



*Empowered lives.
Resilient nations.*

Social protection, growth and employment

**Evidence from India, Kenya, Malawi, Mexico,
Peru and Tajikistan**



*Empowered lives.
Resilient nations.*

Social Protection, Growth and Employment

**Evidence from India, Kenya,
Malawi, Mexico and Tajikistan**

May 2013

First published by the United Nations Development Programme in the USA in 2013.

Copyright © United Nations Development Programme, 2013.

All Right reserved

ISBN: 9-789211-263633

Cover design by Saswata Alexander Majumder

Cover Image by Bengy/Shutterstock

For a list of publications please contact:

United Nations Development Programme

Bureau for Development Policy

One United Nations Plaza

New York, NY 10017, USA

Tel: +1 212 906 5081

Email: poverty.reduction@undp.org

website: www.undp.org/poverty

Disclaimer

The views expressed in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of the institutions to which they are affiliated or the United Nations or their Member States, including UNDP.

FOREWORD

We live in times that seem to be defined by shocks and vulnerabilities, and these shocks and vulnerabilities have the potential to slow down, or even reverse, achievements in human development. The recent global economic downturn has already had some negative effects on human development indicators, for example. In recent decades, there has been a renewed interest in social protection policies as a way to help households cope with the negative effects of economic policies. Many countries have adopted cash transfer programmes, for example, as a way to support the income of poor households and encourage them to invest more in developing human capital through education and health. While evaluations of these programmes show measurable improvements in some human development indicators such as school attendance and health status, less is known about their sustained effects on poverty reduction and inclusive growth. This sustained effect can be potentiated if the positive effects on education and health, for instance, are accompanied by a better possibility of beneficiaries to insert themselves productively in the labour market and the local economy.

Employment is a key strategy for sustainable poverty reduction and promotion of inclusive growth. However, economic growth, even when rapid, has not always created jobs, particularly jobs for the poor. Furthermore, in the present global context, growth has slowed down and employment has suffered as well. Even when growth recovers, the need for innovation and re-organization of production and service delivery in order to reduce costs might well mean a weaker demand for labour. Less rapid growth and lower employment intensity of growth will make inclusive growth and progress in human development more difficult. In addition to this, the quality of the jobs created also matters in terms of human development outcomes. Insecure, unstable and unprotected employment has limited potential to have a lasting effect on poverty reduction. In this sense, a closer linkage of employment policies with social protection policies and programmes can also promote greater resilience both at the level of the household, but also the economy as a whole.

Both employment and social protection thus are keys to inclusive growth, sustained poverty reduction and improvement in human development. However, establishing the linkages between them so as to potentiate the positive effects of employment and social protection remains an area where much needs to be learned.

The present volume addresses this question by looking at evidence from six country case studies to assess how to enhance the employment impact of social protection programmes by improving the consistency of objectives between them and the macro, sectoral and territorial policies adopted by countries. These studies look at a range of social programmes to assess their potential and limitations for supporting more inclusive growth and for sustained poverty reduction. They also focus on design and implementation questions as well as their links with other social and macroeconomic policies. This publication offers valuable insights into these issues and highlights key policy considerations for policy makers. It also offers an important

contribution to the discussion on how to think about the linkages, which requires further research and work.

I hope that the present volume would be useful to academics, researches, policy-makers and broader development practitioners.

A handwritten signature in black ink, reading "Selim Jahan". The script is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Selim" and last name "Jahan" clearly distinguishable.

Selim Jahan
Poverty Practice Director
Bureau for Development Policy
United Nations Development Programme

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword	iii
Boxes, Figures and Tables	vi
List of Acronyms and abbreviations	ix
List of Contributors	xii
Acknowledgements	xiii
1. Growth, Employment, Poverty and Social Protection: A conceptual framework <i>Albert Berry</i>	1
2. Social Protection and Labour Markets in Malawi: the Centrality of Agriculture <i>Andrew Charman</i>	41
3. Addressing Transitory and Chronic Poverty: Social Policies in Peru 1990–2010 <i>Janina Leon</i>	99
4. Challenges of transition economies: Economic reforms, emigration and employment in Tajikistan <i>Omair Amir and Albert Berry</i>	157
5. Labour, Income and Social Programmes in Contemporary Mexico <i>Carlos Salas</i>	201
6. Guaranteeing Jobs for the Rural Poor: An Assessment of India's MGNREGA public works programme <i>Eduardo Zepeda, Diana Alarcon, Scott McDonald, Chandan Sapkota, Manoj Panda, and Ganesh Kumar</i>	235
7. The Youth Employment Challenge: The insertion of Kenya's youth into formal and informal jobs <i>Eduardo Zepeda, Fatou Leigh, Lydia Ndirangu and Jacob Omolo</i>	257
8. Policy, Institutional and Methodological lessons from six country studies <i>Albert Berry</i>	287

BOXES, FIGURES AND TABLES

BOXES

Box 3.1: The new Humala government and its social policy agenda—a quick glance	130
Box 3.2: The new Humala government and proposals for microenterprises and MFIs— a quick glance	135

FIGURES

Figure 2.1: Population Age Structure, 2008	44
Figure 2.2: Maize Production, Disaggregated by Variety, 1987–2010	73
Figure 2.3: Burley Production and Yield, 1987–2010	76
Figure 2.4: Cassava and Sweet Potato Production, 1987–2010	78
Figure 4.1: FAO Food Price Index in Real Terms, 1961–2010	172
Figure 4.2: Food Price Trends in Tajikistan and Globally, 2007–2010	173
Figure 4.3: Trends in Remittances, 2008–2011	173
Figure 4.4: Productivity of Land by Farm Type, 1991–2006	179
Figure 4.5: Cropping Pattern in Household Plots and Dehkan Farms (DF), 2007–2008	179
Figure 5.1: Female Labour Force Participation Rates, by Age, 1995 and 2010	207
Figure 5.2: Open Unemployment Rate, 2000–2011	208
Figure 7.1: Population Trends by Age Group and Area of Residence, 1955–2100	259
Figure 7.2: Youth and Adult Unemployment Rates, 2005/06	260
Figure 7.3: Activity Choices of the Working-age Population 2005/06	260
Figure 7.4: Youth Unemployment Rates and Activity Choice by Area, 2005/06	262
Figure 7.5: Youth Unemployment Rates and Activity Choice by Gender, 2005/06	263
Figure 7.6: Youth Unemployment Rates and Activity Choice by Educational Attainment, 2005/06	264
Figure 7.7: Youth Unemployment Rates and Activity Choice by Gender, Area of Residence and Age, 2005/06	265
Figure 7.8: Unemployment Rate by Gender, Type of Area of Residence and Education, 2005/06	266
Figure 7.9: Employment and Unemployment by Age, Type of Area of Residence, Gender and Education, 2005/06	267
Figure 7.10: Wage Variation by Age in Rural and Urban Areas, 2005/06	270
Figure 7.11: Wages by Type of Employer and Location, 2005 /06	270
Figure 7.12: Wages by Gender, 2005/06	271
Figure 7.13: Wages by Type of Employment for Young People and Adults by Gender, 2005/06	272
Figure 7.14: Wages by Education, Age and Type of Work, 2005/06	272
Figure 7.15: Number of Young People Employed in KKV Public Works by Ministry	277

TABLES

Table 1.1: Different Types of Provision of Direct Social Protection against Emergencies	7
Table 1.2: Links between Social Protection Components and Employment, and Relations to Motors of Pro-poor Growth	17
Table 1.3: Key Considerations around Selected Social Protection Policies	20
Table 1.A1: Asian Development Bank's Components and Subcomponents of Social Protection	33
Table 2.1: Indicative Features of Poverty	51
Table 2.2: Proportion of Households That Own Selected Assets, 2004 vs. 2008	52
Table 2.3: Proportion of Households Affected by Severe Shocks, c. 2004	54
Table 2.4: Timeline of Key Institutional Actions for Social Protection	56
Table 2.5: Social Protection Interventions, Estimated Beneficiaries and Accumulated Costs, c. 1994–2010	63
Table 2.7: Cost–Benefit Comparative Analysis: Starter Pack, AISP and Food Aid	81
Table 2.8: Maize and Tobacco Labour Input	84
Table 2.9: Distribution of Benefit from Productivity Enhancement Measures	87
Table 3.1: Government, Social and Basic Social Expenditure, 1999–2010	109
Table 3.2: Total Government Expenditure and Social Expenditure, 1999–2010	110
Table 3.3: Basic Social Expenditures by Type of Expenditure, 1999–2010	110
Table 3.4: Head of Household by Social Programme and Characteristics, 2000, 2005 and 2009	112
Table 4.1: Sources of Cash Income, Tajikistani Households, 2006	169
Table 2.6: Maize Fertilizer Consumption, 1996–2007	74
Table 4.2: Estimates of the Share of Individual and Corporate Sector in Land, Based on Data from Goskomstat and the State Agency for Surveying, Cartography and Land Use, 2006	178
Table 5.1: Macroeconomic Data on Mexico, 1980–2011	202
Table 5.2: Poverty Data for Mexico, 1984–2010	203
Table 5.3: Latin America's Loss of Market Share in the USA to China, 1996–2009	206
Table 5.4: Labour Force Participation Rates, by Gender, 1995–2010, 2nd quarter	207
Table 5.5: Increases in Employment, by Size of Establishment, 2006–2010, 2nd quarter	209
Table 5.6: Percentage of Employment by Job Position, by Economic Sector, 1995 and 2010, 2nd quarter	211
Table 5.7: Employment by Economic Sector, by Size of Establishment and by Whether Paid or Not, 2010, 2nd quarter	212
Table 5.8: Percentage of Paid Workers with Social Security Benefits, by Economic Sector, 2010, 2nd quarter	213
Table 5.9: Percentage of Paid Workers with Labour Benefits, by Economic Sector, 2010, 2nd quarter	213

Table 5.10: Percentage of Paid Workers with Labour Benefits, by Type of Labour Contract, 2010, 2nd quarter	214
Table 5.11: Contractual Arrangement of Paid Workers, by Economic Sector and Size of Establishment, 2010, 2nd quarter	215
Table 5.12: Average Monthly Labour Income by Economic Sector, Size of Establishment and Job Position, 2010, 2nd quarter	217
Table 5.13: Number of Microbusinesses by Whether the Owner Hires Paid Workers and by Number of Workers, 2008	219
Table 5.14: Main Reasons for Beginning a Small Business, 2008	220
Table 5.15: Microbusinesses, by Economic Activity, by Presence of Paid Workers or not, and by Age, 2008	220
Table 5.16: Main Problems Reported by Microenterprises, by Availability of Fixed Location for Business, 2008	221
Table 5.17: Type of Registration with an Institution by Microenterprises, 2008	222
Table 5.18: Trade Union Membership by Type and by Type of Microenterprise, 2008	222
Table 5.19: Access to Health Services, by Type of Microenterprise and Type of Health Service, 2008	223
Table 5.20: Flows between Employment, Unemployment and Economic Activity, 2010, 2nd and 3rd quarters	224
Table 5.21: Distribution of Employed Persons by Size of Establishment, 2010, 2nd and 3rd quarter	224
Table 5.22: Support Programmes for Micro-units, Known of and Used, 2008	225
Table 5.23: Access to Community Health Insurance, by Whether Employed or Not and, for Those Employed, by Decile of Per Capita Family Income, 2010, 2nd quarter	226
Table 5.24: Coverage of the Employment Support Programme (PAE), 2003–2010	227
Table 6.1: NREGA's Job Creation and Household Coverage, 2006–2011	242
Table 6.2: Share in the Total Number of Person-days Worked on NREGA Projects by Women, SCs and STs, 2006/07–2011/12	242
Table 6.3: Distribution of NREGA Works by Project, 2006/07 and 2011/12	243
Table 6.4: Central Government Expenditures on NREGA Programmes, 2006/7–2011/12	244
Table 7.1: Typology of Kenya's Employment Creation Interventions, 1963–2011	275

LIST OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

AAH	Action Against Hunger
ADB	Asian Development Bank
ADMARC	Agricultural Development and Marketing Corporation
AISP	Agricultural Inputs Subsidy Programme
ALDSAP	Agricultural and Livestock Development Strategy and Action Plan
ATU	A trabajar urbano
CCT	Conditional cash transfer
CIS	Commonwealth of Independent States
DEVPOL	Development Policies
DFID	Department For International Development (UK)
ENAHO	National Survey of Households
ENAMIN	National Survey of Microenterprises
ENE	National Employment Survey
ENOE	National Survey of Occupation and Employment
EU	European Union
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
FFW	Food for work
Fondo PyME	Small and Medium Sized Enterprises Fund
GDP	Gross domestic product
GNI	Gross national income
GoM	Government of Malawi
IDB	Inter-American Development Bank
IHS	Integrated Household Survey
ILO	International Labour Organization
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IMSS	Mexican Social Security Institute
INEGI	National Institute of Statistics and Geography
INGO	International Non-Governmental Organizations
ISSSTE	Institute for Social Security and Services for State Workers
K	Phosphorous
KIHBS	Kenya Integrated Household Budget Survey
KKV	Kazi Kwa Vijana

KShs	Kenyan Shillings
KYEP	Kenya Youth Empowerment Project
LAC	Latin America and Caribbean
LDC	Least Developed Country
LDW	Local Development Window
MA	Moving average
MASAF	Malawi Social Action Fund
MCP	Malawi Congress Party
MDG	Millennium Development Goal
MFI	Microfinance institution
MoAFS	Ministry of Agriculture and Food Security
MOYAS	Ministry of Youth Affairs and Sports
MPRS	Malawi Poverty Reduction Strategy
MPVA	Malawi Poverty and Vulnerability Assessment
MSME	Micro, small and medium-sized enterprise
MTC	Ministry of Transport and Communication
MVAC	Malawi Vulnerability Assessment Committee
MyPE	Micro y Pequeña Empresa (micro and small enterprise)
N	Nitrogen
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
NGO	Non-governmental organization
NREGA	National Rural Employment Guarantee Act
NSO	National Statistics Office
NYS	National Youth Service
OB	Organizacion de base (civil society organization)
OBCs	Other backward classes
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OPM	Office of the Prime Minister
OPV	Open-pollinated varieties (maize)
P	Potassium
PAE	Employment Support Programme
PCM	Presidency of Ministers' Council
PEN	Peruvian Nuevos Soles (currency)
PET	Temporary Employment Programme
PRONAFIM	National Programme for Microenterprise Financing

PVD	Provias Descentralizado
PVN	Provias Nacional
PWP	Public works programme
S	Sulphur
SACA	Smallholder Agricultural Credit Administration
SAL	Structural Adjustment Loans
SAM	Social Accounting Matrix
SC	Scheduled castes
SFFRFM	Smallholder Farmers Fertiliser Revolving Fund Mechanism
SIS	Sistema Integral de Salud (Integrated Health System)
SME	Small and medium-sized enterprise
SpyME	Sub-ministry for Small and Medium-sized Enterprise
SSR	Soviet Socialist Republic
STPS	Ministry of Labour and Social Provision
STs	Scheduled tribes
TIP	Targeted Inputs Programme
TJS	Tajikistani Somoni (currency)
TSC	Teachers Service Commission
UDF	United Democratic Front
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WFP	World Food Programme
WMS	Welfare Monitoring Survey

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Diana Alarcón is Senior Economic Affairs Officer at the Development Policy and Analysis Division of the U.N. Dept. of Economic and Social Affairs. Formerly Leader of the Inclusive Development Cluster.

Omair Amir is an Independent Researcher with a focus on Central and South Asia. Previously he was Research Assistant at the Department of Economics at the University of Toronto.

Albert Berry is Professor in the Department of Economics at the University of Toronto.

Andrew Charman is the Director of the Sustainable Livelihoods Foundation in South Africa.

Ganesh Kumar is Professor at the Indira Gandhi Institute of Development Research, Mumbai, India.

Fatou Leigh is Economic Advisor in UNDP Kenya.

Janina V. Leon, Ph.D. is Professor in the Department of Economics at the Pontificia Universidad Catolica del Peru.

Scott McDonald is Professor of Economics in the Department of Accounting, Finance and Economics at Oxford Brookes University, United Kingdom.

Lydia Ndirangu, Ph.D. is Assistant Director of the Research Centre at the Kenya School of Monetary Studies, Kenya.

Jacob Omolo, Ph.D. is Lecturer at the Kenyatta University, Kenya.

Manoj Panda is director of the Institute of Economic Growth, New Delhi, India. He was previously director of the Center for Economic and Social Studies, Hyderabad and Professor at the Indiar Gandhi Institute of Development Research, Mumbai.

Carlos Salas-Páez is Professor at CESIT-Instituto de Economía of UNICAMP, Brazil.

Chandan Sapkota is Economics Officer at the Asian Development Bank, Nepal Resident Mission. He was a junior fellow at the Carnegie Endowment for International Peace from 2009 to 2010.

Eduardo Zepeda is Inter-regional Policy Coordinator of the Development Policy and Analysis Division of the U.N. Dept. of Economic and Social Affairs. He was previously Senior Policy Advisor in the Poverty Practice of the Bureau for Development Policy of the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and Senior Associate in the Trade Equity and Development Program at the Carnegie Endowment for International Peace.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work would not have been possible without the leadership—both at the intellectual and management levels—of Selim Jahan, Director of the Poverty Practice of UNDP. His conceptual contributions and unfaltering support for this work led to the successful conclusion of a product based on sound research and analysis that can contribute to the policy debate about the linkages between social and economic policies.

Professor Albert Berry provided the conceptual backbone of the project and coordinated the preparation of the case studies that are the heart of this volume. Dr. Berry was responsible for the development of the conceptual framework and the overview chapter. Beyond that, he acted as content editor of all country studies and in many cases was actively involved with authors in the preparation of chapters, making sure all parts effectively contributed to the whole.

The project was launched by Diana Alarcón during her tenure as Leader of the Inclusive Development Cluster in the Poverty Practice. Her solid knowledge of the field of development economics and policy, effective management and indefatigable energy took this work from an idea to a viable research initiative. Eduardo Zepeda also had a key leadership role in the development of this project contributing substantively, not only to his own chapters, but to the overall arguments and evidence presented in the volume.

In addition to managing the day-to-day activities of the project, Claudia Vinay also contributed substantively throughout the process. Her work could not have been possible, though, without the steadfast support of Mareike Eberz who became involved in the latter stages of the project. She provided able research support to finalize chapters and efficiently and cheerfully managed the complicated peer review process and a myriad other details. Almudena Fernández stepped in to help when the need arose to make sure that the process moved along—this on top of her other responsibilities. Eliane D’Pierre was the cornerstone on the operational side, efficiently managing contracts, payments, procurements, planning events, communications and travel needs. A note of thanks goes also to Anuradha Seth, Team Leader of the Inclusive Green Growth Team of the Poverty Practice, who patiently supported the team’s involvement in this work at the tail end when the small details seemed never-ending.

Special thanks, of course, go to all authors of the background studies, which served as a basis for the preparation of the country chapters in this publication. They are: Omair Amir, Andrew Charman, Janina León and Carlos Salas. For the India chapter, the collaboration with the Carnegie Endowment for International Peace was instrumental and facilitated the participation of Ganesh Kumar, Scott McDonald, Manoj Panda, and Chandan Sapkota. For the Kenya chapter, special thanks go to the UNDP Kenya Country Office and Regional Bureau for Africa, in particular to Fatou Leigh for her contributions on both the substantive and coordination sides. Lydia Ndirangu and Jacob Omolo were also co-authors for the Kenya study and Moses Mathu provided research support.

Thanks also to all the peer reviewers both from within UNDP as well as from external institutions and to all the participants in the March 2011 technical meeting. They include: Tuyà Altangerel (UNDP), Rosemary Atieno (University of Nairobi), Babken Babajanian (Overseas Development Institute), Cesar Patricio Bouillon (Inter-American Development Bank), Mariana Campos (Independent Consultant), Griet Cattaert (International Labour Organization), Mohamed Chemingui (Independent consultant), Ricardo Fuentes (OXFAM), Alan Gelb (Center for Global Development), Degol Hailu (UNDP), Radhika Lal (UNDP), the late Sebastian Levine (UNDP), Sheila Marnie (UNDP), Paola Pereznieta (Overseas Development Institute), George Perkovich (Carnegie Endowment for International Peace), Carola Pessino (Centre for Global Development), Robert Pollin (University of Massachusetts, Amherst) and, Fabio Veras Soares (UNDP).

Lance Garmer copy-edited the Malawi case study and Yurik Sandino copy-edited a first version of the Kenya study. Jon Stacey of the Write Effect was in charge of copy-editing the rest of the chapters and of ensuring overall consistency of the text.

Shams Banihani provided detailed quality assurance of the product and efficiently managed the final stages of the publication. Alex Majumder took care of the design and layout.