Water Management of MEW, Director of Geodesy and Cartography Authority, and Director of Revenues of MoF as its members.  **ARAZI:** Based on decision 23 of the Council of Ministers of September 2009, the land management authority *AMLAAK[[14]](#footnote-14)* was renamed ARAZI (Afghanistan Land Management Authority), and restructured within MAIL. ARAZI reports to an inter-ministerial board (commission) comprising MAIL, MoF, MUDA, MoI, the Ministry of Justice (MoJ), High Oversight Office for Anti-Corruption, IDLG, and the General Authority of Geodesy and Cartography of Afghanistan. **[[15]](#footnote-15)** ARAZI has the responsibility to pursue the following strategic objectives:   * Effectively implement the Land Management Law, and establish and manage an efficient land inventory and registry system. * Increase national revenue by eliminating corruption through transparent lease procedures. * Establish and manage a comprehensive land management information system. * Develop and implement a workable land restitution system, and provide quick, easy and effective one-stop-lease services. * Establish an exemplary and trustworthy organization with excellent human resources capacity.   The board meets at least once every six weeks to discuss and decide upon ARAZI issues.  At national level, ARAZI is led by a general director and provides its services through six directorates including: land identification, land lease, investigation of land related disputes, land surveys, registration and technical archive, land management and distribution (exchange and transfer), and monitoring land affairs. ARAZI has a staff complement of around 900 in its main office, provinces and districts. ARAZI’s Kabul head office prepares all development budget plans for the organization’s operation across the country.[[16]](#footnote-16) |
| **Provinces:** At provincial level, ARAZI executes land-related and management affairs through provincial departments. ARAZI’s provincial departments are included within the structures of directorates of agriculture and livestock. Provincial departments regularly communicate and cooperate with provincial and district governors. The Land Identification Delegation and Mission is responsible for executing practical work on the ground. Members of the delegation include: a land identification representative of MAIL (chair), a land administrative representative of MAIL, and representatives of MoF, MEW, the agricultural extension section of MAIL, and Cadastre of the Afghanistan Geodesy and Cartography General Authority. Each year MAIL proposes the membership numbers of the land identification delegation to the President for approval, following which, members are then assigned to duty. ARAZI’s provincial departments report to provincial councils and governors and are accountable for their performance. According to SN governance policy, provincial and district governors are responsible for ensuring that public and private land within their jurisdiction are not appropriated or inhabited unlawfully.  **Provincial Commissions for Land Affairs Management:** In order to better implement the land identification process and resolve associated problems, commissions have been established in some provinces, comprising the following members:[[17]](#footnote-17) Provincial Governor (Chair), Provincial Director of Agriculture and Livestock (Deputy), Director of provincial court, Head of provincial office of MoF *(Mustofiat*), Department director of MEW, Head of Geodesy and Cartography Department, and Head of the land affairs management provincial authority. ARAZI’s provincial departments operate within the framework of directorates for agriculture and livestock in all provinces. ARAZI employs 6 officers – one from each of its central directorates – per province. |
| **Districts:** At district level, ARAZI has one officer in charge of activities per area that reports to the ARAZI section of the provincial agriculture and livestock departments. Officers also collaborate with district governors and other related authorities in land affairs management issues. When the need arises (in most cases), officers may request additional technical or administrative staff from their provincial offices or head office in Kabul. |
| **Municipalities**: Within provincial boundaries, and following the President’s approval of their master plans, provincial or district municipalities may request and receive land from ARAZI for plans implementation. However, within cities holding approved master plans, municipalities own the land and can therefore grant, sell or lease land to public or private entities. As per Municipal Law, municipalities are the owners of their master plans. Municipalities also perform the following land related activities:   * Ensure all land within the boundaries of their master plans are accurately registered, landowners hold legal documents, and provide legal support for legitimate landowners and properties within their jurisdiction. * Prevent illegal acquisition of land and/or their utilization for purposes other than those identified and forecasted in the municipal master plans. * Sell and lease land within the framework of Municipal Law, and issue permits to real estate or property dealers. Maintain and update records of all land registration and other property ownership documents. |

## Irrigation

|  |
| --- |
| **Legal Framework:** Services related to irrigation in Afghanistan are delivered within the framework of: the Constitution of Afghanistan; Water Law, enforced in April 2009; NPPs; the Afghanistan National Development Strategy, and the Strategies of the Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock (MAIL), and Ministry of Energy and Water (MEW). |
| **Service Delivery Roles and Responsibilities** |
| Two ministries are mandated to provide water management and irrigation related services:  **The Ministry of Energy and Water (MEW)** carries out the planning, management and development (studies, design, construction, application, immunity, stability, and protection) of water resources in cooperation with related ministries and agencies. MEW, in cooperation with MAIL, MoM, MRRD, MUDA and other related authorities, also specifies water resource and infrastructure boundaries, manages cross-boundary water issues between Afghanistan and neighboring countries, constructs water reservoirs/dams and water diversions, manages rivers, traditional and modern canals, springs, water wells, other natural water resources, and manages water quality control. At national level, MEW generally renders water related services through its water section and related departments including: Programmes, Water Projects Management, M&E, Water Resources, Water Management, Policy and other related offices. MEW, through its Deputy Ministry for Water, associated directorates and programmes, provides the following services in the water sector:   1. Preparation of a National Water Policy and Strategy in cooperation with other related authorities. 2. Preparation and presentation of resource plans for varying requirements (in accordance with national priorities) to the High Council of Water. 3. Collection, analysis and evaluation of land surface water hydrological data, forecast droughts and floods and provision of related warnings. 4. Construction, reconstruction and supervision of dams, general canals, and river/water retaining infrastructures, and monitor their protection and stability. 5. Management and control of infrastructure in catchment areas within the boundaries of water resources. 6. Establishment of river basin authorities and assessment of their activities. 7. Provision of financial and technical resources to enhance the capacity of river basin authorities. 8. Issuing licenses for water use and/or water management constructions.   **The Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock (MAIL)** In cooperation with MEW, MoPH, NEPA and the Ministry of Transport and Civil Aviation (MTCA), MAIL determines and specifies irrigation norms in different river-regions, irrigation systems, land drainage, and other water usage related research; and further determines and specifies water quality norms and standards in agriculture. At national level and through its Deputy Ministry for Irrigation and Infrastructure Development, coupled with linked directorates and programmes, MAIL has the following roles and responsibilities in the water sector:   1. Construction, reconstruction, development and protection of irrigation networks. 2. Monitor irrigation networks in cooperation with water beneficiary associations, and monitor fair distribution of water inside the networks. 3. Construction of water reservoirs/dams inside the networks, and protection of irrigation network boundaries. 4. Modification and improvement of water collection areas for the purpose of flood prevention and environmental protection. 5. Establishment of irrigation associations for the purpose of participation in planning and utilisation of water, monitoring and protecting irrigation networks in river basins. 6. Provide research for the purpose of identifying appropriate irrigation norms and their economic effectiveness. 7. Extension of suitable irrigation technology for the purpose of irrigation quality improvement and decrease in water waste.   **National Environment Protection Authority (NEPA):** Monitors and protects land surface water from pollution, and provides quality control services in cooperation with MEW, MAIL, MUDA, MRRD, MoPH, and MoM.  **Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development (MRRD):** Plays a central role in the construction of small-scale water-related infrastructure in cooperation with MEW, MAIL, MoPH, MoM, MUDA, and NEPA. MRRD is also mandated to mobilize resources for the development of small-scale irrigation schemes.  **High Council for Water:[[18]](#footnote-18)** Coordinates and facilitates implementation of water supply and development and utilization of water resources. The Council is chaired by the second vice-president of Afghanistan and is served by the following members: MEW, MAIL, MUDA, MRRD, MoEcon, MoF, NEPA, and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MoFA). |
| **Provinces:** Water Management Directorates in each province function under MEW and provide their services through approximately 20 employees. At provincial level, directorates implement, and monitor prioritized projects in cooperation with water beneficiary associations and other linked authorities. Provincial departments of irrigationfunction within the structure of MAIL provincial directorates. Water management directorates in the provinces report to both provincial councils and provincial governors and are accountable for their performance. |
| **Districts:** At district level, MEW, depending on available resources, capacity and needs, establishes and operates its water management departments. These departments work with communities and *Mirabs[[19]](#footnote-19)* in the districts. Provincial directorates of agriculture, irrigation and livestock have approximately 2 employees who, at district and village levels provide their services through on-farm irrigation management modalities, establish water beneficiary associations and work with *Mirabs* in the related communities. |
| **Municipalities**: Since most farmlands are located outside urban areas, municipalities generally have no major role in this sector. However, in the event where major irrigation systems or infrastructures exist within their jurisdictions, municipalities maintain good inter-governmental relationships with the irrigation sector’s provincial and district authorities, and accordingly provide their required cooperation and support services. |

## Agricultural Extension

|  |
| --- |
| **Legal Framework:** Agricultural development support services are delivered within the framework of: the Constitution of Afghanistan; NPPs; ANDS; and Municipal Law. |
| **Service Delivery Roles and Responsibilities** |
| **The Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation, and Livestock (MAIL)** is the leading agency responsible for agricultural extension services in Afghanistan.  MAIL activities are carried out by its three deputy ministries for: 1) Agricultural Infrastructure and Irrigation, which manages Irrigation and Agricultural Infrastructure, and Farms of Nangarhar Valley, 2) Administration and Finance, which provides human resources, procurement, administrative and financial management services to MAIL, and 3) Agricultural Affairs (*technical affairs*) which is tasked with: agricultural research, cooperatives support, quality control, plant protection, agricultural extension (crops extension, family economy, horticulture), livestock and animal health, and natural resource management (forestry, protected areas, pastures) departments.[[20]](#footnote-20)  In addition, MAIL’s structure incorporates the following departments: ARAZI, policy, planning and programme coordination units including agriculture-related statistics and Management Information Systems (MIS), provincial relations, internal audit monitoring and evaluation, communication and public relations and legal advisory for the MAIL Chief of Staff office.  MAIL is currently responsible for the following activities:   * Policy and strategy formulation, implementation and impact assessments - supplying advice to government on the state of Afghanistan farming and its role in the economy, and proposing appropriate legislation and regulations. * Information management and dissemination – collecting quality data and statistics on the agricultural sector and market to enable better-informed decision-making from the central ministry to farmers. * Disaster response – responding to natural disasters and helping farmers recover their farms/losses, and address floods-related problems. * Protection activities – undertaking border protection and providing quarantine services to keep Afghanistan free of unwanted pests and diseases. * Agricultural finance – providing funding to farmers through the Agricultural Development Fund, and supporting community-based organizations by providing funds and resources to enable rural communities to undertake agricultural projects. * Government support programmes – administering government assistance schemes. * Communities and natural resource management – educating rural communities in sustainable natural resource management. * Irrigation schemes – managing irrigation schemes to provide irrigation water to farmers. * Designing and managing construction of buildings and facilities related to agriculture. * Diagnostic services – providing laboratory and diagnostic testing services for plant and animal diseases and food safety, conforming to specifications set by purchasers, and disease control through animal and plant health surveillance. * Food security – monitoring household food security and establishing reserves and supplies. * Agricultural research – owning facilities and carrying out research into all aspects of pastoral farming and horticulture, production and processing, and owning and running demonstration farms. * Extension – providing free advisory services to agricultural producers. * Education – providing high school, technical, and vocational education and training in agriculture. * Inspection/enforcement of compliance with standards – inspecting and testing inputs, facilities and food products, and certification of input quality control and food safety standards by establishing standards for agricultural inputs and food products. * Input provisions – providing farmers with seeds, saplings, fertilizers and animals. * Animal health – provision of veterinary health services, animal reproductive services, vaccines and related products. * Participation on producer/marketing boards – representing government on statutory organizations, setting prices for some products. * Private sector facilitation – providing awards/grants to facilitate private sector participation in the agricultural sector.   In order for MAIL to provide efficient and effective services, it also performs the following core management and administrative activities:   * Communication with sector stakeholders and donors, coordination with provincial directorates in preparing work plans, and maintaining regular communication with internal and provincial directorates. * Appointment and recruitment of the Commission for directorates, and employees for national and provincial directorates, conduct training programmes for the personnel of MAIL directorates, and follow-up personnel performance measurements and reviews. * Provision of adequate financial resources both for operation and development services, and other needed procurement support programmes to the central ministry and provincial directorates. * Preparation of organizational structures for provincial directorates and Terms of Reference (ToR) to all of their employees.   MAIL’s capital and operational expenditure is planned and prepared yearly, together with its provincial directorates. M&E and internal audit directorates report directly to the Minister.  **Ministry of Energy and Water (MEW):** MEW, through its Deputy Ministry for Water provides large scale water management and related infrastructure development services for irrigation purposes including: establishing key water reservoirs, control of rivers, and establishment, extension and maintenance of major canals and related infrastructure.  **Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development (MRRD**): MRRD provides some agricultural extension-related support services through its National Solidarity Programme (NSP) and National Area Based Development Project (NABDP).  **Ministry of Counter Narcotics (MoCN):** In order to curb and diminish poppy cultivation in Afghanistan, MoCN provides a number of agricultural extension-related services through alternative livelihood and crop production programmes, and provides human and financial support services for their implementation. |
| **Provinces:** In all 34 provinces, functionalprovincial MAIL directorates provide the ministry’s related services in their jurisdictions. Provincial directorates may also recruit below public service grade 5 employees if locally available. Directorates’ technical divisions/directorates report to MAIL in Kabul, while their administration departments report to provincial governors’ offices. Provincial directors of agriculture and livestock are also responsible to lead the agriculture and livestock sector TWGs, represent the sector in provincial development committee meetings, and coordinate with other related participants and stakeholders.  Provincial line departments for agriculture, irrigation, and livestock report to the provincial councils and provincial governors and are accountable for their service delivery performance. MAIL directorates receive capital and operational development funding through annual budgets. Provincial directorates report monthly, quarterly and annually to the planning and programmes coordination unit and to the provincial relations directorates of MAIL. In an attempt to address needs and service delivery issues, respective MAIL directorates refer provincial reports and/or related components to other relevant departments. Provincial directorates are also expected to be involved in preparing provincial development plans, implement, monitor and evaluate programmes or projects initiated nationally (or specifically in their provinces and districts), and report their status, progress, and challenges to MAIL.  Provincial Directorates of MRRD and MoCN, and national and international NGOs also provide some services in agriculture through communicating and coordinating with agriculture and livestock provincial directorates in the provinces. |
| **Districts:** MAIL’s district departments employ around 3 - 6 officials. The skills and number of officials per district depend on the needs, available resources, and number of programmes of agriculture, irrigation and livestock operating in the district. Agricultural and livestock services needs are communicated from villages to districts, and accordingly from districts to provincial directorates to asses and plan related service delivery. District level officers perform the instructions received through the respective departments of provincial MAIL directorates. They distribute seeds and fertilizers to farmers, establish agricultural cooperatives, and collect district information on annual agricultural production. Each district office sends monthly progress reports to the planning department of the provincial directorates. District offices are financially dependent on provincial directorates for agriculture, irrigation and livestock. |
| **Municipalities**: Municipalities within the boundaries of city master plans (where they exist) provide green environments, establish and maintain public parks, plant trees, and protect bio-environments. |

## Energy

|  |
| --- |
| **Legal Framework:** Energy supply and management services are delivered within the framework of: the Constitution of Afghanistan; Electricity CompanyCharter; NPPs; and the Afghanistan National Development Strategy (ANDS). |
| **Service Delivery Roles and Responsibilities** |
| **The Ministry of Energy and Water (MEW)** plays a leading role in the energy sector.  MEW’s structure incorporates the Deputy Ministry for Energy, which operates through the following departments: energy programmes, energy policies, renewable energy, monitoring and evaluation, energy institute, and construction (includes construction units which design and construct national level energy infrastructure, such as power stations), technical control services, administration, procurement, planning, finance and the Water and Power Engineering Institute (WAPICA). MEW’s annual operational and development budgets are funded by the government’s core budget through MoF.  MEW provides a range of energy sector related services including:   * Draft and develop energy related policies and laws, leading and management, identification of vision and strategic objectives for the energy sector, and setting national norms and standards for electricity and provision of related M&E services in Afghanistan. * Annual energy sector planning and development, energy needs assessment exercises for gas, coal, renewable energy, and electricity, and maintenance of the energy sector database. * Surveying, designing, engineering and procurement of infrastructures for generation, import, transmission and distribution of energy, together with their financial, administrative and human resources requirements. * Introduce and customize new/appropriate technology for effective use of energy for the application in industry development. * Improvement of generation and distribution capacity for electricity through generation facilities, transmission lines, and distribution networks for electricity distribution to the cities, districts and villages. * Customizing utilization of renewable energy (bio-gas, solar and wind). * Capacity development in the energy sector, and extension and development of electricity provision to rural areas.   **Da Afghanistan Brishna Sherkat (DABS)** is a state owned commercial company with its head office in Kabul. DABS pursues the following objectives:   1. Provision and development of electricity in all parts of the country. 2. Generation, purchase, supply, and transmission of electricity to customers. 3. Acquiring and occupying land, building and construction of facilities, providing production machinery and equipment through outright purchase or lease, maintenance of tools and equipment, control and monitoring output, provision of cables and distribution networks enabling operational connectivity, all with a view towards the supply of electrical energy.   The founding partners of DABS are: MEW, MoF, MUDA and MoEc. DABS is governed by a management board and led by a general director who is also the director of the executive board. DABS consists of the following structures:   1. Shareholders Assembly (DABS shareholders assembly is the highest decision-making body of the company, and meets at least once a year). 2. Management Board (includes operations, commercial, administration and finance directorates of DABS). 3. Monitoring/Inspection Board. 4. Executive Board (senior management of DABS).   The management board and the members of its controlling delegation receive quarterly and annual financial, programme, and assessment reports prepared by the executive board. DABS has the following roles and responsibilities:   1. Provision of sustainable electricity to customers, purchase of economically viable electricity locally and internationally, and selling of electricity energy to foreign countries if appropriate. 2. Planning, design, establishment, management, maintenance, control and supervision of: electricity production establishments, transmission networks, distribution (sub-stations, transformers and cables), and warning and controlling systems. 3. Establishment, operation and maintenance of principal establishments for the purpose of reliable, safe and economic service delivery to the customers. 4. Management and maintenance of company assets by means of a framework designed to secure sustainable operations and development of company activities; and selling equipment and power supply services to customers locally and outside the country. 5. Manage activities in such a way as to be financially accountable. This includes following international accounting norms, transparent procurement systems, controlling assets and inventories, safety management, and annual financial audits.     DABS’s annual budget is prepared by its executive board and forwarded to the management board during the last quarter of each year. DABS transfers funds for expenditure, and receives income to and from its regional or provincial offices bi-monthly. In addition to MEW and DABS, MoM is responsible for the provision of locally extracted natural gas and coal related services, and the Ministry of Commerce and Industries (MoCI) is responsible for oil or gas imports to Afghanistan. |
| **Provinces:** At provincial level, all energy sector programmes and projects are initiated and planned by MEW and implemented in cooperation with provincial governments and electricity directorates. Provincial directorates of MEW receive their budget through MoF. MEW’s services, which mainly relate to construction, maintenance or development of energy sector infrastructure, are provided through national and international contractors in a region or province. As soon as provincial projects are implemented they are transferred to DABS. DABS operates regional and provincial directorates in a number of provinces, however, the presence of DABS branches in each province differs in size and depends on available resources, its management capacity, and the volume of expected services in the province. Provincial directorates of MEW and/or DABS are accountable to the provincial governor and the provincial councils for their performance in service delivery. The provincial and or regional offices of DABS report to their headquarters on a monthly and quarterly basis. The MRRD through its NSP and NABDP programmes, and with the assistance of communities, also builds some micro-hydropower generation systems in a number of provinces and districts. |
| **Districts:** While there are district departments of energy supply and management in some districts, their size and employee quota are dependent on the volume of expected MEW activities in a specific district. |
| **Municipalities**: Municipalities are expected to extend their support and cooperation to MEW or its related provincial or district branches when public works are being undertaken or implemented in their areas of responsibilities in terms of municipal master plans. |

## Disaster Management

|  |
| --- |
| **Legal Framework:** Disaster management services are delivered within the framework of: the Constitution of Afghanistan; Law on Disaster Management; and ANDS. |
| **Service Delivery Roles and Responsibilities** |
| **The Afghanistan National Disaster Management Authority (ANDMA)** In cooperation with relevant ministries, NGOs, Community Councils (CCs), CSOs, and affected communities, ANDMA is responsible for disaster management and coordination activities, implementing the Law on Disaster Management, and implementing decisions by the High Commission for Disaster Management. At national level, ANDMA is responsible for preparing a National Strategic Plan for Disaster Management Services, and is required to conduct related national planning sessions bi-yearly, and provincial monitoring missions at least once a year.  Besides ANDMA, the **High Commission for Disaster Management** also performs its role in disaster management. The Commission is chaired by the Deputy President of Afghanistan, and includes ministers from MUDA, MoFA, MoI, MoPH, MEW, MAIL, MPW, MRRD, MoE, MoTCA, MoCI, and MoRR, directors from IDLG and NEPA, the Director General of Afghanistan Red-Crescent Society,[[21]](#footnote-21) and the Mayor of Kabul together with his Director of Chamber of Commerce and Industries. The Director General of ANDMA serves the Commission as secretary. |
| **Provinces:** Besides serving the provincial commission as secretary, and in the event of a disaster, ANDMA provincial directorates are also responsible for opening an emergency financial account to assist those affected. Treasurers for financial and material assistance are appointed by the provincial directorate to take charge of disaster management in each province. Under normal circumstances, provincial directorates include directors who employ around 5 to 7 officials. Provincial directorates for disaster management report to their head office in Kabul and are also accountable to provincial councils and provincial governors for their performance in service delivery.  In order to implement decisions by the high commission and coordinate services, Provincial Commissions for Disaster Managementhave beenestablished (see Figure 2). These commissions are chaired by provincial governors, and include the Head of the Afghan National Army, Internal Security/Police Commander, *Mustofi,[[22]](#footnote-22)* Directors of MoPH and MoFA (if existing), MEW, MPW, MRRD, MoE, MAIL, MoTCA, MoRR, MoCI, NEPA, and the Afghanistan Red Crescent Society. ANDMA provincial directors serve the commission as secretary/coordinator. Provincial commissions are expected to assess the magnitude and impact of a disaster, register the affected community, coordinate related emergency services and provide relief and assistance to the affected area within 72 hours of its occurrence/reporting. All government agencies, NGOs, and CSOs are expected to immediately report disaster/s in their areas of operation.  Provincial authorities are also responsible for disaster prevention construction projects, establishment of state institutions, and development of alternative residential infrastructure in areas under disaster risk. |
| **Districts:** Based on the needs of, and for the purpose of the implementation of the High Commission for Disaster Management’s decisions as well as for better coordination in the districts, an Extra-Ordinary Disaster Commission, chaired by district governors and including district level authorities may be established. At district level, ANDMA does not have its own employees; however, for disaster precautions and coordination in disaster management, its provincial directorates utilize village affairs coordination officers (one per district) for the affected district(s). Village affairs coordination officers will also serve the district commission for disaster management as secretary. In the event of a severe disaster in a particular district, ANDMA will establish an Emergency Operations Centre in the area, which will also coordinate and cooperate with CDCs and DDAs. District and local commissions are expected to report any disaster incident within 24 hours. |
| **Municipalities**: Provincial and district mayors are members of the provincial and district disaster management commissions. However, when planning, and during a disaster response, all members of the commission, including municipalities, are required to utilize their resources expeditiously to manage and assist the affected communities. |

**Figure 2: Structure of the Disaster Management Commissions**[[23]](#footnote-23)

**at National, Provincial, and District Levels:** 

# Assessment of Current Assignments

This assessment was compiled from various sources including: interviews, observations and information gathered during field visits, assembled responses to questionnaires, available and provided reports, and the findings from related literature for each sector. It emphasizes both the degree of compliance with de jure roles and responsibilities and the *de facto* situation, along with the associated problems and challenges.

## *1. Education Sector*

**Education Sector Overview**

Education in Afghanistan comprises primary, secondary, and higher level schooling and is managed by MoE and MoHE.[[24]](#footnote-24) Reportedly, an estimated 57% of men and 86% of women are illiterate. Since 2002 the government of Afghanistan, together with donors, has built around 4,000 schools and recruited and trained more than 100,000 new teachers. Presently, around 8 million male and female students are enrolled in primary and secondary general, Islamic, and technical and vocational education. Despite the establishment of new institutions, a higher demand for primary and secondary education – for both males and females – exists in Kabul. Kabul University reopened in 2002, and around 24,000 male and female students enrolled for higher education, including enrollment at the American University for Afghanistan, which was established in the capital in 2006. Five other universities have been reopened, rehabilitated or newly constructed in Nangarhar, Balkh, Kandahar, Herat, and Khost. There are also private higher education universities or institutes established in more than 10 provinces.

**Education Sector Service Delivery**

MoE and MoHE provide management, administrative, development, M&E, and regulatory services for the education sector across the country. Sector directorates administer and support education at provincial level. Likewise in districts, education departments provide services in five identified sub-sectors covering general education, teacher training, vocational training, religious studies, and literacy. Employee numbers vary according to the volume of services required and provided per district. In the case of visited and reported districts, around 5-10 employees were assigned to each sub-sector, with specific ToR.

Despite ongoing insecurity in some parts of Afghanistan, services in the education sector have improved since 2002. During this time the Education Law was developed and approved, and the first National Education Strategic Plan (NESP) was completed in 2010 with the second NESP already developed and launched for effective implementation in 2014. Over the past decade, primary school enrolment has risen from around 1 million to about 8 million. Enrollment of girls has shot up from almost zero to 37%, and the number of teachers in general education has increased seven-fold. Since 2003, over 5,000 school buildings have been rehabilitated or newly constructed. Presently, over 50% of schools have usable buildings. For the last 12 years the country has worked towards rebuilding and reopening its universities and higher education institutes – almost all of which were damaged by war or suffered major staff losses.

However, major challenges still exist. Field visitors reported that remote or insecure districts and provinces had a higher rate of inadequately educated teachers (or teachers with lower teaching capacity). About 250 schools were reported to have no qualified teachers at all. In most cases the student per teacher ratio was reported to be considerably high. Qualified female teachers are concentrated in the capitals of major provinces. The quantity and quality of literacy services, as well as adult education – especially in the provinces and districts – was reportedly limited and poor. Most school laboratories are not functional, or lack adequate materials and equipment. Some schools do not have buildings, or are not surrounded by a protective perimeter wall required for the safety of both teachers and students. Higher education institutions have limited capacities and are unable to meet the overwhelming demand for access from an increasing number of high school graduates.

**Reporting Mechanisms**

District education departments report to provincial directorates. Provincial directorates in turn report monthly and quarterly to the MoE headquarters in Kabul. There are also Technical Working Group (TWG) meetings and PDC meetings where provincial directorates report to stakeholders in the provinces. In addition, provincial directorates report in writing to the Sector Affairs Departments of the provinces. The MoE has different support programmes with individual donors, and according to the Memoranda of Understanding (MoU), each programme office reports to the individual donor in line with their respective rules and requirements. In education promotion cluster meetings, all the stakeholders including the MoE report on both national progress and concerns of the education sector overall.

**Monitoring and Evaluation**

The 2007 Education Management Information System (EMIS) survey was unable to collect data from roughly 200 schools and was unable to verify data on a further 400. Reportedly, teacher registrations or audit payrolls in insecure areas have not been possible. MoE and MoHE have not provided adequate M&E services, leaving many issues unrecorded and many concerns not fully considered or addressed. While both ministries have their own mechanisms and related directorates and departments for regular M&E of the quantity and quality of services provided, field visits and formal interviews conducted in the provinces have revealed that these practices are inadequate – especially in second and third grade provinces and districts. Informants describe how reports have not been systematically recorded nor archived properly, with the concerns raised not having been addressed.

**Funding and Financial Procedures**

Funds to cover all education services costs are provided by a combination of national resources and donors’ financial support. Financial resources are channeled through the MoF, with or without earmarking preferences for particular provinces or services. However, there are also off-budget contributions by some donors to ministries, either nationally or to particular provinces, programmes, or projects. Provincial directorates receive their operations and development funds through the *Mustofiat*s*.* Provinces draw on the funds they themselves receive to provide funding for salaries and other costs in district education departments.

**Main Problems and Challenges**

* About 60% of students are still being taught in tents or other unprotected structures because more than 5000 educational institution across the country lack buildings. The result is that some parents refuse to allow their children, especially daughters, to attend schools.
* The lack of female teachers concerns many parents, especially in more conservative areas. Some parents do not allow their daughters to be taught by men, again resulting in many girls being prevented from attending school.
* Another major concern is the targeted destruction of schools – especially those for females by anti-government elements. Over the period of 2006-2009, 439 teachers, education employees and students were killed. In 2008 alone, 140 teachers were killed or wounded and 650 schools were shut down because of security concerns. Many parents doubt the government's ability to protect them and their children, and these conditions make recruitment of staff to work in these areas difficult.
* Approximately 40% of school-aged children and youth currently do not have access to education, while around 4 million more children, with a majority of them girls, are “out of school” or not attending.
* About 70% of teachers do not meet the minimum requirement of being graduates with 14 formal education grades, and available statistics for 2010 show a teacher student ratio of 1:32, which is likely to increase with more student enrollment.
* There is still no standardized curriculum, and high school textbooks remain woefully inadequate in quantity and content.
* There is a lack of reliable data in the education sector, including population statistics. Key measures of equity and efficiency, and information needed to project future budget requirements are not readily available.
* Limited attention to, and late decisions in connection with law making, policies and procedures for private sector engagement in education has been a problem. Afghanistan does not yet have its Higher Education Law in place, whilst private institutions have been providing their services for about 10 years.
* While Early Childhood Education (ECE) is prioritized clearly in the Education Law, it receives very limited attention. Relevant progress reports were not provided to the study mission when field visits were conducted in the provinces.

## *2. Health Care*

**Health Care Sector Overview**

More than 60% of Afghanistan’s population lives within a one-hour walking distance to the nearest health care facility,[[25]](#footnote-25) with women and children having more limited access to facilities overall. The national Health Finance Policy[[26]](#footnote-26) places the mortality rate among children under 5 (excluding the country’s south zone) at 97 per 1000 live births. The maternal mortality rate is 327 per 100,000 live births, while life expectancy for males and females has reportedly risen in recent years to 62 and 64 years, respectively. Only 6% of the total health care expenditure are provided by the government, and this makes up only 4% of all government expenditures.

**Health Care Service Delivery**

MoPH is the leading government organization for implementation of the National Strategy for Health Care and its associated policies. MoPH has its own information management system. In addition, MoPH has developed a 5-year strategic plan in line with the Health and Nutrition Sector Strategy of ANDS, as well as an operational plan for the provision of services to citizens. At national level, the National Institute for Public Health (which operates within the structure of MoPH) researches and develops health care potential. At provincial level, public health departments play a secondary role in public health law and policy implementation while providing health care services to the citizens through relevant facilities.

Specialized national hospitals exist at central level; regional hospitals act as referral hospitals in the major provinces of Herat, Mazar and Nangarhar. Health facilities differ according to their capacity and resources in providing a Basic Package of Health Services (BPHS) as well as an Essential Package of Health Services (EPHS) to citizens. In provinces such as Kabul, Kapisa, Panjshir, Parwan, Takhar, Baghlan, Samangan, Kunduz, Saripul, Urozgan, Balkh, Ghor, and Zabul, the MoPH provides services through its own human resources. Service provisions for the citizens of the remaining provinces are contracted out to a number of NGOs. At district level, district health care coordinators manage the activities of service providers and communicate related issues to provincial health care authorities.

MoPH has also sub-contracted some NGOs such as United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (UNOCHA) in Balkh to deliver services in the districts. At community level, there are health posts/clinics that deliver basic health care services.

Private hospitals and clinics are licensed through the MoPH and provincial directorates of public health to provide services and produce, import and market medicine and medical materials in line with MoPH national policy for private health care providers.[[27]](#footnote-27) They also run outpatient care centers in the capital, provinces and districts. Some international NGOs also have a presence in the provinces. Health care TWGs in each province coordinate various health care service providers. Members, including some international NGOs, meet at least once a month to share related issues and priorities, and to make decisions regarding needs. Major issues are forwarded for discussion and decision-making at provincial development committee meetings, chaired by provincial governors or their deputies.

Provincial directorates of public health routinely provide the following health care services**:**

* Enforcing Public Health Law and other MoPH rules and regulations, monitoring and evaluation of provincial and district health care facilities;
* Environmental health control;
* Mass immunization, Tuberculosis, and Malaria services;
* HIV/AIDS testing and protection services;
* Public awareness and treatment services for drug addicts;
* Nutrition, and reproductive health care services; and
* Pharmacy services.

**Funding and Financial Procedures**

MoPH’s Afghanistan Health Financing Policy, effective as of 2012, aims to move towards universal health coverage, through raising sufficient funds and improving efficiency and equity. MoPH has a centralized system of resource mobilization and finance. The development budget is mainly sourced from donor assistance in the sector, through support in both on-budget and off-budget modalities. On-budget support is channeled through the MoF and the budget section of the MoPH, while donors supply off-budget support through direct transfers to service providers or the MoPH. *Mustofiats* provide a secondary level of financial resources in provinces, transferring funds to MoF departments through which sector departments, including health, receive their funds.

**Reporting Mechanisms**

MoPH has internal guidelines for reporting health care services and issues. Provincial health facilities report to MoPH’s provincial public health directorates and provincial relations directorates. However, since MoPH has sub-contracted a number of NGOs to provide services in the districts, such report to the respective NGOs and through them directly to the MoPH in Kabul. Provincial relations departments collect and communicate provincial department reports to MoPH internal departments, or stakeholders outside the ministry.

**Monitoring and Evaluation**

Internal MoPH guidelines exist for M&E. All health care providing facilities, including those managed by NGOs in the provinces and districts, are regularly monitored by provincial departments, and by relevant MoPH staff on an ad hoc basis.

Representatives of the MoPH and its provincial relations directorates participate in provincial health committee meetings at least once a month. M&E departments monitor district health facilities at least once a week.

**Main problems and challenges**

Field visits in 5 provinces, formal interviews, and background document research highlighted the following problems and challenges in the public health care system and its facilities:

* MoPH’s centralized budget planning and disbursement process limits the provision of timely and sufficient budgetary resources, and provincial health authorities have limited financial authority. Reportedly, several cases of bidding and contracting processes for provincial services were executed at ministry level in the capital.
* Most provincial public hospitals and clinics in districts were established and designed decades ago, for much smaller populations. No updated censuses have captured or revealed the extent of growing populations, leading to internal displacements, overcrowding and unresponsiveness in service delivery to the increasing public needs.
* Human resources are insufficient.
* In addition, due to security risks, health care personnel are reluctant to go to some districts to provide services. Policy has been to sub-contract service provision to NGOs (who offer higher salaries, yet are still unable to access some risky areas). This “double standard” negatively affects staff and service personnel in public health facilities and their willingness or ability to provide services to the public. The impact of salary differences raises questions about the sustainability of improved service delivery in public health care facilities.
* Service provision is insufficient and slow, with weak communication between provincial directorates and MoPH, further undermining provincial and district services. Technical capacity for service delivery strategy, planning, or improvements is insufficient.
* When sub-contracting NGOs for provision of health care services in the provinces, MoPH has not sufficiently considered provincial public health care authorities.
* Systems and procedures for the establishment of pharmacies or drugstores are lengthy.
* Around 50% of health care clinics in districts are housed in rented private buildings. Most existing health care facilities do not have appropriate buildings to meet their needs.
* Public health facilities have insufficient transport or ambulance services (sometimes none).
* Reportedly, in some cases, health care TWGs did not take citizens’ needs and demands for more or improved service provision into consideration.
* Little or no quality control of imported medicines exists. In most cases quality is poor, which complicates treatment processes by making them lengthy and sometimes ineffective.
* By law, procurement in Afghanistan requires complex and lengthy procedures.
* Issues in HIV/AIDS transmission and treatment, and health care services for the elderly and disabled, are areas of concern that require much more attention from MoPH.

## *3. Rural Roads*

**Rural Roads Overview**

With approximately 80% of Afghanistan’s population based in rural areas, the potential for reducing poverty and increasing economic activity and public access to key services is clearly linked to an expanded and improved rural road network. According to a GIRoA provincial brief[[28]](#footnote-28) the average distance to the nearest drivable road in Afghanistan is 3.1 kilometers. Most roads linking districts to provincial capitals, and all established village level roads, are unpaved.

**Service Delivery in the Rural Roads Sector**

Historically, MRRD and its provincial directorates carried out the establishment and improvement of rural roads.

In 2002, when communities were living mostly in isolation from each other following a lengthy period of conflict and greatly required access roads, government launched the National Emergency Employment Programme (NEEP) – supported by multiple donors – with the aim of increasing community access to rural infrastructure and providing emergency employment in rural areas. NEEP was succeeded by the NRAP, with a focus on the further provision of rural road access to connect households and communities to essential services. NRAP is jointly managed by MPW and MRRD, with UNOPS responsible for implementation. Project activities are contracted to the private sector and/or directly to communities. Considerable progress has been made in road infrastructure development and maintenance, and in the preparation of a Rural Roads Master Plan. MRRD has established a computerized database for NRAP that collects data from all 34 provinces, and has consequently specified the need for new roads.

**Funding and Financial Procedures**

NRAP receives funds from the World Bank through the Afghanistan Reconstruction Trust Fund’s (ARTF) on-budget channel. Other entities such as USAID and the UNDP’s NABDP and the NPRP projectshave their own off-budget funding mechanisms in provision of rural access services.

**Reporting Mechanisms**

Provincial coordinators of NRAP report implementation progress or issues to provincial directorates of MRRD and their regional coordination units, which forward them to their PIUs and ultimately to central PDCU in Kabul. PDCU, through its coordinator, reports the national status of the programme to the steering committee of NRAP, comprising MRRD and MPW.

**Monitoring and Evaluation**

An inter-ministerial committee chaired by the Minister of Finance (or his representatives) and including ministers (or their delegates) from MPW, MRRD, and other line ministries involved as beneficiary ministries in NRAP (including agriculture, basic education, health, and counter narcotics), is responsible for overseeing the programme and monitoring its integration with other rural development programmes. The Programme Coordination Unit in the MoF is responsible for the overall coordination, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the programme, and provides regular consolidated progress reports to the steering committee. The PCU also ensures that progress is in accordance with an implementation schedule, and monitors the contract obligations of the consulting companies. To assist in coordination, a working group chaired by the national coordinator and comprising the focal points of beneficiary ministries and implementing bodies (PIUs and UNOPS) has been established, and meets each month to ensure adequate technical coordination and communication between entities and ministries at the implementation level.

**Main Problems and Challenges**

* NRAP is being implemented in the absence of a rural access policy framework.
* The spread of intensive practices in agriculture, while expanding productivity, undermines employment creation in rural areas, which will increase incentives for the unemployed to resort to poppy cultivation.
* Reports indicate that funds have been spent in an ad hoc manner in the context of a multi-year project and a rather unrealistic rural access programme and plan.
* There is little or no coordination between the NSP, NABDP and NPRP, which may also include rural road development projects.
* In the long run, salaries paid by NRAP will not be affordable within the GIRoA budget.
* Norms and standards in rural road development have not been sufficiently considered by private companies or some NGOs, especially in areas with higher security risks. Reportedly, some companies implementing sub-projects do not to have the required technical expertise.
* Due to regular road damages as a result of physical erosion, landslides, snow and rainfall, operations and maintenance funding needs are insufficient in comparison to resources invested in establishment and construction.
* The steering committee for rural roads rarely meets and hardly fulfills its assigned roles.
* Upgrading practices for rural roads has “hardly happened.”
* Rural access issues have not featured in the agendas of the working groups created for Agriculture and Rural Development and Transport sectors of the ANDS**.**

## *4. Water Supply and Sanitation*

**Water Supply and Sanitation Sector Overview**

According to the MRRD’s report on Rural Water Supply, only about 27% of the population has access to safe drinking water. An estimated 17 million rural and urban Afghans are in need of safe drinking water, with around 23% of deaths in the country attributed to contaminated water and poor sanitation. Between 30% and 50% of water points across the country are reportedly dysfunctional due to drying water sources, a falling water table, damage caused by natural disasters, poor quality of construction materials and equipment, and a lack of maintenance and poor operation. Contamination levels of drinking water are around 60%, without adequate capacity and infrastructure for water quality control at national and provincial levels. People utilize different water sources such as rivers, streams, ponds, pools, springs, canals, piped water schemes, dug wells, boreholes, and tube wells. According to the MRRD WASH policy, only about 5% of the total population has access to safe hygienic latrines, while 58% of households make use of traditional, antiquated latrine facilities.

**Water Supply and Sanitation Services Delivery**

Historically, CAWSS was responsible for the provision of safe drinking water for urban household in a number of provinces. CAWSS was dissolved in 2009 as a result of a government decision and replaced with AUWSSC, a state enterprise engaged in service delivery in the water supply and sewage sector. AUWSSC operates through a general directorate in Kabul and SBUs in 6 major cities. In other provinces and districts, depending on the volume of pre-planned work, AUWSSC maintains sub-SBUs. AUWSSC is mandated to produce, purify and distribute water, and monitor the quality of drinking water for households and residential or commercial buildings under its coverage or programme areas. It is currently investigating its capital resources and financial balances, and producing strategic plans. Progress reports showing the extent and types of services rendered to citizens, and/or the populations covered were unavailable to the study mission. However, field visits indicated a limited number of piped water supply schemes in cities such as Kabul, Mazar, Jalalabad, Herat, and Parwan. AUWSSC has reportedly not yet been able to perform major activities in the sewage or sanitation sector.

In most major cities and a number of districts, municipalities also engage in sewage, waste management, and sanitation services, including construction or installation of garbage collection containers, garbage gathering and disposal, withdrawal of septic tanks, construction and maintenance of public latrines, control of public baths and swimming pools, cleaning roads and side ditches, and rabies control.

In rural areas, the MRRD, through its provincial offices, programmes and projects – mainly implemented by CDCs or private companies – provides drinking water and sanitation services. MRRD follows its strategic plan and the recommendation of its WASH policy developed in 2010, and maintains a database showing the existence, needs, plans, and implementation progress of water supply and sanitation facilities and services in rural areas. The ministry also provides hygiene education in rural communities through different programmes together with other players in villages and districts. Some national and international NGOs also work in the provision of safe water sources and sanitation in selected districts.

**Funding and Financial Procedures**

As a state enterprise, AUWSSC is expected to generate revenue against services rendered, recover costs and finance its operation and development. For a variety of reasons it has not been able to achieve this and receives financial support from the World Bank, KFW (through a German grant), and USAID. There is no cost to citizens at district and village level where MRRD provincial directorates – through CDCs – provide water supply and sanitation assistance and services. As per MRRD programme rules and regulations, beneficiaries may pay a portion of the incurred project and maintenance costs of the facilities and services they receive. Municipality Law promotes the generation of revenue and/or cost recovery against the sanitation services they provide in their coverage areas. MoF oversees the general revenue and expenditure status of municipalities across the country.

**Reporting Mechanisms**

At national level, AUWSSC reports to its board, which consists of MUDA, MoEc, MoF, NEPA, and the Kabul Municipality. In provinces and districts, and on a monthly and quarterly basis, SBUs report sector progress and situations to provincial governors’ offices as well as to the AUWSSC head office in Kabul. Municipalities’ reporting mechanisms differ from one to the next. For example, the Kabul municipality reports directly to the office of the President or Administrative Affairs, while provincial municipalities report to both the IDLG and (some) to provincial governors. Some district municipalities report to the IDLG, district governors, and provincial capital municipalities, while others report only to the IDLG and their district governors.

**Monitoring and Evaluation**

AUWSSC has established its own monitoring and evaluation system. SBUs and sub-SBUs are monitored quarterly by visiting head office officials. There are also existing MoF procedures for monitoring state enterprises, especially their financial transactions. Donor agencies that have provided grant assistance also monitor AUWSSC, its SBUs or sub-SBUs on visits.

**Main Problems and Challenges**

* Service provision was reported to have slowed as a result of the transition from CAWSS to AUWSSC, given that AUWSSC has needed to recover or reconcile its predecessor’s assets and liabilities, and also overhaul and manage the operating system. Consequently (and in most cases) citizens create their own water sources, such as dug wells, bore wells, and pump wells. Often, their construction of non-standard types of septic reservoirs can lower the level of and contaminate the water table.
* Little or no progress has yet been made by AUWSSC or any other organization for sewage and sanitation in urban areas of provinces.
* Relatively little attention has been given to improving sanitation in rural areas.
* Cooperation between AUWSSC and state institutions – particularly municipalities, energy, and telecommunication departments – in the provinces and districts is poor.
* AUWSSC faces difficulties in recovering past revenue from both public and private institutions, hidden in the costs of their projects, especially in the provinces.
* AUWSSC’s technical and service delivery capacity and that of its SBUs and sub-SBUs is reportedly very low, especially with reference to available means of transportation and machinery, workshops, and other equipment.

## *5. Civil and Vital Registration*

**Civil and Vital Registration Sector Overview**

Civil registration is Afghanistan’s major legal basis for establishing the rights and privileges of its citizens. Its main purpose is the registry, record keeping and provision of legal documents. Vital events comprise live births, adoptions, recognitions, deaths, marriages, divorces, separations and annulments. For an individual Afghanistan citizen, civil registration records of birth provide essential legal documentation of his/her identity and civil status, such as; name, tribe, religion, date and place of birth, father’s name and nationality, ancestry or lineage, sex and nationality/citizenship on which a wide array of individual and family rights depend. In Afghanistan, nationality is based on the identified genealogy of a person’s parents and grandparents. Interviews conducted in the provinces suggested that only around 40% of live births are reported for registration in civil and vital registration departments across the country. It was said that people rarely report or register deaths, marriages, and divorces.

**Civil and Vital Registration Sector Service Delivery**

Presently, civil and vital registration affairs and services are provided through the General Directorate for Civil and Vital Registration and Foreign Citizens’ Affairs in Afghanistan, which is found within the structure of MoI’s Deputy Ministry for Administration**.** Almost all registry and recording services are outdated, mostly carried out manually in related logbooks.

The general directorate includes three main directorates: civil registration, vital statistics, and foreign citizens’ affairs. The directorate for foreign citizens’ affairs provides services such as the registration of the entry and exit dates and status of foreign citizens, addressing requests for Afghanistan citizenship, and citizenship termination requests of those Afghans who live abroad. Provincial departments provide related services to populations in provinces, and also support district offices. There are on average 5 employees providing services in each district office. In most provinces and districts, and for various reasons, data quality has been poor and often incomplete with considerable errors in coverage – one limiting factor being that registration offices are closed on Thursdays and Fridays.

Recently MoI has also established a general directorate for distribution of electronic identity cards *(Tazkira)[[29]](#footnote-29)* within the structure of the Deputy Ministry of Administration. This entity is expected to take over parts of the activities of the functional general directorate for civil and vital registration, but has not yet commenced practical delivery of services. It has three main departments: operations, technical, and enrollment.

**Reporting Mechanisms**

District offices for civil and vital registration report statistics and data to provincial departments, which in turn report the accumulated provincial reports to the general directorate for civil and vital registration and foreign citizens’ affairs in Kabul. The directorate does not publish any independent report, but sends its reports, data and statistics to MoI and the CSO.

**Monitoring and Evaluation**

A monitoring and evaluation department operates within the general directorate for civil and vital registration and for foreign citizens’ affairs, and is mandated to regularly monitor the processes, quantity and quality of service delivery in Kabul, the provinces and districts. Duplicate civil registration logbooks from all provinces are archived in Kabul for future reference or related assistance to citizens living or working in the city. According to field visits and relevant formal interviews conducted in the provinces, M&E practices, especially at provincial and district levels has been limited and ineffective.

**Funding and Financial Procedures**

The general directorate in Kabul and the provinces receives its funds from the national core budget through MoI. Provincial departments receive MoI allocated budget through the MoF’s *Mustofiat.[[30]](#footnote-30)* The newly established general directorate for electronic identity cards has to date received only $5 million from MoI’s development budget.

**Main Problems and Challenges**

* Archives in almost all departments of the general directorate are recorded in logbooks. Manual registration increases the risks of human error, damage, and loss of records.
* The operational budget for provincial offices has been inadequate. They are short of basic needs such as stationery and office equipment, and in most cases do not have their own office buildings. Vehicles and motorbikes for employees to better deliver services are in short supply.
* People generally do not value birth, death, and marriage registration.
* The commencement of electronic identification cards has proceeded with little or limited coordination amongst stakeholders or cooperating organizations. The law for the provision of the cards is still in draft status and under review in the MoJ**.**

## *6. Land Registration*

**Land Registration Overview**

Prior to September 2009, the *AMLAAK* directorate of MAIL conducted all land registration and land-related services at national and sub-national levels. In 1966 the Afghanistan Geodesy and Cartography office initiated a cadastral survey of the public and private land in all 34 provinces, completed in 1977.[[31]](#footnote-31) This information is however only available in analogue formats, and there are severe discrepancies between national and regional records due to the breakdown of administrative processes over the past three decades.

According to the successor organization, ARAZI,[[32]](#footnote-32) only about 35% of total land has been recently surveyed, and around 6% of total land has been registered. Most deeds, which document and verify the transfer of ownership of real estate in Afghanistan have been either damaged or destroyed during the decades of conflicts.[[33]](#footnote-33) Illegal land appropriation and occupation – mainly of public or state-owned land – has been undertaken by powerful individuals or ex-warlords in almost all parts of Afghanistan, and is escalating. Government law enforcement agencies are too weak to prevent this, or to recover the usurped land. The causes vary from the degree of involvement of provincial law enforcement authorities in the issues, corruption, and insecurity of the areas where some illegal occupations take place. Land registration services in provinces have been performed manually and are recorded in ARAZI provincial department logbooks.

**Provision of Land Registration Services**

Land registration services at national and sub-national levels are part of the activities of the ARAZI general directorate. In recent years, major efforts have been focused towards revitalization of the *Makhzans[[34]](#footnote-34)* as registries at provincial courts to regularly provide legal support for real estate owners. ARAZI has established a Land Information Management System (LIMS) for more efficient and effective land affairs management. There are two types of property ownership documents, namely legal property deeds registered with the government (MAIL, or Municipalities), and customary deeds issued by local communities. Since 2001 the survey and registration process of land has been relatively slow. However, in provinces the operation and annual plans of ARAZI for land registration or other services have been integrated into the overall provincial plans of the agriculture and livestock directorates.

**Funding and Financial Procedures**

As the national institution for land affairs management, ARAZI receives its financial resources through the core sources of MAIL and MoF in the form of a development and operational budget. ARAZI can also receive off-budget technical or financial support from donor agencies. The general directorate generates some revenues from leasing government land to the public, institutions and businesses.

**Reporting Mechanisms**

At national level, ARAZI reports to its inter-ministerial board.[[35]](#footnote-35) Provincial ARAZI departments report regularly to the main office in Kabul, to the sectors services department of the offices of the provincial governors, and to the provincial commissions for land affairs management in those provinces where these exist. ARAZI reports are integrated into MAIL progress or annual reports. District departments send their reports on a monthly basis to the planning departments of MAIL’s provincial directorates.

**Monitoring and Evaluation**

Within its organogram, ARAZI operates an M&E department in each provincial office of MAIL. However, the quality of ARAZI’s M&E procedures is inadequate. No M&E land registration reports were provided to the study mission during field visits in the provinces or during formal interviews in Kabul.

**Main Problems and Challenges**

* ARAZI currently faces shortages of financial, technical and human resources, at head office and in provinces and districts.
* Of national concern, ARAZI staff salaries are low in comparison to the salaries provided by international NGO’s. This causes regular turnover of staff and makes it difficult to recruit competent and professional staff.
* The importance of land registration concern has been overlooked by central government.
* Increasing illegal occupation of public land by powerful individuals and ex-warlords remains a serious and ongoing problem.
* There are legal ambiguities in the application of penalties or punishment concerning illegal land occupants.
* MoF has in some cases overlapped with and interfered with ARAZI in its official or mandated responsibilities.
* In some provinces and districts, land documents and records do not exist, have been lost, or have been destroyed.
* Afghanistan does not have updated and valid land registration legislation clearly defining the important issues in the land registration process, which *inter alia* include: administration of the registration system, contents of the registry records, the structure of a basic registration unit, what to register as interested and affected issues, first time registration processes, maps and boundaries standards, the legal implication of registration, and the related rules for governing changes entered into the registry records.
* In some provinces and most districts, agriculture and livestock departments – which include ARAZI land registration staff – do not have sufficient offices or buildings, and are not provided with means of transportation.
* The security situation in some provinces and a number of districts leads to land registration authorities often being reticent to physically exercise land registration processes.

## *7. Irrigation*

**Irrigation Sector Overview**

Afghanistan’s agriculture is supported by informal, formal, surface water, and ground water irrigation systems. Central government supports large-scale irrigation schemes, while informal irrigation systems – a traditional means which has existed forgenerations – are used for about 90% of the irrigated area in the country. Communities use rivers, streams, springs, *Kareze*s,*[[36]](#footnote-36)* and wells as water resources for irrigation. Water distribution is generally based on its availability together with the entitlements or rights of beneficiaries. Afghanistan’s most cultivable areas receive low or insufficient rainfall during the irrigation season, with major annual precipitation occurring at higher elevations such as the Hindu Kush mountains. The annual average volume of water used for irrigation is estimated to be 95 billion cubic meters, consisting of about 90% surface water and the balance ground water. Geographically, Afghanistan is made up of 5 major river basins with surface water flows peaking in spring and early summer when the snows melt. Afghanistan’s cultivation area is estimated to be about 8 million ha, making up about 12% of the country’s total area.

**Service Delivery in the Irrigation Sector**

At national level, two ministries – MEW and MAIL – provide water and irrigation sector support services to citizens. MEW manages services at the national level through its deputy ministry for water, directorates for water programmes and policies, by way of related projects for the rehabilitation of irrigation schemes, development of water dams, and establishment of hydro meteorological facilities. Formal irrigation schemes are developed, financed, managed and operated by central government, with the largest schemes located in Helmand, Ghazni, Parwan, Nangarhar, Badakhshan, Kunduz, Takhar, Baghlan and Balkh provinces. There are 6 regional offices – per river basin – which cover 34 provinces, with one staff member employed for the provision of irrigation related services in each particular district.

At national level, MAIL provides services through its directorate for irrigation. In the provinces it has departments for irrigation under the line provincial directorates for agriculture and livestock, and accordingly they also have related staff in each district. At national level, other government entities such as MRRD also provides small-scale irrigation support services through its NABDP and NSP programmes. At provincial level, MRRD manages and coordinates irrigation support services through its provincial departments, NGOs, private companies and local CCs.

**Reporting Mechanisms**

Each irrigation district department sends its monthly reports to the planning directorates of MAIL’s provincial departments. After consolidation, planning departments send their provincial reports to the directorate of irrigation as well as the directorates of planning, and provincial relations of MAIL.

**Monitoring and Evaluation**

MAIL at the national level includes a general directorate for M&E, which is expected to conduct regular monitoring and evaluation of all MAIL programme services, including the irrigation sector. The irrigation directorate, under the deputy ministry of irrigation and agricultural infrastructure of MAIL, also has an M&E department and is expected to conduct monitoring and evaluation of irrigation sector programmes and services. Likewise, the provincial relations department of MAIL has an M&E department that in turn conducts M&E practices in provincial irrigation services. Officials of MAIL’s provincial line directorates are expected to conduct M&E practices in irrigation programmes and service delivery in their respective provinces and districts.National and international NGOs also providing irrigation sector related services have their own M&E systems within their organizations and for the particular programme or project. Despite this elaborate structure, or because of it, field visit assessments and background information analysis found that M&E practice in this sector has been weak, unsystematic and insufficient. Few M&E reports were provided to the mission when conducting formal interviews in the provinces.

**Funding and Financial Procedures**

Financing for the sector’s operations and development projects and services are provided through the core budgets of MAIL and MEW, channeled through the MoF. However a major part of the development budget has been provided through external support, from the World Bank, Asian Development Bank and other donors. In the provinces, NGO’s such as USAID and the Food and Agricultural Organization of the United Nations (FAO) also financially support irrigation related services.

**Main Problems and Challenges**

* The *Amu Darya River* basin is one of the country’s biggest water and irrigation sources, but often causes damage to agricultural land in its neighboring communities.
* Insufficient budget exists for irrigation sector development, resulting in the inability of provincial departments to finance their development services.
* Most provincial or river basin area departments of irrigation do not have their own office buildings.
* Most irrigation staff in the provinces and districts are not provided with transportation and do not have sufficient tools and equipment.
* In some provinces, the available water quantity is not sufficient for the increasing irrigation needs of communities.
* All development budget planning and expenditures are prepared at MAIL headquarters in Kabul, but insufficient financial resources are provided for provincial or zonal offices to meet their irrigation sector development needs.
* Irrigation professionals working in this sector are limited in number and relatively low levels of government salaries promote high staff turnover.
* Financial expenditures and local procurement systems in MAIL are lengthy and outdated, hindering the provision of irrigation services.
* There is no separate provincial budget available to establish water beneficiary associations, nor sufficient funds available for infrastructure maintenance.

## *8. Agricultural Extension*

**Agricultural Sector Overview**

Afghanistan’s economy is fundamentally agriculturally based. During the 1960s and 1970s Afghanistan’s farmers produced sufficient cereals, fruits, vegetables, and meats for both domestic consumption and some exports (providing 20% of the world raisins at one time) – despite the fact that Afghanistan is a dry country with little rainfall and frequent droughts. Presently, agriculture suffers from poor management, insufficient investment, and ruined infrastructure. More than 50% of forests have been illegally cut, used, sold or transported to neighboring countries. Around 12% of land in Afghanistan is suitable for agriculture, with only 6% currently under cultivation. Agriculture contributes to about 50% of the GDP (excluding the opium economy). Wheat is the major crop, playing a major role in the national economy, and also providing for food security, with outputs fluctuating annually. Corn, rice, cotton and sugar beet are also cash crops, which help reduce imports. Production is impacted by water shortages during late summer due to limited water resources management capacity, waste, improper use and old irrigation infrastructures. Nevertheless, according to a recent report,[[37]](#footnote-37) agricultural output in Afghanistan has shown a growth of 60% during the last 7 years, obviously off a very low base but still remaining an important achievement.

**Agricultural Extension Sector Service Delivery**

MAIL regulates, coordinates and manages agriculture, irrigation, and livestock nationally. MAIL, led by the Minister, and three deputies (technical, administration and finance, irrigation and agricultural infrastructures), operates around 40 directorates in Kabul. MAIL provides its related services through four major programmes: Natural Resource Management, Agricultural Production Fertility, Agricultural Economic Rehabilitation, and Reform and Capacity Development. Headquarters provides policy and strategy development and direction, programme initiation, coordination, capacity enhancement, communication, procurement, administrative and financial and human resources support services.

Provincial directorates in the 34 provinces provide most of MAIL’s services. Some have developed annual work plans and three-year development plans. Employee numbers vary, and are dependent on the intensity and extent of existing agriculture, irrigation, and livestock activities on human, financial and technical capacity, as well as the security situation. There are up to 40 employees in some provinces. Provincial directorates work through personnel in agricultural extension, land management, irrigation, forestry, plant protection, quality control of products, and provide support to cooperatives, irrigation, veterinary and animal health, planning, and administration and finance departments. Some of the larger provincial offices such as in Balk, Nangarhar, and Herat provide technical support to neighboring provinces when needed.

In some offices (both provincial and district), human resources are inadequate and not responsive to current service needs, with many posts remaining vacant for both professional and administrative staff. Although reform and capacity enhancement has been one of the internal priority areas for MAIL, limited real differences in terms of management, human resources and technical capacity for service delivery were reported in the visits to provincial offices. Agricultural seed and chemical fertilizers allocated and distributed to farmers are insufficient. Lack of financial resources earmarked for the establishment of water beneficiary associations has precluded their establishment.

In addition to MAIL, MRRD and Ministry of Counter-Narcotics, through their provincial directorates and programmes such as the NSP, NABDP and Alternative Livelihoods, also provide some agricultural and irrigation development support services. Related projects are proposed through CDCs and DDAs, or other provincial mechanisms established for communities, and are executed by NGOs and/or private companies. Beside the government services, major NGOs bi and multilateral organizations such as FAO, USAID, United States Department of Agriculture, World Food Programme, and International Center for Agricultural Research in the Dry Areas also provide support for agricultural development services in the capital, provinces and the districts.

**Reporting Mechanisms**

District departments report project progress and related issues and challenges to provincial directorate’s planning departments on a monthly basis, while provincial directorates send the accumulated reports, including finance and administration statuses and other related activities to the planning, programmes and provincial relations directorates in Kabul, on a quarterly and annual basis. MAIL’s downward directives take place through three deputy ministries, provincial relations and plans, and programme directorates. MAIL has begun the practice of uploading some of its progress and annual reports onto its official website.[[38]](#footnote-38)

**Monitoring and Evaluation**

MAIL’s national and provincial M&E directorates and sections are reportedly functional. The directorate for quality control of agricultural products also provides monitoring services through MAIL’s general directorate for agricultural extension. While each programme, provincial directorate, and general directorate reportedly applies certain mechanisms for monitoring services within their own structures, field visits and related interviews in the provinces produced very few M&E reports. Provincial visits showed that M&E practices have not been conducted adequately, regularly and in a systematic manner. Central government’s control and audit authority of the Council of Ministers also assigns its delegation, and performs some control and audit services for MAIL and its provincial directorates as per their own agenda.

**Funding and Financial Procedures**

Agricultural extension service funds – which cover operational, development, project implementation and service delivery – are channeled through the government core budget supplied by MoF. Donors’ budget support is also channeled through MoF’s on-budget system to MAIL, which possesses its own internal planning and budgeting procedures. MAIL forwards an annual forecast budget to MoF and parliament, and after approval receives the budget in different installments based on actual expenditures. MAIL provincial staff consulted during the field visits mentioned that funds were mostly inadequate or arrived late, limiting their proper utilization. MAIL spent more than 98% of its budget in the first quarter of 2012.

**Main Problems and Challenges**

* Influential and powerful individuals at national and provincial levels reportedly interfere with regular agricultural service delivery in the communities concerned.
* While major controls of projects exist prior to contract signature for implementation with the NGOs or private companies, thereafter little control or M&E practices were reported to take place by the respective MAIL departments and officers in the provincial directorates and district departments.
* Provincial offices are not provided with adequate office buildings, stocks, funds, or human and technical resources to enable them perform mandated plans or services. The execution and payment of allocated budget to finance the projects and services sometimes take up to a month, with up to 20 signatures required in certain processes.
* Only about 30% of the country’s available water resources are currently being utilized, and at very low efficiency and productivity. Irrigation and rural water supply infrastructures have deteriorated due to strife, drought, and lack of maintenance. In many locations, off-farm water schemes are unreliable because the rehabilitation and construction of irrigation systems is still slow with the catchment and storage of water inefficient. A strong need exists for on-farm, low-cost water-efficient technologies.
* The annual recruitment policy, which prohibits MAIL from recruiting employees on more than one cycle per year, together with relatively low salary levels for professional public servants are further barriers to productivity.
* There is reportedly little or no attention paid to the maintenance of agricultural infrastructure.

## *9. Energy*

**Energy Sector Overview**

Afghanistan’s major energy sources are electricity, gas, oil, and coal, with 85% of energy demand covered by traditional biomass (such as wood, fusel, and dung). While the country has estimated total hydropower potential of 23,000 MW,[[39]](#footnote-39) Afghanistan currently generates only 600 MW of electricity through hydropower, thermal and diesel power production facilities and imports most of its electricity from the neighboring counties of Uzbekistan, Turkmenistan, Tajikistan, and Iran. Only a small segment of the population has access to the power grid, this statistic placing Afghanistan at one of the lowest rankings in the world. Total annual per capita energy consumption is less than 25 KWH, while the demand for energy has continuously been rising and will continue to escalate. Major oil and gas reserves exist in the northern parts of the country, along with an estimated 73 million tons of coal reserves. The country imports its petroleum products – diesel, gasoline, and jet fuel – mainly from Pakistan, Uzbekistan, Turkmenistan, and Iran. Three decades of war have caused about 65% of power lines to be destroyed, and poor maintenance, lack of funds, and limited technical and management capacity have caused serious further deterioration of Afghanistan’s power grid. Rural areas remain practically unconnected to the grid or other affordable, sustainable power supply options. In urban areas power coverage is estimated to be over 70%, which includes costly privately owned diesel-power generators.

**Energy Sector Service Delivery**

MEW leads energy sector affairs and services via a deputy ministry of energy. MEW outsources to national and international companies for implementation of projects in the provinces or districts. The main services provided by MEW itself are as yet relatively minor, given recent rehabilitation of old power stations and negotiations with neighboring countries to connect more sources to the national grid in order to extend the network to more of the provinces.

Reporting by the MoEc indicates that MEW managed to spend only 52% of its approved development budget in 1390, a fairly typical year (a combined figure for the water and energy sectors). [[40]](#footnote-40) In addition to weak capacity and GIRoA’s cumbersome financial management and procurement regulations, execution of development budgets is hindered by the approval and allocation of funds taking place well after the start of the fiscal year, as well as uncertainties regarding the timing of disbursement of donor funds. As a result of political pressures to include development projects in the budget regardless of the likelihood that they will be financed and implemented, the approved development budget for most ministries is usually significantly larger than the funds eventually allocated for this purpose.

Besides the ministry, DABS is the state-owned commercial electricity supplier, with 6,405 technical and administrative staff distributed throughout the country. According to a DABS report,[[41]](#footnote-41) its beneficiaries increased by 16% between 2010-2011 and 2011-2012, from 885,885 to 914,327. The report shows decreases in electricity energy loss and an increase in the distribution, sales, and revenues of electricity. However, it urgently needs a commercial re-orientation for its sustainability and solvency, and in order to attract private sector investments.

Major dams built for energy purposes have filled with silt and mud, decreasing water reservoir capacity and restricting the generation of energy. MEW’s monitoring and supervision practices, especially of its provincial and regional offices and ultimately the hydropower generation stations, has been inadequate. MEW has delivered few services to date in alternative or renewable energy.

Very few districts have been serviced with grid electricity. However, MRRD, through its NSP and NABDP programmes and rural energy projects has constructed a number of micro-hydropower generation facilities and provided some diesel generators to rural communities. Major diesel generators supply Kabul, Qalat, Kandahar, and Lashkargah. According to national level authorities in MEW as well as its provincial and regional directorates, government and donors have not been keen to invest additional funds in energy sector major infrastructure, although USAID does support some energy sector services to the provinces and districts.

**Reporting Mechanisms**

MAIL’s provincial directorates provide monthly and quarterly reports to headquarters, and MEW’s energy support programmes report to their directorates on a regular basis. DABS offices in the provinces regularly report to their head office. The company itself reports to its shareholders and customers on a regular basis.

**Monitoring and Evaluation**

MEW’s M&E department within its deputy ministry for energy is mandated to perform monitoring and evaluation of energy sector services provided by its internal institutions and provincial directorates. This practice has been relatively weak, especially in the provincial or regional offices. There have been a number of external evaluations and financial audit practices conducted on DABS through Ernest & Young (an international accounting and auditing company) and other global companies.

**Funding and Financial Procedures**

MEW and other energy sector related ministries or authorities are reported to have been provided with adequate funds in response to their annual budget forecasts and plans for operational and development services. However, field visits and related formal interviews conducted in Kabul and the provinces revealed that MEW and its provincial level offices have been unable to allocate more funds to their energy sector projects.

**Main Problems and Challenges**

* Lack of security has been one of the major problems confronting service providers in this sector, especially MEW, DABS, MRRD, and MoM, and further discourages strong global interest groups from reaching out to such projects in some parts of Afghanistan.
* Interlocutors noted that more than a decade after the start of the new government, insufficient effort has been made to generate electricity and develop natural energy sources internally, with strong reliance continuing on imported and unsustainable energy sources.
* Most diesel units supplied to rural communities through the NSP require overhaul or replacement, with most not in operation due to a lack of funding for fuel and other operation and maintenance costs. Additionally, dependence on diesel generation results in high economic losses due to the prohibitively high cost and unreliability of fuel supplies.
* The procurement processes of some major donors in the energy sector, particularly the World Bank and Asian Development Bank, take considerable time and thus cause delays in extending service delivery.
* Lower salaries and benefits in the public sector compared with NGOs and international organizations in the energy sector cause considerable turnover among quality employees.
* MEW’s M&E practices, especially related to its provincial and regional offices and power generation stations, have been inadequate.

## *10. Disaster Management*

**Disaster Management Sector Overview**

Afghanistan’s landscape is one of wide plains in the north and southwest, rocky mountains in the east and central parts, and desert in the south and west. Earthquakes, droughts, floods, landslides, extreme winter conditions and avalanches are the country’s main natural hazards, negatively affecting the lives, property and livelihoods of its people. Recently, a lengthy drought has been experienced while the frequency of earthquakes in the north and northeast has been relatively high. In spring, when snows melt and rainfall is heavy, floods are common. The war has left the nation with high casualties, and has destroyed or reduced the coping capacity of communities and government. Over the period 1970-1998, Afghanistan suffered the effects of an estimated 57 major disasters, killing approximately 19,630 people with a further 3,361,178 affected.[[42]](#footnote-42) Drought, combined with the conflict, has created a large internally displaced population living in extremely poor conditions, often with very limited opportunities for livelihoods.

**Service Delivery in Disaster Management**

One of the oldest such organizations in Afghanistan, the Disaster Management Authority was established in 1971. In 2005 it was restructured and renamed ANDMA. ANDMA provides services in keeping with the constitution and the application of the National Strategic Plan (revised in 2010). Afghanistan, in partnership with the United Nations and other development organizations, has developed a Disaster Management Framework, a National Strategy for Disaster Management, and a National Disaster Management Plan. Around 80% of the provinces have to date developed strategic development plans for disaster management. The National Disaster Management Commission under the leadership of the Second Vice President has also been established. In the provinces, governors chair the Provincial Disaster Management Commissions, which also include provincial line department heads, mayors, *Mustofi,[[43]](#footnote-43)* and the Afghanistan Red Crescent Society.

As a policy-making national authority, ANDMA is mandated to coordinate and manage all aspects related to disaster emergency response, with the post-disaster recovery and development phase falling under the responsibility of government line ministries. In support of ANDMA, a National Disaster Management Commission has been established and is providing its services. This commission has a 24/7 active national disaster alert system. At national level there are at least two sessions held annually for disaster management service delivery preparedness. ANDMA has established offices in about half of the provinces where it’s Emergency Operation Centers operate through DDAs and/or CDCs as the first response to disasters.

However, according to the related formal interviews conducted in the provinces, it reportedly takes around three months from receiving incident reports to physically providing assistance to the affected areas. Insufficient operational budget is often reported as one of the major causes for delays or poor quality in service delivery. Besides its own operations, and in order to decrease the risk of landmines, ANDMA has also been communicating with and coordinating and supporting land mines clearance agencies in the country. Some of the major UN agencies such as UNDP, UNOCHA, United Nations Assistance Mission in Afghanistan (UNAMA), and the World Health Organization (WHO), also technically and financially support ANDMA.

**Reporting Mechanisms**

ANDMA’s Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) and reporting policy requires disaster occurrences or incidents in a village to be reported to: district authorities (including the governor), the provincial Commission for Disaster Management chaired by the governor, and to the provincial directorate for disaster management (see Figure 3, below).

In order to improve reporting efficiency and timely communication with provincial directorates, ANDMA has recently received a sufficient number of CODAN (high frequency communications and land mobile radio applications) equipment and radios sets. However these have not yet been installed because of a lack of technical capacity and support from national partner agencies. Despite this, ANDMA provincial offices regularly report to the main office in Kabul on a case-by-case manner and on a quarterly basis. At national level, ANDMA reports to the Council of Ministers and the National Disaster Management Commission.

**Funding and financial procedures**

Based on its annual budget plans, ANDMA receives its operation funds from the national core budget through the MoF. United Nations and other cooperating international agencies also provide some on- and off-budget support. However, these sources are insufficient to comprehensively cover and finance infrastructure and development programmes, nor to supply the equipment of early warning systems. A recent ANDS progress report[[44]](#footnote-44) indicates that ANDMA has experienced serious problems in delivering its development programmes and accordingly could not manage to spend around 80% of its development budget.

**Monitoring and Evaluation**

ANDMA monitors and conducts an annual audit of its provincial directorates to promote preparedness and the improvement of service delivery. Besides this, the general directorate for control and audit of the Afghanistan Council of Ministers also conducts regular audits of ANDMA’s performance and financial status of ANDMA, and also its provincial directorates.

**Main Problems and Challenges**

* Many government and non-government agencies focus their financial support on post-disaster activities, leaving inadequate financial resources to design and implement disaster risk management activities and programmes for public awareness. ANDMA wants to recruit more qualified staff at provincial level, but due to financial constraints is unable to do this.
* Insufficient institutional capacity, ownership and development within ANDMA and weak or no coordination between ANDMA, donors and other related participants at both national and provincial levels have caused duplication of effort in some areas. This is compounded by the fact that many agencies have developed several different guidelines and formats for project/activity implementation.
* Security constraints have been one of the major challenges for the National Disaster Management Plan to design and implement activities at provincial, district and community levels. This has also caused delays in drafting the Provincial Disaster Management Plans in Kandahar, Paktia, Helmand and Uruzgan provinces.
* A lack of strategic warehousing exists for the storage of relief commodities, especially in the provinces categorized at a higher level of disaster risk.
* Furthermore, there is a lack of air transportation such as helicopters to airlift employees and relief commodities when disasters occur.

**Figure 3: Communication and Coordination Linkages for**

**Disaster Management in Afghanistan**[[45]](#footnote-45)**:**



# Alternative Approaches to Improve Service Delivery

Based on the mission’s research and discussions regarding inter-governmental roles in service delivery in Afghanistan, this section attempts to provide a set of suggested alternatives towards improved service delivery in each of the targeted sectors.

At central, provincial, district, municipal and local levels, generic problems include: a lack of efficiency and effectiveness in planning, oversight and financial management systems; insufficient coordination amongst decision making bodies; limited human resource and absorption capacity; lack of effective communication between the capital and provinces; and recruitment of some employees based on nepotism. Since Afghanistan is largely dependent on international development support, and because of a lack of domestic skills and expertise, there appear to be huge disparities in salaries between expats and local officials/staff, contributing to high staff turnover.

Given the limited time and resources available for this study, there has been no attempt to devise comprehensive responses to all issues and problems that were identified during the mission. The following compilation, by functional sector, is intended to flag some key, relevant suggestions and alternative approaches.

***1. Education***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Ministries** | **Suggestions** |
| **Ministry of Education:** MoE should improve its functional assignments as mandated in education legislation and described in section E of this study, and:   * Enforce its central sections for human resources, provincial relations, procurement and finance to regularly assess and supply adequate financial, human resources, and procurement needs of the provincial directorates of education. * In order to decrease duplication and overlapping, and equally distribute services – especially when planning and building new education facilities – MoE should further develop MIS, planning, and provincial relations sections. * Establish and support a performance management/measurement unit, which performs regular visits to the provinces and districts and, in cooperation with the ministry’s human resources section, provides necessary rewards and penalties and performs adjustments in MoE, its directorates, and departments in provinces and districts. * In order to enhance employment for school graduates, sections for technical and vocational education and their facilities and services – especially in provinces – should be further developed and strengthened. * MoE senior management – especially the policy section – together with MoF should standardize and rationalize the salaries and benefits policy for MoE employees and services providers in remote areas of the country. Roles and responsibilities of the policy section should be reconsidered, further developed, and strengthened. * In order to fill gaps and decrease the high staff turnover in provincial directorates, MoE’s human resources and policy sections, in cooperation with the IARCSC, should reconsider its annual recruitment policy to quarterly or semi-annual practices. * In order to address the requests for procurement and supply of education materials such as lab materials, textbooks, tables and chairs, and stationery more efficiently – MoE’s senior management should assess and strengthen the roles and responsibilities of supply chain management departments and officials from the MoC center to provincial directorates. Furthermore education facilities at the provinces and districts should be further facilitated in this regard. * In order to enhance and improve construction and reconstruction of education facilities such as schools, MoE should further support, facilitate and strengthen the service delivery roles and responsibilities of its construction directorate, as well as planning, procurement, and provincial relations sections in this regard. * To enhance the effectiveness and the quality of education services, and measure performance in provinces and districts, the following MoE roles and responsibilities should be strengthened: M&E practices, provincial relations, quality control, human resources, and policy and planning. * For the purpose of streamlining assessment in service delivery, MoE should conduct annual retreats during which all central and provincial departments share experiences and collaborate on key performance areas, MoUs and/or service agreements to address short term and chronic challenges.   **Ministry of Higher Education:**   * In order to better understand and assign roles and responsibilities within the departments at the center and in the provinces, MoHE’s senior management should collaborate with MoJ and other related authorities to prioritize, finalize, and enforce the higher education law in the country. * Roles and responsibilities of MoHE departments in private higher education institutions require improvement in monitoring, evaluation, and quality control, and related service delivery mechanisms. |
| **Provinces** | The roles, responsibilities, and authority of provincial education directorates should be improved in areas including:   * Directorates should be provided with more procurement and financial authorities to efficiently fulfil most of their needs locally, such as supplying educational material and reconstructing or maintaining facilities. * Directorates should be provided with sufficient human resources and recruitment authority to effectively provide services. * In order to support education directorates’ services adequately and in a timely manner, the roles and responsibilities of other provincial related departments such as the governor’s office and *Mustofiat* should be further defined and strengthened. * In order to facilitate and improve the services provided by district departments of education, provincial directorates should strengthen their support through regular monitoring and evaluation, to address and provide for their needs in a timely manner. |
| **Districts** | The roles and responsibilities of district education departments should be enhanced and supported in the following areas:   * Regular and quality provision of support services to education facilities. * Regular and effective communication and coordination with provincial education directorates and district governors as and when required. * Support other education related initiatives in the districts in line with the national education law and policies. * Enhance monitoring and evaluation services in relation to the education sector in the district. |
| **Municipalities** | According to the present legislation, municipalities’ roles and responsibilities are unclear. These must be defined and clarified. Municipalities supporting the education sector within their jurisdiction should consider the following roles and responsibilities:   * Regular cooperation with provincial and district education directorates for other related services including construction or reconstruction of schools, sports clubs, and stadiums. * Initiation of municipal level functions to enhance hygiene and sanitation knowledge and practices among communities. * Support and initiate programmes and facilities for pre-primary schools, vocational and skills enhancement. |

***2. Health Care***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Ministries** | **Suggestions** |
| Ministry of Public Health (MoPH):In seeking to achieve more fully its mandated roles and responsibilities, the MoPh should consider the following suggestions to enhance performance efficiency and effectiveness and improve service delivery:   * Provide more procurement and financial authority and responsibility to provincial public health directorates, enabling them to supply most of their needs locally. * Provide major financial and planning roles, responsibilities, and authority to public health provincial directorates. * Reassess and enhance the roles and responsibilities of intra- and inter-provincial relations, planning and policy, programmes, and HMI sections of MoPH, aimed at an equitable, easily accessible, and affordable health care support system, and meeting the changing needs of the nation. * Establish a stronger resources mobilization unit in coordination and cooperation with national and international funding institutions, to provide targeted and adequate financial resources for the enhancement and improvement of health care facilities and services in the country. * Enhance the roles and responsibilities of the ministry’s M&E unit to improve service delivery and enable regular and effective M&E of the health care system and facilities, at national and provincial level. * Establish a capable performance measurement unit within MoPH that regularly coordinates with senior management to perform and provide timely assessments and measurements of employees’ performance, and accordingly inform senior management of areas for potential improvement. * Enhance and reorganize the capacities of MoPH’s policy and human resource units (in cooperation with IARCSC) to assess the availability of worthy health care service providers and professionals, and evaluate and respond to sector human resources needs, in accordance with open market policy, available resources, and free and fair competition. * Establish and support a stronger unit for public complaints in collaboration with the High Office for anti-corruption Oversight (HOO) in the capital with further offices in all of the provinces to properly receive, register, and follow complaints with regards to health care facilities, practitioners, and services. |
| **Provinces** | In addition to pursuing the roles and responsibilities assigned to provincial public health directorates, and in order to enhance and support health care service delivery mechanisms in the provinces, MoPh should consider the following suggestions:   * Provincial directorates should establish special units with specific roles and responsibilities to monitor and control imported medicine, especially at ports of entry in those provinces that border neighboring countries. * In order to enhance the quality of services provided by private and public facilities and individuals, public health directorates and their related units should further strengthen their M&E roles and responsibilities. * In order for provincial public health directorates to effectively and efficiently be able to perform their assigned roles and responsibilities, further cooperation and support is required from other provincial authorities such as provincial governors, police, municipalities, and provincial councils. * Establish provincial departments for public complaints within the structure of provincial public health directorates to properly receive, record, assess, and follow up communities’ complaints in the province. Departments need to have links to MoPH’s central office, provincial governors, and provincial councils. |
| **Districts** | * The roles and responsibilities of district health care coordinators should be further strengthened and enhanced. * Adequate employees with required skills and clearly defined roles and responsibilities should be recruited for service in district health care coordination offices. * District health care coordination offices should be further supported with adequate financial and procurement roles and authority. |
| **Municipalities** | According to the findings of the field visits, municipalities have been inefficient and ineffective in performing their legally assigned roles and responsibilities in support of health care services in the country.   * Municipalities should review and clarify the related roles and responsibilities of their departments. * Municipalities should further strengthen and support their M&E departments, and enhance their coordination and cooperation roles and responsibilities. |

***3. Rural Roads***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Ministries** | **Suggestions** |
| Besides their mandated roles and responsibilities, and with the objective of improving service delivery in rural roads, MRRD, MPW and other stakeholders of the sector should also consider the following suggestions:   * Rural access considerations are essential for various other government initiatives including agriculture, roads, trade, irrigation, and rural enterprise development**.** Advocacy for this and resource inputs are required from all related authorities. * In order to avoid duplication, overlap, miscommunication, misuse of resources, and lack of coordination between service providers, their roles and responsibilities should be clearly defined. MPW should be responsible for and invest more in district-to-province roads that carry high volumes. MRRD should invest efforts and resources and be responsible for building only village-to-village and village-to-district roads. * MRRD will need to build and maintain roads in the communities through its NSP and NABDP programmes, which should be streamlined by assigning responsibilities to one unique department or programme. Other ministries requiring rural roads, including MoE, MoPH, MAIL, and MoCN should refer their needs to MRRD. * MRRD and MPW should develop a comprehensive and long-term national rural access policy, applicable to all stakeholders and initiatives. The policy should envisage a longer-term national vision for the development of rural roads and provide more clarification on the roles and responsibilities of its stakeholders. * Both MRRD and MPW should further support their M&E sections and efforts for regular and improved rural road construction, rehabilitation, and maintenance services. Meanwhile ministries should also establish and equip specific maintenance units for regular rural road maintenance services. |
| **Provinces** | * Shorter management distances would enhance service delivery in rural road construction and rehabilitation. Management through the existing regional office is proving to be problematic. However, the roles, responsibilities and authorities of the provincial directorates should be enhanced and further supported. * Provincial offices should be given increased M&E and quality control roles and responsibilities. * Provincial rural roads offices must maintain regular and effective coordination and communication with all relevant stakeholders in the province, including the governor’s office, and provincial councils. However, the coordination roles and responsibilities of rural roads offices should be further supported and developed. |
| **Districts** | Rural Roads offices do not exist in the districts. However, in the case of related projects, planning, assessment, and implementation, the roles and responsibilities of the provincial offices should also contain provisions for regular and effective communication with the district authorities and entities such as the district governor, DDAs, and CDCs. |
| **Municipalities** | The rural roads programme office conflicts with the municipalities’ existing responsibilities for building roads in the districts. In order to avoid overlapping and duplication, the rural roads programme office should respect the boundaries of the district municipality‘s master plan and their available road building plans and resources. However, it would also be effective for them to effectively cooperate and coordinate with each other in this regard. To improve service delivery it should also be possible that they utilize each other’s resources, thereby creating synergy. |

***4. Water Supply and Sanitation***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Ministries** | **Suggestions** |
| * At national level, AUWSSC’s board (MUDA, MoEc, Kabul Municipality, and MoF) should cooperate with law enforcement authorities to recover its outstanding funds from public and private entities. * AUWSSC central office and its board members should endeavor to adequately equip its SBUs or sub-SBUs and enhance their technical and operational capacity. * AUWSSC, in cooperation with the relevant municipality sections, should enhance their capacity and efforts to develop and improve the sewage and sanitation service delivery mechanisms of urban areas. * Findings of field visits revealed that MoM, NEPA, and MoPH have inadequately performed their related service delivery roles in this sector, as required by the water legislation. The high council of water should convene to assess their performance versus their mandated responsibilities in this regard. * In order to further strengthen AUWSSC’s roles and improve its service quality, its board should also establish a public complaints and a customer services department within its structure. Public complaints departments should report directly to the board and also have SBU representation within their structure in each of the provinces. |
| **Provinces** | * Provincial directorates of MRRD need to increase their sanitation improvement programmes/projects in rural areas. * AUWSSC board member ministries and their provincial or district departments, relevant national and international organizations such as SBUs and sub-SBUs, municipalities, MRRD directorate, provincial government offices, district government offices, departments of information and culture, education, women affairs, the media, and PCs should collaborate to increase public awareness in the cities about smarter use of water resources and the proper management thereof. |
| **Districts** | In order to enhance and improve the water supply and sanitation service delivery mechanism in the district, sub-SBUs and the municipality should increase their regular communication and coordination with CDCs, DDAs, district governors, and related provincial departments |
| **Municipalities** | Municipalities and other provincial directorates of sector ministries such as telecommunication, energy, and public works in the provinces need to maintain satisfactory and regular communication and cooperation with AUWSSC SBUs or sub-SBUs. |

***5. Vital and Civil Registration***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Ministries** | **Suggestions** |
| Ministry of Interior (MoI):   * In order to function more efficiently and improve service delivery, the general directorate for civil and vital registration and foreign citizens’ affairs should be separated from the structure of MoI, and become an independent national authority. * Despite the recent establishment of the general directorate for electronic *Tazkira* (ID), MoI should maintain the present and functional general directorate for civil and vital registration and the foreign citizens’ affairs, and use the expertise of its staffs, and archives for background records and citizen identity checks. * MoI should also establish public complaints departments with adequate resources to properly receive, register, and follow up citizens’ complaints in relation to service delivery quality regarding the directorate in Kabul and the provinces. The public complaints departments should report to the senior management of MoI, general director of civil and vital registration, HOO, and in provinces to provincial governors. * The general directorate for civil and vital registration and foreign citizens’ affairs should consider civil and vital registration as the main source for vital statistics, and best practice should be applied continuously and permanently. It should be compulsory to record vital events in connection with the population of Afghanistan. * In order to detect the errors in the statistical returns from local registrars, quality and reliability of the statistical data should be carefully and regularly monitored on an on-going basis, ensuring that: * Statistical reports from the registration areas are received on a timely basis. * All provincial or district registration departments have reported their data. * Reported vital event frequencies correlate with the expected values for the same time period in recent past. * The registry and recording system should be upgraded and computerized, especially the country’s archive system. There should be a secure, common, and shared system for online and immediate registry of births and deaths across the country. * Sufficient budget, financial, and human resources should be provided to the general directorate for civil and vital registration and the foreign citizens’ affairs office. |
| **Provinces** | * All registry and recording systems in provinces and districts should be upgraded and computerized, and be connected to one central archive system of the civil and vital registry services in the country. * Sufficient budget, financial, and human resources should be provided to provincial and district offices for civil and vital registration and foreign citizens’ affairs. |
| **Districts** | * Besides their mandated roles and responsibilities, district offices for civil and vital registration should regularly communicate with CDCs, DDAs, district government authorities, municipalities, health care, education facilities, and service providers in order to support and encouraging communities to promptly report and register birth, death, marriage, displacement, migration, and divorce incidents. * District offices should be adequately supported with financial, technical, and human resources in order to enable them provide better services to citizens. |
| **Municipalities** | Municipalities should regularly support the civil and vital registration office of the district by providing timely information and statistics about birth, death, marriage, divorce, migration and displacement incidents. |

**6. Land Registration**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Ministries** | **Suggestions** |
| Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock (MAIL):   * In order to enable MAIL and ARAZI to improve the performance of their mandated roles and responsibilities in land registration and other land affairs, the last revisions and amendments made to the Law on Managing Land Affairs, and all other related and required regulations, must be finalized. * MAIL, ARAZI, and MoF need to make efforts to technically and financially support and equip ARAZI’s main and provincial departments and staff for efficient service delivery. They should invest their resources such that the provincial offices of ARAZI have their own buildings within which they will be able to properly operate. * ARAZI with the assistance of its inter-ministerial board should invest its efforts to prepare and validate a land registration law to clearly define the important issues in land registration processes such as penalty measures for illegal land occupants. |
| **Provinces** | * Provincial commissions for land affairs management – especially law enforcement authorities – should utilize the bulk of their resources to reclaim illegally occupied public or private land, and accordingly speed up land surveys and registration processes in the country. * As soon as possible, ARAZI should prioritize the transfer all land registration data from manually recorded logbooks to a centralized, safe, and secure system. |
| **Districts** | * In consideration of the economic and social importance of land issues in Afghanistan, ARAZI should assign more personnel to district offices and provide them with adequate financial and technical support. * Officers should be equipped with transportation to facilitate their work-related movements, and radios and internet facilities to maintain regular and timely communication with ARAZI’s main and provincial offices. |
| **Municipalities** | Municipalities should provide mandated land-related services established within their master plans. In the interim they should fully cooperate with ARAZI officials and staff in the districts. |

***7. Irrigation***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Ministries** | **Suggestions** |
| Ministry of Energy and Water (MEW):   * In order to decrease land loss and erosion, and provide more water for irrigation, MEW should focus on water flow control, national irrigation water needs, embankment support, and enhancing the utilization of the natural water resources provided by the *Amu Darya* River. * In order to provide required and efficient irrigation services, provincial irrigation departments should have an effective role in MAIL’s budget planning and accordingly be adequately tasked with financial resources, procurement, and human resources. * In order to better respond to irrigation needs at national level, additional and sufficient funds need to be mobilized through MEW and MAIL. * M&E activities for quality and quantity assurance of irrigation sector related services should be enhanced both in MEW and MAIL at national and provincial levels. * In order to enhance and improve irrigation systems and provide adequate and accessible water for agriculture, the roles, responsibilities, and performance of MAIL’s irrigation deputy ministry should be reviewed and adjusted accordingly. To increase the efficiency and timely supply of needs in the provinces the deputy ministry should have its own procurement, finance, and human sources sections. * Both MAIL and MEW should establish fully equipped performance measurement units. These units, in communication and coordination with their senior management in Kabul, and related provincial and district directorates and departments, should perform annual and semi-annual performance reviews of their central, provincial, and district employees. The results of these reviews should be linked to fair reward or penalty practices in the ministries. |
| **Provinces** | * Sufficient and appropriate office buildings should be built for provincial and district MAIL directorates and departments, and assurance should be made that their officials are adequately equipped with transportation and other technical means. * In order to respond to the growing needs for irrigation services, additional water resources should be developed, managed, improved, and applied across the country. |
| **Districts** | * District employees of both MEW and MAIL and their existing resources are insufficient to respond to the needs in the districts. District level offices should be adequately equipped with more professional and support personnel. * A closer cooperation should be established between the employees of MEW and MAIL. |
| **Municipalities** | * Municipalities do not have direct roles and responsibilities in the irrigation sector. However, in support of their greening role within the boundaries of their master plans they can further cooperate and coordinate with district officials for irrigation and improve water supply and management facilities. |

***8. Agricultural Extension***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Ministries** | **Suggestions** |
| Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock (MAIL):   * In order to reduce agricultural and land damage caused by the *Amu Darya* River*,* and manage its water as a core resource for agricultural development, the government including MEW and MAIL should invest funds in controlling the flow of the river and accordingly plan, assess, design, and implement more sustainable infrastructures to harness damage, while efficiently utilizing the water it provides. In addition, MAIL (in cooperation with MEW and MRRD) should invest more in improving and constructing infrastructure for irrigation development, aiming to supply adequate water for irrigation purposes. * MAIL senior management in Kabul should ensure that the provincial directorates for agriculture, irrigation, and livestock have sufficient and adequately trained employees, convenient office buildings, adequate equipment, tools and vehicles, and sufficient funds to run their operations. * MAIL has prepared and operates within the bounds of around 40 different laws, regulations, charters, guidelines, manuals, frameworks, directives, and procedures, which in most cases are not clear to its own employees in Kabul and are especially unclear to the staff providing services in the provinces and districts. MAIL, in cooperation with related government entities, should draft and process comprehensive national agriculture, irrigation, and livestock legislation, within the bounds of which the service providers at any level and related categories can easily operate. * MAIL in Kabul has a relatively large and flat type of organizational structure, which in some cases makes the flow of resources, operation processes, and service delivery complicated and inefficient. In order to save resources, MAIL should assess and restructure its organization with a focus on de-concentration, and provide adequate human resources to the provinces and districts. * In order to improve the implementation of national priorities and programmes for agricultural, irrigation and livestock services, MAIL should prepare annual plans with clear, achievable and measurable benchmarks and indicators. MAIL should also establish a comprehensive and secure information system, and maintain and update it on a regular basis. * In order to measure achievements, identify strengths and weaknesses, avoid waste of resources and provide timely preventive and corrective measures, MAIL should additionally invest in its M&E efforts and improve their mechanisms. This is especially important for the provinces and districts that are real implementation and proving grounds of the programmes and provision of related services. Thus, MAIL should take the needs and concerns of its provincial directorates into consideration. The ministry should also conduct annual retreats to discuss and assess its performance and service delivery quantity and quality and accordingly prepare itself for improvement. * In order to effectively utilize resources, reduce overlap and duplication, and avoid politicizing of projects, prioritization and selection of projects should take place according to the national agriculture, irrigation, and livestock policies, priority programmes, annual and provincial development plans, in consultation with the related sector committee of parliament, provincial and community councils, provincial and district governors, directors of economy of those provinces, and other national and provincial stakeholders. |
| **Provinces** | * In order to effectively and efficiently carry out their mandated roles and responsibilities, provincial directorates should focus more on those districts where agricultural activities take place, and invest the bulk of their resources there. * In order to improve human resources utilization, provincial directorates of MAIL should also improve and adjust their organizational structures, and accordingly provide their suggestions to the MAIL centre in Kabul. * MAIL should enhance its coordination with rural rehabilitation departments, provincial councils, and other agencies working for agricultural development in the provinces. |
| **Districts** | Officials of agriculture, irrigation, and livestock should enhance their cooperation, and related coordination efforts with CDCs, DDAs, and other district stakeholders and thus improve the effectiveness of their services. |
| **Municipalities** | Municipalities are not directly linked to MAIL in the centre and the provinces. However, MAIL provides saplings each year in the capital and the provinces or districts, and thereby supports the municipalities in greening activities. Likewise municipalities can also render their cooperation with MAIL by providing tools, equipment, and human resources as and when they are required in the provinces or the districts. |

***9. Energy***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Ministries** | **Suggestions** |
| Ministry of Energy and Water (MEW):   * In order to understand the sector’s existing service delivery capacity, and with the aim of developing the organizational structure and its resources, MEW should be further evaluated and thoroughly reviewed. * In light of this sector’s inadequate service delivery and under-expenditure of its development budget, and to achieve short-term results, MEW should employ, contract or outsource energy sector activities to competent international or regional bodies. * In an effort towards transparency and increased customer satisfaction, DABS needs to empower and equip their customer services sections more efficiently. * DABS should also establish a performance measurement unit within its structure that (in close communication with human resources at provincial and district offices) will assess and measure the performance of its other units and personnel both in Kabul and the provinces. The unit should report its findings and provide suggestions to the board of DABS, and its general director. * In order to obtain desirable results and provide better and higher quality services MEW and other energy sector related government and state organizations should practice management for results – setting indicators and measure and improve their progress accordingly by increased M&E activities. * There are a number of major and minor energy sector related projects under the assessment of MEW. Government financial institutions should offer their financial support if these projects are to be implemented to achieve timely service delivery. * For MEW to be able to effectively and efficiently play its role and accomplish its responsibilities, it should be provided with adequate financial and procurement authority in order to satisfy needs in a timely manner. * For the purpose of encouraging government employees to provide their services in the energy support sector, and thus decrease staff turnover, the remuneration scheme for professional and technical employees working in the public sector, especially those working in insecure and remote areas, should be revised so as to provide sufficient salaries and additional incentives. * In order to reduce Afghanistan’s dependence on imported electricity and energy resources over time, MEW should invest in development of efficient domestic energy resources, and establish and construct national power generation infrastructures (especially hydro power) where appropriate and cost-effective. * In order to better identify and classify the roles and responsibilities of all the public and private entities involved in energy sector services delivery, the drafted Energy Law should be finalized, issued, and enforced as soon as possible. |
| **Provinces** | * In order to improve and increase service delivery, provincial hydropower plants need to be rehabilitated where feasible and cost-effective, and additional financial and human resources devoted to such domestic electricity generation systems. * MEW should support the roles of the provincial authorities in programme and project planning and development. The ministry should further authorize its provincial or regional offices to consult the provincial council, provincial development committee, and energy sector working group members in connection with energy sector programmes and projects and consider their recommendations in this regard. * Regional and provincial offices of MEW should also increase their communication and cooperation with provincial directorates of MAIL and MRRD, especially in connection with irrigation and micro-hydropower generation facilities. |
| **Districts** | * MEW, DABS, and MRRD should improve electricity supply services to rural areas to stimulate economic development, particularly through the use of electricity for production in micro and small businesses, likewise to foster long-term stability through increased income. * In order to decrease overlapping and duplication of activities, power supply initiatives in districts and rural areas should conducted through a shared approach by all services providers. * MEW, MRRD, and DABS should consult and coordinate with DDAs, CDCs and district governors prior to any initiative. |
| **Municipalities** | Municipalities need to play a supportive role in assisting power generation and distribution institutions. Municipalities should always reveal their plans, schemes, and urban plans, programmes, projects, and technical resources with MEW, DABS and MRRD provincial and district organizations. |

***10. Disaster Management***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Ministries** | **Suggestions** |
| Afghanistan National Disaster Management Agency (ANDMA):   * A National Policy on Disaster Managementshould be developed as the basis for a long-term disaster management approach in Afghanistan. The policy would need to take a comprehensive and clear approach of linking the relief and rehabilitation activities with development, and to be appropriate to and fit in with the current dynamics in the country, respecting its physical, social, economic, and political environment. It also needs to be cross-sectoral in which all other relevant sector policies have appropriate linkages with the national disaster management system. * In order to improve and enhance its service delivery quantity and quality, ANDMA would need to increase its role in: disaster preventive measures, assessment and mitigation of the causes of disasters, and reconstruction and relief. * A national disaster information management system needs to be established which supports information sharing and collaboration between existing institutions and agencies, and has the capacity to conduct specific studies and research activities. * Key performance indicators inside national and provincial disaster management plans should be developed and accordingly monitored and reported to the National and Provincial Disaster Management Commissions. These indicators should measure the outcomes and effectiveness of the strategies, policies, and programmes, inform agency accountability and responsibility for each performance indicator, and identify opportunities for improvement leading to better disaster management outcomes. * When planning budgets, ANDMA’s provincial directorates need to be adequately consulted and assured that realistic funding exists for operation and development programmes. Furthermore, the establishment of relief stocks and supply of vehicles and equipment is needed to improve services delivery. * In order to become aware of and take corrective measures, and for the purpose of quality service delivery, ANDMA should increase its provincial monitoring visits and regularly communicate with provincial commissions for disaster management and support its provincial directorates. |
| **Provinces** | * ANDMA provincial directorates should conduct community awareness programmes and provide training to communities, in order for them to develop their own capacity to reduce vulnerability and prepare them to cope with disasters. * At provincial level, preparedness activities should be planned and decided upon by Provincial Disaster Management Commissions. These plans should provide protocols for functions at provincial level under a specific section on administrative structure and within the SOP for provincial governors. Provincial governors and commissions will be the focal authorities for disaster management functions at province and district levels. |
| **Districts** | * CDCs, DDAs, and government and security officials in the districts can play key roles as informants and associated partners in disaster management. However villages’ affairs coordination officers need to have ad-hoc as well as scheduled meetings with them and with the district commission on disaster management. * The district disaster management commission should ensure that all district communities are aware of the commission and its specific responsibilities to plan and cope with disasters as and when needed. |
| **Municipalities** | Municipalities have a number of required resources, tools, and equipment that can be of major assistance for disaster management. They are also directly connected with communities through their representatives. However, provincial directorates, provincial and district commissions, and provincial and district governors should always maintain effective communication and cooperation with the provincial and district municipalities. |

# **Conclusion**

Efforts have been made to enhance the capacity and capability of public institutions to provide essential services to citizens, including the establishment and services of the IARCSC, development of the SNGP, and initiation of the ANDS and NPPs. However, **despite these improvements, public services and capacities are still inadequate**, poor in quality, and inefficient or ineffective.

**National ministries and authorities play key roles** in Afghanistan’s centralized system of government, particularly for planning, decision-making, and service delivery. In practice, however, **most are unable to fulfill them**. This is due in part to widespread weaknesses in professional and institutional capacity. Problems of communication and coordination are particularly prevalent in the education, rural roads, land registration, water and sanitation, irrigation, and disaster management sectors. Procurement and financial management practices are considered cumbersome and difficult for most public institutions to manage effectively. Compounding these weaknesses, there are sometimes “gaps” between related laws, rendering them incomplete and ineffective, especially in higher education and land registration. Despite the inability of central institutions to respond adequately to local needs, it is unlikely the centralization of decision-making, in particular, will be relinquished in the near future.

Under current Afghan law and budgetary procedures, **provincial and district governments have little input into the budget process**. Allocations of funds to the provinces, especially for the operational budget, are determined by the central ministries; allocations from provincial funds to the districts within each province are in turn determined by the provinces. This being said, the government has started on drafting a revised provincial budgeting policy with the objective of giving more authority to the provinces. Allocation of funds for the current fiscal year do not begin until the budget has been approved by parliament, which typically occurs with some delay. In addition to this source of delay, weak capacity, and GIRoA’s cumbersome financial management and procurement regulations, execution of development budgets is hindered by uncertainties regarding the timing of disbursement of donor funds, which finance most of Afghanistan’s development spending. As a result of political pressures to include development projects in the budget regardless of the likelihood that they will be financed and implemented, the approved development budget for most ministries and sectors is usually significantly larger than the funds actually allocated for this purpose.

**At provincial and district levels**, public institutions’ performance and service quality depend on various factors including: (i) the influence and expertise of provincial and district governors; (ii) the level of coordination and cooperation between stakeholders in each sector; (iii) efficiency of sector’s respective central ministries or independent authorities; (iv) the effectiveness of their monitoring and evaluation (M&E) practices; (v) the levels of expertise of provincial and district officials; (vi) the availability of adequate financial, human and technical resources at local levels; (vii) remuneration; (viii) clarity in roles and responsibilities; (ix) the potential for inappropriate influence by powerful individuals; and above all (x) the safety and security situation.

**Municipalities** still function under outdated legislation enacted in 2000, which does not fully address the present and increasing needs for public service delivery. In addition, municipalities face shortages of professional human resources, owing mainly to low remuneration. There are also significant overlaps evident in the roles and responsibilities between municipalities and some sector ministries, particularly in water and sanitation.

In some sectors – particularly land registration, education, energy, and water supply and sanitation – there are reports of instances in which **powerful individuals inappropriately apply influence** for personal gain or community benefits, in ways that in turn decrease the overall quality, efficiency, and effectiveness of public service delivery. In some cases **provincial or district governors** may exert their authority to bypass rules and regulations regarding recruitment or termination of officials, or support certain sectors while neglecting others. Reportedly some **members of parliament and/or provincial councils** may exert power inappropriately over ministries or provincial and district public departments for personal, group, or community interests and gain. Examples of these various issues include (but are not limited to) ongoing delays in finalizing the higher education law, owing to differences of interest among powerful competing figures, and interference with land registration and enforcement.

Despite these and other difficulties, **service delivery in a handful of sectors shows improvement**, particularly in education and rural roads. Accordingly, public perception of government performance – particularly with regards to education – has improved. Some provinces show a greater improvement in service delivery in those sectors covered by this study, than others. For example, public institutions and authorities in Herat are providing considerably higher-level services across most sectors than others visited (outside of Kabul). In addition, provincial authorities in Balkh and Nangarhar have shown progress in the development of strategic plans and sector-related coordination with municipality services.

This study has suggested various **ways in which public institutions could improve the level and quality of service delivery to the public**. Notably, at national level, sector ministries and independent authorities could further enhance their external communication, coordination, and cooperation with other stakeholders and ministries. Similarly internal communication and coordination between relevant support offices – particularly finance, procurement, human resources, and provincial directorates – could be improved. In addition, central ministries should do more to ensure the timely and adequate supply of financial, technical, and human resources to their provincial directorates. To improve quality control and accountability, both central and provincial government institutions should improve and enhance their M&E practices, and establish and better support public grievance and complaints mechanisms. Moreover, provincial directorates in their respective sector working group meetings can further encourage and engage provincial councils, taking note of their members’ concerns and recommendations and seeking to address them. Finally, the roles and responsibilities of municipalities in service delivery should be re-examined, to determine whether there is scope for them to be more active in some sectors.

# References

Adam Smith International, “*Education Sector Analysis (Final Draft),” Kabul,* June 2010.

Afghanistan Research and Evaluation Unit, *“The A to Z Guide to Afghanistan Assistance (Tenth Edition),”* 2012.

Afghanistan Public Policy Research Organization (APPRO), “*Afghanistan’s Power Sector: Pipedreams or Workable Solutions?*” Policy Paper, August 2007.

Asian Development Bank, ADB Technical Assistance Report, Project Number: 43497, “*Islamic Republic of Afghanistan: Power Sector Master Plan,”* November 2010.

Baqi, Misbah Abdul, “*Higher Education in Afghanistan,”* International Islamic University, Islamabad-Pakistan, December 2009.

Da Afghanistan Breshna Sherkat, “*Brief Activities Report of Da Afghanistan Breshna Sherkat,*” 5 November 2012.

Da Afghanistan Breshna Sherkat (DABS) Website, <http://www.dabs.af/en>

Favre, Raphy, Watershed Consultant, and Golam Monowar Kamal, AIMS Field Coordinator, “*Watershed Atlas of Afghanistan* *(First Edition),”* Afghanistan Information Management System, Kabul, January 2004.

Gebremedhin, Dr. Yohannes, *“Legal Issues Pertaining to Land Titling and Registration in Afghanistan,*” USAID Afghanistan, 21 February 2006, <http://afghanistan.usaid.gov>

German Development Cooperation with Afghanistan, “*Education in Afghanistan,*” August 2011,[www.ez-afghanistan.de](http://www.ez-afghanistan.de)

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, “*Afghanistan National Development Strategy,”* 2008.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, “*Afghanistan National Development Strategy, Energy Sector Strategy, 2008-2013,*” 2008.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, “*Afghanistan National Development Strategy, Prioritization and Implementation Plan, mid 2010-mid 2013, Volume I,”* Kabul International Conference on Afghanistan, 20 July 2010.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, *“Afghanistan National Development Strategy, Water Resources Management, 2008-2013,”* 2008.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, “*Civil Servants Law*,” June 2008.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Afghanistan Land Authority (ARAZI) Website, [www.arazi.gov.af](http://www.arazi.gov.af)

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Afghanistan National Disaster Management Authority (ANDMA) Website, [www.andma.gov.af](http://www.andma.gov.af)

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Central Statistics Office, “*Estimated* *Population of Afghanistan,*” 2012-2013.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Independent Administrative Reform and Civil Service Commission (IARCSC), *“Guideline for Implementing the Public Administration Reforms at Sub national Level,”* August 2008.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Independent Directorate of Local Governance (IDLG), *“Implementation of the Sub-national Governance Policy: Progress and Prioritization,”* Draft 1.1, November 2011.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Independent Directorate of Local Governance (IDLG), “*Sub-National Governance Policy,*” Spring 2010.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock (MAIL) Website, [www.mail.gov.af](http://www.mail.gov.af)

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Economy (MoEc), “*Afghanistan Provincial Briefs,”* June 2011.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Economy (MoEc), *“Projects Implementation and Expenditure of the Development Budget of the Ministries and Authorities in the First Quarter of 1391, General Directorate for Policy, Monitoring and Evaluation of Afghanistan National Development Strategy.”*

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Economy (MoEc), General Directorate of Policy ANDS M&E, “*ANDS Annual Progress Report, 2010-2011.”*

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Education (MoE), “*Education Sector Strategy for the Afghanistan National Development Strategy with Focus on Prioritization,”* March 2007.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Education (MoE), “*Policy Guidelines for Community Based Education,”* February 2012.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Education (MoE) Website, [www.moe.gov.af](http://www.moe.gov.af)

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Energy and Water (MEW), “*Annual Progress Report,”* 2011.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Energy and Water (MEW) Website, [www.mew.gov.af](http://www.mew.gov.af)

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Finance (MoF), “*Development Cooperation Report,”* 2012.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Finance (MoF), Ministry of Public Works (MPW) and Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development (MRRD), “*Annual Report, National Rural Access Programme (NRAP)*,” 2008-2009.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Higher Education (MoHE), *“National Higher Education Strategic Plan, 2010-2014.*” 2010.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry Higher Education (MoHE) Website, [www.mohe.gov.af](http://www.mohe.gov.af)

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Justice (MoJ), “*Civil Registration Law*,” 2010.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Justice (MoJ), “*Education Law,”* 2008.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Justice (MoJ), “*Law on Managing Land Affairs*,” 31 July 2008.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Justice (MoJ), *“Public Heath Law*,” December 2009.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Justice (MoJ), “*The Constitution of Afghanistan,”* 2004.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Justice (MoJ), “*Water Law,*” April 2009.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Justice (MoJ), Official Gazette 945, “*Electricity Company Charter,”* 4May 2008.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Justice (MoJ), Official Gazette 1089, “*Law on Disaster Management*,” October 2012.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Justice (MoJ) Website, [www.moj.gov.af](http://www.moj.gov.af)

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Mines (MoM) Website, [www.mom.gov.af](http://www.mom.gov.af)

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Public Health (MoPH), *“Health Financing Policy, 2012-2020,”* 2012.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Public Health (MoPH), *“National Policy for Private Health Care Sector,”* 2010.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Public Health (MoPH), “*Strategic Plan for the Ministry of Public Health, 2011-2015,*” 2011.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Public Health (MoPH) Website, [www.moph.gov.af](http://www.moph.gov.af)

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development (MRRD), “*Afghanistan National Rural Water, Sanitation, and Hygiene (WASH) Policy,*” January 2010.

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development (MRRD) Website, [www.mrrd.gov.af](http://www.mrrd.gov.af)

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Urban Development Affairs (MUDA) Website, [www.MUDA.gov.af](http://www.moud.gov.af)

Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, National Rural Access Programme (NRAP) Website, [www.nrap.gov.af](http://www.nrap.gov.af)

Islamic Emirate of Afghanistan, Ministry of Justice, *“Municipal Law,”* 7 October 2000.

Palau, Rainer Gonzalez, “*Challenges Facing Afghanistan’s Education Sector,”* Civil Military Fusion Centre, Afghanistan Resource Desk, February 2012.

Pritchett, Lant, and Varad Pande, “*Making Primary Education Work for India’s Rural Poor: A Proposal for Effective Decentralization,”* World Bank, Social Development Papers, South Asia Series, Paper No.95, June 2006.

Rout, Bob, “*Water Management, Livestock and the Opium Economy, How the Water Flows: A Typology of Irrigation Systems in Afghanistan,***”** Afghanistan Research and Evaluation Unit Issue Paper, June 2008.

Shakir, Shakir Ullah, *“Higher Education Reform; Now and Then****:*** *The Governance and Sustainability of Higher Education in Afghanistan,”* International Conference on Mainstreaming Education for Sustainable Development in the Asia Pacific Region, September 2011.

Shurkin, Michael, “*Sub-National Government in Afghanistan,*” RAND, National Defence Research Institute, 2011, <http://www.rand.org>

Stefanie, N., “*From Dispute to Resolution: Managing Land in Afghanistan*,” Civil-Military Fusion Center, October 2011.

The Asia Foundation, *“Advancing Educational Opportunities in Afghanistan,”* October 2010,[www.asiafoundation.org](http://www.asiafoundation.org)

The Asia Foundation, “*An Assessment of Sub-National Government in Afghanistan,*” April 2007.

Transitional Islamic State of Afghanistan, Ministry of Education, “*National Report on the Development of Education in Afghanistan”,* 10 August 2004.

United Nations, “*Principles and Recommendations for a Vital Statistics System,*” New York, 2001.

United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), “*Afghanistan Annual Report 2011.*”

UNDP Afghanistan, *“Strategy for Sub-National Governance and Service Delivery for Peace,”* October 2013.

UNDP Afghanistan Website, [www.undp.org.af](http://www.undp.org.af)

USAID Afghanistan, Fact Sheet, “*Commercialization of Afghanistan Water and Sanitation Activity (CAWSA),”* December 2010, <http://afghanistan.usaid.gov>

USAID Afghanistan, Fact Sheet, “*Democracy and Governance,”* September 2012, <http://afghanistan.usaid.gov>

USAID Afghanistan, Fact Sheet, “*Economic Growth,”* May 2012, <http://afghanistan.usaid.gov>

USAID Afghanistan, Fact Sheet, “*Education,”* June 2011, <http://afghanistan.usaid.gov>

USAID Afghanistan, Fact Sheet, “*Health,”* December 2012, <http://afghanistan.usaid.gov>

USAID Afghanistan, Fact Sheet, “*Infrastructure,”* May 2012, <http://afghanistan.usaid.gov>

USAID Afghanistan, Fact Sheet, “*Support to Sub-National Governance Structure (RC East/RC South),”* June 2011, <http://afghanistan.usaid.gov>

USAID and International City/Country Management Association, “*Municipal Management Manual for Afghanistan,”* 2010, [www.umcasia.org](http://www.umcasia.org) .

Wahid, A. Ahad, Technical Deputy Mayor of Kabul *“Kabul Municipality and Issues of Kabul City,*”September 2010.

Wily, Liz Alden, “*Land and Governance at the Crossroads, A Review of Afghanistan’s Proposed New Land Management Law,***”** Afghanistan Research and Evaluation Unit, Briefing Paper Series, October 2012.

World Bank, *“Strengthening District Level Accountability and Service Delivery Outcomes in Afghanistan. Component One. Mapping of fund flows in three pilot districts - survey on perceptions of service delivery,”* Draft Analytical Report, April 2011.

World Bank and Department for International Development (DfID), “*Working Paper 5 for Afghanistan Expenditure Review, Education Sector,” 2010.*

*The views expressed in this publication are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily represent those of the United Nations, including UNDP, or the UN Member States.*

**

Stay connected!

[Description: Description: facebook](http://www.facebook.com/UNDPinAfghanistan) <http://www.facebook.com/UNDPinAfghanistan>

[Description: twitter logo](https://twitter.com/#!/undpafghan) <https://twitter.com/UNDPAf>

[http:/](http://www.gplus.to/UNDPinAfghanistan)/plus.google.com/+UndpOrgAf



[Description: Description: Youtube](http://www.youtube.com/undpafghanistan) <http://www.youtube.com/UNDPAfghanistan>

[Description: flickr logo](http://www.flickr.com/photos/undpafghanistan/)  <http://www.flickr.com/photos/UNDPAfghanistan/>

United Nations Development Programme

Jalalabad Road, UNOCA Complex

Kabul, Afghanistan

[WWW.AF.UNDP.ORG](http://WWW.AF.UNDP.ORG)

1. These objectives also apply at the national level, insofar as central government institutions facilitate sub-national governance and service delivery. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. The structure of the Afghan public sector is also discussed in great detail, in the context of budget and financial management practices, the UNDP’s Afghanistan Sub-National Governance Study Paper No. 2, *Local Budget and Treasury Processes*, July 2013. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. *Organogram of the Central Government of Afghanistan*, p. 95, A-Z, Afghanistan Research and Evaluation Unit (AREU) Publication, 2012. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Independent Directorate for Local Governance (IDLG), “*Implementation of the* *Sub-national Governance Policy: Progress and Prioritization,”* Draft 1.1, November 2011. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Independent Directorate for Local Governance (IDLG), *“Implementation of the Sub-national Governance Policy: Progress and Prioritization,”* Draft 1.1, November 2011. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Independent Administrative Reform and Civil Service Commission (IARCSC), *“Guideline for Implementing the Public Administration Reforms at Sub-national Level,”* August 2008. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. World Bank, *“Strengthening District Level Accountability and Service Delivery Outcomes in Afghanistan. Component One. Mapping of fund flows in three pilot districts - survey on perceptions of service delivery,”* Draft Analytical Report, April 2011. [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. Source : <http://www.undp.org.af/undp/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=112&Itemid=57>. [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. *Madrasa*: A school in which only Sharia sciences are taught. [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. *Modaresan*: The plural form for *Modaress* meaning teachers or lecturers in a *Madrasa*. [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Justice, *“Water Law,”* April 2009, pp.10-11 [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Justice, *“Water Law,”* April 2009. [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. *Tazkira*: National Identity Card, in Dari Language [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. *AMLAAK:* Land affairs management authority that operated under MAIL structure until September 2009. [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
15. Source: www.mail.gov.af [↑](#footnote-ref-15)
16. Source: Interviews conducted with officials in the target provinces [↑](#footnote-ref-16)
17. For example, Nangarhar Province has a Provincial Commission for Land Affairs Management. [↑](#footnote-ref-17)
18. The members of the High Council for Water are appointed by the President. [↑](#footnote-ref-18)
19. *Mirabs* are individuals who are employed by farmers and/or communities to oversee and manage the distribution of water for agricultural purposes. [↑](#footnote-ref-19)
20. Source: [www.mail.gov.af](http://www.mail.gov.af) ; Organization Structure of Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation, and Livestock. [↑](#footnote-ref-20)
21. The Afghanistan Red Cross Society (ARCS) is the Afghanistan affiliate of the International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies. [↑](#footnote-ref-21)
22. *Mustofi*: Head of treasury department or provincial department of MoF in the province. [↑](#footnote-ref-22)
23. Source: [www.andma.gov.af](http://www.andma.gov.af) [↑](#footnote-ref-23)
24. Bearing in mind the responsibilities of MoLSAMD for some aspects of technical, vocational, and special education. [↑](#footnote-ref-24)
25. USAID Afghanistan, Fact Sheet, *“Health,”* December 2012. [↑](#footnote-ref-25)
26. Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Public Health, *“Health Financing Policy, 2012-2020,”* 2012. [↑](#footnote-ref-26)
27. Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Public Health, *“National Policy for Private Health Care Sector,”* 2010. [↑](#footnote-ref-27)
28. Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Economy, “*Afghanistan Provincial Briefs*,” June 2011. [↑](#footnote-ref-28)
29. *Tazkira*: National Identity Card, in Dari Language [↑](#footnote-ref-29)
30. *Mustofiat:* A provincial department of MoF that receives, manages and distributes the government funds in and for the different sector departments active in the province. [↑](#footnote-ref-30)
31. Source: [www.arazi.gov.af](http://www.arazi.gov.af) [↑](#footnote-ref-31)
32. ARAZI is a general directorate within the structure of MAIL and provides services in land affairs management across the country. [↑](#footnote-ref-32)
33. Stefanie, N., “*From Dispute to Resolution: Managing Land in Afghanistan*,” Civil-Military Fusion Center, October 2011. [↑](#footnote-ref-33)
34. *Makhzan:* Is the source registry place of the properties placed in the provincial or national courts. [↑](#footnote-ref-34)
35. The inter-ministerial board for ARAZI consists of MAIL, MoI, MoF, MoJ, MUDA, IDLG, Afghanistan Geodesy and Cartography Authority, and High Office of Oversight for Anti-corruption. [↑](#footnote-ref-35)
36. *Karez: A*n underground canal type of traditional water supply and irrigation scheme, which makes use of shallow underground water where possible. [↑](#footnote-ref-36)
37. Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Economy, General Directorate of Policy ANDS M&E, “*ANDS Annual Progress Report, 2010-2011.”* [↑](#footnote-ref-37)
38. Source: [www.mail.gov.af](http://www.mail.gov.af) [↑](#footnote-ref-38)
39. Source: [www.dabs.af/en](http://www.dabs.af/en) and the Afghan Energy Information Center (AEIC). [↑](#footnote-ref-39)
40. Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Economy, General Directorate of Policy, ANDS M&E, “ANDS Annual Progress Report, 2010-2011.” [↑](#footnote-ref-40)
41. Da Afghanistan Breshna Sherkat, “*Brief Activities Report on Da Afghanistan Breshna Sherkat*,” 5 November 2012. [↑](#footnote-ref-41)
42. Source: [www.undp.org.af](http://www.undp.org.af) [↑](#footnote-ref-42)
43. *Mustofi:* Head of the provincial finance or treasury department assigned and supervised by MoF. [↑](#footnote-ref-43)
44. Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Economy, General Directorate of Policy, ANDS M&E, “ANDS Annual Progress Report, 2010-2011.” [↑](#footnote-ref-44)
45. Source: [www.andma.gov.af](http://www.andma.gov.af) [↑](#footnote-ref-45)