Conflict Management through State Reform: Federalism in Pakistan
Asma Faiz

PRESENTATION AT
INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON PARTICIPATORY FEDERALISM AND DECENTRALIZATION: FROM FRAMEWORK TO FUNCTIONALITY
SEPTEMBER 27, 2013
Pakistan: A Divided Society

- Escalating internal conflict
- Institution-building in the face of demographic disparities
- Federalism and question of regime type
- Challenges of constraining the majority of the largest federating unit
- Building federalism: Cause and effect of ethnic conflict
Institutional design, conflict management and federalism

- Federalism-- a fuzzy concept?
- Forty-four adjectives preceding the term federalism (Davis)
- Does federalism exist and does it matter? (Riker)
- Formal sharing or division of authority among two or more levels of government (Riker)
- Enhancing democratic participation and accountability
- Improving public policy and governance
- Accommodating ethno-linguistic groups in diverse societies
Dimensions of federalism

- State-building through homogenization
- Varieties of the federal system:
  - i) extent of power distribution;
  - ii) size and numbers of federating units;
  - iii) majoritarian vs. consensual electoral systems
- Federalism as a “delegatory anti-majoritarian mechanism (Weaver)
- The contribution of regional and ethnic political parties (Amoretti and Bermeo)
Federalism and ethnicity-I

- Federalism and management of ethnic conflict
- The “peace-preserving” potential of federal institutions (Bermeo)
- Federal regimes: better equipped to respond to ethnic insurgencies, separatist challenges and demands for minority rights (Bermeo)
- Federal institutions: response to ethnic security dilemmas faced by groups in divided societies (Lake and Rothchild)
Federalism and ethnicity-II

- Does federalism exacerbate ethnic conflict?
- Regional governments as agents and arenas of sub-national mobilization (Nordlinger)
- Establishment of regional governments: the way for creation of “parallel states” (Eaton)
- Presence of a territorial unit in convergence with ethnic identity: the desire for separatism (Hale)
- Ethno-federal institutions hinder the development of national/federal identity (Roeder)
Federalism in Pakistan

- Tracing federalism in a divide society: A case study of Pakistan
- The Government of India Act 1935 and provincial autonomy
- The Lahore Resolution 1940: Pledge to establish "independent and autonomous states in Muslim majority areas"
- Divergent interpretations of the Lahore Resolution
Dilemmas of state-formation: Quasi-federalism vs. substantive centralism

- Religion instead of language as a marker of identity for the state
- Pursuit of inter-wing parity in the face of Bengali majority
- The One-Unit scheme as the federalizing formula (1956 and 1962 Constitutions)
- Rejection of One-Unit by ethnic groups across Pakistan
Federalism: The second phase

- Post-conflict state-building— the 1973 Constitution
- Establishment of a bi-cameral legislature— the imbalance of power between two houses of parliament
- Senate – the territorial chamber: limited decision-making powers
- Dismissal of federal governments by military and civilian presidents
- The emergence of Muhajir ethnic identity
- The perceived Punjabization of Pakistani state
- Deepening grievances of ethnic groups
- The weakness of federal parties
Federalism: The third phase-I

- Reforming the State: The 18th Amendment
- Removal of the Concurrent List
- Devolution of 17 ministries (40 subjects) to provinces
- Enhanced powers of the Council for Common Interest (CCI)
- The 7th National Finance Commission (NFC) award streamlined (2009)
Federalism: The third phase-II

- Revisiting the population-resource principle for NFC Award
- Sharing and distribution of natural energy resources
- Water disputes: prior consent of the provincial government for construction of hydro-electric projects
- Re-naming North Western Frontier Province (NWFP) to Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK)
- Financial and political responses to the Baloch grievances
Responses to the 18th Amendment

- Reactions from secondary ethnic minorities: Demands for establishment of new Provinces
  - i) Hazara in KPK
  - ii) Seraikis in Punjab
  - iii) Muhajirs in Sind
- Federalism and the “core ethnic region” in Pakistan
The 18\textsuperscript{th} Amendment: Challenges and problems of implementation

- The Implementation Commission (IC) and road to devolution
- Revival of devolved ministries under different titles by the federal government
- Capacity-building at the provincial level
- Education: Overcoming disparities; a universal standard of education across provinces
- Health: Revisiting employee service structures; continued intervention of federal government in vertical programs
Conflict management after the 18th Amendment

- The question of timing:
  - i) Delayed introduction of reforms
  - ii) Failure in implementation (e.g. Balochistan)
- Emergence of new grievances
- Strengthening ethnic identities (?)
- Managing or exacerbating conflict (?)
Thank You