The global financial and economic crisis beginning in 2008 has highlighted and reinforced the need for effective social protection mechanisms that prevent households from falling into poverty in times of economic hardship while also being sustainable, thus helping families to improve their earnings permanently. Meanwhile, it is widely recognized that social protection policies must be consistent with labour market mechanisms and with employment policy in order for either or both to be as beneficial as possible. This volume, using a broad definition of social protection, takes an in-depth look at selected programs and their interaction with employment generation and growth in six diverse countries: India, Kenya, Malawi, Mexico, Peru and Tajikistan, focusing on the impact on poverty and vulnerability of the poor and consistency or lack thereof with other growth and pro-poor policies. It thus aims to contribute to understanding how social and economic policies can be better integrated to simultaneously advance social welfare, employment outcomes and inclusive growth.
Social Protection, Growth and Employment

Evidence from India, Kenya, Malawi, Mexico and Tajikistan

May 2013
First published by the United Nations Development Programme in the USA in 2013.


All Right reserved

ISBN:    9-789211-263633

Cover design by Saswata Alexander Majumder

Cover Image by Bengy/Shutterstock

For a list of publications please contact:

United Nations Development Programme
Bureau for Development Policy
One United Nations Plaza
New York, NY 10017, USA
Tel: +1 212 906 5081
Email: poverty.reduction@undp.org
website: www.undp.org/poverty

Disclaimer

The views expressed in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of the institutions to which they are affiliated or the United Nations or their Member States, including UNDP.
We live in times that seem to be defined by shocks and vulnerabilities, and these shocks and vulnerabilities have the potential to slow down, or even reverse, achievements in human development. The recent global economic downturn has already had some negative effects on human development indicators, for example. In recent decades, there has been a renewed interest in social protection policies as a way to help households cope with the negative effects of economic policies. Many countries have adopted cash transfer programmes, for example, as a way to support the income of poor households and encourage them to invest more in developing human capital through education and health. While evaluations of these programmes show measurable improvements in some human development indicators such as school attendance and health status, less is known about their sustained effects on poverty reduction and inclusive growth. This sustained effect can be potentiated if the positive effects on education and health, for instance, are accompanied by a better possibility of beneficiaries to insert themselves productively in the labour market and the local economy.

Employment is a key strategy for sustainable poverty reduction and promotion of inclusive growth. However, economic growth, even when rapid, has not always created jobs, particularly jobs for the poor. Furthermore, in the present global context, growth has slowed down and employment has suffered as well. Even when growth recovers, the need for innovation and re-reorganization of production and service delivery in order to reduce costs might well mean a weaker demand for labour. Less rapid growth and lower employment intensity of growth will make inclusive growth and progress in human development more difficult. In addition to this, the quality of the jobs created also matters in terms of human development outcomes. Insecure, unstable and unprotected employment has limited potential to have a lasting effect on poverty reduction. In this sense, a closer linkage of employment policies with social protection policies and programmes can also promote greater resilience both at the level of the household, but also the economy as a whole.

Both employment and social protection thus are keys to inclusive growth, sustained poverty reduction and improvement in human development. However, establishing the linkages between them so as to potentiate the positive effects of employment and social protection remains an area where much needs to be learned.

The present volume addresses this question by looking at evidence from six country case studies to assess how to enhance the employment impact of social protection programmes by improving the consistency of objectives between them and the macro, sectoral and territorial policies adopted by countries. These studies look at a range of social programmes to assess their potential and limitations for supporting more inclusive growth and for sustained poverty reduction. They also focus on design and implementation questions as well as their links with other social and macroeconomic policies. This publication offers valuable insights into these issues and highlights key policy considerations for policy makers. It also offers an important
contribution to the discussion on how to think about the linkages, which requires further research and work.

I hope that the present volume would be useful to academics, researches, policy-makers and broader development practitioners.

Selim Jahan
Poverty Practice Director
Bureau for Development Policy
United Nations Development Programme
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Foreword</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boxes, Figures and Tables</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Acronyms and abbreviations</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Contributors</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Growth, Employment, Poverty and Social Protection: A conceptual framework</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Albert Berry</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Social Protection and Labour Markets in Malawi: the Centrality of Agriculture</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Andrew Charman</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Janina Leon</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Challenges of transition economies: Economic reforms, emigration and employment in Tajikistan</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Omair Amir and Albert Berry</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Labour, Income and Social Programmes in Contemporary Mexico</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Carlos Salas</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Guaranteeing Jobs for the Rural Poor: An Assessment of India’s MGNREGA public works programme</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Eduardo Zepeda, Diana Alarcon, Scott McDonald, Chandan Sapkota, Manoj Panda, and Ganesh Kumar</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. The Youth Employment Challenge: The insertion of Kenya’s youth into formal and informal jobs</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Eduardo Zepeda, Fatou Leigh, Lydia Ndirangu and Jacob Omolo</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Policy, Institutional and Methodological lessons from six country studies</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Albert Berry</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
BOXES, FIGURES AND TABLES

BOXES
Box 3.1: The new Humala government and its social policy agenda—a quick glance  130
Box 3.2: The new Humala government and proposals for microenterprises and MFIs— a quick glance

FIGURES
Figure 2.1: Population Age Structure, 2008  44
Figure 2.2: Maize Production, Disaggregated by Variety, 1987–2010  73
Figure 2.3: Burley Production and Yield, 1987–2010  76
Figure 2.4: Cassava and Sweet Potato Production, 1987–2010  78
Figure 4.1: FAO Food Price Index in Real Terms, 1961–2010  172
Figure 4.2: Food Price Trends in Tajikistan and Globally, 2007–2010  173
Figure 4.3: Trends in Remittances, 2008–2011  173
Figure 4.4: Productivity of Land by Farm Type, 1991–2006  179
Figure 4.5: Cropping Pattern in Household Plots and Dehkan Farms (DF), 2007–2008  179
Figure 5.1: Female Labour Force Participation Rates, by Age, 1995 and 2010  207
Figure 5.2: Open Unemployment Rate, 2000–2011  208
Figure 7.1: Population Trends by Age Group and Area of Residence, 1955–2100  259
Figure 7.2: Youth and Adult Unemployment Rates, 2005/06  260
Figure 7.3: Activity Choices of the Working-age Population 2005/06  260
Figure 7.4: Youth Unemployment Rates and Activity Choice by Area, 2005/06  262
Figure 7.5: Youth Unemployment Rates and Activity Choice by Gender, 2005/06  263
Figure 7.6: Youth Unemployment Rates and Activity Choice by Educational Attainment, 2005/06  264
Figure 7.7: Youth Unemployment Rates and Activity Choice by Gender, Area of Residence and Age, 2005/06  265
Figure 7.8: Unemployment Rate by Gender, Type of Area of Residence and Education, 2005/06  266
Figure 7.9: Employment and Unemployment by Age, Type of Area of Residence, Gender and Education, 2005/06  267
Figure 7.10: Wage Variation by Age in Rural and Urban Areas, 2005/06  270
Figure 7.11: Wages by Type of Employer and Location, 2005/06  270
Figure 7.12: Wages by Gender, 2005/06  271
Figure 7.13: Wages by Type of Employment for Young People and Adults by Gender, 2005/06  272
Figure 7.14: Wages by Education, Age and Type of Work, 2005/06  272
Figure 7.15: Number of Young People Employed in KKV Public Works by Ministry  277
TABLES

Table 1.1: Different Types of Provision of Direct Social Protection against Emergencies

Table 1.2: Links between Social Protection Components and Employment, and Relations to Motors of Pro-poor Growth

Table 1.3: Key Considerations around Selected Social Protection Policies

Table 1.A1: Asian Development Bank’s Components and Subcomponents of Social Protection

Table 2.1: Indicative Features of Poverty

Table 2.2: Proportion of Households That Own Selected Assets, 2004 vs. 2008

Table 2.3: Proportion of Households Affected by Severe Shocks, c. 2004

Table 2.4: Timeline of Key Institutional Actions for Social Protection

Table 2.5: Social Protection Interventions, Estimated Beneficiaries and Accumulated Costs, c. 1994–2010

Table 2.7: Cost–Benefit Comparative Analysis: Starter Pack, AISP and Food Aid

Table 2.8: Maize and Tobacco Labour Input

Table 2.9: Distribution of Benefit from Productivity Enhancement Measures

Table 3.1: Government, Social and Basic Social Expenditure, 1999–2010

Table 3.2: Total Government Expenditure and Social Expenditure, 1999–2010

Table 3.3: Basic Social Expenditures by Type of Expenditure, 1999–2010

Table 3.4: Head of Household by Social Programme and Characteristics, 2000, 2005 and 2009

Table 4.1: Sources of Cash Income, Tajikistani Households, 2006

Table 4.2: Estimates of the Share of Individual and Corporate Sector in Land, Based on Data from Goskomstat and the State Agency for Surveying, Cartography and Land Use, 2006

Table 5.1: Macroeconomic Data on Mexico, 1980–2011

Table 5.2: Poverty Data for Mexico, 1984–2010

Table 5.3: Latin America’s Loss of Market Share in the USA to China, 1996–2009

Table 5.4: Labour Force Participation Rates, by Gender, 1995–2010, 2nd quarter

Table 5.5: Increases in Employment, by Size of Establishment, 2006–2010, 2nd quarter

Table 5.6: Percentage of Employment by Job Position, by Economic Sector, 1995 and 2010, 2nd quarter

Table 5.7: Employment by Economic Sector, by Size of Establishment and by Whether Paid or Not, 2010, 2nd quarter

Table 5.8: Percentage of Paid Workers with Social Security Benefits, by Economic Sector, 2010, 2nd quarter

Table 5.9: Percentage of Paid Workers with Labour Benefits, by Economic Sector, 2010, 2nd quarter
LIST OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

AAH  Action Against Hunger
ADB  Asian Development Bank
ADMAC  Agricultural Development and Marketing Corporation
AISP  Agricultural Inputs Subsidy Programme
ALDSAP  Agricultural and Livestock Development Strategy and Action Plan
ATU  A trabajar urbano
CCT  Conditional cash transfer
CIS  Commonwealth of Independent States
DEVPOL  Development Policies
DFID  Department For International Development (UK)
ENAHO  National Survey of Households
ENAMIN  National Survey of Microenterprises
ENE  National Employment Survey
ENOE  National Survey of Occupation and Employment
EU  European Union
FDI  Foreign Direct Investment
FFW  Food for work
Fondo PyME  Small and Medium Sized Enterprises Fund
GDP  Gross domestic product
GNI  Gross national income
GoM  Government of Malawi
IDB  Inter-American Development Bank
IHS  Integrated Household Survey
ILO  International Labour Organization
IMF  International Monetary Fund
IMSS  Mexican Social Security Institute
INEGI  National Institute of Statistics and Geography
INGO  International Non-Governmental Organizations
ISSSTE  Institute for Social Security and Services for State Workers
K  Phosphorous
KIHBS  Kenya Integrated Household Budget Survey
KKV  Kazi Kwa Vijana
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PVD</td>
<td>Provias Descentralizado</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PVN</td>
<td>Provias Nacional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PWP</td>
<td>Public works programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S</td>
<td>Sulphur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SACA</td>
<td>Smallholder Agricultural Credit Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAL</td>
<td>Structural Adjustment Loans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAM</td>
<td>Social Accounting Matrix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Scheduled castes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SFFRFM</td>
<td>Smallholder Farmers Fertiliser Revolving Fund Mechanism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIS</td>
<td>Sistema Integral de Salud (Integrated Health System)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SME</td>
<td>Small and medium-sized enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SpyME</td>
<td>Sub-ministry for Small and Medium-sized Enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SSR</td>
<td>Soviet Socialist Republic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STPS</td>
<td>Ministry of Labour and Social Provision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STs</td>
<td>Scheduled tribes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TIP</td>
<td>Targeted Inputs Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TJS</td>
<td>Tajikistani Somoni (currency)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TSC</td>
<td>Teachers Service Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UDF</td>
<td>United Democratic Front</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USAID</td>
<td>United States Agency for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WFP</td>
<td>World Food Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WMS</td>
<td>Welfare Monitoring Survey</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Diana Alarcón is Senior Economic Affairs Officer at the Development Policy and Analysis Division of the U.N. Dept. of Economic and Social Affairs. Formerly Leader of the Inclusive Development Cluster.

Omair Amir is an Independent Researcher with a focus on Central and South Asia. Previously he was Research Assistant at the Department of Economics at the University of Toronto.

Albert Berry is Professor in the Department of Economics at the University of Toronto.

Andrew Charman is the Director of the Sustainable Livelihoods Foundation in South Africa.

Ganesh Kumar is Professor at the Indira Gandhi Institute of Development Research, Mumbai, India.

Fatou Leigh is Economic Advisor in UNDP Kenya.

Janina V. Leon, Ph.D. is Professor in the Department of Economics at the Pontificia Universidad Catolica del Peru.

Scott McDonald is Professor of Economics in the Department of Accounting, Finance and Economics at Oxford Brookes University, United Kingdom.

Lydia Ndirangu, Ph.D. is Assistant Director of the Research Centre at the Kenya School of Monetary Studies, Kenya.

Jacob Omolo, Ph.D. is Lecturer at the Kenyatta University, Kenya.

Manoj Panda is director of the Institute of Economic Growth, New Delhi, India. He was previously director of the Center for Economic and Social Studies, Hyderabad and Professor at the Indiar Gandhi Institute of Development Research, Mumbai.

Carlos Salas-Páez is Professor at CESIT-Instituto de Economía of UNICAMP, Brazil.

Chandan Sapkota is Economics Officer at the Asian Development Bank, Nepal Resident Mission. He was a junior fellow at the Carnegie Endowment for International Peace from 2009 to 2010.

Eduardo Zepeda is Inter-regional Policy Coordinator of the Development Policy and Analysis Division of the U.N. Dept. of Economic and Social Affairs. He was previously Senior Policy Advisor in the Poverty Practice of the Bureau for Development Policy of the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and Senior Associate in the Trade Equity and Development Program at the Carnegie Endowment for International Peace.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work would not have been possible without the leadership—both at the intellectual and management levels—of Selim Jahan, Director of the Poverty Practice of UNDP. His conceptual contributions and unfaltering support for this work led to the successful conclusion of a product based on sound research and analysis that can contribute to the policy debate about the linkages between social and economic policies.

Professor Albert Berry provided the conceptual backbone of the project and coordinated the preparation of the case studies that are the heart of this volume. Dr. Berry was responsible for the development of the conceptual framework and the overview chapter. Beyond that, he acted as content editor of all country studies and in many cases was actively involved with authors in the preparation of chapters, making sure all parts effectively contributed to the whole.

The project was launched by Diana Alarcón during her tenure as Leader of the Inclusive Development Cluster in the Poverty Practice. Her solid knowledge of the field of development economics and policy, effective management and indefatigable energy took this work from an idea to a viable research initiative. Eduardo Zepeda also had a key leadership role in the development of this project contributing substantively, not only to his own chapters, but to the overall arguments and evidence presented in the volume.

In addition to managing the day-to-day activities of the project, Claudia Vinay also contributed substantively throughout the process. Her work could not have been possible, though, without the steadfast support of Mareike Eberz who became involved in the latter stages of the project. She provided able research support to finalize chapters and efficiently and cheerfully managed the complicated peer review process and a myriad other details. Almudena Fernández stepped in to help when the need arose to make sure that the process moved along—this on top of her other responsibilities. Eliane D’Pierre was the cornerstone on the operational side, efficiently managing contracts, payments, procurements, planning events, communications and travel needs. A note of thanks goes also to Anuradha Seth, Team Leader of the Inclusive Green Growth Team of the Poverty Practice, who patiently supported the team’s involvement in this work at the tail end when the small details seemed never-ending.

Special thanks, of course, go to all authors of the background studies, which served as a basis for the preparation of the country chapters in this publication. They are: Omair Amir, Andrew Charman, Janina León and Carlos Salas. For the India chapter, the collaboration with the Carnegie Endowment for International Peace was instrumental and facilitated the participation of Ganesh Kumar, Scott McDonald, Manoj Panda, and Chandan Sapkota. For the Kenya chapter, special thanks go to the UNDP Kenya Country Office and Regional Bureau for Africa, in particular to Fatou Leigh for her contributions on both the substantive and coordination sides. Lydia Ndirangu and Jacob Omolo were also co-authors for the Kenya study and Moses Mathu provided research support.
Thanks also to all the peer reviewers both from within UNDP as well as from external institutions and to all the participants in the March 2011 technical meeting. They include: Tuya Altangerel (UNDP), Rosemary Atieno (University of Nairobi), Babken Babajanian (Overseas Development Institute), Cesar Patricio Bouillon (Inter-American Development Bank), Mariana Campos (Independent Consultant), Griet Cattaert (International Labour Organization), Mohamed Chemingui (Independent consultant), Ricardo Fuentes (OXFAM), Alan Gelb (Center for Global Development), Degol Hailu (UNDP), Radhika Lal (UNDP), the late Sebastian Levine (UNDP), Sheila Marnie (UNDP), Paola Pereznieto (Overseas Development Institute), George Perkovich (Carnegie Endowment for International Peace), Carola Pessino (Centre for Global Development), Robert Pollin (University of Massachusetts, Amherst) and, Fabio Veras Soares (UNDP).

Lance Garmer copy-edited the Malawi case study and Yurik Sandino copy-edited a first version of the Kenya study. Jon Stacey of the Write Effect was in charge of copy-editing the rest of the chapters and of ensuring overall consistency of the text.

Shams Banihani provided detailed quality assurance of the product and efficiently managed the final stages of the publication. Alex Majumder took care of the design and layout.